© 2012

## Jessica Lynn Chisholm

## ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

UPON THE SQUARE:
AN $E X$ TEMPORE AND COMPOSITIONAL PRACTICE IN FIFTEENTHAND EARLY SIXTEENTH-CENTURY ENGLAND

by<br>\section*{JESSICA LYNN CHISHOLM}

A Dissertation submitted to the<br>Graduate School - New Brunswick<br>Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey in partial fulfillment of the requirements<br>for the degree of<br>Doctor of Philosophy<br>Graduate Program in Music<br>written under the direction of<br>Andrew Kirkman<br>and approved by

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

New Brunswick, New Jersey
May, 2012

# ABSTRACT OF THE DISSERTATION 

Upon the Square: An Ex tempore and Compositional Practice in Fifteenth- and Early Sixteenth-Century England
by JESSICA LYNN CHISHOLM
Dissertation Director:
Andrew Kirkman

References to "sqwars," "sqwarenote," "square song," and "bokys of squaris" appear in various English ecclesiastical archival records, but the precise meaning of the term and its practices has yet to be fully understood. Aside from these textual examples, the only source where the term appears specifically in connection with musical notation is LonBL 17802-5 (the Gyffard Partbooks) which includes three Masses entitled "Upon the Square," one by William Whitbroke (c.1501-1569) and two by William Mundy (c.1528-1591). Based on these Masses and other fragmentary evidence, the term square has come to be defined by modern scholars as a melody in measured notation (usually for tenor voice range), that most likely originated as the lowest part of a previously existing polyphonic composition (usually for three-voices), and was extracted for use in one or more later compositions.

Extant compositional evidence further suggests that squares derived from the practices of formulaic improvisation and ex tempore performance as described in contemporary theoretical treatises; perhaps as an "intermediary" phenomena, between preexistent melodies such as chant, and complex polyphonic compositions that are in turn based upon the preexistent melody. In other words, squares seem to have involved extemporizing or composing upon a melody that was once extemporized or composed upon a melody.

This study explores the extent to which this practice was used within English preand post-Reformation sacred music. It concerns both the origin and creation of squares as an extension of the practical training used by period musicians, and the use of squares in further polyphonic settings throughout the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries. In particular, this study aims to demonstrate the variety of uses for these melodies, including how some squares may have been tailored for the liturgical needs of individual parishes and churches; as well as provide a window into the general methodology of fifteenth- and early sixteenth-century elaboration and composition.

## To my parents

## RICHARD and MARY

this project would not have been possible without your patience, understanding, love, good humor, and support

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Special appreciation goes to my advisor, Andrew Kirkman, whose academic comments have saved me from a number of timely diversions and embarrassments. I had the privilege of working with him on various independent studies, the topics of which have proven fundamental to my understanding of fifteenth-century compositional practice, as well as preparing me for this particular undertaking. Further, I am grateful for his agreement to continue discussing this project long distance after accepting a new teaching position overseas. I thank him for staying the course.

I would like to thank the members of my committee for commenting on my work: Rufus Hallmark, Floyd Grave, and Rob Wegman. Professor Hallmark has been an encouraging supporter of this project, as well as an avid listener. Professor Grave has been one of the pillars of my entire academic experience at Rutgers, beginning with my first course, "The History of Music Theory" - a topic that has proved both fascinating and essential to this project. I am extremely grateful for the amount of care and insight he has provided for my methodology, his positive approach, and for the amount of time he has spent with me discussing the process of revising and editing this project. I would also like to express my utmost respect and gratitude to Rob Wegman for his insightful academic comments and suggestions, as well as for his genuine concern and support for me as a scholar and as a person. He has helped me far more than he perhaps realizes and I will be eternally grateful. I would also like to thank Gary Yost for reading some of the earliest drafts of this paper. His comments as a musicologist removed from my daily discussion of squares and fifteenth-century compositional practice have been invaluable beyond words. Gary has given generously and graciously of his free time to discuss my
work, and I am extremely appreciative.
I would also like to thank the Chalice Consort (www.chaliceconsort.org), volunteers at the Tallis Scholars Summer School, UK (www.tsss.uk.com), and the members of Vox Fidelis (www.voxfidelis.org) for performing various movements of my transcriptions of the three Masses Upon the Square. Hearing this music live, in real time, and discussing the performing experience with professional musicians has been a key aspect of this project.

The members of Vox Fidelis, in particular, have become my extended family during my tenure at Rutgers, and their love and enthusiasm have given me the strength and encouragement needed to complete this project. I am especially grateful to members Scott Whitener (Professor of Music, Brass, and Conducting at Rutgers University), Timothy Smith (director), and Diana Whitener who spent countless hours with me discussing the issues of performing early music in the light of musicological study.

I heartily wish to thank Margaret Bent for pointing out the Beverley MS as a further source of the Or me veult melody, and Ted Dumitrescu, for forwarding a draft of his work on the York Mass Fragments. I would also like to thank the librarians of Cambridge University for allowing me to view CambriU 4450(9).

It is with the greatest honor that I express my supreme gratitude to my family and friends for their love and encouragement. I offer my regards and blessings to all of those who supported me in any respect during the completion of this project.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ..... ii
Dedication ..... iv
Acknowledgements ..... v
List of Music Examples and Charts ..... xi
Sigla and Abbreviations of Manuscripts ..... xvii
Chapter 1 - The Historiography of Squares ..... 1
Square Historiography ..... 2
The Current State of Square Scholarship ..... 10
The Term "Square" ..... 16
Objectives ..... 19
Chapter 2 - The Creation and Keeping of Squares: An Overview of the Theoretical and Compositional Evidence ..... 25
The Creation of Squares and the Training of Musicians ..... 26
Basic Musicianship ..... 27
Sights ..... 27
Faburden ..... 32
Discant ..... 34
Squarenote ..... 37
Countir ..... 37
The Creation of Squares Against a Plainchant ..... 39
The Creation of Squares Based on Polyphonic Evidence ..... 46
The Keeping of Squares ..... 50
Chapter 3 - Case Studies: Squares in Written and Ex tempore Polyphony ..... 59
Kyrie \#1: The Leroy Kyrie ..... 60
Kyrie \#2: The Whitbroke Mass Upon the Square and Dunstaple's Dominica die ..... 76
Kyrie \#4: Damett's Wordless Credo and Ludford's Missa feria iv ..... 82
Sanctus \#6: Mundy's first Mass Upon the Square and the Flitcham Manuscript ..... 85
Gloria \#3: An Anonymous Old Hall Gloria and the York Fragments ..... 88
Two Magnificats: Questionable Monophonic Mensural Concordances ..... 90
A Monophonic Mensural Stella celi ..... 95
Chapter 4 - A Jubilate Deo for Three Men and A Child Upon the Square of In Exitu Israel ..... 101
The Manuscript ..... 102
Upon the Square of In exitu Israel ..... 106
The .C. Psalm, Jubilate Deo ..... 114
For Three Men and a Child ..... 118
A Possible Composer ..... 121
A Potential Piece of Corresponding Polyphony ..... 122
The Temporal Frame of the Missing Jubilate Deo ..... 129
Chapter 5 - The Portugaler / Or me veult / Kyrie Melody: A Square from Foreign and Secular Sources ..... 134
The Concordant Sources ..... 136
A Comparison of the Concordant Sources ..... 161
The Meaning of the Term "Portugaler ..... 170
Squares, Dance Tunes, and Carols ..... 174
Chapter 6 - The Three Masses Upon the Square ..... 184
The Three Masses and the Gyffard Partbooks ..... 184
The Use and Placement of the Squares within the Three Masses ..... 187
General Compositional Features ..... 199
Contrapuntal Dissonance within the Three Masses ..... 203
Accidentals and the Three Masses ..... 209
Bibliography ..... 220
Appendix I - A List of Some Squares, Potential Squares, and Square Concordances ..... 232
Appendix II - Transcription of the Three Masses Upon the Square ..... 262
William Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square
Kyrie ..... 263
Gloria ..... 270
Credo ..... 277
Sanctus ..... 289
Agnus Dei ..... 297
Notes ..... 303
William Mundy’s First Mass Upon the Square ..... 305
Kyrie ..... 306
Gloria ..... 310
Credo ..... 319
Sanctus ..... 331
Agnus Dei ..... 341
Notes ..... 347
William Mundy's Second Mass Upon the Square ..... 348
Kyrie ..... 349
Gloria ..... 352
Credo ..... 360
Sanctus ..... 372
Agnus Dei ..... 380
Notes ..... 385
Appendix III - Some Archival References to Squares ..... 387
Curriculum vitae ..... 389

## LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

Chapter One
Example 1-1A: Lansdowne 462, f.152, system 2, Dominica die, Dunstable ..... 11
Example 1-1B: Royal App. 45-48, Alternatim Kyrie of Ludford Missa feria ii, opening polyphonic excerpt ..... 12
Example 1-1C: Gyffard Partbooks, Kyrie of Whitbroke Mass upon a Square, opening excerpt ..... 12
Chapter Two
Example 2-1: two faburdens from LonLP 438, feria iv ..... 33
Example 2-2: two faburdens from LonLP 438, feria iii ..... 34
Example 2-3: Scottish Anonymous, f.104v ..... 35
Example 2-4: comparison of Lansdowne Sanctus 6 and the Sanctus square of Mundy's first Mass Upon the Square ..... 40
Example 2-5: comparison of Sarum Sanctus VII, Lansdowne Sanctus 6, and Sarum Sanctus IV ..... 40
Example 2-6: hypothetical three-voice setting for Lansdowne Sanctus 6 ..... 41
Example 2-7: comparison of Sarum Sanctus V, Lansdowne Sanctus 1, Lansdowne Sanctus 2, and Lansdowne Sanctus 4 ..... 42
Example 2-8: comparison of Lansdowne Sanctus 6 and Sarum Sanctus VI ..... 44
Example 2-9A: Sarum Sanctus V ..... 47
Example 2-9B: Old Hall Manuscript, f.84v, Sanctus, opening excerpt ..... 47
Example 2-9C: Fountains Fragments, f.11v, Sanctus, opening excerpt ..... 47
Example 2-9D: Lansdowne 462, f.1v, Sanctus, opening excerpt ..... 48
Example 2-10A: Sarum Sanctus V and Old Hall Sanctus square, f. 84v ..... 48
Example 2-10B: Sarum Sanctus V and Fountains Fragments square, f.11v ..... 48
Example 2-11: chart of Lansdowne 462 Kyrie squares ..... 51
Example 2-12: chart of Lansdowne 462 Sanctus squares ..... 52
Chapter 3
Example 3-1: Lansdowne 462, f.151v, ninth system, Dominica die ..... 60
Example 3-2: LonBL A45-8, Missa Dominica, Ludford, opening excerpt ..... 64
Example 3-3 comparison of monophonic and polyphonic versions of the Kyrie of Ludford's Missa Dominica ..... 65
Example 3-4A: melodic comparisons of Kyrie I melody ..... 66
Example 3-4B: melodic comparisons of Christe melody ..... 66
Example 3-4C: melodic comparisons of Kyrie II melody ..... 67
Example 3-5: LonBL 30520B, Mass Le Roy, Nicholas Ludford, fragment ..... 70
Example 3-6: Gyffard Partbooks, Leroy Kyrie, Taverner, opening excerpt ..... 72
Example 3-7: LonBLM 24. d.2, f.118r, Kyrieleyson ..... 73
Example 3-8: Petrucci, CantiC, f.152-156, Tandernaken, Erasmus Lapicida, opening excerpt ..... 74
Example 3-9: comparison of Kyrie \#1 square concordances, opening excerpts ..... 75
Example 3-10: comparison of Kyrie \#1 square concordances, closing excerpts ..... 75
Example 3-11: Lansdowne 462, f.152, system 2, Dominica die, Dunstable ..... 76
Example 3-12: LonPR 163/22/1/3v ..... 78
Example 3-13: comparison of Lansdowne 462 Dominica die and the Kyrie of Ludford's feria ii ..... 79
Example 3-14: comparison of Lansdowne 462 Dominca die, the Kyrie of Ludford's feria ii, and Whitbroke's Kyrie ..... 80
Example 3-15: comparison of the square between Lansdowne 462 Dominica die and Whitbroke's Kyrie ..... 81
Example 3-16: Kyrie \#4 ..... 82
Example 3-17: LonBL 57950, ff. 79v-80, Credo, Damett, opening excerpt ..... 82
Example 3-18: Sarum Kyrie XXI ..... 83
Example 3-19: LonBLR A45-48, Ludford Missa feria iv, opening excerpt ..... 84
Example 3-20: Ludford Credo, opening excerpt ..... 84
Example 3-21: Lansdowne 462, f.1v, twelfth system, Sanctus ..... 85
Example 3-22: Gyffard Partbooks, Mass Upon the Square, Sanctus, William Mundy, opening excerpt ..... 86
Example 3-23: NorwichR 299, B, opening excerpt ..... 87
Example 3-24: YorkB 9, A recto, fragmented Gloria, monophonic mensural melody ..... 89
Example 3-25: Old Hall Manuscript, f.3v, Gloria, opening excerpt ..... 90
Example 3-26: comparison between DoverAC NR/JB and LonBL C.52.b.21, monophonic Magnificats ..... 91
Example 3-27A: DoverAC NR/JB6/iii verso ..... 93
Example 3-27B: London partbook C.52.b.21,f. 191 ..... 93
Example 3-28: Lansdowne 463, f.152v, Stella ..... 95
Example 3-29: monophonic non-mensural melodies, OxfBLC 64v and LonBLR 7.A.VI ..... 95
Chapter Four
Example 4-1: model of the orientation of CambriU 4405(9) ..... 105
Example 4-2: LonBLH 2945, f.67, In exitu Israel, opening excerpt ..... 108
Example 4-3: In exitu Israel, Binchois, opening excerpt ..... 110
Example 4-4: MonteA 871, In exitu Israel, Pietro Oriola ..... 111
Example 4-5: Gyffard Partbooks, In exitu Israel, Sheppard, Byrd, and Mundy, opening excerpt ..... 113
Example 4-6: Gyffard Partbooks, In pace, Taverner, opening excerpt ..... 119
Example 4-7: Gyffard Partbooks, Gloria in excelsis, opening excerpt ..... 121
Example 4-8: Lumley Partbooks, Iubilate Deo, first verse ..... 124
Example 4-9: comparison between Lumley Iubilate Deo tenor and the tonus peregrinus ..... 125
Example 4-10A: Lumley Iubiate Deo, top line ..... 126
Example 4-10B: Gyffard Partbooks, In exitu Israel, Sheppard, Byrd, and Mundy, opening excerpt ..... 127
Example 4-11A: Lumley Partbooks, Iubilate Deo, opening excerpt ..... 127
Example 4-11B: Lumley Partbooks, Laudate pueri, opening excerpt ..... 128
Chapter Five
Example 5-1: List of melodic concordances for Kyrie \#3 ..... 134
Example 5-2: Kyrie \#3 ..... 136
Example 5-3: Strasbourg, Portugaler ..... 139
Example 5-4: St. Emmeram, f.65r, Portugaler ..... 141
Example 5-5: St. Emmeram, f.92, Ave tota casta ..... 142
Example 5-6: Buxheim Organbook, Portugaler, opening excerpt ..... 145
Example 5-7: Mellon Chansonnier, Or me veult, opening excerpt ..... 145
Example 5-8: Beverley Kyrie, opening excerpt ..... 149
Example 5-9: YorkB 1, Gloria fragment, opening excerpt ..... 150
Example 5-10: comparison of Strasbourg Portugaler, Mellon Or me veult and the York Gloria ..... 151
Example 5-11: LonBLR A45-48, Missa feria iii Kyrie, opening excerpt ..... 155
Example 5-12: LonBLR A56, f.15, Kyrie Christe ..... 156
Example 5-13: LonBL 18936-9, Christe, John Taverner ..... 157
Example 5-14: Alcetur Bible, Ormavoyt ..... 159
Example 5-15: OxfC 371, f.19v, orma vulte ..... 160
Example 5-16: chart, comparison of Kyrie \#3 settings ..... 162
Example 5-17: comparison of Kyrie \#3 melodies ..... 163
Example 5-18A: Mellon Chansonnier ff. 69v-70r ..... 169
Example 5-18B: LonBLR A48, f. 10 ..... 169
Example 5-19: St. Emmeram, f.1v, Gloria "Portugal" ..... 171
Chapter Six
Example 6-1: chart of square distribution in Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square ..... 191
Example 6-2: Whitbroke Gloria, multiple mensurations ..... 192
Example 6-3: chart of square distribution in Mundy's first Mass Upon the Square ..... 193
Example 6-4: square in treble register ..... 195
Example 6-5: square in treble register "gloria tua" ..... 196
Example 6-6: chart of square distribution in Mundy's second Mass Upon the Square ..... 196
Example 6-7: chart of mensural distributions between the three Masses ..... 198
Example 6-8: two-voice texture in the Whitbroke Credo ..... 199
Example 6-9: triplet rhythmic figure ..... 200
Example 6-10: voice exchange in the Sanctus of Mundy's first Mass ..... 200
Example 6-11: square set a third below the triplex line ..... 201
Example 6-12: bassus as the highest voice of the overall texture ..... 201
Example 6-13: imitation in the Kyrie of Mundy's first Mass ..... 202
Example 6-14: ascending imitative figures ..... 202
Example 6-15: syncopation in the Gloria of Mundy's second Mass ..... 203
Example 6-16: accented passing tones in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass ..... 204
Example 6-17: contrapuntal dissonance in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass ..... 204
Example 6-18: contrapuntal dissonance against the square in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass ..... 205
Example 6-19: rhythmic dissonance figures in Whitbroke's Kyrie ..... 206
Example 6-20: opening of Whitbroke's Kyrie ..... 207
Example 6-21: opening of Mundy's first Kyrie ..... 207
Example 6-22: full beat dissonance ..... 208
Example 6-23: repeated figure in the Gloria of Mundy's first Mass ..... 208
Example 6-24: excerpt of Sanctus from Mundy's first Mass ..... 209
Example 6-25: bar 111, Gloria of Mundy's second Mass ..... 209
Example 6-26: bars 78-79 of Whitbroke Credo ..... 213
Example 6-27: bar 18, Whitbroke Credo ..... 213
Example 6-28: Sanctus from the Fountains Fragments, f.11v, opening excerpt ..... 214
Example 6-29: bar 17, Gloria of Mundy's first Mass ..... 215
Example 6-30: bar 55, Gloria of Mundy's first Mass ..... 215

## SIGLA AND ABBREVIATIONS OF MANUSCRIPTS

BevER 19/2/I/A: Beverley. East Riding of Yorkshire Archives and Records Service, MS DDHU 19/2/I/A.

BevER 19/2/IV/Av: Beverley. East Riding of Yorkshire Archives and Records Service MS DDHU 19/2/IV/A.

BevER 19/2/IV/B: Beverley. East Riding of Yorkshire Archives and Records Service MS DDHU 19/2/IV/B.

BevER 19/2/V/A: Beverley. East Riding of Yorkshire Archives and Records Service MS DDHU 19/2/V/A.

BurySEC: Bury, St. Edmunds. St. Edmundsbury Cathedral Old Library, fragments.
CambriE 300: Cambridge. Emmanuel College Library, MS 300.
CambriT B.II.34: Cambridge. Trinity College Library, MS B.II.34.
CambriU 667: "Caius Choirbook." Cambridge. University Library, MS Gonville and Caius 667/760.

CambriU 4405(9): Cambridge. University Library, Additional MS 4405(9).
CambriU 6668: Cambridge. University Library, Additional MS 6668.
CambriU Pembr. 314: Cambridge. University Library, MS Pembroke 314.
DoverEK NR/JB: Dover. East Kent Archives Centre, MS NR/JB.
DurC CC: Durham. Cathedral, Dean and Chapter Library, Muniments Communar's Cartulary.

DurC A.III.11: Durham. Cathedral, Dean and Chapter Library, MS A.III.11.
DurC C.I.20: Durham. Cathedral, Dean and Chapter Library, MS C.I. 20
DurU S.R.9.D.3: Durham. University Library, MS S.R.9.D.3.
EtonC 178: "Eton Choirbook." Eton. College Library, MS 178.
ExCL 1981: Exeter. City Library, MS S.M. 1981.
HertLR 57553: Hertfordshire. Archives and Local Records, MS 57553.

LonBL 1709: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 1709.

LonBL 3052B: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 3052B.

LonBL 4911: "Scottish Anonymous." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 4911.

LonBL 5665: "Ritson Manuscript." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 5665.

LonBL 17802-5: "Gyffard Partbooks." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MSS Additional 17802-17803.

LonBL 18936-9: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MSS Additional 18936-18939.

LonBL 30520: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 30520 B.

LonBL 31922. "Henry VIII Manuscript." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 31922.

LonBL 40011: "Fountains Fragments." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 40011 B.

LonBL 57950: "Old Hall Manuscript." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional 57950.

LonBL C.52.b.21: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Additional C.52.b.21.

LonBLH 2945: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Harley 2942.

LonBLLA 462: "Lansdowne 462." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Lansdowne 462.

LonBLLA 763: "Lansdowne 763." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Lansdowne 763.

LonBLM. 24 d.2: "Baldwin Commonplace Book." London. British Library, Reference Division, Music Library, MS RM 24 d.2.

LonBLR 7.A.VI: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Royal Appendix 7.A.VI.

LonBLR A45-8: "Ludford Lady Masses." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MSS Royal Appendix 45-48.

LonBLR A56: London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MS Royal Appendix 56.

LonBLR A74-6: "Lumley Partbooks." London. British Library, Reference Division, Department of Manuscripts, MSS Royal Appendix 74-76.

LonLP 438: London. Lambeth Palace Library, MS 438.
LonLP H5142.P.1545: London. Lambeth Palace Library, MS H5142.P. 1545.
Lon PR 163/22/1/3: London. Public Record Office, MS Exchequer K.R. Miscellanea E 163/22/1/3.

MonteA 871: Monte Cassino. Biblioteca Dell'Abbazia, MS 871.
MunBS 3224: Munich. Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Musiksammlung, Musica MS 3224.
MunBS Lat. 14274. "St. Emmeram Manuscript." Munich. Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Handschriften-Inkunabelabteilung, MS Latunus monacensis 14274.

MunBS 3725: "Buxheim Organbook." Munich. Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Cim. 352b. (MS 3725).

NorwichR 299: "Flitcham 299." Norwich. Norfolk and Norwich Record Office, MS 299.
OxfBDI 167: "Digby 167." Oxford. Bodleian Library, MS Digby 167.
OxfBLC 124: Oxford. Bodleian Library, MS Lincoln College Latin 124.
OxfBMS e.420-2: "Wanley Partbooks." Oxford. Bodleian Library, MSS Music School e. 420-422.

OxfC 371: Oxford. Christ Church, MS 371.
StrasBM 222: "Strasbourg Manuscript." Strasbourg. Former Bibliothèque Municipale MS 222 C. 22 (destroyed in 1870).

StratS 37/41. Stratford-upon-Avon. Shakespeare Birthplace Trust Records Office, MS DR 37/41.

StratS 98/1744/1: Stratford-upon-Avon. Shakespeare Birthplace Trust Records Office, MS DR 98/1744/1.

VatRE 1146: Vatican City. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Reginenses Latini 1146.
Yale 91: "Mellon Chansonnier." New Haven. Yale University Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 91.

YorkB 1: "York Masses." York. Borthwick Institute, MS Mus. 1.
YorkB 9: "York Binding Fragments." York. Borthwick Institute, MS Mus. 9.

## CHAPTER 1

## THE HISTORIOGRAPHY OF SQUARES

The term square may refer to a variety of practices, and have a variety of meanings, in fifteenth- and early sixteenth-century English sacred music. References to "sqwar," "sqwarenote," "square song," and "bokys of squaris," appear in various ecclesiastical archival records from this period, but the precise meaning of the term and the musical practices to which it refers have yet to be fully understood. The only source to use the term in connection with musical notation is the Gyffard Partbooks (LonBLLA 17802-5), which includes three Masses entitled "Upon the Square" - one by William Whitbroke (c.1501-1569) and two by William Mundy (c.1528-1591). Based on these Masses and other fragmentary evidence, the term square has come to be defined by modern scholars as a melody in measured notation (usually in tenor voice range), that most likely originated as the lowest part of a previously existing polyphonic composition (usually for three voices), and was extracted for use in one or more later compositions. ${ }^{1}$ Squares were sometimes copied individually as monophonic melodies into processional books, antiphonaries, and graduals; apparently for use in ex tempore performances and written polyphonic settings. The most frequently discussed example is the British Library gradual, Lansdowne 462 (LonBLLA 462), containing end pages with twenty-five monophonic mensural melodies. The compositional lives of some of these melodies, tracked through various sources, reveals melodic concordances between polyphonic settings as temporally diverse as the Old Hall Manuscript (LonBL 57950) compiled between 1415 and 1421, and the Gyffard Partbooks of around 1557. However, the full

[^0]extent of these melodic concordances, and their implications for understanding English compositional practice, remain yet to be explored.

## SQUARE HISTORIOGRAPHY

Overall, the study of squares and their melodic concordances is a relatively recent endeavor, as the majority of known correspondences have only been discovered within the past sixty years. One of the first modern academic references to such melodic correspondences can be found in Manfred Bukofzer's Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music from 1950, in which he described a series of three tripartite monophonic lines found in a fifteenth-century manuscript in the Vatican Library: VatRE 1146, ff. $72 \mathrm{v}-73 .{ }^{2}$ These melodies are not labeled as squares, and when they were first discovered in 1913, it was assumed that they were dance tunes for instrumental improvisation. It was not until the subsequent discovery of concordances in Lansdowne 462 (fol. 151v) that scholars realized the Vatican melodies were connected to liturgical music. In Lansdowne 462, the three Vatican melodies are specifically labeled as Kyrie tenors: for Feria Sexta, Quarta, and Dominica die. The Vatican manuscript also contains the inscription "Lambt" at the top of f .72 v , and the third melody, Dominica die, is marked "Le Roy." Bukofzer speculated that "Lambt" referred to a Lambertus, who would have composed the first two Vatican manuscript melodies, while the third melody could

[^1]have been written by the "Roy Henry" whose name appears in the Old Hall Manuscript. ${ }^{3}$
Further investigation led Bukofzer to discover that the Le Roy / Dominica die melody is the same as the Kyrie tenor of Ludford's Missa Dominica found in LonBLR A45-8. ${ }^{4}$ So, although the Vatican and Lansdowne melodies were not labeled as squares in either source, they have ultimately been described as squares because of their melodic concordance, their storage as monophonic mensural melodies, and their appearance in later compositions. Curiously, Bukofzer only mentioned the Vatican melodies as a side note to his discussion of basse danse melodies, specifically in order to discard the idea of these melodies as possible dance tunes. ${ }^{5}$ However, time has shown that there may be a connection between certain squares and dance tunes, a topic that will be discussed in Chapter Five.

About ten years after the publication of Bukofzer's 1950 book, a series of articles appeared in various journals concerning Nicholas Ludford and his extant compositions, including Hugh Baillie's 1958 article in The Musical Quarterly. ${ }^{6}$ Baillie discussed the various manuscripts in which Ludford's music could be found, including LonBL 1709, a bifolium with a fragmentary four-part Mass "Leroy." It was later discovered that this four-voice Mass is based on the same Le Roy / Dominica die melody. ${ }^{7}$

[^2]Baillie was also one of the first analysts to piece together the organization of Ludford's Lady Masses. Certain movements, specifically all of the Kyries and all but two of the Glorias and Credos, require alternatim performance. The Sanctus and Agnus Dei movements are treated polyphonically throughout. The LonBLR A45-48 partbooks, containing these Masses, also contain Alleluia settings that alternate plainchant and polyphony, as well as chant sequences. Baillie first assumed that one of the partbooks is an organ book, and that the monophonic mensural parts of the Masses are cantus firmi for an organist to improvise upon. ${ }^{8}$ This was later disputed by Bergsagel, but it opened the door to the possibility of ex tempore instrumental performance on these monophonic mensural melodies. ${ }^{9}$ Further settings of known squares were later discovered in organ collections, including a Kyrie square in LonBLR A56 and the Buxheim Organbook (MunBS 3725) that will be discussed in Chapter Five. Bersagel also noted that the Alleluia verses presented by Ludford follow the exact order appointed for daily Masses of the Virgin in the Sarum Missal of 1526 from Candlemas to Advent; and the order of Sequences conforms to the order of the 1526 Missal for the daily Lady Mass throughout the octave of the Assumption. ${ }^{10}$ This would suggest that the Ludford Lady Mass collection, complete with its squares, was designed to be used on a regular basis.

Bergsagel, who prepared the edition of Ludford's collected works for the Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae, also included an historiographical account of the previous scholarship on Ludford. He made special mention of H.B. Collins and Sir Richard Terry

[^3]who originally intended to publish a transcription of Ludford's Masses but never completed the project. H.B. Collins, working in 1916, was the first to connect the Ludford Missa Dominica melody with Taverner's Leroy Kyrie, a potential square described in Baillie's 1960 article. ${ }^{11}$ He was also one of the first scholars to discuss the three Masses Upon the Square found in the Gyffard Partbooks. ${ }^{12}$ Musically, Collins had little to say about the three Masses, but he seems to have been the first scholar to inquire into the meaning of the title "Upon the Square." The explanation offered below from Collins is the first in a long line of speculations, as the term certainly engages with a variety of potential meanings and associations. ${ }^{13}$

Each movement is divided into short sections separated by full closes, these sections being sung by three of the voices only, the four being only employed together (as a rule) in the concluding section of each movement. It is obvious that if each of the four voices takes its turn to rest, there are four possible combinations of the remaining three voices. Expressed in figures, the combinations will be $123,124,134,234$. I suggest that the four combinations are the four sides of the square.

Bergsagel also included the recently discovered York Masses in his discussion ${ }^{14}$, but he explained that his work was primarily concerned with identifying the cantus firmi of the seven Ludford Lady Masses. ${ }^{15}$ He called attention to other authors such as Frank Harrison who were discovering sixteenth-century records listing sums of money paid for the "prykkyng of squaris;" ${ }^{16}$ and he concluded that the individual melodies he was

[^4]studying in the Ludford Masses were the squares, possibly because of the shape of their notation. ${ }^{17}$ Harrison collected the following information in his 1958 Music in Medieval Britain: ${ }^{18}$

* the melodies used by Ludford in his Sunday and Thursday feria Masses are the same as the Sunday and Thursday feria melodies in Lansdowne 462
* one of the Dominica die melodies in Lansdowne 462 is found in Taverner's Kyrie called Le Roy in the Gyffard Partbooks
* the melodic basis of the Kyrie of Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square corresponds to that of Ludford's Mass for Monday
* The Kyrie melody of Ludford's Tuesday Mass was also used as the basis of one of the Masses in the York fragments. The Christe portion of this melody was also set in three different ways by Taverner
* VatRE 1146 contains the Le Roy melody and two other melodies that also appear in Lansdowne 462, one of which was used by Mundy in his first Mass Upon the Square.

Two years later, this preliminary information was expanded by Hugh Baillie in his 1960 article "Squares" in Acta Musicologica. ${ }^{19}$ Baillie further sought to illustrate some of these melodic correspondences systematically by compiling a list of monophonic Kyrie tenors extracted from the seven Lady Masses by Nicholas Ludford and the Kyrie melodies found in Lansdowne 462. ${ }^{20}$ Baillie believed that the Kyrie melodies seemed to possess the most "strongly melodic character with emphatic periodic rhythm," and he concluded that because of this character, they were the most frequently used for further compositions - as opposed to squares from other Mass movements. ${ }^{21}$

[^5]While this perceived preference for Kyrie melodies is somewhat contrary to what has since been discovered in the compositional evidence, Baillie's comment is one of the first to show an interest in typology: common characteristics that can serve to identify further squares and square concordances in the repertoire.

While Bergsagel, and Baillie to some degree, were primarily concerned with the compositions of Nicholas Ludford, their discussions formed the first academic commentary on squares and the composers who worked with squares. Few scholars have discussed whether or not written compositions based on squares were cultivated by particular circles of composers. Names such as Nicholas Ludford, William Whitbroke, William Mundy, and John Taverner appear frequently in the scholarly literature concerning squares. Is this because the work of these composers has survived by chance, or did they form a group of composers who turned an improvisational practice into a specific compositional technique? Also, are there specific manuscript collections that seem to cultivate written polyphony based on squares? The Gyffard Partbooks, for example, contain all three of the only known verbal references to "squares" in a specifically musical context. Also, as will be discussed in Chapter Two, a number of squares can trace their origins to compositions found in the Old Hall Manuscript.

Bersagel added that squares might be faburden tenors, ${ }^{22}$ a particularly keen observation that was not really explored prior to Brian Trowell's article on faburden in 1978. ${ }^{23}$ The archival phrase "prykkyng of squaris" was perhaps a direct reference to the notation of the melodies in a manner related to the notating of faburdens for later

[^6]compositional or improvisational usage. ${ }^{24}$ Further archival references to squares, including a "Mass de squarenote," and pieces and melodies composed "upon the eight tones, ${ }^{, 25}$ led Trowell to conclude that squares, as mensural melodies, were most likely related to the practice of composing on the faburden. Trowell implied a general distinction between the creation of faburdens and squares, in that faburden was supposedly a strict formula for alternating thirds and fifths below a plainchant melody, whereas squares seem to have been more freely created below (and even above) the plainchant. ${ }^{26}$ At the same time, does the reference to a Mass "de squarenote" indicate that the square melody was transmitted in uniform square-shaped notation, and that the performers were expected to improvise both harmony and rhythm upon it? If so, it would seem that there were a variety of ways for transmitting squares; more so than may have been previously thought. Written polyphonic settings matching this description, with one voice part written in uniform breves, appear within the Gyffard Partbooks. However, these do not include the label "upon the square" in their title.

Two years after Baillie published his article on squares, Bergsagel published a second article pertaining to Ludford; and while this article was mostly concerned with performance practice and performance forces, he raised important points about the adaptation of squares to different lines of text within the seven Lady Masses. ${ }^{27}$ His article is especially pertinent to an understanding of composition upon a square because it points out the difficulty of differentiating between a highly ornamented square and newly

[^7]composed material. Bergsagel's article was the first to raise the possibility of considerable compositional freedom in melody and rhythm based partly on the need to accommodate new texts. This compositional freedom might be a "permitted phenomenon," not based on specific texts or particular compositional rules but rather on the way early English composers thought about the topic; perhaps even as an intellectual exercise. This particular issue will be further discussed in Chapters Three and Five.

Overall, the appearance of Bergsagel's and Baillie's articles in the 1960's represented the most concentrated effort to decipher the phenomenon of squares in the mid-twentieth century, but the topic was generally dropped for the following fifty or so years. The occasional melodic concordance was discovered between pieces of English polyphony, and these were documented, but little commentary was made on this practice and its social meanings. The most central work on squares following Bergsagel's and Baillie's articles was offered by Margaret Bent, who provided the defining entry in the New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. She explained that squares were monophonic mensural melodies that had most likely been extracted from three-voice compositions, and that there are documented concordances of squares between pieces of extant polyphony (particularly pertaining to the Or me veult melody that will be discussed in Chapter Five); but she explained that "no further refinements to this definition are available., ${ }^{28}$ It was not until Lisa Colton's discovery in the late 1990's of a set of monophonic mensural melodies in the binding fragments of a record book in York (YorkB 9) that the discussion of squares was revisited. ${ }^{29}$ Most of these binding fragments contain potential Gloria squares set in alternatim, including one with a specific

[^8]connection to the Old Hall manuscript. Colton's findings indicate just how many more examples of potential squares might be missing or hidden in unusual locations. As the monophonic Lansdowne 462 collection has since shown, squares can potentially include hymns, antiphons, and even-numbered verse settings of the Magnificat presumably for use in the same alternatim manner as in the Ludford Masses and the examples in the York binding fragments. The hymns in Lansdowne 462 point to a rather large-scale use of this practice, one that could potentially involve hundreds of pieces.

## THE CURRENT STATE OF SQUARE SCHOLARSHIP

The term square, as applied to English polyphony from the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, is indeed highly problematic, particularly since there are no specific definitions of the term "square" in period theoretical sources. References to the term continue to be found in churchwarden accounts and other financial records, such as those concerning money paid for the copying of "squaris," but never with any explanation of what a square might be or how it was used. Much of our understanding of the term and its practices, then, comes from piecing together various forms of compositional evidence. Such evidence includes the appearance of a particular melody in a collection of monophonic mensural melodies such as Lansdowne 462, or as a concordance in more than one polyphonic source. The presumed use of these monophonic mensural melodies in further ex tempore performances also connects them with period theoretical works that discuss the basic techniques of improvised harmony and compositional process. Otherwise, our knowledge of squares is based primarily on Margaret Bent's definition in The New Grove Dictionary and Hugh Baillie's 1960 article in Acta Musicologica. ${ }^{30}$

[^9]One of the central problems in current square scholarship is that Hugh Baillie's methodology and criteria for identifying monophonic mensural melodies as squares were not firmly stated. He seems to have used one of a few possible criteria for devising his list of Kyrie squares. The first concerned the concordances, where the bottom part of a polyphonic composition also appears in one or more later compositions. The concordant melody might function as the bottom voice of the new composition, or it might appear in a variety of contexts: perhaps migrating between different voice parts or presented with considerable rhythmic and melodic elaboration. For example, the melody below (Ex. 11A) is found in Lansdowne 462. It further appears in two separate English polyphonic sources: Royal App. 45-48 (LonBLR A45-48): the tenor of Nicholas Ludford's Missa feria ii; and the Gyffard Partbooks: migrated throughout the Kyrie of William Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square, beginning with the bassus line (see below, Ex. 11B and 1-1C). [All musical examples throughout this and the following chapters are my transcriptions unless otherwise noted]. Within the three source locations listed above, the melody can be seen in different mensurations and with different ornamental and compositional treatments, including migration between voice parts in the Whitbroke Mass, and as part of a collection of monophonic mensural melodies in Lansdowne 462.


Ex. 1-1A: Lansdowne 462, f.152, system 2, Dominica die, Dunstable


Ex. 1-1C: Gyffard Partbooks, Kyrie of Whitbroke Mass upon a Square, opening excerpt

Because the label "Upon the Square" appears in the Whitbroke title, the melody has been considered a square in all of its subsequent appearances. Otherwise, the definition of a square as a melodic concordance is currently based on inference rather than any particular definition found in historical account records or musical treatises. While the practice of melodic extraction and reuse is probably the meaning of "upon the square," it is necessary to point out this particular problem of missing documentation and definitive labels.

Another criterion, although not explicitly defined as such by Baillie, is that a square could be the monophonic line used in alternatim Mass settings. For example, in his list of Kyrie squares, numbers 6 and 7 are simply the monophonic lines from the alternatim Kyries in Ludford's Missa feria vi and Missa sabato respectively, and he did not find any instances of monophonic storage or corresponding polyphonic pieces in
which these two melodies are used. Baillie's inclusion of these alternatim Kyries in his list of squares was based on a logical presumption. Even if there are no extant written compositions based on these melodies, it is still very likely that they could have existed in the polyphonic, or more likely, the ex tempore repertoire.

An additional criterion, taken into consideration in the present study, is that squares might be found with other squares. For example, Baillie included certain monophonic mensural melodies from Lansdowne 462 in his list of squares, such as Kyrie \#14 and Sanctus \#1, even when these melodies had no concordances or alternatim settings. He judged them to be squares simply because of their location as part of a collection, in close proximity to melodies that he had already deemed to be squares.

To be sure, the methods of identification outlined above are all based on conjecture, and it must be remembered that there are only three extant pieces of music specifically connected with the term square. Other melodic concordances that do not include the three Masses Upon the Square have received the label "square" as a result of Baillie's assumption, or based on modern usage of the term, but they should probably be described as "probable" or "potential" squares. With this in mind, the term "square" may appear throughout the following chapters as a reference to any given melody that matches one of the criteria discussed above. To summarize, then, the current criteria needed to identify a potential square includes the following:

* correspondences: the melody can be found in more than one piece of polyphony
* monophonic storage: the melody can be found singly in monophonic mensural notation, often penciled into the margins or end-pages of a gradual or other service book
* collections: squares might be found with other squares, as in a collection of monophonic mensural melodies or in sets of polyphonic works based on squares, such as Ludford's seven Lady Masses
* alternatim settings: the melody is the monophonic mensural portion of an alternatim piece.

Appendix I will register a number of these melodies and their known concordances. Baillie's original list of melodies from his 1960 article has been used as a starting point, with due consideration to his assumptions about alternatim Mass movements, various polyphonic correspondences, monophonic melodies in collections, melodies found near known squares, and even pieces that look like squares - a phenomenon that will be discussed over the course of the following chapters. Hopefully, such a list can lead to the discovery of further square melodies hidden within the repertoire.

Because squares are currently defined as melodies that provide the basis for further compositions, there is very little to differentiate squares, and composition upon squares, from other compositional practices that involve a cantus firmus. Considering that compositional borrowings and modeling on preexistent pieces were common practices throughout the Continent as well as England, this is a valid concern. However, the information found in treatises concerning improvised polyphony, as well as the extant compositional evidence that appears to relate to the practice, seems to indicate that at least some fifteenth- and sixteenth-century English composers thought of this practice as more than merely composition on a borrowed melody. In other words, the compositional evidence seems to suggest that squares derived from the practices of formulaic improvisation and ex tempore performance practices as described in contemporary
theoretical treatises. Such methods might have included faburden, discant, and sights: the visualization of prescribed pitches above and below a given melody, usually chant, in order to extemporize harmony. These techniques are often listed with the term "squarenote" in archival records, sometimes in the context of hiring a choirmaster who could teach these formulas to young musicians (as was the case for Thomas Ashwell in 1513), or in the context of payments made for the copying of a book of "square note" for the choir. ${ }^{31}$ Since squares involve the extraction of a melodic line from a preexisting composition, they represent an extra step in the process. In other words, as will be described over the course of the following chapters, composing on a square meant composing or extemporizing on a melody that had originally been composed or extemporized upon a melody.

Furthermore, Jane Flynn has recently suggested that the creation of squares and the use of squares belonged to a specific type of borrowing based on a hierarchy of learned skills, according to which singers learned specific formulas for improvising simple harmony above and beneath plainchant for day-to-day ecclesiastical services. She has also noted that the general practice of improvisation over plainchant provided one of the first methods for training composers. ${ }^{32}$ Certain compositional evidence shows that some squares were indeed created in this manner - as faburden or discant improvisations against plainchant that were fitted with mensural rhythm and extracted for further ex tempore or written compositional use. To create squares and use them in subsequent

[^10]performances, then, would indicate a certain level of educational and practical achievement.

In general, composition upon a square remains an obscure topic, conceptually overlapping with period theoretical descriptions of both faburden and discant (two-part polyphony devised by moving in contrary motion with the plainchant), yet never clearly defined in any known treatises. The exploration of squares in relation to faburden is what led to the key realization that the majority of monophonic mensural tenors, such as those in Lansdowne 462, probably came from previously composed pieces. Various collections of monophonic melodies, such as seen in Lansdowne 462, were extracted from previously devised three-voice polyphonic works, rather than existing as newly created monophonic mensural melodies. They were created by composing or extemporizing against a preexistent melody such as chant, and they were most likely intended for use in further compositions and ex tempore performances.

## THE TERM "SQUARE"

The term "square" appears in a variety of period contexts outside of musical circles, and these may very well have informed the perceptions of the composers who were using the mensural melodies. Historical derivations of the phrase "upon the square" include references to "evenness" and "to be even with." This could perhaps describe the relationship between an original plainchant, or other melody, and an added voice part composed with the same level of rhythmic activity in roughly the same vocal register. The term was also used to describe a canon, rule, or guiding principle; for example, "after the rule and square of holy scripture."33 As mentioned above with regard

[^11]to the reference to a Mass "de squarenote," a square may also refer to the shape of the notation itself. Perhaps the melodies were originally derived from plainchant notated in uniform breves, as in "a melody written upon square shaped notes," and the rhythmic elements were added later. In this regard, references to notational shape are found in the 1550 Book of Common Prayer Noted, which explains that squares are an older notational shape equal to the value of a semibreve. ${ }^{34}$

The Dictionary of Obsolete and Provincial English records the term with a variety of meanings. "Square" could describe honesty, honestly made transactions, and items acquired in an honest manner. In other words, playing upon the square implies following the given rules and doing what is honest and sincere. ${ }^{35}$ Perhaps composing upon the square might imply that there are rules for the game: a method of composition. Grose's Classical Dictionary of the Vulgar Tongue describes the term as "evenness," such as that which exists between two people on achieving a mutual agreement or having mutually settled accounts. The threat "that you will be upon the square with another" means to "get even with" someone for some supposed injury. ${ }^{36}$

Grose's Dictionary further explains that, "all fair, upright, and honest practices are called the square in opposition to the cross." This particular meaning further appears in a rather unlikely place: the language and rubrics of Freemasonry. The practice of

[^12]Freemasonry, while far removed from the domain of sixteenth-century musical composition, still maintains the same connotation of social order and pseudo-chivalry that would have been familiar to the knightly orders and courtiers of fifteenth- and sixteenthcentury England. The Masons supposedly "meet upon the level and part upon the square," denoting social equality within the lodge and social hierarchy outside. When they depart from their private meetings, they are required to carry no resentment about their differing social standings. ${ }^{37}$ The Masonic references to social order are also connected to Divine designations. Here, the physical symbol of a square represents this order: ${ }^{38}$

In the order of the lodge, the square is first (before the compass).... The square rests upon the compass before the compass rests upon the square. That is to say, just as a perfect square is a figure than can be drawn only within a circle or about a circle, so the earthly life of man moves and is built within the Circle of Divine life and law and love which surrounds, sustains and explains it.


The cosmic idea of the Divine circle and the square could very well have been understood by fifteenth- and sixteenth-century musicians, particularly since it was visible in the building of cathedrals, churches, and other physical structures. The vaulted

[^13]ceilings of these buildings were built upon a square frame, vertical columns and transverse ribs supporting the upper cross vaults. ${ }^{39}$ Furthermore, evidence of this concept can be found in rather unusual places, for example on an old inscription found on the foundation stone of Baal Bridge near Limerick, left by early sixteenth-century masons: ${ }^{40}$

I. WILL. STRIUE. TO. LIUE. - WITH. LOUE. \& CARE. - UPON. THE. LEUL. - BY. THE. SQUARE. 1517.

As pointed out by Linda Phyllis Austern, early modern English writers appear to have considered that the objects and events from one plane of existence (such as physical or spiritual) illuminated all others. Various analogies offered an important way in which the ordinary or mundane world held the possibility of transcendence. Austern explains, ${ }^{41}$
[English writers] often positioned musical practices from the natural human and celestial realms so that they mutually reflected each other for moral or didactic purposes, or cast light on the divine plan that governed all.

## OBJECTIVES

To summarize, the present study concerns the definition of squares as an aspect of the English improvisatory and compositional tradition: first to be examined is the origin and creation of squares; second, the use of squares in further polyphonic settings

[^14]throughout the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries. This study aims to continue where Harrison, Bergsagel, Baillie, and Bent left off by demonstrating the variety of uses for these melodies as well as providing a window into the general methodology of fifteenthand early sixteenth-century elaboration and composition.

Over the course of the following chapters, a series of questions and issues will be addressed. First, how and why were squares originally created and used? What distinguishes a square, and composing on a square, from any other form of borrowing or cantus firmus treatment? What is the nature of the connection between squares, ex tempore performance as described in treatises, and composition based on ex tempore techniques? What distinctions, if any, exist between the extant terms "squarenote," "square song," and "upon the square?" What distinctions exist between the terms faburden, sighting, discant, and squarenote? These questions will be discussed in Chapter Two.

In a number of cases, monophonic squares such as those found in Lansdowne 462 can be traced to three-voice compositions found in early fifteenth-century sources such as the Old Hall Manuscript. Many of these pieces contain a middle voice comprising plainchant, while the lowest voice (the potential square), works against the tenor in a manner highly reminiscent of the theoretical descriptions for improvised discant. Using examples of squares with known connections to Sarum chant as a model, it is possible to retroactively line up a number of squares with their putative originating chants. Overall, the theoretical discussions seem to indicate that the creation and use of melodies such as squares is closely connected to the practical training of young musicians. However, this practical basis also appears to have provided the foundation for more complex pieces
such as the highly syncopated and melismatic Ludford Lady Masses and the three Masses Upon the Square in the Gyffard Partbooks. Related questions concerning the origin and usage of squares will also be explored in Chapter Two.

Next, how exactly were the squares used in written polyphony? In the Whitbroke Mass shown above (Ex. 1-1C), the Kyrie square migrates between the different voice parts. The square is not highly ornamented or altered; rather, the surrounding voice parts provide the rhythmic and extra-melodic interest, and the square is used as scaffolding over which to build the other parts. In the Ludford Mass, however, the square is cast in alternatim settings and is subjected to various ornamentations, even supplemented with additional melodic material. In this instance, Ludford treats the square in the same manner as the other voice parts: as an equally contiguous thread in the musical fabric rather than as a structural scaffolding.

Further, these two pieces are the only extant polyphonic settings of this particular square. Other squares, such as the Leroy Kyrie melody, appear in numerous polyphonic settings. Some squares seem to have led long compositional lives, while still other potential squares have no surviving polyphonic settings. The topic of such square concordances will be explored through a series of case studies in Chapter Three.

Chapter Four will focus on one particular case study, the documentation of the square of In exitu Israel as found in a Cambridge Additional Manuscript (CambriU $4405(9)$ ). This is a single sheet of velum that was once used as the cover page for two polyphonic pieces (now missing) that were composed upon a square. In the margins on the verso side of the folded sheet is a penned listing for a piece that can roughly be transcribed as "The .C. Psalme Jubilate Deo, iiii partes for iii men and a Childe, to be
songe in the steade or place off Benedictus ffor sydes ad placitum upon the Square of In Exitu Israel de Egypto." ${ }^{42}$ Although the piece itself is missing, the title provides important information concerning the performance practice of squares. The same part designation, for three men and a child, also appears in a setting of In pace by Taverner found in the Gyffard Partbooks - the very manuscript containing the three Masses Upon the Square. The Gyffard Partbooks further contain a setting of In exitu Israel, ascribed to Sheppard, Byrd, and Mundy. The piece is an alternatim setting composed over repeated portions of a mensural melody. Other polyphonic settings of In exitu Israel and Jubilate Deo might provide further insight into the nature of the music that was once contained in CambriU 4405(9).

The recto side of CambriU 4405(9) names a missing "communion off iiij partis for iii men and a Childe upon the square of Ormaveute by William Whitbrook." Presumably this is a reference to the anonymous chanson Or me veult found in the Mellon Chansonnier that has melodic correspondences with various pieces of English sacred music. This mensural melody, labeled Kyrie \#3 by Baillie in his 1960 article, ${ }^{43}$ is of an as yet unknown origin. Extant archival evidence seems to indicate that the creation and use of squares was an English phenomenon; however, as Hugh Baillie pointed out, it is difficult to ignore the melodic similarities between certain squares and the tenor lines of Continental chansons and sacred polyphony by composers such as Binchois and Du Fay. ${ }^{44}$ The discovery of this melodic correspondence between various pieces of sixteenth-century English sacred music and a variety of fifteenth-

[^15]century Continental polyphonic works, including a work attributed to Du Fay, has opened the door to the possibility of squares being derived from both secular music and Continental sources. Further melodic correspondences with Continental pieces entitled Portugaler might also connect the melody with improvised dance repertoires. The discussion of this melody and the possible connections between squares and secular music will be explored in Chapter Five.

Chapter Six contains a study of the three Masses Upon the Square in the Gyffard Partbooks, the only known examples of written music found in connection with the title "square." How were these Masses constructed? How were their squares utilized over the course of their respective movements? What can we learn from the Masses that will add to our understanding of the practice of composing on a square? This chapter will explore the construction of these Masses as well as the process of transcribing them from the Gyffard Partbooks - and the particular difficulties and ambiguities that this entailes.

On a more devotionally elaborative level, the creation and use of squares provided an opportunity to "trope" traditional plainchant. This was an opportunity to offer musical comment on the text, and to embellish the liturgy by physically participating in a practice designed to elicit Divine intercession on behalf of its performers and listeners. ${ }^{45}$

Connected to this idea is the evidence that certain sixteenth-century composers were using melodies composed in the previous century in order to construct sacred polyphony. For example, in Ex. 1-1 above, the Dominica die melody in Lansdowne 462 is ascribed to Dunstaple, a composer removed from Ludford and Whitbroke by nearly a century. Why

[^16]did Ludford and Whitbroke choose to compose with such an archaic melody? What do names such as Dunstaple and "Le Roy" - as well as Ludford, Whitbroke, and Mundy represent for our understanding of the square repertoire? In many ways, the choice of older melodies appears to have been a deliberate attempt on the part of these composers to connect with the past and to participate in an esteemed tradition passed down through the generations. In this sense, the study of squares provides fresh insight into the way people conceived of music, its creation, and its purpose in the fifteenth and early sixteenth century.

## CHAPTER 2

## THE CREATION AND KEEPING OF SQUARES:

 AN OVERVIEW OF THE THEORETICAL AND COMPOSITIONAL EVIDENCESo far, squares and potential squares have been defined as mensural melodies for tenor voice range that were extracted from the lowest part of a preexisting composition, usually a faburden- or discant- type setting constructed around a plainchant. These extracted lines were sometimes stored monophonically, presumably for use in future notated polyphonic settings, or for improvised performance "on the book." How exactly were these lines created in the context of their originating compositions and how were they copied and stored for future use? Our current understanding of this process is based on the descriptions of improvised polyphony (i.e. faburden and discant) provided in period theoretical treatises, as well as the extant compositional evidence involving melodic concordances. This chapter offers an exploration of the relevant theoretical and compositional sources in response to the following questions concerning the creation of squares:

* How were musicians generally trained to improvise and notate polyphony, and how might this training have related to the practice of creating squares?
* How were certain squares created against plainchant, and what can this process tell us about their musical characteristics?
* What does the surviving polyphonic evidence tell us about the creation and fashioning of squares?
* How were squares kept for future use? Where can such melodies be found?


## THE CREATION OF SQUARES AND THE TRAINING OF MUSICIANS

As mentioned in Chapter One, the practice of creating and using squares seems to have been connected to the basic training of musicians. Jane Flynn has recently pointed out that the practical skills needed by musicians are almost always listed in the same order in archival records, as follows: plainsong, pricknote, faburden, discant (sometimes listed as "descant"), squarenote, and countir. This most likely suggests a progressive order of attainment expected of students. ${ }^{1}$ Young choristers, in particular, needed to understand mensural music before they could sing chant in rhythm. They also needed to be able to "sight" notes on a staff that were consonant with the written chant before they could sing basic parallel harmony such as faburden. Each of these techniques - faburden, discant, squarenote, and countir - was connected to the practice of sights or sighting, one of the first skills that musicians were taught and thus one of the most important techniques for informing more advanced musical practices. These techniques for devising ex tempore harmony, originating from the one base practice of sights, might intermingle with each other, borrowing from each other. Elements and combinations of these techniques appear in many of the various concordant pieces based on squares. It should be understood, then, that squares did not exist as an isolated practice. In practical reality, the creation and use of squares was part of a broader musical curriculum, and these practical, or day-to-day techniques are briefly explored below. This by no means represents an exhaustive survey of the skills needed by fifteenth- and early sixteenthcentury musicians, but it is intended to show the general connection between these skills and the creation and use of squares.

[^17]
## Basic Musicianship:

Young musicians would have begun their training by learning to read pitches on a musical staff and to read mensural rhythm by memorizing the notes and shapes of ligatures in tables of prolation. ${ }^{2}$ Students were taught to read melodies from a book such as plainchant in uniform note values - and to add a new rhythmic scheme, such as alternating breves and semibreves. Later, they were taught to ornament the measured line to create a "broken" version with additional notes resulting in enhanced rhythmic complexity. Both techniques were described by Thomas Morley, who called them "figuration," and examples can be seen in the treatise known as Scottish Anonymous (LonBL 4911). ${ }^{3}$ Further examples have been pointed out by Andrew Hughes, such as those in the manuscript ShrewS 6, which contains several rhythmicized and ornamented versions of chants. Some of these examples are multiple versions of the same chant. ${ }^{4}$

## Sights:

Once students were comfortable with reading pitches and rhythm, they were taught to read a succession of equal note values, over which they learned to improvise basic harmony. Much of this improvisation was done via the technique of sights, the visualization of pitches above and below a written pitch in order to facilitate the creation of harmony. The term "sight," or the term "imagine," also referred to the series of

[^18]"acordis:" the choice of consonances specified for each voice part of faburden and discant - specific techniques for improvising harmony that will be described below. ${ }^{5}$ Each voice part had its own formula for creating harmony appropriate for its voice range. In treble discant, for example, the singer could chose between a number of specific intervals: creating a fifth, sixth, octave, tenth, or twelfth above the plainchant. This singer was then instructed to visualize these notes on the staff at a particular interval below the plainchant but to sing that pitch an octave higher. Musicians would read from a single line of music, but sound their pitches in their appropriate vocal registers to create harmony. Johannes Boen (d.1367) described in his Musica of 1357 hearing improvised harmony when he was a student in Oxford. Boen mentions that it was universally "beloved" by laymen and clerics, and their [the English musicians'] singing consisted entirely of thirds and sixths, ending on fifths and octaves. ${ }^{6}$ Importantly, this technique was used by the adult singers as well as the student singers.

One of the earliest collections of fifteenth-century English treatises that describes sights, and the various improvisatory techniques involving sights, is the vernacular treatise Lansdowne 763 (LonBL 763). This collection was most likely compiled, edited, and copied by John Wylde (fl. c.1425-1450), a preceptor at the Augustinian Abbey of the Holy Cross, Waltham. ${ }^{7}$ The first of the three Landowne 763 music treatises is ascribed to Lionel Power (d.1445), who begins with the statement, "This tretis is contriuid vpon

[^19]the gamme for hem that will be syngers or makers or techers. ${ }^{\circ 8}$ This message is quite telling, for it explains that singers, composers, and teachers did not necessarily need separate treatises - as the techniques contained within were important for all musicians.

Power describes sights as follows: ${ }^{9}$
...pu shalt hem ymageyn between pe playnsong \& pi discant here foloype ensample. Ferst to informe a childe in his counterpoynt, he most ymagyne his vnisoun pe 8te note from pe playnsong benepe, his 3de pe 6te note benepe, his 5te e 4the note benepe, his 6te be 3de note benepe, his 8te evyn with pe playnsong....

Outside of England, the technique of sighting was described by Gulielmus Monachus, who mentioned treble sight (sounding upwards an octave) in his only known treatise, $D e$ preceptis artis musicae from c.1480-90. ${ }^{10}$ Monachus attributed these methods to the English, perhaps having learned them from the English Carmelite John Hothby (c.14301487), who traveled widely throughout Europe and eventually settled in Lucca in 1467. Hothby mentioned sighted discant in his De Arte Contrapuncti, using the term gradi in rules for improvising polyphony organized by voice range. ${ }^{11}$ Trowell believes that Monachus himself was an Englishman, perhaps even the "miser Gulielmo inglese" hired

[^20]in Antwerp during the later fifteenth century on behalf of the Duke of Ferrara. ${ }^{12}$
One further description of sights comes from the Musices Opusculum of Nicolaus
Burtius (c.1453-1528) printed in 1487. Burtius, a theorist, historian, and chronicler active in Bologna and Parma, explained that: ${ }^{13}$

The counterpoint I learned in childhood....does not come from musicians, but from practical singers, who in greater measure seek a lower level than a higher. They stoop to apply counterpoint separated from the rules of musicians....A unison makes an octave above, a third a tenth, and an octave a fifteenth. Suppose that the tenor begins on low feded, which are fa mi re mi re in Guidonian vocables, then the organized voice should also begin on f; yet it is an octave above, for it only looks like a unison, but in sound it is an octave, as I said. Then put a third above e; it also looks like a third but it sounds a tenth above. If you want to form a fifth above $d$ it will be a fifth to the eyes but a twelfth in sound.....The second rule arises when the tenor ascends. A unison makes an octave, a third under the tenor makes a sixth, a fourth produces a fifth, a sixth under the tenor a third, and an octave under the tenor a unison....These principles, which are used daily in the chapels of princes, especially by ultramontane singers, I have assembled for the usage of those who wish to organize music on a plainsong within only four lines.

Here, Burtius seems to have been disparaging of the technique, explaining that practical singers had their own methods as opposed to the academically educated theorists. These singers did not read notes on a staff as a fixed system; rather, they sounded these pitches according to their own requirements; particularly to avoid notating music outside of a single staff. Importantly, he explains that these techniques "are still used in the chapels of princes," and they are especially used by "ultramontane singers," or foreigners from the north.

The idea that sights and related ex tempore techniques for devising harmony

[^21]on a fixed melody were employed in different parts of Europe, as described by Monachus, Hothby, and Burtius, is not necessarily surprising. However, it is important to note that none of these theorists say anything about extracting the newly devised harmony as an independent melody for future use. Terms such as squarenote, or references to books of squares, have yet to appear in any extant sources from the Continent. The only theorist who comes close to describing such a technique is Tinctoris. He comments in his Liber de arte contrapuncti that this is "most rare," but there are those who can harmonize on any other part of composed music, and this requires the highest degree of art and skill. ${ }^{14}$ This one statement may be the closest Continental reference to performing on a square without actually using the term "square."

The technique of sighting worked in the opposite direction as well; for example, visualizing notes above the chant but sounding down a fifth or octave. Examples of extant faburdens that were copied in sight notation can be found in various sources. Musicians would sometimes "pencil in" their sights with little dots on the same staff as their plainchants, but understand how to sound their new pitches down a specific interval in order to stay within their own voice ranges. An example of this appears in LonBL C.52. b.21, f.lvi (c. 1528), where the sight notation of the faburdener is added on the staff above or at unison with the plainchant, which must then be transposed down. ${ }^{15}$ This particular example for Vespers shows some of the penciled-in notes written in mensural notation, such as the grouping found at the beginning of the second staff, and again, above the word "spiritum," demonstrating a general connection between the ability to sight notes around a melody and the ability to improvise mensural rhythm.

[^22]Faburden:
Power's treatise in Lansdowne 763 is followed by a discussion of the forms of improvised counterpoint (involving the voices in parallel motion) that was most likely meant to follow the introduction to sights. This is an anonymous treatise that historians generally refer to as "Pseudo-Chilston." After a student was comfortable with sighting pitches around a plainchant, he could begin singing basic harmony "on the book.,"16 Creating faburden was the easiest way of doing so since it moved in parallel motion with the chant. ${ }^{17}$ Sighting, once again, formed the basis of faburden, where the plainchant became the middle voice of a three-part harmonization. The singer of the bottom part, the faburden, used sights to sound either a third or a fifth below the chant. The restriction of faburden to thirds beneath the chant, in particular, supposedly allowed for the easy addition of a third voice above the chant moving in parallel fourths. Choristers could then sing faburden the same way in which they sang monophonic chant: either unmeasured or in mensural rhythm. ${ }^{18}$ A related example, lacking the interval of a fifth, can be seen in a Lambeth Palace manuscript (LonLP 438), as pointed out by Jane Flynn, where a collection of monophonic mensural melodies contains two lines, both labeled feria iv, that fit together at the intervals of a unison or third (below, Ex. 2-1).

[^23]Ex. 2-1:


These two melodies were described by Flynn as squares, and she explains that the lower voice could be sung up an octave, with an additional voice added in parallel fourths above the lowest voice (i.e. fit in between the two feria melodies) to create a faburden setting. ${ }^{19}$ In truth, there is nothing in the manuscript to indicate that these melodies should be used together other than the matching title, feria iv. They could have been created against each other, or they could have been created individually against the same line of chant. They could, more importantly, have been intended for use as the basis of further improvisation or written settings. Other melodies in the Lambeth manuscript, such as the feria ii settings, do not work together. However, the feria iii settings (f.180) might be set together (below, Ex. 2-2).

[^24]Ex. 2-2:


The feria iii melodies make an interesting case, as they use more intervals than just thirds, they cross ranges with each other, and they include parallel fifths and dissonant intervals such as seconds; yet they begin and end on a unison. It could be that both lines were created individually against a chant and were never intended to be set together, but at the same time, this type of "unorthodox" treatment (regarding voice crossing and the occasional dissonant clash) occurs in the three Masses Upon the Square that will be discussed in Chapter Six.

## Discant:

After a student musician understood how to perform faburden, or parallel harmony, he learned discant. This was a form of devising harmony that involved more intervals than just thirds and fifths, and moved in contrary motion with the chant or originating melody. ${ }^{20}$ Power makes the specification in his Lansdowne 763 treatise that when one is singing a discant part, one may progress from one interval to another as long as the same perfect interval is not repeated in a direct sequence. ${ }^{21}$ Otherwise, the performer was free to harmonize consonant intervals as he wished. This would fit the

[^25]description of the two Lambeth feria iii examples seen above in Ex. 2-2 except for the instances of parallel fifths.

According to Pseudo-Chilston, more than one person could extemporize discant if they followed certain rules that prescribed the intervals for each individual voice part. ${ }^{22}$ Scottish Anonymous describes this as well, creating a four-voice harmonization with a plainsong in the tenor. ${ }^{23}$

The thretent rewill:
Gif, in countering of four partis, the plane sang dois ascend above C sol-fa-ut, D la-sol-re, E la- me, Ff fa-ut, G sol-re-ut in the alt, than the ferd sycht sall keip the boundis betuix the plane sang and the baritonant in the maner of ane tenor and the third sycht salbe boundit in the way of ane counter quhillis abouve the plane sang and quhyllis beneth, and gif the plane sang dois descend in C fa-ut, D sol-re, E la-me, Ff fa-ut, G sol-re-ut greves, than the ferd sycht sall be the lawest part abov the plane sang and the thrid syght salbe the hyest, the quhilkis thrid and ferd partis sall gif eyris everry ane till uther, that is to say, quhan the thrid sight dois ascend the ferd sall decend ane econtray keipand alternitie fro ane till ane uther in thair turn ay with iteracion eftir as the formalitie of the plane sang to perfyt melodie dois confirm, so that the thrid and the ferd sycht do knaw the ordour and passaig of the barritonant and the plane sang togidder the thrid and the ferd syght sall thair partis infer and in thair proprie boundis plesandly convoy.


Ex. 2-3: LonBL 4911, ff.104v

[^26]Aplin points out that this "haphazard system" increases the chance of parallel perfect intervals which are only avoided by introducing passing tones in the bass, and he concluded that this four-voice technique was probably not sung in an ex tempore fashion as Scottish Anonymous describes it. ${ }^{24}$ Yet this very problem was discussed by Tinctoris in his Liber de arte contrapuncti: that with two, three, four, or many, voices harmonizing super librum, one voice is not subject to the other as long as each of them makes consonances with the tenor. In written composition, all voice parts are mutually bound to each other, so that all the voices should be concordant with each other. ${ }^{25}$ Tinctoris adds that the super librum version is something most laudable, rather than "disgraceful." He considered this if the singers avoided clashes as much as possible, and he specified that the singers needed to agree upon an arrangement of concords to help avoid such dissonances. ${ }^{26}$ Otherwise, one wonders if there could have been a certain tolerance within this practice if dissonances or parallel intervals did occur between the newly-created lines. Certain excerpts from the Whitbroke Mass Upon the Square seem to fit this description of super librum performance for multiple voice parts. In the Whitbroke Mass, consonances are generally maintained between added voices and the tenor, but not always between the added voices themselves. This will be further discussed in Chapter Six. ${ }^{27}$

[^27]
## Squarenote:

After a student learned to improvise harmony against chant, modern scholars assume that he could learn "squarenote." Jane Flynn suggests that squarenote specifically applies to improvisation against mensural melodies that are not chant; ${ }^{28}$ otherwise, the term squarenote is not used in theoretical treatises. One possibility to consider is that the term squarenote might also refer to an extracted melody minus the mensural rhythm: in other words, a melody in uniformly square-shaped notes. Examples of melodies in uniform notation can be found in various sources, as will be discussed below. Perhaps this explains why fifteenth- and sixteenth-century musicians used the terms "squarenote," rather than "squaresong." Beyond this, our knowledge of squares comes from mensural tunes such as those seen in Lansdowne 462.

## Countir:

Countering, or "countir," is one of the last techniques mentioned in Jane Flynn's list of the skills needed by musicians. ${ }^{29}$ It seems that the terms discant and counterpoint, or "countir," were somewhat interchangeable as the definition of both involved the addition of only consonant intervals to a pre-existing monophonic line in a note-againstnote texture. ${ }^{30}$ Judson Maynard has provided a detailed study of countering, explaining that the practice had its root in discant, but more fully involves the florid style of

[^28]breaking or ornamenting the "simple" notes. ${ }^{31}$ In other words, this involved the fracturing of larger note values into smaller ones in order to provide rhythmic and melodic interest. When Hugh Baillie originally described the nature of squares in his 1960 article, he borrowed the medieval term cantus fractus to describe this technique. ${ }^{32}$

Examples of this latter term can be seen in various treatises, including that of Petrus frater dictus Palma ociosa (fl.1336). Petrus described cantus fractus in his Summa musice as flores musice mensurabils - the "flowers of measured music" - or
"contrapunctus diminutus." ${ }^{, 33}$ These "flowers" are the decorations of note-against-note counterpoint that can be reduced to a single pitch against the tenor. Petrus provides a series of examples for this technique, where decorated discantus lines are shown "just as one might compose., ${ }^{34}$ By the late fifteenth century, examples of polyphony based on the fracturing of melodic lines into rhythmically complex melismas can be seen for example in the Eton Choirbook (EtonC 178), the Caius Choirbook (CambriU 667), and the seven Ludford Masses (found in LonBLR A45-48). This latter source in particular, which contains a number of known squares, provides a pertinent example of why the search for more squares in the repertoire should not ignore rhythmically complex and highly ornamented polyphonic settings. At the same time, other examples of polyphonic works based on squares keep the square melody (generally in the lowest voice part) in a fairly recognizable form while fracturing the upper voices. Such examples will be further

[^29]discussed in the next chapter.
One further note: as Clive Burgess and Andrew Wathey have pointed out, socalled "simple polyphony" was once assumed to have been confined to singers and institutions of limited capabilities, yet the situation was probably quite the opposite, with simple polyphony existing in the very same environments where more lavish polyphony was performed. This may explain why borrowed musical material, such as squares, could "filter readily" between different repertoires at different levels of complexity. ${ }^{35}$

## THE CREATION OF SQUARES AGAINST A PLAINCHANT

Returning to the idea that some squares were originally created as faburden or discant lines below plainchant, it would make sense that certain squares could be traced back to an originating chant-based composition. While such an attempt at retroactive alignment might never yield results for certain squares, there is still much that can be learned about the creation of squares from any attempt to match a square with an originating chant. For example, the square of the Sanctus movement from William Mundy's first Mass upon the Square also appears in monophonic storage in Lansdowne 462, yet the origins of this melody remain a mystery. The melody appears as follows as Lansdowne Sanctus 6 (top line in Ex. 2-4 below), and within the Sanctus movement of Mundy's first Mass Upon the Square (the ornamented bottom line of the same example) found in the Gyffard Partbooks.

[^30]Ex. 2-4:


An attempt to match this square with plainchant reveals that the melody could have been derived from at least two Sarum Sanctus chants. The following example (below, Ex. 2-5) compares the square as seen in Lansdowne 462 with two possible corresponding plainchants. This example begins at the Benedictus section of the Sanctus, which reveals the greater number of unisons with the chant. The mensural rhythm has been removed from the example for the purpose of more clearly aligning the note values. The numbers listed above the Sarum melodies indicate the interval between the chant and the Lansdowne melody.

Ex. 2-5


The Sarum plainchants Sanctus IV and VII are closely related, and the Lansdowne
melody could have been devised in a performance based on either of these chants. In the second system of this example, a rather formulaic pattern of unisons and thirds appears in the Osanna section. In fact, Sarum chants IV and VII contain the same pitches in their Osanna sections. In the first system, the word "venit" reveals a passage of unisons between the Lansdowne melody and Sanctus IV. It seems highly plausible that the Lansdowne 462 melody could have been derived from the Sanctus IV chant, particularly since it contains so many unison passages beyond just the word "venit." ${ }^{36}$ Based on the construction of the Old Hall example seen above, it is possible to construct a theoretical originating piece for the Lansdowne Sanctus 6 melody that might look something like the following:

Ex. 2-6:


Here, the portions of unison between the Sarum chant and Lansdowne Sanctus 6 have been replaced with harmony in thirds in the chant voice, and the chant migrates between the two lower voices as seen in the various pieces found in the Old Hall Manuscript. This

[^31]example is pure conjecture, and represents one of many possibilities, but exercises such as this provide important clues for locating squares and their originating pieces.

In practice, certain plainchants were used more frequently than others in the day-to-day liturgy of the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, and it may be suggested that various square profiles might have been formed against the same frequently used chants. For example, the plainchant for Sarum Sanctus V was used frequently: on certain simple feasts, on Sundays, and on octaves. ${ }^{37}$ This particular chant may be plausibly aligned with at least three Lansdowne Sanctus melodies (see below, Ex. 2-7: the mensural rhythms of the Lansdowne melodies have been removed for simplification).

## Ex. 2-7:



[^32]

Based on the number of consonant intervals created between the chant and each individual Lansdowne melody, including the number of unisons, it can be determined that the first two Lansdowne melodies, and quite possibly the third, were probably created against this particular line of plainchant in a discant-style setting. Most likely, the chant migrated into the lowest voice-part as part of a now unknown three-voice composition or ex tempore performance, and this lowest voice-part was later extracted and copied into Lansdowne 462. This is a pattern that, once again, represents a compositional construction familiar to many of the Mass movements in Old Hall. The chant line in these three-voice settings (the tenor part), would be replaced with newly composed material in the places where the chant migrated into the added voice part. For example, the word "Dominus" in Lansdowne 1 and 2, "terra" in Lansdowne 2, and the ends of phrases such as "in excelsis" in all of the above examples are at unison with the chant. The three Lansdowne melodies probably existed at some point in written compositions that exchanged portions of the chant between the main chant-bearing part and the newlycomposed line (the tenor and contratenor parts respectively).

Returning to the Lansdowne Sanctus 6 melody described above in Ex. 2-4 (the square of the Sanctus movement in Mundy's first Mass Upon the Square), the alignment between this melody and Sarum Sanctus IV reveals many unisons and thirds. However,
the intervals of a third created against the chant generally sit above the chant rather than below (see below, Ex. 2-8).

Ex. 2-8:


The pattern of descending thirds and unisons, such as those seen at the words "celi" and "Osanna," may be redolent of a practical formula used in ex tempore performance. These intervallic formulas fit the descriptions of how to improvise faburden, but they don't explain why the square sits above the chant. Perhaps this has to do with a transposition of the chant or of the square itself, or with the practice of sights. Either way, the connection between the two melodies is quite apparent in this example. Andrew Hughes has pointed out examples of written polyphony in which the chant is transposed up a third. He considered these transpositions to be "a most unusual shift for which no convincing explanation can be offered,, ${ }^{38}$ except perhaps, that they are some remnant of ex tempore practice.

[^33]Another possibility for explaining the potential alignment between Sarum Sanctus IV and Lansdowne Sanctus 6 is that the movement above and below the chant, keeping equal voice ranges and ending on the same pitch, is more representative of the compositional technique known as gymel. Gymel, meaning "twin," is an English term that describes the temporary splitting of one voice part in a polyphonic composition into two voice parts of equal range. The two voice parts of gymel operate in the same voice range, while discant and faburden utilize two adjacent voice parts and ranges. This technique first appeared in early fifteenth century sources, including the Old Hall Manuscript, where certain compositions contain the technique in short duet sections as a textural change within a three-part context. ${ }^{39}$ Pseudo-Chilston of Lansdowne 763 uses the term "countergemel" to describe the technique: ${ }^{40}$

And alwey sette pe voce yn be same note $\&$ in pe same twne pat pe plain-song is in, and alwey be-gynne $\&$ ende pi countergemel begynne $\&$ ende in vnisoun."

The treatise writer explains that faburden and sights were designed to create counterpoint, whereas gymel involved the splitting of a single voice part to create interweaving lines. This would only last for a specified passage of music before the two lines returned to a unison by the end of that passage. This description seems to fit Ex. 2-8 above, except for the fact that "countergemel" was intended to be used for a short passage of music rather than an entire piece or performance.

As we are lacking any specific written or theoretical explanations of how squares were created, it might still remain a possibility that musicians used their skills in creating

[^34]faburden, discant, and countergemel to inform their creation and use of squares. Example 2-1 above, of the two feria iv melodies in LonLP 438, might provide a partial example of such a technique. Both voices begin and end in unison, yet they do not necessarily interweave with each other. The concept of voice crossing used in gymel technique may not apply to the majority of squares and their origins, but it is related to the structure of the three Masses Upon the Square. Within these Masses, the square melodies migrate into different vocal registers - in essence, crossing the voice parts and interweaving the melodic lines.

## THE CREATION OF SQUARES BASED ON POLYPHONIC EVIDENCE

Our knowledge concerning the creation and use of squares is reliant on extant compositional evidence, particularly involving melodic concordances, but musicians of this period most likely used what modern musicians might call "compositional skills" and "improvisational skills" far more interchangeably than this title might indicate, and it will be important to keep this possiblity at the forefront of the following discussion. For example, the Sarum plainchant Sanctus V appears in the tenor part of a three-voice Sanctus setting in both the Old Hall Manuscript (LonBL 57950, f.84v) and the Fountains Fragments (LonBL 40011, f.11v) - see below in Ex. 2-9A-C. ${ }^{41}$ The Sarum plainchant was fitted with mensural rhythm (beginning at the second statement of "Sanctus"), and harmony was created by adding intervals in a formulaic

[^35]pattern to derive a triplex and a contratenor part. ${ }^{42}$ Originally, this harmony could have been improvised, but at some point the pieces were written down in mensural notation. The contratenor part was then extracted from one or another of these versions and copied as a monophonic mensural melody in Lansdowne 462, f.1v, fourth system (below, Ex. 2PD).


Ex. 2-9A: Sarum Sanctus V


Ex. 2-9B: Old Hall Manuscript, f.84v, Sanctus, opening excerpt without chant incipit


Ex. 2-9C: Fountains Fragments, f.11v, Sanctus, opening excerpt without chant incipit

[^36]

Ex. 2-9D: Lansdowne 462, f.1v, Sanctus, opening excerpt

The added voice parts in the polyphonic settings from the Old Hall Manuscript and the Fountains Fragments were created by the addition of specifically consonant intervals: perfect fifths, octaves, unisons, thirds and sixths. The use of these intervals fits period descriptions of simple discant as described above - excepting the setting of the word "Dominus," where the chant temporarily migrates to the newly composed line (the contratenor). This can be seen below (Ex. 2-10A and B) with the mensural rhythm removed.


Ex. 2-10A: Sarum Sanctus $V$ and Old Hall MS


Ex. 2-10B: Sarum Sanctus $V$ and Fountains Fragments

The Fountains Sanctus contains further compositional deliberation; for example, maintaining the pitch C in the chant/tenor line at the word "Dominus" in order to avoid the unison A between the tenor and contratenor. In the fourth bar of Ex. 2-9C, the top voice includes the addition of an F-sharp to avoid a tritone against the tenor B-natural. This addition makes for an unusual "chromatic" ascending top line. A similar figure
appears in the first bar of the example. In this case, there is no tritone to avoid, and no apparent reason why the F-sharp was added.

The Lansdowne Sanctus uses a different mensuration than the versions in the Old Hall Manuscript and the Fountains Fragments, showing that there could have been further versions of this polyphonic Sanctus from which the Lansdowne 462 example was possibly extracted. Otherwise, the Lansdowne example might have been a single line of discant created against the chant, given an original mensural scheme, and immediately set in monophonic storage. However, a newly created harmonization most likely would not contain such a direct replication of pitches from the Old Hall and Fountains lowest voice parts. It certainly seems more likely that the Lansdowne Sanctus was extracted and rhythmically modified from one or more of these settings. It was then kept in monophonic storage, presumably as a readily available melody for future use in ex tempore performance or written composition.

The practice of creating a potential square, such as the melody derived from Sarum Sanctus V, and using it as the basis of further polyphonic performances seems to have been fairly widespread throughout England. Archival records include lists of payments for squares and pieces based on squares, such as at All Saints, Bristol in 1524: "Item to John Corner of the Gaunts for pricking five books of songs of square note," Louth Parish Church in 1535 for the copying of "a sqwar apon the viij tunes," and also All Saints, Bristol in 1535-6, "item iiij Square boks." A further reference from Canturbury Cathedral in 1557 shows that squares were sometimes used for special occasions: "Queen Elizabeth made a ceremonial entry into Canterbury Cathedral. The
choir was standing on either side and brought up her Majesty with a square song."43

## THE KEEPING OF SQUARES

Once a square was created, it could be extracted from its original performance context and copied in monophonic notation. Extant source records reveal two categories of notated squares: copied lists of monophonic melodies, and written polyphony based on squares (such as the seven Lady Masses by Ludford). However, there are no extant title references for any of these collections. The label "square," then, may have been a label like "pricksong," a description of the process of creation and not necessarily intended as a categoric title. It would be the equivalent of calling a piece "upon the chant" or "upon the counterpoint." In this sense, the three Masses entitled "Upon the Square" in the Gyffard Partbooks might be something of an anomaly. It would also mean that the technique of using squares may be embedded in far more genres and places than has been previously noticed.

So far, Lansdowne 462 has been the most frequently discussed collection of monophonic squares and potential squares. This is a Sarum gradual dating from c. 14151456 that may have belonged to Norwich Cathedral and was later owned by William Petty Fitzmaurice, the first Marquis of Lansdowne. At different times throughout the fifteenth century, a series of monophonic mensural tenor lines in black notation were added by several scribes into the folios at either end of the book (folio 1 v and ff . 151v-

[^37]$152 \mathrm{v}) .{ }^{44}$ The contents of these pages are as follows:

* Folio 1v: 1 Asperges, 7 Sanctus melodies
* Folio 151v: 9 Kyrie melodies
* Folio 152: 2 Kyrie melodies, 1 Magnificat, 1 Sanctus
* Folio 152v: hymns Stella celi extirpavit, O Gloriosa stella maris, Salva nos Jhesu, Vidi aquam

Lansdowne 462 may have originally contained other hymns and Mass settings, since the manuscript seems to have lost some of its early pages. In the following chart, the Kyrie melodies in Lansdowne are listed, followed by the number assigned by Baillie. The ranges listed indicate lowest to highest note.

Ex. 2-11:

| Name | Number | Location | Length | First <br> pitch | Last <br> pitch | Range | Text |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| feria ii | 8 | f.151v $1^{\text {st }}$ system | 36 bars | D | D | C-C |  |
| feria iii | 9 | f.151v $2^{\text {nd }}$ system | 34 bars | D | D | C-C |  |
| feria iv | 10 | f.151v $3^{\text {rd }}$ system | 29 bars | D | D | C-B | x |
| Dominica die | 5 | f.151v $4^{\text {th }}$ system | 44 bars | C | F | D-D |  |
| [six-fold] | 11 | f.151v $5^{\text {th }}$ system | 46 bars | F | D | C-C | x |
| feria vi | 12 | f.151v $7^{\text {th }}$ system | 46 bars | A | G | C-D | x |
| Dominica die | 1 | f.151v $9^{\text {th }}$ system | 37 bars | A | G | D-E | x |
| feria vi | 13 | f.151v $11^{\text {th }}$ system | 21 bars | F | F | C-D | x |
| Martyn | 14 | f.151v $12^{\text {th }}$ system | 40 bars | D | D | C-Bb | x |
| Sabato Lyonal | 15 | f.152 $1^{\text {st }}$ system | 28 bars | G | G | D-E | x |
| Dominica die <br> Dunstaple | 2 | f.152 $2^{\text {nd }}$ system | 30 bars | D | D | C-C | x |

Of the extant melodies, most stay within the range of an octave, and they move generally in stepwise motion or in thirds with the occasional leap of a fourth or fifth, and they sometimes include hemiola. The melodies vary in length and some contain mensuration changes; and most of them involve only breves and semibreves with the occasional

[^38]minim. Virtually all of these melodies stay within the range of an octave, usually C to C or D to D . Further, all the melodies that begin on D end on D , and the melodies beginning on $G$ end on $G$. The two melodies that begin on $A$ end on $G$, and the two melodies that begin on F end respectively on F and D. Perhaps this shows that the fifteenth-century musicians who used this particular collection desired melodies that ended on certain pitches and stayed within a very specific vocal range, most likely related to modal octaves. ${ }^{45}$

The Sanctus melodies in Lansdowne 462 display many of the same characteristics as the Kyries: range within a specific octave and length appropriate for their respective text. The list of Sanctus melodies, however, includes an example that ends on C and an example that ends on E .

Ex. 2-12:

| Number | Location | Length | First pitch | Last pitch | Range |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | f.1v $2^{\text {nd }}$ system | $80+$ bars | Missing | F | C-C |
| 2 | f.1v $4^{\text {th }}$ system | 118 bars | F | F | C-C |
| 3 | f.1v $6^{\text {th }}$ system | 116 bars | C | C (8ba) | C-C |
| 4 | f.1v $8^{\text {th }}$ system | 126 bars | F | F | C-D |
| 5 | f. 1 v 10 th system | 125 bars | F | F | C-C |
| 6 | f. 1v 12th system | 123 bars | D | D | C-C |
| 7 | f. 1v 14th system | 122 bars | G | E | C-C |

While Lansdowne 462 seems to be the most frequently mentioned collection
of squares and potential squares that has survived, there are other collections of monophonic mensural melodies and potential squares. Sometimes these melodies are found together on flyleaves just as in the case of Lansdowne 462, and other times they

[^39]are penciled individually into the cover-boards or page margins in processional books and other sources. Some are notated in uniform square-shaped notation, devoid of any mensural rhythm. However, none of these sources contain as many individual melodies as the Lansdowne 462 collection. The list below provides an inventory of some of these sources listed in order of their location:

## Collections of Monophonic Mensural Melodies

* DoverEK NR/JB (monophonic mensural Magnificats and psalm tones)
* LonBL C.52.b. 21 (monophonic mensural Magnificats and psalm tones)
* LonBLLA 462 - Lansdowne 462 (described above)
* LonLP 438, f.180v ("ffaburdon," monophonic mensural troped Kyries for Rogation days)
* VatRE 1146 (four untitled monophonic mensural melodies, three of them later identified as Kyries in Lansdowne 462)
* WellsMS (fragments of monophonic melodies carved into a slate tablet)
* YorkB 9 (fragments of monophonic mensural alternatim Glorias and other un-texted monophonic melodies)

Monophonic melodies copied in uniform square-shaped notation

* ArunCA - York Antiphonal (Dixit Dominus, Sit nomen, In exitu)
* BevER 19/2/IV/Av (Sancta Maria virgo)
* BevER 19/2/IV/B (Ave Maria)
* OxfBDI 167 - Digby 167 ("Frank" Queen note, 2 basse danses with French titles)

Misc. monophonic mensural melodies copied into the front and end boards, and margins, of pre-existing sources

* Alcetur Bible, verso title page (contains the Or me veult melody)
* CambriE 300 (fragments of three incomplete Kyries by Dunstaple)

Monophonic melodies that alternate plainchant and mensural notation

* BurySEC (fragments of an alternatim Magnificat)
* LonBLH 2945, ff. 65-70 (Sarum Processional containing chant for even numbered verses of psalms Laudate pueri and In exitu Israel, erased and replaced with an alternatim mensural melody).

Many of these melodies are found in processional books, and certain titles connected with these melodies refer to pieces that were liturgically used in processions - such as the Rogation Kyries and the In Exitu Israel and Laudate Pueri melodies that will be further discussed in Chapter Four. Some melodies, such as the Or me veult square copied into the front of the Alcetur Bible (to be discussed in Chapter Five), would have ostensibly seemed to exist outside of the square tradition had they not been connected with various pieces of liturgical polyphony.

The inclusion of squares and potential squares in alternatim settings, listed in the final category above, also supports the notion of a tradition of composition and performance based on improvisation. Musicians were taught to alternate improvised polyphony based on plainchant with direct plainchant in a manner that dates back to the development of organum in the ninth and tenth centuries. The practice of alternatim was not necessarily restricted to liturgical texts that were responsorial in character: psalms, canticles, hymns, sequences, and the Ordinary of the Mass were also set in this fashion,
one verse alternating with the next. ${ }^{46}$ Simple settings that alternated chant and mensural polyphony (both written and ex tempore) most likely provided the foundation for more elaborate and florid examples of alternatim settings, such as the seven Ludford Lady Masses. The further discovery by Lisa Colton of monophonic alternatim mensural melodies in York, some of which were extracted from polyphonic settings concordant with examples in the Old Hall Manuscript, indicate that the repertoire of alternatim settings embodies an important clue to understanding the practice of composition and performance upon a square. Among the large number of liturgical pieces that utilized alternatim performance in the extant English liturgical repertoire, it would seem likely that many such settings could have been developed upon the square.

Further adding to the above list of potential squares in storage are complete or fragmentary pieces of polyphony that have been penciled into flyleaves or the coverboards of various musical collections. These examples may or may not have been used for the extraction of squares, but their notation and method of storage resembles the ways in which some squares and pieces based on squares were preserved. This latter category, of polyphonic works stored on flyleaves, seems especially pertinent in light of cases such as that of BevER 19/2/I/A, a source that contains a Kyrie based on the Or me veult square. ${ }^{47}$ Some of these sources of polyphony found on flyleaves and coverboards are listed below. As can be seen, this is a rather extensive list, indicating just how many pieces of extant polyphony could potentially contain squares.

[^40]Sources of polyphony copied into flyleaves and end pages

* ArunC (two settings of Asperges me)
* BevEr 19/2/I/A (Kyrie based on the Or me veult melody)
* BevER 19/2/I/B (Kyrie)
* BevER 19/2/III/A-Bv (Sanctus)
* BevER 19/2/V/A (Credo)
* CambriU Pembr. 314 (fragments of Mass movements)
* CambriT B.II. 34 (fragmentary Credos)
* DurC CC (Gloria)
* DurC A.III.11v (troped Kyrie)
* DurC C.I.20, f.4v (Virgo dei genitrix)
* DurU S.R.9.D. 3 (fragment of a Kyrie)
* ExCL 1981 (Magnificat)
* HertLR 57553 (fragments of a Kyrie)
* LonLP H5142.P (fragment from backboard, Salve festa dies)
* LonPR 163/22/1 f.3v (Kyrie, contains Kyrie \#2)
* LonBL 3052b (Ludford, Mass Le Roy)
* NorwichR 299 (contains Sanctus \#6)
* StratS 37/41 (two Kyrie settings)
* StratS 98/1744/1 (Kyrie, fragmentary Gloria, three fragmentary Credos)
* YorkB 1, ff.3v-7 (Mass fragments, contains Or me veult melody)

In summary, squares and potential squares can be found in monophonic mensural collections, written in uniform square notation, copied onto slate cartellae, written out in
settings that alternate chant and monophonic mensural melodies, or embedded within polyphonic works stored in the front and end-pages of processionals and graduals. Examples such as LonBL 3052b may seem unconnected to the practice of composing on a square, but the fragmentary Ludford Mass in this source was found to contain a melodic correspondence with the Le Roy melody (Kyrie \# 3 that will be discussed in Chapter Three). The range of sources where one might find squares is quite vast, and evidence of squares could potentially be found in any of these sources. This list may further extend into complete polyphonic collections. While there are hundreds of pieces stored in various manuscript sources from the fifteenth and early sixteenth century, the following list involves collections that contain known squares:

## Polyphonic collections that contain known squares

* LonBL 57950 [Old Hall Manuscript]
* LonBL 40011B [Fountains Fragments]
* LonBL R.M. 24. d2 [Baldwin Commonplace Book]
* LonBLR A45-48 [the Ludford Lady Masses]
* LonBLR A56 [keyboard settings]
* LonBL 17802-5 [Gyffard Partbooks]

The search for melodic concordances between the above sources and the creation of a database of borrowed melodies is a project that extends beyond the scope of this dissertation. In the meantime, a number of the concordant sources will be explored in the following chapter and the list of melodies provided in Appendix I will form a starting
point for such a database. In summary, the following conclusions can be made from this chapter:

* many squares were probably used in ex tempore performance, much of which was surely informed by the practical training given to young singers
* squares based on chant were created primarily as faburden or discant settings
* based on current knowledge, the Old Hall Manuscript and related sources dating from the same time period provide the earliest sources of squares and potential squares
* the Old Hall Manuscript, as a source of certain squares, utilized a tradition of migrating voice parts: pieces based on chant often moved portions of the chant into the newly composed lower line (the future square), leaving a "trail" for locating the originating chant once the square is removed from its polyphonic setting. Similarly constructed musical settings, in sources other than Old Hall, may lead to the discovery of further squares
* chants that were used more often throughout the year, such as Sarum Sanctus V, have more potential matches with monophonic mensural melodies (potential squares). This may suggest that squares were commonly used to adorn less festive chants
* not all squares are based on chant
* alternatim settings seem to be a frequent point of origin and use for squares
* squares can be found in the most simple of faburden or discant style settings as well as the most florid, fractured, and rhythmically complex polyphonic settings
* the extent of the extant sources of squares in written polyphony still needs further investigation - there may be dozens of concordances awaiting discovery in the manuscripts listed above, as well as other sources.


## CHAPTER 3

## CASE STUDIES: SQUARES IN WRITTEN AND EX TEMPORE POLYPHONY

In an article published in 1978, John Aplin posed a series of questions concerning polyphonic composition over extracted faburden lines during the first half of the sixteenth century. Aplin's primary concern was to track the specific ways in which English composers utilized the faburden lines, and how their treatments may have influenced the following generation of composers. ${ }^{1}$ Since his discussion concerned the extraction and use of mensural melodies from previously-composed pieces, Aplin's analysis may apply equally well to squares. In this chapter, Aplin's line of investigation will be applied to a series of case studies involving the concordant sources of various squares.

Aplin concluded that the phenomenon of composing upon extracted faburden tunes was not a widespread practice used by early sixteenth-century composers. He explains: ${ }^{2}$

Faburden tunes, like the plainsong tones themselves, were retained during these difficult early years when the traditional schemes of unity, evolved within the plainsong liturgy and dependent upon it, had disintegrated with the Latin rite. An existing method was modified into something more subtle resulting in the structural likeness of individual faburden works. But these works remain an isolated pocket, using a structural device which found no wider acceptance.

Aplin may have considered the practice of borrowing faburden lines to have been an "isolated pocket" because the practice probably happened far more frequently in $e x$ tempore performance than in written polyphonic works. This is an important

[^41]consideration, and with this in mind, this chapter will seek to explore various case studies that concern both written and ex tempore polyphony. How were squares used? What, if anything, did a musician working with a square take from a previous polyphonic treatment made by another musician based on that same square? Are there any specific structural traits that seem to reappear in a manner suggestive of a technique used only for squares?

KYRIE \#1: THE LEROY KYRIE


Ex. 3-1: Lansdowne 462, f.151v, ninth system, Dominica die

One of the most widely used squares is the Dominica die / Le Roy melody, labeled Kyrie \#1 by Hugh Baillie (above, Ex. 3-1). ${ }^{3}$ While this melody is not specifically identified as a square in any of its known sources, modern scholars have included it within the square repertoire with good reason: it can be found in six separate sources four of which contain known squares:

* Lansdowne 462, f.151v (monophonic mensural melody, Dominica die) [early to midfifteenth century]
* VatRE 1146, f. 72v (monophonic mensural melody) [mid-fifteenth century]

[^42]* LonBLR A45-8 (Ludford, Missa Dominica) [c.1525]
* LonBL 30520 (fragment, Ludford, Mass Le Roy) [before c. 1549]
* LonBL 17802-5 (Taverner, Le Roy Kyrie) [before c.1557]
* LonBLM 24 d.2, f.118r (Anonymous, Kyrie) [sixteenth century]

The origin of the Kyrie \#1 melody remains unknown, and the attempt to align it with any plainchant Kyrie, as described in the previous chapter, has yielded no match. Further, this melody maintains a rather high vocal registration in all of its known concordances; this is in comparison with other squares, particularly as seen in Appendix 1. However, certain other square melodies pointed out by Hugh Baillie, such as his Kyrie \#4 found in the Ludford Missa feria iv, sit rather high as well. ${ }^{4}$ These could have been transposed or they could have been composed above a preexisting melodic line, as described in Chapter

## Two.

One of the earliest known sources containing this melody is VatRE 1146, f.72v, a manuscript containing treatises by English theorists dating from about 1450, as well as four monophonic mensural melodies written in black notation. ${ }^{5}$ The Kyrie \#1 melody is the third melody listed, and is labeled "Le Roy." When the melodies were first documented and discussed in Monumenti Vaticani di Paleographia Musicale Latina in 1913, they were thought to be dance tunes for instrumental improvisation. ${ }^{6}$ It was not

[^43]until exact melodic matches were discovered in Lansdowne 462, in melodies labeled as Kyrie tenors for Feria Sexta, Quarta, and Dominica die, that scholars realized the tunes were extracted from, or destined for, liturgical settings.

As Manfred Bukofzer pointed out, the label "Le Roy," may be a reference to the name "Roy Henry" that appears in the Old Hall Manuscript as the composer of an unrelated Gloria (ff. 12v-13) and Sanctus (f. 80v). The identity of this composer has been the topic of debate among scholars for many years; some believe that he may have been King Henry IV of England (reigned 1399-1413) while others believe that Roy Henry was his successor, King Henry V (reigned 1413-1422). It is possible that the name Roy Henry does not actually refer to a monarch, rather to a sobriquet or other nickname. Yet, the placement of the Gloria and Sanctus at the head of their respective sections in the manuscript certainly suggests that the pieces or the composer were considered important. There is admittedly no musical connection between the Roy Henry in the Old Hall Manuscript and the Kyrie \#1 square, but the references Roy Henry and Le Roy are so rare that it seems reasonable to keep open the possibility of a correlation.

As a further note to the label "Le Roy," we do not know when this label was attached to the melody, and it could have been a much later addition. One possibility is that it was a reference to some type of royal involvement with the melody. In particular, many scholars have discussed King Henry VIII as an active composer, and a number of
his compositions may have been based on borrowed melodies. ${ }^{7}$ Perhaps he had some type of performance or composition based on the Kyrie \#1 melody that has since been lost thus prompting the label "Le Roy." Importantly, though, any reference to "The King" in a manuscript probably indicated some type of royal association or interest in the melody. As we know that Henry VIII composed and maintained an interest in music, and his reign coincided with the careers of Ludford and Taverner, his name should be considered among the potential borrowers of the "Le Roy" melody.

The earliest extant piece of polyphony involving this melody is the Nicholas Ludford three-voice Missa Dominica (below, Ex. 3-2) found in LonBL A45-8. These partbooks contain seven Lady Masses by Nicholas Ludford; each Mass assigned to one day of the week, and they represent the only extant collection of daily Masses. Each Mass is further based on a square, and the same square is utilized throughout all of the Mass movements, not just the Kyrie. These are set in four partbooks: three containing the individual parts of the three-voice polyphony, plus one book containing monophonic mensural melodies to fill in the alternatim portions of the Masses. The polyphonic portions include the Ordinary plus alleluias and sequences; and the fourth book, with the alternatim parts, includes offertories and communions copied in chant notation.

[^44]The books were probably copied around 1525 at St. Stephen's Westminster. ${ }^{8}$


Ludford's polyphonic writing is highly syncopated and melismatic, yet the square itself retains its basic outline with minimal ornamentation. This can be seen in the example below (Ex. 3-3), comparing the monophonic Lansdowne 462 melody with the version used by Ludford in the polyphonic portions of the alternatim Kyrie of his Missa Dominica. In certain measures (in the modern transcription), the melody is exactly the same in both the monophonic and polyphonic versions. In other measures, the melody is ornamented with extra notes and broken into smaller rhythmic values, such as in bar 4; or the polyphonic version of the melody is rhythmically offset from the monophonic version, as in bars 20 and 35-36. Regardless of the type of ornamentation or rhythmic variance added to the polyphonic version, almost every transcribed bar of the two respective pieces begins on the same pitch. An exception can be seen in bar 7. Further, the opening few measures of the first and second Kyrie portions are identical.

[^45]Ex. 3-3:


In the Gloria, the melody is far more ornamented, augmented, and altered, sometimes to the point of rendering the distinction between the square and newly composed melodic material unrecognizable. In the following example, the monophonic portions of the alternatim Mass have been extracted for comparison with each other. The square is divided into three sections, corresponding to the divisions for the Kyrie I, Christe, and Kyrie II, and these three melodic segments, in turn, have been used as the melodic basis for both the Gloria and Credo movements (see below, Ex. 3-4A - Ex. 3-4C). The individual verses of the Gloria and Credo have been extracted and set against their corresponding melodic bases in the Kyrie. This way, the level of ornamentation can be seen more clearly, as can the distribution of the Kyrie square throughout different portions of the Gloria and Credo.

Ex. 3-4A: KYRIE I


Ex. 3-4B: CHRISTE


Ex. 3-4C: KYRIE II


Some of the melodic variants in Ludford's setting appear to have been introduced to accommodate the texts of the various Mass movements. One of the more noteworthy versions of the melody might be seen as the first verse of the Gloria (above, Ex. 3-4A).

Here, only the beginning and end of the Kyrie melody is used, most likely to accommodate the limited amount of text provided in this verse. At the same time, there are instances where the opposite is true, where a verse of text contains more words than the chosen melodic portion can rhythmically accommodate. This can be seen in the Credo verses where multiple syllables have been assigned to a single note. This would appear to be an anomaly on Ludford's part, for he generally took considerable care in underlaying the Gloria text. For example, in verse two (using the Kyrie I portion of the melody seen in Ex. 3-4A), he broke the note values at the opening of the Kyrie in order to accommodate the text "gra-ti-as a-gi-mus." It is unclear, then, why he left so many unbroken note values in the Credo, particularly in the Christe section of the melody. Credo verses two and four (using the Christe portion of the melody, seen above in Ex. 34B), leave words such as "natum," "ante," "lumen," "verum," "filio," and "qui locutus" without proper rhythmic underlay. One possibility is that Ludford notated much of his square line in long notes, and a later scribe perceived the need to accommodate the tune to the words of the Gloria. This may have been the case particularly where notes are simply broken without the introduction of melodic variants.

Ludford's use of the square in certain verses, such as Gloria verse six (also using the Christe portion of the melody, seen in Ex. 3-4B), shows a pattern of beginning and sometimes ending a section with the square and then filling in the phrase with freely composed material. Gloria verse six would almost seem to use a different melody if it were not for the opening few notes and final pitches. This pattern of only utilizing the opening and closing pitches of the square appears more frequently in some of the other Lady Masses by Ludford, and it demonstrates a certain level of compositional freedom
applied to the square. In these cases, the square is used as a "spring board," so to speak, in which the general character of the melodic passage is set, but the composer is free to design the remaining passage of music as he sees fit. Gloria verse three (using the Kyrie II portion of the melody, seen above in Ex. 3-4C) reveals this general idea as well, although it follows the square melody somewhat more closely than does verse six.

Another technique for varying the square melody was to change its mensuration. An example can be seen by comparing verses seven and eight of the Credo, shown under the Kyrie II grouping above (Ex. 3-4C). Verse eight represents the original version of the melody (or "original" in comparison with the Kyrie version of the melody), here notated in $C$ ( $4 / 4$ meter in the transcription). A simple change is seen in verse seven, stating the very same melody with minimal elaboration in $\subset$ ( $6 / 8$ in the transcription). The more complicated techniques of mensural alteration begin with examples such as Credo verse four, also found in the Kyrie II grouping above. Verse four compresses the pitches in a format of one measure for every two measures of the Kyrie, yet the melody is still notated in C (Ex. 3-4C, the example notates this in 2/4 to align the pitches). Conversely, an augmentation is created between Gloria verse four and the original Kyrie (also Ex. 3-4C). Two measures of verse four pitches equal one measure of the original Kyrie, yet both are still notated in $\mathcal{C}$ (verse 4 in the example is notated in $12 / 8$ to align the pitches).

The most mensurally complicated verses are probably Gloria three and five (seen above in the Kyrie II list, Ex. 3-4C). Here, Ludford used the square with little regard for maintaining its original mensural/rhythmic scheme. The melody is stretched and compressed, and supplemented with additional pitches in a manner that makes the square
far more difficult to discern.
The treatment of the square in the Sanctus and Agnus Dei involves a rather different approach. Here, there is no implication of alternatim performance, and the square is ornamented and set in segments of a two- versus three-part texture. The two movements open in almost the same way, with the same melodic figures in both the lower two voice parts; and both movements are also particularly syncopated and melismatic, closely resembling the design and style of pieces found in the Caius and Eton Choirbooks. Overall, the Ludford Missa Dominica is one of the more interesting source examples, particularly since the square melody is treated with such variety. The freedom to ornament a square and vary its mensuration and melodic content seems to be the normal practice for Ludford, as he uses these techniques in all of his seven Lady Masses.

Ludford also wrote a four-voice Mass on the Sunday feria melody: the Mass Le roy. Only a fragment of this Mass survives in LonBL 30520B; and the melody occurs at the words "in excelsis" of the Benedictus (below, Ex. 3-5).


Ex. 3-5: LonBL 30520B, Mass Le Roy, Nicholas Ludford, fragment excerpt

This particular fragment was once part of a large choirbook that apparently contained a collection of works by Ashwell and Ludford. ${ }^{9}$ The first folio includes a dedicatory page

[^46]to King Edward VI dated October 5, 1549 - a curious item, particularly since the fragments contain Latin Mass music in a florid polyphonic style. ${ }^{10}$ The reign of King Edward VI was known for its religious reforms; and specifically, the simplification and vernacularization of sacred music. As will be discussed in Chapter Four, the year 1547 saw the issuance of rules that strictly governed these matters. Perhaps this explains why the choirbook was ultimately destroyed.

Despite the pitifully fragmentary state of this source, the polyphonic writing of the Le Roy "in excelsis" appears to be as florid as in Ludford's Missa Dominica. Portions of the other voice parts remain, but they are more fragmented than the line containing the square and a reconstruction of the vertical alignment of these voices is unfortunately no longer possible. The most that can really be discerned here is that this Mass was stylistically florid and written for four voices. This raises a particularly interesting question as well: since both works are so similar with regard to structure, why was this piece entitled Le Roy, while the Lady Mass on this same melody was entitled Dominica die? The titles of these pieces are found on the manuscript pages with the music rather than in an index or some other reference. These titles could have been added by a scribe; or possibly, the melody could have circulated widely with both titles.

Ludford's Missa Dominica was also the first of his seven Lady Masses to be recognized as containing a square - a melody concordantly shared with other pieces of polyphony. This includes the Taverner Leroy Kyrie found in the Gyffard Partbooks (below, Ex. 3-6). These partbooks were probably copied during the reign of Queen Mary

[^47]I for use at St. Paul's, London. ${ }^{11}$ The alternatim Leroy Kyrie was written for four voices rather than three, and the square melody is consistently found in the triplex part (the uppermost line found in the second part book). This is particularly noteworthy, as the extant polyphonic sources of squares rarely set the square in the top voice part.


Ex. 3-6: Gyffard Partbooks, Leroy Kyrie, Taverner, opening excerpt

Furthermore, the final known setting of this melody is even more elaborate: an anonymous Kyrie in the Baldwin Manuscript (LonBLM 24.d2, f. 118r). This is an eclectic source, containing music ranging from about 1440 to 1606 that was copied and compiled by one John Baldwin (d.1615), a singer from Windsor and a gentleman of the

[^48]Chapel Royal. ${ }^{12}$ The wide variety of pieces in this collection was no doubt due to Baldwin's interest in collecting the music of previous generations. The book itself is often referred to as a "commonplace book," or a book which collects music or other items according to the author's interests for future reference. As can be seen in the example below (Ex. 3-7), the square melody is left in a rather simple form and used as the basis for an imitative texture.


Ex. 3-7: LonBLM 24. d.2, f.118r, Kyrieleyson

In some ways, the setting looks more like an instrumental work. For example, the following Tandernaken by Erasmus Lapicida (d.1547) shows the same structural design

[^49]as the Baldwin Kyrie: a fixed melody in the bottom line, supporting two imitative and highly syncopated upper lines that move mostly in thirds and sixths (below, Ex. 3-8). ${ }^{13}$


Ex. 3-8: Petrucci, CantiC, f. 152-156, Tandernaken, Erasmus Lapicida, opening excerpt

The Baldwin Kyrie is also found next to two other anonymous Kyries that are composed in a very similar manner and will be included in the list of potential squares found in Appendix 1. While this setting is for three voices with the square in the lowest voice (as seen in each of the seven Ludford Lady Masses), the level of ornamentation here is quite exceptional, constituting one of the most rhythmically complex and florid settings of any of the extant polyphonic pieces based on squares.

In looking at these six concordances together, each setting utilizes the square within a melismatic texture for either three or four voice parts, and generally ornaments the square less than the melodic lines surrounding it. This leaves the square highly recognizable in all of these sources. In fact, as polyphonically varied as these sources are, the square itself appears remarkably intact in each of these examples, except of

[^50]course in certain verse statements within the Ludford Missa Dominica. In the example below (Ex. 3-9), the square melody from the opening of each of these sources is compared. The melody is virtually the same in each.

Ex. 3-9:


The most significant difference between these sources seems to be in the patterns of ligatures, which becomes more apparent towards the final section of the melody (below, Ex. 3-10). Based on these ligatures, it seems that the Ludford Dominica die Kyrie and the Taverner Le Roy Kyrie are the most closely related.

Ex. 3-10:


Of all the concordant sources of squares, the Kyrie \#1 melody seems to have remained the most intact in all of its sources. Perhaps this says something about the popularity or the significance of the tune. One can further imagine a number of ex tempore settings of the melody as well; and like the Kyrie \#3 melody that will be discussed in Chapter Five, it seems that we are left with the tip of the iceberg of a much wider usage and practice.

KYRIE \#2: THE WHITBROKE MASS UPON THE SQUARE AND DUNSTAPLE'S DOMINICA DIE


Ex. 3-11: Lansdowne 462, f.152, system 2, Dominica die, Dunstable

Kyrie \#2, as the melodic basis of the Kyrie of Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square, represents one of the few examples of a mensural melody connected with the term square. The melody is also preserved among the monophonic mensural melodies of Lansdowne 462 (see above, Ex. 3-11). Overall, the melody appears in four known sources:

[^51]In Lansdowne 462, Kyrie \#3 appears with the label Dominica Die and the name
Dunstaple. However, there are no surviving polyphonic works by Dunstaple that contain this melody. The only polyphonic source that dates from the time of Dunstaple is a fragment held in the London National Archives (LonPR 163/22/1/3v). This source was discovered in 1970 by Roger Bowers and was probably copied sometime around $1455 .{ }^{14}$ It contains four fragmentary Kyries, including one by Power, and was written in score format, similar to the three-voice faburden- and discant-style settings seen in the Old Hall Manuscript. What survives is the outer edges of the folio, with a large gap in the center. The only portions of the square that are visible in this source are bars 9-13 and bars 27-30 of the Lansdowne 462 example (seen above in Ex. 3-11). The composer ascription for this fragmented polyphony is entered in DIAMM as John Dunstaple, and the piece is discussed in Margaret Bent's study Dunstaple, ${ }^{15}$ yet the handwriting of the ascription is highly illegible. The piece very well could have been composed by Dunstaple, but the writing on this particular fragment does not indicate the name. The following example is based on Margaret Bent's transcription of the source found in her study Dunstaple (Ex. 312). ${ }^{16}$

[^52]

Ex. 3-12: LonPR 163/22/1/3v, based on a reconstruction by Bent

One of the more interesting features of this fragment is its cadential structure, where the final sonority is approached in a series of descending parallel sixth chords - a technique that is generally described in modern literature as "Burgundian," or the style that one might hear in Binchois' chansons. Of further note, this Kyrie, dating from the first half of the fifteenth century, does not appear to be based on any known plainchant, as one might expect for a Kyrie setting from this period. In fact, the liberal use of hemiola and the cadential structure mentioned above seem more reminiscent of the Continental chanson repertoire. If this piece had not appeared with the Kyrie text, one might have assumed it was a secular piece.

The Kyrie \#2 melody next appears about seventy years later in Ludford's Missa feria ii, found in Lon BLR A45-48 (below, Ex. 3-13). A comparison between the

Ludford feria ii and the Lansdowne Dominica die of "Dunstaple," shows that the Ludford melody is far more ornamented in the polyphonic sections and is not so easily recognizable as the monophonic melody stated in the opening measures of the Mass. Overall, Ludford's setting of the melody in the Missa feria ii is similar to the Missa Dominica setting discussed above with regard to style and format.

Ex. 3-13:


The final extant source to contain the melody is the Kyrie of William Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square. For the most part, the square is not highly ornamented or altered. The Whitbroke Kyrie also seems to be more melodically related to the Lansdowne 462 melody (below, Ex. 3-14).

Ex. 3-14:


The third section (or Kyrie II section) of the melody, shown above beginning at bar 23, contains the final verse statement of the Whitbroke Kyrie. Previous verses of the Kyrie II section in the Whitbroke Kyrie are melodically compressed to equal two bars for each one of the Lansdowne copy written below in $8 / 4$ to align the pitches (Ex. 3-15). Both are still notated in C mensuration; a technique similar to that used by Ludford in the Missa Dominica discussed above. This type of rhythmic augmentation and diminution is related to the ex tempore practices taught to young singers when they learned to improvise upon lines of plainchant described in Chapter Two; and it is certainly related to much older practices of cantus firmus treatment, such as mensural canons. The full Kyrie of Whitbroke's Mass Upon the Square can be seen in Appendix 2.

Ex. 3-15:


Whitbroke shifts the square between voice parts in his Kyrie (as will be further discussed in Chapter Six), whereas Ludford keeps the square in the lowest voice part. Ludford's method of treatment is generally more varied, involving more extensive use of ornamentation, mensural shifts, and textural changes, while Whitbroke tends to quote the square more literally, with minimal ornamentation. In this regard, Whitbroke and Ludford's polyphonic treatments seem to exemplify opposing trends, just as was seen with the concordant sources of the Le Roy melody.

An added interest in this melody involves its history. The ascription to Dunstaple in Lansdowne 462, if accepted at face value, implies that the melody was almost a hundred years old when Whitbroke and Ludford encountered it. This is a noticeable discrepancy that raises the question as to why these sixteenth-century composers were so interested in a melody that supposedly originated in the early fifteenth century. This discrepancy is a theme that will reoccur throughout the following examples and chapters.

KYRIE \#4: DAMETT'S WORDLESS CREDO AND LUDFORD'S MISSA FERIA IV


Ex. 3-16: Kyrie \#4

The next melody (seen above in Ex. 3-16) ${ }^{17}$ was identified as Kyrie \#4 in Hugh
Baillie's 1960 article. ${ }^{18}$ The melody appears as the melodic basis of Ludford's Missa feria $i v$, yet it does not appear in Lansdowne 462 or in any of the Masses Upon the Square as seen in the previous examples. The melody does appear in the textless bottom line of a three-voice Credo by Thomas Damett found in the Old Hall Manuscript (LonBL
57950), ff. $79 \mathrm{v}-80 .{ }^{19}$


Ex. 3-17: LonBL 57950, ff. 79v-80, Credo, Damett, opening excerpt

[^53]In looking at the Kyrie \#4 melody provided by Baillie (above, Ex. 3-16) in comparison with the Damett setting in Old Hall, it becomes apparent that the melody probably did not originate with the Damett Credo. The melody is particularly short; and it is divided into three sections, more fitting of the Kyrie text. The Damett setting uses repeated statements of the Kyrie \#4 melody in order to accommodate the overall length of the Credo text. This bottom line (the tenor) often sits higher than the middle line (the contratenor) in the Damett setting, and these the two lower voices occasionally overlap and interweave.

Of all the Kyrie squares originally collected by Hugh Baillie, the Kyrie \#4 melody is set in one of the highest registers. Interestingly, there are a small number of Sarum Kyrie plainchants that sit in this register, including Kyrie XXI (opening excerpt seen below, Fig. 3-18); ${ }^{20}$ however, no such plainchant specifically matches any of the voice parts in the Damett Credo.

Ex. 3-18:


The unusually high register of the square, if left untransposed, would also necessitate a higher pitch level for any polyphony built above it, as became the case in the Ludford Missa feria iv (below, Ex. 3-19). Ludford could have easily transposed the melody to a lower pitch level, but he set this three-voice Mass for treble, mean, and tenor.

[^54]

Ky - ri
Ex. 3-19: LonBLR A45-48, Ludford Missa feria iv, opening excerpt of polyphony

In the Credo of Ludford's Mass, the composer incorporated a number of duet sections with various combinations of two voice parts (below, Fig. 3-20). The square is also highly ornamented, to the point of being almost unrecognizable in comparison with the Damett example, except that it maintains its high pitch level.


Ex. 3-20: Ludford Credo, opening excerpt

Beyond their common citation of the square melody, there appear to be no musical connections between the Damett and Ludford pieces. However, Ludford's choice of melodic basis for a polyphonic work is drawn from a much older convention, providing another example of a sixteenth-century composer drawing on the melodies of the
fifteenth century. ${ }^{21}$

SANCTUS \#6: MUNDY'S FIRST MASS UPON THE SQUARE AND THE FLITCHAM MANUSCRIPT


Ex. 3-21: Lansdowne 462, f.1v, twelfth system, Sanctus

The collection of monophonic mensural melodies in Lansdowne 462 contains a number of Sanctus melodies, and the melody found on the twelfth system of f.1v was used by William Mundy in the Sanctus of his first Mass Upon the Square (above, Ex. 321). As can be seen, this is a particularly plain melody, for there are no mensuration changes, elements of rhythmic variety, or much in the way of ornamentation. In using

[^55]this melody in his first Mass Upon the Square, Mundy changed the mensuration and added various ornaments in order to integrate the melody into the overall profile of the other voice parts (below, Ex. 3-22).


Ex. 3-22: Gyffard Partbooks, Mass Upon the Square 1, Sanctus, William Mundy, opening excerpt

Considering the simple nature of the square as it appears in Lansdowne 462, it seems likely that it originated as a faburden- or discant-style line created against a plainchant. Retroactively aligning the melody with plainchant, as described in Chapter Two, shows that the melody could have been created against Sarum Sanctus IV (transposed up a fifth). ${ }^{22}$ Along similar lines, some sixteenth-century examples of polyphony involving squares were based on melodies that can be traced back to early fifteenth-century sources derived from plainchant, particularly the three-voice, scoreformat literature such as seen in the Old Hall Manuscript. Taking its cue from this observation, my search for such pieces has led to the discovery of a concordant source in

[^56]Flitcham 299, B (NorwichR 299), dating from around 1400 (below, Ex. 3-23). ${ }^{23}$ One of the clues used in this search was the fact that this source is notated in a score format similar to a number of pieces in the Old Hall Manuscript. In speculation, perhaps this format was a popular one for the extraction of preexisting melodies.


The Flitcham manuscript was first discussed by Andrew Hughes in 1978, when he made the original connection with Lansdowne $462 .{ }^{24} \mathrm{He}$ also noted that the bifolium containing this Sanctus setting was folded horizontally along the middle for its use as a cover page around the year $1512,{ }^{25}$ a process similar to that seen in the cases of CambriU 44505(9) (discussed in Chapters Four and Five), LonPR 163/22/1/3v (discussed above), and DoverAC NR/JB (discussed below).

Where and how might Mundy have encountered this particular melody? The priory at Flitcham was a cell of the Augustinian Priory at Walsingham, and the Priory

[^57]owned the manuscript until its Dissolution in $1538 .{ }^{26}$ Did Mundy maintain any connection with this Priory, or did this melody circulate in any number of "books of squares" throughout various parts of England? Did Mundy know where this melody originated? The Flitcham manuscript, Landowne 462, and the Sanctus of Mundy's first Mass Upon the Square all share the same melody, thereby adding to the list of sixteenthcentury polyphonic works that have melodic concordances in early fifteenth-century sources. No other motives or compositional elements are shared between the Mass by Mundy and the Flitcham Sanctus.

## GLORIA \#3: AN ANONMYOUS OLD HALL GLORIA AND THE YORK BINDING FRAGMENTS

While the following example does not involve a correspondence between pieces of polyphony, it does show one of the ways in which musicians extracted squares from polyphonic settings and stored them monophonically for ex tempore and written compositional use. Most of the monophonic mensural melodies in the Lansdowne 462 collection are extractions of complete bottom lines from preexisting polyphonic works. However, there are occasional examples, such as the Magnificat found on f.152, that were extracted in a pre-ready alternatim format - a format that would indicate an intended purpose for ex tempore performance (between plainchant and ex tempore harmony built on the monophonic mensural line). This Lansdowne 462 Magnificat is a monophonic mensural melody, copied like the other squares in Lansdowne 462, only its text includes the alternating verses of the Magnificat text (i.e. every other verse, since the plainchant would fill in the missing verses).

A similar format occurs with the monophonic mensural Gloria that appears in a

[^58]series of fragmented paper binding strips found in YorkB 9, A recto. Like the Landowne 462 Magnificat, the monophonic mensural Gloria in the York binding strips appears with fragmentary references to every other verse of the Gloria text (below, Ex. 3-24).


Ex. 3-24: YorkB 9, A recto, fragmented Gloria, monophonic mensural melody

Despite the fragmentary nature of the source, it is still apparent that the extracted line was set for alternatim performance. This is confirmed by a melodic concordance with a polyphonic Gloria found in the Old Hall manuscript, f.3v (below, Ex. 3-25). In comparing these two sources, it can be seen that the York Gloria was fashioned from a melodic extraction of every other verse seen in the Old Hall example. ${ }^{27}$

[^59]

The question here, then, is why did the scribe not copy the entire melodic line? Most likely, he intended it only for alternatim performance and he was not concerned with the integrity of the melody. The York copyist could have also encountered the melody in this pre-made alternatim form. Extant archival references to the copying of squares seem to indicate that these melodies were transmitted at a fairly frequent rate, but in certain cases, they may have been tailored for the liturgical needs of individual parishes and churches. Examples such as the alternatim York fragments may one day provide clues to the individual practices of various institutions.

## TWO MAGNIFICATS: QUESTIONABLE MONOPHONIC MENSURAL CONCORDANCES

The use of squares in various pieces of written and ex tempore polyphony is not
limited to Mass movements only. As can be seen in Appendix I, there are also votive pieces and hymns based on squares. Some of these melodies in Appendix I are found in polyphonic settings, and others remain only as monophonic mensural melodies. Many of these melodies may have been further used in ex tempore performances.

Examples of monophonic mensural melodies (that are not from Mass Ordinary movements) copied for compositional and ex tempore performance can be found by sorting through the extant literature, preserved in collections such as Lansdowne 462 or on the page margins of various service books. In such a search, I have found the following two Magnificats, both copied monophonically in DoverAC NR/JB and in LonBL C.52.b.21. ${ }^{28}$ These two sources provide examples of the levels of melodic discrepancy that can occur between squares (as monophonic mensural melodies). In the first case, the two copies of a Magnificat melody are obviously related; but in the second case, the two copies of the melody have enough differences to merit questioning their relationship. The first example can be seen below (Ex. 3-26). The two copies have been aligned to show their relationship.


Ex. 3-26: opening excerpts

[^60]The two copies have the same mensuration and the same melodic profile, yet they still reveal a few differences. For example, the first section of the melody (separated from the second by the double bar lines) undergoes melodic variation for two measures, beginning around bar 5, yet both sources end on the pitch F. The second sections begin on the same pitch, but no further correspondence is discernable after that, and the sources end up concluding the section on different pitches. The next section begins in a similar manner. Why might these two melodies display such discrepancies when the opening phrases were so faithfully preserved? As seen in the other case studies above, many of the composers using squares in polyphony maintained "recognizable" versions of their squares. Perhaps this was not the case with squares intended for ex tempore performance. Both of these copies (seen in Ex. 3-26) could have been written down after an ex tempore performance of the melody, which might account for these variations. Both begin with the same faburden-style pattern and then "diverge" into freer treatment. This might indicate a particular practice among musicians that formulaically prepares or introduces an ex tempore performance. The musicians could begin with a familiar faburden-like formula, ensuring that they are comfortable and prepared before diverging into ex tempore discant or countering. ${ }^{29}$

Each of these manuscripts contain copies of another related Magnificat, but with a far greater level of variation between the two readings (below, Ex. 3-27A and B).

[^61]Ex. 3-27A:


Ex. 3-27B:


The biggest differences seem to be in rhythm and mensuration. This second pair of Magnificats represents an example of the rhythmic variety that could be applied to any monophonic non-mensural melody created against a chant line. The opening passages share the same pitches, but they begin to differ further into the melody. Most of these differences happen in the second half of each verse section, and then the two Magnificats
return to the same pitches in later passages. There are at least two structural possibilities here: first, the two Magnificats are just highly variant copies of the same melody based on a previous performance; or second, the formulas for creating faburden-style lines, such as these Magnificats, were so universal as to create highly related lines against the same originating chant in different locations.

The writing down of monophonic mensural melodies, such as these Magnificats, indicates that they were intended to be used again, or at least documented for some type of posterity or record. As mentioned above, Aplin seemed to think that this practice of extracting and reusing monophonic mensural melodies was not very widespread, but the contrary may indeed be true. The evidence for it, though, requires some diligent searching and the acceptance that copies of the same melody might embody considerable variation, even to the point of rendering their relationships questionable. For example, if these two monophonic Magnificats shown above did share a common antecedent - as opposed to being two separate improvisations against the same chant that coincidentally contain a high number of melodic similarities - it would indicate that squares could enjoy a considerable amount of variation in their creation and copying. The rhythmic discrepancies might also be due to the nature of copying squares: namely, that some squares were probably copied in non-mensural notation (as seen in Chapter Two), and the performers were expected to devise their own mensural rhythms. The other examples of squares in the case studies discussed previously in this chapter seem to indicate that once a square was adapted to polyphony, composers tended to keep the melody in a generally recognizable form. Exceptions to this are the Gloria and Credo movements of Ludford's seven Lady Masses.

## A MONOPHONIC MENSURAL STELLA CELI



The monophonic mensural melody Stella celi extirpavit, appears in the first system of f.152v in Lansdowne 462 (above, Ex. 3-28) - a somewhat curious addition to this collection of mostly Kyrie and Sanctus melodies. The same Stella celi melody also appears in monophonic non-mensural form in two separate manuscripts: OxfBLC 64v and LonBLR 7.A.VI (opening excerpts seen below, Ex. 3-29).

Ex. 3-29:


These latter two examples were copied into their respective manuscripts in stroke notation, presumably so that future musicians could design their own mensural and rhythmic schemes for the melody. The three concordant copies of the Stella celi are all monophonic, suggesting that there was little interest in preserving or propagating any particular rhythmicization or harmonization of the tune. Thus the freedom to create new mensural rhythms and ex tempore harmony may have held a certain attraction for performers working with squares.

The use of the Stella celi was the topic of a recent paper by Christopher Macklin, who discussed the importance of this text and music as a response to the various plague outbreaks that occurred in the fifteenth century. The Stella celi text, without musical notation, was widely copied in this period, ${ }^{30}$ and one of the earliest known polyphonic versions of the text is a three-voice discant motet attributed to John Cooke in the Old Hall Manuscript. ${ }^{31}$ Further musical sources of the text include a plainsong melody in a Liber Cantus (CambriU 6668, f.112r-v), a separate plainsong in a Sarum processional in the Norwich Castle Museum (NorwichCM 158.926.4e, ff.133v-134), and the monophonic tenor found in Lansdowne $462 .{ }^{32}$ Later polyphonic settings of the Stella celi text appear in the Eton Choirbook (EtonC 178) and twice in the Ritson Manuscript (LonBL 5665). Manfred Bukofzer also discussed this text, noting that the tenor of a Stella celi setting attributed to Guillaume le Rouge is identical to that of the chanson So ys

[^62]emprentid, ${ }^{33}$ and Macklin has pointed out that this same melody has a number of further concordances. ${ }^{34}$ Melodies such as this, with multiple concordant sources are certainly related to the spread and use of squares, as will be further explained in Chapter Five in the context of the Or me veult melody.

While the above examples can only provide a handful of "snapshots" into the compositional and performance treatment of squares, they do provide some indication of the degree of practical and creative freedom associated with the practice. Musicians did not seem to be limited by form, structure, ornamental style, mensuration, or any other considerations when approaching written composition upon a square. This is significant, considering that the three extant Masses Upon the Square and the seven Lady Masses by Ludford display such high levels of stylistic and structural similarity. William Mundy and William Whitbroke probably collaborated in their formats to create the set of three Masses Upon the Square, as will be further discussed in Chapter Six.

At the beginning of this chapter, a series of questions was proposed concerning the interrelations between different pieces of written polyphony based on the same square. First, what, if anything, did a composer using a square take from a previous polyphonic treatment of that square? The above enquiry has indicated that no known melodic material, other than the square itself, was shared between different composers. Even multiple pieces written by the same composer may display marked differences,

[^63]including the name of the melody itself, as seen in Ludford's Le Roy and Dominica Die examples. We do not know what sources composers were using when selecting a square. They could have acquired their squares from purely monophonic sources, from complete pieces of polyphony involving a square, or they could have remembered squares from ex tempore performances.

Second, in comparing polyphonic correspondences, are there any specific compositional traits that seem to recur in a way as to suggest there are techniques specifically associated with squares? There definitely seems to have been a penchant for florid, syncopated melismatic polyphony in the written sources of square settings. However, most of these sources date from the first half of the sixteenth century, and they seem to resemble the florid style of other pieces from this period that are not based on squares. This stylistic profile, then, may be more related to the time period in which the squares were set than to the genre per se; or at least more related to retrospective attempts at pre-Reformation composition, such as in the case of the exceptionally florid Baldwin Kyrie.

On the other hand, the extant polyphonic sources of squares only contain settings written for either three or four voice parts, rather than five or more. This may be due to the specific performance contexts for which square settings were composed, rather than to any particular rule for composing with squares. Lady Masses, for example, were generally performed in Lady chapels, small side chapels, or intimate settings; and would not have required many singers. At the same time, most commissioned Masses appear to
have been performed in small side chapels or intimate settings. ${ }^{35}$ In this sense, the form and structure of these pieces may have been dictated mostly by the performance setting. These Lady Masses could have been, in a sense, stylizations of something that would more typically have been performed ex tempore. Another consideration may be that the practice of composing on a square, or on some other preexistent melody of some age or temporal distance from the performers, might have invoked the esteem of an ancient and venerable practice handed down from generation to generation.

Concerning ornamentation, some of the polyphonic examples, such as the Ludford Lady Masses, do ornament the square, while others, such as the Taverner Le Roy Kyrie, do not ornament the melody at all. This being said, it is important to remember that there are no known original forms for these melodies, and that "ornamentation" is really just a type of variance, as are melodic transpositions. Based on our current knowledge of the extant repertory of polyphonic square pieces, it seems that squares, as a type, did not call for any specific musical procedure or treatment and could be adapted flexibly to what the composer intended or his responsibilities demanded.

While some squares seem to have enjoyed long compositional lives, other potential squares seem to have generated no surviving polyphonic settings. Why might this be so? The most realistic answer to this question is that we are probably missing most of the written evidence, and also that the vast majority of performances on a square were likely sung ex tempore. Two particular melodies come to mind in this connection: the Le Roy melody mentioned above, and the Or me veult melody that will be discussed

[^64]in Chapter Five. These two melodies seem to have enjoyed the most widespread use, yet their individual construction or melodic profile is not significantly different than that of the other squares collected in Appendix I. Perhaps these two melodies carried a significance now unknown, which ensured their widespread use, just as in the case of the Continental L'homme armé melody. Perhaps they functioned as the topic of a musical "game" or challenge for a particular group of composers, namely Taverner, Whitbroke, Mundy, Ludford, and a few of their colleagues. The important point here is that the differences between squares and square usage might be accounted for by setting and purpose. ${ }^{36}$

[^65]
## CHAPTER 4

## A JUBILATE DEO FOR THREE MEN AND A CHILD <br> UPON THE SQUARE OF IN EXITU ISRAEL

So far, the discussion of squares has focused on evidence contained in practical musical sources. However, there are also documentary references found in church and university archival records that provide important information concerning the practice of performing and composing upon a square. ${ }^{1}$ Most of these are financial records for the remuneration of musicians who copied "square note," "square song," and Masses said to be based on squares. Other references include the records for hiring musicians with the skills to teach "square note," faburden, and other ex tempore practices as described in Chapter Two. Despite the number of currently known documentary references to squares, only one of these, Cambridge University Additional Manuscript 4405(9), (CambriU 4405(9)) identifies any squares by title. This one manuscript leaf was used as a title and cover page for two polyphonic works based on squares that have since been lost: the verso side cites "the square of In exitu Israel" as the basis for a polyphonic rendition of the text Jubilate Deo, and the recto side contains a similarly penned heading for a Communion "upon the Square of Ormaveute" by William Whitbroke. The recto title of this manuscript was first mentioned by Margaret Bent in connection with the Or me veult melody (to be discussed in the next chapter), and notification of it was published in David Fallows' A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs. ${ }^{2}$ To my knowledge, no one has discussed the verso side of the leaf.

Overall, the two polyphonic titles contained on this leaf, along with the three

[^66]Masses Upon the Square that will be discussed in Chapter Six, make a total of five contemporary references to squares by title. This one manuscript, then, represents one of the most tantalizing references to squares that have survived from the period. While it poses some difficulties of interpretation, it still provides important information concerning the overall practice of composing upon a square, and will be discussed as follows:

* CambriU 4405(9): concerning this manuscript and the specific information provided in the verso title
* The square of In exitu Israel: the potential origin of the square extracted from a preexisting polyphonic setting
* The .C. Psalm Jubilate Deo: the title of the lost piece
* The designation "for three men and a child": and what this might potentially indicate in terms of a compositional framework
* A possible composer: a look at the two names penned underneath the verso title
* A potential piece of corresponding polyphony: an example of a piece that matches these criteria
* The temporal frame of the missing Jubilate Deo


## THE MANUSCRIPT

CambriU 4405(9) is a single sheet of vellum that was part of a collection of fragments collected by A.G.W. Murray, a librarian at Trinity College, and was donated to Cambridge University Library in the early twentieth century. Other fragments in this collection include: ${ }^{3}$

[^67]* copies of an indulgence printed in 1498 by Wynkyn de Worde and found with others in the binding of a Latin Bible printed at Venice in 1495
* four leaves, one signed qiii, of Chepman and Myllar's edition (c. 1508) of Blind Harry's Wallace
* a leaf of an unknown Pilgrim's book, printed by Pynson about 1513, containing a reference to Dante's tomb at Ravenna
* four leaves of an octavo Sarum Breviary printed at Venice by J. Herzog about 1493-4
* leaf xliii of a book in Veldener's type 8, which may be the unknown first part of CA 1675
* several leaves of the edition of Holt's Lac puerorum printed at Antwerp about 1500 by Adriaen van Berghen
* a packet of fragments found in the binding of a law book printed by R. Tottell in 1556 apparently waste from the printing office of Dirick van der Straten at Wesel. Among these are fragments of the "Ipswich" 1548 edition of Bale's Scriptores, whose provenance is established by the identity of the types. Murray had begun a paper on these fragments but it was never completed
* A single leaf of the Psalter of 1459. This final entry contains the two titles for the lost pieces "upon the square." The titles were most likely added to the leaf in the first half of the sixteenth century

As can be seen, the contents of this inventory are somewhat arbitrary, other than
Murray's apparent interest in collecting items from the late fifteenth and early sixteenth century, and there is nothing to indicate when, where, and how he acquired the single leaf of the 1459 Psalter. ${ }^{4}$ It seems that this leaf was also used as scrap paper, for it contains filigree designs (perhaps used in the incipit of a musical staff), mathematical figures, handwriting practice, and various other pen trials. ${ }^{5}$

[^68]With the aid of digital photographic scans, it has been possible to decipher most of the words listed in the verso inscription, including the Jubilate Deo title. In the margins of the folded sheet is the penned title of a piece as follows:
> $<$ Th>e .C. Psalme, Jubilate deo, iiii par<tes>
> $<$ ffor> iii men and a Childe, to be songe in <the>
> $<$ ste $>$ ade or place off Benedictus ffor sydes ad placitum
> upon the Square of
> In Exitu
> Israel de Eg<ypto>

This is followed by two names that reference a "Bomett," or "Bonmett," or "Bormett," and a "Bentaa." The two names appear to have been written by a different hand from that of the title, and they may have been added at a later time.

Both titles (on the verso and recto sides of the manuscript) look to have been written in a similar hand, and both are positioned in similar locations on the page. The diagram below (Ex. 4-1) provides a model of how the page is oriented. The original vellum leaf was removed from its binding in the Psalter, turned on its side and folded in half. The left side of the page was folded back and fitted underneath the right side of the page to form a cover - where music could be slipped in between the sheets from the right side. The title of the piece based on the In exitu Israel square is written in the top right margins, around the edge of the Psalter text.

Ex. 4-1:


The fold in the middle of CambriU 4405(9) contains small holes where the pages of polyphony were most likely sewn together and physically attached to the manuscript as a cover page. At some point, the manuscript cover was reversed (folded inside-out) to become the cover page for a Communion setting by Whitbroke; or vice versa. It is not clear whether the manuscript held the Jubilate Deo or the Whitbroke Communion first. The most that can be determined is that the side with the Jubilate Deo title experienced a great deal of wear and tear, as the text is far more smudged and faded than the title of the Whitbroke Communion.

The very top of the page, oriented as seen in the model above (Ex. 4-1), is extremely difficult to decipher and it has not been included in the above inscription. At most, the word "pari" or "partis" is visible, shortly followed by the letters "h" or "he," perhaps part of the word, "the." These letters are so faded that they could also be part of a composer name or place of origin. Or, to the contrary, they seem to have been part of an earlier title that has since been scratched off the page to make room for the Jubilate Deo
title. While the top line of this inscription is virtually illegible, the remaining portions of the text can be deciphered through digital photographic magnification. The title then serves as a "face-value" reading, providing clues about the type of polyphony that may have once been contained within this vellum leaf. The verso title indicates that the lost piece was called Jubilate Deo (the hundredth Psalm); it was written for four voice parts; it was performed by three men and a child; it was intended as a substitution for the Benedictus to be used ad placitum; and it was based on an In exitu Israel square.

## UPON THE SQUARE OF IN EXITU ISRAEL

The title of the missing Cambridge piece indicates that it was based on a square: the extracted lower voice part of a pre-composed polyphonic setting. In this case, that basis was a melodic line extracted from a setting of In exitu Israel, or psalm 113 (Vulgate):

When Israel came out of Egypt, the house of Jacob from among the strange people. Judah was his sanctuary: and Israel his dominion. The sea saw that and fled: Jordan was driven back. The mountains skipped like rams: and the little hills like young sheep. What aileth thee, O thou sea, that thou fleddest: and thou Jordan that thou wast driven back? Ye mountains that ye skipped like rams: and ye little hills like young sheep? Tremble thou earth at the presence of the Lord: at the presence of the God of Jacob.

The In exitu Israel text, with or without music, was used for three specific occasions: the sacraments of the dying, Sunday Vespers (during certain times of the year), and Easter Vespers. In the final rites, when this service was possible, In exitu Israel was intended for the moment immediately after death when the soul leaves the body. The response Subvenite sancti Dei was said, followed by the verse Suscipiat te Christus and the psalm

In exitu Israel or Dilexi quoniam with the antiphon Chorus angelorum. ${ }^{6}$ This text is also found in the Mystery play d'Elx for the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin (upon her death and Ascension into Heaven), ${ }^{7}$ as well as in Dante's Divine Comedy (Purgatory Part II), where a boat piloted by an Angel carries newly deceased souls to purgatory while they sing In exitu Israel. ${ }^{8}$

As a plainchant or polyphonic setting, In exitu Israel was also used during Sunday Vespers and as a psalm with antiphon sung during Vespers on Easter day. The latter context, for Easter Vespers, existed from at least the ninth century and is described in Pierre Batiffol's History of the Roman Breviary. After the psalmody, the clergy would walk in procession to the rood screen as they sang the psalm Laudate pueri with Alleluyas. There, at the rood screen, they sang the Magnificat for a second time within the service, and a second collect. The procession would then proceed to the baptismal font as they sang the psalm In exitu Israel with Alleluyas; and there they sang the Magnificat for a third time, and a third collect. ${ }^{9}$ Denis Stevens adds that a second context

[^69]for the In exitu Israel existed if the clerics did not process to the rood screen. In this case, the Laudate pueri was used during the procession to the baptismal font and the In exitu Israel was used during the return procession from the font. ${ }^{10}$

The processional psalm In exitu Israel was probably performed with ex tempore polyphony, and at least one Processional contains various psalm tones with modifications made to the manuscript: specifically, the erasure of portions of the original plainsong and its substitution with alternatim settings in monophonic mensural notation. LonBLH 2945, ff. 67-70 contains an In exitu Israel setting that was altered in this very manner (below, Ex. 4-2). This particular source provides the only known example of the In exitu Israel text with mensural notation in any of the fifteenth-century English sources. ${ }^{11}$

Stevens mentioned this example as well, pointing out the consistent manner in which the upward leap of a fourth occurs at the beginning of every verse. ${ }^{12}$ He interpreted this motion as an indication of a fauxbourdon performance, or a "hybrid...neither bourdon, fauxbourdon, nor discant," yet still "mechanical" in form since complex florid polyphony would be difficult to perform in procession. ${ }^{13}$ In this sense, the psalm-tone basis, as a simplified melodic form, would facilitate the easy addition of ex tempore harmony.


[^70]
fa - cta est__ iu - de - a san $-\mathrm{cti}-\mathrm{fi} \quad \mathrm{ca}-\mathrm{ci}-\mathrm{o} \quad$ e


Ex. 4-2: LonBLH 2945, f.67, In exitu Israel, opening excerpt

This "mechanical" style also appears on the Continent in Binchois' setting of In exitu Israel, yet his example is through-composed rather than alternatim (below, Ex. 43). ${ }^{14}$ According to Barbara Haggh, this setting by Binchois is the earliest polyphonic setting of In exitu Israel to survive. Here, as opposed to the source in Ex. 4-2, Binchois' setting was most likely designed for the rites of the recently deceased as it lacks the Alleluias and alternatim format. ${ }^{15}$

[^71]

Ex. 4-3: In exitu Israel, Binchois, opening excerpt

This particular setting was discussed in a recent study by Mattias Lundberg concerning the use of the tonus peregrinus in polyphonic settings. Vocal fauxbourdon, as seen in Binchois' setting (and above in LonBLH 2945), became a dominant polyphonic device for psalmody. ${ }^{16}$ This connection was described by theorists such as Gafurius in 1496: ${ }^{17}$

Singers, moreover, call this type of counterpoint fauxbourdon: in it, this middle part, contratenor, very often follows the notes of the cantus, proceeding at the interval of a fourth below it. It is very often observed by musicians in the singing of Psalms.

Lundberg points out that Gafurius regards the cantus as the core of the structure, whereas the psalm-tone terminationes in his own three-part examples always occur in the tenor part. Within Binchois' example above, the tonus peregrinus (serving as the cantus firmus) migrates from the top voice and finishes in the tenor in a manner that was to

[^72]become common in the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries. ${ }^{18}$ The importance of this format in the discussion at hand is its relationship with the polyphonic treatment of certain squares. The idea of a migrating cantus firmus was seen in the creation of squares in Chapter Two, particularly involving some of the polyphonic Mass movements in the Old Hall Manuscript. Further, the use of squares as a migrating cantus firmus will appear in Chapter Six concerning the three Masses Upon the Square by William Whitbroke and William Mundy.

Further Continental polyphonic settings of In exitu Israel are somewhat rare, but include settings by Josquin and Ludwig Senfl. Of particular interest, though, is the setting found in Montecassino Biblioteca dell'Abbazia MS 871, (MonteA 871). ${ }^{19}$ This is a setting of Neopolitan origin that follows a similar format to the description of the missing Cambridge Jubilate Deo (below, Ex. 4-4). ${ }^{20}$


[^73]

Ex. 4-4: MonteA 871, In exitu Israel, Pietro Oriola

The Montecassino manuscript contains works by both Continental and English composers including Bedingham, Frye, and Dunstaple. ${ }^{21}$ The In exitu Israel is ascribed to one Pietro Oriola [Orihuela] (fl.c.1440-1484), a Spanish composer who was employed as a singer at the court of Alfonso V of Aragon in Naples. ${ }^{22}$ As can be seen, the Oriola In exitu Israel is scored for mean, two tenors, and a bass. It is homophonic, breaking

[^74]the text into short phrases with the occasional syncopated melodic figure that leads to a cadence point (such as seen in bars 6-7), and harmonized in a style reminiscent of fauxbourdon. In fact, the Oriola In exitu Israel sounds more like an English Reformed setting than a Continental work dating from some time in the mid-fifteenth century.

A sixteenth-century source of this text is found in the Gyffard Partbooks: a setting by John Sheppard, [William] Byrd, and William Mundy (below, Ex. 4-5).


Ex. 4-5: Gyffard Partbooks, In exitu Israel, Sheppard, Byrd, Mundy, opening excerpt

While this piece does not resemble the homophonic style of the Binchois example, it is still constructed over repeated portions of a mensural melody (seen above in partbook 17805). This voice part is divided into two sections that are repeated and slightly varied over the course of the polyphonic piece: the same constructional concept used in the LonBLH 2945 and Binchois settings. The composer of the lost Cambridge Jubilate Deo, could have extracted the bottom line of any of these settings (or others currently
unknown), and used it as a square. At the same time, it is particularly questionable whether or not examples such as the Binchois or Oriola pieces were available to the composer of the lost Cambridge Jubilate.

With this constructional process in mind, one particularly important question remains: why use the In exitu Israel melody as the basis of a Jubilate Deo setting? This is especially intriguing since, as mentioned, the In exitu Israel square was probably derived from one of the psalm tones. Hundreds of polyphonic pieces and performances were derived from the psalm tones, which makes the specific title designation "of In exitu Israel" that much more striking. The psalm tones are not necessarily the most interesting of chant lines for devising ex tempore harmony, and any harmony based on the psalm tones would be somewhat limited melodically. As will be discussed further, this limitation in a square melody may have been a very specific choice for the lost Cambridge Jubilate Deo. Otherwise, the knowledge of any symbolic or contextual connection between the In exitu Israel and Jubilate Deo texts is currently lacking.

## THE .C. PSALM, JUBILATE DEO

The first visible line of the Cambridge verso title references the hundredth psalm, labeled "<th>e .C. Psalm, Jubilate deo." This is followed by "in <the> <ste>ade or place of Benedictus ffor sydes ad placitum;, ${ }^{23}$ indicating that it should be used as a substitute

[^75]for the Benedictus of Lauds or Morning Prayer. The 1559 Book of Common Prayer contains rubrics for such a service as described by this title inscription: ${ }^{24}$

And after the second Lesson shall be used and said, Benedictus, in English as followeth: [Benedictus
BLESSED be the Lord God of Israel: for he hath visited and redeemed his people. And hath raised up a mighty salvation for us: in the house of his servant David. As he spake by the mouth of his holy prophets: which have been since the world began.

That we should be saved from our enemies: and from the hands of all that hate us.
To perform the mercy promised to our forefathers: and to remember his holy covenant.

To perform the oath which he swore to our forefather Abraham: that he would give us.
That we being delivered out of the hands of our enemies: might serve him without fear.

In holiness and righteousness before him: all the days of our life.
And thou child shalt be called the Prophet of the Highest: for thou shalt go before the face of the Lord, to prepare his ways.

To give knowledge of salvation unto his people: for the remission of their sins.
Through the tender mercy of our God: whereby the dayspring from on high hath visited us.

To give light to them that sit in darkness, and in the shadow of death: and to guide our feet into the way of peace.

Glory be to the Father, and to the Son: and to the Holy Ghost.
As it was in the beginning, is now, and ever shall be: world without end. Amen.
Or else this Psalm.
[Jubilate Deo. Ps. 100
O BE joyful in the Lord all ye lands: serve the Lord with gladness, and come before his presence with a song.

Be ye sure that the Lord he is God: it is he that hath made us, and not we ourselves, we are his people, and the sheep of his pasture.
to a traditional performance setup with decani (the South, or right side when facing the altar) and cantoris (the North, or left side).
${ }^{24}$ John E. Booty, ed., The Book of Common Prayer 1559: The Elizabethan Prayer Book, Folger Shakespeare Library, Washington, D.C., 20003 (1976), 56-58. Another version of this text appears as follows: "O all you lands the treasures of your joy / In merry shout upon the Lord bestow. / Your service cheerfully on him employ / With triumph song into his presence go. / Know first that he is God, and after know / This God did us, not we ourselves, create. / We are his flock, for us his feedings grow; / We are his folk, and he upholds our state. / With thankfulness, oh enter then his gate; / Make through each porch of his your praises ring. / All good, all grace, of his high name relate; / He of all grace and goodness is the spring. / Time in no terms his mercy comprehends; / From age to age his truth itself extends." See Sandra Bell, Marie Loughlin, Patricia Irace, The Broadview Anthology of Sixteenth-Century Poetry and Prose (Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview Press, 2011), 757.

O go your way into his gates with thanksgiving, and into his courts with praise: be thankful unto him, and speak good of his name.

For the Lord is gracious, his mercy is everlasting: and his truth endureth from generation to generation.

Glory be to the Father, and to the Son, etc.
As it was in the beginning, is now, and ever shall be: world without end. Amen.

Jubilate Deo was the second of the fixed psalms for Lauds on Sundays and certain festivals. After the liturgical reforms in the first half of the sixteenth century, it was adopted as a responsory canticle (in 1552), and was used when the rubrics directed the Benedictus to be omitted in Morning Prayer, as seen in the excerpt above. The provision for substituting the Benedictus happened for a variety of reasons, including when the Benedictus text already occurred in the Lesson or Gospel for the day, as it did on February 18, June 17, June 24, and October 15. ${ }^{25}$ In his influential historical commentary on the Book of Common Prayer printed in 1858, William Henry Pinnock explains: ${ }^{26}$

The Benedictus stood alone in the first liturgy of 1549 and has frequently been preferred to the Jubilate since the introduction of the Psalm as an optional alternative, yet there are many clergymen who use the Jubilate universally, considering the Benedictus as only applicable to a particular circumstance and therefore less suitable to the jubilant character of praise and thanksgiving from all lands and every Christian congregation. This however is completely a matter of opinion and the officiating minister is left by the Rubric to his own choice. On occasions of thanksgiving the Jubilate is certainly to be preferred.

If Pinnock's description is correct, the missing Cambridge Jubilate Deo could have been used on a very regular basis. What becomes particularly striking, then, is that there are so

[^76]few extant settings of Jubilate Deo that can be dated from this period. Once again, the text was not frequently used until after the reforms and there are no known settings of the text in fifteenth-century English sources. ${ }^{27}$

According to Kenneth Elliot, a setting of the Jubilate Deo text was made by Robert Johnson (c.1500-1560). Johnson was a Scottish composer who wrote a number of Latin works designed for the Roman Rite in the 1520 's and 1530's; but also participated in the first attempts to adapt Latin compositions to English words in the 1540's. He composed music for the English Morning Communion and Evening Service, written entirely in a homophonic style, including a Jubilate Deo, Benedictus, Te Deum, Magnificat, and Nunc Dimittis. ${ }^{28}$ Another Jubilate Deo setting was composed by Thomas Whythorne (1528-1596), an English lutenist and composer. He was a student at Oxford who left for the Continent during the reign of Mary I. He returned to England in 1555 and later became a private tutor at Trinity College, Cambridge. ${ }^{29}$ Both of these men would have been in a temporal position to potentially find their Jubilate Deo settings enclosed within CambriU 4405(9). Whythorne, in particular, who maintained connections with Cambridge could have written his setting for one of the Colleges there. Thus far, my search for both of these composers' Jubilate Deo settings has not led to positive results, but an anonymous Jubilate Deo setting found in the Lumley Partbooks will be discussed further below.

[^77]
## FOR THREE MEN AND A CHILD

The titles contained on both sides of CambriU 4405(9) indicate that the missing pieces were designed "for three men and a child." Such a designation could convey a number of meanings. Perhaps the pieces contained in the manuscript cover were written at an appropriate level of difficulty for a young singer, and perhaps even used as a training exercise. The designation could have also served a more practical purpose; for example, as a useful descriptor for a choirmaster who needed to sort pieces by performance forces. Overall, though, the part designation refers to specified voice ranges, a distinction that is somewhat rare among the extant musical literature. Clive Burgess and Andrew Wathey have pointed out the archival records of All Saints' Bristol, including a list of books given to the church between 1535 and 1536, drawn up by the proctor William Young. Among the list of donations are the following: ${ }^{30}$

* Item v Antem boks ffor men and chylder
* Item v mass boks ffor men [and] chylder
* Item iiij Square boks
* Item v masse boks which were bought of Mr Mawnsell for men and chylder
* Item more bought of Sir Wyllyam Deane iiij boks of massys for men and chylder
* Item iiij boks of keryes and Allaluyas ffor men and chylder

A further and rather extensive donation was made by one William Brigeman, who had been a clerk at Eton College in 1503 and died in Bristol in 1524. Brigeman stipulated that his donation was to be made "under the condition that no children were to be taught

[^78]upon the said books, scrolls and rolls. ${ }^{, 31}$ Perhaps Brigeman was concerned that children would not be responsible in caring for the materials; otherwise, it is entirely unknown why he made the stipulation. Certain locations, such as All Saints’ Bristol, may have fostered performances and written polyphony with the education and performances of children in mind, and Brigeman had to specify (for whatever reason) that he did not want these books used for such purposes. ${ }^{32}$

An example of an extant polyphonic work with this title designation appears in the Gyffard Partbooks: a setting of In pace for three Men and a Childe by John Taverner (below, Ex. 4-6).


It is particularly useful to see the vocal ranges and designations in a contemporary piece of polyphony bearing this title designation. The top voice is written for the lower end of a treble range, or a mean range, plus two tenors and a bass. ${ }^{33}$ Of further interest is the top

[^79]voice, written entirely in longs, or uniformly square-shaped notes. Perhaps such pieces, with sustained note values in the top voice part, were part of the idiom for works involving "three men and a child." To clarify, as this is the only known polyphonic work with this title, such an inference certainly needs more evidence.

As a side note, David Wulstan has provided an admirable study of just how much singing was done by children, particularly at Cardinal College, Oxford under the direction of John Taverner. Special service days, such as Christmas, involved an even more intense singing schedule for both men and boys. Wulstan relates that: ${ }^{34}$
[Taverner's Christmas day would have begun] at 5 a.m. with Mary Matins sung by the boys, then an hour later the full choir sang Matins and Prime followed by Lady Mass. At seven in the morning, the Salve regina was sung, together with the Ave Maria punctuated by bells, and Sancte Deus.... Requiem Mass followed, then at 9 a.m. the choir sang the Mass of the Day. At 3 p.m. the boys sang the Mary Evensong, followed by the full choir singing the main Evensong, doubtless including a Magnificat by Taverner. After this, Compline was sung, and then three polyphonic antiphons, probably Gloria tibi trinitas, ...Mater Christi and $O$ Wilhelme pastor bone in honour, respectively, of the Trinity, the Virgin and William of York, and ending with a prayer for Wolsey himself. After this wearing day, Taverner...and the choir contemplated yet another long ceremonial as midnight approached.

Included in this Midnight Mass was the verse "Gloria in excelsis," written for boys' voices in imitation of the angels singing, "peace on earth to all men."35 A setting of this verse by Taverner exists, also in the Gyffard Partbooks, with a treble line notated in uniform breves (below, Ex. 4-7). While there is no evidence that this was the specific piece used by Taverner for his Christmas services at Cardinal College, the top line does

[^80]share a similar design with the Taverner In pace for three men and a childe.


Pieces such as this Gloria and the Taverner In pace could have been used as exercises designed to orient children and young singers to various ex tempore techniques in the context of a four-voice polyphonic performance, just as the pieces could have been written solely for the timbre of children's voices. Importantly though, a few connections are being made: the Gyffard Gloria (most likely for boys' voices) and the Taverner In pace for three men and a child involve a top voice written in uniformly shaped sustained note values. The setting of In pace also matches the vocal-register designation of the MonteA 871 In exitu Israel for mean, two tenors, and bass. Elements of these pieces, particularly the In pace, may very well represent the general type and style of piece that could have been enclosed in the cover of CambriU 4405(9) "for three men and a child."

## A POSSIBLE COMPOSER

The verso title of CambriU 4405(9) further lists two somewhat smudged and faintly legible names that slightly overlap the edge of the Psalter text: "Bonmett" or "Bormett," and a "Bentaa." The capital letter "B" in both names does not resemble the " B " written in the title for the word "Benedictus," and it appears that the names were
added at a later date, perhaps unconnected with the title. These names may not even indicate a composer, rather, they could have been added by someone practicing their handwriting; yet the names were written directly underneath the title as it was scrawled down the edge of the document and around the preexisting text. One interesting possibility for the name is John Benbow, who became Taverner's successor at Cardinal College, Oxford in $1530 .{ }^{36}$ William Whytbroke, whose name appears on the recto side of CambriU 4405(9), was sent to evaluate Benbow as a potential successor at the College. The items of expense in the College household books of 1530 show: ${ }^{37}$

To Benbowe coming from Manchester to be master of the choristers, 29 May, 2s, 9d. / Expenses of Dom Whytbroke riding for Benbow at the Dean's command 6s, 8d.

It would not be difficult to imagine both men, working at the same institution at a later date, storing copies of their music within the same cover leaf. The only problem with this conjecture is that only the second name on the verso side of CambriU 4405(9) looks like the name Benbow.

## A POTENTIAL PIECE OF CORRESPONDING POLYPHONY

The search for a potential copy of the missing Cambridge Jubilate Deo is a difficult task, even with the clues provided in the verso title. The reality is that the piece could have been lost or destroyed, leaving no extant copies. However, one period setting

[^81]can be found in the Lumley Partbooks (LonBLR A74-6): the English vernacular Iubilate Deo (below, Ex. 4-8). ${ }^{38}$ This piece contains a number of features described in the Cambridge leaf, and it will serve as a key example of the type of piece that could have once been enclosed in this cover.

The Lumley books are generally regarded as one of the most important sources of early English Reformation Church music to have survived the Catholic counter-reforms of Mary Tudor. ${ }^{39}$ They were compiled in 1547-8, with other works added over the course of the sixteenth century. They bear the names of Arundel and Lumley on the parchment fly-leaves, and they once formed part of the library of Henry Fitzalan, twelfth Earl of Arundel (c.1512-1580). ${ }^{40}$ They may have been used in the Chapel Royal or Westminster Abbey and taken to Arundel with Thomas Cranmer's library when it was confiscated by Queen Mary I in $1553 .{ }^{41}$ They were then given to Fitzalan, who passed them to his daughter, the wife of John Lumley (First Baron of Lumley), upon his death in $1580 .{ }^{42}$ The books are unique among the Lumley collection in that they contain liturgical music with English texts, for the Lumley household remained Roman Catholic throughout the liturgical reforms of the sixteenth century. ${ }^{43}$ Like the verso side of CambriU 4405(9), they show signs of wear and tear, particularly surrounding the earlier pieces in the

[^82]collection, suggesting that they were used on a fairly regular basis. ${ }^{44}$


Ex. 4-8: Lumley Partbooks, Iubilate Deo, first verse

The Iubilate Deo, like many of the other service pieces in the partbooks, is very basic, consisting of four-part homophonic writing reminiscent of fauxbourdon or falsobordone settings. ${ }^{45}$ There are five verses set to the same melody, with the last line of

[^83]each verse repeated, much in the fashion of a short hymn. It was written for four voices, it contains the text of Psalm 100, and its registration follows a format of a low treble (or mean) plus two tenors and a bass - the very same registration as the Taverner In Pace for Three men and a Child.

As mentioned in Chapter Two, a number of squares were originally composed against plainchant, and they were extracted to become the basis of a further piece of polyphony. The tenor line of the Lumley Jubilate Deo appears as a possible discant against and above the tonus peregrinus (below, Ex. 4-9). As already mentioned, the psalm tones formed the basis of certain In exitu Israel settings, such as seen in LonBLH 2945 (Ex. 4-2).

Ex. 4-9:


Admittedly, there is nothing particularly definitive here, and it becomes impossible to speak confidently of a melodic relationship without first seeing a full polyphonic In exitu Israel that contains a concordant line with the Lumley Iubilate Deo - but the general concept of the process is still here. There could have been an In exitu Israel setting based on the tonus peregrinus, and one of the newly composed lines could have been extracted and used as the basis for a piece like the Lumley Iubilate Deo. Furthermore, this piece is found in a collection of service works for the newly reformed Church of England, a collection that necessitated simplified musical settings with minimal melodic or harmonic complications. The Iubilate Deo, with its simple homophonic texture - and potentially
with its tenor composed against the tonus peregrinus - certainly represents this ideal.
Another possibility for a piece such as the Lumely Iubilate Deo is that a square could be embedded in another voice part. Judith Blezzard's research on the Lumley books might shed some light on this particular search. Within the Lumley collection consisting mostly of canticles, metrical psalms and anthems - the setting of Psalm 8, Domine Dominus noster, involves two sections of music, alternating even and odd verses. Blezzard has noted that the odd-numbered verses of this psalm bear a resemblance to Cornysh's Blow Thy Horn Hunter, which appears in LonBL 31922. In Blezzard's words: ${ }^{46}$
if contrafactum here was intentional, it shows that the emphasis had shifted from the tenor line (around which Cornysh wrote his tune), to the top voice, which predominated in this psalm. It also shows regard for the ideals of contemporary psalmists whereby it was quite in order to borrow suitable secular or even "popish" tunes if that were convenient.

Perhaps the Lumley Iubilate Deo contains a top line extracted from a pre-existing In exitu Israel piece. So far, the only melody that might be considered a match would be that of the Gyffard In exitu Israel setting by Sheppard, Byrd, and Mundy; but in truth, this a not a very clear connection (see below, Ex. 4-10A and B, particularly within book 17803).


Ex. 4-10A: Lumley Iubilate Deo, top line ${ }^{47}$

[^84]

Ex. 4-10B: Gyffard Partbooks, In exitu Israel, Sheppard, Byrd, and Mundy, opening excerpt

As a side note, the Lumley Iubilate Deo is related to the Laudate pueri within the same books (below, Ex. 4-11A and B). Normally, the Laudate pueri is used with the In exitu Israel during Easter Vespers, as described above, but this Laudate pueri is melodically related to the Iubilate Deo. The triplex and contratenor lines seem to be the most related, while the two pieces use different tenor melodies.


Ex. 4-11A: Lumley Partbooks, Iubilate Deo, opening excerpt ${ }^{48}$

[^85]

Ex. 4-11B: Lumley Partbooks, Laudate pueri, opening excerpt ${ }^{49}$

As far as Blezzard can determine, none of the Lumley pieces is a direct adaptation from a pre-existent Latin work, but she points out that the older styles of composers such as Taverner were not entirely abandoned by the reformers, particularly cantus firmus technique: ${ }^{50}$
[Cantus firmus] techniques occur in the Lumley music in two ways: first as the inclusion of an identifiable plainsong given syllabic underlay and used as the tenor part, and second as the allusion to features typical of plainsong rather than to identifiable chants... Most of the Lumley pieces fit the first category and derive their chants from the eight psalm tones.

Of further significance, Blezzard described the Lumley Iubilate Deo and a Benedicite as

[^86]pieces that were "less clearly derived from a particular tradition or technique but which nevertheless show consistent verse structure." ${ }^{51}$ Perhaps the "particular tradition or technique" is really the technique of composing with a square.

## THE TEMPORAL FRAME OF THE MISSING JUBILATE DEO

As mentioned at the beginning of this Chapter, the title inscriptions contained within CambriU 4405(9) were probably added sometime in the first half of the sixteenth century. Historically, this period is known for the series of liturgical reforms begun by King Henry VIII in 1529 in an attempt to annul his marriage to Catherine of Aragon. By May of 1532 , he demanded the submission of the English clergy to the Crown, making it illegal for them to pass religious law without royal license. By 1534 , this was modified into the "Act of Supremacy" which placed the King as the supreme head of the Church in England. In the years following, the churches of England were directed to abolish fasting days, pilgrimages, offerings to images and statues; and a number of monasteries were dissolved. Henry was succeeded in 1547 by Edward VI, his nine year old son, and the country was governed by the boy's uncle, a Protestant regent. The injunctions concerning liturgical behavior were more strictly enforced at this time, and they included a ban on such items as vestments, stone altars, shrines, statues, and bells. These directives remained in force until the succession of the Catholic Queen Mary I in 1553, who was then succeeded by Queen Elizabeth I upon Mary's death in 1558.

The chief effects of these reforms involved a drastic curtailment of music (i.e. simplified forms, and less polyphonic pieces), as well as the adoption of the English language for liturgical music. However, liturgical texts in Latin were not expressly ruled

[^87]out until the Act for the Uniformity of Service in 1549. At this point, processions, antiphons, responds, Alleluias, tracts, graduals, and sequences were eliminated. Further, the traditional Latin Office Hours were reduced to Matins and Evensong (or Morning and Evening Prayer). ${ }^{52}$

With this in mind, CambriU 4405(9) might seem to fit somewhere in the time frame of the 1549 Act for the Uniformity of Service. The elimination of graduals might explain why the Cambridge manuscript consists of a page torn out of a gradual; for someone, at some point, decided to reuse the gradual page as a title page for the two compositions "upon the square." The use of a Jubilate Deo as a substitution for the Benedictus was also part of the new service of Morning Prayer.

Within this same year, the first complete English metrical Psalter was published: the Psalter of David newely translated into Engliysh metre by Robert Crowley. The music consists of no more than a chant-like tune with a single harmonization of tone 7 (tonus peregrinus) ${ }^{53}$ which is placed in the tenor. This music was little used, perhaps because of the overly austere and restricted nature of the music, ${ }^{54}$ but it does represent the compositional process of the time: the idea of devising simplified homophonic music that had some type of basis in the psalm tones for use in the reformed Church of England. In this sense, the Lumley Iubilate Deo makes a well founded example of what the missing Cambridge work may have constituted. If the missing Cambridge piece was indeed written for use within the reformed Church, the simple homophony and English vernacular of the Lumley Iubilate Deo would provide a model of reformed ideals. At the

[^88]same time, the reference to an In exitu Israel square may have represented a specific homage to the liturgical (and processional) music of the past.

Importantly, as mentioned above, the early reformers were not entirely opposed to utilizing certain older compositional techniques. Judith Blezzard has pointed out that The Primer in Englishe \& Latin: set forth by the Kynges Maieste \& his Clergie to be taught lerned, \& read: \& none other to be vsed throughout all his dominions of 1545 (largely Cranmer's work), ${ }^{55}$ contains texts without music that were probably sung to preexistent popular tunes. At the accession of King Edward VI in 1547, the Primer and the Common Prayer Book were enforced as the sole permitted service books for congregational worship. ${ }^{56}$ The Wanley Partbooks (OxfBMS e.420-2, tenor book missing), which are roughly contemporary to the Lumley books, also contain English works set to entire preexistent Latin compositions. ${ }^{57}$ In connection with this, the Lumley books are missing Communion settings; just as the recto side of CambriU 4405(9) indicates that it once contained a Communion setting based on the secular tune Or me veult. Perhaps the missing Whitbroke Communion, once stored in the cover page of CambriU 4405(9), was designed to go with one or another of these books.

As a side note to the Lumley and Wanley Partbooks, there is one further source that contains early Reformed Church music matching the type of descriptors provided in the titles of CambriU 4405(9): the 1560 publication of John Day's Certaine / notes set forth in foure and / three parts to be song at the morning Com/munnion, and evening

[^89]praier, very necessa/rie for the Church of Christe to be fre/quented and vsed: \& vnto
them / added diuers godly praiers / \& Psalmes in the like / forme to the ho/nor \& praise /
of God. This title was changed in 1565 to Mornyng / and Euenyng prayer and /

## Communion, set forthe in foure / partes, to be song in church, both / for men and

children, with dy/uers other godly prayers \& / Anthems, of sundry / mens doynges. ${ }^{58}$
These later dates of 1560 and 1565 would indicate their use in the Elizabethan Church,
but John Aplin has provided reason to believe that the pieces contained within the
Certaine Notes may have been gathered together as early as the Edwardian years. ${ }^{59}$
Notably, the title of the 1565 revision includes information related to CambriU 4405(9):
music for Morning Prayer (or Lauds at which the Jubilate Deo was used) and
Communion music in four parts for men and children. Most of the works in this
collection are credited to their composers, Caustun, Heath, Hasylton, Johnson, Knyght,
Okeland, Sheppard, Stone, Tallis and Whitbroke; and many of these pieces are
adaptations from Latin originals. ${ }^{60}$ The collection contains three full services: one for
men by Caustun, another for men and children also by Caustun, and a third Service by

[^90]Heath supplemented with two settings of the evening Canticles by Whitbroke and Knight. The morning Service for men by Caustun further contains a Benedictus based on the tonus peregrinus. ${ }^{61}$ Conceivably, this was the type of piece that the Jubilate Deo of CambriU 4405(9) could have been designed to substitute.


While it may prove impossible to locate the missing music that was once enclosed in CambriU 4405(9), the significance of finding another reference to squares is invaluable. The clues provided in this one title indicate that squares may exist in the English vernacular repertoire, that they were sometimes devised for specific vocal registrations such as "for three men and a child," and that some squares were probably derived from psalm tones as well as from more elaborate chants or melodies. Of the utmost importance, though, is that if the Jubilate Deo text was really not used until after the reforms, it means that CambriU 4405(9) provides a very important clue concerning the practice of squares: specifically, that the practice continued beyond the religious reforms, at least into the Edwardian years, and was not necessarily restricted to preReformation traditions.

[^91]
## CHAPTER 5

## THE PORTUGALER / OR ME VEULT / KYRIE MELODY: A SQUARE FROM FOREIGN AND SECULAR SOURCES

So far, squares have been described as an English phenomenon, appearing in British sources and involving polyphony ascribed to English composers. However, there is one square that appears in over fourteen sources scattered between England and the Continent bearing title references to Continental polyphony. These include the label Portugaler, and the French chanson title, Or me veult (see below, Ex. 5-1). Many of these concordances have been discovered by Margaret Bent and Hugh Baillie, and others by Edmond de Coussemaker and Helmut Hell; but as of yet, they have not been recognized for their significance to fifteenth- and sixteenth-century English compositional practice, nor have they been discussed together with regard to their concordances. An archival reference on the recto side of CambriU 4405(9), described in the previous chapter, further names the French chanson title in connection with the label "square:" a cover page for a lost "communion off iiij partis for iii men and a Childe upon the square of Ormaveute by William Whitbrook." ${ }^{1}$

Ex. 5-1: Melodic concordances:

* Portugaler, ascribed to G. Dufay, two voices - StrasBM 222, f. 108 [Early fifteenth century]
* Portugaler, two voices - MunBS Lat. 14274, f. 65 [c.1440-1450]
* Portigaler, two voices - MunBS Lat. 14274, f. 77
* Ave tota casta Virgo, three voices - MunBS Lat. 14274, ff.92v-93

[^92]* O incomparabilis Virgo, attributed to Du Fay, three voices - MunBS 3224, f. 9 (originally ff.102v-103) [c.1440-1445]
* Portigaler, keyboard arrangement - MunBS 3725, f.21v-21r, (Staatsbibliothek Cim. 352b) [c.1450-1470]
* Or me veult, three voices - Yale 91, ff.69v-70r [c.1470's]
* Kyrie, three voices - BevRS 19/2/I/A [mid fifteenth century]
* Gloria-Credo pair, four voices - YorkB 1, f.3v-7 [c.1475-1480]
* Missa feria iii, Nicholas Ludford, three voices - LonBLR A45-48 [c.1525]
* Kyrie-Christe, keyboard arrangement - LonBLR A56, f. 15 [c.1530]
* Ormavoyt, monophonic mensural melody - Alcetur Bible (Evesham Almonry Museum) [c.1537]
* Orma vulte, keyboard arrangement - OxfC 371, f.19v [before c.1570]
* Three-fold Christe eleison, William Taverner, three voices - LonBL 18936-9 [compiled c.1615, before 1545]
* [lost] Communion Upon the Square of Ormaveut, William Whitbroke, four voices CambriU 4405(9) [early to mid sixteenth century]

While melodic borrowing between England and the Continent has been long discussed by modern scholars, the vast number of sources for this particular melody - as well as its contemporary identification as a square - makes this example unique. Where might this melody have originated and how did it come to be used as a square? What does this melody reveal concerning the phenomenon of squares either extending beyond England or imported from foreign sources? What does this melody reveal concerning the connection between squares and other genres that involve ex tempore performance upon a preexisting melody? This chapter seeks to explore these questions through the following topics:

* The locations of the concordant sources
* A comparison of the concordant sources
* The possible meanings of the term "Portugaler"
* The possible connection between squares, dance tunes, and carols


## THE CONCORDANT SOURCES

When Hugh Baillie published his article "Squares" in 1960, the Continental concordances of this melody and the specific reference to Whitbroke's lost Communion had not been discovered. He listed this particular melody as Kyrie \# 3 (below, Ex. 5-2): the melodic basis of Nicholas Ludford's Missa feria iii found in LonBLR 45-48. ${ }^{2}$


Ex. 5-2: Kyrie \#3

Because Baillie believed that all of the Ludford Lady Masses were based on squares, he included this melody in his list of squares even though it does not appear in a monophonic collection such as Lansdowne 462, nor was it called a square in any of the sources known to him. However, Baillie's assessment of this melody was well considered; it is a mensural melody that was set in alternatim, it is found in a manuscript collection with other pieces based on squares, and it shares a melodic concordance with

[^93]two other pieces of music: a three-fold Christe eleison by John Taverner in LonBL 18936-9 and an anonymous keyboard setting in LonBL A56. ${ }^{3}$

Square \#3 consists of breves and semibreves moving mostly in stepwise motion with the occasional leap of an octave, fifth, or third; and it is not particularly long or especially melismatic. In most ways, it looks like the other squares collected by Baillie in his article, and there is virtually nothing to suggest why it acquired its unusual popularity. In the Missa feria iii, Kyrie \#3 serves as an alternatim melody in the Kyrie, Gloria, and Credo, and is also interwoven between the voice parts of the other Mass movements.

As mentioned in Chapter Two, a number of squares originated as the bottom parts of three-voice, faburden- or discant-like settings based on chant, such as those seen in the Old Hall Manuscript. Kyrie \#3, as the basis of Ludford's Missa feria iii, looks as if it might have derived from this tradition as well; but as of yet, no originating chant-based composition has been found. In this sense, Kyrie \#3 seems to be more like the Le Roy melody discussed in Chapter Three: both melodies are used as a cantus firmus in a number of liturgical settings, yet they cannot be retroactively aligned with any known plainchant. The contours of Kyrie \#3, as well as those of the Le Roy melody, certainly match the contours of the other "liturgical" squares in Baillie's list; but at the same time, they are suspiciously similar in profile to the tenors and contratenors of chansons by Continental composers such as Binchois and Du Fay. ${ }^{4}$ In fact, it was within this context

[^94]of the Continental chanson repertoire that Margaret Bent discovered a melodic concordance for Kyrie \#3 attributed to Du Fay in the lost Strasbourg manuscript. ${ }^{5}$

The lost Strasbourg manuscript (StrasBM 222), dating from the early fifteenth century, is one of the earliest known sources to contain the Kyrie \#3 melody. ${ }^{6}$ The original manuscript was destroyed by fire during the Franco-Prussian War (August 24-25, 1870) and is now only known from descriptions, a thematic index reconstructed by Charles Van den Borren, and a handwritten facsimile made around 1866 by Edmond de Coussemaker. ${ }^{7}$ Kyrie \#3 appeared in the tenor line of a textless two-voice chanson on a six-line staff and was ascribed to "G. Dufay" with the incipit "Portugaler" (below, Ex. 5$3) .{ }^{8}$

[^95]

Ex. 5-3: Strasbourg, Portugaler

The Strasbourg copy contains a number of errors, a particularly frustrating problem since it remains unclear whether the mistakes were part of the original manuscript or derived from Coussemaker's hand. ${ }^{9}$ Overall, this source was a rather cosmopolitan

[^96]Germanic collection containing Mass movements and a number of secular pieces in German, Dutch, Italian, and Latin. ${ }^{10}$ It was closely contemporary with the Old Hall Manuscript and the Fountains Fragments; and like the pieces contained in the Fountains Fragments, the Strasbourg pieces were written on six-line staves.

Coussemaker's study was the first to track the concordant sources of Portugaler, and he matched the Strasbourg setting to three versions of the piece in the St. Emmeram Codex and one in the Buxheim Organbook. The St. Emmeram Codex (MunBS Lat. 14274) appears to be a slightly later source than Strasbourg. It was copied in Vienna sometime between 1440 and 1450, presumably at the Benedictine monastery of St . Emmeram in Regensburg. ${ }^{11}$ The first two examples in St. Emmeram consist of two-voice pieces that appear on folios 65 and 77. In both of these examples, the title incipit appears only in the top voice (not in the tenor), where it is specifically labeled "Discantus Portugaler." This would seem to suggest that Portugaler - and this also includes the Strasbourg Portugaler - once existed as a polyphonic piece with at least a discantus and a tenor part. This first example stands out on the manuscript page, being written in

[^97]void notation while the surrounding pieces have been copied in full black notation with red coloration. The Portugaler on f .65 looks to be a later addition to the manuscript page, in fact, the tenor voice was left incomplete, missing its last six bars in modern transcription (below, Ex. 5-4). In addition, the St. Emmeram Portugaler settings on folios 65 and 77 only involve the first half of the Portugaler piece as seen in Strasbourg.


Ex. 5-4: St. Emmeram, f. 65r, Portugaler

The second concordance in St. Emmeram appears on f. 77 and contains the same incipit as the example on f .65 , only here spelled "Discantus Portigaler." This example is in full black notation like the surrounding pieces, but it contains a number of errors. ${ }^{12}$ The tenor voice is also incomplete, just as on f.65, missing the last six bars of the piece. Importantly, though, two copies of the same two-voice piece in the same manuscript, even in their incomplete states, suggest that someone or some group of people were particularly interested in its preservation.

[^98]The third example in St. Emmeram appears on folios $92 \mathrm{v}-93$ with the tenor incipit, "Portugaler" (below, Ex. 5-5). ${ }^{13}$ This setting adds a contratenor part to the twovoice framework, and the top voice contains a Latin text in honor of the Blessed Virgin: Ave tota casta Virgo. This version is written in void notation and includes the extended second section of music that exists in the Strasbourg setting.


Ex. 5-5: St. Emmeram, f.92, Ave tota casta, opening excerpt

Since the tenor incipit indicates that Ave tota casta Virgo was related to the Portugaler pieces, it is unclear why a scribe did not subsequently complete the two-part versions in folios 65 and $77 .{ }^{14}$ One possible answer is that the Ave tota casta may have been added

[^99]at a much later date and the connection between the Marian motet and the two Portugaler settings in the manuscript was not noticed.

St. Emmeram, like the Strasbourg manuscript, is also a rather cosmopolitan source, containing works by both Continental and English composers such as Binchois, Du Fay, Dunstaple, and Power. Many of the motets in St. Emmeram are sacred contrafacta of secular works, ${ }^{15}$ which further supports the assumption that the Portugaler settings are the earlier sources of the melody and the Ave tota casta text was added later. It still does not explain whether Ave tota casta was arranged by a Continental or English composer, or who devised the contratenor part. Further, the manuscript contains a number of monophonic mensural and non-mensural melodies, mostly Kyrie and Credo movements.

Kyrie \#3 is also found in MunBS 3224, f.9, in a three-voice motet, $O$ incomparabilis Virgo. This manuscript was copied sometime between 1440 and 1445 and contains Mass music as well as French and Latin secular pieces, yet the provenance of this manuscript is Italy - not the city of Munich where it currently resides. ${ }^{16}$ This concordance was identified in 1983 by Helmut Hell, who explained that it appears in the manuscript with an ascription to Du Fay. ${ }^{17}$ However, since the earliest known appearance

[^100]of the Kyrie \#3 melody is in the Strasbourg manuscript, it means that if the Portugaler ascribed to Du Fay was indeed written by him, it would have been a very early work.

What seems more likely is that Du Fay was responsible for the contrafactum $O$ incomparabilis Virgo, for which he devised a contratenor line for the Portugaler piece, perhaps during his time in Italy. ${ }^{18}$ Once this piece was known, the ascription in the earlier Strasbourg manuscript could have been added retroactively. This might also explain why a separate scribe added the contratenor line in f .92 of the St. Emmeram Codex. ${ }^{19}$

The concordance in the Buxheim Organbook (MunBS 3725), f.21, is also copied with the title "Portugaler." This source may have been prepared for the Court of Duke Sigismund (1460-1467), and the main layer was copied around $1460 .{ }^{20}$ Here, the Kyrie \#3 melody is assimilated into the left-hand accompaniment while the "discantus Portugaler" is treated in a florid, improvisatory manner (below, Ex. 5-6).

[^101]

Ex. 5-6: Buxheim Organbook, Portugaler, opening excerpt

In 1973, Margaret Bent pointed out that the pieces in the St. Emmeram Codex and the Buxheim Organbook are further related to the ballade Or me veult bien esperance mentir found in the Mellon Chansionnier (Yale 91), ff. 69v-70r (below, Ex. 5-7). ${ }^{21}$


Ex. 5-7: Mellon Chansonnier, Or me veult, opening excerpt

[^102]The Or me veult chanson does not contain the same extended portion of music seen in Strasbourg or the Ave tota casta contrafacta, but it does utilize the same discantus, contratenor, and tenor lines of the first section. The Or me veult chanson appears to be an extraction of the first half of these Marian motets. The text of this chanson was analyzed by Perkins and Garey in the commentary to the 1979 Mellon Chansonnier edition, and they drew attention to the combination of legal terminology ("abusement," "jura," "certefiant," "serment," "parjurement") and allegory (the personification of Hope). Garey mentions that this was "evidently considered a delightfully humorous effect, in full harmony with the courtly tone,,"22 a somewhat curious comment considering the subject of broken oaths and abandonment.

Or me veult bien Esperance mentir A ceste foys et faire abusement De sa promesse quant me jura tenir

Mon cuer en joye et doulx esbatement

Certefiant de voloir maintenir Envers moy ce dont m'avoit fait serment Et que de moy non feroit partement Tant que je fusse en ce point prisonnier.

Mais je voy bien que c'est parjurement, Car maintenant me veult du tout lessier.

Now would Hope deceive me
At this time, and abuse
The promise made when she swore she'd keep
My heart in joy and pleasure,

Certifying that she intended to honor The solemn oath she swore to me, And that she would never depart from me As long as I would be, to that degree, a prisoner.
But I see clearly that it was perjury, For now she intends to leave me quite alone. ${ }^{23}$

As can be seen, the text consists of traditional courtly love poetry that personifies a "power," such as Hope. In this case, the personified power, Hope, causes the courtly lover to trust; only to be led into deception. The themes of betrayal and unrequited love

[^103]are hallmarks of the courtly love idiom; and the opening text of this chanson, "or me veult," further appears in a number of earlier literary sources, including those listed below. In this sense, the phrase itself may have been well known within courtly circles, along with the general themes of unrequited love. In England, the French language was still spoken at court well into the sixteenth century, further promoting the potential spread of this text.

* Jean Renart, Le Roman de Galerent, Comte de Bretagne: ${ }^{24}$

Ne se peut a droit conseilier / ormeveult amours exiller / et vous par temps m'en occirez / puisqu'en voustre pais irez / et demourrez la sans retour

* Alexandre Pey, Doon de Maience: ${ }^{25}$

Son enseigne commence moult fort à escrier: or avant, beaulx amiz! Qui or me veult amer Sy me suive bien tost. Plus ne puis endurer...

* La doctrine des princes et des servans en court: ${ }^{26}$ Bien m'a aymé, or me veult forbanir / De son povoir pour moy plus estranger / Pour les paroles que dit le mensonger

Within the Mellon Chansonnier, Or me veult follows three English-texted pieces but immediately precedes other works ascribed to Du Fay. This is particularly intriguing since there is a high probability that Or me veult - using the same opening music as the Ave tota casta and perhaps the $O$ incomparbilis Virgo - could have been arranged by Du Fay. In the 1970 's, a number of scholars, including Margaret Bent, believed that Or me veult was an English composition. ${ }^{27}$ This was supported by the fact that the English source concordances containing the Kyrie \#3 melody referenced the Or me veult chanson.

[^104]David Fallows has discussed this particular quandary in detail, explaining that the lower two voices of Or me veult seem characteristic of Du Fay's work in the 1420's and 1430's while other characteristics seem to be of English origin. ${ }^{28}$ However, in the new light of the Portugaler pieces and the Continental contrafacta, it seems that Or me veult either originated on the Continent or derives from a Continental setting.

The Mellon Chansonnier dates from around 1475, a time when Burgundian and English relations were particularly strong, as the marriage of Charles the Bold to Margaret of York in 1468 solidified a relationship between the two territories. This could have fostered various musical exchanges between the two territories that led to the transmission of the Kyrie \#3 melody. Charles the Bold of Burgundy was known to have been particularly fond of English music, and he even requested the service of Robert Morton (c.1430-c.1479) from his father; ${ }^{29}$ so English authorship of the Or me veult chanson (perhaps as an arrangement of a preexisting Portugaler or contrafacta setting) is still possible. Morton was an English composer working on the Continent at the Court of Burgundy, and the majority of pieces in the Mellon Chansonnier were written by Burgundian Court composers - including Morton, Antoine Busnoys (c.1430-1492), and peripherally, Du Fay.

Regardless of who arranged the Or me veult chanson, it seems to have provided the model for the subsequent English contrafacta, rather than any of the Portugaler pieces. One of the earliest extant sources of polyphony containing the Kyrie \#3 melody in

[^105]England is actually one of the most recently discovered: an anonymous Kyrie found in Beverley (BevRS 19/2/I), (below, Ex. 5-8)..$^{30}$


Ex. 5-8: Beverley, Kyrie, opening excerpt

The first and most obvious aspect of this Kyrie is that it does not utilize the Portugaler discantus or the Continental contratenor; these two voice parts are entirely new. The piece also does not include the extended second section seen in the Strasbourg Portugaler, the Ave tota casta, and the Buxheim Portugaler. The Beverley cantus and contratenor lines are also highly syncopated, reminiscent of the lines found in the English carol repertoire. This type of rhythmic design, along with the piece's appearance in white mensual notation, would date this Kyrie from at least after c. 1450.

Another early source that was discovered in the light of Hugh Baillie's article on squares is the alternatim Gloria-Credo pair in the York Mass fragments, ff. 3v-7 (YorkB 1). This pair was identified by Margaret Bent and is listed in David Fallows’ The Songs of Guillaume Dufay (below, Ex. 5-9). ${ }^{31}$ This example, like the Beverley Kyrie, uses only the tenor melody, and does not use the Portugaler discantus or the added contratenor that

[^106]appears in Or me veult and the Latin contrafacta. The Mass pair was copied sometime between 1475 and $1480 ;{ }^{32}$ and in the late sixteenth century, the folios containing it were removed from their original context and incorporated into the binding of a volume of Consistory Court Acts deposited in the Diocesan Registry of York. ${ }^{33}$ Further, the city of York is located only about thirty miles from Beverley, making the transmission of this melody and its concordances between these territories that much easier.


Ex. 5-9: YorkB 1, Gloria fragment, opening excerpt

One of the more interesting aspects of these Mass fragments is that of all the extant English sources, this is the only one to include any form of extended music in the manner of the Strasbourg Portugaler, the Ave tota casta, and the Buxheim Portugaler. The extended portions of the York Mass pair are somewhat related to these Continental pieces, but are not entirely congruent with them. In some areas, the extended music

[^107]appears to consist of newly composed material. Interestingly, some portions of this material match the Strasbourg Portugaler more closely than the Or me veult chanson. The following example (Ex. 5-10) shows these relationships with the York Gloria aligned with the Strasbourg and Mellon sources. Once again, the York Gloria is an alternatim movement, lacking mensural music for the alternating verses. For the purpose of comparison, the corresponding sections of the York Gloria have been moved to align with the other sources. The Gloria text is provided as a label to indicate the music's location within the movement.

Ex. 5-10:




This second section, beginning around bar 45, is perhaps the most intriguing. The similarity between the extended portion of the Strasbourg source and that of the York Gloria is close enough to call attention to itself, but varied enough to pose the question as to whether the compiler of the York Mass actually knew about the Continental extension.

Bars 53 and 54, for example, share the same general contour, but they are certainly different melodies - so much so that their alignment is highly questionable. However, bars 56-57 contain the same pitches, only set in a different rhythmic sequence. Also, the York Gloria contains its own extended portion of music beginning around bar 11.

Of further importance is the dating of these sources: the York Mass fragments were compiled at roughly the same time as the Mellon Chansonnier, yet they appear to be more closely related to the Strasbourg source, or at least to one of the earlier Continental sources that contain the extended section. Perhaps the York compiler had access to one of the other Continental versions of the melody with the extended portion of music. Perhaps there was another polyphonic model for the melody that made its way to England.

Overall, the York Mass pair represents the most freely treated use of the Kyrie \#3 melody out of all the polyphonic concordances. This level of freedom raises an important question: why did the York compiler ornament the melody so heavily particularly the extended portion - to the point of near non-recognition? Perhaps there existed another avenue of square usage that allowed for the melody to be ornamented in this manner; meaning that there could be further examples of squares embedded in the highly florid English polyphonic repertoire. It also seems highly likely that instrumental settings of this melody existed, involving high degrees of floridity. Some of these could have been performed ex tempore. Most of the other polyphonic sources containing the Kyrie \#3 melody maintain its structural integrity, adding the extreme levels of ornamentation to the other voice parts of the polyphonic setting. What this suggests, with intriguing insistence, is that what survives of this tune's tradition is just the tip of an
iceberg, most of which is now lost.
After the York Masses, there seems to be a lull in appearances of the melody in polyphonic settings, or at least a lull between the currently identified concordances from this time period. The next English source, then, is the alternatim Ludford Missa feria iii found in LonBLR A45-48 (below, Ex. 5-11).


Ex. 5-11: LonBLR A45-48, Missa feria iii Kyrie, Nicholas Ludford, opening excerpt of polyphony

This setting is organized in much the same fashion as the Missa Dominica discussed in Chapter Three. The square is set in the lowest voice part and is ornamented, yet it is still recognizable. This melody is used in all Mass movements, not just the Kyrie.

In his original article on squares, Hugh Baillie further connected the Missa feria
iii with an anonymous keyboard setting that uses part of the Kyrie \#3 melody. This setting is found in LonBLR A56, an organbook from c. 1530 containing various compositions based on fixed melodies, as well as measured plainsongs and faburdens to be improvised upon. ${ }^{34}$ The setting comprises two musical sections, labeled Kyrie and Christe. However, both of these sections set the Kyrie portion of the Kyrie \#3 melody and not the Christe (see above, Ex. 5-2 to view the three sections of the melody marked by a double bar). The end portion of the square is also altered in the keyboard Christe sections. Overall, the keyboard setting is very improvisatory in style, using small note values and complex syncopations (below, Ex. 5-12). ${ }^{35}$ The square melody is shifted to the treble register for the Christe section, and the melody migrates to the cantus.


Ex. 5-12: LonBLR A56, f. 15, Kyrie Christe

[^108]The three-fold Christe eleison for three voices by John Taverner is found in LonBL 18936-9 (below, Ex. 5-13). ${ }^{36}$ Taverner's Christe only uses the mean, contratenor, and bassus, as there is no part for this piece in the treble book. The Christe portion of the square appears twice in the contratenor voice and then migrates to the mean line. The square is also transposed relative to its position in the Ludford Mass, and it contains no ligatures in the manuscript notation. The top voice (the mean) is of particular interest, especially in the last section where the square migrates to the mean and the contratenor is given a string of complex rhythms in triplet figurations.


[^109]

Ex. 5-13: LonBL 18936-9, Christe, John Taverner

Of further note is the fact that the piece was referred to as "Christe," and contains the same portion of the square melody that was set as the Christe section in Ludford's Mass. This may signify that the square circulated as a liturgical melody, losing the Or me veult title or reference, and was replaced with a Kyrie text in some locations. Also, as there are no Kyrie square portions to this piece, it is unknown whether the Kyrie text of Taverner's piece was performed with plainchant, ex tempore polyphony, or if there are missing written polyphonic portions. The manuscript does not appear to be missing any parts. At the same time, a significant portion of Taverner's works involve alternatim performance, and the individual statements of the Christe are each signed "Mr. Taverner" in the manuscript as one would see at the end of a completed work. Perhaps these signature separations indicate that any one of these three Christe portions could be used in its own alternatim setting and that they were not intended to be sung consecutively. This could also be a peculiarity of the partbooks; for once again, they were compiled at least thirty or forty years after Taverner's death. We do not know what source the scribe was using
when he copied the Christe setting. Taverner may have written this piece for the choir of Cardinal College during his short tenure under the employ of Cardinal Wolsey. Such complex rhythmic writing, as seen in this setting, would certainly represent an "impressive" level of musical achievement (i.e. in florid polyphony) befitting such an institution. Further, such a piece, that may have been used as such a prestigious institution, may have prompted the scribe of LonBL 18936-9 to copy the piece.

Another source for the Kyrie \#3 melody is the Alcetur Bible of the Evesham Almonry Museum, where it appears as a monophonic mensural tune with the title "ormavoyt" (below, Ex. 5-14). ${ }^{37}$ This melody appears on the coverboard of the Bible, next to a setting of $O$ bone Jesu by Fayrfax and a lute tuning chart. Perhaps the melody was "popular" at the time, or was considered suitable for further improvisation. Either way, the melody was deemed important enough to copy down for future reference.


Ex. 5-14: Alcetur Bible, Ormavoyt

This source was first mentioned by Thurston Dart, who described it in his article "Notes on a Bible of Evesham Abbey" in 1964. ${ }^{38}$ Dart described the melody as a dance tune,

[^110]since it lacked text and it was not connected with the square repertoire until three years later. The title Ormavoyt and the melody were not recognized as a concordance with the tenor line of the Or me veult chanson until Margaret Bent's identification, which she communicated to the editors of Musica Britannica volume 66, an edition of Tudor keyboard music. ${ }^{39}$

One further keyboard setting is found in a Christ Church manuscript (OxfC 371) where it is labeled "orma vulte" (below, Ex. 5-15). ${ }^{40}$ This is a far simpler setting of the melody than the one seen above in LonBLR A56, but at the same time, the melody is also more difficult to recognize. It consists only of a very short portion of the Kyrie section transposed into a much lower register and rhythmically altered. This setting is from a later source, a compilation dating from around 1570 , but the piece itself may have been composed at a much earlier date.


Ex. 5-15: OxfC 371, f.19v, orma vulte

The final extant English source involving the Kyrie \#3 melody is the handwritten title found on the recto side of CambriU 4405(9): a "Communion of iiij partes ffor iij

[^111]men and a Childe, upon the square of Ormaveute, m[aster] William Whitbrooke." This manuscript, and the designation for three men and a child, were discussed in the previous chapter. Although there is no surviving music connected to this manuscript, it is the only title that connects the word "square" with the Or me veult melody.

## A COMPARISON OF THE CONCORDANT SOURCES

The use of the Kyrie \#3 melody, in all of its known sources, then, can be charted in a variety of manners. First, when grouped into types of setting, it can be seen that the melody was used more frequently in Mass or liturgical settings within England, whereas the Continental genres are more varied.

Chanson settings
Strasbourg Portugaler
St. Emmeram Portugaler f.65r
St. Emmeram Portugaler f.77r
Mellon Chansonnier Or me veult

Contrafacta settings / motets
St. Emmeram Ave tota casta Virgo
Munich 3224 O incomparabilis Virgo

Mass Settings
York Fragments Gloria and Credo
Beverly Kyrie
LonBLR A45-48 Missa feria iii
Gyffard Partbooks Christe

Keyboard settings
Buxheim Portugaler
OxfC 371 orma vulte
LonBLR A56 Kyrie

Monophonic copies
Alcetur Bible Ormavoyt

Communion settings
CambriU 4450(9) [missing]

However, when examining the actual use of the melody within individual pieces, the English sources seem to be the more varied (see chart below, Ex. 5-16). Comparatively, the Kyrie \#3 melody shows the larger number of transpositions and ornamentations in the English sources, as well as a rather insular propensity for extracting portions or sections
of the melody. The English sources do not contain the "discantus Portugaler," nor the added contratenor line that may have been devised by Du Fay.

Ex. 5-16:

| SOURCE | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Kyrie } \\ & 1 \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | Christe | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Kyrie } \\ & 2 \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | extended | first pitch | discantus Portugaler | Du Fay (?) contratenor |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Strasbourg | X | X | X | x | G | x |  |
| Emmeram f. 65 | X | X | partial |  | G | X |  |
| Emmeram f. 77 | X | X | partial |  | G | X |  |
| Ave tota casta | X | X | X | X | G | X | x |
| O incomparabilis |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Buxheim | x | X | X | X | G | X |  |
| Mellon | X | X | X |  | G | x | x |
| Beverley | X | X | x |  | G |  |  |
| York | x | X | x | ? | G |  |  |
| Ludford | x | x | x |  | D |  |  |
| LonBLR A56 | X |  |  |  | D |  |  |
| Alcetur | x | x | x |  | G |  |  |
| OxfC 371 | partial |  |  |  | A |  |  |
| Taverner Christe |  | x |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| CambriU 4405(9) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

In the following example (below, Ex. 5-17), the melodies have been aligned to view their relationships. Here, the York Gloria stands out as the most ornamented version of the melody, even more so than the Buxheim Portugaler and the Ludford Missa feria iii Kyrie. The closest formulaic connections might be seen between the Strasbourg Portugaler, the Buxheim Portugaler, and the Ave tota casta, which all share the same extended portion of music. Further, the Ave tota casta and the Buxheim Portugaler share a final repeat of the "Kyrie 2" portion (the final, or third, section) of the Kyrie \#3 melody. This seems to be a rather odd connection, perhaps indicating some type of relationship between the compiler of the organ setting and the compiler of the sacred contrafacta. In bar 29, the Beverley Kyrie and the York Mass Gloria share the same ornamental cadence, dipping down to G before the next measure. Perhaps this is
coincidence, but these are the only two sources to contain this figure. Bar 57 further shows the differences between the Strasbourg Portugaler and the Ave tota casta and Buxheim Portugaler. The York Mass fragment seems to be modeled on the latter two, here, at the end of the extended section.

Ex. 5-17:






As seen in the comparison above, some of the Continental sources, particularly the Strasbourg Portugaler, the Ave tota casta Virgo in the St. Emmeram manuscript, and the Buxheim Portigaler ascribed to Du Fay, all contain a second portion of music that does not appear in any of the English sources except the York Mass fragments. It is interesting, as well, that all the extant English sources carry the title reference to Or me veult or nothing at all. The Or me veult chanson does not carry this extended second section of music. Clearly, this particular chanson - carrying the square melody and the title reference to Or me veult - provided some type of hinge-point or connective key for the melody's travels between England and the Continent.

Of all the extant English sources, the Ludford Missa feria iii tenor seems to be the most closely connected with a "Continental" work: the Or me veult chanson in the Mellon Chansonnier. Aside from a few slight alterations, the copies in these two manuscripts look remarkably alike considering that they are separated by roughly fifty years; even the ligatures are close to identical (below, Ex. 5-18).


Ex. 5-18A: Mellon Chansonnier ff. 69v-70r ${ }^{41}$


Ex. 5-18B: LonBLR A48, f. $10^{42}$

[^112]
## THE MEANING OF THE TERM "PORTUGALER"

The meaning of the term "Portugaler" has remained a mystery ever since the discovery of the two-voice Portugaler in the Strasbourg manuscript. Coussemaker speculated that the label Portugaler may have been in reference to a popular piece composed in honor of the marriage of Philip the Good and Isabella of Portugal in 1430. ${ }^{43}$ This would certainly fit the general time frame of the Portugaler copies in the Strasbourg and St. Emmeram sources. Both sources (excluding the Ave tota casta in St. Emmeram) notate a cantus and tenor part - preserved without any other part(s) or any texts that could have been added ex tempore.

Van den Borren, on the other hand, suggested a further connection with Du Fay beyond the ascription that appears with the concordant contrafacta in MunBS 3224. He believed that Du Fay heard an instrumental, or dance, version of this melody; and while this is pure speculation, he corroborated the idea with the proposal that it might be loosely related to Du Fay's Portingaloise, a basse danse that appears in a Brussels Manuscript from the Ducal Library of Burgundy (BrusBR 9085). ${ }^{44}$ Van den Borren may well have been on the right track in connecting this melody to dance pieces, as will be further discussed below, but Du Fay's Portingaloise has virtually no connection to the Portugaler piece, other than the name and the first three notes. The title Portingaloise is furthermore a French derivative, as opposed to the English or Germanic "Portugaler."

As a curious side note, the St. Emmeram manuscript contains a further piece

[^113]bearing the title "Portugal." The second piece to appear in the manuscript is a Gloria movement with the name "Portugal" written at the top of the page (below, Ex. 5-19). As can be seen, though, this Gloria movement bears no melodic connection to the two copies of the Portugaler chanson or the Ave tota casta contrafactum. At most, it shows that some one or some group was interested in pieces connected with the name "Portugal."


Furthermore, the term "Portugaler" is used in the Calendar of the Close Rolls preserved in the Great Britain Public Record Office from 1405 to 1409 in reference to a particular man: ${ }^{45}$

May 16. Westminster. Memorandum of a mainprise body for body and under a pain of 2001. made in chancery 10 May this year by William Jurdaun 'taillour' and Geoffrey Rose, both of London, to have John Pynell a 'Portugaler' of Lussheboun there from day to day until dismissed from the court, in order to answer Simon Benfelde and other men of Shorham.

While this is obviously not a reference to music, it does indicate that the term
"Portugaler" was used in England during the early fifteenth century. More specifically: that the English were familiar enough with the designation to understand that "Portugaler" meant "the Portuguese man." The term was certainly used as a surname,

[^114] of the Deputy Keeper of the Records, Henry IV, volume III, A.D. 1405-1409 (London: published by His Majesty's Stationary Office 1931), 386.
as seen in the Close Rolls from 1387: a pardon to Peter Portugaler for stealing from John de Brandon at Bishops Lenn. ${ }^{46}$ This date, 1387, is the year following the treaty of Windsor, a ratification of various alliances between England and Portugal that dated back to the 1340s. Specifically, the two parties agreed to provide each other with military and naval assistance on request, and to help defend each other's monarchy against French and Castilian attacks. The new King of Portugal, Dom João, married Philippa of Lancaster, sister of the future King Henry IV of England. Commercially, this agreement granted all Portuguese traders the right to travel freely in England, and to permanently settle there; just as the Englishmen were granted the same rights in Portugal. ${ }^{47}$ The friendship between the two countries was celebrated in Richard Hakluyt's The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques, and Discoveries of the English, from around 1436: ${ }^{48}$

Portugalers, with us, have troth in hand, whose marchandy commeth much into England. They ben our friends, with their commodities, and we English passen into their countrees....

It seems highly probable that the friendship between England and Portugal fostered the exchange of artistic and musical ideas, for Philippa and João's Chapel modeled its practices on those of the Chapel Royal at Windsor, and their children encouraged the systematic adoption of a polyphonic liturgy; ${ }^{49}$ but there is one important missing link:

[^115]there are no extant references to Kyrie \#3 in England that are labeled Portugaler. If any specific reference is made, it is to the Or me veult title seen in the Mellon Chansonnier, rather than to the Portugaler tunes or the Latin contrafacta attributed to Du Fay. While the alliance between England and Portugal seems like a logical place to look for the origins of this melody, direct evidence is currently lacking. Coussemaker may very well have been on the right track when he speculated that the Portugaler pieces were used at the marriage celebrations of Duke Philip the Good and Isabella of Portugal, for Isabella was the only daughter of Philippa and João of Portugal.

Returning to the British Close Rolls, the specific mention of a man called "a Portugaler" hints at yet another possible meaning for the term: this was a label applied to hundreds of Sephardic Jewish exiles who emigrated to parts of Italy, England, and Germany from the Iberian peninsula. The term is also included in Max Weinreich's History of the Yiddish Language as a specific reference to Sephardic Jews. ${ }^{50}$ While their compulsory expulsion from Spain and Portugal did not come until 1492 and 1497 respectively, emigrants and sea merchants with the designation "Portugaler" seem to have been traveling across Europe and the Mediterranean throughout the fifteenth century. So, then, could the putative reference to Sephardic Jews and/or Portuguese sea merchants and more importantly - any improvisatory musical forms they might have transmitted, have dated back to the time of the Strasbourg manuscript? ${ }^{51}$ Could there have been a

[^116]prototype chanson that predated the mensural form of Kyrie \#3, or an improvised dance form related to the practices of these emigrants? This is pure conjecture, but perhaps Du Fay encountered the Portugaler piece as a dance or instrumental improvisatory tune during his time in Italy, and later used it for a contrafactum. This might explain why his name was associated with the melody in MunBS 3224, and perhaps retroactively added to Strasbourg. To take this one step further, such contrafacta could have provided the model for the Buxheim organ setting on the Portugaler melody, keeping in mind the relationship involving the extended sections of music between the contrafacta and the organ setting. The Buxheim organ book contains a number of contrafacta and dance tunes, including at least five sets of keyboard basse danses each consisting of two polyphonic elaborations of the same melody. ${ }^{52}$ Importantly, Buxheim seems to be a repository of borrowed melodies and reworked tunes gathered from different parts of the Continent.

## SQUARES, DANCE TUNES, AND CAROLS

As mentioned above, Du Fay may have encountered the Kyrie \#3 melody as part
of a dance setting called Portugaler. The possible connection between squares and

[^117]dance tunes may run a bit deeper; in that fifteenth century dance tunes were often copied down as monophonic mensural or non-mensural melodies - much in the same manner as squares. The monophonic melody found in the Alcetur Bible, for example, was copied in much the same manner as the monophonic mensural squares in Lansdowne 462, yet it was originally described in 1964 by Thurston Dart as a dance tune. ${ }^{53}$ The same description was made concerning the three Vatican melodies (found in VatRE 1146 described in Chapter One). All of these melodies exist without text, and they appear with no descriptive information other than titles such as Orma vulte or Le Roy. These traits, then, caused various earlier scholars to assume that they were dance tunes. ${ }^{54}$

As a bit of a side note, the idea of the Kyrie \#3 melody being connected with the dance repertoire is further supported by two literary references to a specific dance called "Ourfute," or "Ourefute," listed by David Fallows and provided by Margaret Bent. ${ }^{55}$ The meanings of these terms are not necessarily clear, other than that they were used for dancing. One possible suggestion is that they translate as "over-foot," ${ }^{\text {" }}$ but it seems more likely that they are Anglicized references to the Or me veult melody. Of further note is that both poems refer to Ourfute in tandem with Orliance; and also, the first poem contains a reference to Portingall. Perhaps these were all dances derived from chansons, or at least pieces that reflected some type of nationalistic origin.

[^118]* a dance "Ourfute" in the Scottish Tale of Colkelbie Sow, 1568 but written before 1501, late sixteenth century Bannatyne MS GB-En Advocates 1.1.6 f.357-365. ${ }^{57}$

At leser drest to dance<br>Sum Ourfute sum Orliance...<br>Sum the Faites full Zarne<br>Off Portingall and Navarre<br>Sum countirfutit the gyss of Spane

* a dance "Ourefute" in the Scottish An Interlude of the Laying of a Gaist. ${ }^{58}$

And it wald sing and it wald dance
Ourefute and Orliance
Quha coniurit the littil gaist sa 3 e ?

Further related to period improvised dances is the genre of basse danses. The connection between squares and basse danse tunes might not be an obvious one, but it presents itself as highly significant. The manner of devising certain basse danse performances is almost parallel to the use of certain squares: extracting a monophonic mensural line from a preexisting composition, preserving the melody in a new source, altering the rhythmic scheme of the original melody, and devising ex tempore harmony upon the melody. Often the extracted melodies for basse danses were transmitted in uniform note values such as in stroke notation or solid breves; or, in other words, "square" shaped notes.

An example of an unmeasured basse danse tune notated on the same manuscript page as an unmeasured faburden tune is found in OxfBDI 167, f.31v (c.1450-c.1475). This source includes three lines of stroke notation, plus one line of monophonic mensural notation. The Census-Catalogue lists these as one hymn faburden tenor, one basse danse

[^119]with French title (tenor only), and one basse danse with the title "queen note" (tenor plus an added discantus- the mensural melody on the lowest system). ${ }^{59}$ In other words, the mensural melody is not the hymn faburden tenor; rather it is the discantus line of a basse danse. So, then, why was the hymn faburden tenor written in stroke notation? Presumably, this tenor was intended for the ex tempore addition of both mensuration and harmony. One of the most important points to make here is that the techniques employed for notating and improvising upon monophonic melodies, whether mensural or notated in uniform note values, were far more universally connected than might have been previously realized.

Closely related to the discussion of uniform mensural notation is the process of adding text to these lines (for example in choral polyphony based on squares), and extemporizing harmony. In written polyphony, the correspondence between the number of pitches and the number of syllables is a problem encountered within the various movements of Ludford's Lady Masses. Jan Willem Bonda explains that fifteenth-century musicians read these melodies in uniform notation as melodic "scaffolding," meaning that the note values could be broken in order to accommodate the text. ${ }^{60}$ When extemporizing harmony, it is worthwhile to examine the "harmonic" construction of basse danse tunes in relation to that of squares, simply because the techniques and

[^120]difficulties encountered in creating an ex tempore basse danse arrangement are closely related to the difficulties encountered in an ex tempore performance based on a square. Ross Duffin has described this process in detail, explaining that on the surface, there would seem to be little difficulty in improvising harmony on these melodies. In theory, a performer need only create consonant intervals against the dance tenor (or square) melody, but in practice, difficulties manifest themselves quickly, and they "necessitate a more narrowly prescribed set of options" for the performers. ${ }^{61}$ For example, if a contratenor is playing or singing a fifth below the tenor, then the discant may not use a third above the tenor because it would create a seventh over the contratenor; a fifth above the tenor while the contratenor is playing or singing a fifth below the tenor creates a ninth between the outside voices, etc. This means that the discant player or singer must use thirds and fifths with great care, and rather, use sixths and octaves above the tenor more frequently, while the contratenor player or singer should avoid sixths below the tenor.

Duffin mentions that the more familiar a musician became with the habits of his colleagues, the more likely he was to avoid conflicts. ${ }^{62}$ It can easily be imagined that this aspect of performer interaction was part of the day-to-day experience in extemporizing on a square.

One further connection to make between squares and basse danses is that many of these basse danse melodies were derived from the tenor parts of Burgundian chansons

[^121]deprived of their mensural rhythm. Some were even performed as polyphonic compositions in two or more voices, ${ }^{63}$ which might explain why the above examples, such as those found in St. Emmeram, are listed with both "discantus Portugaler" and "tenor Portugaler." A number of basse danses took the name of the choreography to which they were applied, meaning, then, that if Portugaler was ever used as a basse danse, there very well could have been an earlier tune with a completely different text that served as the model for the Portugaler pieces, or simply that it was devised originally for dancing. It also means that Du Fay's Portingaloise of Burgundy could have used the same choreography as the Portugaler pieces, rather than the music.

Eileen Southern has found that of the hundred or so extant basse danses, only four tunes originated in Italian sources, while the French repertoire is far more extensive. Two of the dances, Beaulte and La verdelete, have identical melodies though their titles and choreographies differ, showing again that the titles usually indicate the names of the dance choreographies, which may or may not be identical to the titles of the original models for the dance melodies. ${ }^{64}$ Portugaler, for example, as a dance tune may have originated from a chanson on a differently-titled topic, and a preponderance of these melodies in French sources may have made the possibility of their travel to England and across the Continent that much easier.

Other fifteenth-century Continental dance tenors such as Filles à marier and Le petit Rouen, and their choreographies, were written out in the Salisbury Basse Danse manuscript of about 1497, and printed in the Robert Coplande treatise There

[^122]followeth the manner of dancing base dances, published in London in 1521. ${ }^{65}$ This particular publication is only separated from the Ludford Missa feria iii by roughly four or five years; specifically indicating that the practice of borrowing tenor lines for dance improvisation was not unheard of in England, and - more importantly - that this type of treatment, once again, bears relation to the broad practice of composing upon a square.

As a significant side note, another secular performance genre that may have been related to the dance repertoire - and indirectly related to squares - is the English carol. The carol is generally recognized as a fifteenth-century form of "popular piety," involving highly syncopated melodic lines and a format of verses and refrains called "burdens." Yet, the carol has a multifaceted history, including a derivation from the medieval French Carole, a courtly dance song. ${ }^{66}$ John Stevens has pointed out that the combination of these genres and purposes were part of the activities of the Franciscan Friars who propagated various English carols. According to Stevens, the essential purpose of the Franciscans - with regard to music - was to "edify by entertainment, and to take some of the Devil's good songs away and give them back to God. ${ }^{\circ 67}$ The Franciscans fostered a tradition of sacred contrafacta for the purpose of spiritually reaching a broad populace; a practice that may be related to the sacred contrafacta described above with the Portugaler / Or me veult / Kyrie melody. The Portugaler settings discussed above, however, appear in manuscripts copied at Benedictine institutions.

[^123]In this sense, it is worth mentioning that a number of the extant carols appear as monophonic mensural melodies in Franciscan manuscripts, copied in the same manner as squares such as those seen in Lansdowne 462. Some monophonic carols, such as Though I Sing, are written in uniform, non-mensural notation - copied more in the manner of a basse danse. According to Stevens, the carol writers sometimes borrowed their Latin lines from hymns based on plainchant melodies, perhaps revealing that some of the carols were sung to plainchant hymn melodies just like certain squares. ${ }^{68}$ As mentioned above, the keeping of monophonic mensural and non-mensural carol melodies further involves the very same process as the keeping of squares described in Chapter Two. Some of the carols, such as The Best Rede, contain rubrics for the top line, "ad placitum," meaning that these top lines were probably added and considered interchangeable, or open to ex tempore additions in a manner also related to the use of squares.

A recent article by Christopher Macklin describes the musical endeavors of the Franciscans in response to various maladies and social disturbances, particularly plague and infectious disease. The hymn Stella celi extirpavit, as mentioned in Chapter Three, was used as a plea for deliverance from such illness and plague; ${ }^{69}$ a hymn that also appears as a monophonic mensural melody among the squares in Lansdowne 462. The fact that this melody, used as a popular response to a distressing communal event, appears in a collection of known squares further illustrates the widespread use and even "purpose" of squares. Music for an important invocation, such as pleading for relief from plague, would necessarily (or hopefully so), be available to lay musicians and clerics for

[^124]immediate and pressing use. ${ }^{70}$
The Stella celi, as described in Chapter Three, was a text that existed in various monophonic and polyphonic settings that crossed between England and the Continent. The phenomenon of borrowing between the two territories is an extensive one that can not be fully addressed here. Yet, it should be pointed out that there are a handful of examples that may one day be found to connect to the square repertoire. In his recent book on this topic, Theodore Dumitrescu has described a case in which an English music fragment is most likely borrowed from Binchois. The two-voice Votre trey dowce on f.144v of the Ritson Manuscript uses the tenor of Binchois' chanson as the foundation for a "curious newly composed counterpoint made up of repeated statements of a single motive of different pitch levels. ${ }^{71}$ Of the utmost importance here is the suggestion by Kemp, and also Stevens, that the piece represents a style of improvised dance music. ${ }^{72}$

Dumitrescu also describes a leaf at the front of a Sarum Processional, Harley 1512, f. 2 (LonBLH 1512), containing various pen trials as well as the Binchois tenor labeled "VOTRE." This tenor line is written in stroke notation with the ending in mensural notation, a system used most often with basse danse tunes. ${ }^{73}$ Perhaps this tenor was used

[^125]for more than just basse danses. Once again, though, this is a topic that certainly needs further investigation outside of the parameters of the present study.

Returning to the Kyrie \#3 melody, it seems quite probable that it traveled as a dance or improvisatory tune, but the reality is that we may never know exactly where this melody came from. Given that all the earlier sources containing the melody are Continental and the later sources English, it would suggest that it originated on the Continent and made its way to England with the Or me veult chanson - but as with most phenomena of this kind, the answer is rarely so obvious, if indeed it can be determined at all. In looking at the Continental sources, there is an added factor to keep in mind: many of them are quite cosmopolitan, and they contain pieces by English composers.

At the same time, the various corresponding sources do tell us something about squares. The very same traditions of improvisation over fixed melodies used with squares were also used in the secular world: the ex tempore creation of contratenor lines, the improvisation of dance tunes and instrumental pieces, and the application of mensural rhythm to tunes written down in uniform note values. The significance of this one particular melodic example, the Or me veult melody, is that it was physically connected to the English term "square." The door has been opened to an enormous repertoire of potential square correspondences that include both Continental chansons and dance tunes.

## CHAPTER 6

## THE THREE MASSES UPON THE SQUARE

Over the course of the preceding chapters, the three Masses specifically labeled "Upon the Square," two by William Mundy and one by William Whitbroke, have been mentioned as the only extant pieces of polyphony to have the label "square" attached to their title. These Masses are found only in the Gyffard Partbooks (LonBL 17802-5) compiled around 1557, and they share various compositional aspects such as the migration of the squares between voice parts, the use of generally three voices at a time, dissonance treatment, selection of vocal ranges, and the segmentation of textual phrases. Also, the part designations for triplex, medius, contratenor, and bassus within all three Masses involves a specific configuration of two overlapping top voices in a mean register plus a high tenor and a bass. [My transcription of the three Masses Upon the Square can be found in Appendix II]. ${ }^{1}$ How were these Masses constructed and what can we learn about their various compositional elements that will add to our understanding of the practice of composing upon a square?

## THE THREE MASSES AND THE GYFFARD PARTBOOKS

The Gyffard Partbooks were acquired by the British Museum in 1849 and rebound in 1934. Unfortunately, no record was kept of the original gathering structure during the rebinding process, and the twentieth-century binders accidentally exchanged the cover pages of the medius and contratenor books. The binders further assigned the

[^126]medius as the top voice part with the call number 17802, creating a bit of a puzzle for future transcribers (see below). The modern transcription provided in Appendix II, then, uses the original titles in order to keep the original part order: triplex, medius, contratenor, bassus.

| Original \# |  | Original title |  |  | Current title |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| voice 1 |  |  |  | Current call number |  |
| triplex |  | triplex |  | 17803 |  |
| voice 2 |  | medius |  | contratenor |  |
| voice 3 | contratenor |  | medius |  | 17802 |
| voice 4 | bassus |  | bassus |  | 17804 |
|  |  |  |  | 17805 |  |

The Gyffard Partbooks encompass settings of various liturgical categories: the Asperges me, Mass settings, individual Kyrie movements, motets, Magnificats, and other Marian music by composers such as Sheppard, Tallis, Taverner, and Tye. In Bray's study of their compilation, he noticed that the two Kyries that contained squares Taverner's Le Roy Kyrie (Kyrie \#1) and Hyett's Kyrie (Kyrie \#13) - were separated from the other Kyries by gaps in the manuscript. Otherwise, the order of pieces in the partbooks is by liturgical arrangement, and then by composer according to age. ${ }^{2}$ The three Masses Upon the Square are placed together as a set, but they are also separated from other Masses based on a preexistent melody, such as the three Western Wynde Masses by John Taverner, Christopher Tye, and John Sheppard.

The three Western Wynde Masses are certainly related in structure and design to the Masses Upon the Square, but they are based on the treble, or primary tune of a

[^127]popular melody, as opposed to the tenor or contratenor of a preexisting piece. ${ }^{3}$ The Western Wynde Masses are all four-voice polyphonic works in which a minimallyornamented preexisting melody migrates between the voice parts - very much like the three Masses Upon the Square - but they lack the designation "upon the Square of Western Wynde" in their titles. Perhaps, in this case, the designation "square" was only used for borrowed contratenor or tenor lines.

The Western Wynde Masses are followed in the partbooks by Sheppard's The ffrench Masse and Be not afraide Masse, Tallis' Plainsong Mass, Taverner's Playnsong Masse, and Sheppard's Playnsong Masse for a Mene. ${ }^{4}$ This latter setting contains a tenor part in uniform chant notation that physically looks like a line of "squares," yet this Mass does not contain the phrase "upon the square" in its title. The three Masses Upon the Square are then separated from these other Masses by some forty pieces. The Masses Upon the Square may have been separated for a reason, possibly due to their basis on squares as opposed to other fixed melody types. Otherwise, they could have been added to the partbooks at a much later date, or they could have become separated during the rebinding process in the early twentieth century.

Hugh Baillie believed that all of the music in the Gyffard Partbooks was written during the reign of the Catholic Queen Mary I, and he also believed that the books were probably never used for performance, as certain pieces still contain many uncorrected errors. He further theorized that the manuscripts were probably shelved and deemed

[^128]inappropriate for services in the new Church of England under Queen Elizabeth. ${ }^{5}$ The three Masses Upon the Square, in particular, do contain a number of scribal errors, including missing mensuration signs, incorrect note values, and missing and misapplied rests. However, certain passages in the three Masses contain various "corrections" within the individual partbooks: for example, crossed-out stems on minims in order to make semibreves, or numbers written above notes to indicate their rhythmic value when hollow notes were accidentally filled in. While the numerous manuscript errors certainly lend credence to Baillie's belief, these corrections, as well as further evidence discussed throughout this chapter, indicate that the Masses Upon the Square were most likely used in performance at some point.

## THE USE AND PLACEMENT OF THE SQUARES WITHIN THE THREE MASSES

Each of the three Masses is entitled "Apon [Upon] the Square," implying a single square for each Mass. However, each movement within the three Masses contains a different melodic basis, or square. In this sense, the three Masses are really "upon the [various] square[s]," and the list below shows the melodic concordances for each of the squares across the three Masses. The Whitbroke Mass and Mundy's second Mass share the same square melodies between each of their respective movements except the Kyries, and all three Masses share the same Credo square. ${ }^{6}$

[^129]
## WHITBROKE MASS UPON THE SQUARE

Kyrie square - Kyrie \#2

* Lansdowne 462, f. 152, second system, Dunstaple, Dominica die
* LonBLR A45-48, Ludford, Missa feria ii
* LonPR 63/22/1/3v, Kyrie fragment

Gloria square - Gloria \#2

* same as the Mundy Mass 2 Gloria

Credo square - Credo \#1

* all three Masses Upon the Square

Sanctus square - Sanctus \#8

* Same as the Mundy Mass 2 Sanctus

Agnus square - Agnus \#2

* Same as Mundy Mass 2 Agnus

MUNDY MASS UPON THE SQUARE 1
Kyrie square - Kyrie \#10

* Lansdowne 462, f.151v, third system, feria iv
* VatRE 1146

Gloria square - Gloria \# 1

* Old Hall Manuscript, ff.2-2v, Gloria

Credo square - Credo \#1

* all three Masses Upon the Square

Sanctus square - Sanctus \#6

* Lansdowne 462, f.1v, twelfth system, Sanctus

Agnus square - Agnus \#1

* [unknown]

MUNDY MASS UPON THE SQUARE 2
Kyrie square - Kyrie \#13

* Lansdowne 462, f.151v, eleventh system, feria v
* LonBL 17802-5, Hyett, Kyrie

Gloria square - Gloria \#2

* same as the Whitbroke Mass

Credo square - Credo \#1

* all three Masses Upon the Square

Sanctus square - Sanctus \#8

* same as the Whitbroke Mass

Agnus square - Agnus \#2

* same as the Whitbroke Mass

Within the Gyffard Partbooks, the three Masses Upon the Square have been neglected and left untranscribed until quite recently. This is somewhat remarkable, given that other pieces from these partbooks have long been available in modern edition. Pieces such as the Western Wynde Masses and the Taverner Le Roy Kyrie have been performed and recorded for years. Why, then, were the three Masses neglected? The most complicated, and interesting, issue concerning the relative neglect of the Masses is the peculiar positioning of the squares with respect to the part assignments. Within each of the three Masses, the square melodies migrate between different voice parts, occasionally with some type of ornamentation. This is facilitated by changing the clef markings within each individual partbook. The square is almost always written in a low clef for the bass register except for a few short instances that will be discussed below in Mundy's two Masses. This means that the contratenor and two mean voices were periodically required to sing the square melody in its bass register.

It is possible that the square was transposed into an appropriate register by the respective singers, and that the original cleffing was only an aspect of visual integrity for the square. However, changing the register of the square would disturb the harmonic function of the counterpoint. Other extant pieces using squares, such as the Ludford Lady Masses discussed in the previous chapters, generally keep the melody in its customary
tenor or bass partbook, and do not include transpositions of the squares into higher registers. Exceptions to this include the Taverner three-fold Christe found in LonBL 18936-9, discussed in Chapter Five; and the Taverner Leroy Kyrie found in the Gyffard Partbooks, discussed in Chapter Three. In the Taverner Christe, the square is moved to the top voice part in the third section of the piece, and the melody is transposed into the appropriate sounding register for the top line. The same is true for the Leroy Kyrie, where the square is used in the top voice, written in an appropriate vocal register for a mean or treble singer. These two pieces seem to be among a very few number of exceptions though, for most extant written pieces based on squares keep the melodies consistently in their respective lower registers.

It is also possible that men who could sing in the bass register were positioned on all voice parts when performing the three Masses and that they took over whenever the square appeared in their partbook. A further possibility is that the singers might have physically exchanged partbooks over the course of the performance; an idea that seems excessively impractical but still possible. This obstacle of part voicing alone might be reason enough to explain the modern neglect of the Masses; although to be sure, it might have made an interesting game for the performing musicians in the sixteenth century. The three Masses are also highly sectional, containing a cadence and definitive pause marked with a double bar line and fermata at the end of every phrase - an aspect that in modern terms seems to "stunt" the musical progression of each movement. Perhaps these fermatas were part of the style for performing votive Masses; or possibly, they were used as pauses to allow performers to exchange partbooks.

Of the three Masses, the Whitbroke Mass Upon the Square involves the most
frequent migrations of the bass-register squares into the triplex and medius partbooks.
The overall use of the squares within the Mass can be charted as follows (Ex. 6-1).
Reading the chart from left to right, the opening text of each individual phrase is provided. The " $x$ " in each box indicates the voice parts being utilized within the polyphonic texture, and the square is labeled as such in its appropriate voice part.

Ex. 6-1:

|  | mensuration | triplex | medius | contratenor | bassus |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| KYRIE | $\phi$ | X | x |  | square |
| Kyrie |  | square | x | X |  |
| Kyrie |  | x | X | square |  |
| Christe | ¢ | X |  | X | square |
| Christe |  |  | X | square | x |
| Christe |  | X | X |  | square |
| Kyrie |  | X | square | X |  |
| Kyrie |  | x | x | square |  |
| Kyrie | C | X | X | X | square |
| ET IN TERRA | ¢ |  | X | X | square |
| Laudamus |  | X | X | square |  |
| Gracias |  | X |  | X | square |
| Dominus |  | square | x | x |  |
| Domine fili |  | x | x |  | square |
| Domine Deus |  |  | X | square | x |
| Qui tollis |  | X | square | x |  |
| Qui tollis |  |  | x | X | square |
| Qui sedes |  | X | X | square |  |
| Quoniam |  | X |  | square | x |
| Tu solus |  | x | square | x |  |
| Cum sancto | C | X | x | X | square |
| FACTOREM |  | X | X |  | square |
| Et in unum |  | square | x | x |  |
| Et ex patre |  | x | X | square |  |
| Deum de Deo | $\phi$ |  | X | square | X |
| Qui propter |  | x | x | x | square |
| Et incarnatus | C | X |  | X | square |
| Et resurrexit |  | square | x | x |  |
| Et ascendit | ¢ | x | X |  | square |
| Et iterum | $\varphi$ and C | X | X | square |  |
| Et in spiritum | ¢ |  | X | X | square |
| Qui cum patre |  | x | square | X |  |


| Et unam | \& and C | X | x |  | square |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Confiteor |  | X | X | square |  |
| Et expecto |  | X |  | x | square |
| Et vitam |  | X | x | X | square |
| SANCTUS | $\phi$ | X | X |  | square |
| Dominus |  | X | X |  | square |
| Pleni sunt | ¢ | X | square | x |  |
| Osanna |  | X | x | X | square |
| Benedictus |  | square | x | x |  |
| Osanna | ¢ and C | x | X | X | square |
| QUI TOLLIS | $\phi$ | X |  | X | square |
| Miserere |  | X |  | X | square |
| Agnus Dei | 4 | square | X | X |  |
| Miserere |  | x | X | square |  |
| Agnus Dei | C | X | X | X | square |
| Dona nobis | $\underset{\sim}{¢}$ and ${ }^{\circ}$ | X | X | X | square |

As can be seen, the mensuration of the various sections is changed more frequently within the last three movements, and sometimes even involves multiple mensurations at the same time. Generally, the second mensuration is used for the square only, while the other two (or three) voice parts are notated in the first mensuration. For example, beginning in bar 76 of the Gloria, the contratenor (containing the square) is set in a different mensuration from the other voices (below, Ex. 6-2). This does not make an aural impact, for two measured units of the contratenor equal three measured units of the other two voices, but it does create a noteworthy visual aspect within the movement.

Ex. 6-2:


The reason for the mixed mensurations is entirely unknown, though it is noteworthy that the square's mensuration matches that of Mundy's second Mass at each instance. The use of squares, as seen in Chapter Three, was not necessarily concerned with maintaining a single mensural setting for any given square melody, a fact which would discredit the idea that Whitbroke might have been maintaining an "original" form of the square melodies.

The use of the squares within Mundy's First Mass can be seen as follows:
Ex. 6-3:

|  | mensuration | triplex | medius | contratenor | bassus |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| KYRIE | $\phi$ | x |  | x | square |
| Kyrie |  | X | X | square |  |
| Christe | ¢ |  | X | X | square |
| Christe |  | x | square | x |  |
| Kyrie |  |  | x | square | X |
| Kyrie | C | x | x | x | square |
| ET IN TERRA | 4 | X |  | X | square |
| Laudamus |  |  | X | square | X |
| Gratias |  | x |  | X | square |
| Domine Deus |  | X | x |  | square |
| Domine fili |  |  | square in treble clef | x | X |
| Domine Deus |  | x | x | x | square |
| Qui tollis | C | x |  | x | square |
| Qui tollis |  | x | x | square |  |
| Qui sedes | ¢ |  | X | x | square |
| Quoniam tu solus |  | ? square in treble clef |  | X | x |
| Tu solus Dominus |  | X | ? square in treble clef |  | X |
| Jesu Christe |  | X | X | square |  |
| Amen |  | X | X | x | square |
| FACTOREM | C | X |  | X | square |
| Et in unum |  |  | x | square | X |
| Et ex patre |  | x | x | square |  |
| Deum de Deo | ¢ | X |  | x | square |
| Qui propter |  | X | x | x | square |
| Et incarnatus | C |  | x | square | x |
| Et resurrexit |  | x |  | X | square |


| Et ascendit | $\phi$ | X | X |  | square |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Et iterum | C | X | X | square |  |
| Et in spiritum | 4 | x | X | square |  |
| Qui cum patre |  | X |  | x | square |
| Et unam | C | square in treble clef | x |  | x |
| Confiteor |  | x | X |  | square |
| Et expecto |  |  | X | square | x |
| Et vitam | C | X | X | x | square |
| SANCTUS | 4 |  | x | X | square |
| Sanctus |  | X | X | X | square |
| Pleni sunt |  | x | X | square |  |
| Gloria |  | square in treble clef |  | x | X |
| Osanna |  | X | x | x | square |
| Benedictus |  | X | X | square $1^{\text {st }}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { square } \\ & 2^{\text {nd }} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
| Osanna | C | X | X | X | square |
| AGNUS DEI | $\phi$ | X |  | X | square |
| Miserere |  |  | x | square | x |
| Agnus Dei | 4 | X |  | square | X |
| Miserere |  | X | x | square |  |
| Agnus Dei | $\phi$ | X | X | X | square |

The chart of Mundy's first Mass reveals that the composer preferred to keep the squares in the lower two voice parts, and that he was far less adventuresome than Whitbroke in having the squares migrate into the upper two voices. In fact, he only moves the bassregister square into the medius voice once, in the second statement of the Christe. Of the greatest interest are the few occasions when square material is found in the top two voices, written in the appropriate vocal register for a treble or mean singer; for example in the Gloria (below, Ex. 6-4).

Ex. 6-4:


The judgment concerning whether or not this melodic material is really a square is based on Mundy's consistent treatment of the squares throughout his two Masses. Within each phrase, or section separated with a double bar line, the square material is the first voice to enter the musical texture. This can be seen in the top voice in bar 98 of Ex. 6-4. Furthermore, this treatment of the square (as the first voice to commence in the polyphonic texture), can also be seen in Ludford's seven Lady Masses.

The first occurrence of a square being transposed into the treble register is found in the Gloria at "Domine fili," in the medius voice. The second occurrence happens at "Quonium tu solus" in the triplex voice. This second example occurs at precisely the point where the one concordant source for this melody has suffered a loss of material. Mundy's Gloria has a melodic concordance with an anonymous Gloria found in the Old Hall Manuscript, ff. 2-2v. The second half of this source - beginning with the text "miserere nobis" - is now missing (see Ex. 6-4, above, in bar 93 of the bassus voice). Mundy then began the next section with what appears to be the square in the triplex voice, notated in the treble register.

The notation of the square in the treble register happens again in the Sanctus at the text "gloria tua" (below, Ex. 6-5 in bar 47):

Ex. 6-5:


This particular example can be confirmed as including the square, for it follows a concordant source found in Lansdowne 462, f.lv, twelfth system. There is no apparent reason why Mundy would randomly transpose this one portion of the square up an octave to fit the top voice part. There is also no apparent reason why Mundy chose only these few instances to set the square within the top two voices.

The use of the squares within Mundy's second Mass can be seen in the chart below (Ex. 6-6). Like his first Mass, Mundy preferred here to keep the squares in the lower two voices. In fact, the square only appears in the medius once, at the "confiteor of the Credo.

Ex. 6-6:

|  | mensuration | triplex | medius | contratenor | bassus |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| KYRIE | $\boldsymbol{\phi}$ | x |  | x | square |
| Kyrie |  |  | x | square | x |
| Christe | $\mathbf{Q}$ | x | x |  | square |
| Christe |  | x |  | square | x |
| Kyrie |  |  | x | x | square |
| Kyrie | C | x | x | x | square |
| ET IN TERRA | $\mathbf{Q}$ | x | x | x | square |
| Laudamus |  |  | x | square | x |
| Gratias |  | x | x |  | square |
| Domine Deus |  | x | x | x | square |
| Domine fili |  | x | x | square |  |


| Domine Deus |  | x | x | x | square |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Qui tollis | C |  | X | square | X |
| Qui tollis |  | x |  | x | square |
| Qui sedes | ¢ |  | x | square | x |
| Quoniam tu solus |  | x | x |  | square |
| Tu solus Dominus |  | x | x | square |  |
| Cum sancto spiritu | C | X | X | x | square |
| FACTOREM |  | X |  | x | square |
| Et in unum |  |  | x | square | x |
| Et ex patre |  | x | x |  | square |
| Deum de Deo | ¢ | X |  | square | X |
| Qui propter nos |  | x | x | x | square |
| Et incarnatus | C |  | X | X | square |
| Et resurrexit |  | x |  | square | X |
| Et ascendit | $\phi$ | x | x |  | square |
| Et iterum | C |  | x | x | square |
| Et in spiritum | ¢ | X |  | square | x |
| Qui cum patre |  | x | x |  | square |
| Et unam | C | x |  | square | x |
| Confiteor |  |  | square in treble clef | square | X |
| Et expecto |  | X | x | square |  |
| Et vitam |  | X | X | x | square |
| SANCTUS | $\phi$ | X |  | X | square |
| Dominus Deus |  | x | x |  | square |
| Pleni sunt | ¢ |  | X | square | X |
| Osanna |  | x |  | X | square |
| Benedictus |  | x | x | square |  |
| Osanna | C | X | X | x | square |
| AGNUS DEI | $\phi$ | x |  | X | square |
| Miserere |  | x |  | x | square |
| Agnus Dei | ¢ |  | X | square | x |
| Miserere |  | x | X | square |  |
| Agnus Dei | C | X | X | X | square |
| Dona nobis | $\bigcirc$ | X | X | X | square |

Closer inspection also reveals a direct relationship between the mensuration changes of the three Masses Upon the Square. All three Masses begin their Kyries in $\boldsymbol{\phi}$ and move to $\boldsymbol{\phi}$ in their Christe sections. This is true regardless of format, for Whitbroke provides three polyphonic sections for the Kyrie while Mundy's two Masses
are set in alternatim. The final statement of all three Kyrie movements is set in $\mathcal{C}$, and similar correspondences occur across the other movements. The following chart further reveals these relationships.

Ex. 6-7:

|  | WHITBROKE | MUNDY 1 | MUNDY 2 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Kyrie | $\phi$ | $\phi$ | $\phi$ |
| Christe | ¢ | ¢ | ¢ |
| Kyrie (last statement) | C | C | C |
| Et in terra | ¢ | 4 | ¢ |
| Qui tollis | ¢ | C | C |
| Qui sedes | ¢ | ¢ | ¢ |
| Cum sancto spiritu | C | ¢ | C |
| Factorem | C | C | C |
| Deum de Deo | $\phi$ | ¢ | ¢ |
| Et incarnatus | C | C | C |
| Et ascendit | $\phi$ | ¢ | $\phi$ |
| Et iterum | $\varphi_{\text {and }} \mathrm{C}$ | C | C |
| Et in spiritum | 4 | 4 | ¢ |
| Et unam | ¢ and C | C | C |
| Sanctus | $\phi$ | ¢ | $\phi$ |
| Pleni sunt | ¢ | ¢ | ¢ |
| Osanna (last statement) | ¢ and C | C | C |
| Qui tollis (Whitbroke) / Agnus (Mundy) | $\phi$ | $\phi$ | $\phi$ |
| Agnus Dei | ¢ | ¢ | ¢ |
| Agnus Dei | C | $\phi$ | C |
| Dona nobis | ¢ and ${ }^{\circ}$ | $\phi$ | $\bigcirc$ |

Whitbroke's Mass and Mundy's second Mass share various mensural changes, for example at the "cum sancto spiritu," the "sanctus," the second "Agnus Dei," and the "dona nobis." In other locations, the two Mundy Masses are more closely related, for example at the "qui tollis," and the "Deum de Deo." Mundy's first Mass also includes a different phrase distribution in the Gloria; for example, containing separate phrases for "Jesu Christe," and "Amen." The distribution of voice parts and the placement of the square for any given textural phrase appears far more arbitrary across the three Masses.

Also, Whitbroke's Mass and Mundy's second Mass share the same squares in all movements except their Kyries. Here, Mundy used the Le Roy tune also used by Taverner in his Le Roy Kyrie.

## GENERAL COMPOSITIONAL FEATURES

As mentioned above, the three Masses share various compositional and structural features such as the vocal distribution for two means, a high tenor, and a bass; the segmentation of the phrases; the use of generally three voices at a time; and the homogeneous integration of the square into the surrounding polyphonic fabric. Yet, there are a few occasions within the three Masses that do not follow these general patterns. The Crucifixus section of the Whitbroke Credo is particularly striking since it contains the only passage within all three Masses that utilizes a two-voice texture (below, Ex. 6-8). Ex. 6-8:


This section also contains a triplet figure that appears in bar 52 in the triplex part. The figure seems to be a somewhat random melodic ornament, and not necessarily connected to the text. A related figure appears in the medius in bar 27 (below, Ex. 6-9). These are the only moments within any of the three Masses that contain such a figure.

Ex. 6-9:


The Sanctus of Mundy's first Mass contains one of the few examples of a voice exchange within a single musical phrase (below, Ex. 6-10). In bar 103, the square migrates to the bassus partbook in the middle of the phrase.

Ex. 6-10:


Related to the topic of voice exchange are the instances where various voice parts are extended into the upper ends of their ranges. For example, in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass, the contratenor ascends to a high F in bar 18 (below, Ex. 6-11). This creates a particularly unusual aural effect as this part sits only a third below the triplex line. As can be seen in bar 17, this is approached by a leap of a seventh, preceded by a fifth in the same direction. This short passage, with all voices in a relatively high register, seems to take on the characteristic of a three-part treble or mean piece.

Ex. 6-11:


The following passage from the Credo of Mundy's second Mass also places the bassus part in a fairly high register. In fact, at the cadence in bar 32, the bassus becomes the highest voice of the overall texture (below, Ex. 6-12).

Ex. 6-12:


This particular feature is perhaps due to the nature of the square itself, as a melody that sits in a particularly high register. This specific square (the Credo square) is further shared by all three Masses.

Contrapuntally, the three Masses display various instances of imitation, such as seen below (Ex. 6-13) in the Kyrie of Mundy's first Mass. This cascading figure is also found throughout the other movements of the Mass.

Ex. 6-13:


The reverse of this effect is seen at the end of the movement, which features ascending imitative figures:

Ex. 6-14:


Mundy's second Mass also contains a considerable amount of melodic and rhythmic interest within the Gloria. The contratenor in the passage below (Ex. 6-15), for example, contains a much higher level of syncopation than is seen in any of the other Mass movements.

Ex. 6-15:


## CONTRAPUNTAL DISSONANCE WITHIN THE THREE MASSES

Within the three Masses, there is also an inordinate number of downbeat dissonances, or accented passing tones. These usually last the duration of an eighth note (and sometimes a quarter note) in modern transcription. Some of these dissonances call to mind similar occurrences in the music of early- to mid-sixteenth-century England. Composers such as Thomas Tallis, John Sheppard, William Byrd, and Christopher Tye included these small clashes in many of their compositions. ${ }^{7}$ An example appears in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass (below, Ex. 6-16). On the third beat of bar 131, the Bnatural in the medius, on the syllable "glo-" clashes with the sustained C in the triplex. The medius B could probably be an A, but examples such as this appear so frequently within the three Masses that they seem to be part of the idiom.

[^130]Ex. 6-16:


Most of these examples flow out of the contrapuntal interaction of the parts. For example, also in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass (below, Ex. 6-17), the contratenor opens the "et in spiritum" with an ascending step followed by a third which is imitated in the top two voices. The triplex, while following this melodic contour, enters with a direct clash against the contratenor: a D in the triplex against the C in the contratenor voice. Ex. 6-17:


This is a rather intense clash, lasting for a full quarter note in modern transcription. Altering this pitch, though, would disturb the intervallic pattern of the imitation, and it presents a problematic question in terms of understanding sixteenth-century performance practice: was such a discord really tolerated in the counterpoint? In looking at the melodic structure of these three voice parts, it certainly seems possible.

A further point of interest concerns the interaction between the dissonant voices.

There are a number of times where a voice part creates a contrapuntal dissonance with the square. Such an example occurs on the downbeat of bar 22 in the Credo of Mundy's first Mass, where the contratenor D clashes with the bassus E (below, Ex. 6-18). Here, the contratenor is creating a direct dissonance with the square in the bassus partbook. Ex. 6-18:


Clashes between the square and the other voice parts do happen on an occasional basis within the three Masses. The clash in Ex. 6-18 might seem to be a mistake if it were not for the same imitative intervallic structure appearing in the triplex line.

Examples such as these were discussed in an article by Roger Bray in 1969 as a way of deducing that the partbooks were never actually used in performance; ${ }^{8}$ however, it would seem unwise to dismiss the Gyffard Partbooks as performance sources so easily. As discussed in Chapter Two, squares and the use of squares derived from a tradition of ex tempore performance, and it would make sense that at least a few remnants of such techniques might occasionally make their way into written composition. Specifically, ex tempore performers might have tolerated such a clash, particularly if it resulted from following the melodic contours of the other performers.

After encountering these figures again and again, especially within the opening

[^131]movements of the Whitbroke Mass, and in the context of a fairly consistent use of particular rhythmic figures, they seem to represent a trademark of Whitbroke's writing for his Mass Upon the Square. Such rhythmic figures would include the sequence of eighthnote motives containing accented passing tones that begins in bar 91 of the Kyrie (below, Ex. 6-19). This rhythmic figure seems to be a model for the majority of discords within the movement, as well as in the subsequent movements of Whitbroke's Mass. These generally include the clash on the first note of the eighth-note pair, such as the triplex G against the medius A at the beginning of bar 92 .

Ex. 6-19:


While all three Masses contain a number of such accented and unaccented passing tones, the Whitbroke Kyrie, which is also the longest Kyrie of the three Masses, displays this particular issue early on (below, Ex. 6-20). In the fourth bar of this movement, the triplex D momentarily clashes with the medius C. Even more unusual is the fact that this dissonance immediately follows a clash between the bassus F and the medius B-natural. In the next measure, the triplex G clashes with the medius F.

Ex. 6-20:


Similar issues appear in the opening of the Kyrie of Mundy's first Mass (below, Ex. 621). Beginning in bar 3, the bassus E clashes against the contratenor D ; in bar 4 , the contratenor G clashes against the triplex A ; in bar 5 the bassus A clashes against the triplex B; and the second bassus A clashes against the contratenor G. These examples generally act as passing tones; but overall, they make for a rather unusual number of discords within the opening few bars of a Mass movement.

Ex. 6-21:


Whereas most of the dissonances that occur in this movement last merely the duration of an eighth note in modern transcription, a few of them last for an entire beat (see below, Ex. 6-22: the medius C against the contratenor B in bar 48). In a modern edition, the medius can easily be changed to a D , but the manuscript contains a C semibreve, not a D and a C minim. In other words, this does not seem to have been an
error on the part of the scribe or composer.
Ex. 6-22:


One particular dissonance figure occurs in more than one location throughout the Gloria of Mundy's first Mass (below, Ex. 6-23). In bars 116 and 128, the second line descends, so that the B clashes with the C in the third voice. The repeat of this figure seems to further the conviction that such downbeat dissonances were intentional. Ex. 6-23:


Another such example occurs in the Sanctus of Mundy's First Mass (below, Ex. 6-24). A highly noticeable dissonance occurs in bar 68, where the third beat of the contratenor line is indicated as an F-natural against the descending B in the medius line. This would seem to be a manuscript error, whether scribal or accidental, if it were not for the fact that the F-natural is held into the next bar against an F-natural in the bassus. In this case, the
tritone between the medius and contratenor may have been intentional, especially since an F-sharp is added to the medius in bar 74 to avoid a tritone with the B in the top voice.

Ex. 6-24:


One final example of a contrapuntal dissonance occurs in bar 111 of the Gloria of Mundy's second Mass (below, Ex. 6-25). The upper two voices clash with the lower two voices in an accented passing figure (the pitches E and G in the upper two voices against the D and F in the lower two voices). Once again, this seems a bit too complicated to have been a simple scribal error, as all four part books are involved in this discord. Ex. 6-25:


## ACCIDENTALS AND THE THREE MASSES

Aside from the contrapuntal dissonance seen above, the difficulties surrounding added accidentals are particularly problematic within the three Masses Upon the Square.

Apparently many of the accidentals in the Gyffard Partbooks were added by someone (or even various hands) looking at the individual books - mostly the triplex book. In certain cases, the accidentals do look to have been added later, "squeezed" into a small space a few notes in advance of the affected note. Also, the accidentals added into key signatures do not always match those of the other partbooks, particularly where it would make sense to match the triplex and medius books that share the same vocal register, melodic contours, and sometimes the same imitative figures. This evidence indicates that at least some of these accidentals were added by performers who were unaware of the other voice parts, possibly by individuals studying the singular partbooks outside the context of a polyphonic performance. In other instances, a B-flat sign has been added to a key signature where the pitch B does not appear in the melodic line. In these cases, it seems that the performer was aware of what was happening in the other voice parts and placed the flat in the key signature as a reference. These instances, combined with the rhythmic and notational corrections mentioned above, support the idea that the three Masses were indeed used in performance at some point.

Period theorists sometimes relate that singers often added accidentals that were not necessarily intended by the composer. This is mentioned in William Cornysh's 1504 poem, A parable between informacion and musicke. Cornysh, who represents "Truth" in his poem, is set against an adversary who represents the contemporary performer. He states that the performer is "so curious in his chauntynge, that to bere a trew plainsong it is not possible." Truth states, "I epe be roune and he be square, the one is bemole, and the other bequare." ${ }^{9}$ Supposedly, Cornysh, as a composer and choirmaster, applied a

[^132]different set of performance parameters than his "adversary." ${ }^{10}$ To be sure, Cornysh is describing hexachordal usage in the singing of plainsong, but the very inconsistency shown in the three Masses Upon the Square alone implies that performers were not unanimous in their interpretation of any given piece of polyphony - particularly concerning when to use B-flat or B-natural. Since both pitches were part of the gamut, the more important question might be: when were the accidentals added to the three Masses?

This topic is further addressed by the theorist William Bathe in the 1580 's, and he wrote of contemporary musicians performing earlier music: ${ }^{11}$
there be eight notes, whose ascension, and descension doe comprehend all tunes, as the roote doth the tree, be they never so difficult, with flats and sharps, who so knew how to use them, the notes are common, the use is rare, or not yet found which being knowen, will give great light to musitions and breed great ease to singing men.

Roger Bray has explained that Bathe's contemporaries in the 1580's seem to have had a problem with performance practice, and that Bathe's comments indicate that they desired to solve it in a manner that reflected earlier practices: by the men "who so knew how to use them [flats and naturals]. ${ }^{12}$ Bathe's excerpt is admittedly ambiguous, but it does support the idea that a number of sixteenth-century musicians may have either disagreed over ficta application and hexachordal usage, or they were removed from an older common practice. By the end of the century, Thomas Morley remarks in his Plaine

[^133]and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musik, "Because I thought it better flat than sharp, I have set it flat; but if any man like the other way better let him use his discretion." ${ }^{13}$ It seems, then, that this attitude of performer discretion (or retrospective interpretation) was applied in the case of the three Masses Upon the Square, since most of these accidentals appear to have been added sometime after the individual partbooks were copied.

One further point made by Roger Bray is that sometimes the accidentals within the Gyffard Partbooks reconfirm the key signature. ${ }^{14}$ Occasional appearances of B-sharp ("square B," indicating B-natural) happen throughout the three Masses when there is really no reason to assume the note should have ever been a B-flat. Bray seems to believe that the Gyffard scribe was copying what he saw, and the accidentals were present in the source from which he was copying. ${ }^{15}$ However, it seems more likely that the marks were added by certain performers whose tendency may have been to utilize the soft hexachord more often than the hard hexachord. Quite often though, within the Whitbroke Mass especially, the addition of B-flat to the triplex line creates uncharacteristic dissonances with the other voice parts. The Gloria of the Whitbroke Mass provides a few good examples of this, where the added accidentals create discords with another voice part, which in turn creates a spiral effect requiring musica ficta in other voice parts.

In other instances, the specific problems with added accidentals arise between two or more voices when B-naturals are consistently paired with both F-natural and E (sometimes within the same measure), making the choice between using B-flat or B-

[^134]natural far more difficult. In other words, the choice of pitch required a certain awareness of what was happening in the other voice parts. An example of this occurs in the following passage from the Whitbroke Credo (below, Ex. 6-26: between the top two voices, particularly at bars 78 and 79).

Ex. 6-26:


Bar 18 has a B-flat added to the medius voice to accommodate the leap from F to B ; however, this creates a direct tritone with the E in the triplex voice (below, Ex. 6-27). This happens again in bar 58, just before the cadence, where the medius has a B-flat to avoid a tritone on beat two, but then clashes with the E on beat three.

Ex. 6-27:


In the same example, at bar 16, the triplex voice reaches a cadence with a raised third, Fsharp, immediately followed by F-natural. These accidentals are marked in the partbook, further calling for an editorial B-flat in the medius voice. This particular
figure, involving what might be currently called "direct chromaticism" appears throughout this Mass and occasionally in the other two Masses.

It seems that the performers, or perhaps the composer, preferred to treat cadence points with a raised third, but continued the polyphony without the raised third. Throughout the three Masses, the addition of F-sharp at cadence points (specifically at the ends of the phrases marked by a double bar line), happens almost regularly. As a bit of a side note concerning the "direct chromaticism," this pattern was also seen in the beginning of Chapter Two in the Sanctus example found in the Fountains Fragments (below, Ex. 6-28), although not at a cadence point.


Ex. 6-28: Fountains Fragments, f.11v, Sanctus, opening excerpt without chant incipit

The Gloria movement of Mundy's first Mass also contains a number of unusual F-sharp additions within the top two voice parts. These additions seem quite random, aside from their association with raising the third of a D minor sonority. In the example below (Ex. 6-29), the F-sharps lead to the pitch G, but this is not always the case with each added F-sharp within the overall movement.

Ex. 6-29:


This particular accidental appears fairly frequently throughout the remaining movements of the first Mass as well, and with no consistent method or manner. For example, in bar 55 of the Gloria (below, Ex. 6-30), one might expect to see an F-sharp added to the fourth beat, but no such accidental appears.

Ex. 6-30:


The Credo movement of Mundy's first Mass contains a number of similar issues, particularly involving the use of F-sharps. Once again, many of these seem quite random, such as the F-sharp that appears in bar 11, which immediately follows a similar melodic figure in bar 10 that does not contain an F-sharp. Such examples certainly seem to support the idea that these ficta notations were added variously by individual performers who may have been looking at the partbooks outside of a polyphonic performance. Like many of the B-flats, the F-sharps seem to have been squeezed into the staff in an
available space before the note it affects.

As mentioned at the beginning of this chapter, the three Masses Upon the Square are the only pieces of extant polyphony with the label square attached to their titles. From what can be seen, their treatment of the square melodies bears some relationship to the treatment of square melodies seen in the previous chapters. Specifically, many of these pieces utilize three or four voice parts, and they may ornament the square, but they all keep the square in a recognizable format. On the other hand, the three Masses Upon the Square contain some very specific differences from the pieces seen in the previous chapters, such as the dissonance treatment, the restriction of the vocal ranges, and the migration of the squares between voice parts.

After viewing the chart seen above in Ex. 6-7, it is apparent that Mundy and Whitbroke must have enjoyed some type of interaction or corroboration in the design of these three Masses. As mentioned in Chapter Three, the idea of composers utilizing melodies of considerable age and temporal distance may have invoked the esteem of an ancient and venerable practice handed down from generation to generation. The three Masses Upon the Square, then, may have further involved a related transmission of practice between the older Whitbroke and younger Mundy. It may be significant that both composers chose to entitle their Masses "Upon the Square." This is speculation, of course, but considering the time period of religious and liturgical reforms, the two composers may have consciously chosen to entitle their pieces in reference to the musical practices of the past.

William Whitbroke (c1501-1569), also the composer of the lost Communion upon
the Square of Ormaveute described in the previous two chapters, was a vicar choral at Lichfield Cathedral who took orders to become a priest. By 1529-30, he was a chaplain in John Taverner's choir at Cardinal College, Oxford, and was later appointed one of the twelve chaplains of the choir at St. Paul's Cathedral. ${ }^{16}$ David Mateer has mentioned that the early layer of the Gyffard Partbooks is dominated by the works of Oxford musicians, including Taverner, Appleby, and Sheppard. ${ }^{17}$ Whitbroke's associations with both Oxford and St. Paul's may have contributed substantially to the repertoire preserved in the Gyffard Partbooks. ${ }^{18}$ Whitbroke could have been responsible for carrying a certain body of written polyphony to St. Paul's, London after the dissolution of Cardinal College. Perhaps such events may have even influenced Mundy to extract Taverner's Le Roy Kyrie square for the Kyrie of his second Mass Upon the Square.

As a side note, Whitbroke was dismissed from St. Paul's Cathedral in 1564 because he refused to subscribe to the Protestant 38 articles. His story seems somewhat similar to Gyffard's - the latter was a Dr. Roger Gifford, President of the Royal College of Physicians between 1581-4, and one of Queen Elizabeth's Physicians Ordinary from 1587. At one time, he owned the manuscript, possibly using it for private services. He further became embroiled in certain religious controversies in Oxford as the students and professors struggled to adjust to the Elizabethan religious reforms. ${ }^{19}$

William Mundy (c.1528-c.1591), the younger of the two composers, spent most of his working career within the city of London, later becoming a Gentleman of the

[^135]Chapel Royal. By 1559, he had become a lay vicar at St. Paul's Cathedral, where he and certain other members of the Cathedral music staff subscribed (willingly or unwillingly) to the basic tenets of the Act of Supremacy and Uniformity. He is perhaps better known for his English Anthems, as history has seemingly judged many of his Latin compositions more critically. The following, admittedly unfortunate, quotation appears in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians: ${ }^{20}$

The quality of his [Mundy's] Latin compositions, like that of his vernacular output is uneven. The earliest and least effective pieces are in the Gyffard Partbooks which include two masses based on various squares and part of an alternatim faburden based setting of the processional psalm In exitu Israel for Easter Vespers composed jointly with Sheppard and Mr Birde.

It seems that this statement could benefit from revision in light of the context provided above - namely that all three Masses probably represent a practice related to ex tempore performance, particularly in the realm of dissonance treatment. On the basis of these three Masses (as well as on a number of the pieces discussed in Chapter Three), a connection between ex tempore practice and composing upon a square might be seen to differentiate composition on squares from general cantus firmus treatment. There are obvious similarities between composing upon a square and cantus firmus treatment, such as the subjection of a fixed melody to ornamentation and the occasional migration of the melody between voice parts, but the connection with improvisatory practice seems to set "squares" and "squarenote," in a different category. The choices of preexisting melodies for a cantus firmus generally involve chant or a popular melody such as the treble line (or main melody) of a popular song, as opposed to the contratenor or harmony part devised

[^136]against a chant or popular melody. In other words, squares encompass the extemporizing or composing upon a melody that was once extemporized or composed upon a melody.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alighieri, Dante. Dante's Divine Comedy: The Purgatorio: A Prose Translation by the late William Stratford Dugdale with the text as edited by Brugnone Bianchi and with explanatory notes. London: George Bell and Sons, 1883.

Aplin, John. "A Group of English Magnificats 'Upon the Faburden." Soundings 7 (1978), 85-100.

Aplin, John. "The Fourth Kind of Faburden: the Identity of an English Four-Part Style." Music \& Letters 61 (1980), 245-265.

Aplin, John. "The Origins of John Day’s 'Certaine Notes." Music \& Letters 62 (1981), 295-299.

Austern, Linda Phyllis. "Nature, Culture, Myth, and the Musician in Early Modern England." Journal of the American Musicological Society 51 (1998), 1-47.

Baillie, Hugh. "Nicholas Ludford (c.1485-c.1557)." Musical Quarterly 44 (1958), 196208.

Baillie, Hugh. "Squares." Acta Musicologica 32 (1960), 178-193.
Baltzer, Rebecca. "Lambertus, Brabant." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 14, pp. 169-170.

Bannister, Henry Marriott. Monumenti Vaticani di Paleogaphia Musicale Latina. Codices e vaticanis selecti phototypice expressi, xii. Leipzig: Harassowitz, 1913.

Batiffol, Pierre. History of the Roman Breviary. London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1912.

Bell, Sandra, Marie Loughlin, Patricia Irace. The Broadview Anthology of SixteenthCentury Poetry and Prose. Peterborough, Ontario: Broadview Press, 2011.

Bent, Margaret, and Roger Bowers. "Cooke [Cook], J(ohn)." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 6, pp. 387-388.

Bent, Margaret. Counterpoint, Composition, and Musica Ficta. New York: Routledge, 2002.

Bent, Margaret. "Damett." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 6, pp. 872-873.

Bent, Margaret. "Dunstaple, John." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 7, pp. 711-717.

Bent, Margaret, ed. The Fountains Fragments: with and Introduction by Margaret Bent. Clarabricken, Killkenny, Ireland: Boethius Press, 1987.

Bent, Margaret. "New and Little-Known Fragments of English Medieval Polyphony." Journal of the American Musicological Society 21 (1968), 137-156.

Bent, Margaret. The Old Hall Manuscript: A Paleographic Study. Ph.D. thesis, Cambridge University, 1969.

Bent, Margaret. "Squares." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 24, pp. 226-227.

Bent, Margaret. "The Transmission of English Music 1300-1500: Some Aspects of Repertory and Presentation." In Studien zur Tradition in der Musik: Kurt von Fischer zum 60. Geburtstag. Ed. Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht and Max Lütolf. München: Musikverlag Emil Katzbichler, 1973. pp. 65-83.

Bergsagel, John. "An Introduction to Ludford (c.1485-c.1557)." Musica Disciplina 14 (1960), 105-130.

Bergsagel, John. "On the Performance of Ludford's Alternatim Masses." Musica Disciplina (1962), 35-55.

Blackburn, Bonnie. "Hothby, John." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 11, pp. 750-751.

Blackburn, Bonnie. "On Compositional Practice in the Fifteenth Century." Journal of the American Musicological Society 40 (1987), 210-284.

Blezzard, Judith. "The Lumley Books: a Collection of Tudor Church Music." Musical Times 112 (1971), 128-130.

Blezzard, Judith, ed. The Tudor Church Music of the Lumley Books. Madison: A-R Editions, 1985.

Blunt, Rev. John Henry, ed. The Annotated Book of Common Prayer; Being an Historical, Ritual, and Theological Commentary on the Devotional System of the Church of England. Waterloo Place London: Rivingtons, 1866.

Bonda, Jan Willem. "Tandernaken, Between Bruges and Ferrara." In From Ciconia to Sweelink: Donum Natalicium Willem Elders, ed. Albert Clement and Eric Jas. Atlanta: Rodopi, 1994. pp.49-74.

Booty, John, ed. The Book of Common Prayer 1559: The Elizabethan Prayer Book. Folger Shakespeare Library. Washington, D.C: University of Virginia Press, 1976.

Borren, Charles van den. Le Manuscrit Musical M. 222 C. 22 de la Bibliothèque nationale et universitaire de Strasbourg. Annales de l'Académie Royale d'archéologie de Belgique. Anvers: Imprimerie E. Secelle, 1924.

Bowers, Roger. "Cooke [Cook], J(ohn)." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 6, p. 387.

Braunschweig-Pauli, Dagmar. "Studien zum sogenannten Codex St. Emmeram: Entstehung, Datierung, und Besitzer der Handschrift München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 14274 (olim Mus. Ms. 3232a). Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch 66 (1982), 1-48.

Braunschweig-Pauli, Dagmar. "Neue Ergebnisse zum Codex St. Emmeram." Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch 65 (1981), 1-5.

Bray, Roger, compiler. The British Library Music Manuscript Collection. Harvester Microform - Harvester Press Publishing Group, 1983.

Bray, Roger. "British Museum Add. MSS. 17902-5 (The Gyffard Part-Books): An Index and Commentary." Royal Music Association Research Chronicle 7 (1969), 31-50.

Bray, Roger. "The Interpretation of Musica Ficta in English Music c.1490-c.1580." Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association 97 (1970-1), 29-45.

Brewer, J.S. and James Gardner, eds. Calendar of Letters and Papers, Foreign and Domestic, of the Reign of Henry VIII, preserved in Her Majesty's Public Record Office, the British Museum, \&c. 1862-1885.

Brewer, J.S., ed. Letters and Papers, Foreign and Domestic, of the Reign of Henry VIII. Vol. 2, Pt. 2. London, 1864.

Brown, H.M., Franck D’Accone, and Jessie Ann Owens, eds. London British library R.M.24.d2. Renaissance Music in Facsimile. New York: Garland, 1987.

Bukofzer, Manfred. "Popular and Secular Music in England to c.1470." In Ars Nova and the Renaissance 1300-1540, ed. D.A. Hughes and G. Abraham. London: New Oxford History of Music, 1960. pp. 107-133.

Bukofzer, Manfred. Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music. New York: W.W. Norton, 1950.

Burgess, Clive, and Andrew Wathey. "Mapping the Soundscape: Church Music in English Towns, 1450-1550," Early Music History 19 (2000), 1-46.

Burstyn, Shai. "Power's Anima mea and Binchois' De plus en plus: a Study in Musical Relationships." Musica Disciplina 30 (1976), 55-72.

Burtius, Nicolaus. Musices Opusculum. Trans. Clement A. Miller. Musicological Studies and Documents 37. American Institute of Musicology: Hänssler-Verlag, 1983.

Caldwell, John, ed. Tudor Keyboard Music, c.1520-1580, Musica Britannica 66. London: Stainer and Bell, 1995.

Calendar of the Close Rolls preserved in the Public Record Office Prepared under the superintendence of the Deputy Keeper of the Records, Henry IV. Vol. III, A.D. 14051409. London: published by His Majesty's Stationary Office 1931.

Calendar of the Patent Rolls Preserved in the Public Record Office: Richard II, A.D. 1385-1389. Kessinger Publishing, 2010.

Cambridge University Library, Report of the Library Syndicate: for the Nine Months Ending 30 September 1920. From the University Reporter, 1920-1921. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1921.

Chadd, David, and Roger Bowers. "Whytbroke, William." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 27, pg. 352.

Clossen, Ernest, ed., Le Manuscrit dit des Basses danses de la Bibliothèque de Bourgogne. Bruxelles: Société des bibliophiles et iconophiles de Belgique, 1912. Minkoff reprint, 1976.

Collins, H.B. "Latin Church Music by Early English Composers." Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association 39 (1912-13), 97-121.

Colton, Lisa. "Music in pre-Reformation York: a new source and some thoughts on the York Masses." Plainsong and Medieval Music 12 (2003), 71-88.

Courde de Montaiglon de, Anatole, ed. Recueil de poésies françoises des XVe et XVIe siecles, morales, facétieuses, historiques. Vol. 4. Paris: Chez P. Jannet, Libraire, 1856.

Curtis, Gareth, and Andrew Wathey. "Fifteenth-Century English Liturgical Music: A List of the Surviving Repertory." Royal Music Association Research Chronicle 27 (1994), 1-69.

Dart, Knowles and Thurston. "Notes on a Bible of Evesham Abbey," English Historical Review 79 (1964), 775-778.

Davison, Nigel. "The Western Wind Masses," Musical Quarterly 57 (1971), 427-443.

Disney, R. A History of Portugal and the Portuguese Empire: from its Beginnings to 1807. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Duffin, Ross. "Ensemble Improvisation in the Fifteenth-Century Mensural Dance Repertoire." Paper presented at "Performance Practice and Repertory of Loud Minstrels in the $15^{\text {th }}$ Century." Alden Biesen, Belgium, June, 1995.

Duffy, Eamon. The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c.1400c.1580. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005.

Dumitrescu, Theodore. "An English Adoption of the Burgundian Chanson." In Citation and Authority in Medieval and Renaissance Musical Culture: Learning from the Learned. Suzannah Clark and Elizabeth Eva Leach, eds. Rochester: Boydell and Brewer, 2005. pp. 174-83.

Dumitrescu, Theodore. The Early Tudor Court and International Musical Relations. Burlington: Ashgate, 2007.

Dumitrescu, Theodore, ed. Fifteenth-Century Liturgical Music VII, The York Masses. Early English Church Music 52. Published for the British Academy, Stainer and Bell, 2010.

Ebreo, Guglielmo. De pratica seu arte tripudii $=$ On the practice or art of dancing. Ed., Barbara Sparti. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993.

Elliot, Kenneth. "Johnson, Robert (i)." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol.13, pp. 164-165.

Fallows, David. A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415-1480. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Fallows, David. The Songs of Guillaume Dufay: Critical Commentary to the Revision of Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae. American Institute of Musicology, 1995.

Flood, William Henry Grattan. Early Tudor Composers: Biographical Sketches of ThirtyTwo Musicians and Composers of the Period 1485-1555. London: Oxford University Press, 1925.

Flood, William Henry Grattan. "New Light on Early Tudor Composers, XII - John Taverner." Musical Times 61 (1920), 597-598.

Flynn, Jane. "The Education of Choristers in England During the Sixteenth Century." In English Choral Practice 1400-1650. Ed. John Morehen. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995. pp. 180-199.

Frobenius, Wolf. Johannes Boens Musica und seine Konsonanzlehre. Freiburger Schriften zur Musikwissenschaft, 1971.

Gangwere, Blanche. Music History During the Renaissance Period 1520-1550: A Documented Chronology. Westport Connecticut: Praeger, 2004.

Gerber, Jane. The Jews of Spain: A History of the Sephardic Experience. New York: Free Press, 1992.

Goldie, Francis. A Bygone Oxford. London: Burns and Oats, 1881.
Greene, Richard Leighton. The Early English Carols. Second edition. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977.

Grose, Francis. Grose's Classical Dictionary of the Vulgar Tongue Revised and Corrected with the Addition of Numerous Slang Phrases Collected from Tried Authorities. London: Chancery-Lane, 1823.

Haggh, Barbara. "Binchois and Sacred Music at the Burgundian Court." In Binchois Studies. Ed. Andrew Kirkman and Dennis Slavin. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. pp. 11-25.

Hakluyt, Richard. The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques, and Discoveries of the English Nation: Made by Sea or Ouer-land, to the Remote and Farthest Distant Quarters of the Earth, at any Time Within the Compasse of These 1600 yeres: Deuided into Three Seuerall volumes, According to the Positions of the Regions, Whereunto they were Directed. London: George Bishop, Ralph Newberie, and Robert Barker, 15991600.

Hamm, Charles. Census-Catalogue of Manuscript Sources of Polyphonic Music 14001550. Five Volumes. American Institute of Musicology. Neuhausen-Stuttgart: Hänssler-Verlag, 1988.

Harrison, Frank Llewelyn. Music in Medieval Britain. London: Routledge and Deagan Paul, 1963.

Hawkins, Sir John. A General History of the Science and Practice of Music. Vol. 1. London: J. Alfred Novello, 1853.

Hell, Helmut. "Zwei weitere Blätter zum Fragment Mus. Ms. 3224 in der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek aus der Dufay-Zeit." Musik in Bayern 27 (1983), 43-49.

Higginbottom, Edward. "Alternatim." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 1. pp. 426-427.

Horrall, Sara, ed. The Southern Version of the Cursor Mundi. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1978.

Horrox, R., ed. The Black Death. Manchester Medieval Sources. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1994.

Hughes, Andrew. "Fifteenth-Century English Polyphony Discovered in Norwich and Arundel," Music \& Letters 59 (1978), 148-158.

Hughes, Andrew. "Mensural Polyphony for Choir in $15^{\text {th }}$ Century England." Journal of the American Musicological Society 19 (1966), 352-369.

Hughes, Andrew, and Margaret Bent. "The Old Hall Manuscript - A Re-Appraisal and an Inventory." Musica Disciplina 21 (1967), 97-147.

Jander, Owen. "Cantus (i)." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 5, p. 66.

Kaye, Philip, ed., The Sacred Music of Gilles Binchois. New York: Oxford University Press, 1992.

Kemp, Walter. "Votre trey Dowce a Duo for Dancing." Music \& Letters 60 (1979), 3744.

Kirkman, Andrew. "Binchois the Borrower." In Binchois Studies. Ed. Andrew Kirkman and Dennis Slavin. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. pp. 119-135.

Laing, David and William Carew Hazlitt, ed. Early Popular Poetry of Scotland and the Northern Boarder. Vol. 1. London: Reeves and Turner, 1895.

Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel. Contrapunctus Diminutus and Prolongation http://www.umds.ac.uk/kis/schools/hums/music/dlw/cdp.htm. April 1998. Accessed May 2009 and February 2012.

Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel. Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel. "Petrus frater dictus Palma ociosa." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 19, pp. 523-524.

Lefferts, Peter M., "Discant II: English Discant." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 7. pp. 371374.

Lima, Robert. Dark Prisms: Occultism in Hispanic Drama. Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1995.

Lopez, Fernão. The English in Portugal, 1367-87: Extracts from the Chronicles of Dom Fernando and Dom João. Trans. Derek W. Lomax and R.J. Oakley. Warminster: Aris and Phillips, 1988.

Lundberg, Mattias. Tonus Peregrinus: The History of a Psalm-Tone and Its Use in Polyphonic Music. Burlington, Vermont: Ashgate, 2011.

Machlin, Christopher. "Plague, Performance and the Elusive History of the Stella celi extirpavit." Early Music History 29 (2010), 1-31.

Mackey, Albert Gallatin, ed. Encyclopedia of Freemasonry. Vol. 2. Whitefish, Montana: Kessinger Publishing, 2003.

Massey, Gerald, Ancient Egypt: the Light of the World. Vol. 2. London: T.Fisher Unwin, 2002.

Masson, Irvine. The Mainz Psalters and Canon Missae, 1457-1459. London:
Bibliographical Society, 1954.
Mateer, David. "The Gyffard Partbooks: Composers, Owners, Date and Provenance." Royal Music Association Research Chronicle 28 (1995), 19-43.

Mateer, David. "Mundy, William." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 17, pp. 389-390.

Maynard, Judson. "Heir Beginnis Countering." Journal of the American Musicological Society 20 (1967), 182-196.

Meech, Sanford. "Three Musical Treatises in English from a Fifteenth-Century Manuscript," Speculum 10 (1935), 235-269.

Merbecke, John. The Booke of Common Praier Noted. 1550.
Morley, Thomas. A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke (1597). Ed., Alec Harman. New York: W.W. Norton, 1952.

Newton, Joseph. Short Talks on Masonry. Whitefish, Montana: Kessinger Publishing, 1998.

Osborn, James, and Robert McQuillan. "Whythorne, Thomas." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 27, pp. 353-354.

Owens, Jessie Ann. Composers at Work: The Craft of Musical Composition 1450-1600. New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

Parton, Kenton. "On Two Early Tudor Manuscripts of Keyboard Music," Journal of the American Musicological Society 17 (1964), 81-83.

Paxton Frederick S. Paxton, Christianizing Death: The Creation of a Ritual Process in Early Medieval Europe. New York: Cornell University Press, 1996.

Perkins, Leeman, and Howard Garey, eds., The Mellon Chansonnier. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979.

Pey, Alexandre. Doon de Maience, Chanson de Geste, Publiée pour la premiére fois d'après les manuscrits de Montpellier et de Paris. Paris: Chez F. Vieweg, 1859.

Pinnock, Rev. William Henry. The Laws and Usages of the Church and Clergy - The Ornaments and Goods of the Church. Cambridge: J.Hall and Son, 1858.

Pope, Isabel, and Masakata Kanazawa, eds. The Musical Manuscript Montecassino 871: A Neapolitan Repertory of Sacred and Secular Music of the Late Fifteenth Century. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978.

Pope, Isabel, and Tess Knighton, "Oriola, Pietro [Orihuela, Pedro de; Pere]," New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 18, p. 701.

Raine, James, ed., Historiae dunelmensis scriptores tres. London: J.B. Nichols and Son, 1839.

Reber, Franz von. History of Medieval Art. Trans. Joseph Thacher Clarke. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1887.

Renart, Jean, Le Roman de Galerent, Comte de Bretagne, par le trouvère Renaut. Ed. Anatole Boucherie. Paris: Maisonneuve et Charles Leclerc, 1888.

Rumbold, Ian. "The Compilation and Ownership of the "St. Emmeram" Codex (Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 14274)," Early Music History 2 (1982), 161-235.

Rumbold, Ian, and Peter Wright, Der Mensuralcodex St. Emmeram: Faksimile der Handschrift Clm 14274 der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek München, Ed. Bayerischen Staatsbibliothe and Lorenz Welker. Elemeta Musicae 2. Reichert, Wiesbaden, 2006.

Sanders, Ernest. "Gymel," New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 10, pp. 610-613.

Sandon, Nick. The Use of Salisbury 1: The Ordinary of the Mass. Devon: Antico, 1984.

Schubert, Peter. Counterpoint Pedagogy in the Renaissance. The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory. Ed. Thomas Christensen. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Seay, Albert, ed., Gvilielmi Monachi: De Preceptis Artis Mvsicae. American Institute of Musicology: Hännsler-Verlag, 1965.

Shore, S. Royale. "The Early Harmonized Chants of the Church of England," Musical Times 53 (1912), 650-653.

Skinner, David. "At the mynde of Nycholas Ludford." Early Music 22 (1994), 393-415.
Slavin, Dennis. "The Binchois Game." In Binchois Studies. Ed. Andrew Kirkman and Dennis Slavin. New York: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Southern, Eileen. "Basse-Danse Music in Some German Manuscripts of the $15^{\text {th }}$
Century." In Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music: A Birthday Offering to Gustave Reese. Ed. Jan La Rue. New York: W.W. Norton, 1966. pp. 738-755.

Southern, Eileen Southern. "Some Keyboard Basse Danses of the Fifteenth Century." Acta Musicologica 35 (1963), 114-124.

Squire, W.B. "Notes on an Undescribed Collection of English $15^{\text {th }}$ Century Music," Sammelbände der Internationalen Musikgesellschaft 2 (1901), 342-392.

Stevens, Denis. "Processional Psalms in Faburden." Musica Disciplina 9 (1955), 105110.

Stevens, Denis, trans. and ed. Early Tudor Organ Music II: Music for the Mass, Early English Church Music 10. Published for the British Academy, Stainer and Bell (1969).

Stevens, John. "Carol" (1-2). New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed., Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 5, pp. 162-170.

Stevens, John. Music and Poetry in the Early Tudor Court. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979.

Strohm, Reinhard. The Rise of European Music 1380-1500. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Taruskin, Richard, ed. T'Andernaken: ten settings in three, four and five parts (modern score), five partbooks in original notation. Coconut Grove: Ogni Sorte, 1981.

Thesaurus Musicus II: Le Manuscrit musical M 222 C 22 de la Bibliothèque de Strasbourg XVe siècle, Bruxelles: Office International De Librairie. New York: Old Manuscripts and Incunabula Specialists in Facsimile Editions (1977).

Tinctoris, Johannes. The Art of Counterpoint (Liber de arte contrapuncti). Ed. Albert Seay. American Institute of Musicology, 1961.

Trowell, Brian. "Faburden 2: Early Faburden." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 8, pp. 497502.

Trowell, Brian. "Faburden and Fauxbourdon," Musica Disciplina 13 (1959), 43-78.
Trowell, Brian. "Faburden - New Sources, New Evidence: A Preliminary Survey." In Modern Musical Scholarship. Ed. Edward Olleson. Leeds: Knight and Forster Limited, 1978. pp. 28-78.

Trowell, Brian. "Sight, Sighting." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanlie Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 23, pp. 371-372.

Trowell, Brian. "Wylde, John." New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Ed. Stanley Sadie. New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001. Vol. 27. p. 599-600.

Ullmann, Walter, ed. Liber regie capelle: A Manuscript in the Biblioteca Publica, Evora 92. London: Henry Bradshaw Society, 1961.

Wallner, Bertha Antonia, ed. Das Buxheimer Orgelbuch: Handschrift Mus. 3725 der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek, München. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955.

Ward, John. "The Lute Music of MS Royal Appendix 58." Journal of the American Musicological Society 13 (1960), 117-125.

Wathey, Andrew. "Newly Discovered Fifteenth-Century English Polyphony at Oxford." Music \& Letters 64 (1983), 58-66.

Wegman, Rob. The Crisis of Music in Early Modern Europe, 1470-1530. New York: Routledge, 2005.

Weinreich, Max. History of the Yiddish Language. Vol. 2. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008.

Williamson, Magnus. "Liturgical Polyphony in the Pre-Reformation English Parish Church: A Provisional List and Commentary." Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle 38 (2005), 1-43.

Wilson, Christian. "Alternatim Practices in Sixteenth-Century England: Improvisation at the Organ and a Bunch of Squares." Unpublished lecture recital paper, Christ Church, Oxford (2006).

Woods, Isobel. "A Note on 'Scottish Anonymous.'" Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle 21 (1988), 37-39.

Wright, Peter. "Binchois and England: Some Questions of Style, Influence, and Attribution in his Sacred Works." In Binchois Studies. Ed. Andrew Kirkman and Dennis Slavin. New York: Oxford University Press, 2000. pp. 87-118.

Wright, Thomas. Dictionary of Obsolete and Provincial English Containing Words from the English Writers previous to the Nineteenth Century which are no longer in use, or are not used in the same sense, and words which are now used only in the provincial dialects. London: H.G. Bohn, 1857.

Wulstan, David. Tudor Music. London: J. M. Dent and Sons, 1985.

## APPENDIX 1

## A LIST OF SOME SQUARES, POTENTIAL SQUARES, AND SQUARE CONCORDANCES

KYRIE \#1


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $9^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Kyrie
* VatRE 1146, f. 72v - monophonic melody
* LonBLR A45-8 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa Dominica
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - John Taverner, four-voice Le Roy Kyrie
* LonBL 30520b - Nicholas Ludford, four-voice Mass Leroy
* LonBLM 24 d.2, f.118, "Baldwin Commonplace Book" - three-voice Kyrie

KYRIE \# 2


* LonBLLA 462, f.152, $2^{\text {nd }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Kyrie, Dunstaple Dominica die


## * LonBL 17802-5 "Gyffard Partbooks" - Kyrie of three voice Whitbroke Mass Upon the Square

* LonBLR A45-8 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa feria ii
* LonPR 63/23/1/3 verso - fragment, three-voice Kyrie

KYRIE \#3


* StrasBM 222, f. 108 - two-voice Portugaler, ascribed to G. Dufay
* MunBS Lat. 14274, f. 65 - two-voice Portugaler
* MunBS Lat. 14274, f. 77 - two-voice Portigaler
* MunBS Lat. 14274, ff.92v-93 - three-voice Ave tota casta Virgo
* MunBS 3224, f. 9 (originally ff.102v-103) - three-voice $O$ incomparabilis Virgo, attributed to Du Fay
* MunBS 3725, f.21v-21r, (Staatsbibliothek Cim. 352b) - Portigaler, keyboard arrangement
* Yale 91, ff.69v-70r - three-voice Or me veult
* BevRS 19/2/I/A - three-voice Kyrie
* YorkB 1, f.3v-7 - four-voice Gloria-Credo pair
* LonBLR A45-48 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa feria iii
* LonBLR A56, f.15-Kyrie-Christe, keyboard arrangement
* Alcetur Bible (Evesham Almonry Museum) - Ormavoyt, monophonic mensural melody
* OxfC 371, f.19v - Orma vulte, keyboard arrangement
* LonBL 18936-9, "Gyffard Partbooks" - John Taverner, Three-fold, three-voice Christe eleison
* [lost] Communion Upon the Square of Ormaveut, William Whitbroke, four voices CambriU 4405(9) [early to mid sixteenth century]

KYRIE \#4


* LonBL 57950, f.79v-80, "Old Hall Manuscript" - Thomas Damett, three-voice Credo
* LonBLR A45-8 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa feria iv

KYRIE \#5


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $4^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic melody, Dominica die
* LonBLR A45-48 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa feria v

KYRIE \#6


* LonBLR A45-48 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa feria vi

KYRIE \#7


[^137]KYRIE \#8


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $1^{\text {st }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic melody feria ii

KYRIE \#9


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $2^{\text {nd }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic melody feria iii
* LonBLM 24 d.2, f. 116 "Baldwin Commonplace Book" - three-voice, nine-fold Kyrie

KYRIE \#10


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $3^{\text {rd }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic melody feria iv
* VatRE 1146, f.72v - monophonic melody
* LonBL 17802-5 "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 1, Kyrie

KYRIE \#11


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $5^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic, six-fold Kyrie

KYRIE \#12


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $7^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Kyrie, feria vi
* VatRE 1146, f.72v - monophonic melody

KYRIE \#13


* LonBLLA 462, f.151, $11^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic melody feria $v$
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - Hyett Kyrie
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 2, Kyrie

KYRIE \#14


* LonBLLA 462, f.151v, $12^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Kyrie, "Martyn"

KYRIE \#15


* LonBLLA 462, f.152, $1^{\text {st }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Kyrie, "Lyonel" Sabato

KYRIE \#16


* LonBLM 24 d.2, f.117, "Baldwin Commonplace Book" - three-voice Kyrie

KYRIE \#17


* NorwichR 299, Av, "Flitcham 299" - monophonic Kyrie

KYRIE \#18


* LonLP H5142.P.1545, f.cxxxi verso - monophonic melody (handwritten at bottom of page)

KYRIE \#19


* LonLP 438, f. 180 - monophonic melody "ffabordon" feria iii

KYRIE \#20


* LonLP 438, f.180v - "ffabordon" feria iii

KYRIE \#21 (new concordance)


* LonLP 438, f.180v - "ffabordon" feria ii
* OxfB Rawl. liturg. e 45, f.59v - monophonic melody (written at bottom of page)

KYRIE \#22


[^138]KYRIE \#23


* LonLP 438 - "ffabordon" feria iv


## KYRIE \#24



* OxfB Rawl. Liturg. e. 45, f.60v - monophonic melody (written at bottom of page)


## GLORIA \#1



62

${ }^{78}$



* LonBL 57950, ff.2-2v, "Old Hall Manuscript" - Gloria (second half missing)
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 1, Gloria


## GLORIA \#2




* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Whitbroke, four-voice Mass Upon the Square, Gloria
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 2, Gloria


## GLORIA \#3



* LonBL 57950, f.3v, "Old Hall Manuscript" - three-voice Gloria
* YorkB 9, Ar, - monophonic alternatim Gloria (fragment)


## GLORIA \#4



* YorkB 9, Av - monophonic alternatim melody (fragment)


## CREDO \#1





* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks"- William Whitbroke, four-voice Mass Upon the Square, Credo
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks"- William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 1, Credo
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 2, Credo


## SANCTUS \#1






sis

* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $2^{\text {nd }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#2



* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $4^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus
* LonBL 57950, f.84v, "Old Hall Manuscript" - three-voice Sanctus
* LonBL 40011 B, "Fountains Fragments" - three-voice Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#3



* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $6^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus
* LonBL 57950, f.99, "Old Hall Manuscript" - Excetre, three-voice Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#4



* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $8^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#5



* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $10^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#6



* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $12^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 1, Sanctus
* NorwichR 299, B, "Flitcham 299" - three-voice Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#7



* LonBLLA 462, f.1v, $14^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Sanctus


## SANCTUS \#8




* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Whitbroke, four-voice Mass Upon the Square, Sanctus
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 2, Sanctus

AGNUS DEI \#1


* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Whitbroke, four-voice Mass Upon the Square, Agnus Dei
* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 2, Agnus Dei

AGNUS DEI \#2


* LonBL 17802-5, "Gyffard Partbooks" - William Mundy, four-voice Mass Upon the Square 1, Agnus Dei


## SALVE FESTE DIES \#1



* LonBLH 2942, f.121v - Salve feste dies


## SALVE FESTE DIES \#2



* LonBLH 2942, f. 121r - Salve feste dies


## SALVA NOS JHESU



* LonBLLA 462, f.152v, $4^{\text {th }}$ system, "Lansdowne 462" - monophonic Salve nos Jhesu


## STELLA CELI



* LonBLLA 462, f. 152v - monophonic Stella
* OxfBLC 64v - monophonic non-mensural melody
* LonBLR 7.A.VI - monophonic non-mensural melody


## [UNTITLED]



* LonBLH 2945, f.119v, "Harley 2945" - monophonic melody


# MASS UPON THE SQUARE 

by
William Whitbroke




Chri

ste
ley





## Mass Upon the Square <br> GLORIA



vo - lun - ta
tis








De - i pa - tris A


## Mass Upon the Square CREDO

William Whitbroke









tris







## Mass Upon the Square SANCTUS








sis
${ }^{76}$




sis $\qquad$


## Mass Upon the Square AGNUS DEI

William Whitbroke





pa


## TRANSCRIPTION NOTES ON WHITBROKE'S MASS UPON THE SQUARE

Kyrie
15: medius pitches E,D,E,C,D changed to F,D,F,C,E
33: bassus - all previous rests appear twice
66: contratenor contains 5 extra rests
69: contratenor F-sharp removed

Gloria
11 and 12: triplex B-flats removed
14 and 21: medius B-flats removed
24: bassus contains 5 extra rests
41: contratenor B-flat removed
42: medius B-flat removed
48: bassus contains 4 extra rests
71: medius clef change missing
78: triplex B-flat removed
93 and 94: triplex B-flats removed
98 and 101: triplex B-flats removed
106: medius contains 7 extra rests
110,112 , and 113: triplex B-flats removed
115: bassus contains 3 extra rests
$119,120,122$, and 123: triplex B-flats removed
125: triplex pitches $\mathrm{D}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{C}$ changed to $\mathrm{B}, \mathrm{A}, \mathrm{A}$

Credo
15: bassus contains 8 extra rests
20: bassus contains 7 extra rests
35: triplex contains 5 extra rests
66: bassus contains 6 extra rests
70: triplex missing semibreve rest
85: bassus contains 6 extra rests
138: bassus contains 4 extra rests
153: triplex contains 1 extra rest
160: triplex G-sharp removed
Sanctus
22: contratenor contains 7 extra rests
40: bassus contains 4 extra rests
91: triplex missing 5 rests

## Agnus Dei

29: medius remove G-sharp
34: contratenor remove F-sharp
43: triplex remove B-flat
64: triplex remove G-sharp
Chant incipits


# MASS UPON THE SQUARE 1 

by

William Mundy







pro - - $\quad$ pter_ mag - nam pro - pter mag-nam glo - ri - am - tu -



di mi-se-re - re no $\quad$ - $\quad-\quad-\quad-\quad-\quad-\quad$ - bis





A
















glo - ri-a tu

a glo - ri-a tu - $\quad$ - a glo - ri-a $t u$














# TRANSCRIPTION NOTES ON WILLIAM MUNDY'S FIRST MASS UPON THE SQUARE 

Kyrie
19: cantus and contratenor missing mensural sign, clef change not included until bar 30
52: medius E added, missing from manuscript
Gloria
10: bass clef change mine
57: medius B-flat taken out
78: cantus B and A changed to D and C
90: bassus D changed to semibreve from minim
114: contratenor clef change mine
Credo
4, 6,11 : cantus B-flat taken out
12: medius B-flat taken out
21: medius missing menusural sign
31: cantus B-flat taken out
38: cantus F-sharp taken out
110: contratenor B-flat taken out
118: cantus B-flat taken out
127: contratenor missing menusural sign
152: medius and contratenor missing mensural sign
153: medius F-sharp taken out
Sanctus
11: medius G-natural added at end of bar
42: cantus F-sharp taken out
107: medius second note A changed to a B
132: cantus F-sharp taken out
Agnus Dei
64: contratenor third note B changed to A

## Chant incipits



# MASS UPON THE SQUARE 2 

by

William Mundy






ma - gnam
glo - r
am
tu
am

De - us pa
ter om-ni - po-tens
De-us pa
ter - om - ni - po
tens



















## Mass Upon the Square 2 SANCTUS









cel
sis o-san - na in ex - cel






A - gnus De



# TRANSCRIPTION NOTES ON WILLIAM MUNDY'S SECOND MASS UPON THE SQUARE 

Kyrie
19: cantus F-sharp taken out

## Gloria

11: medius B-flat taken out
12: bassus B-flat taken out
15: bassus B-flat taken out
32: medius B chanted to A
38: bassus B-flat changed to C
64: cantus E changed to D
69: medius and contratenor B-flats taken out
70: bassus D changed to F
71: bassus missing one minim rest
79: bassus B-flat taken out
83: contratenor B-flat taken out
98: cantus B-flat taken out
121: cantus B changed to D

## Credo

3: cantus, second F-sharp taken out, contratenor third note E changed to D
5: bassus third note B changed to A
11: medius B -flat taken out
14: medius F-sharp taken out
16: bassus last note F changed to G
83: bassus G-sharp removed
113: bassus second note F changed to E
135: contratenor B-flat taken out

## Sanctus

7: cantus last note A changed to B
8-9: cantus reads D,G,A,B,C,D,C,B,A,C,B,C; changed to DF,G,A,B,C,B,A,G,B,A,B
Agnus Dei
9: contratenor F-sharp taken out
11: cantus extra bar of rest removed
20: contratenor B changed to A
50: cantus second note F changed to E
51: medius F-sharp changed to A
54: bassus last note F changed to E
64: bassus second note C semibreve changed to D minim

Chant incipits


## APPENDIX III

## SOME ARCHIVAL REFERENCES TO SQUARES

Bristol, All Saints, 1524: Item to John Corner of the Gaunts for pricking five books of songs of square note. ${ }^{1}$

Bristol, All Saints, 1535-1536: Item iiij Square boks. ${ }^{2}$
Canterbury Cathedral, 1557: Queen Elizabeth made a ceremonial entry into Canterbury Cathedral. The choir was standing on either side and brought up her majesty with a square song. ${ }^{3}$

Cambridge, Kings College, 1529: vj bokys of squaris off ye wych ij be papyr ye reste parchmente....

Cambridge, Kings College, 1557: [5s to pryme] for pryckynge iij Masses \& the squares \& for one skynne of parchement. ${ }^{5}$

Cambridge, Trinity College 1555: Item payd unto Syr Fyrbanke for prickyn furth of the squares for the Kyries, gloria in excelsis, etc. xiid. ${ }^{6}$

Durham Cathedral, 1513: [Deed of Appointment of Thomas Ashwell as Cantor of Durham] ...videlicet quod idem Thomas Hashewell illos monachos Dunelmenses et octo pueros seculares...tam ad modulandum super organa, quam ad planum cantum et organicum, decantando scilicet plane song, priknott, faburden, dischant, swarenote, et counter, quantum in ipso est gratis laborabit et informabit. ${ }^{7}$

Durham Cathedral, 1496, 1502, 1513: [similar to above, involving the teaching of swarenote]. ${ }^{8}$

Greenwich, 1538 Greenwich: [sermon preached before the court of Henry VIII by John Longland, Bishop of Lincoln concerning the "appropriate" lack of celebration for Good Friday] Where are the solempnytyes of the masses sayd \& songe, as are in the other festyuall dayes? Where are the solempne songes of discant, pricked song, faburden, square note, regalles \& organs? ${ }^{9}$

[^139]London, St. Mary at Hill, 1538: [to] Sir Marke for carolles for cristmas and for v square bookes, iijs iiijd. Paid for paper for the same songes, xijd. ${ }^{10}$

Louth Parish Church, 1535: [for the copying of] a sqwar apon the viij tunes. ${ }^{11}$
Oxford, Magdalen College, 1532: Sol' bull pro le prykkyng unam missam et square in scripto gradali ut patet per billam...Sol' bull et norwych pro prykkung of squaris in 12 gradalibus in capella ut patet per billam...Sol' bull et Norwych pro le prikkyng of squarys in 3 gradalibus. ${ }^{12}$

Warick 1464-1465: Item. J. quayer of olde pricked song in parchemyn of square note [entry struck out]....Item j an olde reed parchemyn book of square note and other songes of the gieft of Sir Thomas Tippes. ${ }^{13}$

Wells Cathedral 1538: [May 13 appointment of John Smith; among other itmes, he must proide himself with the following for the choir, for the lady Chapel, and for the processions on the principal feasts. These should be left for his successor] Cantuum crisporum sive diversorum, vulgariter nuncupatos square books and pricke songe books. ${ }^{14}$

Westminster Abbey 1447: Item j. boke of square note. ${ }^{15}$
Worcester Priory, 1465-1466: Item dat Edmundo hewes pro eius labore in le sqwar note habend - vjs. viijd. ${ }^{16}$

Worcester Priory, 1521: Pro factura duorum Magnificat et unius misse de square note et alterius misse de quinque partinus una cum le prickinge ejusdem...xiiis. iiiid. ${ }^{17}$

York Minster, 1552: there be note other note sung...saving square note plain, so that every syllable may be plainly and distinctly pronounced, and without any reports of repeating which may induce any obscureness to the hearers. ${ }^{18}$

Yorkshire, Leconfield Proverbs [moral precepts inscribed on the walls and ceilings of Leconfield Manor; one set of proverbs is devoted to music. This particular quote concerns "square" as a reference to certain note value] But whose penne is to swift in pricking of a songe / He markithe so his mynnyms fro pe square pt it shall sownde wronge. ${ }^{19}$

[^140]CURRICULUM VITAE<br>Jessica Lynn Chisholm

## Education

| $1994-1999:$ | Bachelor of Arts in Music History and Literature, summa <br> cum laude, Youngstown State University, Youngstown, <br> Ohio |
| :--- | :--- |
| $1999-2001:$ | Master of Music, Youngstown State University, <br> Youngstown, Ohio |
| $2004-2012:$ | Ph.D. Historical Musicology, Rutgers University, New <br> Brunswick, New Jersey |

## Teaching

2006 - present:
2010 - present:
2003:
2002-2004:

1999-2001:

Lecturer, Rutgers University, New Brunswick, New Jersey
Lecturer, The College of New Jersey, Ewing, New Jersey
Lecturer, Youngstown State University, Youngstown, Ohio
Lecturer, Mount Union College, Alliance, Ohio
Teaching Assistant / Graduate Lecturer, Youngstown State University, Youngstown, Ohio


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Margaret Bent, "Squares," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Groves Dictionaries: 2001), 24: 226.

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ Manfred Bukofzer, Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music (New York: W.W. Norton, 1950), 191. Bukofzer lists one Bannister as the discoverer of these melodies, as documented in Monumenti Vaticani di Paleographia Musicale Latina, 1913, no. 86g.

[^2]:    ${ }^{3}$ Bukofzer, Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, 191. See Rebecca Baltzer, "Lambertus, Brabant," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 14: 169170. There are a number of musicians who carried the name Lambertus in the early fifteenth century, including one Lambertus Brabant (fl. c.1430), presumably a Franco-Flemish composer whose only extant compositions are a Gloria and Credo. Lambertus may have also been the Johannes Lamberti Brabant who was a paid singer at Cambrai Cathedral from 1439-40, and a canon from 1442. There was also a Johannes Lamberts who sang at St. Donation, Bruges in 1461; and a Jehan Lambert, dit de la Bassee, who was a singer in the Burgundian Court Chapel from 1436 until 1467.
    ${ }^{4}$ Bukofzer, Studies, 191-192. Willibald Gurlitt informed Bukofzer of another fragmentary Mass by Ludford found in the Ratsschulbibliothek in Zwickau. These discoveries were some of the first to begin the process of piecing together the melodic correspondences of potential squares, leading to the later realization that Ludford's seven Lady Masses were probably all based on squares.
    ${ }^{5}$ Bukofzer, Studies, 192.
    ${ }^{6}$ Hugh Baillie, "Nicholas Ludford (c.1485-c.1557)," Musical Quarterly, 44 (1958): 196-208.
    ${ }^{7}$ These connections will be discussed in Chapter Three.

[^3]:    ${ }^{8}$ Baillie, "Nicholas Ludford," 203.
    ${ }^{9}$ John Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford (c.1485-c.1557)," Musica Disciplina, 14 (1960), 117. This also became the topic of a recent paper by Christian Wilson, "Alternatim practices in sixteenth-century England: Improvisation at the Organ and a Bunch of Squares," unpublished lecture recital paper, Christ Church, Oxford (2006).
    ${ }^{10}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 117.

[^4]:    ${ }^{11}$ Baillie, "Squares," 178.
    ${ }^{12}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 120-121.
    ${ }^{13}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 121. Quotation taken by Bergsagel from H.B. Collins, "Latin Church Music by Early English Composers," Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association, 39 (1912-13), 66.
    ${ }^{14}$ These will be discussed in Chapter Five in connection with the Or me veult square.
    ${ }^{15}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 123 (footnote).
    ${ }^{16}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 125. Frank Harrison, Music in Medieval Britain (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1963), 292. See Appendix III for further archival references.

[^5]:    ${ }^{17}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 125. See Appendix III, Yorkshire Leconfield Proverbs, for support of this theory.
    ${ }^{18}$ Harrison, Music in Medieval Britain, 292.
    ${ }^{19}$ Hugh Baillie, "Squares," Acta Musicologica, 32 (1960): 178-193.
    ${ }^{20}$ Baillie, "Squares," 178-193.
    ${ }^{21}$ Baillie, "Squares," 186. Baillie was not clear about what he meant by "strong melodic character" and "periodic rhythm," but it seems that he might have been comparing the Kyrie and Sanctus melodies of Lansdowne 462. The Lansdowne Sanctus melodies are written almost entirely in uniform breves.

[^6]:    ${ }^{22}$ Bergsagel, "An Introduction to Ludford," 129-130.
    ${ }^{23}$ Brian Trowell, "Faburden - New Sources, New Evidence: A Preliminary Survey," in Modern Musical Scholarship, ed. Edward Olleson (Leeds: Knight and Forster Limited, 1978), 28-78.

[^7]:    ${ }^{24}$ This was also Frank Harrison's conclusion in Music in Medieval Britain, 292.
    ${ }^{25}$ See Bent, "Squares," 226-227.
    ${ }^{26}$ Trowell, "Faburden - New Sources," 50. A more detailed discussion of these techniques can be found in Chapter Two.
    ${ }^{27}$ John Bergsagel, "On the Performance of Ludford's Alternatim Masses," Musica Disciplina, 16 (1962): 35-55.

[^8]:    ${ }^{28}$ Bent, "Squares," 226.
    ${ }^{29}$ Lisa Colton, "Music in pre-Reformation York: a New Source and Some Thoughts on the York Masses," Plainsong and Medieval Music, 12 (2003): 71-88.

[^9]:    ${ }^{30}$ Bent, "Squares," 226-227; and Baillie, "Squares," 178-193.

[^10]:    ${ }^{31}$ Deed of Appointment of Thomas Ashwell as Cantor of Durham: "...videlicet quod idem Thomas Hashewell illos monachos Dunelmenses et octo pueros seculares...tam ad modulandum super organa, quam ad planum cantum et organicum, decantando scilicet plane song, priknott, faburden, dischant, swarenote, et countre." James Raine, ed., Historiae dunelmensis scriptores tres (London: J.B. Nichols and Son, 1839), cccxcviii. See also Appendix III.
    ${ }^{32}$ Jane Flynn, "The Education of Choristers in England During the Sixteenth Century," in English Choral Practice 1400-1650, ed. John Morehen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 180-199.

[^11]:    ${ }^{33}$ Baillie, "Squares," 187.

[^12]:    ${ }^{34}$ John Merbecke, The Booke of Common Praier Noted 1550. This book was in ordinary use for about two years before the second Book of Common Prayer of Edward VI. It was then discontinued during the reign of Mary I.
    ${ }^{35}$ Thomas Wright, Dictionary of Obsolete and Provincial English Containing Words from the English Writers previous to the Nineteenth Century which are no longer in use, or are not used in the same sense, and words which are now used only in the provincial dialects (London: H.G. Bohn, 1857), 2: 901. To be "upon the square" meant "to be even with." To "play upon the square" meant to play honestly, and the Dictionary provides the following bit of advice, "men must be knaves, 'tis in their own defense, mankind's dishonest; if you think it fair amongst known cheats, to play upon the square, you'll be undone."
    ${ }^{36}$ Francis Grose, Grose's Classical Dictionary of the Vulgar Tongue Revised and Corrected with the addition of numerous slang phrases collected from tried authorities (London: Chancery-Lane, 1823), 1377.

[^13]:    ${ }^{37}$ Albert Gallatin Mackey, ed., Encyclopedia of Freemasonry (Whitefish, Montana: Kessinger Publishing, 2003), 2: 683.
    ${ }^{38}$ Joseph Newton, Short Talks on Masonry (Whitefish, Montana: Kessinger Publishing, 1998), 37.

[^14]:    ${ }^{39}$ Franz von Reber, History of Medieval Art, Joseph Thacher Clarke, trans. (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1887), 283-284. As a side note, this analogy is further discussed in Gerald Massey's Ancient Egypt: the Light of the World (London: T. Fisher Unwin, 2002), 2: 724. "The New Jerusalem was built upon the square. The city lieth four-square and the length thereof is as great as the breadth (Rev. $21: 16) \ldots$.this was the heaven of Atum based upon the four quarters of the solstices and the equinoxes which followed the making of Amenta." The idea, here, is that proportioned, balanced, and ruled items were considered to be of Godly or spiritual origin; and thus shared similar concepts related to Musica mundana and Pythagorean musical theory.
    ${ }^{40}$ Mackey, Encyclopedia of Freemasonry 2, 963.
    ${ }^{41}$ Linda Phyllis Austern, "Nature, Culture, Myth, and the Musician in Early Modern England," Journal of the American Musicological Society, 51 (1998): 2-5. Austern further explains that natural philosophy and related disciplines of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries were largely based on resemblances between "the diverse elements of an ordered universe through which one could read beyond obvious visible signs and discern underlying truths."

[^15]:    ${ }^{42}$ The full transcription (including what is visible on the manuscript and what is inferred) can be found in Chapter Four.
    ${ }^{43}$ Baillie, "Squares," 179.
    ${ }^{44}$ Baillie, "Squares," 186.

[^16]:    ${ }^{45}$ See Eamon Duffy, The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c.1400-c.1580, second ed. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005). Duffy's study concerns the practices of religion as a complex and vigorous "experience," with multiple layers of meaning and symbolism. Embellishment of chant, for example, carried a purposeful spiritual meaning, beyond being a general musical technique.

[^17]:    ${ }^{1}$ Jane Flynn, "The Education of Choristers in England During the Sixteenth Century," in English Choral Practice 1460-1650, ed. John Morehen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 182.

[^18]:    ${ }^{2}$ Flynn, "The Education of Choristers," 183. Such charts can be found in LonBL 21455, f.8; and LonBLR 58, f.51.
    ${ }^{3}$ Thomas Morley, A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke, ed., R. Alec Harman (New York: W.W. Norton, 1953), 169. Morley describes figuration as "the singing of one plainsong note long and another short, and yet both are pricked in one form" (written in uniformly shaped notation, but sung with two different note values alternated), or "of making the plainsong as your descant notes and so making upon it" (breaking the plainsong into the same note values as the descant). Concerning Scottish Anonymous, see Isobel Woods, "A Note on 'Scottish Anonymous,"" Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle, 21 (1988): 37-39.
    ${ }^{4}$ Andrew Hughes, "Mensural Polyphony for Choir in $15^{\text {th }}$ Century England," Journal of the American Musicological Society, 19 (1966), 357.

[^19]:    ${ }^{5}$ Brian Trowell, "Sight, sighting," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 23: 371.
    ${ }^{6}$ Wolf Frobenius, Johannes Boens Musica und seine Konsonanzlehre, Freiburger Schriften zur Musikwissenschaft, 2 (Stuttgart: Musikwissenschaftliche Verlags-Gesellschaft, 1971), 76.
    ${ }^{7}$ Brian Trowell, "Wylde, John," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 27: 599. His title of preceptor indicates that his role was that of a teacher or tutor, responsible for teaching plainchant and other music to the monks for the Mass and Offices.

[^20]:    ${ }^{8}$ Lionel Power, "This tretis..." in Sanford Meech, "Three Musical Treatises in English from a FifteenthCentury Manuscript," Speculum, 10 (1935), 242.
    ${ }^{9}$ Power, "This tretis," 242.
    ${ }^{10}$ Albert Seay, ed., Gvilielmi Monachi: De Preceptis Artis Mvsicae (American Institute of Musicology, 1965), 7. He includes a discussion of the practices of gymel and fauxbourdon with the specific acknowledgement that these latter two practices are of English origin (modi Anglicorum). He describes fauxbourdon as consisting of three voice parts: a top voice (cantus), tenor, and contratenor, where the cantus begins in unison with the tenor. The cantus will be reading a unison with the tenor but singing an octave higher. The cantus will then continue by reading a third below the tenor but still singing an octave higher, resulting in a sounding pitch a sixth above the tenor. This is maintained until the end of the passage where the singer returns to the visual unison, sung at the octave.
    ${ }^{11}$ Bonnie Blackburn, "Hothby, John," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 11: 750-1. Grado di pari indicated counterpoint in the tenor register, Grado di quarta indicated counterpoint a fourth above the tenor, Grado di quinta indicated counterpoint a fifth above the tenor, and Grado di octava indicated counterpoint an octave above the tenor. See also John Hothby, De arte contrapuncti, Gilbert Reaney, ed., Corpus scriptorum de musica 26 (University of Michigan: American Institute of Musicology, 1977).

[^21]:    ${ }^{12}$ Brian Trowell, "Faburden and Fauxbourdon," Musica Disciplina, 13 (1959), 64.
    ${ }^{13}$ Nicolaus Burtius, Musices Opusculum, trans. Clement A. Miller, Musicological Studies and Documents 37 (American Institute of Musicology: Hänssler-Verlag, 1983) 87-88. The original Latin is found in Nicolai Burtii Parmensis, Florum Libellus, ed., Olschki, Historiae Musicae Cultores 28 (Florence 1975).

[^22]:    ${ }^{14}$ Johannes Tinctoris, The Art of Counterpoint (Liber de arte contrapuncti), ed. Albert Seay (American Institute of Musicology, 1961), 103-105.
    ${ }^{15}$ An image of this manuscript can be found on DIAMM.

[^23]:    ${ }^{16}$ Concerning "On the book," performance (cantare super librum), see Margaret Bent, Counterpoint, Composition, and Musica Ficta (New York: Routledge, 2002); and Bonnie Blackburn, "On Compositional Process in the Fifteenth Century," Journal of the American Musicological Society, 40 (1987): 210-284.
    ${ }^{17}$ Concerning the creation of faburden, see Brian Trowell, "Faburden 2: Early Faburden," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 8: 497-502.
    ${ }^{18}$ Flynn, "The Education of Choristers," 188.

[^24]:    ${ }^{19}$ Ibid.

[^25]:    ${ }^{20}$ Peter M. Lefferts, "Discant II: English Discant," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 7: 371-374.
    ${ }^{21}$ Power, "This tretis," 242.

[^26]:    ${ }^{22}$ [Pseudo Chilston], "Here folwith a litil tretise...," in Sanford Meech, "Three Musical Treatises in English from a Fifteenth-Century Manuscript," Speculum, 10 (1935): 258.
    ${ }^{23}$ LonBL 4911, ff.104v, "Scottish anonymous" Book III: Countering. After course materials used in the Princeton graduate seminar "Counterpoint, 1300-1600" by Rob Wegman in 2008.

[^27]:    ${ }^{24}$ John Aplin, The Fourth Kind of Faburden: The Identity of an English Four-Part Style," Music \& Letters, 61 (1980): 248-50.
    ${ }^{25}$ Tinctoris, The Art of Counterpoint, 103-105. Tinctoris, Liber de arte contrapuncti (1477), 2:107-110: In hoc autem res facta a contrapuncto potissiumum differt, quod omnes partes rei factae sive tres sive quatuor sive plures sint, sibi mutuo obligentur, ita quod ordo lexque concordantiarum cuiuslibet partis erga singulas et omnes observari debeat, ut satis patet in hoc exemplo quinque partium existenti, quarumquidem partium tres primo, deinde quatuor ac postremo omnes quinque concinunt. Sed duobus aut tribus, quatuor aut pluribus super librum concinentibus alter alteri non subiicitur.
    ${ }^{26}$ Ibid. Non tamen vituperablile immoplurimum laudabile censeo si concinentes similitudinem assumptionis ordinationisque concordantiarum inter se prudenter evitaverint. Sic enim concentum eorum multo repletiorum suavioremque effecient.
    ${ }^{27}$ Overall, though, the preference was generally for consonant intervals, particularly the "imperfect" third and sixth. Remarks by English writers such as, "the mo inperfite tones that a man synges in the trebull, the

[^28]:    meriere it is," indicates this preference. See Lefferts, "Discant," 371. Examples of what modern musicians might term "rough counterpoint" (i.e. containing a greater number of dissonant clashes), may exist in various fragments and unexplored written sources - a project that extends beyond the scope of this dissertation.
    ${ }^{28}$ Flynn, "The Education of Choristers," 188.
    ${ }^{29}$ Flynn, "The Education of Choristers," 182 . The final skill listed is the ability to play the organ.
    ${ }^{30}$ Peter Schubert, "Counterpoint Pedagogy in the Renaissance," in The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory, ed. Thomas Christensen (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 505-506. Most fifteenth century theorists (including Prosdocimo, Burzio, Ugolino, Ramis, Tinctoris, and Gaffurio) presented six to eight fundamental voice-leading rules to regulate contrapunctus simplex. While these rules vary somewhat from one theorist to another, each theorist typically supplemented these rules with lists of short examples intended to provide the singer with a "menu" of formulas to be memorized that could then be called upon in improvisation.

[^29]:    ${ }^{31}$ Judson Maynard, "Heir Beginnis Countering," Journal of the American Musicological Society, 20 (1967), 196.
    ${ }^{32}$ Baillie, "Squares," 178 (footnote).
    ${ }^{33}$ Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, Contrapunctus Diminutus and Prolongation http://www.umds.ac.uk/kis/schools/hums/music/dlw/cdp.htm. April 1998 (Accessed May 2009, and 28 February 2012).
    ${ }^{34}$ Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, "Petrus frater dictus Palma ociosa," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 19: 523-524. Cistercian houses did not normally favor decorated polyphony. Petrus seems to have been providing a practical manual for polyphonic Mass composition in a simple up-to-date style for use outside of his Order.

[^30]:    ${ }^{35}$ Burgess and Wathey, "Mapping the Soundscape," 19.

[^31]:    ${ }^{36}$ The phenomenon whereby certain squares share pitches with plainchant was also noticed by Andrew Hughes. He used this characteristic as one of his defining features for squares in his "Mensural Polyphony for Choir," 357. "Squares [like faburdens] are lower voices and are mensural, but they differ from faburdens in that at certain points the chant migrates into a unison with the square."

[^32]:    ${ }^{37}$ Nick Sandon, The Use of Salisbury 1: The Ordinary of the Mass (Devon: Antico, 1984-1999), 77.

[^33]:    ${ }^{38}$ Andrew Hughes, "Mensural Polyphony for Choir," 359. See for example the Old Hall Manuscript f.88v for a transposition up a third, and f .38 v and f .50 v for a transposition within the course of a piece.

[^34]:    ${ }^{39}$ Ernest Sanders, "Gymel," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 10: 611. The term does not seem to have come into use much before the 1430's. 40 "Pseudo Chilston," "Here folwith a litil tretise," 261.

[^35]:    ${ }^{41}$ The Fountains Fragments of Fountains Abbey were compiled between 1446 and 1460 by Thomas Swynton, Abbot in 1471. The fragments (three paper bifolia, f.9-14) were bound at that time and mounted in Add. MS 40011B. They contain pieces that date from the late fourteenth century. See Charles Hamm, ed., Census-Catalogue of Manuscript Sources of Polyphonic Music 1400-1550, American Institute of Musicology (Neuhausen-Stuttgart: Hänssler-Verlag, 1988), 2: 77-78; and also Margaret Bent, ed., The Fountains Fragments: with an Introduction by Margaret Bent (Clarabricken, Killkenny, Ireland: Boethius Press, 1987).

[^36]:    ${ }^{42}$ After Sandon, The Use of Salisbury 1: 77.

[^37]:    ${ }^{43}$ Further references to squares can be found in Appendix III and also Christian Wilson, "Alternatim practices in sixteenth-century England: improvisation at the organ and a bunch of Squares," unpublished lecture recital paper, Christ Church, Oxford (2006). Andrew Kirkman has pointed out to me that the piece for such an entry as that described for Queen Elizabeth would almost certainly have been a Te Deum, for which numerous accounts of this type exist (detailing the welcoming of bishops, monarchs, and other dignitaries). In truth, such a reference - as well as others listed in Appendix III - may actually be a reference to nothing more specific than polyphony based on squares. This would further indicate the illusive nature of the terms "square," "squarenote," and "square song," as they most likely carried diverse meanings within the time period.

[^38]:    ${ }^{44}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 97.

[^39]:    ${ }^{45}$ As an interesting side note, a similar pattern of predictable final pitches based on modal octaves can be seen in the cantus lines of Binchois' chansons. Cantus lines that begin on certain pitches have a high percentage of ending on other specific pitches, similar to the format seen with the Lansdowne Kyries. This could be a possible clue in predicting the finals of Binchois' chansons as described in the "Binchois Game." See Dennis Slavin, "The Binchois Game," in Binchois Studies, ed. Andrew Kirkman and Dennis Slavin (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), 163-198.

[^40]:    ${ }^{46}$ Edward Higginbottom, "Alternatim," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Groves Dictionaries, 2001), 1: 426.
    ${ }^{47}$ This source was pointed out to me by Margaret Bent.

[^41]:    ${ }^{1}$ John Aplin, "A Group of English Magnificats 'Upon the Faburden,"" Soundings, 7 (1978), 87.
    ${ }^{2}$ Aplin, "A Group of English Magnificats," 100. He does not describe what "the structural likeness of individual faburden works" specifically entails.

[^42]:    ${ }^{3}$ Hugh Baillie, "Squares," Acta Musicologica, 32 (1960), 178.

[^43]:    ${ }^{4}$ Baillie, "Squares," 178.
    ${ }^{5}$ Charles Hamm, ed., Census-Catalogue of Manuscript Sources of Polyphonic Music 1400-1550, American Institute of Musicology (Neuhausen-Stuttgart: Hänssler-Verlag, 1988), 4: 26. The melodies are written on parchment folios in black mensural notation by a single scribe. The treatises date from the late fourteenth century and f .72 v contains the cropped name "Lambt" written on the top of the page. This name may be in reference to the treatise on the preceding manuscript page (pointed out to me by Rob Wegman). The manuscript was copied in England.
    ${ }^{6}$ Henry Marriott Bannister, Monumenti Vaticani di Paleogaphia Musicale Latina, Codices e vaticanis selecti phototypice expressi, xii (Leipzig: Harassowitz, 1913), no. 86 g . There is no specific information provided on why scholars thought that these were dance tunes other than the fact that they are lacking any text.

[^44]:    ${ }^{7}$ For example, John Ward has argued that the melody of Pastime with Good Company did not originate with King Henry VIII, but was a melody of Continental origin. See John Ward, "The Lute Music of MS Royal Appendix 58," Journal of the American Musicological Society, 13 (1960): 123-124. Ward explains that a melody virtually identical to Pastime exists in several Continental sources, usually with the title De mon triste deplaisir. The earliest of these sources is a chanson by Jean Richafort published by Attaingnant in 1528. The same tune with a related title, De ma tristesse, was published by Symon Cock in his collection of monophonic psalm settings imprinted in Antwerp in 1540. These used folksongs for their sources. De ma tristesse was used in the psalm In exitu Israel (a title that will be further discussed in Chapter Four), and shortly afterwards, Clemens non Papa used the melody in a three-voice setting. Two further independent lute transcriptions were published in 1547 . This case has since been debated by Nigel Davison. See Nigel Davison, "The Western Wind Masses," Musical Quarterly, 57 (1971), 429. The likelihood is that Pastime with Good Company was composed before 1520. John Stevens dates Henry VIII's manuscript (LonBL 31922, containing Pastime) to about 1515, thus Henry VIII's version survives in the earlier source. See John Stevens, Music and Poetry in the Early Tudor Court (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 386.

[^45]:    ${ }^{8}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 107. The partbooks LonBL A45-8 retain their original covers of brown leather stamped with the arms of King Henry VIII and Catherine of Aragon.

[^46]:    ${ }^{9}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 61. LonBL 30520B consists of three fragmentary parchment folios in irregular sizes due to fraying and tearing. These fragments include a Gloria-Credo pair by Ashwell and a Sanctus-Agnus pair by Ludford; both copied by a single scribe.

[^47]:    ${ }^{10}$ Ibid. It is possible that the dedicatory page is not related to the musical fragments.

[^48]:    ${ }^{11}$ These partbooks are also the only extant sources of the three Masses Upon the Square that will be discussed in Chapter Six. Concerning the Gyffard Partbooks, see Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 48-49. They were copied by a single scribe in white mensural notation except for some folios written in strene notation. They contain sacred music arranged by liturgical categories, and then arranged by seniority of the composers.

[^49]:    ${ }^{12}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 1: 98-99. See also Howard Mayer Brown, Frank D’Accone, Jessie Ann Owens, eds., London British Library R.M.24.d2, Renaissance Music in Facsimile (New York: Garland, 1987), v.

[^50]:    ${ }^{13}$ After Richard Taruskin, ed., T'Andernaken: ten settings in three, four and five parts (modern score), five partbooks in original notation (Coconut Grove: Ogni Sorte, 1981), 20-22.

[^51]:    * Lansdowne 462, f. 152, second system, monophonic mensural melody Dominica Die, Dunstable (see above, Ex. 3-11)
    * LonPR 163/22/1/3v
    * LonBLR A45-49, Nicholas Ludford, Missa feria ii
    * Gyffard Partbooks, William Whitbroke, Mass Upon the Square, Kyrie

[^52]:    ${ }^{14}$ The leaf was removed from its original source or collection around 1510 and was used as a wrapping for the rental papers of a manor within the parish of Wye, Kent. See Andrew Wathey, "Newly Discovered Fifteenth-Century English Polyphony at Oxford," Music \& Letters, 64 (1983): 58-66. See also Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 116. The polyphony is in black mensural notation with red coloration, copied by a single scribe.
    ${ }^{15}$ Margaret Bent, Dunstaple (London: Oxford University Press, 1981), 72.
    ${ }^{16}$ The clearest passage of this fragment is the last few bars of the first Kyrie moving into the first few bars of the Christe. The clefs, which are not shown in the manuscript, were supplied by Bent, as well as the missing parts of the square (here shown in half-sized note heads). Bent, Dunstaple, 72.

[^53]:    ${ }^{17}$ Melody after Baillie, "Squares," 189.
    ${ }^{18}$ Baillie, "Squares," 179.
    ${ }^{19}$ The Old Hall Manuscript will continue to appear throughout the following chapters as a source of extracted melodies used as squares. The manuscript was copied between 1410 and 1420 and contains English repertoire dating from about 1370 to 1420: various individual Mass movements (except Kyries) and motets. The manuscript was in the hands of members of the household Chapel of King Henry V by about 1415. See Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 82-83.

[^54]:    ${ }^{20}$ Plainchant quoted after Nick Sandon, ed., The Use of Salisbury 1: The Ordinary of the Mass (Devon: Newton Abbot Antico Edition, 1984-1999), 65.

[^55]:    ${ }^{21}$ As a further note, it is possible that the tradition of square extraction and recycling predates the Old Hall collection. A brief search through some of the fourteenth-century repertoire (particularly involving threevoice, score-formatted works) has so far yielded no square concordances, but a more detailed search may one day prove fruitful.

[^56]:    ${ }^{22}$ See Sandon, The Use of Salisbury 1, 76.

[^57]:    ${ }^{23}$ The catalogue listing in DIAMM confirms the melodic connection between the Sanctus setting in the Flitcham manuscript and Lansdowne 462, but the connection with Mundy's Mass Upon the Square is not mentioned.
    ${ }^{24}$ This source consists of one parchment bifolio that now serves as a wrapper for a legal document. It contains 4 Kyries, 1 incomplete Credo, 2 Sanctus settings (one incomplete), and 1 motet. These were written in black mensural notation in score format, copied in England by a single scribe in the late fourteenth or early fifteenth century. The legal document is dated 1512. See Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 251.
    ${ }^{25}$ Andrew Hughes, "Fifteenth-Century English Polyphony Discovered in Norwich and Arundel," Music \& Letters, 59 (1978), 148.

[^58]:    ${ }^{26}$ The manuscript was deposited in the Norwich record office in 1956.

[^59]:    ${ }^{27}$ This connection was discovered by Lisa Colton. See her "Music in pre-Reformation York: a new source and some thoughts on the York Masses," Plainsong and Medieval Music, 12 (2003): 71-81.

[^60]:    ${ }^{28}$ The London source is a Sarum hymnal printed in Antwerp in 1528 with manuscript additions: 9 Magnificat faburdens and 10 hymn faburdens. The Dover source consists of several pieces of parchment originally used as a cover. One large folded leaf is part of a service book, while the other two leaves contain polyphony and were positioned in the front on the new binding during the early sixteenth century. Images of these sources can be found on DIAMM.

[^61]:    ${ }^{29}$ This is certainly a phenomenon that needs further investigation, but 6 of the 24 Kyries listed in Appendix I contain the opening figure of an ascending fourth reminiscent of such a technique. The same general profile of these Magnificats, including the ascending fourth, further appears in a more florid and ornamented form in the tenor voice (and to some degree, the treble voice) of William Cornysh's five-voice Magnificat. See Paul Doe, ed., Early Tudor Magnificats I, Early English Church Music 4 (London: Stainer \& Bell, 1964), 49-64.

[^62]:    ${ }^{30}$ Christopher Macklin, "Plague, Performance and the Elusive History of the Stella celi extirpavit," Early Music History, 29 (2010), 7.
    ${ }^{31}$ Cooke is first recorded as a member of King Henry V's household chapel in 1413, he was a colleague of Thomas Damett, and he accompanied the King during the battle of Agincourt. See Margaret Bent and Roger Bowers, "Cooke [Cook], J(ohn)" in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 6:387. Cooke represents another link with the musicians of the English Royal households and the Old Hall manuscript (as a source of certain squares). See Macklin, "Plague," 9; and Andrew Hughes and Margaret Bent, "The Old Hall Manuscript - A Re-Appraisal and an Inventory," Musica Disciplina, 21 (1967), 104.
    ${ }^{32}$ Macklin, "Plague," 11-12.

[^63]:    ${ }^{33}$ Manfred Bukofzer, "Popular and Secular Music in England to c.1470," in Ars Nova and the Renaissance, 1300-1540, ed. D.A. Hughes and G. Abraham (London: New Oxford History of Music, 1960), 131-132.
    ${ }^{34}$ Macklin, "Plague," 6-7. See also W.B. Squire, "Notes on an Undescribed Collection of English $15^{\text {th }}$ Century Music," Sammelbände der Internationalen Musikgesellschaft, 2 (1901): 342-92; and Margaret Bent, The Old Hall Manuscript: A Paleographic Study (Ph.D. thesis, Cambridge University, 1969), 329333.

[^64]:    ${ }^{35}$ See Eamon Duffy, The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c.1400-c. 1580 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992); and Magnus Williamson, "Liturgical Polyphony in the PreReformation English Parish Church: A Provisional List and Commentary," Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle, 38 (2005): 1-17.

[^65]:    ${ }^{36}$ For example, Andrew Kirkman has pointed out to me that fauxbourdon-like textures are fairly common in laments and Requiems; perhaps the use of squares carried a certain set of liturgical occasional connotations including processions.

[^66]:    ${ }^{1}$ See Appendix III for a list of some archival references to squares.
    ${ }^{2}$ David Fallows, A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415-1480 (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), 301-302.

[^67]:    ${ }^{3}$ Cambridge University Library, Report of the Library Syndicate: for the Nine Months Ending 30 September 1920, from the University Reporter, 1920-1921 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1921), 4.

[^68]:    ${ }^{4}$ The Cambridge University Library, Report of the Library Syndicate does not provide any specific information about the 1459 Psalter. Most likely, it was a copy of the Mainz Psalter published by Fust and Schöffer - the second major work printed with movable type after the Gutenberg Bible. The 1459 version was a revised edition of their 1457 Psalter, with twenty-three lines per page as compared to twenty lines in the 1457 edition; but using the same types and initials as the 1457 edition. At least ten copies are known, plus various fragments, all of them printed on vellum. See Irvine Masson, The Mainz Psalters and Canon Missae, 1457-1459 (London: Bibliographical Society, 1954).
    ${ }^{5}$ Similar markings can be seen in BevRS 19/2/I/Bv.

[^69]:    ${ }^{6}$ Frederick S. Paxton, Christianizing Death: The Creation of a Ritual Process in Early Medieval Europe, (New York: Cornell University Press, 1996), 39.
    ${ }^{7}$ The Mystery Play of d'Elx, or Misteri d'Elx, is a liturgical drama dating from around the second half of the fourteenth century and celebrated in the Basilica of Santa Maria in the city of Elche on the fourteenth and fifteenth of August. The Misteri is divided into two parts, enacted over two days, and re-creates the death (the "Vespra") and Assumption of the Blessed Virgin into Heaven ("La Festa"). The first part ends with five angels carrying the soul of Mary (in the form of a small sculpted image) to Heaven while singing the In exitu Israel text. This important moment, when the soul of the Blessed Virgin joins God in Heaven upon the death of her body, closes the first act of the Misteri. See Robert Lima, Dark Prisms: Occultism in Hispanic Drama (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 1995), 9-10.
    ${ }^{8}$ Dante Alighieri, Dante's Divine Comedy: The Purgatorio: A Prose Translation by the late William Stratford Dugdale with the text as edited by Brugnone Bianchi and with explanatory notes (London: George Bell and Sons, 1883), 16-17: "Then, as by degrees he came towards us, the divine winged one appeared more clearly....But he drew near to the strand in a swift bark, so light withal that it scarce displaced the water. On the poop was standing the heavenly pilot; blessedness appeared written on his brow: and more than a hundred spirits sat within the boat, and sang all together with one voice, 'In exitu Israel de Aegypto,' with all the remainder of that psalm. ...Then he blessed them with the sign of the holy cross; whereupon they at once leaped out on the shore, and he departed as swiftly as he had come. The multitude that remained there seemed strange to the place, gazing about, as those who contemplate things new and marvelous."
    ${ }^{9}$ Pierre Batiffol, History of the Roman Breviary (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1912), 97.

[^70]:    ${ }^{10}$ Denis Stevens, "Processional Psalms in Faburden," Musica Disciplina, 9 (1955), 106.
    ${ }^{11}$ Gareth Curtis and Andrew Wathey, "Fifteenth-Century English Liturgical Music: A List of the Surviving Repertory," Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle, 27 (1994): 1-69.
    ${ }^{12}$ This motion was discussed in Chapter Three concerning two monophonic mensural Magnificats; and six of the twenty-four Kyrie examples in Appendix I also share this characteristic in their opening gestures.
    ${ }^{13}$ Stevens, "Processional Psalms," 108. Andrew Kirkman has pointed out to me that the fauxbourdon idiom is also typical of lamentation and funeral rites.

[^71]:    ${ }^{14}$ After Philip Kaye, ed., The Sacred Music of Gilles Binchois (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), 203.
    ${ }^{15}$ Barbara Haggh, "Binchois and Sacred Music at the Burgundian Court," in Binchois Studies, ed. Andrew Kirkman and Dennis Slavin (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 22-23. The piece survives in two Italian sources: Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale MS 112 (FlorBN Magl. 112bis); and Modena, Biblioteca Estense e Universitaria MS a.X.1.11 (ModE X.1.11).

[^72]:    ${ }^{16}$ Mattias Lundberg, Tonus Peregrinus: The History of a Psalm-Tone and Its Use in Polyphonic Music (Burlington, Vermont: Ashgate, 2011), 26.
    ${ }^{17}$ After Lundberg, Tonus Peregrinus, 26. See Franchinus Gafurius, Practica musicae 1496 (New York, 1979), f.dd, iv r. Huiusmodi autem contapunctum cantores ad Faulxbourdon appellant: in quo quidem medius ipse contratenor saepius notulas cantus subsequitur: diatessaronica sub ipsis depression procedens: quod in psalmodarium modulationibus a musicis frequentius obseruatur.

[^73]:    ${ }^{18}$ Lundberg, Tonus Peregrinus, 28.
    ${ }^{19}$ See Charles Hamm, Census-Catalogue of Manuscript Sources of Polyphonic Music 1400-1550, (Neuhausen-Stuttgart: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler Verlag, 1979-1988): 2: 173-174. MonteA 871 is a composite of several originally separate fascicles bound together in the late seventeenth century. Parchment folios contain various writing on religious topics while the paper folios contain music. The main scribe was probably a Benedictine monk at the monastery of St. Michele arcangelo de planciano in Gaeta. The music was probably copied sometime between 1480 and 1500 but contains repertoire dating from between 1430 and 1480. The non-musical portions date from the thirteenth to fourteenth centuries.
    ${ }^{20}$ After Isabel Pope and Masakata Kanazawa, eds., The Musical Manuscript Montecassino 871: A Neapolitan Repertory of Sacred and Secular Music of the Late Fifteenth Century (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1978), 123-124.

[^74]:    ${ }^{21}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2:173.
    ${ }^{22}$ Isabel Pope and Tess Knighton, "Oriola, Pietro [Orihuela, Pedro de; Pere]," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 18: 701.

[^75]:    ${ }^{23}$ The transcription of "steade" was pointed out to me by Andrew Kirkman; and the "ffor sydes" was pointed out to me by Rob Wegman. The reading of this phrase is admittedly difficult in that it requires a high degree of magnification [digital images need to be ordered from the Cambridge University Library]. The opening letter matches the "s" of "songe" in the line above and the "s" of "square" in the line below (my interpretation). If the phrase does read as "ffor sydes," it would be quite unusual. Most period documents use this term in reference to "sides" - as in the sides of a Church, yard, wall, or dwelling. My tentative suggestion is that if the phrase does transcribe as "ffor sydes," it could refer to the sides of a choir loft. Accounts of the reforms made at Christ Church, Oxford (during the reign of King Henry VIII, but after the time of Cardinal Wolsey) include the following: "Imprimis to Poppyng Jaye, the joiner, for taking down the stalls and sydes of the choir and high altar and other things in the church for eight days." See Francis Goldie, A Bygone Oxford (London: Burns and Oates, 1881), 12-13. In this sense, "ffor sydes," might refer

[^76]:    ${ }^{25}$ Rev. John Henry Blunt, ed., The Annotated Book of Common Prayer; Being an Historical, Ritual, and Theological Commentary on the Devotional System of the Church of England (London: Rivingtons, 1866), 17.
    ${ }^{26}$ Rev. William Henry Pinnock, The Laws and Usages of the Church and Clergy - The Ornaments and Goods of the Church (Cambridge: J. Hall and Son, 1858), 1351.

[^77]:    ${ }^{27}$ See Gareth Curtis and Andrew Wathey, "Fifteenth-Century English Liturgical Music: A List of the Surviving Repertory," Royal Music Association Research Chronicle, 27 (1994): 1-69.
    ${ }^{28}$ Kenneth Elliot, "Johnson, Robert (i)," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Groves Dictionaries, 2001), 13: 164-165.
    ${ }^{29}$ James Osborn and Robert McQuillan, "Whythorne, Thomas," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Groves Dictionaries, 2001), 27: 353-354.

[^78]:    ${ }^{30}$ Clive Burgess and Andrew Wathey, "Mapping the Soundscape: Church Music in English Towns, 14501550," Early Music History, 19 (2000): 44.

[^79]:    ${ }^{31}$ Burgess and Wathey, "Mapping the Soundscape," 34 (italics mine).
    ${ }^{32}$ See David Skinner, "At the Mynde of Nycholas Ludford," Early Music, 22 (1994): 399, concerning John Moore, a parish clerk of St. Stephens who in 1529 was paid 5s 4d for the "prykyng of ix kyryes, alleluyas, viij sequences, vj anthems, a Mass of iij parts for men, and an Exultant for children." Records such as these suggest that it was not always assumed that boys would sing the top voice parts. Skinner also cites Roger Bowers, "A Ministry in Music: the Singing Boys of English Parish Churches in the Late Middle Ages," unpublished paper presented at the International Medieval Congress, University of Leeds, July 12, 2005.

[^80]:    ${ }^{33}$ Further information on these part designations can be found in Magnus Williamson, "Liturgical Polyphony in the Pre-Reformation English Parish Church," Royal Musical Association Research Chronicle, 38 (2005): 1-43.
    ${ }_{35}^{34}$ David Wulstan, Tudor Music (London: J. M. Dent and Sons, 1985), 262.
    ${ }^{35}$ Ibid.

[^81]:    ${ }^{36}$ See also William Henry Grattan Flood, "New Light on Early Tudor Composers XII - John Taverner," Musical Times, 61 (1920): 597.
    ${ }^{37}$ Flood, "New Light," 597. After J.S. Brewer and James Gardner, Esq., eds., Calendar of Letters and Papers, Foreign and Domestic, of the Reign of Henry VIII, preserved in Her Majesty's Public Record Office, the British Museum, \&c., (London: King's College, 1862-1885). The quote uses both spellings of the name: Benbowe and Benbow. See also William Henry Grattan Flood, Early Tudor Composers: Biographical Sketches of Thirty-Two Musicians and Composers of the Period 1485-1555 (London: Oxford University Press, 1925), 90.

[^82]:    ${ }^{38}$ After Judith Blezzard, ed., The Tudor Church Music of the Lumley Books (Madison: A-R Editions, 1985), 55-56. For images of the manuscript, see Roger Bray, comp., The British Library Music Manuscript Collection (Harvester Microform - Harvester Press Publishing Group, 1983).
    ${ }^{39}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 111. The Lumley Partbooks are a set of three books; the bassus book is lost, although it was included in an inventory of the Lumley collection in 1609. The books consist of 11 service sections, 17 anthems, 1 English litany, 1 English secular piece, 1 French secular piece, and about 40 textless pieces. The secular pieces are later additions. See also Judith Blezzard, "The Lumley Books: a Collection of Tudor Church Music," Musical Times, 112 (1971), 128.
    ${ }^{40}$ Blezzard, "The Lumley Books," 128.
    ${ }^{41}$ Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, ix
    ${ }^{42}$ Blezzard, "The Lumley Books," 128.
    ${ }^{43}$ The temporal significance of this manuscript, including the musical demands set out by the English reformers, will be discussed below.

[^83]:    ${ }^{44}$ Ibid.
    ${ }^{45}$ Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, ix. In Royal App. 75 and 76 the verses follow the normal succession, but the layout of the surviving portion of the piece in Royal App. 74, in which only odd-numbered verses appear on a verso page, might suggest antiphonal performance. Perhaps this is related to the descriptor "ffor sydes" as seen in the verso title of CambriU 4405(9).

[^84]:    ${ }^{46}$ After Blezzard, "The Lumley Books," 128.
    ${ }^{47}$ After Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, 55-56.

[^85]:    ${ }^{48}$ Ibid.

[^86]:    ${ }_{59}^{49}$ After Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, 14-16.
    ${ }^{50}$ Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, viii. The musical changes made by the English reformers will be discussed below.

[^87]:    ${ }^{51}$ Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, ix.

[^88]:    ${ }^{52}$ Blanche Gangwere, Music History During the Renaissance Period, 1520-1550: A Documented Chronology (Westport Connecticut: Praeger, 2004), 304.
    ${ }_{54}^{53}$ Concerning the label of tone 7 as the tonus peregrinus, see Lundberg, Tonus Peregrinus, 85.
    ${ }^{54}$ Gangwere, Music History During the Renaissance Period 1520-1550, 305.

[^89]:    ${ }^{55}$ Printed at London, 1545, in the Fletestrete at the signe of the Sunne, ouer against the conduite, by Eduard Whitchurche.
    ${ }^{57}$ Blezzard, The Tudor Church Music, vii.
    ${ }^{57}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 294. The Wanley Partbooks are a set of three paper books copied by a single scribe. They contain music for 10 services, 32 service sections, 47 anthems, and 1 textless piece. They were copied between 1549 and 1552, perhaps in London for use at a private chapel or parish church. They were later owned by the antiquarian Humphrey Wanley (1672-1726) and then by the Oxford University music school.

[^90]:    ${ }^{58}$ John Aplin, "The Origins of John Day’s 'Certaine Notes'," Music \& Letters, 62 (1981), 296. The British Library has copies of both the bass and medius books with 1560 title pages, though the medius music was probably not set up by then. In 1565 , title pages were printed for a complete set of partbooks.
    ${ }^{59}$ Aplin, "The Origins," 295. See also 297-298: Aplin explains that certain pieces within the collection share concordances with the Wanley Partbooks. The Certaine Notes collection may have been organized by 1553 and political circumstances caused its publication to be delayed. John Day finally issued it in 1565, having abandoned another plan to publish it in 1560 . Day had printed much of the bass book at this time, but then stopped; perhaps because he was not convinced that the venture was commercially viable. The bass book was completed and issued along with the medius, contratenor, and tenor books five years later. The early concept of the collection is evidenced by the number of pieces that originated in adapted plainsong, a technique common in the Edwardian years but probably regarded as somewhat archaic in the 1560 's. Aplin also points out discrepancies between the 1560 pages in the bass volume and the rest of the set. The individual movements of Caustun's Service for men appear in a different order in the bass book than in the medius, contratenor and tenor books. Since this bass book was designed first, it probably represents Day's first intentions. Caustun's Communion Service in the bass book follows the order of the 1549 Prayer Book - Kyrie, Gloria, Creed, Sanctus - while the other three books follow the order of the 1559 re-issue of the revised Prayer Book: Kyrie, Creed, Sanctus, Gloria; meaning that the order of Caustun's Service in the bass book would have had no liturgical validity by 1560 .
    ${ }^{60}$ See S. Royale Shore, "The Early Harmonized Chants of the Church of England," Musical Times, 53 (1912), 650.

[^91]:    ${ }^{61}$ Shore, "The Early Harmonized Chants," 650.

[^92]:    ${ }^{1}$ This source was pointed out by Margaret Bent and is listed by David Fallows in his Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs 1415-1480 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 301.

[^93]:    ${ }^{2}$ After Hugh Baillie, "Squares" Acta Musicologica, 32 (1960): 178-193.

[^94]:    ${ }^{3}$ Baillie, "Squares," 179. Baillie has the Taverner Christe listed incorrectly as appearing in the Gyffard Partbooks.
    ${ }^{4}$ This profile includes the utilization of mostly breves and semibreves with occasional minims, a number of wide intervalic leaps, and the frequent use of hemiola. This can be seen in a number of the Kyrie melodies found in Appendix I. See also Shai Burstyn, "Power's Anima mea and Binchois' De plus en plus: a Study in Musical Relationships," Musica Disciplina, 30 (1976): 55-72; and Ted Dumitrescu, "An English Adoption of the Burgundian Chanson," in Suzannah Clark and Elizabeth Eva Leach, eds., Citation and

[^95]:    Authority in Medieval and Renaissance Musical Culture: Learning from the Learned (Rochester: Boydell and Brewer, 2005), 174-83.
    ${ }^{5}$ Margaret Bent, "The Transmission of English Music 1300-1500: Some Aspects of Repertory and Presentation," in Studien zur Tradition in der Musik Kurt von Fischer zum 60 Geburtstag, Hans Heinrich Eggebrecht and Max Lütolf, eds., (München: Emil Katzbichler, 1973), 68.
    ${ }^{6}$ Charles van den Borren, Le Manuscrit Musical M. 222 C. 22 de la Bibliothèque nationale et universitaire de Strasbourg, Annales de l'Académie Royale d'archéologie de Belgique (Anvers: Imprimerie E. Secelle, 1924),16. The original manuscript also contained the date 1411 on f .142 for a treatise: "Et sic cum Dei adjutorio libellus iste musicalium...finitus est anno Domini MCCCCXI."
    ${ }^{7}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 3: 163-164. The Strasbourg Manuscript is considered an early fifteenthcentury source with later additions dating from around 1450 . The manuscript was of southwest German monastic origin; perhaps copied in Strasbourg, Freiburg im Breisgau, or its vicinity. In addition to the polyphony, the manuscript also contained theoretical treatises by Phillipe de Vitry, as well as fourteen monophonic pieces.
    ${ }^{8}$ See Thesaurus Musicus II: Le Manuscrit musical M 222 C 22 de la Bibliothèque de Strasbourg XVe siècle, Bruxelles: Office International De Librairie (New York: Old Manuscripts and Incunabula Specialists in Facsimile Editions), no. 81.

[^96]:    ${ }^{9}$ These errors have been adjusted in the above musical example. The mensuration Tempus perfectum, prolatio major is most likely a mistake (either scribal or by Coussemaker), as well as the following: the cantus is missing the rest in bar 5; bar 25 of the cantus contains an extra B semibreve written above the $F$ (its purpose is unknown); bar 28 of the cantus is missing the E minim (included in the above example); bar

[^97]:    45 of the cantus contains the following figure - D breve, E breve ligatured to a C breve, a D breve and a C semibreve (this figure makes the cantus line too long and has been adjusted in the above example to match the other Portugaler sources, this figure also constitutes the only ligatured notes in the entire piece); bar 55 of the cantus has an A minim instead of a semibreve; and bar 10 of the tenor has the C written as a minim instead of a semibreve. The end of the second section of the cantus includes an extra two bars with an A breve, G semibreve, and an A breve followed by repeat signs. The opening pick-up notes in the cantus are not in any other source.
    ${ }^{10}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 3: 163-164. The contents of this manuscript originally included 3 Kyries, 14 Glorias, 10 Credos, 1 Credo, 4 Sanctus, 2 Sanctus-Agnus pairs, 6 hymns, 24 motets, 88 French secular pieces, 18 German secular pieces, 8 Latin secular pieces, 4 Dutch secular pieces (one of these is possibly corrupt English rather than Dutch), 4 Italian secular pieces, and 4 textless pieces. The importance of this list resides in the variety of pieces from different countries, as well as the connection with sacred music. This seems to be a trend among the Continental collections that contain the Kyrie \#3 melody.
    ${ }^{11}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 239-240. Three gatherings of this manuscript were possibly copied at the Augustinian convent of St. John the Baptist and St. John the Evangelist in Munich. The manuscript was owned by the St. Emmeram monastery until it was transferred to the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in 1811 during the secularization of the Bavarian monasteries. See also Ian Rumbold and Peter Wright, Der Mensuralcodex St. Emmeram: Faksimile der Handschrift Clm 14274 der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek München, ed., Bayerischen Staatsbibliothe and Lorenz Welker, (Reichert, Wiesbaden, 2006), 2: 72.

[^98]:    ${ }^{12}$ The second system of the discantus is accidentally written in bass clef instead of continuing the discantus clef. There is an E breve in the tenor part that does not belong in the melody.

[^99]:    ${ }^{13}$ See Ian Rumbold and Peter Wright, Der Mensuralcodex St. Emmeram: Faksimile der Handschrift Clm 14274 der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek München, edited by the Bayerischen Staatsbibliothe, and Lorenz Welker, Elemeta Musicae, 2 (Reichert, Wiesbaden, 2006).
    ${ }^{14}$ The main scribe and compiler of this manuscript was Hermann Pötzlinger, a priest and rector scolarum of the Benedictine monastery of St. Emmeram at Regensburg. However, there were at least three other contributors to the manuscript. Rumbold and Wright believe that the Portugaler settings in folios 65 and 77 were copied by different hands, and that the Ave tota casta was copied by Pötzlinger with another scribe appending the contratenor. See Rumbold and Wright, Der Mensuralcodex St. Emmeram, Commentary, 8990 and 135. See also Dagmar Braunschweig-Pauli, "Studien zum sogenannten Codex St. Emmeram: Entstehung, Datierung, und Besitzer der Handschrift München, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 14274 (olim Mus. Ms. 3232a), Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch, 66 (1982): 1-48; Dagmar Braunschweig-Pauli, "Neue Ergebnisse zum Codex St. Emmeram," Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch, 65 (1981): 1-5; Ian Rumbold, "The Compilation and Ownership of the "St. Emmeram" Codex (Munich, Bayerische

[^100]:    Staatsbibliothek, Clm 14274)," Early Music History, 2 (1982): 161-235; and Rumbold and Wright, Der Mensuralcodex St. Emmeram, 72 and 86.
    ${ }^{15}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 240.
    ${ }^{16}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 228-229; and 4: 445. This is a particularly fragmentary collection, containing 3 Credos, 1 Gloria, 1 hymn, 4 motets, 3 French secular pieces, and 1 Latin secular piece. Most are fragmentary and incomplete; copied by a single scribe in black mensural notation on red staves with red coloration. The pages consist of paper and parchment folios of irregular sizes recovered from bindings of incunabulum printed in Venice in 1493 by Arrivabeni. Apparently, these are the only surviving remnants of a musical manuscript containing at least 106 folios. Images of this source are not easily available and were unaccessable for use in this chapter's discussion. The following discussions concerning comparisons will not include this source.
    ${ }^{17}$ Helmut Hell, "Zwei weitere Blätter zum Fragment Mus. Ms. 3224 in der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek aus der Dufay-Zeit," Musik in Bayern, 27 (1983): 43-49. See also David Fallows, The Songs of Guillaume Dufay: Critical Commentary to the Revision of Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae (American Institute of Musicology, 1995), 6: 244. The O incomparabilis Virgo was originally found on ff.102v-103. This

[^101]:    collection further contains a piece, Iuvenis qui puellam, with the inscription "Decretalis Guillermus du fay." Fallows has suggested that Du Fay, at some point, may have been in physical proximity with the manuscript or its compilers.
    ${ }^{18}$ The topic of whether or not Du Fay was the composer of this piece is one of certain controversy among modern scholars. My thanks to David Fallows and Alejandro Planchart for their comments on a version of this chapter read at the Medieval-Renaissance Conference held at Kings College, London, July 2010.
    ${ }^{19}$ Rumbold and Wright, Der Mensuralcodex St. Emmeram, Commentary, 135.
    ${ }^{20}$ Bertha Antonia Wallner, ed., Das Buxheimer Orgelbuch: Handschrift Mus. 3725 der Bayerischen Staatsbibliothek, München (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1955).

[^102]:    ${ }^{21}$ Margaret Bent, "The Transmission of English Music 1300-1500," 68. Transcription after Leeman Perkins and Howard Garey, eds., The Mellon Chansonnier (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979), 1: 172-173.

[^103]:    ${ }^{22}$ Perkins and Gary, The Mellon Chansonnier, 2: 395-396.
    ${ }^{23}$ Translation taken from Perkins and Garey, The Mellon Chansonnier, 2: 395.

[^104]:    ${ }^{24}$ Jean Renart, Le Roman de Galerent, Comte de Bretagne, par le trouvère Renaut, Anatole Boucherie, ed., (Paris: Maisonneuve et Charles Leclerc, 1888), 59.
    ${ }^{25}$ Alexandre Pey, Doon de Maience, Chanson de Geste, Publiée pour la premiére fois d'après les manuscrits de Montpellier et de Paris (Paris: Chez F. Vieweg, 1859), 140.
    ${ }^{26}$ Anatole de Courde de Montaiglon, ed., Recueil de poésies françoises des XVe et XVIe siecles, morales, facétieuses, historiques (Paris: Chez P. Jannet, Libraire, 1856), 4: 35.
    ${ }^{27}$ Bent, "The Transmission," 68.

[^105]:    ${ }^{28}$ David Fallows, "Songs of Guillaume Dufay," 244. Specifically, Fallows points out the imitation in bar 10, the figuration in bar 14-15, the triple figures in bars 23-25, the textural interchange at the beginning of the secunda pars, and the treatment of the contratenor in bars 39-40 and 51-55, as characteristics of Du Fay's work. Features suggesting an English origin are the "strange" text distribution, "stunted" counterpoint, and a melodic style that is otherwise different from Du Fay's work, particularly at phrase ends. For full score in modern edition, see Perkins and Garey, The Mellon Chansonnier, 173.
    ${ }^{29}$ Perkins and Garey, The Mellon Chansonnier, 8.

[^106]:    ${ }^{30}$ This source was generously pointed out to me by Margaret Bent.
    ${ }^{31}$ Fallows, "The Songs of Guillaume Dufay," 243. Transcription after Theodore Dumitrescu, ed., FifteenthCentury Liturgical Music VII, The York Masses, Early English Church Music 52 (published for the British Academy, Stainer and Bell, 2010), 20-39. The York Mass collection contains two sections: the remains of two small performance sources assembled by one musician and used at different times at York. The first set, containing the Or me veult Mass pair dates from c.1475-1480, and the second set dates from c.14901500.

[^107]:    ${ }^{32}$ Dumitrescu, The York Masses, xx.
    ${ }^{33}$ The music folios were recovered from the binding around 1940 by the Rev. Dr. J.S. Purvis and later stored in the Borthwick Institute of Historical Research. See Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 4: 168.

[^108]:    ${ }^{34}$ For further information on this source, see Kenton Parton, "On Two Early Tudor Manuscripts of Keyboard Music," Journal of the American Musicological Society, 17 (1964): 81-83.
    ${ }^{35}$ See also Denis Stevens, trans. and ed., Early Tudor Organ Music II: Music for the Mass, Early English Church Music, 10 (Published for the British Academy, Stainer and Bell), 16-17.

[^109]:    ${ }^{36}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue 2: 49-50. LonBL 18936-9 consists of four surviving partbooks of an original five, copied by a single scribe. Many pieces have text incipits or titles only, and some were probably copied for instrumental performance. The set was compiled around 1615 in England, probably in the household of Edward Paston (1550-1630) of Norfolk - a country gentleman and collector of music. The partbooks contain 1 Mass, 80 Mass ordinary sections or fragments, 18 Requiem Mass sections or fragments, 2 Mass Proper sections, 4 Magnificat sections, 1 hymn, 1 Lamentation, 32 motets, 9 anthems, 49 English secular pieces, 8 Italian secular pieces, 3 Latin secular piece, 3 French secular pieces, 4 textless pieces (including 1 In nomine, 1 Fantasia, and 1 pieces with title "Miserere"). Taverner's Christe would date from before 1545 .

[^110]:    ${ }^{37}$ After "Related Works Not for Keyboard," in John Caldwell, ed. Tudor Keyboard Music, c.1520-1580, Musica Britannica, 66 (London: Stainer and Bell, 1995), 158.
    ${ }^{38}$ Knowles and Thurston Dart, "Notes on a Bible of Evesham Abbey," English Historical Review, 79 (1964): 775. Dart described the collection as "miscellaneous," and he commented that "none of them [the

[^111]:    pieces] appears to be known from other sources, printed or manuscript." The Bible itself is dated 1537, yet the music was probably added some time thereafter. John Alcetur was a sexton of the Abbey until its dissolution in January of 1539.
    ${ }^{39}$ Caldwell, Tudor Keyboard Music, 158.
    ${ }^{40}$ See also Stevens, Early Tudor Organ Music II: Music for the Mass, 18.

[^112]:    ${ }^{41}$ Perkins and Garey, The Mellon Chansonnier 1, 172.
    ${ }^{42}$ Roger Bray, compiler, The British Library Music Manuscript Collection (Harvester Microform Harvester Press Publishing Group, 1983).

[^113]:    ${ }^{43}$ Charles Van den Borren, Le Manuscrit Musical M. 222 C.22, 172.
    ${ }^{44}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 1: 93. The manuscript dates from around 1470 and contains 58 basse danse melodies with dance steps indicated under the music. It is possible that some of the melodies were utilized in later polyphonic pieces. A facsimile and transcription can be found in Ernest Clossen, ed, Le Manuscrit dit des Basses danses de la Bibliothèque de Bourgogne (Bruxelles: Société des Bibliophiles et iconophiles de Belgique, 1912; Minkoff reprint, 1976).

[^114]:    ${ }^{45}$ Calendar of the Close Rolls preserved in the Public Record Office Prepared under the superintendence

[^115]:    ${ }^{46}$ Calendar of the Patent Rolls Preserved in the Public Record Office: Richard II, A.D. 1385-1389 (Kessinger Publishing, LLC, 2010), 346.
    ${ }^{47}$ Fernão Lopez, trans. Derek W. Lomax and R.J. Oakley, The English in Portugal, 1367-87: Extracts from the Chronicles of Dom Fernando and Dom João, (Warminster: Aris and Phillips, 1988), xxi.
    ${ }^{48}$ Richard Hakluyt, The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques, and Discoveries of the English Nation: Made by Sea or Ouer-land, to the Remote and Farthest Distant Quarters of the Earth, at any Time Within the Compasse of These 1600 yeres: Deuided into Three Seuerall volumes, According to the Positions of the Regions, Whereunto they were Directed (London: George Bishop, Ralph Newberie, and Robert Barker, 1599-1600).
    ${ }^{49}$ A.R. Disney, A History of Portugal and the Portuguese Empire: from its Beginnings to 1807 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 171. Andrew Kirkman has also pointed out to me that there exists a copy of King Henry V's coronation rites in a fifteenth-century manuscript in Evora. See Walter Ullmann,

[^116]:    ed. Liber regie capelle: A Manuscript in the Biblioteca Publica, Evora 92 (London: Henry Bradshaw Society, 1961).
    ${ }^{50}$ Max Weinreich, History of the Yiddish Language 2 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), 117. According to Weinreich, until 1828, everything that was not in Loshn-koydesh in the services of the Sephardic synagogue in London was said in Portuguese.
    ${ }^{51}$ See Jane Gerber, The Jews of Spain: A History of the Sephardic Experience (New York: Free Press, 1992). The social history of this region would certainly support the spread of culturally specific improvisatory musical forms. A massacre of Jewish natives in Seville (June 1391), forced a number of conversions as well as expulsions from the country. Those who converted to Christianity were supposedly allowed to assume positions of wealth and power, which eventually caused resentment among the "old"

[^117]:    Christians. During the reign of Ferdinand and Isabella, rumors of people "Judaizing" among the converted population began the Spanish inquisition of 1481 ; and by 1492 all Jews were ordered to depart from Spain by the end of July. England and France had already established bans on their Jewish populations in previous centuries, most German towns had expelled their Jewish population in a hysteria surrounding the Black Plague, and most of the Italian territories refused to accept these refugees. Many of them fled to Portugal where they were permitted entrance upon the payment of a hefty sum. Those who could not pay for an entrance permit were often sold into slavery. Concerning the activities of certain Jewish musicians of the time, see Guglielmo Ebreo, De pratica seu arte tripudii $=$ On the practice or art of dancing, Barbara Sparti, ed., trans. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993).
    ${ }_{52}$ Eileen Southern, "Some Keyboard Basse Danses of the Fifteenth Century," Acta Musicologica, 35 (1963): 114-115. The Lochamer Liederbuch (Berlin Deutsche Staatsbibliothek, MS 40613) is another source of basse danse material, as well as an Italian source by the dancing master Antonio Conazano, which includes three basse danse tunes: tenore del re di spagna, cancon de pifari dicto el farrarese, and tenore collinetto. The first of these, known elsewhere as La spagna, was perhaps the most famous of the tunes and is thought to have travelled extensively. Sources such as these could potentially provide further concordant sources of squares.

[^118]:    ${ }^{53}$ Knowles and Thurston Dart, "Notes on a Bible of Evesham Abbey," English Historical Review, 79 (1964): 775.
    ${ }^{54}$ See for example Henry Marriott Bannister, Monumenti Vaticani di Paleogaphia Musicale Latina (Leipzig: Harassowitz, 1913), no. 86g.
    ${ }^{55}$ Fallows, "The Songs of Guillaume Dufay," 243.
    ${ }^{56}$ This is a basic translation that was confirmed by Leofranc Holford-Strevens at the 2010 Med-Ren Conference at Kings College London.

[^119]:    ${ }^{57}$ David Laing and William Carew Hazlitt, eds., Early Popular Poetry of Scotland and the Northern Boarder (London: Reeves and Turner, 1895), 1: 287.
    ${ }^{58}$ Laing and Hazlitt, Early Popular Poetry of Scotland, 194.

[^120]:    ${ }^{59}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 278. The manuscript also contains calendars and astronomical tables. It was copied in England and owned by the Oxford mathematician Thomas Allen (1542-1632) and bequeathed to Sir Kenelm Digby (1603-1665). See also Dumitrescu, The Early Tudor Court, 162-163. The titles of the Digby melodies are Quene note, Auxce bon youre delabonestren, and Eterne rex altissime Redemtor et... along with a mensurally-notated discant part for the Quene note tenor. Dumitrescu points out that no further text survives for the French song Auxce bon youre, but a polyphonic version of the music with only the initial "A" is found in TrentC 87 , ff. $117 \mathrm{v}-118 \mathrm{r}$ [see further, Fallows, Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 94]. That Quene note is also a French tenor is probably indicated by the heading "ffrankus" which is attached to the music in the decoration at the beginning of the top staff. This manuscript can be viewed on DIAMM.
    ${ }^{60}$ Jan Willem Bonda, "Tandernaken, Between Bruges and Ferrara," in From Ciconia to Sweelink: Donum Natalicium Willem Elders, ed. Albert Clement and Eric Jas (Atlanta: Rodopi, 1994), 60-61.

[^121]:    ${ }^{61}$ Ross Duffin, "Ensemble Improvisation in the Fifteenth-Century Mensural Dance Repertoire," (paper presented at the conference, "Performance Practice and Reptertory of Loud Minstrels in the $15^{\text {th }}$ Century," at Alden Biesen, Belgium, June, 1995), 2.
    ${ }^{62}$ Duffin, "Ensemble Improvisation," 2. Duffin also points out the importance of cadences as structural places where each improviser had specific, and narrow, responsibilities. Supposedly the performer of the tenor needed to ornament the cadence point, both for general "interest," and as an alert for the other improvisers that a cadence was imminent and that they had better prepare to "carry out their cadential duties." In this sense, the cadences took on something of a "contrapuntal stature." Improvisers could not just "pretend that the tenor was unornamented and play against the original melody, they had to adjust their lines to correspond to the more rapidly moving notes being played by the tenor" (p.4).

[^122]:    ${ }^{63}$ Manfred Bukofzer, Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music (New York: W.W. Norton, 1950), 195.
    ${ }^{64}$ Eileen Southern, "Basse-Danse Music in Some German Manuscripts of the $15^{\text {th }}$ Century," in Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music: A Birthday Offering to Gustave Reese, ed. Jan La Rue (New York: W.W. Norton, 1966), 742.

[^123]:    ${ }^{65}$ Heartz, "Basse danse," 866.
    ${ }^{66}$ See Richard Leighton Greene, The Early English Carols, second ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977), xxxii. Greene cites the Cursor Mundi of c. 1300 as using the term carol to designate a round-dance (p. xxxiii). For a sense of the poem's sources, see H.C.W. Haenisch, "Inquiry into the Sources of the Cursor Mundi," in Cursor Mundi, ed., Morris (1892), 1-56, and the explanatory notes in The Southern Version of the Cursor Mundi, ed., Sarah Horrall (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1978).
    ${ }^{67}$ John Stevens, "Carol" (1-2), in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York, Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 5: 164.

[^124]:    ${ }^{68}$ Ibid.
    ${ }^{69}$ Macklin, "Plague," 4.

[^125]:    ${ }^{70}$ As a side note, Macklin ("Plague," 3), mentions the court records of Henry VIII, which indicate that when fear of the plague prompted him to dismiss his entire court and remain in quarantine at Windsor, the only people who remained with him were his physician, his three favorite gentlemen, and the Italian organ virtuoso Dionisio Memo. In other words, the only people the King could not do without were his three most trusted courtiers, his doctor, and his musician. See also Letters and Papers, Foreign and Domestic, of the Reign of Henry VIII, ed. J.S. Brewer (London, 1864), 2: 1149 and 1188.
    ${ }^{71}$ Dumitrescu, "An English Adoption of the Burgundian Chanson," 161. Dumitrescu has provided an important study of these types of relationships, and he feels that the songs in both the Mellon Chansonnier and the Ritson Manuscript adopt various Burgundian characteristics (p.177).
    ${ }^{72}$ Dumitrescu, The Early Tudor Court, 162. Specifically, Dumitrescu relays that Kemp (elaborating on a suggestion made by Stevens), hypothesizes that the piece represents a style of a saltarello, as it might have been played by musically illiterate minstrels. See Walter Kemp, "Votre trey Dowce a Duo for Dancing," in Music \& Letters, 60 (1979), 37-44; and also Reinhard Strohm, The Rise of European Music 1380-1500 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 352.
    ${ }^{73}$ Dumitrescu, The Early Tudor Court, 162.

[^126]:    ${ }^{1}$ Within this modern transcription, the squares have been maintained in their respective voice parts to show the migrations. However, most modern performers would request a separate edition that maintains the square in the bass part. Such an edition is not provided within Appendix II, but it was used for various performances that I organized over the summer of 2011.

[^127]:    ${ }^{2}$ Hamm, Census-Catalogue, 2: 48-49; and also Roger Bray, "British Museum Add. MSS. 17802-5 (The Gyffard Part-Books): An Index and Commentary," Royal Music Association Research Chronicle, 7 (1969): 46-47.

[^128]:    ${ }^{3}$ Various scholars have pointed out that the Western Wynde tune has been used in a variety of settings other than just the three Masses of the same name - possibly including Henry VIII's Pastime with Good Company. See Nigel Davison, "The 'Western Wind' Masses," Musical Quarterly, 57 (1971), 429; and Dumitrescu, The Early Tudor Court, 165, concerning the borrowing of melodies by Henry VIII and William Cornysh.
    ${ }^{4}$ For a complete list of the contents of the Gyffard Partbooks, see Bray, "British Museum Add. MSS. 17802-5," 34-40.

[^129]:    ${ }^{5}$ Hugh Baillie, "Squares," Acta Musicologica, 32 (1960), 183.
    ${ }^{6}$ The numbers provided in this list correspond to the numbers used in Appendix I.

[^130]:    ${ }^{7}$ See for example, John Sheppard's Regis Tharsis and Verbum Caro; Christopher Tye's Missa Euge Bone; Thomas Tallis' Loquebantur, Ave Dei Patris Filia, Missa Puer natus est; Robert White's Magnificat, Portio mea, Lamentations, and Christi qui lux es et I-IV. The previous generation of composers such as William Cornysh and John Taverner do not use as many such dissonances; on the other hand, the use of various clashes within these pieces is still not as frequent as in the cases of the three Masses Upon the Square.

[^131]:    ${ }^{8}$ Bray, "British Museum Add. MSS. 17802-5," 48. He adds that the partbooks also contain examples of gymel where one singer needs to turn the page but not the other.

[^132]:    ${ }^{9}$ In the Fleete made by me William Cornishe, otherwise called Nysewete, chapelman with the most famose and noble king Henry the VII. his reyne the xix yere the moneth of July. A treatise betwene Trouth and

[^133]:    Informacion, vv. 11, 13, 15, 16. This is also discussed in Bray, "The Interpretation," 31. Also see Sir John Hawkins, A General History of the Science and Practice of Music (London: J.A. Novello, 1853), 1: 354.
    ${ }^{10}$ Bray, "The Interpretation," 31.
    ${ }^{11}$ William Bathe, A Briefe Introduction to the True Arte of Musick (1584). Excerpt from chapter IV (unpaginated). This is discussed in Roger Bray, "The Interpretation of Musica Ficta in English Music c.1490-c.1580, Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association, 97 (1970/1971), 30.
    ${ }^{12}$ Bray, "The Interpretation," 30.

[^134]:    ${ }^{13}$ Thomas Morley, A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke (1597), ed. R. Alec Harman (New York: W.W. Norton, 1952), 167.
    ${ }^{14}$ Bray, "The Interpretation," 34.
    ${ }^{15}$ Bray, "The Interpretation," 34.

[^135]:    ${ }^{16}$ David Chadd and Roger Bowers, "Whytbroke, William," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 27: 352. See also W.H. Grattan Flood, "New Light on Early Tudor Composers XVI: William Whytbroke," Musical Times and Singing Class Circular, 62 (1921): 246-247.
    ${ }^{17}$ David Mateer, "The Gyffard Partbooks: Composers, Owners, Date and Provenance," Royal Music Association Research Chronicle, 28 (1995): 21.
    ${ }^{18}$ Chadd and Bowers, "Whytbroke," 352.
    ${ }^{19}$ Mateer, "The Gyffard Partbooks," 38.

[^136]:    ${ }^{20}$ David Mateer, "Mundy, William," in The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians (New York: Grove's Dictionaries, 2001), 17: 390.

[^137]:    * LonBLR A45-48 - Nicholas Ludford, three-voice Missa Sabato

[^138]:    * LonLP 438, f.180v - "fabordon" feria iv

[^139]:    ${ }^{1}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22.
    ${ }^{2}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22; Burgess and Wathey, "Mapping the Soundscape," 44.
    ${ }^{3}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 23.
    ${ }^{4}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22; Also Baillie, "Squares,"180
    ${ }^{5}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 23.
    ${ }^{6}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practies," 23.
    ${ }^{7}$ James Raine, ed., Historiae dunelmensis scriptores tres (London: J.B. Nichols and Son, 1839), cccxcviii
    ${ }^{8}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22; Baillie, "Squares," 180; Flynn, "The Education of Choristers," 182.
    ${ }^{9}$ Rob Wegman, The Crisis of Music in Early Modern Europe, 1470-1530 (New York: Routledge, 2005), 144; Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 23.

[^140]:    ${ }^{10}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22; Baillie, "Squares," 180.
    ${ }^{11}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22.
    ${ }^{12}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22; Harrison, Music in Medieval Britain, 181 and 292.
    ${ }^{13}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22.
    ${ }^{14}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22; Baillie, "Squares," 180.
    ${ }^{15}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 22. See also Westminster Abbey Muniment 6643, m.2.
    ${ }^{16}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices." 22.
    ${ }^{17}$ Wilson, "Alterntim Practices," 22; Baillie, "Squares," 180.
    ${ }^{18}$ Wilson, "Alternatim Practices," 23.
    ${ }^{19}$ Wegman, The Crisis of Music, 155 and 159.

