ENRICHING THE FRENCH ROMANCE:
PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA’S EARLY COSMOPOLITAN SONGS (1838-1850)

By
ANGÉLICA MINERO ESCOBAR

A Dissertation submitted to the
Graduate School-New Brunswick
Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
Graduate Program in Music
written under the direction of
Prof. Rufus Hallmark
and approved by

____________________

____________________

____________________

____________________

New Brunswick, New Jersey

October, 2012
ABSTRACT OF THE DISSERTATION

Enriching the French Romance:
Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s Early Cosmopolitan Songs (1838-1850)

By ANGÉLICA MINERO ESCOBAR

Dissertation Director:
Prof. Rufus Hallmark

The development of the sentimental romance of the 1830s and 1840s into the more sophisticated genre of song known as mélodie is often linked to Gabriel Fauré and Henri Duparc’s early songs. In his seminal study, La Mélodie française de Berlioz à Duparc, Frits Noske did much to correct this limited model by discussing the works of composers such as Charles Gounod, Hector Berlioz, Hyppolyte Monpou, and Louis Niedermeyer. The author, however, failed to consider the early songs of the influential French mezzo-soprano of Spanish origins, Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1821-1910). These compositions, close to thirty songs in French, German, Italian and Spanish, reflect the scope of her international operatic career and her facility to absorb different languages, musical styles, and cultures. Investigating the genesis of the early songs and analyzing and contextualizing them are key goals of the present dissertation.

I intend to demonstrate through the examination of primary source material that the construction by influential contemporaries such as George Sand, Théophile Gautier, Alfred de Musset, and Franz Liszt of Viardot-Garcia’s personality as cosmopolitan, versatile, and exotic qualified her in the eyes of the Romantic generation
as a valid representative of the Other and thus a legitimate creator of a wide variety of musical styles. In particular, the consecration of young Viardot-Garcia’s fascinating musical personality in George Sand’s influential novel *Consuelo* (1842) determined the course and objectives of her career both as singer and composer during the 1840s.

Through the publication of her two initial song albums, Viardot-Garcia contributed to the modification of expectations surrounding the typical French *romance* of the 1840s. Viardot-Garcia modernized its style by introducing into it foreign musical resources, thus liberating it from the formal regularity and musical weakness, which limited its expressive possibilities. The high quality of these publications in combination with the composer’s international fame pushed them into the vanguard of the revitalization tendency of French art song. Just as Berlioz and Gounod have been commonly embraced from the time of Ravel to our day as the fathers of French *mélodie*, Viardot-Garcia may now receive her own accolade as the mother of French *mélodie*. 
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The seeds of the present dissertation were planted almost a decade ago, during my academic studies at the Esther Boyer College of Music, Temple University (Philadelphia, PA). My mentor there, Prof. Stephen Willier, introduced me to the meteoric careers of María Malibran and Manuel García fils and nurtured my passion for French art, culture, and music. His course on historic operatic recordings remains a highlight of my education as singer and musicologist. In 2006, I performed for the first time two songs by Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “Haï luli” and “Les Filles de Cadix,” both edited by Patricia Adkins Chiti and republished in Songs and Duets of Garcia, Malibran and Viardot: Rediscovered Songs by Legendary Singers (Van Nuys: Alfred Music, 1997). I still remember how impressed I was by their beauty and how my curiosity was stirred by their compositional quality.

A three-year fellowship generously granted by the Mason Gross School of the Arts of Rutgers University (New Brunswick, NJ) allowed me to pursue my interest in French art song. My education as musicologist continued there under the guidance of Prof. Douglas Johnson, Prof. Andrew Kirkman, Prof. Floyd Grave, and Prof. Richard Chrisman. Their courses and seminars, full of insight and probing questions, challenged and enriched me. I remain obliged towards them for setting such high academic standards.

I am also deeply grateful to my dissertation director, Prof. Rufus Hallmark. With patience, intelligence and friendship, Prof. Hallmark guided me through the many challenges I encountered during the research and writing processes of the present project. His unerring belief in my work sustained and encouraged me during many difficult hours
of uncertainty. His experienced comments and editing drove me to redouble my efforts and tackle the limitations of my arguments. Prof. Hallmark also brought my dissertation to the attention of Prof. Susan Youens, whose enthusiasm for the project has given me reason to feel proud.

I am obliged to the librarians of the Houghton Library, Harvard University (Cambridge, MA), particularly to Ms. Mary Haegert and Ms. Carmelia Napoleone, who kindly assisted me as I inspected and reproduced valuable manuscripts of the Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (Ms Mus 232), to the librarians at the Département de la Musique of the Bibliothèque nationale de France, particularly Madame Catherine Massip, who supported me in a myriad of ways as I inspected and reproduced, during a few days in the spring of 2008, the bulk of Viardot-García’s published songs, and to Mr. Göran Grahn, curator of the Nydahl Collection (Stockholm, Sweden), for allowing me to sit for hours at a time at the collection’s library, inspecting unpublished letters by Felix Mendelssohn, Richard Pohl, and Pauline Viardot-Garcia.

I should also make special note of all the encouragement that I received from Prof. Alexandre Zviguilsy, president of the Association des Amis d’Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot et Maria Malibran and director of the Musée Européen Ivan Tourguéniev in Bourgival. For almost forty years, his knowledge, labor, and passion have made possible the work of scholars like me. I am also honored by his trust and true friendship. I count our walks in Bourgival and in Paris’ 15ème arrondissement among my happiest memories.

I wrote this dissertation on the constant move, living first in Philadelphia, then Berlin and Mexico City, and finally Stockholm. With so many pressing changes, I often
felt a strong need to retreat into quiet labor. For a total of three months, the artist-in-residence program at the Anderson Center for Interdisciplinary Studies (Red Wing, MN) offered me a beautiful refuge where I could advance the project. The director of the center, poet Robert Hedin, has all my appreciation and admiration.

I also thank my dear husband, concert pianist and early keyboard performer Michael Tsalka, who supported and encouraged me throughout the project. Hearing him sight-read reproductions of manuscript scores by Viardot-Garcia and perform Chopin’s 24 Preludes on Ivan Turgenev’s square piano at Bourgival was pure magic.

A final note of gratitude must go to my father, Javier Minero Ruesga, who knew all along what I was capable of achieving, to my mother, Esther Escobar Blanco, who taught me how to love art and music, and to my grandfather, Don Amalio Escobar Rojero, who taught all of us mathematics, literature, ethics, and the meaning of the word “courage.”
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Person and Career of Pauline Viardot-Garcia:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Background Summary</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reception and State of Scholarship on Viardot-Garcia’s Songs:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changing Views on her Compositional Achievements</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology and Approach</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. ANTECEDENTS: ROMANTIC FRENCH ART SONG AND THE GARCÍA FAMILY</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romance into Early Mélodie</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The García Dynasty: A Displaced Clan of Singers, Composers, and Pedagoues</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A COSMOPOLITAN MUSICAL TRAINING: STYLISTIC INFLUENCES ON PAULINE GARCIA’S EARLIEST KNOWN COMPOSITIONS</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. BECOMING CONSUELO OR THE TALENTED OTHER: GEORGE SAND, FRÉDÉRIC CHOPIN AND THE ARTISTIC AND CREATIVE MATURITY OF PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. AN AMBITIOUS ENTERPRISE: L’ALBUM DE MME. VIARDOT-GARCIA (1843)</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. CAN A COMPOSER HAVE AN INTERNATIONAL OPERATIC CAREER? : NEW FRIENDSHIPS, CHALLENGES AND SACRIFICES</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. STRUGGLING TO KEEP THE BALANCE: SIMPLICITY MEETS SOPHISTICATION IN L’ALBUM VIARDOT DE 1850

ENVOI

BIBLIOGRAPHY

APPENDICES

A. PUBLISHED SONGS AND SONG COLLECTIONS BY PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA (1838-1910)

B. PUBLISHED VOCAL ARRANGEMENTS AND TRANSCRIPTIONS BY PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA (1844-1910)

C. CATALOGUE RAISONNÉ: PUBLISHED SONG COLLECTIONS, SONGS AND ARRANGEMENTS BY PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA (1838-1850)

D. LOST SONGS AND ARRANGEMENTS BY PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA (1838-1850)

E. SCORES

1) “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.]
2) “La Chapelle” / Ballade, PVG.s.I.2
3) “Tu d’amarmi,” after Ms.Mus.232, item 60 [1.]
4) “Il ne vient pas,” after Ms.Mus.232, item 60 [7.]
5) “Le Retour de printemps,” after Ms.Mus.232, item 60 [1.]
6) “L’Enfant de la montagne” / Ballade, PVG.s.I.1
7) “L’Abricotier” / Chanson servienne, PVG.s.I.3
8) “L’Ombre et le jour” / Mélodie, PVG.s.I.7
9) “L’Absence” / Caña española, after PVG.s.II.3
10) “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6
11) “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10

F. MANUSCRIPTS OF SONGS BY PAULINE VIARDOT-GARCIA: CIRCA 1838-1850

viii
LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

Example

1.1. P. Viardot-Garcia, *Presto* in *An Hour of Study*, vol. 2., mm. 1-8  
27
1.2. L’autre jour en me promenant,” trans. P. Viardot-Garcia, mm. 1-17  
40
2.1. Frédéric Bérat, “Ma Normandie,” mm. 1-12  
68
2.2. Loïsa Puget, “La Voix tendre,” mm. 1-33  
72
2.3. Hippolyte Monpou, “L’Andalouse,” mm. 1-13  
77
2.4. Louis Niedermeyer, “Le Lac,” mm. 1-14  
78
2.5. Hector Berlioz, “La Captive,” mm. 1-18  
80
2.6. Manuel García, Opening Duet, “Soy la maja más remaja”/“En viendo a mi Gregoria,” *La Maja y el Majo*, mm. 85-88  
84
2.7. Manuel García, Overture, *El poeta calculista*, mm. 61-71  
87
2.8. Manuel García, “Yo que soy contrabandista,” *El poeta calculista*, mm. 102-124  
89
2.9. Manuel García, Overture, *La Mort du Tasse*, mm. 1-7  
97
2.10. Manuel García, Act I, Scene II, *La Mort du Tasse*, mm. 148-152  
98
2.11. M. Malibran, “Addio a Nice,” *Dernières pensees musicales*, mm. 1-29  
111
2.12. M. Malibran, “Rataplan”/*Chansonette, Album lyrique*, mm. 1-35  
115
3.1. Manuel García, “Es correor”/ “Le courier,” arr. P. Viardot-Garcia, mm. 6-18  
136
3.2. Manuel García, “Es correor”/ “Le courier,” mm. 51-58  
137
3.3. P. Garcia, “Seligter Tod,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 1-8  
159
3.4. P. Garcia, “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 1-8  
167
3.5. P. Garcia, “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 22-32  
168
3.6. P. Garcia, “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 48-57  
169
3.7. P. Garcia, “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 59-64  
170
3.8. P. Garcia, “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 65-70  
170
3.9. P. Garcia, “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], mm. 90-100  
171
178
3.11. P. Garcia, “Il ne vient pas,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.], mm. 1-24  
182
3.12. P. Garcia, “Il ne vient pas,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.], mm. 52-70  
184
3.13. P. Garcia, “Il ne vient pas,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.], mm. 74-82  
186
197
200
3.16. P. Garcia, “Le Retour de printemps,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [2.], mm. 7-8  
201
202
3.18. P. Garcia, “Le Retour de printemps,” alternate ending, after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [3.], mm. 15-26  
205
4.1. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Exilé polonais,” PVG.s.I.5, mm. 48-63  
218
4.2. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant,” after Ms Mus 232, item 54, mm. 64-82  
225
4.3. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant et la mère,” PVG.s.I.6, mm. 1-24  
227

ix
4.4. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Le Chêne et le roseau,” PVG.s.I.8, mm. 98-106  233
5.1. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 18-27  277
5.2. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 103-112  280
5.3. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 75-86  281
5.4. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 10-17  282
5.5. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 58-69  283
5.6. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 3-9  284
5.7. F. Schubert, “Abschied,” D. 475, mm. 8-12  285
5.9. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 50-57  286
5.10. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 123-140  287
5.11. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Abricotier,” PVG.s.I.3, mm. 1-9  293
5.15. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Abricotier,” PVG.s.I.3, mm. 86-93  296
5.16. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Abricotier,” PVG.s.I.3, mm. 120-134  296
5.17. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7, mm. 1-3  303
5.18. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7, mm. 3-8  304
5.19. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7, mm. 20-26  304
5.20. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7, mm. 25-38  305
6.1. P. Viardot-Garcia, Transcription of draft for “Marie et Julie,” Ms Mus 232, item 60 [15.], mm. 1-21  323
6.2. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Marie et Julie,” PVG.s.II.8, mm. 1-30  325
6.3. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Un Jour de printemps,” PVG.s.II.4, mm. 1-16  328
6.4. F. Chopin, Mazurka in G major, Op. 67, No. 1, mm. 1-15  329
6.5. Auguste Levassor(?), “Le Corbeau et le renard,” mm. 1-25  339
6.6. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Le Savetier et le financier,” PVG.s.XVI.6, mm. 21-30  342
6.7. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Le Savetier et le financier,” PVG.s.XVI.6, mm. 43-53  343
6.8. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Le Savetier et le financier,” PVG.s.XVI.6, mm. 128-139  344
6.9. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Le Savetier et le financier,” PVG.s.XVI.6, mm. 140-152  345
6.10. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Le Savetier et le financier,” PVG.s.XVI.6, mm. 149-156  346
6.11. P. Viardot-Garcia, “La Petite chevrière,” PVG.s.II.2, mm. 1-13  358
6.12. P. Viardot-Garcia, “La Petite chevrière,” PVG.s.II.2, mm. 39-54  359
6.13. P. Viardot-Garcia, “La Petite chevrière,” PVG.s.II.2, mm. 27-38  360
6.14. P. Viardot-Garcia, La Jeune République, mm. 44-59  363
7.1. P. Viardot-Garcia, “La Chanson de Loïc,” PVG.s.II.7, mm. 128-149  388
7.2. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Villanelle,” PVG.s.II.5, mm. 1-36  391
7.3. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Marie et Julie,” PVG.s.II.8, mm. 24-44

7.4. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Absemce”/Caña española, after PVG.s.II.3, mm. 1-8

7.5. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Absemce”/Caña española, after PVG.s.II.3, mm. 12-19

7.6. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Absemce”/Caña española, after PVG.s.II.3, mm. 22-30

7.7. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Absemce”/Caña española, after PVG.s.II.3, mm. 31-39

7.8. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Absemce”/Caña española, after PVG.s.II.3, mm. 43-49

7.9. P. Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 1-15

7.10. P. Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 81-92

7.11. P. Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 54-62

7.12. P. Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 34-46

7.13. P. Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 15-23


7.15. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, mm. 1-20

7.16. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, mm. 63-74

7.17. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, mm. 74-82

7.18. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, mm. 92-106

7.19. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, mm. 118-129

7.20. P. Viardot-Garcia, “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, mm. 209-229
LIST OF TABLES

Table

1.1. Most Significant Operatic Roles sung by P. Viardot-Garcia 11
1.2. Operatic and Chamber Works Premiered in Salons by P. Viardot-Garcia 14
3.1. Chronological Reordering of P. Viardot-Garcia’s Earliest Known Songs, Spring 1838-Summer 1839 153
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure

1.2. Claudie Viardot (?), Sketch of the Viardots’ Theatre and Villa in Baden-Baden, c. 1868  24
1.3. P. Viardot-Garcia, Cover for *École classique de chant* (Paris: Hamelle, c. 1890)  30
2.1. “García, role d’Otello,” litograph, c. 1821  99
2.2. François Bouchot, *Portrait de la Malibran en Desdémona*, oil painting, 1834  110
2.3. *Garcia viewing his own larynx*, ink drawing, c. 1860  119
3.1. “La Gallina,” *Air mexicaine*, Ms Mus 232, item 55  129
3.2. Sebastián Iradier, “Juanita,” Ms Mus 232, item 56  139
3.3. Felix Mendelssohn to Josef Keil, Berlin, June 21, 1838, item2571a  149
3.5. Pauline Garcia, “Il ne vient pas,” Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.]  181
3.6. Pauline Garcia, “Tu d’amarmi,” Ms Mus 232, item 60 [1.]  196
4.1. Alfred de Musset, “Superb speech of Indiana” and “The nose of Mr. V. becomes a fountain,” ca. 1840  213
4.2. Ary Scheffer, *Pauline Viardot*, oil on canvas, 1840  216
4.3. Ary Scheffer, H. Soltaum and Rosenthal, title page for “L’Exilé polonais,” lithograph, c. 1843  220
4.4. P. Viardot-Garcia, two fragments from “L’Enfant,” Ms Mus 232, item 54  224
4.5. Maurice Sand, “That is the playing of Liszt! It is not fitting for vocal accompaniment,” ink drawing  229
4.6. Title Page for *Six Mazourkes de F. Chopin pour chant et piano arrangées par Mme. Pauline Viardot* (Second Series), n.d.  261
5.1. P. Viardot-Garcia, “L’Ombre et le jour,” 1842, Ms. 5879  268
5.3. A. Scheffer et al., “L’Abricotier,” title page, lithograph, ca. 1842  271
5.4. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1  276
5.5. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Abricotier,” PVG.s.I.3  292
5.6. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7  301
5.7. Contrasting Poetic Images and Tonalities in Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7

6.1. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, study of Courtavenel, ink drawing


6.3. Maurice Sand, study of Pauline in a pink dress, oil painting, summer 1845

7.1. Victor Coindre, drawing, Thierry frères, printmakers, title page for “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, litograph, c. 1849

7.2. F. Teichet, drawing, Thierry frères, printmakers, title page for “Marie et Julie,” PVG.s.II.8, litograph, c. 1849

7.3. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Absence,”/Caña Española, PVG.s.II.3

7.4. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6


7.6. Pauline Garcia. Mouvement de Tarentelle, AMs, Album de Juliette Zimmerman, Section 2, f. 3r

7.7. Pauline Garcia, Transcription of autograph for Mouvement de Tarentelle

7.8. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

The development of the bourgeois sentimental romance of the 1830s and 1840s into the more sophisticated genre of song known as mélodie is often linked to Gabriel Fauré and Henri Duparc’s early songs from the late 1860s and 1870s. In his seminal study from the 1950s, *La Mélodie française de Berlioz à Duparc*, Frits Noske did much to correct this limited vision, by bringing to the attention of his reader the vocal works from the late 1830s, 1840s and 1850s of composers such as Charles Gounod (1818-1893), Hector Berlioz (1803-1869), Félicien David (1810-1876), Hyppolyte Monpou (1804-1841), and Louis Niedermeyer (1802-1861), among others. The author, however, failed to take into serious consideration the early songs of Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1821-1910), the great French mezzo-soprano of Spanish origins. Viardot-Garcia’s known compositions from this period—close to thirty songs, of which at least nineteen were published in France—would have done much to disrupt Noske’s somewhat linear narrative: These works in French, German, Italian and Spanish, reflect the international scope of her career as an operatic singer and her facility to absorb the languages, musical styles, and cultures surrounding her. Investigating the genesis of these works, analyzing them, and providing stylistic contexts will be the main purposes of this Ph.D. dissertation.

---

Mostly premiered in artistic salons and concert halls of France, Germany, England, and Russia, the early songs were not only popular as a result of Viardot-Garcia’s reputation as a virtuoso, but, as we shall see, also genuinely respected and admired by musicians such as Frédéric Chopin (1810-1849), Franz Liszt (1811-1886), Clara Wieck Schumann (1819-1896), Robert Schumann (1810-1856), Felix Mendelssohn (1809-1847), Hector Berlioz, and Charles Gounod. Camille Saint-Saëns (1835-1921), for instance, made the following observations on her compositional style:

She was a friend of Chopin and Liszt and her tastes were strongly futuristic. . . But it must not be thought from this that her compositions were mere imitations. On the contrary they were extremely original. The only explanation why those that were published have remained unknown and why so many were unpublished is that this admirable artist had a horror of publicity.2

Throughout her long and fruitful life, Viardot-Garcia composed close to 150 original songs and 200 vocal arrangements and transcriptions.3 The wide stylistic variety of her works in these genres—ranging from folk-style songs to emulations of operatic airs to sophisticated examples of German Lieder, Russian songs, and French romances and mélodies—might be a cause for initial bafflement in the modern listener: During the second half of the nineteenth century, for example, she not only produced sensitive and


3 She published individual songs and sixteen song collections for almost seventy years, from 1838 to 1906. Her œuvre also includes five operettas, vocal transcriptions of instrumental works by Franz Joseph Haydn, Franz Schubert, Frédéric Chopin, Johannes Brahms, and Anton Rubinstein, arrangements of popular music, cadenzas, voice and piano arrangements of famous arias, and a few instrumental works including *Six morceaux pour piano et violon* (Paris: E. Gérard, 1867) and *Introduction et polonaise pour piano à quatre mains* (Paris: E. Gérard, 1874). For a full list of her works see Waddington and Žekulin, *The Musical Works of Pauline Viardot-Garcia* (1821-1910).
intelligent settings of Alexander Pushkin (1799-1837), Ivan Turgenev (1818-1883), Mikhail Lermontov (1914-1841), Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832), Eduard Mörike (1804-1875), Alfred de Musset (1810-1857), René François Armand (a.k.a. Sully) Prudhomme (1839-1907), and Théophile Gautier (1811-1872), but also arrangements of Tuscan and Spanish folk songs. She also favored, on more than one occasion, the somewhat sentimental creations of minor French poets such as Louis Pomey (1831-1891) or Édouard Turquety (1807-1867). It also seems that she had no artistic qualms about having the same song translated into different languages for publication in different countries. After 1865, she would often arrange and transpose the same work for a variety of performing forces, thus transforming a solo song into a duet and vice versa (e.g. “Havanaise,” “Les Cavaliers”), adding string parts to it (e.g. “Die Sterne,” “La Nuit”) or making it into an instrumental composition (e.g. “Serenade”). Appendix A presents the titles of original song collections and individually published songs by Viardot-Garcia. Adding up the items included in appendix A, brings to a total of 118 the original songs that were published during the composer’s lifetime. This number, of course, does not take into account Viardot-Garcia’s numerous unedited manuscripts, many of which contain finished works which did not find their way into publication. Until all her manuscripts become available for study (many remain in private collections, mainly in Paris), it will be impossible to determine the total number of original songs composed by Viardot-Garcia. Appendix B lists the numerous published collections of vocal arrangements and transcriptions produced by the composer. Her total of 174 published works in these categories actually surpasses the number of her published
original songs; once again, however, until all her manuscripts have been inspected, it will be difficult to assess the exact number of vocal works produced during her lifetime.

Viardot-Garcia’s lifelong Romantic interest in evocative, remote, and folkloric poetry is well reflected in some of her songs’ employment of regional dances (e.g. Polish mazurka, Andalusian caña and Cuban habanera), modal scales, melismatic melodic lines, and ostinato rhythmic patterns. To this, one should add her interest in poetry and musical forms from the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries (e.g. *Six chansons du XVe siècle* and *Airs italiens du XVIIIe siècle*). Throughout her career, she recognized her public’s hunger for the distant and foreign—in short, the exotic. This explains, at least in part, the success in France and Germany of her song collections based on Russian poetry and Tuscan and Spanish folk tunes. Viardot-Garcia’s own foreign and, as we shall see, versatile personality—she was the last daughter of Manuel del Pópulo Vicente Rodríguez (1770-1832), better known as Manuel García, a brilliant tenor and composer originally from the Spanish province of Andalusia and the sister of María Malibran (1807-1836), the iconic diva of the Romantic period—qualified her in the eyes of the public as a valid representative of the Other and thus a capable and legitimate creator and presenter of exotic musical products. At the same time, her integration into the musical and artistic life of Paris—through her marriage to the art critic and historian Louis Viardot and her close friendship to writers such as George Sand (1804-1876) and Alfred de Musset, painters such as Ary Scheffer (1795-1858) and Eugène Delacroix (1798-1863), and operatic composers such as Gioachino Rossini (1792-1868) and Giacomo Meyerbeer (1791-1864)—allowed her to create romances and early examples of mélodies which were accepted by the public as genuinely French products. These seemingly contradictory
aspects of her artistic and creative personality are worthy of detailed investigation and will be addressed in the course of this dissertation.

Two of the elements which characterize Viardot-Garcia’s early songs, cosmopolitanism and stylistic flexibility, are important to our understanding of her contribution to the expansion and transformation of the aesthetics governing French art song from 1838 to 1850. The thirteen years represented by this period were not picked casually. They represent Viardot-Garcia’s first compositional period—a period which yielded about thirty vocal compositions and, interestingly, was followed by thirteen years of creative silence—and, as we shall see in chapter 2, a critical moment in the stylistic transformation of the *romance* into the more flexible and experimental *mélodie*, mainly through the popularization of the Lieder of Franz Schubert (1797-1828) in France and through the original contributions to the repertoire of French art song by composers such as Berlioz, Monpou and Niedermeyer. It will be the contention of this dissertation that the originality and quality of Viardot-Garcia’s early songs helped to elevate the artistic and musical level of the nascent *mélodie*, offering her contemporaries models which illustrated avenues for the genre’s future development.

---

4 Such preoccupation, however, reveals our own limitations and biases as modern readers with historical perspective, and does little to contextualize the composer within the rich and varied cultural and social reality of her era. It must be remembered that Paris—which would remain Viardot-Garcia’s emotional and physical base for most of her life—was throughout much of the nineteenth century, the cultural capital of Europe, a cosmopolitan microcosm during the July Monarchy (a period which coincided with the apex of the Romantic period) where German (e.g., Meyerbeer, Wagner, and Hiller), Swiss (e.g., Niedermeyer), Hungarian (e.g., Liszt), Polish (e.g., Chopin), Italian (e.g., Cherubini, Rossini, Bellini, and Donizetti), and Spanish (e.g., Manuel García, Juan Tolosa, and José María de Ciebra) musicians mingled and interacted. That such diverse group could thrive in one city reflects the eclectic tastes of Parisian audiences and the variety of venues where musicians could present themselves at the time. For more on the cultural life of Paris during the Romantic Era and beyond see Danièle Pistone, *La Musique en France de la Révolution à 1900* (Paris: Champion Slatkine, 1979) and Ralph P. Locke, ed., *Journal of Musicological Research* 13, no. 1-2, special numbers: “Music in Nineteenth-Century France” (1993).
The rest of this introductory chapter will serve to present information essential to the contextualization of my arguments. An overview of the person and career of Viardot-Garcia will be presented, followed by an account of the state of scholarship relating to her compositional oeuvre. Finally, a subsection will be dedicated to the methodology and approach employed throughout the dissertation to support the different aspects of my thesis.

The Person and Career of Pauline Viardot-Garcia: A Background Summary

Born in Paris on July 18, 1821, Michelle Ferdinande Pauline Garcia was destined to become not only an extraordinary operatic singer but also a respected vocal pedagogue and composer of European art song and operetta. From an early age, the youngest daughter of Manuel García and Joaquina Sitchès (1780-1864) showed extraordinary musical abilities, which filled her elders with wonderment. As we shall see in chapter 3, her father fostered and guided her talents; by the time of his death in 1832, he had already sent her to study with excellent musicians from different countries, including the organist of the Cathedral of Mexico City, Marcos Vega, young Liszt, and the famed teacher of composition at the Paris Conservatoire, Anton Reicha (1770-1836). Manuel García’s first biographer, Paulin Richard, made the following accurate predictions of Pauline’s future during the funeral of the Spanish tenor and composer:
García leaves an incomplete task: the education of a young child whose rare and precocious intelligence it pleased him to develop, of whom he liked to predict the most brilliant future, and whom he believed already the worthy rival of his illustrious daughter, the foremost singer of our time. The widow of Garcia, distinguished artist as well as good mother (for musical ability seems to be shared by all members of this family of virtuosos) will know how to carry out the last wish of the celebrated artist for whom we weep. She and her son will continue this sweet and glorious task.

Six years after her father’s death and less than two years after the death of her famed older sister, under the guidance of her mother and her brother-in-law, violinist Charles de Bériot (1802-1870), Pauline was introduced as the “reincarnation” of la Malibran to some of the most significant artistic circles of Germany, Belgium, and France. She debuted in London’s King’s Theatre and Paris’ Théâtre Italien in 1839, singing the Rossinian roles which had made her sister famous: Rosina, Desdemona, Cenerentola, and Tancredi. Numerous critics were quick to note the parallels between the voices of the two sisters. Like la Malibran’s voice, Pauline’s sizable instrument was characterized by a certain dark timbre, an extended vocal range, impressive agility and


6 María Malibran (1808-1836), who died at age twenty-eight of injuries sustained in a fall from a horse.
great expressiveness. The critic Ernest Legouvé expressed his astonishment upon first hearing the teenage singer:

\[Au \textit{bout de dix mesures, c’est sa soeur vivante de nouveau qu’on applaudit! Même voix, même méthode de chant, même style, une ressemblance de talent qui vous confond, et rien qui sente l’imitation!}\]  

After only ten measures, it was her sister, alive again, that one applauded! The same voice, the same singing method, the same style, a resemblance of talent which confuses you, but in which one perceives no imitation.

But young Pauline was more than a recreation of her dead sister and was keen to prove it. An excellent pianist, she had been more or less forced to quit her dreams of becoming a professional player when she was fifteen. Whenever she had the chance of proving her pianistic skills before an audience, however, she had no difficulties rising to the challenge, as Saint-Saëns recalled:

I have spoken of her great talent as a pianist. We saw this one evening at a concert given by Madame Schumann. After Madame Viardot had sung some of Schumann’s \textit{Lieder} with the great pianist playing the accompaniments, the two great artists played the illustrious author’s duet for two pianos, which fairly bristles with difficulties, with equal virtuosity.

She was also an intellectual, full of charm and humor, and capable of conversing and corresponding in five languages (i.e. Spanish, French, German, English, and Russian) with writers, musicians, philosophers, and politicians. She was well-versed in Classical

\[\text{7 Ernest Legouvé, “Concerts de M de Bériot et de Mlle Garcia,” \textit{Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris} 51, (December 23, 1838), 417.}\]

poetry and admired Homer, Aeschylus, Virgil and Phidias. Like other educated Romantics, she venerated William Shakespeare (1564?-1616), Durante Degli (Dante) Alighieri (c. 1265-1321), Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra (1547-1616), Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832), Friedrich von Schiller (1759-1805), George Gordon Byron (1788-1824) and Heinrich Heine (1797-1856) and was also versed in the history of French literature, setting on several occasions the poetry of Pierre de Ronsard (1524-1585) and Jean de La Fontaine (1621-1695). Additionally, she was an accomplished graphic artist; her ink, charcoal, and graphite portraits and landscapes are both precise and sensitive. A self-portrait was completed in the late 1830s by the teenage singer. It is reproduced as figure 1.1 below:

Figure 1.1. Pauline Garcia, *Self-portrait*, detail, graphite on paper, c. 1836, courtesy of Bibliothèque-Musée de l'Opéra, Paris.
In her late teens, she met de Musset and Sand, both of whom were equally impressed by the wide scope of her literary culture and vocal and histrionic gifts. De Musset wrote several poems for her (i.e. “Sur les débuts de Mesdemoiselles Rachel et Pauline Garcia,” “A Mademoiselle X,” and “Adieu”), while Sand projected onto her all the virtues of the perfect artist. The result was the heroine of her massive and politically progressive novel in two parts, Consuelo and La Comtesse de Rudolstadt. Sand, in addition, orchestrated in 1840 the marriage of Pauline to the liberal art historian and collector Louis Viardot (1800-1883), then director of the Théâtre Italien. Although Pauline admired Viardot’s intellect, integrity, supportiveness, and seriousness, by her own admission, she could not love a husband who was twenty years her senior. Despite this, the unsuited couple, more close friends than lovers, never separated and had four children together: Louise (1841-1918), Claudie (1852-1914), Marianne (1854-1918), and Paul (1857-1941).

During the six decades (i.e. 1840-1900) which spanned her long career as singer, composer, and voice pedagogue, she would befriend a significant segment of the European artistic intelligentsia, including writers already mentioned (i.e. de Musset, Heine, Turgenev) and others, such as Afanasy Fet (1820-1892), Charles Dickens (1812-1870), Gustave Flaubert (1821-1880), Émile Zola (1840-1904), Alphonse Daudet (1840-1897), Henry James (1843-1916) and Prosper Mérimée (1803-1870), painters Ary Scheffer (1795-1858) and Eugène Delacroix (1798-1863), and, apart from the musicians already mentioned, Mikhail Glinka (1804-1857), Charles Gounod (1818-1893), Julius Rietz (1812-1877), Johannes Brahms (1833-1897), Anton Rubinstein (1829-1894), Pyotr Illych Tchaikovsky (1840-1893), Jules Massenet (1842-1912), Gabriel Fauré (1845-
1924), and Reynaldo Hahn (1874-1947). Their numerous testimonies of her kaleidoscopic talent continue to inform modern scholars.

Very soon after her operatic debut, she began to add to her repertoire a variety of roles ranging from the operas of Christoph W. Gluck (1714-1787), Domenico Cimarosa (1749-1801), and Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart (1756-1791) to those of Meyerbeer, Donizetti, Carl Maria von Weber (1786-1826), and Giuseppe Verdi (1813-1901). Table 1.1 presents her most significant roles from 1839 to 1863, the year she officially renounced the French operatic stage. This list gives the reader a sense of her technical domain and stylistic versatility. It should be noted that when performing German and Russian works, she often would sing in the opera’s original language:

Table 1.1. Most Significant Operatic Roles sung by Pauline Viardot-Garcia.9

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Role¹⁰</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Fidelio</em></td>
<td>Ludwig van Beethoven</td>
<td>Leonore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>La sonnambula</em></td>
<td>Vincenzo Bellini</td>
<td>Amina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>I Capuletti e i Montecchi</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Romeo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Norma</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Title role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Il matrimonio segreto</em></td>
<td>Domenico Cimarosa</td>
<td>Fidalma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>L’elisir d’amore</em></td>
<td>Gaetano Donizetti</td>
<td>Adina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>La favorita</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Leonor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹⁰ Roles specifically created for Viardot-Garcia or modified for her voice are marked with an asterisk.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opera</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Don Pasquale</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Norina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lucia di Lammermoor</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Title role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Lucrezia di Borgia</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Maffio Orsini</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Roberto Devereux</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Sara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alina, Regina di Golconda</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Title role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Martha</em></td>
<td>Friedrich von Flotow</td>
<td>Nancy/Lady Harriet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>A Life for the Tsar</em></td>
<td>Mikhail Glinka</td>
<td>Antonida</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Orphée et Eurydice</em></td>
<td>Christoph W. Gluck</td>
<td>Orphée *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Alceste</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Title role *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Sapho</em></td>
<td>Charles Gounod</td>
<td>Title role *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>La Juive</em></td>
<td>Jacques Halévy</td>
<td>Recha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Bianca and Galtiero</em></td>
<td>Alexei Fyodorovich Lvov</td>
<td>Bianca</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Le Prophète</em></td>
<td>Giacomo Meyerbeer</td>
<td>Fidès *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Les Huguenots</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Valentine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Robert le Diable</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Isabelle / Alice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Le camp de Silésie</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Catherine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Don Giovanni</em></td>
<td>W. A. Mozart</td>
<td>Donna Anna, Zerlina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Die Zauberflöte</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Papagena</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Il barbiere di Siviglia</em></td>
<td>Gioachino Rossini</td>
<td>Rosina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>La cenerentola</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Angelina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Otello</em></td>
<td>“</td>
<td>Desdemona</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Apart from these roles, Viardot-Garcia had the opportunity of giving premieres in different salons in France and Germany of several historically important operas and vocal chamber works, some of them created with her voice in mind. Many of these were presented after her official retirement from the stage in 1862. Table 1.2 summarizes her accomplishments in this respect:
At the beginning of her operatic career, the singer benefited much from the cosmopolitan artistic scene in Paris, but also suffered from the petty provincialism of the repressive policies of the July Monarchy. In Thérèse Marix-Spire’s introduction to *Lettres Inédites de George Sand et de Pauline Viardot*, the author documents in chilling detail how her marriage to the republican Louis Viardot, her friendship with George Sand, and the birth of *La Revue indépendante*—founded by Viardot, Sand, and their political guru, the radical liberal thinker Pierre Leroux (1797-1871)—provoked a violent wave of bad publicity for Viardot-Garcia in the manipulated press during 1841 and 1842, forcing her to seek her artistic fortune in other countries, such as Germany, Russia, England, and Spain. Her many tours to these countries established her reputation as one

---

11 Roles specifically created for Viardot-Garcia or modified for her voice are marked with an asterisk.
of the greatest and most original operatic singers of the day. Her first and second Russian seasons during the winters of 1843-1844 and 1844-1845 served as a sort of artistic apotheosis. Together with her close friends, the tenor Giovan Battista Rubini (1794-1854) and the bass Antonio Tamburini (1800-1876), Viardot-Garcia introduced the neophyte public of St. Petersburg 12 to the most popular operas of Mozart, Rossini, Donizetti, and Bellini. After her triumphant debut in November 1843 as Rosina, the Russian aristocracy went wild with enthusiasm for the twenty-two-year-old singer. At the theatre, she was showered by bouquets and sustained applause; journalists discussed her every move, and extravagant parties and gifts were organized for her almost daily. Among her most ardent admirers was the then twenty-five-year-old poet and nobleman Ivan Turgenev. The future writer of Fathers and Sons and A Month in the Country became inextricably linked to the young singer. In order to follow her back to Paris, he quitted his post in the Russian government and broke the financial links to his family. Throughout the 1840s, their romantic relationship intensified, though scholars continue to debate whether or not it was physically consumated around 1849-50.13 Their closeness was such that in 1850 Viardot-

12 There had been no Italian opera company in the city since 1830. April FitzLyon, The Price of Genius: A Life of Pauline Viardot (London: John Calder, 1964), 146.

13 Although Turgenev was forced to travel back to Russia in 1850 and Viardot-Garcia tried to break up their epistolary relationship in the late 1850s, a final reconciliation between Louis Viardot, Turgenev, and the singer took place in 1863. After that, the married couple and Ivan Turgenev would live close to each other, at times in the same house, until 1883, when both Viardot-Garcia’s husband and the writer died. For a detailed analysis of the spiritual, intellectual, and perhaps physical relationship of this ménage a trois see Alexandre Zvirinisky, “Introduction,” Correspondance Ivan Tourgueniev-Louis Viardot: Sous le sceau de la fraternité (Paris: Hermann, 2010), 9-34.
Garcia, with the approval of her husband, would adopt Turgenev’s eight-year-old illegitimate daughter by a Russian seamstress.\textsuperscript{14}

Viardot-Garcia could return to the Parisian stages only after the Revolution of 1848. Then she participated with George Sand in a political scheme to reproject the social significance of art and culture in France. Under a sympathetic Republican regime, she graced for the first time the stage of the Opéra, creating one of her most famous roles, Fidès in Meyerbeer’s \textit{Le Prophète}. This was perhaps the most critical moment of her career as a singer/actress: She was closely involved in the compositional process of the opera\textsuperscript{15} and the four months of preparation necessary for the production’s premiere on April 16, 1849. The French public, journalists and connoisseurs were quick to recognize the extraordinary power of her interpretation. Four days after the premiere, Berlioz wrote:

\begin{quote}
\textit{Madame Viardot est l’une de plus grandes artistes qui vient à l’esprit dans l’histoire de la musique passée et présente. Pour en être convaincu il suffit de l’écouter chanter son premier air, O mon fils, sois béni . . .}\textsuperscript{16}
\end{quote}

Madame Viardot is one of the greatest artists that comes to mind in the history of music, past and present. To be convinced, it suffices to listen her sing her first air, “O mon fils, sois béni” . . .

\textsuperscript{14} Turgenev’s child, Pelageya, had been born and raised as a servant in Spasskoye, the estate of the Turgenev family in Russia. Her life would be radically modified when, without knowing a word of French, she was renamed Paulinette and packed off to Paris by her father. For more on the sad fate of Pelageya Turgenev see Tamara Zviguilsky, “Tourguéniev et sa fille, d’après leur correspondance,” \textit{Cahiers Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot, Maria Malibran} (1988), 17-57.

\textsuperscript{15} Meyerbeer would visit her often and ask her opinion about numbers which he had recently composed, often revising them to gain her approval. Michèle Friang, \textit{Pauline Viardot au miroir de sa correspondance} (Paris: Hermann, 2008), 88.

By the time that the production went on tour to England and Germany, she knew the score and staging so well that she took charge of most rehearsals. In July 1849, she wrote to her Russian friend, Count Mathieu Wielhorski, from London:

. . . je ne vois plus un instant de liberté. C’est moi qui dirige toutes les répétitions avec piano et mise en scène. Costa se contente de tenir son bâton à la main, – il mériterait bien parfois d’en recevoir la caresse sur le dos.\(^\text{17}\)

. . . I do not have a free instant anymore. It is me who is staging and directing all musical rehearsals from the piano. Costa can only hold his baton in the hand—at times one feels like tapping him on the back.

Viardot-Garcia took advantage of her newly acquired influence on the Parisian musical scene to help young Charles Gounod launch his operatic career. Gounod’s first opera, *Sapho*, was mostly composed at the Viardot’s country estate in Roissy-en-Brie, Courtavenel, during the summer of 1850. In the early autumn of that year, Pauline, with the approval of both the composer and the librettist, suggested a series of important changes to the score.\(^\text{18}\) Once revisions were made, the work was premiered at the Opéra on April 15, 1851. Viardot-Garcia sang the title role with great histrionic conviction. Although *Sapho* was not a success, it made the name of Gounod known in Paris.\(^\text{19}\)

In December 1851, the republican government was dissolved through a theatrical *coup d’ état*, staged by president Louis-Napoléon Bonaparte (1808-1873) in order to


\(^{19}\) For a detailed study on the relationship between Gounod and the singer see Thérèrse Marix-Spier, “Gounod and his First Interpreter, Pauline Viardot,” parts I and II, *The Musical Quarterly* 31, no. 2 and 3 (1945), 193-211 and 299-317.
advance his imperial ambitions. Shortly after the Second Empire was declared in 1852, Viardot-Garcia found herself unofficially banned from France’s operatic houses. The debouched conditions of political and social life during the 1850s were clearly echoed in the vulgar musical tastes favored in the salons and theatres of the era. Viardot-Garcia often lamented about France’s poor artistic conditions to friends from abroad. In contrast, the Thursday musical soirées at her home, 48, rue de Douai, were remembered by contemporaries as exceptionally sophisticated occasions:

During the Empire the Viardots used to give in their apartment on Thursday evenings really fine musical festivals, which my surviving contemporaries still remember. From the salon . . . which was devoted to ordinary instrumental and vocal music, we went down a short staircase to a gallery filled with valuable paintings, and finally to an exquisite organ, one of Cavaillé-Coll’s masterpieces. In this temple dedicated to music we listened to arias from the oratorios of Handel and Mendelssohn. She had sung them in London, but could not get a hearing for them in the concerts in Paris as they were averse to such vast compositions. I had the honor to be her regular accompanist both at the organ and the piano.

It was in this private space and in the intimate public matinees of the Salle Herz that sections of the vocal works of J. S. Bach and George Handel were heard for the first time in France. Parts of the operas of Gluck and of the cantatas and psalms of Pergolesi, Vivaldi (1678-1741), and Marcello were also interpreted. Rare performances of the instrumental works of W. A. Mozart and the last string quartets of Beethoven were also organized. In sum, Viardot-Garcia and close collaborators such as Saint-Saëns and the


cellist Charles Lebouc (1822-1893) pushed forth the revival of eighteenth-century music in France.²²

In 1859, Viardot-Garcia collaborated with Berlioz and Saint-Saëns in the adaptation of Gluck’s *Orphée et Eurydice* for a new edition, which would be performed prior to its publication at the Théâtre Lyrique. The French version of 1774—where Orphée had been incarnated by the tenor Joseph Legros (1739-1793)—was transcribed for Viardot-Garcia’s contralto voice, following the key scheme of the original Italian score of 1762. Berlioz and Saint-Saëns also restored Gluck’s orchestral score, studying original manuscripts and the work’s first French edition to filter from their version instrumental additions done in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. They often turned to the Italian version when they considered it superior either in musical or dramatic terms, occasionally taking some liberties with the musical material, as Camille Saint-Saëns recalled:

> The first act of *Orfeo* ends in a tumultuous effect of the stringed instruments which was evidently intended to indicate a change of scene and the appearance of the stage settings of the infernal regions. This passage does not appear in the French *Orphée* and it is lacking in the engraved score, where it is replaced by a bravura aria of doubtful taste, accompanied by a single quartet . . . This same aria, changed with real genius and performed with prodigious great brilliance by Madame Viardot, and re-orchestrated by myself, was one of the strongest reasons for the success of the famous performances at the Théâtre-Lyrique. But it is well understood that it could not properly find a place in an edition where the sole end was artistic sincerity and purity of the text.²³


Orphée became the most famous role sung by Viardot-Garcia. She was to interpret it hundreds of times across Europe from 1859 to 1863. The opera’s adaptation of a castrato role for the voice of a contralto/mezzo-soprano set an important precedent, becoming a commonly accepted practice in the operatic world.

Despite the singer’s professional success as Orphée, the Viardots found themselves increasingly unhappy under the conservative and corrupt regime of Louis-Napoléon. In 1862, they decided to move to Baden-Baden, thus becoming voluntary political expatriates. In this high-class resort of the European aristocracy and upper bourgeoisie, they acquired a charming villa overseeing the Thiergarten valley in which they would live for eight years. After a period of painful estrangement, a final reconciliation between Viardot-Garcia and Turgenev took place in 1863. Turgenev decided then to build a magnificent mansion close to the Viardots’ villa. During these years, he spent entire days by the singer, sharing their common love and admiration for literature, music, art, and each other. Viardot-Garcia—now semi-officially retired from the stage—dedicated much of her energies to composition and her voice students. She also directed elegant Sunday matinees and soirees, which were regularly attended by personalities such as the King Wilhelm I (1797-1888) and Queen Augusta of Prussia (1811-1890), King Léopold II of Belgium (1835-1909), Otto von Bismarck (1815-1898), Johannes Brahms, Franz Liszt, Clara Schumann, and Giulia Grisi (1811-1869).24

---

Turgenev greatly supported Viardot-Garcia’s compositional projects during this period. One of the singer’s first biographers April FitzLyon commented on the motives behind his support:

Turgenev, like George Sand, did everything he could to encourage Pauline to compose—but for different reasons. He was no feminist, but he was a good psychologist, and he realized that, as Pauline’s voice deteriorated, she would need something else to take the place it had filled in her life . . . She wished to compose, and with the sole desire of making her happy, Turgenev did all he could to encourage her in this ambition.25

Not only did he create librettos for her first five operettas, Trop de femmes (1867), Le Dernier sorcier (1867), L’Ogre (1868), La Veillée de la Saint-Sylvestre (1868?), and Le Miroir (1869),26 and contribute several lyrics to her six albums of songs on Russian and German poetry, which were published between 1864 and 1874,27 but he was also involved in the publication process of the song collections, negotiating, for example, with the editor A. F. Iogansen in St. Petersburg and even checking printing plates for the composer.28 Turgenev also made it his personal mission to promote Viardot-Garcia’s

25 FitzLyon, 383.

26 These chamber operettas had piano accompaniment and were conceived as study pieces for Pauline’s voice students and children. They all received their premiere at the Villa Viardot in Baden-Baden. Of these five works, the only complete musical score to survive is that of Le Dernier sorcier. Waddington and Žekulin, 20-4.

27 These five albums, which in some cases were published simultaneously in Leipzig and St. Petersburg, comprise about forty songs, mostly to Russian poetry of Pushkin, Fet, Turgenev, Mikhail Lermontov (1814-1841), and Aleksey Koltsov (1809-1842) and to German poetry of Mörike, Heine, Goethe, and Richard Pohl (1826-1896). The titles of these collections can be seen in appendix A. See also Waddington and Žekulin, 16, 18, 23, 24, 25 and 28.

28 Ivan Turgenev to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, St. Petersburg, January 8/20, 1864, in Lettres inédites de Tourgueniev à Pauline Viardot et à sa famille, eds. Henri Granjard and Alexandre Zviguiisky (Laussane: L’Age d’homme, 1972), 106.
Russian songs and convinced many of his friends to publish favorable reviews on the albums in newspapers in St. Petersburg.²⁹ His enthusiasm for her Russian compositions was viewed with suspicion by many nationalistic intellectuals and musicians, for example César Cui (1835-1918), who published a venomous review of them in the *St. Petersburg Gazette* in 1869. Before such negative reactions, Turgenev objected:

*N’est ce pas un préjugé qui entrave complètement la diffusion et le succès des romances des romances russes, écrites par Mme. Viardot? Quantité d’entre elles sont admirables et, en tout cas, se placent sans comparaison bien plus haut que les œuvres habituelles de ce genre; mais, voyez-vous, comment une étrangère, une Espagnole et, qui plus est, une chanteuse, peut-elle écrire des romances russes? Comme si la musique n’était pas un langage universel, et comme si ces mauvais capitaines de cavalerie en retraite et ces dames décolorées du grand monde dont est nanti notre marché musical, et qui composent leurs petites romances à l’oreille, en tapotant d’un doigt sur leur piano, étaient capables de trouver la véritable expression musicale de la pensée poétique que la fille géniale de Garcia, dont Meyerbeer, et Auber, et Rossini, et Wagner ont déclaré à l’unisson qu’elle était la musique même.*³⁰

Is it not a prejudice which absolutely hinders the diffusion and success of the Russian songs composed by Madame Viardot? Many of them are admirable, and, in any case, place themselves well above the examples commonly found in this genre; but, you see, how can a foreigner, a Spaniard, and furthermore, a singer, write Russian art songs? As if music was not a universal language, and as if dreadful retired cavalry captains and colorless ladies of society, those who now dominate our musical milieu and compose their little romances by ear, using but one finger at the piano, were more capable of finding the true musical expression of poetic thought than the genial daughter of Garcia, whom Meyerbeer, Auber, Rossini, and Wagner have declared unanimously as the incarnation of music itself.

²⁹ FitzLyon, 411.

By 1869, Viardot-Garcia had acquired a good reputation as an operatic composer. Liszt used his influence to arrange a public performance at the Weimar Hoftheater of *Le Dernier sorcier*. The libretto was translated to German by the music critic, poet, and close friend of the Viardots, Richard Pohl (1826-1896). Liszt collaborated with the Belgian director and composer Eduard Lassen (1830-1904) in the orchestration of the score. A few months after the Weimar premiere, Johannes Brahms would conduct a chamber version of the opera, now entitled *Der letzte Zauberer*, in the Viardots newly finished miniature theatre, situated next to their villa and locally known as the Théâtre du Thiergarten. A charming drawing, perhaps drafted by the singer’s second daughter, Claudie—a talented visual artist then in her late teens—presents, from left to right, the exterior of the Viardot’s theatre, the artistic salons and the villa, all now destroyed. It is reproduced in Figure 1.2 below:
At the beginning of 1870, *Der letzte Zauberer* was also successfully performed in Karlsruhe and Riga.\(^{32}\) The onset of the Franco-Prussian war in July of that year, however, dashed all of the Viardots prospects in Germany. As the summer progressed, their once popular musical soirées and matinées were suddenly empty. In October, the whole family fled to London, taking with them little of their worldly possessions; Turgenev was soon to follow, helping to assuage some of the economic difficulties they faced as political refugees. At the end of 1871, the family returned to Paris, which lay in ruins after the four-month siege and the terrible incidents of violence which characterized the Commune period. The Viardots’ house at 48, rue de Douai, near Montmartre, however, stood intact and the family settled within its safe walls. At this stage, Turgenev became an almost


official addition to the family when he moved to the upper level of the house. In May 1875, he helped the Viardots acquire a beautiful summer residence, known as Les Frênes, in Bourgival, about fifteen miles to the west of Paris. Perhaps to avoid gossip, he decided to build a large dacha which overlooked the beautiful mansion. The trio did not know it then, but they had less than eight years left to enjoy their idyllic household arrangement by the Seine.

Though the musical scene in Paris had changed considerably since Viardot-Garcia’s departure to Baden-Baden, she lost no time in reintegrating herself to it through various activities. To begin with, she recommenced her Thursday musical soirées. Like Gounod and Saint-Saëns before them, Fauré, Massenet, Ambroise Thomas (1811-1896), Édouard Lalo (1823-1892), Georges Bizet (1838-1875), and César Franck (1822-1890) now became regular attendants of these musical gatherings. Some benefited from Viardot-Garcia’s musical observations on their compositions and her still significant professional influence. Massenet recalled:

---


34 Gabriel Fauré dedicated to Pauline his Chanson du pêcheur. To her two younger daughters, who were also accomplished singers, he dedicated a duo entitled Tarantelle. Fauré fell in love desperately with Marianne Viardot in 1873. After a long courtship, they became engaged; Marianne broke up the engagement in October 1877, to the great desperation of the composer. Some scholars believe that he began to compose the “Libera me” of his future Requiem in D minor as a result of the break-up. For more on the relationships of Fauré with the Viardot family see Barbier, 304-8.

35 Launay, 144.
I was invited to dine at the house of Mme. Pauline Viardot, the sublime lyric tragedienne. In the course of the evening, I was asked to play a little music. I was taken unawares and I began to sing a bit from my sacred drama *Marie Magdeleine*. I was singing, if I may say so, when Mme. Pauline Viardot leaned over the keyboard and said with an accent of emotion never to be forgotten, “What is that?” “*Marie Magdeleine*” I told her, “a work of my youth which I never even hope to put on.” “What? Well, it shall be and I will be your Mary Magdalene.”

Viardot-Garcia was as good as her word. About a year later, on Good Friday 1873 at the Théâtre de l’Odéon, she performed the sacred drama under the baton of Édouard Colonne (1838-1910). The performance gained praise from Tchaikovsky, Gounod and Bizet and helped to launch Massenet’s career as an operatic composer.

Viardot-Garcia also became a regular attendant, performer, and presenter of new works at the Société nationale de musique, which had been cofounded by Saint-Saëns and by one of the voice professors of the Conservatoire—Romain Bussine (1830-1899)—in late 1871. She kept abreast with the latest developments in instrumental music in France and must have enriched these gatherings by sharing her cosmopolitan experience and stylistic knowledge.

In 1872, Viardot-Garcia was invited by Ambroise Thomas to become a voice professor at the Conservatoire. She would teach there for three years, preparing pedagogical publications for the benefit of her students, including a compilation of fifty

---


37 Pauline composed several chamber works to present at the Société nationale, including
translated Schubert songs\textsuperscript{38} and her own singing method, designed for female voices.\textsuperscript{39}

The exercises with supporting piano accompaniments in this concise method correlate to the empirical \textit{bel canto} tradition which she learned from her father. The last exercise in the book, marked \textit{presto}, exemplifies the kind of vocal flexibility and precision which she expected from her advanced students. See Example 1.1:


\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example1}
\end{figure}


\textsuperscript{38} Franz Schubert, \textit{Cinquante mélodies de Franz Schubert, traduites par Louis Pomey avec annotations et sous la direction de Mme Pauline Viardot} (Paris: E Gérard, 1873).

\textsuperscript{39} Pauline Viardot, \textit{Une heure d’étude. Excercisies pour voix de femme, écrits pour ses élèves par Mme Pauline Viardot. Adoptés au Conservatoire national de musique}, 2 vols. (Paris: Au Ménestrel and Heugel & fils, 1880). This method was translated and published in Germany and the U.S.A. in 1880 and 1881 respectively.
One should realize, however, that this method represents but one aspect of the Garcías’ pedagogy. To one of her students, she described the advantages of exercises over vocalises and the limitations of both of these in the artistic development of the student:

D’après ma méthode, dont un des points principaux est de ne jamais faire perdre le temps aux élèves, en leur faisant chanter des vocalises, et voici pour quelle raison : les vocalises étant faites d’une certaine quantité de difficultés, ces difficultés doivent être étudiées à part, dans des exercices ; tant qu’elles ne vont pas bien, on ne les surmontera que par des exercices. Dès qu’elles le sont [surmontées], il est inutile de fatiguer l’élève à chanter sur a cette musique souvent médiocre et qui n’avance à rien, tout en fatigant les voix. N’est-il pas préférable de faire chanter de bonne musique facile ou progressivement difficile avec des paroles ? Mon père n’en faisait jamais chanter des vocalises, jamais, jamais. Mon frère non plus. Je n’en ai jamais chanté et n’en fais pas faire à mes élèves.  

One of the principal points of my method is to never make students loose their time by making them sing vocalises, and this is the reason: vocalises are made up of a certain amount of [technical] difficulties; such difficulties should be studied on the side, in exercises; vocal [shortcomings] can only be surmounted through exercises. Once these are mastered, it is useless to fatigue the student by making him [or her] sing [vocalises], which are often mediocre and do not make one advance. Is it not preferable to make them sing good simple or progressively difficult music with words? My father never made [his students] sing vocalises, never, never; neither did my brother. I have never sang them and do not force my students to do it.

Her compilation, arrangement and commentary of seventy-six Italian, German and French Baroque, Classical and Romantic arias and songs—forty pieces of which were initially published in 1861—was probably employed to train the stylistic and

---


41 "What began to appear in 1861 was the first of six planned series, each intended to contain fifty items and to appear annually, but the comprehensive collection of c. 1891 included only seventy-six pieces in all, and as late as 1896 an edition of seventy items was still being
artistic understanding of her students. The cover of one of the final editions of this collection is reproduced as Figure 1.3. It gives a sense of the richness and diversity of her vocal repertoire, particularly when one realizes that Viardot-Garcia considered this edition a work in progress:

advertised in the *Annuaire des artistes de l’enseignement dramatique et musical*. In 1861 four batches of ten came out (nos 1-40); in 1862, one batch (nos 41-50); and in 1879-80 a further batch (nos 51-60). The remaining pieces apparently came out singly around 1886 and after, with a new publisher, J. Hamelle. It is known that, as of the winter of 1891-92 at least, Pauline Viardot considered her *École classique du chant* as still a work in progress and firmly intended to add, for example, the Bergère’s aria ‘On s’étonnerait moins que la saison nouvelle’ from Act II scene iv of Gluck’s opera *Armide.*” Patrick Waddington and Nicholas G. Žekulin, 9.

---


Figure 1.3. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Cover for École classique de chant (Paris: Hamelle, c. 1890), courtesy of Bibliotheque Nationale de France.
In 1875, Pauline decided to renounce her post at the Conservatoire after months of struggle to make some important modifications to the curriculum. She had aimed, in particular, to make students work mainly in Baroque, Classical, and Early Romantic repertoire and stay with a single voice professor throughout their training, an approach which was criticized by other professors and the administration. Viardot-Garcia, however, continued teaching privately until almost the end of her life. During her more than forty years as vocal pedagogue in France and Germany, she trained and supported many fine professional singers, including some who premiered roles in famous operas and became, in their own turn, respected voice teachers, among them, Ada Adini (Brünhilde in Die Walküre’s Italian premiere), Desirée Artot (engaged briefly to Tchaikovsky), Marianne Brandt (Kundry in the premiere of Parsifal), Jeanne Gerville-Réache (Genévieve in the USA premiere of Pelléas et Mélisande), Aglaja Orgeni (professor at the Royal Conservatory of Dresden), and Anna Schoen-René (director and founder of the Minneapolis Symphony Orchestra and professor at Juilliard).

After recovering from the traumatic deaths of her husband and Turgenev in 1883, she dedicated much energy to composing. Her last published song dates from 1905. The most representative works published after her return to France are five collections of mélodies, two collections of arrangements of Italian airs from the eighteenth century, a collection of six songs based on French chansons of the fifteenth century, a pantomime entitled Au Japon and a chamber comic opera in three acts, Cendrillon, which received its premiere in her salon in 1904, when the composer was 83 years old. The next year she

---

44 Barbier, Pauline Viardot, 231.

45 For bibliographical information on these collections see appendices A and B of the present dissertation.
traveled to London to participate in a celebration at the Civic Hotel of the one hundredth birthday of her older brother, Manuel Patricio Rodríguez García (1805-1906), baritone, vocal pedagogue and inventor of the laryngoscope. He received several honors on that occasion, including a recognition from the British Medical and Chirurgical Society and the prestigious prize Gran Cruz de Alfonso XII, invested by the Spanish government. It was, perhaps, also an indirect celebration of the impressive accomplishments that the García clan had achieved in more than one hundred years of participation in the musical life of Europe, a subject which will be exposed in chapter 2 of the present document.

Viardot-García died peacefully in her apartment on Boulevard Saint-Germain on May 18, 1910.

Reception and State of Scholarship on Viardot-García’s Songs: Changing Views on her Compositional Achievements

Viardot-García’s privileged position as one of the most virtuosic and coveted performers of her day set her apart and gave her ample opportunity to present her songs not only in the most relevant Parisian salons and concert halls, but in the most prominent musical gatherings and concert houses of Europe. In an undated letter from 1858 to conductor and editor Julius Rietz (1813-1877), she humorously recounted the shock experienced by Weimar audiences, when she presented one of her original Spanish songs (an Andalusian caña) and one of her many vocal arrangements of the Chopin Mazurkas:

---

46 During the winter season of 1840-1841, for example, Pauline was heard at the matinees of Herz and de Labarre, at the Opéra, singing the Requiem of Mozart, at Zimmerman’s famed salon, at Érard’s concert hall, and in the Conservatoire singing arias from Handel and Così fan tutte. Thérèse Marix-Spire, “Introduction” to Lettres Inédites de George Sand et de Pauline Viardot (Paris : Nouvelles Éditions Latines, 1959), 38.
Je veux pourtant vous raconter en quelques mots la soirée donnée à la Altenburg en mon honneur. Tout le ban et l’arrière de la Zukunft étaient présents . . . Comme je m’y attendais bien on m’a fait chanter. Savez-vous ce qui a fait le plus d’effet? Devinez—ma caña—et je n’avais pas [dit] de qui c’était—you pouvez vous [imaginer?] au diapason très élevé d’exaltation qui donne le ton à la Altenburg le tapage qui a éclaté quand le nom de l’auteur-esse a été prononcé—et c’est la princesse qui l’a deviné! oh les femmes sont fines!—puis j’ai terminé par les Mazourkas qui ont fait sauter Liszt sur sa chaise . . .

. . . I want to tell you in a few words about the soirée given at the Altenburg in my honor. All the army and the reserves of the [Music of the] Future were present . . . According to expectation, they made me sing. Do you know what made the greatest effect? Guess—my caña—and I had not [said] by whom it was—you may [imagine] knowing the high pitch of exaltation to which the Altenburg is keyed up, the noise that burst out when the name of the author-ess was pronounced—and it was the Princess who guessed it! Oh, women are keen!—then I finished with the Mazurkas, which made Liszt jump about in his chair . . .

Her former piano professor “jumped about” his chair with excitement. He always considered her music as “charming . . . lively, elegant, and with good style.”

Viardot-García’s songs were admired by some of the most important French, German and Russian composers of her day. Among those that left comments on the beauty and technical mastery of her compositions in letters and/or journalistic articles, we find Chopin, the Schumanns, Brahms, Mendelssohn, Berlioz, Rubinstein, Gounod, Fauré, Massenet, Saint-Säens, and Tchaikovsky. Writers such as Sand, Turgenev, and de Musset also testified to her exceptional talent in text-setting.


48 “. . . la charmante musique, vive, élégante, spirituelle et de bon style de Madam Viardot.” Franz Liszt to Karl Hillebrand, Weimar, February 23, 1869, quoted in Thérèse Marix-Spire, “Vicissitudes d’un opéra-comique : La Mare au diable, de George Sand et de Pauline Viardot,” The Romantic Review 35, no. 2 (April 1944), 137.
Viardot-Garcia’s fame helped her to promote her works once they had been published. Her *Album Viardot de 1850*, for example, received much publicity and praise in England and France, doubtlessly, because this collection of ten songs appeared on the same year that she created the role of Fidès in Meyerbeer’s *Le Prophète* for the Paris Opéra.\(^{49}\) Like other women composers of the nineteenth century, for instance Louise Farrenc (1804-1875) and Loïsa Puget (1810-1889), she understood that her success as a composer depended on exposing her works to continuous interpretation, publication and press criticism. She was perhaps unconsciously reacting to the paradox that dominated the careers of most women composers of the time: in order to be a recognized composer, one had to be first and foremost a recognized interpreter. To Clara Schumann, she explained:

\begin{quote}
*Du hast keine idée, wie ich jetzt beschäftigt bin. Du weisst nicht, welche Arbeit jede einzelne Rolle in sich trägt . . . Vor allem verehre ich den schaffenden Meister, unmittelbar neben ihm den schaffenden Künstler. Beide sind unzertrennbar – denn Jeder allein für sich bleibt Stumm, und zusammen schaffen sie den höchsten und edelsten Genuss des Menschen, die Kunst.*\(^{50}\)
\end{quote}

You have no idea how busy I am just now. You don’t know how much work goes into each individual role . . . I respect first and foremost the creative master, and then the creative artist. They are inseparable—for each remains silent on his own, and together they create the highest and most noble of man’s pleasure, art.

\(^{49}\) The album was reviewed by critic Henri Blanchard in Paris and critic Henry Chorley in London. For more on this articles and a detailed history of the reception of this album see Chapter 7.

Not even her fame as a singer and her generally good reputation as a composer could save her from occasionally having to confront the conventional prejudices of the era. Sometimes these were expressed by influential figures: when in 1862, Émile Perrin (1814-1885), then director of the Opéra-Comique, was offered to produce La Mare au diable, a projected opéra-comique with a libretto by Sand and music by Viardot-Garcia, he reported to Sand’s close friend, the painter Eugène Fromentin, that he would happily accept a libretto by the famed writer, “but that the music of Mme V. . . . inspired him less confidence; he had not heard it, but, he had his doubts.”51 Even the singer’s husband expressed misgivings about his wife’s ability to provide music for Sand’s libretto:

Pauline n’a pas eu la prétention d’être compositeur, elle a écrit un assez grand nombre de morceaux de musique, mais toujours suivant les occasions qui s’offraient . . . . . Ne pouvant pas s’appuyer sur un caractère très précis donné à chaque morceau, Pauline se sent hors d’état de se soutenir au niveau de l’auteur des paroles. Mme. Sand a trop d’esprit, et connaît trop bien l’esprit des femmes, le genre de talent qu’elles tiennent de leur nature impressionnable, qu’elles exercent par une sorte d’instinct plutôt que par la réflexion, pour ne pas bien comprendre cette espèce d’impossibilité.

Pauline never had the pretension of being a composer, she has written a great number of small pieces of music, but always as a response to an assortment of opportunities . . . Being unable to provide each part [of the libretto] with a very precise musical character, Pauline feels that she cannot be at the same level with the author of the words. Mme Sand has too much spirit not to understand this kind of impossibility. She knows all too well the soul of women and the kind of talent that they have as a result of their impressionable nature, which they exert by a kind of instinct and not by the power of reflection.52


In this ouvert chauvinistic vein, Louis Viardot—in his attempt to defend his wife’s inability (or unwillingness?) to finish the music for *La Mare au Diable* after more than a decade of planning and reconsidering from both writer and singer—denied her competence as a composer. Such a statement demonstrates not only an insensitive understanding of her compositional labor up until 1869 (i.e. nine published albums of songs, four operettas, numerous vocal arrangements of Baroque, Classical, and Romantic works, and a few instrumental chamber works) but a bigoted attitude towards the creative achievements of all women. On numerous occasions, Viardot-Garcia the composer had to balance her husband’s attitude—which reflected the general outlook of society towards the artistic achievements of women—with the unbound enthusiasm of her closest defenders, Sand, Turgenev, and Saint-Saëns. Saint-Saëns in particular reflected on her ability to absorb national styles in performance and composition:

She wrote numerous *lieder* on Spanish and German texts and all of these show a faultless diction. . . . Once she sang a Spanish popular song, a wild haunting thing, with which Rubinstein fell madly in love. It was several years before she would admit that she wrote it herself. She wrote brilliant [French] operettas in collaboration with Tourguenienief, but they were never published and were performed only in private. One anecdote will show her versatility as a composer. She was a friend of Chopin and Liszt and her tastes were strongly futuristic. M. Viardot, on the contrary, was a reactionary in music. He even found Beethoven too advanced. One day they had a guest who was also a reactionary. Madame Viardot sang to them a wonderful work with recitative, aria and final allegro, which they praised to the skies. She had written it expressly for the occasion. I have read this work and even the cleverest would have been deceived.\(^{53}\)

A few years before her death, one of her students, Lydia Torrigi-Heiroth, a voice professor at the Académie de musique de Genève, gave a conference at the Salle de l’Athénée of that city on Viardot-Garcia’s achievements as interpreter, composer and teacher. From this conference, we learn that even at the turn of the twentieth century, the scope of her accomplishments as a composer was not too well understood. Torrigi-Heiroth thought it necessary to enumerate and describe in some detail many of her teacher’s song collections, operettas, arrangements, and transcriptions. It is interesting that in her description there is no mention of Viardot-Garcia’s early songs and song collections, that is to say, those works published before 1860. It is probable she did not know much about them. Viardot-Garcia might have not even mentioned them to Torrigi-Heiroth when she was studying with her in the 1870s. Many of the editions were already unavailable, in any case. The romance and mélodie were ephemeral genres, not meant to last for a long time in the consciousness of the public or performer beyond their initial publication. After the conference, Torrigi-Heiroth’s students gave a short recital which included seven of Viardot-Garcia’s songs and trios and one of the choruses from Le Dernier sorcier. Most of the works included in the recital had been published in the 1880s and 1890s. The earliest composition, “Evocation,” was a translation of one of Viardot-Garcia’s Russian albums, which had originally been published in France in

1866.\textsuperscript{55} All of the works were sung in French, even though two of them had been originally conceived in Italian and one in Russian.

After Viardot-Garcia’s death, many of her students, like Torrigi-Heiroth, must have attempted to sustain her reputation as composer by interpreting and teaching her works, but they could do little to change the reception of her songs and operettas during most of the twentieth century. Despite the enthusiasm of the singer’s contemporaries for her compositions, only two or three of her songs and arrangements were republished between the time of her death and 1987.\textsuperscript{56} The cause for the quick oblivion into which these compositions—together with those of other famed women composers of the nineteenth century—fell is reasoned with clear logic by musicologist Florence Launay:

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{55} A second edition of the Russian collection in French translation was released in 1899. Probably the score used in the recital of Torrigi-Heiroth’s students was published that year. \textit{Douze mélodies sur des poésies russes de Pouchkine, Tourguenoff, Feth, Lermontoff, Kolstoff, 2\textsuperscript{nd} ed.} (Paris: J. Hamelle, 1899).
\textsuperscript{56} Viardot-Garcia’s vocal arrangement of the second movement of Haydn’s/Hoffstetter’s?) String Quartet in F Major, Op. 3, No. 5, Hob. III: 17, originally published under the title \textit{Canzonetta de concert, tirée du 17ème quatuor} (Paris: Heugel & fils, 1880), was translated and republished in the twentieth century in the United States under the title \textit{Night is falling, Canzonetta}. (New York: Schirmer, c. 1942). Pauline’s musical treatise, \textit{Une heure d’étude} was also republished several times after her death, in the U.S. under the title \textit{An Hour of Study} (New York: Schirmer, 1939) and in Russia \textit{Uprazhneniya dlya zhenskogo golosa} (Moscow: A. Gutkheyl’, 1918; 1926 and 1967). See Waddington and Žekulin, 33.
\end{flushright}
La réception des œuvres, elle a pu être parfois très positive, la presse musicale en apporte maintes preuves. Nombre de pièces ont été gravées . . . Même en cas de critique positive, l’appartenance de l’auteur au sexe féminin peut passer au premier plan d’une appréciation reste en général androcentriste : la compositrice est louée parce qu’elle écrit « comme un homme. » L’excellence surprend, puisqu’une femme n’y est pas, « par nature », destinée. L’accueil parfois positif des contemporaines semble en effet n’avoir jamais été suffisant pour que les « exceptions » aient pu atteindre, après leur disparition, au statut d’individu/homme écrivant de la musique. . . . Dès qu’une compositrice n’est plus là pour défendre son œuvre, aucune tradition de réception de la création féminine ne prend le relais pour assurer à sa production une certaine pérennité. Ses œuvres disparaissent du répertoire et ses activités sont éradiqués des mémoires.

Force est de constater que les “exceptions” restent assimilées au groupe du compositeur féminin . . . : un groupe de personnes dont on s’attend à ce qu’elles écrivent une musique médiocre, peu travaillée, à l’architecture faible, à l’harmonie simpliste, à leur image de leur « nature féminine », et qui ne mérite pas d’entrer au répertoire musical et de passer à la postérité. Il apparaît que la mentalité du XIXe siècle accordant des natures radicalement différentes aux hommes et aux femmes a perdué au siècle suivant.

The reception of compositions [by women] was at times very positive, The musical press left many proofs. Many of the works were published . . . Even in the case of positive criticism, the gender of the composer could be made the central point of an appraisal, which remained generally androcentric: the composer was praised because she wrote “like a man.” Excellence surprised, because a woman was not destined “by nature” [to attain it].

The sometimes positive reception of contemporaries seems, in fact, never to have been enough for the “exceptions” to have achieved, after their death, a status of individual/man composer of music. . . . After a composer is not there to defend her corpus of works, no tradition of reception for feminene creation takes her place to assure that her production has a certain permanence. Her works disappear from the repertoire and her activities are eradicated from the collective memory.

One is forced to remark that the “exceptions” become assimilated to the group of female composers. . . . : a group of people which was expected to write mediocre music, with an unfinished surface, a feeble form, and a simplistic harmony, made in the image of their “feminine nature” and which did not merit to enter the corpus of musical repertoire and pass into posterity. It seems that the mentality of the nineteenth century, which accorded radically different natures to men and women, persisted during the following century.

57 Launay, 15-6.
By the late 1920s, the vast majority of Viardot-Garcia’s musical compositions had been forgotten; most of the first publications were unavailable to performers. Even her fame as a singer was now dimly remembered. Still, a few French scholars labored on, bringing forth forgotten aspects of her talent. Music historian Julien Tiersot (1857-1936), who had known and admired Viardot-Garcia in her old age, published in 1934 his seminal study on the rapport between French Romantic writers and popular/folkloric music. It included a chapter dedicated to George Sand and Viardot-Garcia’s collaboration in collecting folkloric dances and songs from the region of Berry during the 1840s and 1850s. In 1885, Tiersot received from Viardot-Garcia manuscripts containing musical transcriptions from *briolages*, *bourrées*, and *chansons* which she painstakingly collected from different local peasants during her many visits to Nohant in the 1840s. About fifteen of those transcriptions are reproduced in his book. Her transcribed version of a *chanson* is presented below:


---

Tiersot wrote about his impressions upon first listening to this transcription:

Mme. Viardot ne s'était pas contentée d’écrire cette chanson : Elle me l’a chantée. Je n’ai pas oublié la volubilité, l’entrain, la franche gaieté avec lesquels la grande interprète de Gluck, de Mozart, de Schubert, devenue septuagénaire, rendait la vie à cette chanson gauloise. Elle avait si vivement le sentiment de toute musique, de tout art !

Mme. Viardot did not only write down this chanson: She sang it for me. I have not forgotten the volubility, the energy, the fresh gaiety with which the great interpreter of Gluck, Mozart, Schubert, then in her seventies, gave life to this Gallic song. She possessed such vivid feeling for all music, all art!

Not surprisingly, it was the close relationship between Sand and Viardot-Garcia, which first drew the attention of French scholars back to the accomplishments of the singer. Thérèse Marix-Spire, curator or the Bibliothèque de la Sorbonne in the 1940s and 1950s, meticulously traced and transcribed the correspondence of both women for their first ten years of friendship, publishing it in 1959. In the introduction to her edition of the letters, she contextualized their friendship, giving a historical background to Parisian cultural life in the 1840s and biographical information on the writer and singer. Marix-Spire also included in one of the introduction’s footnotes an incomplete list of Pauline’s songs, which prominently did not include many of the works published outside of France. Despite Marix-Spire’s substantial intelligence as a literary scholar, she was not a musicologist. In a 1944 essay on the failed collaboration of both women on an opéra-comique based on Sand’s novel La Mare au diable, she unfortunately decided to pay too

\[^{59}\text{Tiersot, 170-1.}\]
\[^{60}\text{Marix-Spire, “Introduction” to Lettres Inédites de George Sand et de Pauline Viardot, 38.}\]
much attention to the letter in which Louis Viardot expressed his views on the limits of
his wife’s compositional abilities. In fact, she considered the letter so important that she
quoted it fully in this widely read article. The echoes of Louis Viardot’s opinions can
clearly be felt in Marix-Spire’s statement: “Pauline’s . . . creative talent was not
stimulated but by motifs which were very specific, Spanish, Neapolitan and Sicilian
rhythms.” Incredibly, as we shall soon prove, after its publication by Marix-Spire in
1944, Louis Viardot’s 1869 letter to Adolphe Joanne becomes one of the determining
factors to rationalize, among many biographers of the singer, the reception of his wife’s
compositions in the twentieth century.

Published in 1964, The Price of Genius by English translator, biographer and
historian April FitzLyon became the first and most influential biography dedicated to
Viardot-Garcia. Thanks to FitzLyon’s knowledge of different European languages, music
and literature and her meticulous scholarly labor, she was able to create a vast canvas on
the career and personality of the singer and her multi-layered relationships with her
family, artistic friends and admirers. Her presentation of the supposed illicit amorous
relationship between Viardot-Garcia and Turgenev is well supported and defended,
although conclusive documentary proof about the extent of the physical relationship
between the Russian writer and the Spanish-French singer continues to evade scholars to
this day. On the other hand, April FitzLyon fails to discuss the style, influences, and

---

61 See letter of Louis Viardot to Adolphe Joanne, June 7, 1869, quoted above.

62 “[L]e talent créateur [de Pauline] n’est stimulé que par motifs très caractérisés,
rhythmes espagnols, napolitains, siciliens . . .” Marix-Spire, “Vicissitudes d’un opéra-comique:
La Mare au diable,” 130.
diversity of Viardot-Garcia’s creative output. FitzLyon’s opinions on the compositional abilities of the legendary singer are clearly stated almost from the onset of the book:

Pauline did, in fact, have a talent for composition, and continued to compose throughout her life. Her works were, in her day, admired by Liszt, by Adam, by Moscheles, and many of her contemporaries . . . Her compositions were usually sound, competent, and agreeable, although they never achieved any real distinction. Her knowledge of composition had a more important indirect influence—the help and advice she is known to have given to other composers, such as Gounod, Meyerbeer, and Berlioz.  

This over-confident judgment is not sustained by a single musical quotation throughout the book, which makes one suspect that FitzLyon did not bother to inspect too many of Viardot-Garcia’s compositions. Surprisingly, such unfounded opinions still continue to influence many contemporary biographers of the singer, among them Michael Steen, who in his otherwise well-researched volume, published in 2008, also fails to give any serious consideration to Pauline’s significant corpus of vocal works, even though he had at his disposal something which April FitzLyon lacked forty years ago, considerable advances in the research, republication, and recording of her compositions:

‘Never has there been a woman composer of genius—finally here is one,’ [Liszt] proclaimed. However, his expectations were unfulfilled. Her operettas, songs and many other compositions never justified her being awarded this accolade.

---


Throughout Steen’s book, there is not a single stylistic discussion or musical quotation to support or refute Liszt’s positive opinion. Rather, he finds it easier to limit Viardot-Garcia’s artistic talents to the more comfortable (and traditionally feminine) roles mentioned in the subtitle of the book, *Pauline Viardot: Soprano, Muse, and Lover*. Steen even changes Viardot-Garcia’s *Fach* to make her fit better into his patriarchal outlook!

Such opinionated statements demonstrate that a prejudice still persists in some mainstream circles against “obscure” or unknown repertoire, particularly if composed by a woman. The verdict appears to be that, if a composition is not performed, there must be valid reasons for its exclusion from the standard repertoire. More often than not, it is assumed that the work is simply too mediocre, dull, or outmoded. While sometimes these assumptions might turn out to be true, it would seem to be the duty of scholars and musicians to investigate systematically before passing such judgments. Other contemporary biographers of Viardot-Garcia, such as Barbara Kendall-Davies and Patrick Barbier, have been much better informed about the compositional activities of the famous singer, and although they have not done much to advance the state of scholarship on these works, they have had the good sense of making at some point in their biographies partial enumerations of the compositions, often alluding to the opinions

---

65 Barbara Kendall-Davies, *The Life and Work of Pauline Viardot Garcia*, vol. I, *The years of Fame, 1836-1863* (Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Press, 2003). Kendall-Davies, who is also a singer, recorded six of Viardot-Garcia’s *Lieder* and *melodies* to accompany the first volume of her lengthy and at times somewhat novelized biography. Except for the last song in the CD, “Solitude,” which Viardot-Garcia included in the second song collection from 1849, none of the other five works were composed during the 1836-1863 period.

66 Patrick Barbier, *Pauline Viardot*. Barbier’s excellently documented biography is in my opinion the best contemporary monograph on Viardot-Garcia.

67 These two biographies include no musical examples, analysis, or stylistic contextualization of the compositions.
of her contemporaries and reserving an irrefutable verdict on the entire output. As Barbier states before embarking on his ten-page discussion of the compositions of Viardot-Garcia:

La composition est une autre partie essentielle de la vie de Madame Viardot, tout en demeurant la face cachée de l’iceberg. . . . Pauline appartient bien à la famille Garcia, dont tous les membres ont composé. . . . S’il est de peu d’intérêt d’établir une classification entre les œuvres de cette grande famille, le minimum est de constater la qualité et la profondeur des œuvres de Pauline Viardot . . .

Composition is another essential element in the life of Madame Viardot, although it remains the hidden side of the iceberg. . . . Pauline clearly belonged to the García family, in which every member composed. . . . If it is of little interest to establish a [comparative] classification of the works of this great family, the minimum is to attest the quality and depth of the compositions of Pauline Viardot.

A responsible line of scholarly work on Viardot-Garcia’s compositions has slowly developed over the last fifty years. Curiously, its initial impetus was created through the combined efforts of a group of Slavonic scholars specializing on Turgenev, American feminist musicologists, and finally, by influential singers such as Cecilia Bartoli and Frederica von Stade. The first performances of Viardot-Garcia’s works in modern times occurred in the late 1960s and early 1970s; her late chamber operetta Cendrillion (1904) was first performed in the Newport Jazz Festival in 1967. In 1971, the opening gala recital of the same festival was dedicated to several of her songs and to a repetition of the operetta, which would be recorded for the first time by Opera Rara the following year.69

---

68 Barbier, Pauline Viardot, 263-4.

69 Nicholas G. Žekunin, “Recording of Pauline Viardot’s Music: A Note,” Patrick Waddington and Nicholas G. Žekulin, 149.
During the 1970s and early 1980s, however, such performances were rare and isolated. The introductory conference to a concert given at the UNESCO in 1977, which celebrated Viardot-García’s musical career, makes it clear that interested scholars and performers were working in relative isolation during those years:

*L’insertion dans le programme de ce soir de trois mélodies composées par une de plus grandes cantatrices du siècle dernier, Pauline Viardot, constitue un événement dans l’histoire des représentations musicales. En effet, les mélodies de Mme. Viardot n’ont, à ma connaissance, jamais été entendues en public depuis trois quarts de siècle.*

The insertion in tonight’s program of three *melodies* composed by one of the great singers of last century, Pauline Viardot, represents an event in the history of musical representations. As a matter of fact, the songs of Mme. Viardot have not, to my knowledge, been heard in public after three quarters of a century.

This conference was prepared and presented by young Alexandre Zviguilsky, who was to become one of the world’s leading scholars on Turgenev and the president of the Association des Amis d’Ivan Tourgueniev, Pauline Viardot et Maria Malibran. Since 1977, this international community of scholars with inter-disciplinarian interests has done much—through various expositions, conferences, concerts and the publication in their yearly journal, *Cahiers Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot, Maria Malibran*, of essays and rare primary source material—to advance the study and diffusion of the works of these three personalities. In 1981, for example, they hosted a recital organized by the

---

*70* Extracts from this conference can be found in Alexandre Zviguilsky, “Musique et opéra au XIXe siècle, relations entre compositeur, interprète et publique,” *Cahiers Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot et Maria Malibran* 2 (1978), 127

*72* An overview of the diverse expositions, concerts, theatrical and cinematographic representations, conferences, commemorations, trips, and publications of the *Association* over the
Union des Femmes Professeurs et Compositeurs dedicated to the *mélodies* of Viardot-Garcia and her son. In 1989 they presented, under the supervision and direction of Mildred Clary, a radio series of circa fifteen hours devoted to the careers of the García sisters, in which a few of their compositions were heard for the first time in the French mass media. In 1992, one of their members, Véronica Grange, directed a production of Viardot-Garcia’s *Cendrillon*.

Through the personal efforts of Alexandre Zviguilsky, the first unedited biography of Viardot-Garcia was published in issues no. 9 and no.10 of the Association’s yearly *Cahiers*.73 Gustave Dulong’s *Pauline Viardot, tragedienne lyrique*, completed around 1956, however, shared the same prejudices towards the compositions of Viardot-Garcia as those found in the publications of FitzLyon and Marix-Spire. This is not surprising, for during the research process, Dulong consulted Marix-Spire on several occasions.74 In the analysis of Dulong, who was also not a musician or a musicologist, the singer’s intelligence and fame combined to create in her contemporaries a false appreciation for her songs and operettas:

---


Les éloges que ces compositions musicales lui valent de la part de Rietz et de Tourguéniev ont sans doute été dictés par l’amitié, les applaudissements des hôtes illustres du salon Viardot par la politesse. C’est un fait qu’aucune d’entre elles n’a survécu, qu’aucune de celles qui ont été imprimées ne semble mériter d’être aujourd’hui tirée de l’oubli. Et pourtant, d’un bout à l’autre de sa longue carrière Pauline Viardot se verra accorder, comme compositeur, des éloges dont très souvent il n’y a pas lieu de suspecter la sincérité. L’explication de cette anomalie ressort, semble-t-il, de l’analyse même que nous avons faite du talent personnel de Pauline Viardot. Le trait qui se détache le plus nettement de cette physionomie d’artiste, c’est l’intelligence, c’est-à-dire essentiellement le don de pénétrer et de rendre fidèlement la pensée d’autrui, telle qu’elle se manifeste dans les œuvres des maîtres. Ceux qui sont doués de ce talent peuvent bien devenir des interprètes incomparables, mais ne sont guère des créateurs originaux. On disait des premières mélodies de Pauline Viardot qu’elles auraient pu être de Schubert ou de Schumann. Effectivement elle savait faire du Schumann et du Schubert, mais rien de ce qu’elle faisait n’était proprement du Pauline Viardot.\footnote{Ibid., 155.}

The praises that Pauline received for these musical compositions from [Julius] Rietz and Turgenev were without a doubt dictated by friendship, the claps of the illustrious guests at the salon Viardot by politeness. It is a fact that none among them has survived, that none of those which were published merit to be brought back from oblivion. And therefore, from the beginning to the end of her long career, Pauline Viardot received, as a composer, praises which one must suspect were insincere. The explanation for this anomaly springs, it seems, from the same analysis which we have made of the personal talent of Pauline Viardot. The most significant characteristic of her artistic physiognomy was her intelligence, in other words, the gift to penetrate and to render faithfully the thought of others, as it manifested in the works of the masters. Those who are gifted with such talent can become incomparable interpreters, but they are not original creators. It was said of the first songs of Pauline Viardot that they could have been written by Schubert or Schumann. Indeed she knew how to [compose] like Schumann and Schubert, but nothing which she did was properly [a characteristic work by] Pauline Viardot.

Thus, from Dulong’s perspective the songs composed by a talented intelligent (female) musician of Viardot-Garcia’s stature could only be imitations of the works of true (male)
masters of the era, such as Schubert and Schumann.\textsuperscript{76} The numerous spoken and written praises made of them throughout the years by famous musicians and writers could only amount to insincere and vaguely embarrassed attempts to gain the favor of a woman who did not know the limitations of her own nature and artistic talent. Curiously, Dulong refers to Louis Viardot’s letter to Adolphe Joanne from 1869 in a footnote attached to a statement which appears only a few sentences before he exposes his negative evaluation of Viardot-Garcia’s compositions.\textsuperscript{77}

If Dulong had been alive, he would have been shocked that in 1985—the year that his 1956 biography was finally published—several of the “unworthy” compositions of Viardot-Garcia were being prepared for republication and reinterpretation by American musicologists and famous performers with feminist sympathies. First, “Die Beschwörung”—a German/Russian song to a dramatic poem by Pushkin originally published in 1865—appeared in Indiana University’s momentous \textit{Historical Anthology of Music by Women}\textsuperscript{78} accompanied by an analytical commentary by musicologist Austin B. Caswell. Caswell was genuinely impressed by the profound correlation between music

\textsuperscript{76} It is interesting that her earliest known songs were published 1838, two years before Schumann published his first \textit{Lieder}. Dulong’s reference to contemporaries making a comparison of her earliest works with those of Schumann is based on a misreading of George Sand’s article on Viardot-Garcia from early 1841, where the writer states that upon seeing her scores, several strict and competent musicians made the observation that her songs had the same artistic quality as those of Schubert and Weber. This part of Sand’s article is quoted in Chapter 4 of the present dissertation. George Sand, “Le Théâtre-Italien et Mlle. Pauline Garcia,” \textit{La Revue de deux mondes} IV, no. 21 (February 15, 1840), 587.

\textsuperscript{77} The letter is specifically mentioned in footnote 102 of Dulong’s biography. See Dulong, 155.

and poetry, which Viardot-Garcia achieved through an intelligent manipulation of her compositional means:

Pushkin’s text does not deal with the timid flutterings of awakening love but with the railings of an adult against a cruel thief, Death. Similarly, neither the singer nor the pianist can be classified as genteel: the singer is not given a pretty melody to cradle, but must master rapid dramatic declamation involving extremes of pitch, tempo, and mood; while the pianist must command a technique associated with Chopin and Liszt, both of whom admired Viardot-Garcia’s compositions. Although the musical setting follows the general outlines of Pushkin’s three-verse form, it allows the emotional stance of each verse to dictate the musical drama. The third verse echoes the first in key, mode, and melody, while the second makes use of contrasting material. The second thus presents an image of loving recollection as opposed to the firm resolve of the first and third. Especially effective are the composer’s avoidance of formulaic repetition in the last-line refrain and her dramatic mastery of gradually accumulating chromatic inflections in the accompaniment.  


79 Ibid., 153.


had a preface by Marilyn Horne who for decades had championed the vocal accomplishments of the García sisters.

The most significant repositories of Viardot-García’s compositions in the last twenty-five years can be found in microfilm reels 15 and 16 of the University of Michigan’s *Women Composers Collection*. These reels reproduce sheet music for more than seventy songs, transcriptions, arrangements, dramatic scenes, and operatic choruses of the composer. The disadvantage of the reels, of course, is that most performers have difficulties accessing and reproducing the material.

In 2001, Patrick Waddington, a Turgenev scholar residing in New Zealand, published the first edition of a chronological catalogue of the musical works of Viardot-García. A second revised edition appeared in 2004. Waddington based his meticulous work on the information encoded in the two series of card-indexes (blue and white) of the rich collection of Viardot-García’s scores and manuscripts at the Département de la Musique of the Bibliothèque nationale de France, supplementing it with information

---

82 For a detailed list of the items reproduced in these reels see *Women Composers from the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor: Guide to the Microfilm Collection* (Woodbridge: Research Publications, 1998), 165-9. The guide, however, contains inaccuracies as far as initial dates of publication of several of the compositions; it also attributes one composition by Pauline’s son, Paul Louis Joachim Viardot, to his mother. “Ici-bas tous les lilas meurent” (Paris: Au Ménestrel/Heugel, 1884).


obtained from bibliographies of printed music from the era (e.g. Pazdírek’s *Universal-Handbuch der Musikliteratur* and Carl Friedrich Whistling’s *Handbuch der musikalischen Literatur*), library catalogues from Russia, America, and Great Britain, library stamps on scores, press reviews, and references to the works in the correspondence of the composer and the composer’s friends and colleagues. Thanks to his catalogue a realistic picture of the incipient state of musicological research on Viardot-Garcia’s compositions became evident. As Patrick Waddington stated in the preface to his first edition:

\[ \ldots \text{much remains to be done to situate Pauline Viardot fully in her time as a composer and to assess her relativestature} \ldots \text{my purpose [was] to demonstrate the wealth of material published by Pauline Viardot in her lifetime.} \]

A few American D.M.A. dissertations and M.M. theses on different aspects of Viardot-Garcia’s compositions were written in the 1990s, before students could benefit from the wider perspective provided by the first two editions of Waddington’s chronological catalogue. The most ambitious of these works, Jamée Ard’s “The Songs of Pauline Viardot”

---


86 Waddington, 1st. ed., 3.

Viardot,” still contains valuable and impressive appendices enumerating her songs, operettas, works for piano, transcriptions, arrangements and chamber/ensemble pieces; nevertheless, her fifty-page stylistic discussion of the songs lacks the insight brought by the chronological contextualization of the compositions. For example, she did not realize that many of her earliest works were extremely original, believing that Viardot-Garcia had gained her experience as a composer only after decades of making transcriptions and arrangements of works by others:

As the publication of most of her songs dates from post-1860, it appears that Pauline Viardot, the composer, fully emerged upon her retirement from the stage in 1863 . . . It is interesting to note that Viardot’s earliest creative works were often transcriptions or arrangements of works by other composers (i.e. the mazurkas [performed in 1848], Canzonetta on Haydn’s String Quartet No.17 op. 3 # 5 [published 1845], the collection of chant populaire [a project pursued collaboratively with George Sand, beginning in 1844] and arrangements (Airs Italiens du XVIIIe Siècle [published in 1845]).

A comparison with appendices A and B of the present dissertation shows the inaccuracy in Ard’s estimated dates for the publication of the Canzonetta and Airs Italiens du XVIIIe siècle, which were composed and published in the 1870s and 1880s respectively. Such a miscalculation results in a mistaken assessment of Viardot-Garcia’s earliest compositional accomplishments. Surprisingly, the two D.M.A. dissertations and three M.M. theses published until now fail to discuss the compositions created by Viardot-Garcia before 1864. The present document is the first Ph.D. dissertation dedicated to Viardot-Garcia’s earliest compositions.


89 Ibid., 50-1.
For her authoritative book on women composers in France during the nineteenth century, musicologist Florence Launay inspected and studied in detail the available scores of Viardot-Garcia in Paris’ Bibliothèque nationale and other libraries. Her analysis of Viardot-Garcia’s songs is the first one to formulate a credible framework to understand her stylistic development throughout seventy years of compositional activities. Launay realized that the privileged musical education of Viardot-Garcia, had had its limitations, leaving her insecure about her capabilities as orchestrator and composer of instrumental genres. This, however, did not affect her ability to compose songs with intelligence and originality from the onset of her operatic career:


. . . Pauline Viardot demonstrates from her first publications a great musical knowledge joined to an exceptional talent. The review by Henri Blanchard of the second album [of 1849] puts in evidence the originality of her talent as a composer, when set against the rigid framework of the romance form.

Launay rightfully considered her six years in Baden-Baden as her most productive period, her versatility evident in the collections of Russian songs and German Lieder and in the five French chamber operettas. From Launay’s perspective, the Russian songs, twelve of which were republished in French translation in 1866, could be considered as the first French mélodies by a woman composer:

---

90 Launay, 28.

91 Ibid., 181.
Il faut attendre la fin des années 1860 et le début 1870 pour voir apparaître les premières véritables mélodies écrites par des compositrices [comme Clémence de Grandval et Augusta Holmès]. Leurs pièces furent précédées par les lieder et les mélodies en russe de Pauline Viardot . . . La compositrice manifeste dans ses lieder, une douzaine, en majorité sur de poèmes de Heine, Mörike et Goethe son profond talent d’interprète d’un texte, qui fut éclatant dans sa carrière de cantatrice : elle le met ici au service de la mise en musique d’un poème et le résultat est impressionnant.  

One has to wait until the end of the 1860s and the beginning of the 1870s to witness the appearance of the first mélodies composed by women [such as Clémence de Grandval and Augusta Holmès]. Their pieces were preceded by the German Lieder and the Russian songs of Pauline Viardot . . . In her dozen or so Lieder on poems by Heine, Mörike and Goethe, her profound talent as interpreter of texts, which was extraordinary in her career as a singer, serves to create impressive musical settings for the poetry.

The vocal works which were published in France in the late 1870s, 1880s and 1890s (i.e. numerous independent songs, four collections of mélodies and arrangements of Tuscan songs, eighteenth-century Italian airs, and fifteenth-century French chansons) represent Viardot-Garcia’s best known repertoire today. Rather than considering these works the product of an aging talent, out of touch with the aesthetic and sensibility of the era, Launay praises both her arrangements and mélodies:


93 Launay, 185-6
In 1886, her Six Chansons du XV siècle, published by Heugel, included arrangements of old French and Spanish songs: “Aimez-moi,” “Vous parlez mal de mon ami,” “Chanson de l’infante,” “Le Rossignolet,” “La Dinderindine,” and “Les Trois belles demoiselles.” With these harmonizations, Pauline Viardot placed herself in the avant-garde of the rediscovery and the interpretation of pieces of popular inspiration from the past. Finally, she dedicated herself to the French mélodie. Notably, she offered a setting of prude lyricism of the “Lamento” of Théophile Gautier (Enoch, 1886); another setting of these poem had been dedicated to her by Fauré. . . “Le Vase brisé” on the popular poem of Sully Prudhomme (Miran, 1904) is another example of the subtlety of her harmonic writing.

Even though Launay offers only about ten pages of stylistic discussion on Viardot-Garcia’s compositions, the wide perspective provided by her description of the unknown oeuvre and careers of other French women composers is particularly helpful to assess her relative stature among them.

The most recent and valuable addition to the study of Viardot-Garcia’s songs, however, has not been provided by musicologists, but by the 2011 on-line revised edition of Patrick Waddington’s chronological catalogue of works, this time accompanied by musical incipits compiled by Nicholas G. Žekulin. Apart from being a leading Slavonic literature and language scholar, Žekulin has considerable musical training. In the late

---

94 Launay, 187-8.
1980s, he published a monograph on the sources and genesis of Viardot-Garcia’s most successful operetta, *Le Dernier sorcier*.\(^{95}\) Later on, through his personal efforts and through his study of the work’s manuscript at Harvard University’s Houghton Library, the opera had its first modern production at the University of Calgary in January 2005.\(^{96}\)

Žekulin’s musical *incipits* for the 2011 on-line catalogue will do a great deal to advance the research on Viardot-Garcia’s oeuvre. Scholars can now quickly investigate if a work in one language was published or not in translation in different countries and if a manuscript corresponds to a published work or not. The corrections and additions to the new on-line catalogue make it clear that unknown autographs, published works and arrangements of the composer continue to surface; as a result, a final count and identification system for all of her songs, stage-works, cadences, adaptations, transcriptions, and fragments will still take some time to complete. The on-line format of the present catalogue, however, will permit these ultimate goals to materialize sooner, with scholars being able to communicate to Waddington and Žekulin new discoveries that can be assimilated almost immediately into their electronic document. The on-line catalogue comes at a time when interest among musicians in Viardot-Garcia’s compositional accomplishments seems to have exploded. An indication of this is that, according to Žekulin’s compiled discography, there now exist about forty CDs which

---


include her works,\textsuperscript{97} most of them appearing after Cecilia Bartoli included three of her songs in a CD dedicated to \textit{mélodies} by Ravel, Bizet, and Léo Delibes (1836-1891).\textsuperscript{98} Perhaps the most important among these recordings is Isabel Bayrakdarian’s 2006 CD devoted entirely to songs and arrangements of Viardot-Garcia, which won Canada’s Juno Award for best classical vocal album of 2006.\textsuperscript{99} Bayrakdarian’s nuanced musicality and radiant lyricism has brought a great deal of attention to the composer, in part because of the singer’s recent Metropolitan Opera successes.

**Methodology and Approach**

During the research process—which I began in May 2008—I examined and reproducing numerous manuscripts and first editions of Viardot-Garcia’s songs and vocal arrangements. I inspected Viardot-Garcia’s scores in Harvard University’s Houghton Library, Paris’ Bibliothèque nationale de France and Berlin’s Staatsbibliothek. I also gained access to valuable and in many cases unpublished correspondence of Viardot-Garcia and her contemporaries, particularly in Stockholm’s Nydahl Collection and Harvard’s Houghton Library. My initial purpose was to devise an identification system for her songs, based on Waddington’s 2004 catalogue and my own findings. I soon encountered difficulties. Even though I did manage to assemble copies of much of her vocal oeuvre, important gaps were apparent in my research from the start, which required

\textsuperscript{97} See Žekulin, “Recordings of Pauline Viardot’s Music in the CD Era,” Waddington and Žekulin, 151-3.


more effort, traveling, and time than I could devote prior to the completion of the present dissertation.

Despite the recent cataloguing efforts of Slavonic scholars Patrick Waddington and Nicholas G. Žekulin and musicologists Florence Launay and Beatrix Borchard, a definitive count of the existing vocal compositions of Viardot-Garcia, as we have already stated, remains to be made. Waddington, for example, signals the difficulties of examining songs of Viardot-Garcia still held in private collections in Paris and classifying manuscripts recently sold to private libraries:100

Only by a full and rigorous re-examination of all available resources will it be possible to make a definitive classification of the present bewildering range of Pauline Viardot’s musical productions, distinguishing authoritatively between her original compositions, her adaptations of these, and her arrangements of works by other composers.101

On her seminal book on French women composers, Florence Launay further explains the situation:

100 The most significant collection of manuscripts are those acquired by the Houghton Library, Harvard University (Cambridge, MA) after the death of the husband of Viardot-Garcia’s great-great-granddaughter, Martine Le Cesne. These documents are available for scholarly examination under the title Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (catalogue no. MS Mus 232). A guide of the documents contained in this collection has been prepared by librarians Barbara Wolff and Leslie A. Morris and can be accessed on-line at “Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers: Guide,” Oasis, Harvard University Library, http://oasis.lib.harvard.edu/oasis/deliver/~hou00141 (accessed July 5, 2011).

101 Waddington, 2nd ed., 2.
La production de mélodies de Pauline Viardot présente un véritable casse-tête puisque certains de ses Lieder bénéficieront de traductions en russe ou en française ou allemande, etc. Il est difficile de savoir combien de mélodies elle a effectivement écrit et la notion de style associée à telle ou telle langue d’origine se retrouve totalement brouillée.

The production of mélodies by Pauline Viardot presents a genuine puzzle, since several of her Lieder were translated into Russian, French, German, etc. It is difficult to know how many of the mélodies she actually composed; furthermore, the notion of style associated to this or that original language becomes superfluous in her case.  

So, rather than presenting a flawed inventory of a large amount of Viardot-Garcia’s vocal works, I decided to follow Waddington’s excellent recommendation and dedicate myself to the careful examination of all the known sources for the composer’s songs from 1838 to 1850, in order to establish a documented history of their genesis and stylistic make-up and to formulate an authoritative catalogue raisonné for them.

It will be the contention of this dissertation that, through Viardot-Garcia’s insertion of foreign musical elements into her French romances of the 1830s and 1840s, she contributed in equal measure with composers such as Berlioz, Monpou and Niedermeyer to the stylistic development of this genre into the more flexible and expansive mélodie. I intend to prove that through the popularization of her exotic and exceptional persona on the stage and the publication of her first two song collection, she became influential enough to insert herself in the artistic vanguard which propelled the stylistic shift of the genre. The construction by such leading artistic figures of the era as Sand, Gautier, Musset and Liszt, of Viardot-Garcia’s personality as cosmopolitan, versatile and exotic, qualified her in the eyes of the Romantic generation as a valid

102 Launay, 186.
103 See Appendices C and D of the present dissertation.
representative of the Other and thus, a capable and legitimate creator and transmitter of a wide variety of musical styles. In particular, the consecration of Viardot-Garcia’s complex and fascinating musical personality in George Sand’s influential novel in two parts, Consuelo and La Comtesse de Rudolstadt, determined to a large extent the course and objectives of her early career as singer and composer. I believe that an important key to our understanding of Viardot-Garcia’s varied song styles lies in the novel’s socialist and egalitarian agenda (largely derived from Saint-Simonian principles) and in the privileged quasi-sacred role that it gives to all music, be it operatic, religious, or popular.

A musicological approach which is both analytical and biographical is required to prove the different aspects of my argument:

1) My musical analysis and stylistic contextualization of the works will be structured and detailed, although it will never become so technical as to become inaccessible to a majority of readers with an undergraduate musical education. It will include several transcriptions of previously unpublished musical autographs, literary discussions of Viardot-Garcia’s varied poetic choices for her settings (e.g. works by Ludwig Uhland, Friedrich Christoph Förster, Ambroise Bétourné, Charles d’Orleans, Édouard Turquety, Jean de La Fontaine, and Gustave de Larenaudière, among others), tables relating poetic form and content to the major events in a song’s musical form, tonal and phraseological makeup, and quasi-hermeneutic narratives with musical examples to illustrate the relationship between Viardot-Garcia’s’ compositional techniques and her expressive and aesthetic aims. Stylistic contextualization of the works will be derived from comparisons with other works by the composer and by contemporaries of the era.
2) My biographical approach will, in a sense, be a deconstruction of or intrusion into the current narrative of Viardot-Garcia’s youth and her first decade as a professional singer. Whenever possible, the main focus will be shifted away from her vocal training, from the reaction of her contemporaries to her vocal prowess and artistic intelligence, and from her operatic tours and achievements, and toward her compositional activities and the genesis of several of her songs and song collections. Evidence found in diaries, musical manuscripts, correspondence by Viardot-Garcia and her contemporaries, articles in newspapers, personal journals and other primary source material will be quoted and translated, often for the first time, in English. The idea is to superimpose a new narrative, which projects the image of Viardot-Garcia, the composer. Many of the original sources which will be quoted and discussed have been published in the past but have been overlooked by biographers until now. In a few instances, I bring forth unpublished primary sources to support my arguments. From my perspective, this intense refocusing is necessary to create a new consciousness on the important role that composition played in the professional and personal life of young Viardot-Garcia and to promote interest in the early compositions, which are currently unknown to most scholars and performers.

The dissertation will be organized in the following way: Chapter 2 will present background information essential to contextualize Viardot-Garcia’s early compositional career, which relates to the development of French art song in the 1830s and 1840s and to the musical contributions of the García family. Chapter 3 will be devoted to the earliest biographical evidence of Viardot-Garcia as composer and the sources, genesis and stylistic make-up of several of her first known vocal compositions in German, Italian, and
French. Chapter 4 will explore the intricate personal and artistic relationship between Viardot-Garcia, George Sand and Frédéric Chopin and the effect it had on her activities as a composer. Chapter 5 will present an analytic and stylistic study of *L’Album de Viardot-Garcia*, her first song collection of eight songs published in Paris at the end of 1842. Chapter 6 will explore the consecration of her operatic career through her numerous tours in Russia, England and Germany and the stresses that these tours caused on her compositional activities. Much in the vein of chapter 5, chapter 7 will be dedicated to her second song album of ten songs, *L’Album Viardot de 1850*. A closing *Envoi* will offer the conclusions of the present study and the new scholarly goals it has generated.

Appendices have been designed to supplement the information provided throughout the chapters on specific songs, song collections, and manuscripts composed by Viardot-Garcia. Appendix A provides a general table which includes all the published songs and song collections by the composer from 1838 to 1910. Appendix B includes a table of all her published vocal arrangements and transcriptions for the same period. Appendix C gives a detailed catalogue raisonné of the vocal works completed and published between 1838 and 1850. These tables contain relevant musical information for each composition, including range, tonality, tempo, and meter, and assign, for the first time, a catalogue number to each of them. Appendix D provides a list of the lost vocal compositions for the same time period. Appendix E includes the complete scores for those compositions that are discussed in detail in chapters 3, 5, and 7. Finally, appendix F provides a table listing the extant manuscripts of songs corresponding to the 1838-1850 period, their locations, call numbers, and approximate dates of composition.
CHAPTER 2
ANTECEDENTS: ROMANTIC FRENCH ART SONG
AND THE GARCÍA FAMILY

This chapter provides a context for understanding and appraising the early compositional and singing career of Pauline Viardot-Garcia. The first part discusses and illustrates the aesthetic development of French art song during the 1830s and 1840s, in other words, the period when the young singer began to publish her works in Paris. To illuminate the personal background of Viardot-Garcia’s multifaceted talent, the second subsection of the chapter will be dedicated to the García family, a dynasty of musicians, composers, theoreticians, and pedagogues, who had an influential role in the musical life of the nineteenth century. Both subsections summarize and elaborate on the research of important musicologists in each field, in the case of the first subsection, mainly Frits Noske’s epoch-making *La Mélodie française de Berlioz à Duparc* and David Tunley’s more recent and enriching contribution to the subject-matter, *Salons, Singers and Songs: a Background to Romantic French Song*. In the subsection dedicated to the García family, biographical sketches of Manuel García and his two eldest children by Joaquina Sitchès are mainly based on books and articles by James Radomski, Susan Radomski, April Fitzlyon, and Patrick Waddington. Throughout the chapter, my original scholarly contribution will be found in the form of direct quotations and translations from primary sources, whenever available, and in the selection and stylistic discussion of musical examples to support my arguments.
**Romance into Early Mélodie**

With the unquestionable exception of Hector Berlioz, the arrival of Romanticism to French music was a slow process, propelled, more often than not, by foreign musicians (e.g. Rossini and Meyerbeer in opera; Chopin, Paganini and Liszt in instrumental music). Perhaps in no other genre of music did change of style and taste occur at a slower pace and met with more resistance than in French song. As late as 1846, the music critic Maurice Bourges made the following observations on the state of development of French song (commonly known as *romance*) in comparison to the technical and expressive innovations attained by Romantic poets:

> La strophe libre . . . avec ses vers de mètres mélangés . . . a revécu de nos jours sous la plume de Victor Hugo et son école si fertile en versificateurs adroits. La dynastie des alexandrines, qui ne cessaient a se suivre deux à deux, retombante avec une éternelle uniformité, n’a plus seule tenu le sceptre poétique. L’oreille engourdie par cette résonance continue, s’est éveillé à des rythmes d’une cadence plus neuve . . . l’enjambement . . . a trouvé depuis quelque temps de furieux enthousiastes. . . . La fatigue est telle en musique, à l’endroit du système de carrure en vigueur, qu’un semblable phénomène doit se reproduire infailliblement par une impérieuse loi de réaction.\(^\text{104}\)

The free strophe . . . with its verses based on mixed meters . . . has reemerged in our days through the pen of Victor Hugo and his fertile school of skilled versifiers. The dynasty of alexandrines, which did not cease to follow rank on rank, falling [on us] with eternal uniformity, no longer holds the poetic scepter. The ear, formerly paralyzed by its constant resonance, has been awoken to rhythms of a novel cadence . . . the enjambment . . . has found after some time enthusiastic followers. . . . Such fatigue is similar in music, due to the current system of symmetric paired phrases. A parallel phenomenon [to the one described above] must infallibly take place [in music] by an imperious law of reaction.

\(^{104}\) Maurice Bourges, “Situation mélodique actuelle,” *Revue et gazette musicale de Paris* 13, no. 30 (July 26, 1846), 236.
Bourges clearly signals the dangers of creative sterility in the *romance*, a form of French song that had persistently held to well-established compositional rules for almost one hundred years, among them: the setting of sentimental and formulaic poetry in repetitive strophic forms, simple melodic lines within a limited vocal range, anodyne accompaniments with plain harmonic progressions, and the strict application of the *phrase carrée* principle, which forced all verses into melodic phrases of 4 + 4 measures. Such formulaic principles made the *romance* as a genre accessible to most members of the aristocracy and bourgeoisie and, thus, a commercial success. Apart from a select number of composers with higher artistic goals, for example, Berlioz, Monpou, Niedermeyer, and Félicien David (1810-1876), few creators during the 1830s and 1840s attempted to break these stifling conventions or to set poetry by Romantic poets such as Alfred de Musset, Alphonse Lamartine, or Victor Hugo. There are many reasons why composers of *romances* were slow to effect changes on the genre and to respond to new poetic and aesthetic tendencies. First of all, these formulaic *romances* yielded significant revenues. Furthermore, the composers took nationalistic pride in the genre and respected the tradition in both form and content. Last, but not least, the prosodic problems of setting the new Romantic poetry to music were not negligible.

---

105 Rousseau was probably the first to enumerate the desirable aesthetic qualities when setting to music a poetic *romance*: According to him, a tuneful melody without any type of ornamentation should be a direct musical response to the simplicity of the pastoral situations depicted by the poetry. Harmonic accompaniment, if at all existent, should not be complicated, and all poetic strophes should be set to the same music. Jean-Jacques Rousseau, “Romance,” *Dictionnaire du Musique* (Paris: Chez la Veuve Duchesne, 1767), 427. http://www.archive.org/stream/dictionnairedem00rous#page/426/mode/2up (accessed February 11, 2011).
This is not the place to go into a detailed history of the development of the romance, but it could be useful to understand the conditions under which the majority of the poetry and music for this type of song was produced. Romances were extremely popular during the 1820s, 30s, and 40s. Composers à la mode, who today are almost completely forgotten, among them Loïsa Puget, Pauline Duchambge, Louis Abade, Antoine Romagnesi (1781-1850), Albert Grisar (1808-1879), Frédéric Bérat (1801-1855), and Paul Henrion (1819-1901), together with their poets (known as paroliers) were paid large sums by publishing houses to produce songs as fast as possible. These songs were then interpreted in fashionable Parisian salons either by the composer or by a famous singer of the day. Towards the end of the year, editorial houses collected the most successful romances of the season and published them in large albums. In 1840, for example, no less than thirteen of these volumes were published by different musical magazines and editorial houses. One of the most popular romances of the decade was “Ma Normandie,” by the modest parolier and composer from Rouen, Frédéric Bérat.

Throughout the 1840s this simple nationalistic composition, clearly created for the

---

106 Fits Noske makes a detailed study of the stylistic development of the romance during the first half of the nineteenth century in the first chapter of his book La mélodie française, 4-10. An elaboration on Noske’s arguments with an excellent contextualization of the romance in the Parisian salons of the July Monarchy can be found in chapters 4 through 7 of David Tunley, Salons, Singers and Songs: a Background to Romantic French Song (Burlington, Vermont: Ashgate, 2002).

107 “Les éditeurs . . . paient 500 fr. une romance, et jusqu’à 6000 fr. une collection de six romances d’un compositeur en vogue, qui les chante lui-même ou les confie à des interprètes tels que mesdemoiselles d’Hénin, Drouard, etc. . . .” / “Editors . . . pay up to five hundred francs for a romance and almost six thousand francs for a collection of six romances from a fashionable composer, who sings them himself or entrusts them to interprets such as Mesdemoiselles d’Hénin, Drouard, etc. . . .” Jacques-Auguste Delaire, Histoire de la Romance considerée comme ouvre littéraire et musicale (Paris : Ducossois, 1845), 22. http://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k54429565 (accessed January 5, 2011).

108 Noske, La mélodie française, 8.
pleasure of amateurs, sold more than 3000 copies. Example 2.1 reproduces the opening bars of the song:

Example 2.1. Frédéric Bérat, “Ma Normandie,” mm. 1-12.

Under such strenuous conditions of commercial production, it is small wonder that both mediocre composers and paroliers remained closely attached to the models that they had inherited from the past. Many paroliers favored sentimental subject-matter brimming with artificial emotion and created poems containing strictly-measured verses, preconceived rhyming schemes and a standardized number of strophes. Composers
would then invariably employ melodic phrases arranged symmetrically (known, a previously stated, as phrases carrées), which corresponded exactly to one line of the poem, and would then proceed to set each poetic strophe to exactly the same music.

Rigid strophic settings can create severe problems in musical prosody, since the tonic accentuation of modern French words and phrases tends to be unstable, subtle, and very often variable, even in strictly measured poetry. As a result, in many of these strophic romances, the rhythmic structure of the melodic phrases corresponds more or less to the proper accentuation of the words in the first strophe, but is generally off for all subsequent ones. The effect of careless prosody is often highlighted by a bland and repetitive piano accompaniment.

The combination of these practices often had negative results for the romance’s artistic quality. The author of an article published in *La Revue et gazette musicale* complained:

> On sait que ces messieurs travaillent à la vapeur . . . [ses] mots . . . n’ont pas d’idées. . . . Nous connaissons telle compositeur à qui tel auteur a envoyé à la fois cent romances ou chansonnettes; cela s’appelle une féconde stérilité.

One knows that these men work as fast as possible . . . their words . . . have no ideas. . . . We know of a composer who sent to an author one hundred romances or chansonettes at once; that is what one calls sterile fecundity.

---


The case of Loïsa Puget serves well to illustrate the type of song favored by the bourgeoisie and the aristocracy during the 1830s and 1840s. Mademoiselle Puget became a fashionable interpreter in Parisian salons around 1832, when she was in her early twenties. A blond beauty who had taken composition and piano lessons with Adolphe Adam (1803-1856), she was not only a proficient and prolific composer of romances, but a model of virtue for the young daughters of the social classes which she entertained. She was also a clever entrepreneur, who published her numerous albums of songs in several editorial houses, including Launer, Troupenas, Petit, and Janet et Cotelle. Specialized musical periodicals such as La Revue et gazette musicale (and its two predecessors, La Revue musicale and La Gazette musicale de Paris), Le Ménestrel, and Le Monde musical publicized and praised many of her concerts and albums, including those published in collaboration with other famous composer/interpreters of the day, for example Antoine Romagnesi and Laure Cinti-Damoreau (1801-1863):

Mademoiselle Loïsa Puget possède à fond la science et la théorie de l’album; elle est toujours la providence, la reine de ce genre de musique... Loïsa Puget s’est fait elle-même le commis-voyageur de ses œuvres légères et gracieuses; elle les chante fort bien... avec beaucoup de tact, de finesse et d’esprit; elle a fait connaître enfin et valoir sa personne, de sa présence et de sa voix...


112 Henri Blanchard, “Albums,” La Revue et gazette musicale de Paris 70, no. 70 (December 22, 1839), 562.
Miss Loisa Puget completely possesses the science and theory of the album; she remains the guide, the queen of this genre of music. Loïsa Puget has made herself the ambassador of her light and gracious works; she sings them very well with much tact, delicacy, and spirit; as a result, she is known and valued as a person, presence and voice.

Titles such as “Le Bon curé patience,” “Une députation de demoiselles,” “À La Grâce de Dieu,” “La Priere au St. Bernard,” and “La Voix tendre” must have reassured buyers of Puget’s works that there could be nothing offensive in the lyrics employed in the songs. Indeed, her close collaborator and future husband, poet Gustave Lemoine, provided her with a steady stream of bland, stereotyped poetry, which suited to perfection the conservative moral and religious standards of the bourgeoisie and was far removed from the Romantic excesses of Hugo and Lamartine. Puget complemented these lyrics with charming and undemanding melodic lines and competent but simple accompaniments, thus rendering her songs easily accessible to the daughters of the bourgeoisie and the aristocracy. Her forms were invariably strophic, generally with one poetic strophe corresponding to recurring musical material, immediately followed by a poetic/musical refrain. Three or four poetic strophes with their corresponding refrains would thus be presented to the same musical strophe (i.e. couplet). The beginning of the first musical couplet of “La Voix tendre” (1843) is presented in Example 2.2. Here the poetic/musical persona tries in vain to forget the sweet voice of the beloved, whom s/he last heard at a ball. The repetitive, but charming vocal line is supported by a fashionable waltz-like accompaniment:

---


114 Ibid., 175.
Competent and pleasant, the song perpetuates the aesthetic canons of the salon *romance* of the era. Musicologist Florence Launay makes the following observations about Puget’s style:
Malgré son talent, elle n’a pas su se renouveler. Elle a produit des centaines de romances de qualité mais dont la forme restait immuable. Surtout . . . elle était limitée dans le choix de ses sujets. . . . Son succès populaire et son adéquation parfaite à un goût « moyen » ont fait de Loïsa Puget la cible des pourfendeurs de la médiocrité culturelle de la société bourgeoise.  

Despite her talent, she did not know how to renew herself. She produced hundreds of romances of quality, but their form was immutable. Moreover . . . she remained limited in her choice of subject matter. . . . Her popular success and her perfect compliance to the ‘average’ taste of the era made her the target of those who criticized the cultural mediocrity of bourgeois society.

Indeed, most songs produced by women composers during the July Monarchy “—just as with women themselves—were supposed to be attractive but not pretentious, seductive but not corrupting, morally upright but not moralizing, pleasing but not serious.” The numerous romances of Pauline Duchambge and those of Laure Cinti-Damoreau, for instance, also appear to conform to these paradigms.

Not all women of the era, however, seemed pleased with such limited artistic objectives. George Sand commented with deliberate severity on the personality and vocal works of Puget:


116 Pekacz, 53.

117 Launay, 172-3.
Pretty as an angel, full of funny retorts, she knew how to get everyone to spoil her. I believe that she also spoiled herself, her facile mind being content with superficial ideas. With utter spontaneity, she produced things that were consistently gay, joyously rhythmical, clear in tonality and perfectly natural. These qualities transported them well beyond the vulgarities of the genre. But I . . . knew that she had much more in her than she had produced.  

Viardot-Garcia commented indirectly on Puget’s choice of lyrics:

“I love you because I love you,” says the romance of Mlle. Puget . . .

This laconic statement often has its weight, but, to sum up, it is a quite a sad argument.

Other women composers were also unconvinced by the imposed credo of the commercial romance. The composer and virtuoso pianist Louise Farrenc (1804-1875)—like Viardot-Garcia a student of Bohemian music theorist, pedagogue, and composer Anton Reicha (1770-1836)—succeeded in avoiding the romance altogether and concentrated on composing symphonies, string quartets, instrumental chamber works and numerous piano compositions, and, though not a trained composer, the pianist Hélène Robert-Mazel, treated unconventional subject matter in her song collections and attempted to imitate German Romantic music in her somewhat deficient ballades and mélodies.  

As we shall see in the course of this dissertation, Viardot-Garcia’s highly


accomplished early songs and song collections unwittingly challenged the stereotyped expectations of contemporaries on the compositional abilities of women.

Musicologists with an interest in the development of French art song, such as Carol Kimball, Frits Noske and David Tunley, identify two main factors which greatly contributed to the emergence of the *mélodie* as a distinct genre during the 1830s and 1840s: the publication and diffusion of Schubert’s Lieder in Paris and the pressing desire of some composers to set to music the works of Romantic poets. Six Lieder of Schubert were published in translation by the music editor Simon Richault in 1833. The success of the songs was such that over the next fifteen years, Richault would publish 361 more of them. One of the first interpreters of Schubert’s Lieder was French tenor Adolphe Nourrit (1802-1839), who together with Franz Liszt, presented them in translated versions in concerts and salons in Paris, Marseille, and Lyon between 1835 and 1837. Schubert’s Lieder, through their rich formal variety, synthetic text setting, harmonic complexity, and virtuosic accompaniments, showed French composers the endless artistic possibilities of Romantic song in the hands of a master. Even minor composers such as Henri Reber (1807-1876), Victor Massé (1822-1884), and Ernest

---

120 Launay, 178-9.

121 Noske, 20. Berlioz is generally credited with being the first to consistently employ the term *mélodie* to refer to his art songs. The term had been in circulation from the early 1820s, although it often referred to songs of a popular character. Parisian publishers of Schubert’s songs referred to them as *mélodies*. Henceforth, the term would be employed to refer to an expressive song that closely mirrored its vocal line and accompaniment the meaning of the poetry.


124 Noske, 23. Normally the songs would be presented in French translations of dubious quality.
Reyer (1823-1909) produced *mélodies* in the 1840s which imitated to a certain degree the musical language of Schubert.\(^{125}\)

The lyrics of Schubert’s Lieder also inspired composers less formulaic poems. The free style of French Romantic poetry would provide the initial challenge in the 1830s and 1840s to composers such as Berlioz, Niedermeyer, and Monpou. Each of them would come up with contrasting solutions to the prosodic problems generated by Romantic free verse. In 1830, for example, Monpou published his first *romance*, an unconventional response to de Musset’s sensual “L’Andalouse.” Because of this popular but controversial song and other unconventional settings of Romantic poetry (e.g. de Musset’s “Le Lever” and Hugo’s “Guitare”), Monpou soon became known as *l’enfant terrible* of French salons.\(^{126}\) Many of his musical settings are characterized by rhythmic vigor, sudden metric changes and unconventional phrase lengths (often created through the musical elision of poetic verses and/or the insertion of a musical silence in the middle of one of them). In “L’Andalouse” such resources serve well to illuminate the passionate and unpredictable nature of the poetic persona’s lover. The propulsion created by the bolero rhythm in the accompaniment and by the curious syncopation and accentuation of the vocal phrases is somewhat undermined by the lack of harmonic variety, a


\(^{126}\) Pekacz, 52. When “L’Andalouse” was sang in salons, performers would not only edit their rendition (i.e. substituting verses such as “Une Andalouse au sein bruni” for “Une Andalouse au teint bruni” and so on), but the audience would censor itself. Mothers, for example, sent their virginal daughters out of the room.
compositional weakness which Monpou perhaps could have conquered if he had lived longer. The opening phrases of the song are reproduced in Example 2.3:


Unconnected to Monpou, a handful of foreign composers were also making their first strides in the setting of French Romantic poetry. As early as 1821, the Swiss composer Louis Niedermeyer, a close friend of Rossini, had created an expansive and rather operatic setting of Alphonse de Lamartine’s “Le Lac.” The song contains two distinct musical sections; the first one, marked Maestoso, is similar to a dramatic

127 For a detailed discussion of Monpou’s musical innovations and style see Tunley, 73-7.
measured recitative, while the second one, marked Andante and Romance, resembles an unornamented strophic cavatina. The opening phrases of this ambitious and virtuosic composition are reproduced in Example 2.4. Here, fast, shimmering water-figures in the accompaniment join a vocal line in which the text is delivered at a slow pace within a reduced melodic range. The combination serves to illustrate beautifully Lamartine’s evocative verses:

“Le Lac” was published in 1824 by the editorial house Pacini; it was much admired by Parisian audiences and established the composer’s reputation in the city. Niedermeyer would continue setting the large-scale poetry of Lamartine, extrapolating and adapting for this purpose musical elements from both the Italian operatic tradition and the German Romantic ballad. Foreign composers such as Liszt and Wagner also approached the poetry of Victor Hugo, Alfred de Musset, Alexandre Dumas, and even Pierre de Ronsard producing fine examples of formally and harmonically expanded French art song. Their influence at this stage of development in the genre, however, seems to have been limited, since most of their French works were not published in Paris during the 1830s or 1840s.

Berlioz was probably the most influential composer of early French mélodies during the July Monarchy. From his earliest experimental settings of Romantic poetry, his works were characterized by originality and fluidity of style. In 1832, while visiting the mountains of Subiaco, he set “La Captive,” a poem which formed part of Hugo’s influential collection Les Orientales (1829). The work was published that same year in two versions, one for voice and piano and the other with an ad libitum cello part. Berlioz could not resist the challenge of fitting the work’s unstable harmonies and longing vocal phrases to a variety of orchestral colors and textures. His first orchestral version dates from 1834, but surely the best known one was prepared in 1848 for a London concert where Viardot-Garcia sang under the composer’s baton. This last expanded version includes contrasting musical strophes which are a radical departure from the song’s

128 “Le Lac” became one of the most justifiably celebrated songs of the century . . . [it] was published in various arrangements from mandolin to military band.” Tunley, Salons, Singers and Songs, 84.

129 Ibid., 86.
original strophic setting. The first *couplet* of the original 1832 version is reproduced in 
Example 2.5:

Berlioz’s collection Les Nuits d’été, initially completed in 1841, employs lyrics of the Romantic poet Théophile Gautier (1811-1872). In this collection of six songs, which throughout the 1840s and 1850s underwent a series of transpositions and arrangements, Berlioz demonstrates his full command of the traditional romance, through his subtle application of varied strophic repetition in the vocal line to achieve accurate prosody (i.e. “Villanelle”) and in the accompaniment, often giving the sensation of through-composed forms (i.e. “L’Île inconnue”). Through-composed, rondo and ternary forms can be found in songs such as “Le Spectre de la rose,” “Au Cimetière” and “Absence” respectively. Berlioz’s debt to German Lieder is perhaps not as direct as in the case of composers such as Niedermeyer or Liszt; it can be sensed, however, in his sensitive treatment of the poetic text and in his desire to create a close correlation between music and poetic message. The chamber-music quality found in many of Schubert’s songs, on the other hand, is absent from Les Nuits d’été, since “the piano accompaniment is awkward at times, and the character of the songs calls for the rich and varied colors that Berlioz draws from instrumental sources.” The collection as a whole exemplifies the elusive transitional phase, linking the traditional romance to the more sophisticated mélodie. Against this stylistic backdrop, Pauline made her initial contribution to the genre in 1838.

The García Dynasty: A Displaced Clan of Singers, Composers, and Pedagogues

Manuel del Pópulo Vicente Rodríguez—who as a young man adopted the second last name of his paternal grandfather, García—laid, through his international career as

---

130 See Kimball, Song, 157.

131 Ibid., 159.
tenor, composer, pedagogue, and impresario, the foundations of this extraordinary
musical family of Andalusian origins. García was born in Seville in 1775, where he
trained in counterpoint, harmony, and instrumental and vocal performance until his mid-
teens, under the guidance of Juan Antonio Ripa (1721-1795), *maestro de capilla* of the
city’s cathedral, and Juan Almarcha, keyboardist and cellist at San Salvador, one of the
collegiate churches of the city. Contrary to myths, which later circulated among
contemporaries and even his own family, he had no direct Gypsy, Moorish or Jewish
extraction; instead, he was the son of a humble Catholic shoemaker and his wife. It seems
that throughout his life, García wished to forget his simple beginnings and fabricated (or
at least did not dismiss) some of the fanciful stories which circulated about his origins.
These were later parroted in early memoirs on the tenor and in the oral tradition passed
on by his children and grandchildren.¹³² James Radomski’s finely researched
biography,¹³³ published only ten years ago, does much to dispel erroneous information on
García’s origins and professional life. The even more recent revivals and publications of
several of García’s operas and songs, through the joint efforts of Spanish orchestral
director Juan de Udaeta, the Centro de Documentación Musical de Andalucía and the
Instituto Complutense de Ciencias Músicales of Madrid (ICCMU),¹³⁴ have contributed to

¹³² For distortions on García’s origins, see, for example, José Joaquín de Mora, “Manuel
García” in *No me olvides* (London: Ackerman, 1825), Paulin Richard, “Notes biographiques sur
Manuel Garcia,” *La Revue musicale* 12, no. 22 (June 30, 1832), 171-4, and Louise Héritte de la


¹³⁴ To date the following critical editions of García’s works have been published by the
ICCMU within the *Música Hispana* collection: *Canciones y Caprichos Líricos*, series C, no. 1,
de Udaeta (Iberoautor/ICCMU, 2007), *La mort du Tasse*, series A, no. 75, ed. Juan de Udaeta
(Iberoautor/ICCMU, 2008), *Il Califfo di Bagdad*, series A, no. 77, ed. Alberto Blancafort (Madrid:
bring forth the oeuvre of this versatile composer to the attention of performers, 
musicologists and the public at large. In 2006, James Radomski in collaboration with his 
sister Susan Radomski, a vocal pedagogue specializing in the bel canto era, published 
one of García’s chamber operas. They plan to edit several other of the composer’s 
chamber operas in the upcoming years. The following pages, which trace the life and 
professional accomplishments of the tenor and composer, are mostly a summary of James 
Radomski’s biography. The musical commentaries and observations on his compositions, 
however, are my own.

In 1791, García left his hometown of Seville for the port of Cádiz, a liberal, rich 
city, which boasted Spain’s most impressive public theatre, the Teatro Principal, a venue 
specializing in Italian opera. Apart from having the opportunity to listen to the latest 
operatic styles, García premiered as theatrical singer in the city in sainetes and tonadillas, 
intermezzi-like compositions which mixed the popular dances and songs of Seville (e.g. 
boleros, seguidillas, tiranas, and fandangos) with simple Italianate arias, duets, and trios. 
In 1797, he secretly married Manuela Morales, a dancer of boleros who was related to a 
fairly successful theatrical family. After García forcefully extracted from her parents a 
significant dowry, the couple moved to Madrid, where they joined, as ninth galán and 
fourth dama, a company performing tonadillas, sainetes, and other theatrical pieces at the 
Teatro de la Cruz. It was for this theatrical company, that García created his first lyrical 
composition in 1798, a tonadilla a dúo entitled La maja y el majo. This limited 
composition, revolving around a typical eighteenth-century plot of flirtation, brawling,
plotting, and reconciliation, consists of four musical numbers for a male and female singer and reduced orchestral forces interspersed with dialogue. The overall musical treatment is simple; the singers’ melodic lines, however, exhibit florid melismas, an element which would come to characterize García’s singing and which imitate the ornamental turns found in many of the popular cantos of the gypsies in Andalusia. One can find such turns in the second section of the opening duet, reproduced below as Example 2.6:

Example 2.6. Manuel García, Opening Duet, “Soy la maja más remaja”/“En viendo a mi Gregoria,” La maja y el majo, mm. 85-88.136

During the ten years which followed the initial performances of La maja y el majo, García’s compositional style developed slowly. At the same time, his reputation as tenor

136 Musical extract reproduced from Manuel García, La maja y el majo, La declaración, Quien porfía mucho alcanza, El poeta calculista, ed. Juan de Udaeta (Madrid: Iberaut/ICCMU, 2008), 11.
grew. That García wished to raise the level of the popular *tonadilla* cannot to be doubted. He expressed this in a letter sent to an important patron of the theatrical arts, the Marquis of Astorga, during a visit to Malaga in 1800:

I have learned that Your Excellency, protecting our national culture, has in mind to foster the development of operas in the Spanish language, I have entered upon desires of serving as an instrument for such a worthy purpose, aspiring rather to the honor of working under the auspices of Your Lordship than for my own purpose or convenience.\(^{137}\)

García did not lack imported French and Italian operatic models to study during these years. In May 1802, for example, he sang the part of Count Almaviva (presumably with some parts transposed) in Madrid’s premiere of Mozart’s *Le Nozze di Figaro* at the Teatro de Los Caños. Henceforth, he was to become an avid promoter of Mozart’s operas. Until 1807, he composed at least seven operettas in one act,\(^{138}\) some of which became extremely popular in Madrid, particularly *Quien porfía mucho alcanza* (1802), *El criado fingido* (1804), and *El poeta calculista* (1805). This last work, a buffo operetta in monologue is designed to highlight the acting and singing abilities of its composer. *El poeta calculista* combines Italian operatic numbers (e.g. an instrumental overture and several interludes, grand arias with *recitativi accompagnati*, and a feigned duo, where the tenor with much virtuosity employs falsetto singing to imitate the voice of a soprano as “she” responds to his pleas) with stylized recreations of Andalusian popular dance and song (i.e. *coplas de bolero*, *jaleo*, and *seguidilla*). The plot, which curiously seems to foresee García’s own meteoric career, traces the imaginary journey of the main character

\(^{137}\) Letter of Manuel García to Marqués de Astorga, Málaga, November 29, 1800, quoted in Radomski, *Manuel García*, 34.

\(^{138}\) See Appendix I “Works for the Stage,” Ibid., 307-10.
from provincial copyist to first poet of the court in Madrid. The protagonist is a fake lyricist, who inherits all his verses from a dead master. He connives his triumph in the capital city through the presentation of increasingly complex theatrical works: first short *tonadillas* and *sainetes*, then a long comedy and a grand tragedy in long verses, and finally a grand opera. The study of the libretto of this buffo operetta, perhaps penned by a certain Diego del Castillo, is particularly profitable to our understanding of the social, theatrical, and artistic milieu of Madrid at the beginning of the nineteenth century.

The overture—consisting of a slow introduction followed by a sonata-allegro form without a development section—shows the influence of Mozart in its more sophisticated employment of the orchestral forces (especially the woodwinds), its seamless modulatory process, and the contrasting character of its two thematic areas (i.e. short syncopated rhythmic figures played by the strings for the first theme vs. long legato lines sustained by the woodwinds for the second one). A section of the exposition’s bridge area is reproduced in Example 2.7:
“Yo que soy contrabandista” is one of the airs of *El poeta calculista*. The music, in 3/8 meter and an *Allegretto poco* tempo, is a forceful recreation of an Andalusian *jaleo*, a

---

139 Musical extract reproduced from Manuel García, *La maja y el majo, La declaración, Quien porfía mucho alcanza, El poeta calculista*, ed. Juan de Udaeta, 212.
type of passionate song/dance of the gypsies associated with the polo and the caña.  

The principal character gives the following description of the song:

[Para el sainete] que [el actor] cante a lo gitano y que alborote el gallinero. ¿Qué le pondré? ¿Una tirana?...No, no...¿Un polo?... Aún no me acuerdo. ¿Como se dice? ¿Una caña? Tampoco. Será un jaleo, que siendo cosa andaluza gustará y aunque contemplo que música en un sainete no es muy del caso, ya vemos que a muchos se les agrega.

[For the sainete] [the actor] should sing gypsy style to excite the chickens in the coop. How should I name [the piece]? A tirana? … No, no…A polo? I am not remembering well. How is it called? A caña? Not really. It shall be a jaleo, which being an Andalusian piece will be much liked and even though I really do not envision music in a sainete, we know that many have this addition.

The song describes the getaway of a dashing smuggler, who gallops away from a group of enraged soldiers on his fearless steed. A phrase from this stylized jaleo is reproduced in Example 2.8:

---

140 For a discussion of the different palos or genres of gypsy/flamenco music, see chapter 7 of the present dissertation.

141 Manuel García, La maja y el majo, La declaración, Quien porfía mucho alcanza, El poeta calculista, 312.

---

Throughout the composition, García integrates melodic elements of the Phrygian mode (lowered second and sixth scale degrees) to tonal shifts between E major and C major. This creates an exotic clash of sonorities in the score which, together with the composition’s motoric rhythmic energy, must have indeed excited the audiences of Madrid. When this operetta was premiered by García at the Théâtre de l’Odéon two years later, the Parisian public was startled. After all, as music critic and historian François-Joseph Fétis (1784-1871) claimed in his biographical note on the tenor and composer, it was the first time that authentic Spanish music had been heard on the Parisian stage.¹⁴³ The exotic theme and musical elements of “Yo que soy contrabandista” so caught the imagination of early French Romantics that this jaleo was published independently several times and continued to be interpreted on and off the stage for many decades.¹⁴⁴ It also inspired several compositions and literary works. Victor Hugo, for example, quoted it and used it as a symbolic call for freedom in his first novel, Bug-Jargal.¹⁴⁵ In 1836, Liszt—who had become a good friend of García in the late 1820s—composed and published a Rondeau fantastique sur une thème espagnol-El contrabandista, S. 252. A year later George Sand would write for the Gazette et Revue Musicale a histoire lyrique entitled Le Contrebandier. In Germany, the poet Emmanuel Geibel freely translated García’s lyrics, which Schumann then set as “Der Kontrabandiste,” Spanisches Liederspiel, Op. 74, Anhang. Its influence, perhaps, can still be felt in the colorful setting


¹⁴⁴ Manuel García’s two daughters, María and Pauline, would often interpret it during the lesson scene of Rossini’s Il barbiere di Siviglia.

of the third act of Bizet’s *Carmen*, where the famed gypsy, escaping from her torrid relationship with Don José, joins a group of free-spirited smugglers.

Soon after *El poeta calculista* was premiered in Madrid, Manuel García decided to leave Spain. Perhaps he felt constrained by the limited possibilities of artistic growth within the country, low standards of both instrumentalists and singers, and constant economic and administrative troubles as composer and artistic director of two theatrical companies. His reasons for departing might also have been more personal. Around 1803, he had begun a love affair with a widowed comic actress, María Joaquina Sitchès (1780-1854), who had adopted the artistic name of Joaquina Briones. By 1805, she had given birth to a son and García was ready to separate from his wife Manuela Morales, with whom he already had two daughters. In early 1807, shortly before the beginning of the invasion of the country by the Napoleonic troops, García abandoned Manuela and her two children and departed with Joaquina to seek fortune in Paris. He would never meet his wife again. In March 1808, a second child was born to the illicit lovers, now passing themselves as a married couple.

The first months in the French capital were not easy. Fortunately, García was soon employed by the company of the Opera Buffa to perform for the 1808-1809 season. He premiered in Ferdinando Paër’s *Griselda* and shortly afterwards presented himself in Mozart’s *Le nozze di Figaro* and in his own *El poeta calculista*. Although he was repeatedly criticized by the French press for his tendency to over-embellish and for the

---

146 The son was christened Manuel Patricio Rodríguez García (1805-1906) and would one day be the inventor of the laryngoscope and one of the most famed voice teachers of the nineteenth century.

147 Marie Félicité García (1808-1836), called by her parents María Felicia and later known across Europe as la Malibran was destined to become one of the greatest singers of the Romantic generation.
smallness of his voice, his charismatic personality, extreme flexibility, musical precision, and spontaneous virtuosity were very much admired and very soon he became a favorite singer among the audience of the Odéon. Shortly after Spontini was appointed director of the Opera Buffa in February 1810, García, who detested the composer, decided to leave Paris with his family and try his luck in Italy. He could not have picked a more auspicious time to make the trip.

The Garcíases remained in the Italian peninsula for five years (1811-1816). Around 1812, García commenced, perhaps for the first time in his life, formal lessons in vocal technique with the tenor Giovanni Anzani, then a famed vocal pedagogue. Anzani was a disciple and possibly a student of Nicola Porpora, who had taught such famous castrati as Farinelli and Cafarelli. It seems that García benefited much from his studies with Anzani. At the very least, he developed an instrument with a greater range and a more resonant tone; this, in turn, gave him the ability to project into larger spaces. From Anzani and his appearances in operatic houses in Turin and Naples (where he sang operas by, among others, Mayr, Gluck, Mozart, and Paër), García also seems to have developed a sensitive understanding of the bel canto style. He composed two Italian operas for the San Carlo: a successful buffo style work, *Il califfo di Bagdad* (1813) and *Tella e Dallaton, o sia La donzella di Raab* (1814), a quickly-composed sentimental drama in two acts, which was badly received by audiences in Naples. In both these works, García appeared next to his compatriot, the popular mezzo soprano and future wife of Gioachino Rossini, Isabella Colbran (1785-1845).

In 1815, when Rossini traveled to Naples and was introduced by the administration of the San Carlo to both Colbran and García, he decided to create for their voice types and florid singing style the serious opera *Elisabetta, regina d’Inghilterra*. This commenced a fruitful collaboration between the three artists which culminated with the premiere of *Il barbiere di Siviglia* at Rome’s Teatro di Torre Argentina on February 20, 1816, on which occasion García created the role of Count Almaviva. The collaboration did not continue at the time, however; a few months later, the singer decided to accept an offer extended by the Théâtre Italien to become first tenor of the company. Here he presented the Parisian premiere of *Il califfo di Bagdad* in May 1817.

The work was reviewed with enthusiasm by both the French and German presses

> [García has] arrived [to] a purity, originality, and clarity of ideas, as well as [to] the truly unusual accomplishment of being able to express himself in [a] highly artistic manner. These are qualities which, in this quantity, one might only expect from a man of métier. Normally, such a well-developed talent presumes great practical study. This, however, is not the case with Herr García . . . [who] as one of the most practiced of Europe’s singers, has had no spare time to be able to sacrifice more than a wink of the eye to the art of sitting. . . . [E]ven if we are not talking about a Mozartian genius in this work, yet . . . one notes a highly sober—and in no way coarse—expression, imposing originality, with very fortunate inventions which are not paired with anything bizarre. However, I will not deny that in the course of the whole work, many reminiscences are found. . . . [T]he composer dared in this work to make an innovation which has been attempted in Italy . . . he has the dialogue spoken and not sung in *recitativo*.  

The critic Georg Ludwig Peter Sievers, who hoped in vain to bring García’s opera to Germany, noted the influence of Mozart in it. This is not surprising, considering that by then the tenor had repeatedly sung (in Italian) major roles in *The Magic Flute, Così fan

---

tutte, and Le nozze di Figaro, thus having the chance of carefully studying and memorizing these scores.\textsuperscript{150} That he had intentions of being received both as tenor and composer in France is attested by the fact that in December 1817, García premiered at the Opéra-Comique his first French work, Le Prince d’occasion, a work which might have been even more successful if García had performed in it.\textsuperscript{151}

Ever restless, García signed at the beginning of 1818, a one-year contract with London’s King’s Theatre. There he performed as Count Almaviva both in Mozart’s Le nozze di Figaro and in the London premiere of Rossini’s Il barbiere di Siviglia. A new role, which marked his full artistic and vocal maturity, was Sesto in Mozart’s La clemenza di Tito. Although he was often criticized by the press for his exuberant acting and florid improvisations, they nevertheless recognized in him an excellent musician and a tenor of great vocal prowess.\textsuperscript{152} They might have also perceived in his passionate character, liberal ideas, and indomitable spirit, something new: the full force and individuality of the Romantic artist.

His return to Paris from 1819 to 1823 marked the peak of his singing and compositional career. Not only did he introduce Parisian audiences at the end of 1819 to Il barbiere di Siviglia, but, during the next two years, he accomplished considerable feats. To begin with, he presented himself in the title role of Mozart’s Don Giovanni at the Opéra Italien on October 1820. Although García required several numbers to be

\textsuperscript{150} His “innovation” of substituting recitative for dialogue in Italian opera, probably came both from his knowledge of the tonadilla tradition and Mozart’s The Magic Flute.

\textsuperscript{151} Throughout his career, García never accepted to sing roles in French, German, or English. Both his daughters, however, acquired these skills at a very early age.

\textsuperscript{152} See Radomski, 136.
transposed a tone or two upwards, his impressive stage presence and vocalism, succeeded in endearing this hitherto unperformed masterpiece to members of the Romantic generation. Shortly after this historic revival, García spent two months recovering from wounds provoked by the explosion of a pressure cooker in his home. During this period of rest, he took the opportunity to compose his most ambitious operatic work, *La mort du Tasse, a tragédie lyrique* in three acts. The work was premiered at the Paris Opéra on February 7, 1821. The title role was not sung by García, but by the tenor Louis Nourrit.153

In *Tasse*, the Spanish composer was able to demonstrate his flexible understanding of the stylistic elements which characterized the French operatic school as exemplified in the works of Gluck and Cherubini:

> The complete lack of concessions to vocal ornamentation and improvisation in *Tasso*, as characteristic of a very defined style, is the first distinctive feature of this work . . . French opera taste was very far from empty displays of virtuosity, unrelated to the intimate poetic expression of the text. . . . Everything in *Tasso* . . . co-exists without the sensation of overly predictable moulds of traditional “formula” harmony . . . typical of many operas imported from Italy. . . . [T]he music flows in constant movement without the ear barely being able to predict the harmonic pattern lying behind the music. . . . The poetic action and the music form a concatenation of uninterrupted musical moments in the French style, that is, without numerical separation between the different parts of the work . . . 154

Although the libretto by Jean-Guillaume-Antoine Cuvelier and Joseph Helitas is not accurate in its depiction of the last days of Torquato Tasso (1544-1595), it does capture

---

153 Louis Nourrit (1780-1832) was both a leading tenor at the Paris Opéra and a diamond merchant. At the time of the premiere of *La Mort du Tasse*, his son, Adolphe (1802-1839), began taking voice lessons with García; Adolphe Nourrit became the Spanish tenor’s most renowned and successful voice student (after García’s own children, of course).

the tormented, mercurial, and querulous spirit of the Renaissance poet. García was able to bring dramatic depth to his musical characterization of the author of *La Gerusalemme liberata*—often through the emulation of earlier models, but sometimes with true originality. The overture, for example, with its movement from a tragic *Andantino* in D minor to a brilliant but volatile *Allegro vivace* in D major, recalls the employment of these same shifts in tonality, mood, and tempo to portray the two contrasting aspects of Don Giovanni’s personality (i.e. demoniac vs. gay and hedonistic) in Mozart’s opera. García, of course, had portrayed the Don for the first time only four months prior to the premiere of *La Mort du Tasse*. In García’s overture the two contrasting areas could be understood as musical portrayals of two differing elements in the poet’s personality: his depressive and fatalistic side versus his bold artistry and secret love for Princess Leonor of Ferrara. The opening measures of the overture are reproduced in Example 2.9:
In Act II, Tasso—imprisoned by his rival Ferdinand, who rules Ferrara in place of Princess Leonor’s brother, the kind Duke Alfonso II d’Este—suffers a delirium during a visit by the prison’s governor and his beloved. The delirium is also witnessed by guards and ladies-in-waiting, who constitute a choir in García’s score. The frenzied madness of

---

Tasso is portrayed by the full orchestra through the employment of repetitive, obsessive rhythms, accentuated *forte* dynamics and chromatic instability. A brief extract of this rare example of a Romantic mad scene for tenor is presented in Example 2.10:

Example 2.10. Manuel García, Act I, Scene II, *La Mort du Tasse*, mm. 148-152.\(^{156}\)

Throughout the spring of 1821, *La Mort du Tasse* was repeatedly presented at the Opéra. On June 1821, García appeared next to soprano Giuditta Pasta (1797-1865) in the Parisian premiere of Rossini’s *Otello*. García’s vocalism and acting provoked an absolute sensation; decades after the tenor’s death in 1832, the public would still remember him not only as a fearsome Don Giovanni but as the ideal moor of Venice. A portrait of García in that role, reproduced as Figure 2.1, gives the reader a sense of his theatrical magnetism and charisma:

Figure 2.1. “García, role d’Otello,” Litograph, c. 1821, courtesy of Gallica Database, Bibliothèque nationale de France.
For months *Otello* was presented at the Théâtre Italien. It was in the midst of García’s most successful year as tenor and composer that his last child, Pauline, was born.\(^{157}\)

In 1821 and 1822, García composed two more French operas, *La Meunière* and *Florestan*. These works were hastily composed, however, and were not successful. At the end of 1822, after suffering from vocal indisposition for several months,\(^{158}\) García attempted to initiate a musical society in Paris, *Le Cercle de la rue de Richelieu*. Here lessons, soirées, and score-reading sessions were to be organized. His plans were viewed with suspicion by the authorities, and García, who at the time was also in a delicate political position due to his links with Spanish liberalism, decided to emigrate with his family to London. In 1824, he opened a voice academy for both amateurs and professionals in that city and published his *Exercises and Method for Singing*. Although the method is brief, it gives a close representation of his musical imagination and *bel canto* technique:

Towards the end [of the method] he gives examples of possibilities for embellishing a single line. What is most important to keep in mind is that these are examples of García’s *improvisatory* skills. Merely to sing these lines with precision would be impressive in itself for a tenor in any age. But for García to have such a command of the *music* that he could improvise these sorts of lines on the spot, according to inspiration or according to vocal condition, was a mark of genius.\(^{159}\)

---

\(^{157}\) She was born on July 18, 1821 and was christened Michelle Ferdinande Pauline Garcia (1821-1910). Her godparents were the Italian composer Ferdinando Paer and the princess Pauline Galitsin.

\(^{158}\) Authors such as Fétis and Radomski believe that this indisposition was the first sign of García’s vocal decline. It is very possible that the repeated singing of such taxing roles as Don Giovanni and Otello in combination with the strains of sustaining a reputation as a composer provoked his malaise. See Radomski, 154.

\(^{159}\) Ibid., 170-1.
After a quarrel with the management of the King’s Theatre, García decided to emigrate with his family to the New World at the end of 1825. A New York merchant had offered him the venture capital to initiate the first Italian opera company in the United States. With his usual and somewhat reckless resourcefulness, García decided to employ his own children as part of the singing company. Young Manuel would perform as baritone and María, then but seventeen, would tackle the prima donna roles. In New York, under extremely unfavorable conditions, García not only directed but performed in the first presentations of Italian opera in the country. The operas of Rossini (i.e. Otello, Il barbiere, La Cenerentola, Tancredi, and Il turco in Italia), Giuletta e Romeo by the teacher of Bellini, Rossi, and Mercadante, Niccolò Antonio Zingarelli (1752-1837), and two new Italian works by García (i.e. L’amante astuto and La figlia dell’aria) constituted the principal fare of the company. It was at this time that García befriended Lorenzo da Ponte (1749-1838), then teaching Italian at Columbia College, who urged him to present Mozart’s Don Giovanni for New York audiences. García remained in that city until late 1826, when he decided to travel to Mexico City in the hopes of establishing his family permanently there. He would remain in Mexico for three years, initiating a highly profitable Italian operatic company. In 1827 and 1828 he created at least three comic operas, El Abufar ossia La famiglia araba, Un ora di matrimonio and Zemira ed Azor, and two semi-serious works Semiramis and Don Chischiote. After a long debate in the press about the value or triviality of keeping librettos in their original language, García yielded to pressure and translated several of Rossini’s operas and his own works to Spanish. He also created a few operas in his native language, including Xaira, El gitano

160 His daughter María, who in New York had precipitately married a French businessman twenty-eight years her senior named Francois Eugene Malibran, remained behind.
*por amor* and *Los maridos solteros*. Ultimately, low musical standards, anti-Spanish sentiment and political turmoil drove García and his family out of the newly formed country.\(^{161}\) At the end of 1827, an edict of expulsion which applied to all Spanish citizens was issued by the Mexican authorities. Yet García’s company was so popular that he lingered in the capital for several months. In November 1828, nevertheless, he joined a convoy of about five hundred Spaniards, who began their long and difficult exodus towards the port of Veracruz in the Gulf of Mexico. The Mexican government had hired a security escort to lead the group safely to their destination;\(^{162}\) unfortunately, towards the end of the trip, the escort turned against the Spaniards and robbed them of all their worldly goods. García lost almost all of his New World earnings during this turbulent incident.

Impoverished, the Garcías reached Paris during the summer of 1829. Although the tenor made appearances as Almaviva and Don Giovanni at the Théâtre Italien during the fall of that year, it was evident to both the public and the critics that his voice was all but gone. As a result, García decided to dedicate himself fully to pedagogy. For the last two years of his life, he maintained an active voice academy for which he composed several salon operas.

The tenor and composer died suddenly on June 10, 1832 and was buried at Père Lachaise two days later. Many distinguished artists, music lovers, and friends attended the funeral.

---

\(^{161}\) Mexico had gained its independence from Spain on September 27, 1821, through the signing of the treaty of Córdoba. Spain, however, would not recognize its former colony’s independence until 1836 under the treaty of Santa María-Calatrava.

\(^{162}\) During the nineteenth century, the Mexico City-Veracruz route, also known as the Camino Real, was as famous for its difficult roads and bad weather as for its groups of bandits. Although there is only about five hundred kilometers between both cities, a normal trip at the time would have taken about one month.
the funeral, including Paulin Richard—García’s student and first biographer—the critics François-Joseph Fétis and François-Henri-Joseph Blaze, known as Castil-Blaze (1784-1857), and the musical editor Eugène-Théodore Troupenas (1799-1850). In their speeches, soon afterwards published in *La Revue musicale*, all praised his prodigious talent as singer, musician, and pedagogue. Fétis made a particular point of emphasizing his gifts as composer:

> Des melodies heureuses, et le sentiment le plus profond de l’harmonie, voilà ce qu’on remarque dans ses productions, ou plutôt ce qu’il y a mis et ce qui n’est pas assez connu, car le plus grand nombre de ses ouvrages, et sans contredit les meilleurs, sont restés inédits.

Fortunate melodies, and the most profound feeling for harmony—that is what one sees in his works, or rather, that which is there but is not sufficiently known, for the greatest number of these works, and without a doubt the best, remain unpublished.\(^{163}\)

Although some of García’s most relevant operas and songs have been brought into the attention of the public in the last ten years through the editorial efforts of ICCMU and the performances and recordings of Juan de Udaeta, today the majority of his numerous manuscripts linger in libraries in Spain, France, Italy and the United States. The catalogue of his known works, prepared by James Radomski,\(^ {164}\) gives the reader a clear idea of the monumental editorial task ahead: More than fifty operas in Italian, Spanish, and French, ten sacred works including five masses, more than twenty orchestral arias, several choral works including incidental music for the theatre, collections of Spanish songs with piano

\(^{163}\) François-Joseph Fétis, “Morte et Funérailles de Manuel Garcia,” *La Revue musicale* VI, no. 20 (June 16, 1832), 159, quoted and translated in Radomski, 291.

\(^{164}\) Radomski, Appendices I-IV, 307-21.
and guitar accompaniments, collections of French romances, two symphonies, and a few chamber works and piano sonatas.

The historical importance of García as a founding figure of musical Romanticism in France is crucial to our understanding of his influence:

[Virtuosity] was an important part of Romanticism—particularly in Paris where García flourished. And the virtuosity of the nineteenth century was distinct, imbued with a superhuman, almost mystical fire. García’s artistry was of this sort, and he played, in the vocal sphere, a role akin to that of Paganini in the instrumental. . . . Indeed, at the height of his career, in the 1820s, García was nearly the personification of Romanticism. His electrifying performances of Otello (Rossini) and Don Giovanni created a furo among the dilettanti of Paris. And although this spirit was carried on to even greater heights by his daughters, María Malibran and Pauline Viardot, the seeds were planted by García.¹⁶⁵

García’s Andalusian roots formed an integral part of his exotic allure among Romantics:

Andalusi embodied everything that enlightened France was not and which it envied while despising. García’s artistry was imbued with the mystery of Spain, where the drama between the past and the present, between life and death, between faith and reason was so vivid and alluring. Although he left Seville at an early age, the cathedrals, the universities, the religious processions, the bullfights, the gypsies, all left their mark on García’s character, and neither he nor his audiences would forget it.¹⁶⁶

It is important to note that virtuosity, genius, and exoticism were precisely the three alluring pillars on which his two daughters, María and Pauline, built their cosmopolitan operatic careers. The eldest, María delicia García (1808-1836), known universally to her contemporaries as la Malibran, would become the personification of

¹⁶⁵ Ibid., 2

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., 2-3.
the Romantic prima donna. Almost as if certain of her untimely death, she rushed—during the decade encompassed by her career—through the stages of England, America, France, Belgium and Italy with a superhuman energy, which she undoubtedly inherited from her father. She had a repertoire which included about forty operatic roles, mostly from the principal works of Rossini, Donizetti, and Bellini, but also operas which were specifically written for her by composers such as Michael William Balfe (1808-1870), Carlo Coccia (1782-1873), Fromental Halévy (1799-1862), Giovanni Pacini (1796-1867), Giuseppe Persiani (1799-1869), Lauro Rossi (1810-1885) and Nicola Vaccai (1790-1848). She had an unusually extended range of almost three octaves (E below middle C to high C), exceptional breath control and, like her father, the ability to realize and improvise long coloratura passages with extreme flexibility. It is fascinating that her sizable mezzo soprano voice with silvery high notes, a beautiful and powerful middle register, and dark, velvety low notes approached a bel canto repertoire which today is often associated with the soprano voice (e.g. the principal roles in Bellini’s Norma and La Sonnambula and Donizetti’s L’Elisir d’amore and Maria Stuarda).\footnote{For a full discussion of María’s voice and roles see Martin Heimgartner, “Recreating a Legendary Voice from the Music Scores,” , in accompanying booklet to Vincenzo Bellini, Felix Mendelssohn, et al., María, sung by Cecilia Bartoli with Orchestra La Scintilla conducted by Adam Fischer, London/DECCA 000999002, Compact Disc, 2007.}

Such a conundrum has led a few well-known twentieth-century mezzo sopranos to tackle her roles and try to recreate her vocalism, particularly Marilyn Horne.\footnote{In the late 1960s and 1970s, Horne appeared in and recorded many of the Rossini, Donizetti, Bellini, and Meyerbeer operas that made famous both María and her sister Pauline. In 1968, she also released an album dedicated to the García sisters, see Gioachino Rossini, Gaetano Donizetti, et al. Souvenir of a Golden Era: The Garcia Sisters, voice Marilyn Horne, conductor Henry Lewis, Suisse Romande Orchestra, DECCA 001078902, 2008, compact disc, (original vinyl recording, 1968).} More recently,
Cecilia Bartoli has interpreted with Orchestra La Scintilla many of the arias and songs which made la Malibran famous. Bartoli has based her interpretation in the careful study of original scores employed by the famed singer and other relevant historical and musical documents (i.e. transpositions made by her contemporaries, press reviews of the time, personal accounts, letters, and portraits). The result is a CD released by London/DECCA, which employs early nineteenth-century instrumentation and an orchestral tuning pitch of 430 Hz.\footnote{Vincenzo Bellini, Felix Mendelssohn, et al., María, sung by Cecilia Bartoli with Orchestra La Scintilla conducted by Adam Fischer, London/DECCA 000999002, Compact Disc, 2007.} In this recording, Bartoli gives convincing interpretations of “soprano” arias from Bellini’s La Sonnambula and Norma.

Unlike the case of Manuel García père, biographies of la Malibran are numerous. The initial one was a lengthy volume written by María de las Mercedes Santa Cruz y Montalvo (1789-1852), also known, because of her marriage to a French general, as La Comtesse de Merlin.\footnote{María Mercedes Merlin, Souvenirs et mémoires de Mme. La Comtesse Merlin, 4 vols. (Paris : Charpentier, 1838). Extracts from this autobiography were shortly afterwards published in Madame Malibran (Brussels: Société Typographique Belge, 1838). In the 1840s they were translated to English and published in England and the U.S.A.} A student of Manuel García and a close friend and protector of María, the detailed memoirs of this Cuban writer on la Malibran served as basis for many subsequent biographies and articles devoted to her in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.\footnote{See, for example, Jules Bertrand, La Malibran, anecdotes par J. B. (Paris: Petite Journal, 1864), Clément Lanquine, La Malibran (Paris: Louis-Michaud, 1910), P. Larinoff and F. Pestellini, Maria Malibran e i suoi tempi (Florence: Marzocco, 1943), Suzanne Desternes and Henriette Chandezet, La Malibran et Pauline Viardot (Paris: Fayard, 1969), and Carmen de Reparaz, Maria Malibran, la diva romantique (Paris: Perrin, 1979).} More recently, researchers April Fitzlyon and Patrick Barbier have gathered formerly unknown primary sources and written two excellent monographs on the
singer. The following summary of her life and career is mostly extrapolated from Barbier’s volume on the diva. Once again, the musical analysis of her compositions is my own.

During her childhood, María constantly moved around, following the many moves of Manuel García through France, Italy and England. Her principal music teacher was his father, who submitted the young girl to six years of solfège and counterpoint. In her teens, she complemented her early musical training by studying theory with Auguste Mathieu Panseron (1797-1859), a composer and voice teacher at the Conservatoire who had studied with both Salieri and Cherubini, and piano with Louis Joseph Ferdinand Hérold (1791-1833), a keyboard virtuoso and composer who had studied with Méhul and Louis Adam. In the meantime, García was determined to make out of her youthful, limited voice, an extraordinary vehicle of expression. A strict instructor with his children Manuel and María, García was not beyond using intimidation and physical violence. La Comtesse de Merlin remembered:

One evening María and I were practicing a duet into which García had introduced some embellishments. María, who was then about fourteen years of age, was vainly endeavoring to execute a certain passage, and at last uttered the words “I cannot.” In an instant the Andalusian blood of her father rose. He fixed his large eyes sternly upon her and said, “Did I hear aright?” In another instant she sang the passage perfectly. When we were alone, I expressed surprise at this. “O!” cried she, clasping her hands with emotion, “such is the effect of an angry look from my father, that I am sure it would make me jump from the roof of the house without hurting myself.”

---


173 Maria Mercedes Merlin et al., *Memoirs of Maria Malibran and Other Intimate Friends*, vol. 1 (London: Henry Colburn, 1840), 4-5.
García was convinced that María’s voice and strong, but somewhat wayward, personality could only be trained with an iron will. He must have recognized himself in the mirror of his young daughter. His method and stern discipline later permitted María to tackle successfully the most difficult musical tasks, even under inauspicious circumstances. He, nevertheless, must have left a scar on his daughter’s personality.

Her theatrical debut in Rossini’s *Barbiere* took place in London’s King Theatre in June 1825. A few months later, she was singing as prima donna in her father’s operatic company in New York. The 1826-1827 winter season there was extremely beneficial for her artistic development; before an inexperienced but sympathetic audience, she was able to perfect her interpretations of Rossinian roles such as Desdemona, Rosina, Angelina, Tancredi, Zaida and Semiramis. Soon she had obtained many admirers, among them an apparently rich French merchant based in Philadelphia named François Eugène Malibran, who, after some hesitations, asked her to be his wife. The teenage girl agreed very quickly to marry the forty-five-year-old bachelor. Was she perhaps attempting to escape the heavy yoke of her father’s discipline and the many difficulties and sacrifices of the theatrical stage? It seems that Manuel García acceded to part from his daughter, firstly, because he was convinced of the good intentions of Malibran and secondly, because he was promised by the suitor an eventual payment of 100,000 francs for the economic loss of María’s talent to his company.¹⁷⁴ Two days after her eighteenth birthday, on March 26, 1826, the beautiful singer became Madame Malibran in New York. Half a year later, García with the rest of his family and operatic company, departed towards Mexico City, leaving María to face the consequences of her impetuous marriage.

¹⁷⁴ For a detailed account of María’s marriage to Malibran see Barbier, *La Malibran*, 35-48.
Very soon Malibran’s business went bankrupt and María was forced to reappear on the stages of Philadelphia and New York in concerts and productions of English operettas. Nineteen months after the marriage contract was sealed, María parted without her husband to France. Her intention was to initiate a European operatic career which would allow her to rescue Malibrán from his many debts; she was to live in the Parisian household of her sisters-in-law, who would strictly survey her progress and behavior.

In the first months of 1828, María became reacquainted with the musical society of her childhood. Through the protection of her old friend, La Comtesse de Merlin, she was introduced to the most fashionable artistic salons of her day, which in turn opened opportunities to perform in larger venues. On April 8, she performed in Rossini’s *Semiramide* for the first time at the Théâtre Italien in a memorable evening. For three seasons, she drove audiences to a frenzy, particularly in her incarnation of Rossini’s Desdemona. Several artists made portraits of her in this role, in which she incarnated to perfection the ideal of the Romantic heroine—delicate, innocent, adoring and victimized by circumstances. Figure 2.2 reproduces one of her most beautiful portraits as Desdemona:
But María’s personality, as she grew financially independent and emotionally estranged from her husband, was developing far from these ideals. On the stage, she was impetuous and resourceful and often astonished her audiences by passionate and spontaneous gestures. Off it, she was perfectly capable of hard-bargaining the highest possible fees with any opera company. She possessed also great physical resilience. In a single day, she could horseback ride, rehearse for hours, perform an opera, sing at a salon, and dine and dance with her friends\textsuperscript{175} until the early hours of the morning. She was profligate.

\textsuperscript{175} María befriended some of the greatest artistic personalities of the Romantic period, including the writers Alphonse de Lamartine, George Sand, and Alfred de Musset, the painter.
with her substantial winnings, although she could also be extremely generous, singing often, for example, benefit performances for fellow artists in disgrace. All this could be accepted, even admired, by her contemporaries, but what they could not forgive was her open amorous relationship with virtuoso Belgian violinist Charles-Auguste de Bériot (1802-1870), whom she met around 1829. Pregnant with their first child, at the beginning of 1832, the doors of the Théâtre Italien and all fashionable Parisian salons were closed to her. When the baby died shortly after her birth, María and de Bériot decided to seek their fortune outside of France. Together they traveled to cities such as Naples, Rome, London, Milan and Venice. Wherever María presented herself, she attained fanatical admiration.

Unrestrained applause, friendships in the highest circles, glittering parties, Eugene Delacroix and Italian and French composers, including Gioachino Rossini, Gaetano Donizetti, Vincenzo Bellini, and Hector Berlioz.

176 Less than a year later, on February 1833, María gave birth in Brussels to her only living son, Charles Wilfrid de Bériot (1833-1914). He would become a pianist and composer. See Barbier, 161.

177 The following paragraph gives the reader an idea of María’s hectic and convoluted schedule during the last three years of her life: “She made her Italian début at the Teatro Valle, Rome, on 30 June 1832 as Desdemona; moving to Naples she sang the same role at the Teatro del Fondo on 6 August and Rosina in Il barbiere di Siviglia at the San Carlo on 7 September, followed by La Cenerentola, La gazza ladra, Semiramide and Otello, scoring a tremendous success at every performance. In Bologna she sang Romeo in I Capuleti e i Montecchi on 13 October, substituting the final scene of Vaccay’s Giulietta e Romeo for that of Bellini. In May 1833 at Drury Lane she sang La sonnambula in English; it was so successful that it later transferred to Covent Garden. She returned to the San Carlo, Naples, in November 1833, singing her usual Rossini and Bellini roles, as well as operas by Pacini and Coccia. She sang Norma on 23 February 1834 in Naples, and repeated it at La Scala on 15 May. She visited Venice early in 1835, singing Desdemona and Norma at La Fenice. On 8 April she gave one performance of La sonnambula at the Teatro Emeronitio, which was in dire financial straits, raising enough money to guarantee the future of the theatre, renamed Teatro Malibran. In May she sang Amina and Leonore in Fidelio in English at Covent Garden, then in September returned to La Scala. New roles included Vaccay’s Romeo and the title role of his Giovanna Grey, which she created on 23 February 1836. She also created the title role in Donizetti’s Maria Stuarda on 30 December 1835, causing a famous scandal by ignoring some changes that the Milanese censors had insisted upon. Bellini adapted the role of Elvira in I puritani (1835, Paris) for her to sing in Naples, but the opera was turned down by the management and she never sang it.” Elizabeth Forbes, “Maria Malibran,” in Grove Music Online, ed. L. Macy,
and extravagant gifts were the common fare of her daily life. When she needed rest, which did not seem to happen often enough, she would go to Ixelles, where she and de Bériot had built a magnificent hôtel. In March 1835, after five years of fighting the French civil tribunals, she obtained a divorce from Eugène Malibran. After waiting the regulatory months established by French law to marry again, she wed de Bériot in Paris in March 1836.

It is surprising that with her tight schedule of role preparation, performances and social gatherings, she had the energy to compose. She wrote approximately fifty songs, mostly employing French texts by minor poets such as Ambroise Bétourné (1795-1838), Émile Deschamps (1791-1871), Sylvian Blot, and Alex Duponchel. During her lifetime and the first years after her death, about half of these works were published in France, Germany, Belgium, Italy, England, and the United States. The two most significant publications are her first collection of 1830 or 1831, entitled Album lyrique (Paris: Troupenas, n.d.) and her posthumous album, Dernières pensées musicales (Paris: Troupenas, 1837).178

María’s songs bear subtitles such as “Tyrolienne,” “nocturne,” “ballade,” and “chansonette,” which exemplify some of the subtypes of romances à la mode in the bourgeois salons of the 1830s. As Charlotte Greenspan explains:


178 Both of these collections were re published in the 1980s. See María Malibran, Album lyrique and Dernières pensées, ed. Charlotte Greenspan (New York: Da Capo, 1984).
The songs are a gazetteer of romantic geography, with settings in the Tyrol, Venice, Scotland, and Spain; they are populated with bandits and fiancées of bandits . . . minstrels and pages, soldiers and sailors. But the texts deal more in gentle sentiments and melancholy than in passion.\footnote{Charlotte Greenspan, “Introduction,” to Ibid., V.}

Many of these romances were composed for practical purposes, mainly for her numerous performances in salons and concerts. “Addio a Nice,” with lyrics by Metastasio, for example, was sung during her last appearances in Italy in 1835 and served as a worthy tribute to the devotion of her public. The opening measures of this work dedicated to Rossini are presented in Example 2.11:

Example 2.11. María Malibran, “Addio a Nice,” \textit{Dernièr\textquotesingle es pensees musicales}, mm. 1-29.
In its phrase construction, obsessive repetition of text, and chromatic modulation from tonic to inflected mediant (i.e. A minor to C minor), which takes place in the last system of the first page, this dramatic piece shows more kinship to a cabaletta of Donizetti or Bellini than to a simple canzonetta. Typical bel canto ornamentation is employed later on in the song.

The Italianate style of “Addio a Nice” is characteristic of many of María’s works. Her lyrical melodies require a voice with great extension and flexibility. Her simple accompaniments, equally suited to be played by piano, harp or guitar, go hand in hand with an impulsive treatment of a sophisticated harmonic palette, which includes diminished seventh chords, major-minor inflections, and modulations to the mediant and submediant keys. Some of her works have infectious rhythmic and melodic momentum, which communicates well the restless personality and fabulous virtuosity of the singer/composer. The song “Rataplan” from her Album lyrique has an onomatopoeic title, suggesting the sounds of a military drum roll. Its breathless refrain, reproduced in Example 2.12, includes tongue-twisting repetition of nonsensical syllables and a percussive trill vocalized on an “r”:
Example 2.12. María Malibran, “Rataplan”/Chansonnette, Album lyrique, mm. 1-35.
María’s romances possess charm, sensitivity, and a disarming improvised spontaneity. They were admired by contemporary composers such as Bellini and Berlioz. Among them are first-rate examples of the Romantic romance. Unlike her father and younger sister, however, María had no ambitions of becoming a leading force in the stylistic development of this or any other musical genre.

Her tragic death at age twenty-eight sealed her legendary status among Romantic writers and musicians. Only weeks after her marriage to de Bériot, María, in the early stages of a new pregnancy, was singing at Covent Garden. On July 5—during one of her morning rides at Regent’s Park with her friend Lord William Lenox—she fell from an agitated purebred horse, hitting her head hard against the ground. Hiding the accident from her husband, she continued performing and tried to ignore the growth of a subdural hematoma on her temple and the terrible, paralyzing headaches it provoked. Very soon she knew her fate was sealed, but only confessed it to her good friend Eugène Troupenas and her fifteen-year-old sister, Pauline. Reflecting that her songs would be the only direct testament of her musical talent, she beseeched her editor:

*Mon cher ami, vous me ferez un grand plaisir si vous pouvez réunir dans une nouvelle édition toutes mes romances et les autres mélodies que vous avez eu la bonté d'imprimer... Je chante encore pour ces Anglais avec ma meilleure volonté, mais ma voix s’en va ; elle est finie pour moi... je ne veux en aucun cas mourir avant de revoir Paris, cette grand ville qui m’a donne les premières preuves d’affection qui m’ont attendri le cœur.*

---

180 See Hector Berlioz, “Dernières pensées musicales de Marie Félicité Garcia de Bériot,” *Revue et gazette musicale de Paris* 4, no. 27 (July 2, 1837), 228-9.

My dear friend, you would give me great pleasure, if you could gather in a new edition all my *romances* and other songs which you have so kindly published [in the past]. . . . I continue singing for these English with my best will, but my voice leaves me; all is finished for me . . . In any case, I do not wish to die without having seen Paris again, the great city which gave me the first proofs of affection which stirred my heart.

María performed in Brussels during the second part of July. In August, while she rested in her new countryside property at Roissy-en-Brie, she composed, for what she knew by now would be her posthumous collection of songs, one last song with words by Antonio M. Pellegrino Benelli, “La Morte.”

A few weeks later, she traveled to Manchester where she sang her last concert on September 14. During the encores, she performed brilliant improvisations on *L’Andronico* of Mercadante and then fainted behind the curtains. For the next nine days, she suffered in terrible agony, only to expire, to the surprise and horror of her contemporaries, on September 23, 1836. Shortly after her death, Alphonse de Lamartine wrote the following heartfelt verses, which can be read now at her mausoleum in Laekan, Belgium:

\[Beauté, génie, amour furent son nom de femme
Ecrit dans son regard, dans son cœur, dans sa voix ;
Sous trois formes au ciel appartenait cette âme,
Pleurez, terre, et vous, cieux, accueillez-la trois fois!\]

---

182 The opening verses of Maria’s last song read: “Ton, Ton, chi batte là? Ton, Ton, sono la morte. / Ei camariere hei presto olà apri alla morte.” She dedicated the song to her close friend, the bass Luigi Lablanche. Troupenas would use this composition and its translation to French to close Maria’s posthumous album.
118

Beauty, genius, love were her woman’s name
Written in her face, in her heart, in her voice;
In three ways, this soul belonged to heaven,
Cry, earth and thou, heaven, receive her thrice!

The fate of Manuel Patricio Rodríguez García, the oldest brother of María, was certainly less glamorous, but perhaps preferable. He had an unsuccessful career as an operatic singer yet enjoyed sixty profitable years as voice teacher in the Paris Conservatory (1835-1848) and London’s Royal Academy of Music (c. 1850-1895). Early on, he showed scientific inclinations, which led him to conduct anatomical experiments on the dissected windpipes of chickens, bulls, and sheep. He also had the opportunity of studying the physiology of the human larynx during his military service at French hospitals in Algiers in the early 1830s. In 1854, he invented with two mirrors a rudimentary laryngoscope, which allowed him to observe his own vocal tract. This simple apparatus permitted García fils to view a phonating human larynx for the first time in history. He recalled the moment of discovery in the following terms:

---

183 Teresa Radomski, “Manuel García (1805-1906): A Bicentenary Reflection,” *Australian Voice* 11 (2006), 26-7. He debuted as Figaro, next to her father and sister, in Rossini’s *Il barbiere di Siviglia* in New York’s Park Theatre in late 1825. He soon added other baritone roles such as *Don Giovanni*’s Leporello and *Otello*’s Iago. During the Gracias’ three-year visit to Mexico, he often substituted his father in tenor roles, which quickly caused strain to his upper register. In 1828, he traveled to Italy in the hopes of retraining as tenor. Impressed by the dramatic bass Luigi Lablanche, he also attempted to add volume to his voice. His debut at the Théâtre Italien as Figaro in Rossini’s *Il barbiere* in 1829 was a failure. García fils retired from the professional stage after this performance.
I placed against the uvula [a little dentist’s] mirror [with a long handle] which I had heated in warm water and carefully dried, then flashing upon its surface with a hand mirror a ray of sunlight. I saw at once to my great joy, the glottis open before me and so fully exposed that I could perceive a portion of the trachea. When my excitement had subsided, I began to examine what was passing before my eyes. The glottis silently opening and shutting and moving in action and phonation filled me with wonder and admiration. . .

García’s observations of the vibrating vocal folds confirmed his idea of these being the sole source of tone during both speech and singing. Figure 2.3 shows the position of the two mirrors and the direction of the light as García held them to see his vocal folds:

Figure 2.3. García viewing his own larynx, ink drawing, c. 1860.

The discovery of the laryngoscope had importance not only for the development of a singing method based on the physiology of the human voice, but also for medicine. In the hands of doctors such as Ludwig Türck (1810-1868) and Jan Nepomuk Czermak (1828-1873), the laryngoscope became a sophisticated piece of equipment, essential for the

---


diagnosis of a variety of pathological laryngeal conditions. The first school of laryngology was founded in Vienna only a few years after García’s discovery in the 1860s.\textsuperscript{186}

His many writings include a \textit{Mémoire sur la voix humaine}, which he presented to the Académie des Sciences in 1841 and his detailed \textit{Traité complet de l’art du chant}, a work in two volumes, which was published in Paris in 1840 and 1847 and subsequently translated to Italian and English. In this treatise, he amalgamated the empirical \textit{bel canto} technique of his father with his own scientific discoveries, making the García school the first modern pedagogical method for singing. García’s conclusions on the function of the vocal apparatus while singing are presented in both his \textit{Mémoire sur la voix humaine} and in the first part of his treatise. His most important observations and conclusions are summarized below: 1) The vocal cords are the source of all tone, 2) the neat articulation of the glottis (i.e. prephonatory setting of the vocal folds) or \textit{coup de la glotte} is the basis for precise intonation, 3) basic “bright” or “veiled” tonal quality depends on the level of approximation of the cords as they vibrate, 3) by its contractions, the tube (i.e. vocal tract) modifies the brilliancy and volume (i.e. timbre) of the initial sound generated by the glottal source, 4) a low larynx and high soft palate produces a dark, closed (i.e. \textit{sombre}) timbre, a high larynx and low soft palate produce a clear, bright (i.e. \textit{clair}) sonority, these are the two opposites of a spectrum of vocal hues from which the singer must learn how to create a round, ringing and flexible tone, 5) mechanical principles (i.e. adjustments in

\textsuperscript{186} The medical community always remained grateful to García fils for his discovery, making him an honorary doctor and celebrating in a gala event his one hundredth birthday. The ceremony included the presence of King Edward VII and the unveiling of a portrait made by John Singer Sargent. Malcolm Sterling Mackinlay, \textit{García: The Centenarian and His Time} (New York: Da Capo Press, 1976), 316.
the arytenoids, thyroarytenoid muscles, and laryngeal position) create three distinct registers in female and male voices: the chest, falsetto (medium), and head.\footnote{See Manuel García, \textit{A Complete Treatise on the Art of Singing} I, ed. Donald V. Paschke (New York: Da Capo Press, 1984).}

According to García fils, it was possible to make the transition imperceptible among the registers through a series of exercises (e.g. alteration of a single pitch between chest and falsetto, ascending and descending grupetti passing through a problematic area, etc.) designed to encourage the “pinch of the glottis” (i.e. increased vocal cord adduction) at transitional areas. García’s numerous and complicated exercises throughout his treatise are meant to develop the voice’s flexibility, agility and expressive resources (i.e. articulation, ornamentation, dynamic and timbre variety, etc). In the final part of the treatise, García’s passion for preserving the empirical bel canto tradition he learned from his father becomes apparent. An example of García’s painstaking approach to attain technical perfection can be seen in his scalar exercises to develop the chromatic trill, one of several types of this ornament which he identifies and exemplifies. This excersise is reproduced in Figure 2.4:
Figure 2.4. Manuel García, *Trattato completo dell’arte del canto* (Milan: Ricordi, 1998), 59.
García’s pupils included historical figures such as Jenny Lind (1820-1887), Julius Stockhausen (1826-1906), Mathilde Marchesi (1821-1913), and Erminia Frezzolini (1818-1884). These famous students became teachers in their own turn, preserving the method of the García family well into the twentieth century. The famous Prussian mezzo soprano Mathilde Marchesi, for example, taught in Cologne, Vienna, and Paris and trained the remarkable voices of, among others, Nellie Melba (1861-1931), Mary Garden (1874-1967), and Emma Eames (1865-1952).

While García’s two-part treatise—together with several of his other writings—is available in several languages in modern reprints, there exists only one biography of the pedagogue and theoretician, which was published by one of his most devoted students in 1908. Teresa Radomski’s brilliant article on García fils remains to date the best researched study of his life, discoveries, and pedagogical method.

The third generation of the García clan also produced several fine musicians and composers. Of the children of Manuel García fils, one achieved true distinction: Gustave García (1837-1925) was a fine dramatic baritone, who wrote three books on vocal and stage techniques. The only living son of María Malibran, Charles Wilfrid de Bériot (1833-1914), was a fine pianist and composer who taught at the École Niedermayer and the Paris Conservatoire. His pupils included Maurice Ravel, Enrique Granados, and

---


Ricardo Viñes. Additionally, he composed several works, including four piano concertos.

Finally, two of the four children of Pauline Viardot-Garcia enjoyed musical recognition. The oldest, Louise Héritte-Viardot (1841-1918), was a talented singer, pianist and composer who taught in Sweden and Russia. As a child she received musical guidance from Camille Saint-Saëns, Charles Gounod, and her mother, but she was largely an autodidact in composition. Sadly, many of her works are now lost. There remain three piano quartets, several Lieder, and an opera-comique, *Lindoro*, which was composed for Weimar in 1879. Her autobiography is a fascinating, if somewhat unreliable, source of information on the García clan.\(^{191}\) The youngest son of Pauline, Paul Viardot (1857-1941), became a violinist and musicologist. A pupil of Charles de Bériot and Hubert Leonard at the Brussels Conservatoire, during his youth he toured extensively, both inside and outside of Europe. He composed two sonatas and several virtuosic numbers for the violin.

The fourth and fifth generations of the clan also produced professional interpreters and pedagogues, although none achieving the fame of Manuel García and his children. A comprehensive study on the Garcías’ impact on twentieth-century vocalism remains to be written.

---

CHAPTER 3

A COSMOPOLITAN MUSICAL TRAINING: STYLISTIC INFLUENCES ON PAULINE GARCIA’S EARLIEST KNOWN COMPOSITIONS

In the late 1850s, Viardot-Garcia recounted to Julius Rietz—then conductor at the Leipzig Gewandhaus—some of her earliest musical impressions in a series of long, detailed letters. Not surprisingly, the strong and dynamic personality of her father, Manuel García, marked her youth. The singer described the musical training that she received from him in the following terms:

*C’est mon père qui m’a appris la musique—quand je n’en sais rien, car je ne me rappelle pas les tems où je ne la savais pas. J’ai plusieurs gros cahiers pleins de solfèges, de canons, et d’airs écrits pour moi . . . quand je veux travailler des airs difficiles et réellement utiles pour moi, je reviens à ceux que mon père a fait lorsque j’avais dix ans—je les chantais de bien peu plus mal qu’à présent.*

It was my father who taught me music—when it was, I have no idea, because I do not remember a time when I did not know about music. I have several great notebooks full of solfeggios, canons and airs written for me . . . Whenever I want to practice airs which are difficult and really useful to me, I return to those which my father wrote when I was ten years old—I sang them but very little worse then, than I do now.192

Like her two older siblings, Pauline learned early on the importance of meticulous and strict discipline in order to attain solid musical skills and vocal technique. Unlike them, she absorbed these lessons easily, without painful confrontations with her father’s domineering personality. The father nicknamed little Pauline “the ant,” for her ability to work constantly and with great concentration towards all her objectives. Young Pauline showed an interest not only in singing, but in other disciplines. She had a facility for

---

drawing and, as a result of the family’s trips in France, England and the Americas during the 1820s, she absorbed several languages with great ease.

The tyrannical Manuel García loved with surprising tenderness his youngest child, approving of her industriousness and many talents—perhaps to the detriment of Pauline’s two older siblings, Manuel and María, who must have compared their conflictive relationship to their father to the idyllic bond that their younger sister seemed to enjoy with him. Many years later she would still recall:

\[
\text{Je n’ai éprouvé que de la tendresse de sa part — il m’aimait passionnément et délicatement. Lui qui a été, dit-on, si sévère et si violent avec ma sœur, il a usé d’une douceur angélique avec moi.}
\]

I never experienced anything but affection from him—his love for me was both passionate and sensitive. He who was, some say, so severe and violent with my sister, employed only an angelic sweetness with me.\(^{193}\)

While Manuel García lived, he made sure that she received a complete musical education. Early on, she acquired much experience in the practical aspects of the theatrical world by observing the productions mounted by her father’s operatic company in England during early 1825 and in New York from November 1825 to September 1826. García might have even found small roles for her to perform. From repeated audition, the child must have learned many operas by heart, including Rossini’s *Otello*, *Il barbiere di Siviglia*, *La cenerentola*, and *Il turco in Italia*, Mozart’s *Don Giovanni* and *Le nozze di*

Figaro, Zingarelli’s Romeo, and several of her father’s own works, among them L’amante astuto (originally El amante astuto) and La figlia dell’aria.¹⁹⁴

Later on, Manuel García made sure that she took music lessons not only with him, but with other respected musicians. When his operatic company settled in Mexico City for three years, from late 1826 to January 1829, the girl began keyboard lessons with Marcos Vega, principal organist at the Catedral Metropolitana. It is curious that such a young child could keep vivid memories from this period, and yet this was the case with Pauline. In the 1850s, for example, she would relate to Julius Rietz, with surprising aural detail, how the family was assaulted by a group of thieves on their way to the port of Veracruz:

Les brigands étaient au nombre de soixante — à cheval, masqués et armés jusqu’au dents. . . . On entendait de temps à autre un coup de fusil précédé, accompagné et suivi de cris et de jurons effroyables, les coups de marteaux qui cassaient les coffres, les gémissements des femmes, les piétinements des chevaux et, comme pédale à toute cette discordance, le hurlement du vent qui soufflait dans cette gorge entourée de montagnes. Cette scène a duré deux mortelles heures. Eh bien, je ne me rappelle pas avoir entendu des éclats de de rire plus francs et plus communicatifs que ceux de mon père pendant la nuit qui a suivi la perte de toute sa fortune. . . .

There were close to sixty bandits—on horse, masked, and armed to the teeth. . . . One heard from time to time a shot from a rifle, preceded, accompanied, and followed by screams and abominable swearing, the strikes of the hammers which opened the coffers, the wailing of women, the tramping of horses and, as a pedal tone to all these discords, the hurling of the wind which blew in the gorge surrounded by mountains. Nevertheless, I do not recall having heard a more explosive and frank laughter than that of my father during the night which followed the loss of all his fortune. . . .  

It seems that Pauline also remembered the music which she heard in the streets of Mexico City during those years. In the 1840s and 1850s, she was praised by both Sand and Gounod for her arrangement and performance of Mexican songs. It is not clear if Pauline wrote down these melodies from memory or if another member of the García family transcribed them during the 1826-1829 sojourn. Whether they were penned by Pauline or someone else, these transcriptions are now lost. To my knowledge, only one of them remains, a manuscript of a children’s popular tune entitled “La Gallina,” which is sung to this day in different versions in Spain and some countries of Latin America. The manuscript is an arrangement of the song for three voices in Pauline’s hand.  

Its title page includes the words *Air mexicaine*. A reproduction of the second page of the manuscript follows as Figure 3.1. It contains the three most known verses of this octosyllabic rhyme for children. The treble clef is employed in all three systems.  

---


196 “La gallina,” *Air Mexicaine*, undated autograph manuscript, item 55 in Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (MS Mus 232), Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA. These manuscript was perhaps an arrangement done in the 1850s or 1860s for Pauline’s three youngest children or for her students.

197 “Ea, que gallina tan fea, Como se sube al palo, Y como cacaraquea” / “Oh, what an ugly chicken, How it climbs on the perch, How it cackles.”
Figure 3.1. “La gallina,” *Air mexicaine*, AMs with AMs corrections in the hand of Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Ms Mus 232, item 55, courtesy of Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

Upon the family’s return to Paris in the spring of 1829, García sent his eight-year-old daughter to take classes with two eminent professors from the Conservatoire: the theorist and composer Anton Reicha (1770-1836) and the pianist Charles Meysenberg (1785-c. 1829). Reicha, who was Czech-born, moved to Vienna in 1801 where he studied with Antonio Salieri and Johann Georg Albrechtsberger and befriended Beethoven and Haydn. After he was appointed professor of counterpoint and fugue at the Paris
Conservatoire in 1818, he taught students such as Liszt, Gounod, Franck, and Berlioz.

The latter remembered his lessons with the exacting professor in the following manner:

Reicha was an admirable teacher of counterpoint. He was extremely clear and never wasted words. I learnt a lot from him in a short time. Unlike most teachers, he hardly ever failed to give his pupils the reason for the rules he recommended to them, wherever this was possible. He was neither an empiricist nor a reactionary. He was all for progress in certain branches of music, and his respect for tradition stopped short of idolatry. Hence his constant disputes with Cherubini; . . . Reicha appeared equally indifferent to praise or to criticism. The success of the young Conservatoire musicians for whose education he was responsible was all that he really seemed to care about, and his lessons were models of integrity and thoroughness.198

It is difficult to imagine young Pauline diligently reading through the two volumes of Reicha’s *Traité de haute composition musicale*199 or playing through his pedagogical *Études dans le genre fugé*, op. 97 (1817), but one can assume that the eminent professor would not have wasted his time teaching the rudiments of counterpoint and harmony to a child if she did not already display exceptional musical abilities. It is not known for how long she studied with Reicha. Judging from the solid musical structure of her first known compositions, she probably remained under his tutelage for several years. Reicha must have introduced her to the music of German composers such as Haydn and Beethoven. He or her father might also have introduced her to the songs of Schubert. This idea is

---


supported by an anecdote, which a student of Viardot-Garcia, Ann Schoen-René, heard directly from her:

At the Paris Conservatoire she had studied harmony and counterpoint under the distinguished teacher Anton Reicha, and this knowledge she now put to practical use. Schubert, for whose work her father had shown a fervent enthusiasm, became Pauline’s first great love in music. She copied all his songs, and used them for her solfeggi, for the simple pleasure of being as near as possible to them, and occupied with their construction, which to her was powerfully moving.

The fact that Pauline’s first known works are Lieder gives credibility to this anecdote.

Throughout her life, she would champion Schubert’s songs not only through her excellent interpretations—some of which left indelible memories in her contemporaries—but through her translation and adaptation of fifty of the composer’s Lieder for the publication of a bilingual album in France entitled Cinquante mélodies de Franz Schubert

---

200 Ann Schoen-René (1864-?) was born in Coblenz, Germany and studied in Paris with Viardot-Garcia and in London with Manuel García in the 1880s. Later on, she immigrated to America and became a singer at the Metropolitan Opera. From 1893 to 1909 she resided in Minneapolis where she organized the city’s first symphonic orchestra and the nascent music department of the University of Minnesota. Later on she taught at the Julliard Music School. Her most distinguished student was Risë Stevens. She was a proponent and defender of the García method and remained close to Viardot-Garcia, exchanging letters with her and visiting her in 1909, one year prior to her teacher’s death. For more on Schoen-René see Janis White Dees, “Anna Schön-René, Minnesota Musical Pioneer,” Minnesota History 48, no. 8 (Winter 1983), 332-38. http://collections.mnhs.org/MNHistoryMagazine/articles/48/v48i08p332-338.pdf (accessed July 10, 2010).


202 The famed music historian, Julien Tiersot, for example, remembered in 1910, with great awe an interpretation of “Erlkönig” given by Viardot-Garcia and Saint-Saëns in 1873, long after the singer had passed the zenith of her vocal prowess: “Je n’ai, de ma vie, rien vu ni entendu d’aussi troublant, d’aussi puissant, et qui fût en même temps d’un art plus admirable.”/ “I never, in all my life, saw or heard nothing as troubling or as powerful, which at the same time, was such admirable art.” Julien Tiersot, “Pauline Viardot,” Le Ménestrel 76, no. 21 (May 21, 1910), 162.
We learn much of Pauline’s perception of Schubert’s songs and their transnational influence in the preface which she wrote for that volume:


... Franz Schubert took the popular Lied from the street, and raised it to the height of a small poem, [which could have] a thousand forms, a thousand colors, a thousand emotions. His songs surpassed, by far and all at once, the Lieder produced to that point in his own country, the Italian canzoni, the Spanish boleros, the English songs, and the French romances. Many composers, in each language, imitated him, but none yet has been able to equal him. He remains unique, an example for a genre which he illustrated by illustrating himself.

Although these lines were printed thirty years after the appearance of Pauline’s first songs, one can infer that throughout the years, her idealization and understanding of Schubert’s musical style had significant influence in the conception of many of her own vocal compositions, regardless of their language or national style.

In 1829, Pauline also began to take classes with the well-reputed piano pedagogue Charles Meysenberg. The pianist died shortly after she began studies with him, yet the

---

203 Pauline was aided in the translation of these songs by Louis Pomey and Ivan Turgenev. A full list of the songs included in this collection with their original and translated titles can be found in Antoine Virenque, op. cit., 104-105.

204 In “Préface” to Franz Schubert, Cinquante mélodies de Franz Schubert, traduites par Louis Pomey avec annotations & sous la direction de Pauline Viardot (Paris : E. Gérard, 1873).

205 Isabelle Putnam Emerson, Five Centuries of Women Singers (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2005), 301. Meysenberg was one of the first students to graduate from the Conservatoire, where he studied composition in the 1790s with Étienne-Nicolas Méhul and piano with Louis Adam,
girl, who was showing promise as a keyboardist, had already acquired enough skills to accompany with ease her father’s voice lessons. Almost seventy years later, one of Pauline’s students, Lydia Torrigi-Heiroth, recounted the young girl’s impressions of her father’s method and students:

It was in this way that at age eight, Pauline served as accompanist to the singing lessons of her father. Years later she would laugh, saying that often she benefited more than the students from these lessons. She assimilated the method of her father very well. García had such a high opinion of her knowledge, that when he composed in 1829 an operetta to be sang by his students, he reserved a role in it for his little daughter. Pauline must have sung the part without ever having studied singing or exercised the voice. She managed very well, despite the fact that the role was not at all easy.

After a brief but severe disease, presumably cholera, Manuel García died suddenly on June 2, 1832; Pauline was at the time one month short of her eleventh birthday. The child must have been very much affected by this abrupt loss, but like the rest of her family, she possessed enormous emotional fortitude and did not lose her sense of purpose or her love for life. She kept close to her heart and mind his memorable father of the virtuoso Adolphe Adam. He produced several compositions including three sonatas for piano, a sonata for piano and violin, *Douce Morceaux pour piano faciles et brillants*, and a concerto for piano and orchestra.

---

lessons, the solfeggi exercises which he wrote for her, and many of his compositions, which, over the next years, she would analyze. From her description of her father’s works to Julius Rietz, it seems that she did not allow sentimentality to compromise her sense of critical objectivity:

Je vous ferai voir les partitions de mon père—j’en bien une trentaine au moins. Il avait par malheur beaucoup trop de facilité—il faisait un peu comme Luca fà presto. Et il lui manquait, je prêsume, la faculté de penser longtemps avant d’écrire. Les idées lui arrivaient avec une telle abondance, qu’il les écrivait sans prendre le temps de choisir les bonnes et repousser les mauvaises. C’est un défaut, plus, c’est un malheur. C’est incroyable ce que mon père écrivit de messes, de symphonies, de morceaux détachés, de quatuors sans accompagnement, etc . . . Et puis les libretti de mon père! Tout lui était bon, il n’y connaissait rien! Les Français n’en faisaient pas d’aussi à effet qu’à présent. Chose étrange, papa n’a jamais mis en musique d’opéra de Metastasio. Il en était probablement ressai comme chanteur . . .

I am going to show you my father’s scores—I probably possess at least thirty of them. He had, unhappily, altogether too great facility—he worked somewhat like Luca fà presto. And I presume that he lacked the faculty of prolonged thinking before writing. His ideas rushed upon him in such an abundance that he wrote them down without taking time to choose the good ones and discard the bad ones. It is incredible, what my father wrote in the way of masses, symphonies, detached pieces, unaccompanied quartets, etc . . . And then my father’s librettos! anything found grace in his eyes, he had no discrimination! The French did not write them so much with an eye to effect as at present. A strange fact—papa never set any opera by Metastasio to music. He had probably had his fill of them as a singer . . .

This analytical detachment, even with regard to musical works which were close to her heart, served her well when she had to evaluate her own compositions and those of others. It is not accidental that later on composers such as Meyerbeer, Gounod, Wagner, and Berlioz sought her technical advice and aesthetic approval for their works.

---

Despite Viardot-García’s criticism of her father’s lack of taste in librettos and his hasty approach to composition, throughout her career, she often performed numbers from his operas and *tonadillas* as well as some of his transcriptions of popular Spanish songs.\(^{208}\) She admired in particular those of his works which captured the verve of the Andalusian popular idiom.\(^{209}\)

Many years after her father’s death, she made piano reductions of six of his orchestral airs and published them under the title *Chansons espagnoles par Manuel Garcia père, arranges avec accompagnement de piano par Mme Pauline Viardot* (Paris: E. Gerard & Cie., 1875).\(^{210}\) In the closing song of the collection, “Es corredor”/“Le courrier,” the simple ingenuousness of the anonymous octosyllabic poem is complemented by García’s patter-like, repetitive, and rhythmically displaced setting. The A and A’ sections (mm. 1-30 and 62-85) of the air’s ternary form are organized by a recurrent theme in C major, which is associated with the first two verses of the poem, “Este si que es corredor! Este si, que los otros no!”\(^{211}\) An extract from the A section is reproduced in Example 3.1:

\(^{208}\) At the beginning of her singing career, she often performed García’s arrangements of popular songs from Andalucía such as “El bajelito,” “El jaleo,” and “Canción española.” See “Paulina García-Viardot en el Liceo,” *La Iberia musical* I, no. 22 (May 29, 1842), 85-6.


\(^{210}\) The poet Louis Pomey provided a French text for these songs. His lyrics, however, often differ in meaning from the original ones in Spanish. At the beginning of each arrangement, the vocal part with Spanish lyrics was given in the score.
The allegro marking, duple meter, and jerky rhythmic drive created by the syncopated accents and sudden dynamic changes can easily remind the listener of a fast Spanish dance, perhaps a seguidilla from Seville.

The vocal line in the somewhat contrasting B section (mm. 31-62) is separated by a modulating instrumental interlude, which takes the listener initially to the relative minor. As this harmonically unstable section progresses, the vocal line becomes increasingly lyrical and melismatic. See Example 3.2:

211 “This one truly is a runner, This one, yes, and the others not!”

It is intriguing how García was able, through the employment of Italian operatic conventions, such as the da capo form, to expand the rich tradition of popular dances and songs from his native country. Young Pauline must have learned much about the effective amalgamation of national styles from her father’s compositions.

Despite visiting Spain only once in her lifetime, Viardot-Garcia never lost her feel or enthusiasm for the popular and folkloric music of her father’s land. From 1850 to 1853, for example, she established a friendship with Spanish composer Sebastián Iradier (1809-1865), who had traveled to Paris with Empress Eugenia de Montijo to continue her musical instruction. During his French sojourn, Iradier attained much success as a composer thanks to his arrangements of Spanish popular dances and songs.²¹² He and Viardot-Garcia must have often exchanged not only repertoire, but points of view on the most effective way to arrange these songs and interpret them. There exists, for example, a manuscript in the hand of Viardot-Garcia of one of Iradier’s most successful songs,

---

“Juanita.”\textsuperscript{213} The song’s second section, an emulation of a \textit{jota} from Aragón, marks even the interpolated \textit{hablados}—spontaneous interjections—conventionally voiced by the attending public during the instrumental interludes of this fast dance in triple meter.

Figure 3.2, a reproduction of this segment of the manuscript, is preceded by an English translation of its lyrics:

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{ll}
\textit{Para canciones Vianda} & For songs Vianda, \\
\textit{Para toreros Madrid}, & For bullfighters Madrid, \\
\textit{Para hermosura Granada}, & For beauty Granada, \\
\textit{Para elegancia Paris.} & For elegance Paris. \\
A la jota, jota & To the \textit{jota, jota}, \\
Yo soy española, & I am a Spaniard, \\
No soy andaluza, & I am neither Andalusian, \\
Tampoco Manola, & Nor a Manola, \\
\textit{No soy de [Triana]},\textsuperscript{214} & I am not from \textit{[Triana]}, \\
\textit{No soy de Morón}, & I am not from Morón, \\
\textit{Que soy de Aragón.} & I am from Aragón. \\
\textit{En la raya de Aragón} & In the frontier of Aragón, \\
Me encontré yo un torero, & I met a bullfighter, \\
\textit{Y jamás no he visto} & And never have I seen, \\
\textit{Un mozo con tanto salero.} & A youth with so much charm.
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{213} “Juanita” - del Mo. Iradier, undated Ms in the hand of Viardot-Garcia, item 56 in Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (MS Mus 232). Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

\textsuperscript{214} Viardot-Garcia’s manuscript reads “\textit{gasitana},” a nonsensical term, which in this instance I have substituted for the words “\textit{de Triana},” a town in the province of Andalusia. Its name appears often in Spanish popular songs. Different versions of this verse, at any rate, can be found in diverse manuscripts and printed scores. Another version of the same verse reads: “\textit{A la jota, jota, Vivan los toreros, Viva la cuadrilla, De Banderilleros,}” / “To the \textit{jota, jota, Long life to the bullfighters, Long life to the quadrille, Of \textit{banderilleros}}.” See Sebastian Yradier, “La \textit{Juanita},” Ms, International Music Score Library Project, http://216.129.110.22/files/imglnks/usimg/0/0d/IMSLP36854-PMLP82050-YRADIER\textunderscore S.pdf (accessed July 10, 2010).
Iradier’s “Juanita” was later widely popularized in the orchestral prelude to the zarzuela *Las bodas de Luis Alonso o la noche del encierro* (1897) by Andalusian composer Gerónimo Giménez y Bellido (1857-1923). This instrumental number is still regularly performed throughout Spain and Latin America, although the words of the original song are now largely forgotten. In chapter 7 of the present dissertation, a stylistic analysis of
one of Pauline’s own emulations of an Andalusian *caña* will demonstrate her absorption of the Spanish popular idioms.

From the time of her father’s untimely death until her fifteenth birthday, Pauline’s most ardent ambition was to become a professional pianist. These wishes might have been nourished by the lessons which she began taking either in 1829 or the early 1830s with Franz Liszt. It is not known who introduced Pauline to the virtuoso pianist; it might have been her father or Anton Reicha or the tenor Adolphe Nourrit (one of her father’s most distinguished pupils) or perhaps even her sister, María Malibran, then at the height of her operatic fame. Lessons could have continued until 1833 or even 1834, when Liszt escaped Paris (and scandal) with Marie d’Agoult. At some point after 1833, Pauline also moved out of Paris to Ixelles, on the outskirts of Brussels, where her sister and Charles de Bériot, had begun building a house in 1831. A letter from Liszt to Viardot-Garcia from 1877 suggests that his instruction began when Manuel García was still alive: “Admiring you is the business of everyone, but I flatter myself of excelling at it after many years (commencing by our lessons at your father’s house—at the ‘Rue des trois frères’).” Pauline remembered these lessons all her life with admiration and remnants of quivery, erotic emotion. Like many other young girls of her generation, she had fallen under the sensual spell of the elegant virtuoso:

215 After the death of Manuel García, Pauline and her mother, Joaquina, might have visited Ixelles a few times. A permanent move to Belgium might have not take place until María normalized her amorous ties with de Bériot. She managed, as has been already mentioned, to divorce her first husband in March 1836, which allowed her, in turn, to marry Charles de Bériot.


I was twelve years old. Each Saturday, he gave me a lesson on accompaniment. As I got dressed to go to his house, I experienced such emotion and my hand trembled so strongly that I hardly managed to lace my boots. When I rang his doorbell, my blood froze; when I saw him, my eyes filled with tears. But he received all these homages without too much fatuity, judging them natural and legitimate . . . The physical attributes of Liszt, joined to the vigor of his fingers, justified the infatuation of his female public.

Liszt, who had an instrumental role in presenting Schubert’s Lieder to the French public during the early 1830s through his transcriptions and public concerts with Adolphe Nourrit,\footnote{Frits Noske, \textit{La mélodie française de Berlioz a Duparc} (Amsterdam: North-Holland, 1954), 23-6.} probably encouraged Pauline’s interest in German art song during their lessons in accompaniment. Together with Reicha, he helped to instigate in the girl a general admiration for German music and culture. This taste would be further developed during Pauline’s initial professional tour in Germany in the spring and summer of 1838, when she had the opportunity of befriending Clara Wieck, Robert Schumann, and Felix Mendelssohn. Already during her initial presentations in Paris in the winter season of
1838-1839, she was singing Lieder of Schubert in her recitals, a musical fare that was still relatively unfamiliar to the French public.\footnote{During the late 1830s, 1840s and 1850s, Pauline was well-known among her contemporaries for her ability to accompany herself in some of the most difficult of Schubert’s Lieder, for example, “Erkönig.” Apart from her translated compilation of fifty songs by Schubert, her admiration for Schubert’s style is also demonstrated in her transcription of three waltzes of the composer for voice and piano: Trois valses de Franz Schubert (Paris: E. Gérard, 1875). These arrangements proved to be so popular that they were republished by several editorial houses in France, U.S.A., and Russia in the late nineteenth century. See Waddington and Žekulin, 23-6 and 29.}

Liszt must have appreciated during these Saturday lessons that his adolescent student, despite suffering from the first pangs of love, was talented enough to have a professional career as a pianist, and perhaps even encouraged her to pursue that path. Years later, on an article he wrote for the Neue Zeitschrift für Musik, he praised her many abilities on that instrument:

\begin{quote}
Als eine treffliche Pianistin, welche mit Partiturspiel und vom Blattlesen der schwierigsten Begleitungen besser umgeht, als mancher concertirende Virtuos, sind ihr die Schöpfungen der grossen Meister, ihr Styl, ihre Mittel des Ausdrucks genau bekannt und geläufig. . . .

Bei Erwähnung ihres Claverspiels wollen wir ganz besonders ihren leichten Anschlag, die vollkommene Ubrundung ihrer Passagen nicht mit Schweigen Übergehen, die ihr gewiss, wenn sie etwa auch nur auf denTasten singen wollte, den Beifall kunstverständiger Zuhörer sichern würde. . . . Wir haben sie aber schon damals gleich gern in ihren beiden Virtuositäten gehört, ja sogar auf der Orgel, die sie ganz meisterhaft spielt, und sich zu dem Ende, in ihrem eigenen Hause eine 16 Fuss hohe hat construiren lassen; ein echt künstlerischer Luxus!\footnote{Franz Liszt, “Pauline Viardot-Garcia,” Neue Zeitschrift für Musik 50, no. 5 (January 28, 1859), 51.}
\end{quote}
Excellent pianist, she knows how to reduce for this instrument the texture of orchestral scores and how to decipher the most difficult accompaniments with more talent than many of the most virtuosic players. She knows perfectly the works of the greatest masters, their styles, and their expressive contours. . . . Evoking her pianistic technique, we should mention her particularly light touch and the perfect equality of her lines, which would guarantee certainly the vote of cultured listeners, if one day she would limit herself only to singing in the ivory keys of the pianos. . . We have heard her expressing herself in these two genres [the piano and the voice] with the greatest virtuosity; she also plays the organ, in such a masterly way that she finally had an organ of sixteen feet constructed in her own house: a truly artistic luxury!

It is surprising that despite all his admiration, Liszt fails to mention the fact that Pauline had been one of his earliest pupils. Perhaps by then he had recognized in her delicate and sensitive approach to the instrument the influence of Chopin, whom Pauline befriended in the late 1830s, and who gave her, during the last decade of his lifetime, much valuable pianistic advice, both in formal and informal lessons.²²¹ Liszt might have thought that Pauline had grown too far from his technical and aesthetic formation to recognize her publically as a former student. Pauline, too, shared this feeling of estrangement at the time of the publication of Liszt’s monograph on her, as she explained to Julius Rietz:

_Gestern hat [Liszt] mir vorgetan—nein so wie er spielt kein zweiter—ich bin ganz enzückt von seinem Spiel—Ich habe die Rhapsodien und _Entremment_ aus seinen Harmonien gehört . . . Mit mir ist er sehr einfach, was ihm einen doppelten Reiz verleiht, ja sogar kindisch und ich glaube, dass es kommt natürlich—er hat mich ja seit meiner Kindheit gekannt . . . Mais toutes nos idées sont trop différentes pour qu’il y ait jamais entre nous une sympathie complète._

---

²²¹ For more on Viardot-Garcia’s relationship to Chopin see chapter 4 of the present dissertation.
Yesterday [Liszt] played for me—oh, no one can play as he does—
I am perfectly carried away by his playing— I heard the *Rhapsodies*
and the *Enterrements* of his harmonies . . .Towards me he is very
unaffected, which renders him doubly charming—he is even childlike,
and I believe it comes naturally, for he has known me since my
childhood . . .but our ideas are too different for us ever to be in
complete sympathy. 222

Despite realizing that their musical characters and personal principles differed, Pauline
would recognize throughout her life Liszt’s unsurpassable pianistic talent and defend him
against the open criticism of many of his detractors.

At some point before the move to Ixelles, Pauline’s counterpoint and harmony
lessons with Reicha ceased. Unfortunately, this would place limitations on her future
compositional abilities. From the scope of her oeuvre—as already mentioned, more than
130 songs in French, German, Russian, Spanish, and Italian, around 200 vocal
arrangements and transcriptions, five salon operas with piano accompaniment and a few
compositions for piano and chamber ensembles—it is clear that her instruction in
orchestration and the larger instrumental forms remained unfulfilled. This defect in her
training would later make her doubt her merits as composer.

Putting aside the limiting factors in her otherwise good compositional training—
aspects which she could not easily correct due initially to the pressures of her
professional singing career and after her retirement from the Parisian stage in 1862, to the
time limitations imposed by family life, teaching, and social obligations—Pauline’s
overall musical education was particularly distinguished and privileged in comparison to

222 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to Julius Rietz, Weimar, 1858 or 1859, in “Pauline Viardot-
Garcia to Julius Rietz: Letters of Friendship,” part 1, *The Musical Quarterly* I, no. 3 (July 1815),
356-7 and 360-1.
that received by most women composers/interpreters in France during the first half of the
nineteenth century.\footnote{It must be remembered that the Conservatoire, where Anton Reicha taught, did not
open its courses on composition to women until 1861. One other women composer during this
period, Louise Farrenc (1804-1875), had access to lessons with Anton Reicha. Another
contemporary women composer and singer, Loïsa Puget (1810-1889), took lessons with
composer Adolphe Adam. Florence Launay, \textit{Les Compositrices en France au XIXe siècle} (Paris:
Fayard, 2006), 21-7.}

During her two or three years in Ixelles (1834 or 1835 to March 1838), it
is probable that both her sister and brother-in-law encouraged her to become a pianist.
After all, both María Malibran and Charles de Bériot would have benefited from having a
professional accompanist in the family. Additionally, Pauline’s future would have been
assured by having the rare opportunity of traveling with two of the most sought-after
virtuosos of the day in their concertizing tours. Her earliest public appearance, in Liège
on August 14, 1836 (shortly after her fifteenth birthday) seems to support this theory. On
that occasion, Pauline accompanied her fatally ill sister and de Bériot in a concert which
was attended by Meyerbeer and was favorably reviewed in Parisian journals.\footnote{“Plus de vingt mille curieux assistaient à Liège aux courses de chevaux qu’a
couronnées de la manière la plus brillante le concert donné dans la salle de spectacle de M. de
Bériot, sa femme (Madame Malibran) et Mademoiselle Garcia. Les trois artistes ont excité un
enthousiasme universel.” / “More than twenty thousand curious attended the horse races at Liège,
which have been crowned in the most brilliant fashion by a concert given at the spectacle hall by
M. de Bériot, his wife (Madame Malibran), and Mademoiselle Garcia. The three artists have
provoked universal enthusiasm.” In “Nouvelles,” \textit{La Revue et gazette musicale} 3, no. 36
(September 4, 1836), 314.}

Pauline’s incipient career as a pianist was cut short by the tragic death of María de
Bériot the following month. With the demise of the twenty-eight-year-old diva, Pauline
and her mother found themselves without a steady source of income. Charles de
Bériot—listless and broken-hearted during the first months after his wife’s death—was
more than willing to retain them in Ixelles. He supported Joaquina Sitchès’ scheme to reproject Pauline’s future as a singer. Pauline’s mother—who had never, in any case, been too sympathetic to her youngest daughter’s desires to become a pianist—now pushed her to complete the development of her vocal skills in little more than a year.\footnote{\textit{\textsuperscript{225}} When she was an old woman, Pauline confessed that although she had not dared protest against her mother’s decision, it had almost broken her heart. She had felt a real vocation for the piano, and abandoned her ambitions with the greatest regret. In fact, she remained an outstanding pianist all her life; Liszt, Moscheles, Adolphe Adam, Saint-Saëns, [Chopin and Clara Schumann]. . . have left enthusiastic accounts of her playing.” April FitzLyon, \textit{The Price of Genius: A Life of Pauline Viardot} (New York: Appleton-Century, 1964), 37.} This was, of course, a significant task, which could only be accomplished with much talent and strict discipline. The fourteen months between the death of María and Pauline’s first public appearance as a singer were dedicated to building up repertoire and preparing her for the ambitious undertaking of following in the professional footsteps of both her father and sister. Everyone in the family understood that comparisons between the two sisters would be inevitable, a realization that might have made even rational Pauline lose her serene composure at times. Despite the thorny issue of the association between the voices (or perhaps, boldest of ideas, to emphasize it), the repertoire selected by Joaquina for her youngest daughter mimicked that of María: Rossinian and Donizettian arias, numbers from the \textit{tonadillas} by Manuel García, including “Yo que soy contrabandista,” famous virtuosic ballades such as Auguste Panseron’s \textit{Le Songe de Tartini ou la cadence du diable} and various songs composed by Charles and María de Bériot. Pauline, who must have been singing informally since she was an infant, tackled the \textit{bel canto} repertoire without much difficulty. Like her sister, she possessed a flexible and agile instrument with exact intonation, a rich, sonorous timbre and a register which was remarkably extended (albeit being somewhat uneven). Little wonder that many of her
initial auditors believed that la Malibran had come back to life. In September 1838, the voice teacher and music critic Heinrich Panofka (1807-1887) lamented the apparent lack of interest of the Parisian operatic world for her in the following terms:

Non loin de Paris [il y a] une jeune fille poétique, de dix-huit ans [sic], portant un beau nom cher à l’art et aux artistes, . . . qui fait de sa belle voix, non un simple instrument mécanique, mais l’organe de ses sentiments, de ses pensées, . . . qui a du génie comme sa sœur! . . . Eh bien! on n’a point songé à la gagner pour l’Académie Royale de Musique, où est sa véritable place, où elle eût fait revenir ces jours d’éclat dont on n’a plus que le souvenir; . . . on l’a laissée partir pour l’Allemagne . . .

M. Rellstab, un des critiques le plus spirituels de l’Allemagne [dit qui] . . . sa voix . . . est un mélange de soprano et de ténor, de sorte que la partie basse a de l’affinité avec le violoncelle, et la partie élevée avec le violon. Nous n’avons, en effet, jamais entendu voix humaine qui rappellât davantage les propriétés de ces deux instruments. A se don rare de la nature, l’artiste réunit une étude dirigée plus évidemment d’après un plan méthodique, mais qui n’en reste pas moins étonnante.226

Not far from Paris [there is] a young poetic eighteen-year-old girl [sic] who bears a name cherished by art and artists, . . . who makes of her beautiful voice not a simple mechanical instrument, but a vehicle for her feelings and thoughts, . . . who has genius like her sister! Alas! No one thought of winning her for the Royal Academy of Music, her rightful place, where she would make return those stunning days which one can now only evoke; . . . she was allowed to depart to Germany . . .

Monsieur Rellstab,227 one of the most spiritual critics of Germany [says that] . . . her voice is a combination of soprano and tenor, in such a way that the lower register has affinities with the cello, and the higher one with the violin. As a matter of fact, we have never heard a human voice which brought to mind the qualities of those two instruments. To this rare gift of nature, the artist brings a methodological approach to [vocal] study, which is, nothing short of astonishing.


227 Ludwig Rellstab (1799-1860) was, of course, a famous Schubert poet and music journalist who had extensive influence, particularly in Frankfurt.
Pauline García’s first public recitals were modest affairs in comparison to the splendors that would follow: a charity concert in Brussels on December 13, 1837 and a presentation before the royal family of Ligne. From April to September of 1838, Pauline—chaperoned by her mother—and de Bériot embarked on a five-month tour that would take them to Louvain, Berlin, Leipzig, Dresden, Weimar, and Frankfurt. The objectives were clear: To introduce Pauline in a series of select concerts in the highest echelons of Prussian society and to present her to the most relevant German musicians of the day. During the tour, the contacts and friends of her deceased sister and de Bériot were of invaluable help, as a previously unpublished letter of introduction by Felix Mendelssohn to one of the court counselors of Saxony, Herr Hofrath Josef Keil, demonstrates. 228 A reproduction of the original document is presented in Figure 3.3, followed by a transcription and a translation of the letter:

---

Figure 3.3. Felix Mendelssohn to Josef Keil, Berlin, June 21, 1838, item 2571a, courtesy of Stiftelsen Musikkulturens Främjande (Nydahl Collection), Stockholm, Sweden.
Hochgenter Herr Hofrath


Indem ich Sie noch bitte den verehrter Ihrigen auf das Anlegeleichteste zu empfehlen bin ich mit wahrer Hochachtung.

Ihr ergebenster Felix Maendelsohn-Bartholdy
Berlin den 21 Juni 1838

Esteemed Herr Hofrath,

Allow me through these lines to introduce to you Herr C. de Bériot, who intends to travel from here to Leipzig. I am most grateful to him for many high joys and am obliged, I believe, to show him my appreciation as best as I can, by introducing him to your milieu, and hope, therefore, that you can forgive the liberty which I have taken, and that you can give him a friendly hand, through advice and actions, with his plans in Leipzig. I am certain you will derive excellent enjoyment from his talent, but perhaps even more from the acquaintance of his sister-in-law, Pauline Garcia, one of the greatest living musical geniuses. The artistic perfection, the splendid singing and profound sensibility provoke hardly more wonderment than her unconstrained, witty character, her knowledge of harmony, her piano playing, and her ability to speak several languages, and for these reasons, she is the only figure who can be compared to her late sister Marie Malibran and who, if she continues to develop well, can become her equal. If it pleases you to aid me in this great affair, I bow to you with true admiration.

Your devoted Felix Maendelsohn-Bartholdy
Berlin, June 21, 1838
Felix Mendelssohn’s strong reaction to Pauline’s multi-talented personality was not unique. Those that heard her in Berlin—during concerts which she performed before the Prussian Royal family on May 21 and 28 and later on, during her presentation in Leipzig at the Gewandhaus on June 25—were profoundly moved by her unique, personal interpretations. Schumann reported his impressions of the concert at the Gewandhaus in the following terms:

_Frl. Garcia darf man nur ein Dutzend Tacte singen hören, oder sie an den Flügel sich sessen und sich ein Lied begleiten sehen, um in ihr die echte Kunstnatur zu erkennen. . . . Frl. Garcia ist keine Gesangvirtuosin, aber eine Sängerin._

One need hear Mlle. Garcia sing only a dozen measures or see her sit at the piano and accompany a Lied in order to recognize in her a truly artistic nature . . . Mlle. Garcia is not just a vocal virtuoso but a real singer.

It was at this initial phase of her career that Pauline began to sing her own compositions in public. It is impossible to know if she had been composing for a long time. Her earliest known works date precisely from the first sojourn in Germany. In the next pages, I will establish a chronology for songs created between May 1838 and August 1839, which is based on extant autograph manuscripts, many of which were dated by the composer herself.

The most important collection of autograph manuscripts from this period can be found in a black notebook, now at Houghton Library, Harvard University, which young

---


Pauline acquired or received during the summer of 1839. With clear and accurate penmanship, she began it by notating and dating eight fair copies, first of new works and then of earlier ones. In other words, Pauline began one of the sides of the notebook writing down three songs which she had just composed in August 1839 (identified as compositions [1.] through [4.] of item 60 in Houghton Library’s electronic guide), followed by fair copies of five songs, three of which were composed in Germany in 1838 and two in Brussels, in 1838 or before (compositions [5.] through [9.] in the same guide). One can add to these eight early autographs in German, French and Italian, two more manuscripts of songs in French from the period, “Etoile du soir” (ML96.V44, Library of Congress) and “Approche du rivage” (Rés Vm7 537, Bibliothèque nationale de France). These two unpublished works were also dated by the composer.

Following Pauline’s tours from the spring of 1838 to the summer of 1839, it is possible to propose the following compositional chronology in Table 3.1, which, if

---

231 Notebook, AMs with AMs corrections and revisions, bound in 3/4 black calf with marbled boards, entries from both ends, item 60 in Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (MS Mus 232), Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

232 In the early 1840s, she used the other side of the notebook to make several drafts and sketches of songs.

233 Barbara M. Wolff and Leslie A. Morris, “Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers: Guide,” Oasis, Harvard University Library. http://oasis.lib.harvard.edu/oasis/deliver/~hou00141 (accessed May 20, 2010). According to the electronic guide, the notebook presents nine initial autographs in the following order: “[1.] Tu ch’amarmi (written and dedicated by M [ ] Denza), [2.] Le retour de printemps (words by Charles d’Orleans), [3.] Rivièere fontaine (draft), [4.] Fischerlied (words by Ludwig Uhland) not autograph, [5.] Seliger Tod (words by Ludwig Uhland), [6.] Die Kapelle (words by Ludwig Uhland); [7.] Il ne vient pas (words by [ ] Bétourné); [8.] Goldfischlein (words by [ ] Förster; and [9.] Adieu les beaux jours.” These entries have some mistakes and omissions: For example, autograph [1.] was not written by M. Denza and dedicated to Pauline, but written by Pauline and dedicated to Mr. Denza. Autograph [3.] is not a draft of a new song, but an alternate setting for the third verse of autograph [2.], Le retour de printemps and autograph [4.], as far as I can tell, is in Pauline’s hand-writing. Other revisions to the electronic guide are necessary and should take into account the information contained in this chapter and in Waddington and Žekulin’s 2011 electronic catalogue.
accepted, would entail minor revisions and additions to both Houghton Library’s electronic guide\textsuperscript{234} and the electronic edition of Patrick Waddington and Nicholas G. Žekulin’s chronological catalogue.\textsuperscript{235} The next five Lieder and six romances were completed during Pauline’s initial presentations in Germany (May to September 1838), Brussels (autumn 1838), Paris (December 1838 to March 1839), and London (May to August 1839), as well as during a summer holiday at the beginning of August 1839 in Boulogne-sur-Mer:

Table 3.1. Chronological Reordering of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s Earliest Known Songs, Spring 1838-Summer 1839.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>DATE/PLACE</th>
<th>LOCATION OF AUTOGRAPH</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>PVG.s.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| a)“Goldfischlein” ‘Wenn auf dem See’ | May or June 1838 Berlin | Ms Mus 232, item 60 [8.]
Houghton Library, Harvard U. | Friedrich Christoph Förster | Fair Copy signed “Berlin 1838” | Unpublished |

\textsuperscript{234} For examples of revisions to the Houghton Library’s electronic guide see footnote 233.

\textsuperscript{235} Revisions to Waddington and Žekulin’s electronic catalogue are minor. The most relevant ensue: 1) Based on the dating of the autographs by Pauline and on documentary proof found in the correspondence of the Schumanns, which will be described later in the chapter, both “Seliger Tod” and “Die Capelle,” composed in Leipzig in June 1838, should precede “Etoile du soir,” composed in Berlin two months later, in August 1838. 2) The poetry of “Adieux les beaux jours” is not anonymous but was penned by Ambroise Betourne. 3) Both autographs to songs with words by Ambroise Betourne, “Il ne vient pas” and “Adieux les beaux jours,” are next to each other in the Harvard Manuscript, which might be indicative that they were composed at around the same time in Brussels, during the autumn of 1838, or before.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>DATE/PLACE</th>
<th>LOCATION OF AUTOGRAPH</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>PVG.s.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| b) “Des Knaben Berglied”  
‘Ich bin vom Berg der Hirtenknab’ | Summer 1838? | Lost Autograph | Ludwig Uhland | This song was only published in its French translation, “L’Enfant de la montagne” in 1840. | 0.1.f=1.2 |
| c) “Seliger Tod”  
‘Gestorben war ich von Liebeswonne’ | June 1838 Leipzig | Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.]  
| d) “Die Capelle”/  
“Die Kapelle”  
‘Droben steht die Kapelle’ | June 1838 Leipzig | Ms Mus 232, item 60 [6.]  
Houghton Library, Harvard U. | Ludwig Uhland | Fair Copy signed “Leipzig 1838” | 0.1.g=1.2 |
| e) “Etoile du soir”  
‘Etoile, belle étoile’ | August, 18, 1838 Frankfurt | ML96.V44 (case)  
| f) “Il ne vient pas”  
‘Il avait dit, quand la saison de fleurs’ | 1838 or before | Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.]  
Houghton Library, Harvard U. | Ambroise Béotourné | Fair Copy, not dated, but preceded and followed by manuscripts which Pauline dated 1838 | Unpublished |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>DATE/PLACE</th>
<th>LOCATION OF AUTOGRAPH</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>PVG.s.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>g) “Adieux les beaux jours” ‘Déjà la tendre fleur’</td>
<td>1838 or before Brussels</td>
<td>Ms Mus 232, item 60 [9.] Houghton Library, Harvard U.</td>
<td>Ambroise Bétourné</td>
<td>Fair Copy signed “Bruselles” Pauline seems not to have visited Brussels between Nov. 1838 and the date of publication of the song, 1843.</td>
<td>I.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) “Tu d’amarmi” ‘Tu d’amarmi un di giurasti’</td>
<td>August 1, 1839 London</td>
<td>Ms Mus 232, item 60 [1.] Houghton Library, Harvard U.</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Fair Copy, originally composed for the album of Mr. Denza, copied later onto Pauline’s black notebook. Signed “fait le 1er aout pour l’album de Mr. Denza – Londres, 1839”</td>
<td>Unpublished</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For songs created after the summer of 1839, it becomes harder, often impossible, to establish accurate dates of composition, since Pauline began to abandon the good habit of signing and dating completed autographs. In addition, as we have already discussed, a good number of the autographs for her entire output are now lost, in private collections or have been destroyed. As Waddington and Žekulin’s electronic catalogue establishes, secondary evidence (i.e. letters mentioning the act of composing and/or the completion of specific works, time of publication of songs and collections of songs, and commentaries of contemporaries on Pauline’s interpretations of her compositions) becomes at this stage crucial in establishing the chronology of at least some of her works.\textsuperscript{236}

Transcriptions after autographs found in Pauline’s black notebook of “Die Kapelle,” MS Mus 232, item 60 [6.], “Il ne vient pas,” bMS Mus 232, item 60 [7.], “Tu d’amarmi,” MS Mus 232, item 60 [1.], and “Le Retour de printemps,” MS Mus 232, item 60 [2.] can be found in appendix E of the present dissertation. Except for “Die Kapelle,”\textsuperscript{237} these early compositions have never been published before. The genesis and

\begin{verbatim}
\textsuperscript{236} Waddington and Žekulin, v-vi.

\end{verbatim}
musical style of these four works will be discussed in some detail in the following pages, which bring us back to Pauline’s initial tour in Germany.

Considering the singer’s early musical training with Liszt and Reicha, it should not be surprising that her earliest known compositions were Lieder with lyrics by popular German Romantic poets of the day, specifically Friedrich Christoph Förster (1791-1868) and Ludwig Uhland (1787-1862). Although she probably composed some of these songs in Berlin and Leipzig with the intention of impressing German audiences with her mastery of the language, compositional facility, and interpretative virtuosity, many of them were intimate expressions of her sensibility towards German Romantic poetry and were probably not intended for public performance. Such is the case with her setting of “Seliger Tod.” This miniature musical thought of just eight measures somehow manages to encompass Ludwig Uhland’s one-verse description of the poetic persona’s initiation into the powerful emotions of love:

Gestorben war ich
Vor Liebeswonne:
Begraben lag ich
In ihren Armen;
Erwecket ward ich
Von ihren Küssen;
Den Himmel sah ich
In ihren Augen.

I was dead
To love’s wonderment:
I laid buried
In its arms;
I was awakened
By its kisses;
I saw heaven
in its eyes.

The complete autograph of Pauline’s song is presented in Figure 3.4:
Figure 3.4. Pauline Garcia, “Seliger Tod,” AMs composed in Leipzig, 1838, Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.], courtesy of Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

For the sake of clarity, a transcription of this manuscript is given in Example 3.3:
It is interesting to discover, even in these early and succinct phrases, some of the musical resources which would characterize Pauline’s compositional style during the 1840s, for example motivic economy, clear phrase structure, and tertian modulations through sudden chromatic and enharmonic shifts (i.e. measures 3, 5, and 7) applied to initially ordinary harmonic progression. These resources enable the composer to translate beautifully the poetic persona’s transcendental experience of romantic love. Little importance is given here to vocal and/or pianistic virtuosity; Pauline Garcia’s settings seem to privilege, from the start, the transmission of poetic ideas.

A few of Pauline Garcia’s earliest Lieder were created during the period when her friendship with Robert Schumann and Clara Wieck was blossoming. Early
correspondence between Clara and Schumann and entries in his journal for the summer of 1838 preserve the specifics of their initial encounters. On June 30—four days after Schumann attended the concert by Pauline and de Bériot at the Leipzig Gewandhaus—he was invited to meet them at their lodgings. On that occasion he was once again much impressed by Pauline’s singing and playing.\(^{238}\) From the events which unfolded during the month of July and which will be related in the next pages, she presumably performed for him on that occasion one of her songs.

In the meantime, Pauline and Clara Wieck, who had just returned from concertizing in Vienna, quickly managed to become friends.\(^{239}\) This should not be surprising for both were very close in age (Clara being but a year and a half older than Pauline) and shared a love for music. According to musicologist Beatrix Borchard, Clara very soon confessed to the seventeen-year-old singer her secret relationship with Schumann and the uphill battle she had to sustain every day to hide it from her vigilant and disapproving father, Friedrich Wieck (1785-1873).\(^{240}\) Most probably Clara shared her secret with Pauline and later regretted her initial impulse, deciding to withhold details of the relationship from her. Normally she was quite cautious about sharing this


\(^{239}\) The initial meeting of both young women took place in Leipzig and not in Dresden as some biographers of Clara Schumann have stated in the past. Proof can be found in a letter sent by Clara to Robert from Dresden: “I’ll probably stay in town until Friday because of the Garcias and Bériot; I’ll say hello to them from you and Dr. Reuter today when I go there for a visit—I’ll be thinking a lot of my last visit with them in Leipzig!” Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Dresden, July 3, 1838, in Eva Weissweiler, ed., *The Complete Correspondence of Clara and Robert Schumann*, vol. 1, trans. Hildegard Fritsch (New York: Peter Lang, 1994), 189.

\(^{240}\) Beatrix Borchard, “‘Ma chère petite Clara – Pauline de mon cœur’ Clara Schumann et Pauline Viardot, une amitié d’artistes franco-allemande,” *Cahiers Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot, Maria Malibran* 20 (1996), 130.
information, even with close acquaintances, a point which caused misunderstandings at times between her and Schumann, who had a more extrovert personality and at times spoke overtly with others about his feelings for Clara. Four months after her first meeting with Pauline, she chastised him: “You know my reasons for secrecy and now I’m trusting in the sensitivity that you’ve often shown me. — I won’t say anything to Pauline about our correspondence.”

Her caution in this respect did not diminish with time, even after her arrival to Paris.

Despite Clara's misgivings, Pauline—impressed by the young pianist’s musicality and virtuosity—sympathized with her plight and hoped to help. Both girls traveled to Dresden at the beginning of July 1838, where Pauline and de Bériot were expecting to perform at court. On July 5, Schumann wrote a long missive to Clara where he proposed publishing songs by both young women for the third musical supplement of the Neue Zeitschrift für Musik:

> If you should hear something by Ms. Garcia, a romance, etc., which would be fitting for the supplement, please tell her that I'd asked you to ask her, etc.; it would make me very happy to receive something from the two of you.

When Clara received this letter, Pauline and her family had already left Dresden, so the young girl wrote back to her secret fiancé:


242 During the summer of 1839, as the lovers were planning a secret meeting either in Frankfurt or Altenberg, Clara wrote to her fiancé: “I told [Pauline] (what I tell everyone here) that I wanted to meet with my father and would certainly come back.” Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Paris, August 12, 1838, in Ibid., 374.

I wrote to Pauline in Karlsbad about [your request] right away. I have grown very fond of the dear girl. She is an artist and yet so nice. I think she will surely submit something. . . . But can I really write something? . . . I started a romance for you a long time ago, and it’s really rolling around in my head, but I can’t get it down on paper. . . . Pauline composed some very lovely romances . . . I would love to ingratiate myself to my husband-to-be with a nocturne or a romance. Perhaps I’ll have an inspired idea.244

In the same letter she expressed to Schumann her longing to concertize next in Paris and London and not in Munich and Amsterdam, as her father intended. It may be that she wanted to follow Pauline’s footsteps through these cities, thus getting as far as possible from the enervating presence of her father:

You think that a tour to Paris and London would be too time consuming? You are wrong there. The season in Paris lasts from December until March, I think, and in London until July, if I’m not mistaken. So the tour would continue till summer.245

This idea is supported by the fact that Pauline would spend precisely the months of December 1838 to March 1839 in Paris and April or May to early August 1839 in London. It is probable that both teenagers formulated Clara’s new tour in order to remain close to each other. By the end of the month, Pauline was back in Dresden and both girls had the chance once more of spending happy hours together:

Pauline is here again, and we’ve been at the piano from morning till night. She wrote down the Lied for you yesterday, and I’ll give it to you when I have an opportunity. It is very beautiful—her talent is so great you wouldn’t think it possible.246

244 Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Maxen, July 8/9, 1838, in Ibid., 199.

245 Ibid.

246 Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Dresden, July 26 to 30, 1838, in Ibid., 217.
The Lied which Pauline copied down for Schumann on July 28 was a setting of Uhland’s “Die Capelle,” which she had completed in Leipzig the previous month.

Schumann received the autograph three days later and promised to write a letter (now lost) of gratitude to Fraulein Garcia for her “excellent” work. This Lied became Pauline’s first published composition (PVG.s.0.1.g), making its initial appearance in the third musical supplement of Die Neue Zeitschrift für Musik in September 1838. Two months later, Schumann published in the journal his own commentary on the Lied, revealing his views on Pauline’s talents as a composer:


247 “I'll write to Ms. Garcia, too, whose lied I received yesterday. You have provided me with something very interesting, my dear, young, future housewife.” Letter of Robert Schumann to Clara Wieck, Leipzig, August 1, 1838, in Ibid., 222 and “The third supplement has something by L. Berger, Henselt, Mr. Mathieux and the lied by Ms. Garcia—excellent pieces throughout.” Letter of Robert Schumann to Clara Wieck, Leipzig, August 3, 1838, in Ibid., 225.

Perhaps the reader thanks us for what we assembled for him in the third volume of our journal, pieces of the most diverse art in form and character, among which two were penned by women, who have been in our time in the highest spotlight of the musical world. Many journals here and abroad have already written about Pauline Garcia. As a singer, she follows her famous sister, as a composer she perhaps surpasses her, and this is why she focuses more in this last skill. The song is unusual, first as a German Lied composed by a Spaniard, then in and of itself, in its design and rounding out. The musician has rendered the picture of the poet to the finest detail and has added her own [ideas], even making the shepherd boy sing at the beginning of the work. His song might seem a tag too playful next to the peaceful landscape that the poet spreads before us, [but it] makes the contrast more powerful. Toward the conclusion [of the Lied] the singing of the shepherd boy almost disappears, segments appearing here and there like an echo in the accompaniment; the little bell seems to ring stronger and higher than his singing. It is a personal interpretation, like the composer herself, a voice coming from the deepest self, which gives the Lied the right color and meaning.

There is a combination of bafflement and admiration in Schumann’s appraisal: The bafflement springs from the idea of a Spaniard being able to create an effective German Lied, the admiration, from recognizing the originality and candor of Pauline’s compositional voice. From his detailed comments, it is clear that Schumann’s imagination was captivated by Pauline’s Lied. Schumann signals to the elements which make the song special; particularly, he suggests that much of its uniqueness springs from Pauline’s artful manipulation of the outlines of the musical strophes and by her insertion of the contrasting cheerful song of the shepherd boy. In other words, the musical setting, follows the general outlines of Uhland’s three-verse form (one poetic strophe=one musical strophe), yet compositional flexibly allows the emotional stance of each verse to dictate the musical narrative.

For the present musical description of the song, I have not employed the original version published in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, but an autograph which Pauline
annotated in her black notebook during the summer of 1839 (“Die Kapelle”, MS Mus 232, item 60, [6.]). The composer probably employed this manuscript as a personal copy to perform the piece, since it differs in a few interesting details from the original publication: mainly, the coloratura passage is more virtuosic, requiring a more extended register from the singer. There are also actual metric changes between the two contrasting musical sections in the manuscript which do not exist in the first published version. The manuscript can be seen as an intermediate step between the original published version and the French translated version, which would be published in Paris in 1843.²⁴⁹ A transcription of the full manuscript of “Die Kapelle” (MS Mus 232, Item 60, [6.]) can be found in appendix E. For comparison purposes, it is followed by a copy of “La Chapelle”/Ballade, PVG.s.I.2.

Pauline subtitled the French version of the song with the term ballade. Ludwig Uhland’s poem, however, seems too brief, lyrical, and evocative to actually fit well within this category of narrative song. Written in 1805, “Die Kapelle” was one of Uhland’s earliest poems inspired by folk song. He later included it in the Lieder section of his influential Gedichte (1815). The poem with an English translation is presented below:

²⁴⁹“La Chapelle”/Ballade, PVG.s.I.2 became the second work in the composer’s first collection of songs, Album de Mme Viardot Garcia (Paris: Troupenas, 1843). For the French translated version, Pauline also revised the music, getting rid of the metric changes, clarifying the melodic motion of the inner voices and simplifying the section of coloratura (i.e. reducing its range and removing some of the most taxing intervallic skips to the upper vocal register). These modifications rendered the translated Lied a tag more accessible for French dilettantes.
Droben stehet die Kapelle,
Schauet still ins Thal hinab.
Drunten singt bei Wies' und Quelle
Froh und hell der Hirtenknab'.

Traurig tönt das Glöcklein nieder,
Schauerlich der Leichenchor,
Stille sind die frohen Lieder,
Und der Knabe lauscht empor.

Droben bringt man sie zu Grabe,
Die sich freuten in dem Thal.
Hirtenknabe, Hirtenknabe!
Dir auch singt man dort einmal.

High above stands the chapel,
Mutely gazing at the vale below;
Below, next to meadow and brook,
The shepherd lad sings happily, lightly.

Mournfully tolls the little bell,
Eerily sounds the funeral choir;
The lad’s merry songs now muted,
He listens to the sound above.

Above, they bring to the grave
Those who once frolicked in the vale.
Shepherd lad, shepherd lad!
They will also sing for you one day.

In “Die Kapelle” Uhland combines a simple and direct employment of the German language with a transparent poetic form (i.e. three strophes made up of four trochaic tetrameter lines, each of them employing an alternating rhyme scheme). The effective directness of form and language could make a casual reader forget some of the more subtle qualities of the poem’s content, such as its metaphorical employment of musical and spatial imagery to depict opposite ontological states. Thus, life is represented by the shepherd boy singing merrily by the moving waters of the green vale and ever present and vigilant death by the mournful tolling of the chapel and the eerie singing of its choir high in the mountains. In her setting, Pauline makes a convincing musical interpretation of Uhland’s juxtaposed poetic images by employing contrasting textures, meters, modes and rhythmic figures for them. The song’s A-flat major home key area, for example, quickly becomes associated with the young lad’s song and the life it represents, whereas the parallel minor key (A-flat minor) and mediant key (C minor) soon come to stand for the chapel, its mournful choir and, ultimately, death.
Precise musical gestures to represent key poetic concepts are characteristic of Pauline’s early musical language. The solemn chapel high in the mountains is suggested through the use of a monophonic, hollow-octave texture, a Romantic invocation of a medieval chant or hymn. The initial unison phrase in quarter notes is ambiguous in both mode and key, starting apparently in A-flat major (I) but soon shifting to C minor (iii). The low tones of motive X (do-do-do-ti-la-ti-sol-mi), reproduced in Example 3.4, are associated initially with the chapel and later on with death:


At measure 9, the composer begins to prepare for the initial appearance of the song of the youth by shifting the meter from duple to compound and the dynamic levels from soft to loud. The initial rhythmic figures in quarter notes are infused with forward impetus by the appearance of triplets. Drones in the accompaniment emphasize the pastoral character of the section. Motivic segments of the song of the youth are initially heard in the right hand of the piano, which the singer soon overtakes to build the shepherd’s song (mm. 17-31). The virtuosic vocalise of the shepherd soars through the vale up into the mountains; the composer requires vocal flexibility as well as an extended range to fully represent the
spatial traveling of the shephard’s song through a series of large intervallic skips, which must be executed with speed and precision. Imbedded in the vocalise, motive Y (sol-la-mi-sol), becomes associated with the light, happy, and carefree state of early youth. It is repeated twice at the beginning of the boy’s song (mm. 17-18) and reappears subsequently in rhythmically altered versions (mm. 24-27). Example 3.5 presents these reappearances:


The free, swaying motion of the vocalise is briefly disrupted by an unexpected move to a C-flat major chord (bIII) at measure 29 and a modally altered D-flat minor chord (iv6) in measures 29-30. Motive Y is chromatically altered in the voice, which adds expressive pungency and a hint of uneasiness to the lad’s yodeling. The expected dominant and tonic chords in the home key area, however, still close the progression.

After the shepherd’s song comes to an end, a shift in meter and tempo takes us to the initial theme (measures 39-57) and to the beginning of the second musical theme. The

---

250 It is important to note that both motive X, associated with death, and motive Y, associated with life, are built on thirds. Perhaps it was a way for the composer to facilitate the eventual synthesis of them in the postlude of the song? If so, the metaphorical message could be that life and death hold a mirror to each other.
chant’s sparse texture is now enriched by the tolling of the chapel’s bell on the dominant (E-flat octave). Modal mixture and the addition of a descending countermelody in the bass beginning at measure 49 serve to illustrate the eerie funeral choir of Uhland’s poem. The singer presents a new phrase of the chant or hymn in the tonic’s parallel minor key, a smooth, economic shift which quickly associates the key of A-flat minor with death. See Example 3.6:


A modulation to C minor (iii) and the return of the vocalise in the right hand of the accompaniment appear to be vain attempts to reestablish the happy pastoral character of the music. The lad’s frolicking song hardly has any time to take off; it is disrupted by two hesitant pauses and a diminished seventh chord (m. 63) which does not resolve to its proper dominant, a convincing representation of the doubts and fears which invade the shepherd at this moment. See Example 3.7:
A modal shift to the bright key of C major suddenly occurs at m. 65. What can be its musico-poetic significance? Perhaps the lad has realized just for a moment the ulterior consequences of the mournful chant or hymn. His young life force seems to negate the realization of death for there is a sudden modal shift through an ascending and rhythmically accentuated vocal phrase. See Example 3.8:

As the song comes to a close, it seems that the shepherd is still young enough to ignore the poem’s existential message (i.e. “Dir auch singt man dort einmal”), despite the fact that it is reiterated thrice by the singer/narrator. We return to the home key area and
hear fragments of the lad’s happy song in the piano, slowly disappearing as he takes off, cheerful and oblivious to what has just transpired. Despite his resistance, poem and music keep informing the listener in philosophical terms: Modal mixture is pervasive as beautiful contrapuntal and melodic mixtures of fragments of motives X and Y occur in the last vocal phrase and postlude of the 3.9) composition. They finally seem to join in perfect, bittersweet harmony, slowly descending in range and dynamic level, morendo and interring with them the song’s ontological conflict. See Example 3.9:


Through an economic use of expressive means and an intelligent manipulation of musical resources, the seventeen-year-old composer demonstrated to her German contemporaries
that she could produce a surprisingly mature and beautiful Lied. Her sensitive and detailed musical rendition of Uhland’s text surprised Schumann in 1838, just as it surprises us as modern listeners. It remained to be seen if the composer, in the absence of direct models, could bring such a level of sophistication to the French *romance*.

After Pauline copied “Die Kapelle” for Schumann on July 28, Clara began to vacillate about her own compositional abilities. On July 30, she received and played with admiration Schumann’s *Kreisleriana*, which caused her to question her numerous merits.

I can’t tell you yet what I liked best of [*Kreisleriana*]. I was so excited when I played that I always thought the piece I had just played was the most beautiful one. I am amazed at your genius. . . . Sometimes I get the idea that you might not be satisfied with me . . . I might have given up my music because of Pauline if father hadn’t been with me and hadn’t reminded me of the things I can do, and that some people have more talents than others.\(^{251}\)

A complex of inferiority was to plague Clara during her adult life, making her vulnerable to manipulation. One cannot doubt that, apart from making her one of the most accomplished pianists of her generation, her father, through the demeaning and cruel treatment of his daughter, had a destructive influence on her personality. Sadly, Schumann’s own idealized and unrealistic expectations of his bride-to-be—thoroughly grounded in conventions of the era which limited the role of a married woman to the private sphere—further constrained the full realization of Clara’s artistic potential. Pauline, on the other hand, was not so vulnerable to this kind of manipulation. Her unconventional, itinerant childhood helped her to form an artistic and independent

personality unhindered by the most restrictive behavioral norms imposed on the
individual by his/her surrounding society. In addition, she learned early on the value and
rewards of self-determination from the example set forth by members of her family.
Despite the adversity she had to face after the death of her father and sister, she retained a
winning, open and assertive temperament, which often clashed with the behavioral
sterotypes imposed on women of the time. To Julius Rietz she would confess years later.

_Je n’ai malheureusement aucune des qualités brillantes et fascinantes
de mon père mais je lui ressemble en ceci : c’est que je ne fais pas les
choses à moitié et que j’ai l’horreur de l’hypocrisie. Quand je crois
devoir faire une chose, je la ferai malgré l’eau, le feu, la société,
le monde entier. J’ai une grande force de volonté sur moi-même
. . . Mettez cela à coté de cette passion de changement, de cette
instabilité physique qui est innée dans moi, de la plus complète
indifférence pour la plus grand partie des gens qui je connais, et
surtout pour des évènements qui sembleraient devoir m’intéresser._

Unhappily, I possess not one of my father’s brilliant and fascinating
qualities, but I resemble him in this—that I do not do things by halves,
and have a horror of hypocrisy. When I think I ought to do anything,
I will do it in spite of water, fire, society, the whole world. My will-power
exercises strong control over me. . . . Place that side by side with this
passion for change, this physical instability which is innate in me,
the most complete indifference for the majority of persons whom
I know, and above all for happenings which might be expected to
engage my interest. 252

It was probably this unrepressed willpower, joined to her originality and genuine musical
talent, which allowed Pauline to accomplish so many engagements successfully
throughout her operatic career and to keep a positive attitude through the many
tribulations that she would eventually have to face.

252 Pauline Viardot to Julius Rietz, London, January 21, 1859, in “Letters of Freindship,”
In 1838, she wished that her new friend Clara could find the courage to believe in her artistic gifts and inner strength, thus discovering her own way in the world. She also hoped to be close to her and endeavored to help within the limits of her possibilities. Like a concerned and protective older sister, Pauline wrote to Clara the following lines in imperfect German at the end of August from Frankfurt:


What beautiful things have you made after we last saw each other? Have you composed a lot? Yes? If so, that makes me happy. You will show me your compositions in Brussels, is it not true? I announced your arrival in the musical journal of Monsieur Fétis. Everyone is very curious to hear you. In all our letters, it is spirited little Clara who takes the most important place. Even the piano is impatient to feel your fingers, if you delay your arrival, it will abandon its spot, go to the post and make the trip to Leipzig by stagecoach. . . . Oh, my little Clara, come very soon!

When she wrote this letter of encouragement, Pauline had just performed a concert in Wiesbaden (August 21, 1838). The event had been attended by Meyerbeer, who had traveled especially from Schalbach to hear her. Two years before, he had met her in the role of humble accompanist to her brilliant sister and brother-in-law; now he was

²⁵³ Pauline Garcia to Clara Wieck, Frankfurt, August 22, 1838, quoted in Beatrix Borchard, “‘Ma chère petite Clara – Pauline de mon cœur,’” 130. Clara—irresolute and still hoping that her father would relent and accompany her on the new projected tour—did not manage to reunite with Pauline in Brussels that November.
impressed enough to propose on the spot the composition of an opera especially tailored for her voice.\textsuperscript{254} Thus in the course of less than three months during the summer of 1838, Pauline not only made the acquaintance or reacquaintance of Felix Mendelssohn, Robert Schumann, Clara Wieck, and Giacomo Meyerbeer but also gained their genuine friendship, professional support, and admiration.

In Frankfurt, Pauline composed her first known song in French, “Etoile du soir.”\textsuperscript{255} During the two months which preceded her initial presentations in Paris, she probably composed in Brussels two more songs in French, “Il ne vient pas” and “Adieu les beaux jours,” both to poetry of Ambroise Bétourné (1795-1838), a blacksmith and writer of humble origins from Normandy with leftist sympathies. Manuscripts for both of these works can be found in the black notebook described above.\textsuperscript{256} An extended musical discussion of her setting of Bétourné’s “Il ne vient pas” is presented in the next pages.

\textsuperscript{254} See Ibid., 131. It would take eleven years for this project to come to full fruition in the form of \textit{Le Prophète}.

\textsuperscript{255} “Etoile du soir”, AMs, ML96.V44, Library of Congress, Washington. This manuscipt is signed with the following inscription: “Pauline Garcia, Francfort, Le 18 août 1838”

\textsuperscript{256} “Il ne vient pas” and “Adieu les beaux jours,” AMs, items 60 [7.] and 60 [9.] in Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (MS Mus 232), Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA. The composer indicates in the autograph of “Adieux les beaux jours” that the song was composed in Brussels. My theory is that she composed it in October or November 1838, after her return from the German tour and the completion of her first datable \textit{romance}, “Etoile du soir,” but before setting off to Paris for the winter season of 1838-1839. She was probably attempting to create several original \textit{romances} to impress French audiences with her compositional abilities. The autograph of “Il ne vient pas” (MS Mus 232, item 60 [7.]) immediately precedes that of “Adieux les beaux jours” in the black notebook. Since this song also employs the poetry of Ambroise Bétourné, it is probable that she composed both works at the same time. The alternative remains, however, that both of these songs were created during Pauline’s years in Ixelles in 1835, 1836, 1837, or the beginning of 1838. If so, this would make these two compositions Pauline’s earliest works.
During the 1820s, Bétourné had been known as a romancier in the most fashionable salons of Paris. A compilation of the poetry of this prolific blacksmith entitled *Délassements poétiques, elegies, fables, romances* was published in 1825. The volume encompassed many of the pleasant yet somewhat anodyne romances, which he created for professional and amateur composers of salon songs. These composers must have appreciated the succinct and regular form of Bétourné’s verses, which they could quickly insert into standard and repetitive melodic phrases of 4 + 4 measures. Contemporary admirer Paul Delasalle described his poetic practices in the following manner:

> L’homme de poésie qui arrive ainsi à se plier complaisamment aux vœux et aux idées d’un autre artiste, a rendre son vers rythmé et flexible, à placer les repos et les césures comme des charnières qui se correspondent de distance en distance, et qui permettent au poème de se prêter à toutes les impulsions, à tous les caprices mobiles de l’harmonie . . . est le poète qu’il faut au compositeur, l’accessoire indispensable de son génie, la parole de ses rêveries et de ses émotions. A. Bétourné était cet homme-la.

The man of poetry who is able to yield graciously to the voice and ideas of another artist, to make his verses rhythmic and flexible, to place stops and caesuras as if they were equally measured hinges, thus allowing the poem to lend itself to all the impulses and mobile caprices of harmony, . . . is the poet that a composer needs, the indispensable accessory to his genius, the word of his dreams and emotions. A. Bétourné was such a man.

---

257 A poet who created lyrics especially for composers to set to music, often they were driven by commercial interests. For more on romanciers see chapter 2 of the present dissertation.


During María Malibran’s first years as an independent singer in the French capital (1828-1831), she was on friendly terms with the fashionable *romancier*. She seems to have been attracted to the dichotomy in character presented by this politically active man from the working classes with a passion for sentimental literature and music:

*Je lui ai entendu dire à lui-même qu’il lui arriva plus d’une fois de quitter le tablier de forgeron pour l’habit de gala, et de passer en moins d’une heure de son atelier de serrurerie dans le salon de Mme. Malibran.*

He told me more than once that there were several occasions when he had to change the blacksmith’s apron for a gala suit, and pass in less than one hour from his locksmith’s shop to the salon of Mme. Malibran.

Maria favored Bétourné with several settings of his *romances*, among them “Le Réveil d’un beau jour”/*Chansonnette*, “La Tarentelle”/*Chansonnette*, “Les Refrains”/*Romance*, “La Bayadère”/*Chansonnette*, and “La Résignation”/*Romance* for her *Album lyrique* (Paris: Troupenas, n.d.) and “La Fiancée du brigand”/*Ballade*, “Les Noces d’un marin”/*Chanson*, and “Le Montagnard”/*Tyrolienne* published in her posthumous album, *Dernières pensées musicales de Marie Félicité Garcia de Beriot*. Like many of her contemporaries, Pauline’s older sister was attracted to Romantic poems full of exotic allure and exciting descriptions of the natural world. Many of Bétourné’s *romances* seem to have suited her tastes perfectly. Her setting of “Le Réveil d’un beau jour”/*Chansonnette* exemplifies her musical response to his pastoral evocation of a springtime morning. The musical refrain (A) of this ABAB’AB”A form is reproduced as Example 3.10:

---

260 Ibid.

The section’s simple phrase structure (2 + 4 + 4 + 2 measures), repetitive rhythmic and melodic patterns, and unsophisticated harmonic progressions serve well to create an effective salon emulation of popular music. This is particularly evident in the somewhat tame and short yodeling call included in measures 10 through 12. María’s setting is pleasant but unoriginal, easy to perform for both the accompanist and the singer, a text-
book example of the *romance* as a vocal genre blending bourgeois technical and expressive limitations with romantic sensibility.

A few of the lyrics which María employed in her songs are included in Bétourné’s *Délassements poétiques*, which probably indicates that she owned a copy of this book in Paris, and later on in Ixelles, as well as loose copies of some of his poems. When Pauline decided to compose two songs based on his lyrics in the autumn of 1838, she probably employed the collection of his works compiled by her deceased sister. She might have also known Bétourné personally and heard of his recent death. This could help to explain her somewhat morose choice of lyrics, her melancholic and pensive setting of “Adieu les beaux jours” and the musical and psychological instability of “Il ne vient pas.” The lyrics of the latter are presented below. The two strophes are organized in four verses of ten-syllables each, the caesura within each line falling neatly after the first four syllables. Each strophe is followed by a one-line refrain of eight syllables:

261 “Adieu les beaux jours” can be found in the last section of Bétourné’s *Délassements poétiques*. “Il ne vient pas”, however, is not in that anthology.

262 He had died a few months earlier in Rouen of an attack of apoplexy. Ibid.
Il avait dit quand la saison des fleurs,
Ramènera le printemps dans la plaine,
Libre de soins sur ces bords en hauteurs,
Je reviendrais finir ta longue peine.

Pourant hélas ! Il ne vient pas.

L’oiseau joyeux a recouvré sa voix,
L’air ses parfums, le ruisseau son murmure.
Tout se ranime, et les champs et les bois,
Et les coteaux couronnés de verdure.

Pourant hélas ! Il ne vient pas.

He said, when the season of flowers,
Brings Spring again to the plains,
Without worries on these high cliffs,
I shall come to end your long sorrow.

Despite it all, alas! He does not come.

The joyous bird has recovered its voice,
The air its perfume, the brook its murmur,
All comes to life, the fields, the forest,
And the cliffs crowned with verdure.

Despite it all, alas! He does not come.

The first page of the autograph of “Il ne vient pas” is reproduced in Figure 3.5. It is
followed by a transcription (Example 3.11), which includes the first five measures of the
manuscript’s second page, in order to complete the closing musical phrase:
Figure 3.5. Pauline Garcia. “Il ne vient pas,” AMs with AMs corrections, Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.], courtesy of Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.
In the opening measures of Pauline’s “Il ne vient pas,” there is much harmonic, melodic, and rhythmic instability. The capriciousness of these elements is emphasized by the stable waltz-like accompaniment chosen by the composer. The brief prelude—with its off-beat drone on the tonic pitched against the chromatic lines of the upper voices—might have seemed strange and disorienting to the listener of the time. In its initial simplicity the vocal line is also duplicitous; in less than five measures (mm. 6-10), through a series of arpeggiated upward skips of fifths and fourths, its range opens up to encompass an octave and a half. The delivery of the text is fast and a bit mechanical,
giving the singer few chances to catch her breath. Chromaticism makes itself in the vocal line at the crucial point when the promise of the false lover (i.e. “je reviendrai”) is stated and restated (mm. 17-21); these repetitions, in combination with the rhythmic elongation and syncopation employed to depict the words “finir ta longue peine” (mm.21-24), break up the symmetry in the vocal phrases. As in the cavatina of a Donizettian mad scene, all these destabilizing musical resources contribute to reveal to the listener the deranged mental state of the abandoned poetic persona.

Text painting plays a more concrete role in the musical rendition of the second poetic strophe, which is more descriptive and less narrative than the first one. To begin with, a tertian modulation (mm. 54-55) to the more “relaxed” key of A-flat major (an enharmonic respelling of the tonic’s modally altered mediant key, G-sharp major) changes both musical color and mood. The section is reproduced in Example 3.12:
Chromaticism disappears at this point from the simple harmonic progressions; the vocal line also becomes less rangy, ascending in stepwise motion from tonic to dominant, in what could be construed as an expectant musical gesture. Reviving springtime is captured in a series of pictorial musical figures, presented against the continuous backdrop of the waltz rhythm in the left hand: a syncopated and articulated two-note figure, suggesting a bird call, repeats in the highest range of the keyboard. The sixteenth notes in the melody at measure 65 hint at the brook’s murmuring. Such resources effectively combine to convey to the listener the poetic persona’s change of mood, as she steps out of her own
inner misery to notice the renewal of the natural world which surrounds her. Alas, it is only a brief change. Through a respelled common tone (A-flat=G-sharp) in measures 66-67, the music shifts once again to the sharp side of the tonal spectrum. This change is emphasized by a sequence of brief tonicizations in the accompaniment and chromaticism in the vocal line (measures 67-70). Thus the unstable emotional state of the poetic persona begins to infiltrate her perception of the natural world.

Soon the arrival of spring seems to be equaled in her mind with personal tragedy and loss. As she notes the renewal of life ("tout se ranime"), her mental agitation is captured in the accompaniment. A two-note figure (an inversion of the bird-song figure) repeats, descending and ascending through the middle and upper register of the keyboard, first through an unstable passage in B major with a clashing chromatic inner voice (mm. 72-74), and then through an extended diminished chord (mm. 79-81). This part of the score is reproduced in Example 3.13:
This finally brings us back to the original home key area for the second and final statement of the singer’s mournful and desperate musical/poetic refrain.

It is intriguing that even in one of her earliest French songs, Pauline already demonstrates a convincing amalgamation of national styles through a flexible application of musical resources. In “Il ne vient pas” she incorporates, in relatively seamless fashion, Bétourné’s simple salon lyrics with a sophisticated employment of tonality, harmony, form and motivic development, all for the purpose of creating a convincing and multi-layered musical characterization. Her work also achieves a more equal role between voice and piano than the average romance of the day. In fact, the accompaniment plays at times a more important role than the singer in the depiction of the poem’s external world and the poetic persona’s internal conflict. As was seen in chapter 2, such stylistic elements were foreign to French song at the time, but endemic to German Lieder.
Furthermore, the melodiousness and dramatic vigor of the vocal line set against the steady presentation of the waltz rhythm could be directly extracted from the Italian operatic style of the *primo ottocento*.

There are no records of Pauline performing her two settings of Bétourné during the first months that she spent in Paris, although she probably conceived them for that purpose. Apparently she decided not to employ his lyrics again for subsequent French art songs, perhaps because in the late 1830s—as hinted by Bétourné’s contemporaray Paul Delsalle—the style of his lyrical poetry had already lost its novel veneer and its initial Romantic elan:

*Àujourd’hui que nous l’avons perdu, il serait triste de laisser la romance déchoir . . . Rêvons, composons, inventons de nouveaux rythmes et de nouveaux genres ; le Tyrol est une terre usée ; les glaciers de l’Helvétique fondent au soleil ; les bergères et les fougères sont un peu flétries ; Venise n’a plus de lagunes et de gondoliers à suffire ; les mères larmoyantes et les lionnes andalouses ont trop gémi ou rugi sur les claviers ; les amoureux de nos albums illustrés se sont assez mirés dans les yeux les uns des autres ; faisons du neuf, s’il peut ; sinon, ayons recours à nos ancètres ou à nos voisins ; l’Allemagne est une bonne prêteuse. . . que notre poésie parlée ou chantée se résigne aussi à lui être redevable de quelque chose. Le Français, qui n’est plus léger, a commencé depuis longtemps à pouvoir comprendre la mélancolie de Uhland et de Bürger . . .*\(^{263}\)

\(^{263}\) Ibid.
Today, when we have lost him, it would be sad to leave the romance to decay . . . Let us dream, compose, and invent novel rhythms and new genres; the Tyrol is a used land; the glaciers of Helvetia are melting in the sun; the shepherds and perfumes are a bit wilted; Venice cannot fit more lagoons and gondoliers; Crying mothers and Andalusian lions have wept and roared enough over carnations; the lovers of our illustrated albums have looked into each other’s eyes enough; If possible, let us do something new, if not, let us look for help in the works of our ancestors or neighbors; Germany is a good example . . . let our spoken or sung poetry resign itself to be a bit on its debt. The Frenchman, who is no longer shallow, has begun, after a long time, to understand the melancholy of Uhland and of Bürger.

It is probable that Pauline, with her intelligent understanding of Uhland’s poetry and Schubert’s Lieder, also felt a desire at this time to find more sophisticated lyrics than those by Bétourné for her experimental settings in French. But these concerns had to be set aside at the time, for the young singer was about to seek her fortune in the French capital.

Guided by her mother and de Bériot, Pauline began her Parisian performances in the late autumn of 1838, singing initially for dilettanti in the drawing rooms of Madame Caroline Jaubert and the Belgian ambassador, Charles Le Hon (1792-1868). Later on that season, she would appear at the famous salons of Princess Cristina de Belgiojoso and pianist and pedagogue Pierre-Joseph Zimmerman (1785-1853). After singing a matinée at the salon of Mme. Jaubert, Pauline was introduced to Alfred de Musset, then twenty-eight, who was dazzled not only by her singing but by her knowledgeable conversation.264 The word about her remarkable voice and musical brilliance spread fast.

264 Although their friendship initially flourished, very soon Pauline seems to have tired of the exaggerated attentions of the flamboyant de Musset. Her sympathy towards him was somewhat dampened by his constant drunkenness, disheveled appearance, and filtrations with the
The public’s curiosity about la Malibran’s sister was transformed into frenzy after Pauline’s inaugural concert at the Théâtre de la Renaissance on December 15, 1838. Intrigued and somewhat enamored, de Musset quickly dedicated to her a critic full of praise and poetic verses, which were published in *La Revue des deux mondes* to inaugurate the New Year:

*C’est le même timbre clair, sonore, hardi [de la Malibran], ce coup de gosier espagnol . . . qui produit sur nous une impression à peu près analogue à la saveur d’un fruit sauvage . . . son talent est si naturel, qu’on ne pense même pas à s’en étonner. Sa physionomie pleine d’expression, change avec une rapidité prodigieuse, non seulement selon le morceau, mais selon la phrase qu’elle exécute. Elle possède, en un mot, le grand secret des artistes ; avant d’exprimer, elle sent . . .*

It is the same clear, sonorous and intrepid timbre [of la Malibran], that same Spanish glottal close . . . which produces on the listener an impression analogous to the taste of a wild fruit . . . her talent is so natural that one forgets to be astonished. Her physiognomy full of expression, changes with prodigious velocity, not only depending on the piece, but depending on the phrase which she executes. She possesses in one word the great secret of true artists: Before expressing, she feels . . .

To have such a glowing review written by one of the most prominent literary figures of the city was no small matter. De Musset pinpoints the elements that made Pauline’s artistic personality attractive to the French public. Despite having been born in Paris, she was a representative of the exotic Other, a “wild fruit” with “natural” impulsive genius and unrestrained feeling. Both her father and sister had led highly successful careers in the city by adapting to the advantages (and constrictions) imposed by this somewhat

---

265 Alfred de Musset, “Mlle. Pauline Garcia,” *La Revue de deux mondes*, series IV, vol. 17 (January 1, 1839), 111. The poetic stances were titled *Sur les débuts de Mesdemoiselles Rachel et Pauline Garcia* and were published as a conclusion to de Musset’s article.
artificial identity. Did Pauline now wish to do the same? It is true that she had played her role successfully as a “reincarnation” of her willful sister, but there are hints even in this initial phase of her musical career that she wanted to be recognized for her own individuality, both as singer and as composer. An admiring Adolphe Adam (1803-1856) concentrates on the unique aspects of her personality in a letter written on January 31, 1839 to his friend Samuel Heinrich Spiker (1786-1858), librarian to the King of Prussia and owner of the Spener'sche Zeitung:

*C’est une des plus merveilleuses organisations que je connaisse. Quand je pense que cette petite fille de dix-sept ans parle et chante dans cinq langues, qu’elle joue du piano comme un ange, qu’elle est aussi bonne harmoniste que qui ce soit, qu’elle chante comme sa sœur et qu’elle compose des choses que nous serions fiers d’avoir écrites, je suis honteux de mes trente-quatre ans et d’en savoir si peu. C’est une charmante personne (moralelement s’entend, car elle est très laide), mais d’une modestie et d’une simplicité extrêmes.*

She is one of the most marvelous personalities known to me. When I think that this young girl of seventeen speaks and sings in five languages, that she plays piano like an angel, that she is as fine a harmonist as anyone I know, that she sings like her sister and that she composes things which we would have been proud to write, I am ashamed of my thirty-four years and of knowing so little. She is a charming person (morally, it is to be understood, for she is very ugly), extremely modest and simple;

Not everyone was as fast to appreciate her uniqueness. During a concert at the Paris Conservatoire in February 1839—where she sang next to the tenor Gilbert Duprez a duo from Gluck’s *Orphée et Eurydice*, Lieder by Schubert, and Spanish popular songs—Berlioz, offended by her adaptation of the part of Eurydice to better suit her lower vocal register, failed to understand the intriguing originality of her French/Spanish/German

---

program. In his review of the concert, he tried to lock her once again in the predetermined exotic Spanish-Italian identity associated to the García clan:

*Mlle. Garcia en substituant aux notes élevées de Gluck le sons de contralto . . . a détruit la vérité et l’unité de la conception du maître, et au lieu de l’épouse d’Orphée . . . ne nous a plus donné qu’une cantatrice moderne, à la voix très étendue. . . .
*Les harmonies si essentiellement allemandes de Schubert ne vont pas non plus trop bien à la nature espagnole de Mlle. Garcia : aussi n’a-t-elle fait preuve d’une supériorité réelle que dans les petits morceaux gais et sémillants où elle a déployé avec autant de grâce que d’aisance cette verve humoristique qu’elle tient de son père.*

Mlle. Garcia, by substituting contralto sounds for Gluck’s high notes . . . destroyed the truth and unity of concept of the master, and instead of the wife of Orphée . . . she gave us nothing more than a modern singer with a very extended vocal range. . . . The essentially German harmonies of Schubert do not fit very well with the Spanish nature of Mlle. Garcia: She only proved real superiority in the small, gay and fast [Spanish] pieces, where she showed with grace and security the humorous verve that she inherited from her father.

Berlioz was a most unforgiving critic, particularly with those who dared to alter the operatic scores of Gluck or contaminate his serious French style with *bel canto* flourishes. He would, however, radically change his mind about the singer’s gifts, over the next decade.²⁶⁸

Despite Berlioz’s misgivings about Pauline Garcia’s interpretative gifts as a singer of German music, she seems to have understood the importance of introducing

---


²⁶⁸ Ten years later they would become close friends, after she interpreted for the first time his orchestral version of “La Captive” in London. Ironically, in the late 1850s, during the time when Berlioz was profoundly in love with Pauline, they would collaborate in an adaptation of Gluck’s *Orphée et Euridyce*, in which the part of the tenor was transposed and arranged to better suit her mezzo soprano register. For more on their personal and professional relationship see the *Envoi* of the present dissertation and Patrick Waddington, “Pauline Viardot-Garcia as Berlioz’s Counselor and Physician,” *The Musical Quarterly* 59, no. 3 (July 1973), 382-98.
examples of Lieder to the French public that winter season. During her presentations at fashionable salons and the Paris Conservatoire, she sang Schubert’s songs and, very probably, her settings of Uhland.

In February 1839, Clara and Pauline reunited in Paris; Clara—chaperoned by a student of her age and a French girl picked by her disapproving father, probably for the purpose of spying on her—immediately took quarters at the Hôtel Michadière, the same building where Pauline had been staying with her mother and de Bériot since late November or December 1838.\footnote{John N. Burk, \textit{Clara Schumann: A Romantic Biography} (New York: Random House, 1940), 176.} Unfortunately Pauline was now too busy with professional engagements to dedicate enough time to her friend. Clara saw most of her hopes for successful presentations in the salons and concert halls of Paris dashed by the competitive realities of the French capital. Her own insecurities and reserves, lack of planning, mistrust before possible acquaintances and friends, and dislike of French music and society did not contribute to endear her to the public who had known her formerly as a child prodigy.\footnote{Ibid., 177-80.}

During the first months of 1839, the name of Pauline, who was “making a big splash”\footnote{Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Paris, March 1839, in Eva Weissweiler, ed., \textit{The Complete Correspondence}, vol. 2, 54.} across the city, is seldom mentioned in Robert and Clara’s correspondence. Her appearance in the letters of these months is fascinating to the modern reader, though, for it allows a few intimate glimpses of the girl’s exceptional temperament and talent as she prepared for her operatic debut in London. In March 1839, Clara writes:

Pauline and I have been meeting less frequently because the days in Paris go by, and one doesn’t know where they went. She will give a concert with Bériot on March 11th in the Italian theater, and in the spring she will go to London to perform on the stage there. She is studying harp now, and is already accompanying herself as she sings the Romance from [Rossini’s] Othello.

As Desdemona, Pauline’s sister had been known for her ability to accompany herself during the Willow Song. Evidently, Pauline now wanted to reproduce that feat before the English public.

The following month, Clara—isolated and facing real difficulties adapting to the harder touch required by the pianos of the Erard firm—projected some of her own insecurities onto Pauline’s theatrical performances in London:

Pauline is already in London; she was very mad at you, or rather your journal, because they didn’t even send her the supplement with her lied; I told her it would surely come. I am afraid for her; She is still too young for the theater, and too weak; her voice is not strong enough yet, and she will end up being a failure.272

Despite Clara’s misgivings, Pauline’s initial appearances at the Queen’s Theatre in the difficult roles of Desdemona and Cenerentola were a complete triumph. During the three and a half months spent in England (mid April to early August) and, afterwards, during a restful sojourn in Boulogne-sur-Mer, Pauline did not forget the German friend she had left behind and wrote to her as often as possible:

I wrote to Pauline yesterday: the day before yesterday I received a letter from her from Boulogne which begins like this, “Hurray! Whoopee! My sweet Clara, we’ll see each other soon!” I enjoy her letters so much; she is so kind and hasn’t changed in spite of the success she has achieved; she also asked me to say hello to you.273

272 Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Paris, April 18, 1839, in Ibid., 161.
Pauline returned to composition at the very end of her inaugural London season. On August 1, 1839 she composed, for the album of a certain Mr. Denza, an Italian song, “Tu d’amarmi.” The musical album, which most probably belonged to an admirer, is now lost or destroyed, but Pauline took the precaution of writing down a copy of this composition in the initial three pages of a black notebook, which she had recently acquired or received as a gift (Ms Mus 232, Item 60, [1.]). Most likely, she extracted the three poetic strophes for her song from a long anonymous poem which Ambroise Thomas set in his extensive “La serenata,” a work published in 1835 or 1836 in his Souvenirs d’Italie, six romances italiennes et vénitiennes.

Thomas’ album appeared shortly after he returned from residing four years in Italy. The album’s title suggests that this winner of the Prix de Rome employed folk poetry from different parts of the peninsula, but apart from a general tunefulness, the music of “La serenata” shows little influence from Italian popular idioms. Its virtuosic (if

---

273 Clara Wieck to Robert Schumann, Paris, August 12, 1839, in Ibid., 374

274 Wolff, Barbara and Leslie A. Morris, “Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers: Guide,” Oasis, http://oasis.lib.harvard.edu/oasis/deliver/~hou00141 (accessed July 29, 2010). The electronic guide states that the autograph for this song (Ms Mus 232, item 60 [1.]) was “written and dedicated by M[ ] Denza (sic.)” The only known composer of that last name to have resided in London during the nineteenth century was the Italian Luigi Denza (1846-1922). He, however, had not been born at the time this work was composed. Pauline signed the autograph with the following inscription “fait le 1er aout pour l’album de Mr. Denza — Londres, 1839.” From the inscription, it is clear that Mr. Denza did not pen the work.

275 This would be the first song which she copied into the black album now at Houghton Library, Harvard University (Ms Mus 232, item 60). Two autographs which she composed in Bologne-sur-Mer that same August followed immediately after her initial entry. See table 3.1. above.
somewhat sugary) style is closer to the Italian *bel canto* arias of the day than to any folkloric Italian dance and song.²⁷⁶

Pauline must have been attracted to the supposed popular poetry in Thomas’ collection, but her setting also fails to capture the spirit of folk music, its style being closer to that of a cavatina by Donizetti or Bellini. Towards the end of her song, for example, the melodic line climbs in a series of phrases to the highest range of the voice, until a final ascending scalar cadenza culminates in a sustained high D-flat. The upper register of the voice is employed, in this instance, as a vehicle to express the unearthly joy of lovers as they are ecstatically reunited in an imaginary embrace. It is also used to display the virtuosic flexibility of the singer’s voice. This section of the autograph is reproduced in Figure 3.6. It is followed by a transcription (Example 3.14):

²⁷⁶ A recording of this work can be heard in Ambroise Thomas, “La Serenata,” in Gaetano Donizetti, Jacques Offenbach, Saverio Mercadante et al., *La Serenata*, Elizabeth Vidal, soprano, David Harper, piano, ORR 242, 2007, compact disc.
Figure 3.6. Pauline Garcia, “Tu d’amarmi,” third page of AMs, composed August 1, 1838, Ms.Mus. 232, item 60 [1.], courtesy of Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.
In the next years, Pauline would not compose other arias in Italian. She probably had her fill of the language and the bel canto style through her many performances of operas by Rossini, Donizetti, and Bellini. Many years later, she would actually give vent to her interest in Italian popular music by publishing in Germany, Russia, and France a collection of arranged popular songs entitled Canti Popolari Toscani.\(^{277}\)

\(^{277}\) The collection received different names according to the country of publication: Canti Popolari Toscani/Narodnyye toskanskiye pensi (St. Petesburg: A. F. Iogansen, 1878), Fünf Toskanische Gedichte (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1879), and Poésies Toscanes (Paris: E. Gérard, 1880). See Waddington and Žekulin, 30.
At some point during the first week of August 1839, Pauline and her mother crossed the English Channel and traveled to the seaside resort of Boulogne-sur-Mer, where they remained for about a fortnight so that the young girl could rest before her opening season at Paris’ Théâtre Italien. In London, Pauline had successfully tackled the Rossinian roles of Desdemona and Cenerentola, now she planned to add new parts to her repertoire, mainly Rossina and Tancredi. It seems, however, that new repertoire was not a concern during that holiday, for she completed and annotated in her black notebook two fair copies in a period of about one week (August 7 to 12): another German Lied to poetry by Uhland, “Fischerlied” (Ms Mus 232, item 60 [3.]) and a setting of Charles d’Orléans’ “Le Retour du printemps” (Ms Mus 232, item 60 [2.]). Pauline’s decision to set a *rondeau* from the fifteenth century strikes one initially as odd, particularly when one considers her selection of *verses à la mode* by Bétourné for two out of her three previous *romances*. Perhaps she might have felt the need for individuation by making a radical departure from the sentimental lyrics so often employed by her sister and by searching for poetry which was more congenial to her nuanced sensibility.

Throughout her life, Pauline seems to have felt a special attraction to old French poetry. In the 1840s—as we shall see in subsequent chapters—she would create ambitious settings based on the fables of Jean de La Fontaine (1621-1695) and, encouraged by George Sand, would notate from life performances folkloric songs from the region of Berry. Decades later, she would create scenes based on the plays of Jean

---

278 The new director of the Théâtre Italien, Louis Viardot, had traveled especially to England to listen to her. He was so impressed by her improvisations that he immediately engaged her for the upcoming winter season. See Patrick Barbier, *Pauline Viardot* (Paris: Bernard Grasset, 2009), 32.
Racine (1639-1699) and would compose an album which employed the lyrics of anonymous French *chansons* from the fifteenth century. She would also set the poetry of other Renaissance and Baroque French poets such as Pierre de Ronsard (1524-1585) and Nicolas Boileau-Despréaux (1636-1711). Taking this into account, her setting of Charles d’Orléans’ “Le Retour du printemps” in August 1839 might be an indication that this fascination with historic poetry and music was already at work in the young composer. Based on my transcription of the song’s autograph, I propose the following observations on the aesthetic interaction between d’Orléans’ poem and Pauline Garcia’s musical setting.

A transparent medieval *rondeau* scheme (ABba abAB abbaA) governs the three octasyllabic strophes of “Le Retour du printemps,” a poem about the seasonal renewal of life in Nature. A translation from the old French follows:


A Le temps a laissié son manteau
B De vent, de froidure et de pluye,
b Et s’est vestu de brouderie
a De souleil luisant, cler et beau.

a Il n’y a beste, ne oyseau,
b Qu’en son jargon ne chante, ou crie :
A Le temps a laissié son manteau
B De vent, de froidure et de pluye.

a Rivière, fontaine et ruisseau,
b Portent, en livrée jolie,
b Goutes d’argent d’orfaverie,
a Chascun s’abille de nouveau.
B Le temps a laissié son manteau.

There is no beast, no bird,
That does not sing or cry in his own jargon:

The season has left behind its coat
Of wind, of cold and of rain.

River, fountain and brook,
Wear, as beautiful customs,
Silver drops made by goldsmiths,
Each puts on new garments.

The season has left its coat

In her succinct setting, Pauline responded most strongly to the repetitive lull of the poem’s stylized two-line refrain, creating two metrically displaced phrases of one bar each (called here figures x and x’). These are reiterated throughout the song, at times repeating two times in a row, an effect which overemphasizes the cyclic quality of Charles d’Orléans’ poetic form. Together these phrases form musical refrain A. See Example 3.15:

Throughout the song, the constant reappearance of refrain A creates a miniature, well-articulated rondo form.\textsuperscript{283} Contrasting B and C sections (mm. 5-8 and mm. 15-16), however, preserve the same repetitive rhythmic lull of section A, since the metrically displaced one-bar unit serves as building block for the setting of almost all lines in the poem. Example 3.16 shows the setting of the first two lines of the poem’s second strophe:


Harmonic instability characterizes these two sections, which function as preparation for momentary tonicizations to the supertonic, the second most important tonal area in the composition. The overall form of the song is presented in Figure 3.7: \textsuperscript{284}

\textsuperscript{283} One hesitates to call it a \textit{rondeau} form. Pauline Garcia was probably not familiar with the close interaction between poetry and music in this type of \textit{forme fixe} from the fourteenth century.

\textsuperscript{284} In the graph, I have represented harmonic instability or motion towards a new tonal area with the symbol “/////.” This symbol will be employed in other formal-harmonic graphs throughout the dissertation.
Variety in the reappearances of musical refrain A is achieved through harmonic recoloring, modal mixture, and a two-bar extension of figure x. In section A’’, brief tonicizations to the supertonic (mm. 17-18) are effective in suspending the forward drive of the chordal progression to the final cadence (mm. 21-22). In the closing two bars, the song’s introduction is brought back in the accompaniment, this time combining with the voice’s two-bar extension of figure x. This creates a final circular closure to the brief composition Section A’’ is reproduced in Example 3.17:

285 Notice that the composer omitted verse 11 in her initial setting.

Constant motivic repetition and harmonic stasis, created through the use of drones, produce in the listener a sensation of time in suspension, giving the piece a somewhat remote, ancient character. These choices perhaps do not illustrate very well the vital richness of Charles d’Orléans’ allegorical language, but do succeed in producing in the listener the sensation of a composition created in a remote past. In her little experimental setting, Pauline decided to normalize the third strophe of Charles d’Orléans’ poem by getting rid of the extra third and fourth lines, bringing back instead the two lines of the complete poetic refrain. Later, she must have reconsidered her initial decision for she drafted an alternate ending to the composition immediately following the original fair copy in her black notebook. This draft is reproduced in Figure 3.8:
Figure 3.8. Pauline Garcia, “Le Retour de printemps,” third page of AMs, Ms Mus 232, item 60 [2.], courtesy of Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.
A transcription of this draft is proposed in Example 3.18. A few details in the accompaniment as well as the setting of the text are approximate, though I have respected as closely as possible the composer’s original decisions:

The alternate ending not only includes all the verses of the poem’s third strophe, but balances the different sections of the song’s rondo form much more effectively, making section C (mm.15-22) an area for formal expansion and phraseological and figurative development, and the return of section A’’ (mm. 23-26) a less repetitive event. In the accompaniment of section C, the composer could not resist the opportunity of introducing Schubertian water-figures, which illustrate with great beauty the renewed movement of river, fountain and brook, and the shimmer of their metaphorical glimmering garments.

Which of the two versions of the song is preferable is a question of personal taste. The first version is more succinct and limited, having the repetitive, quasi-hypnotic qualities which modern listeners associate with the medieval formes fixes. The second version is more ambitious, descriptive and dynamic, losing, however, some of the song’s original remoteness and simplicity. Perhaps the composer herself was initially ambivalent as to which version to adopt, for she did not scratch out her initial interpretation of the third strophe. We know, however, that she did not consider her experiments with this setting as unsuccessful for she sang this song in one version or another as late as the summer of 1840.

As the seventeen-year old singer prepared herself for her debut at the Théâtre Italien in the autumn of 1838, she could have well stated that even though she had not yet published one song in Paris, she was on her way to become an innovative force in the stylistic reinvention of the salon romance. In this chapter we have exposed and

286 Although Pauline still decided to repeat at the end of this second version of the song the two verses of the poetic refrain.

287 See Waddington and Žekulin, 2.
exemplified how through her early contact with different musical styles (i.e. popular songs of Spain and Mexico, French, Italian and Spanish opera, and Romantic compositions by Liszt, Mendelssohn, and Schubert) and her privileged musical education, the youngest daughter of Manuel García developed significant facility in manipulating formal, harmonic and melodic compositional procedures, which she soon learned to use with artistic sensitivity in both her German and French compositions. Though she still had to mature as a composer, her rare capacity to transform with emotional honesty poetic text into musical thought was already present in the early songs. As Schumann cunningly signaled, she indeed possessed that “personal voice” which gave a poem “the right [musical] color and meaning.”

In subsequent chapters, we shall see how through the Parisian publication of her first two albums of songs in the 1840s, Pauline continued to develop as composer and to strive for stylistic innovation and amalgamation in French art song. First, however, she had to meet the two artists who would have a determining force in her artistic maturation, George Sand and Frédéric Chopin. This will be the subject of our next chapter.

---

It is possible that George Sand and Frédéric Chopin were introduced to Pauline Garcia before the autumn of 1839 at the salons of common acquaintances such as Charlotte Marliani or Caroline Jaubert. The friendship of these three extraordinary artists, however, really developed during the winter season of 1839-1840. Impressed by Pauline’s creative integrity, her theatrical intelligence, and the multiplicity of her musical gifts, Sand invited her to join her artistic circle. Like Heine and de Musset, George Sand employed the literary trope of the exotic to describe her genius and even to address her:

*Reine du monde, vous ne m’avez pas fait dire quel jour vous pouviez me donner . . . Si j’avais des millions, je les dépenserais ce jour-là en tapis orientaux pour mettre sous vos pieds. Mettez-moi, en attendant, à ceux (les pieds) de la Mère des gracques et priez-la de m’aimer un peu. Quant à vous, je vous y forcerai bien par une adoration qui vous est acquise à jamais. J’aime assez le génie ; mais quand il est joint à la bonté, je me prosterne devant lui.*

Queen of the world, you have not sent word to tell me which day you can dedicate to me . . . If I had millions, I would spend them on buying oriental tapestries, which I would place under your feet on that day. Place me, while I wait for your response, at the feet of the mother of the Gracci [Joaquina Sitchés] and beg her to love me a little. Concerning you, I will force your love by an adoration which belongs to you forever. I love genius enough, but when it is united to kindness, I prostrate before it.

---


During the winter season, Sand regularly attended Pauline’s performances at the Théâtre Italien and visited the García household on rue des Champs-Elysées, 5. On February 15, 1840, she made use of her verve and influence to further Pauline’s career in an extraordinary article which she wrote for *La Revue des deux mondes*:

*L’apparition de Mlle. Garcia sera un fait éclatant dans l’histoire de l’art traité par les femmes. Le génie de cette musicienne à la fois consommée et inspirée constate un progrès d’intelligence qui ne s’était point encore manifesté dans le sexe féminin d’une manière aussi concluante . . .*\(^\text{291}\)

The appearance of Mlle. Garcia will be a luminous fact in the history of art from the perspective of women. The genius of this consummate and inspired musician attests to a progress of intelligence that had not yet made itself manifest in such a conclusive manner in the female sex . . .

Thus Sand, in the strongest possible terms, immediately classifies Pauline as a genius, setting her apart from all other artists of her gender. She becomes, from the perspective of Sand, not only an incarnation of the exotic Other but also of the exceptional Other, a being set aside from the group by her unique artistry. In the extensive article, Sand is not too concerned with the timbre or registral qualities of Pauline’s “magnificent instrument;” what she finds admirable and exceptional is her uncanny capacity to communicate emotions directly to the listener’s soul: “This voice parts from the soul and goes directly into the soul.”\(^\text{292}\) In these words, one notes echoes of Alfred de Musset’s famous poem, “A la Malibran,” which was completed shortly after the death of Pauline’s sister in 1836:


\(^{292}\) “Cette voix part de l’ame et va à l’ame.” Ibid.
C’est ton âme Ninette, et ta grandeur naïve,
C’est cette voix du coeur qui seule au coeur arrive
Que nul autre après toi ne nous rendra jamais. 293

It’s your soul, Ninette, and your innocent grandeur,
This voice of the heart that can only reach the heart,
Which none other after you will be able to give to us.

The resemblance in the choice of descriptive metaphor does not strike one as casual or unintentional. Sand clearly wants to place Pauline’s genius at the same level of her sister’s legendary gifts. The writer also finds in Pauline’s compositional gift a foundation to qualify her as exceptional. For the rest of her life, she would be one of the strongest defenders of her creative abilities:

Voici une fille de dix-huit ans qui écrit de la musique vraiment belle et forte . . . et de qui des artistes très compétents et des plus sévères ont dit : « Montrez-nous ces pages, et dites-nous qu’elles sont inédites de Weber, ou de Schubert, nous dirons qu’elles sont dignes d’être signées par l’un ou l’autre de ces grands noms, et plutôt encore par le premier que par le second. » C’est là, ce nous semble, le premier titre de Mlle Garcia à une gloire impérissable. 294

Here is a girl of eighteen years that writes truly beautiful and strong music . . . and about which very competent and extremely severe artists have said: “If you show us these pages and tell us that they are unedited manuscripts of Weber or Schubert, we will respond to you that they are worthy of being signed by either of those two great names, and probably more by the first than by the second.” This is, it seems to us, the first title of Mlle. Garcia to an imperishable glory.

From the time of her initial friendship with Liszt and her involvement with the disciples of Claude Henri de Rouvroy, comte de Saint-Simon (1760-1825), 295 Sand privileged the


294 Ibid., 587.
creative aspect of musical talent. Sand’s observations on Pauline’s compositional gifts seem to confirm her strongest convictions on the divinity and immortality of the creative soul. At the same time, she clearly notes the strong influence of German music—even Schubert’s Lieder—on Pauline’s earliest compositions.

Sand was determined to shield the budding singer and composer from the most frequent perils of the artistic milieu: Charles de Bériot could not manage her engagements forever. Her mother, Joaquina Sitchès, seemed like a poor judge of character, having encouraged Alfred de Musset’s improper attentions to Pauline. Her older brother, Manuel fils, had to cope with his own career as a singing teacher and a difficult and unhappy marriage. Sand felt that she could step in comfortably. Knowing de Musset’s faults and excesses only too well, she persuaded Joaquina on the pressing need of discouraging the poet’s advances and finding Pauline a proper husband, a man who could be protector and manager at once. The attention of both women fell on Louis Viardot, the director of the Théâtre Italien who had given Pauline her initial operatic engagement in Paris during that winter season.

Despite being twenty-one years older than Pauline, Louis Viardot must have appeared at the time as the ideal companion for the young singer. A dedicated man of Saint-Simon, as he was simply known among his followers, was a theorist of early socialism whose ideas were influential in founding different nineteenth century philosophies, including Marxism, Positivism and Sociology. The crux of his thought centered on the foundation of a socialist-technocratic state in which industrialists would guide society in the principles of cooperation and technological progress, tendencies which would ultimately eliminate poverty from the lower classes. Science and art would take the place of religion in his program.

295 Saint-Simon, as he was simply known among his followers, was a theorist of early socialism whose ideas were influential in founding different nineteenth century philosophies, including Marxism, Positivism and Sociology. The crux of his thought centered on the foundation of a socialist-technocratic state in which industrialists would guide society in the principles of cooperation and technological progress, tendencies which would ultimately eliminate poverty from the lower classes. Science and art would take the place of religion in his program.

296 “The musician or interpreter—in the musical sense of performer, but also in the sense of a linguistic intermediary—furnishes a direction for everyday transactions. The composer or inventor, according to Sand and contrary to the earlier generation of Saint-Simonians, supplies original messages and honest, direct paths to God.” David A. Powell, *While the Music Lasts: The Representation of Music in the Works of George Sand* (Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2001), 328.
letters with a long-standing fascination for Spanish art, literature, and politics, he had also been a good friend of the García family for many years. George Sand knew him well, not only had they had collaborated together in several newspapers and magazines including *Le Globe* and *La Revue de deux mondes*, but Viardot had personally supported Sand in 1837 when her ex-husband, Casimir Dudevant, attempted through legal means to assume the tutelage of her children, Solange and Maurice. Furthermore, Viardot came from a respected family from Dijon and was independently wealthy. Both women calculated that a marriage with him would simplify Pauline’s artistic consecration by Parisian society and therefore encouraged the engagement of the teenaged singer to the older man. Figure 4.1 reproduces two caricatures in a series drawn by de Musset, probably in collaboration with the sculptor Auguste de Barre (1811-1896), mocking the affair.

---

297 After his first sojourn in Spain in 1823, Louis Viardot wrote, among other things, his *Lettres d’un Espagnol* (1826), *Essai sur l’histoire des Arabes et des Maures d’Espagne* (1832), and *Etudes sur l’histoire des institutions, de la littérature, du théâtre et des Beaux-Arts en Espagne* (1835). During the second half of the 1830s, he produced admired translations of Cervantes’ *Don Quixote* and some of his *Exemplary Novels*. Louis Viardot had numerous friends and acquaintances among the liberal Spanish community in Paris and Madrid, including the important politicians Juan Álvarez Mendizábal (1790-1853) and Francisco Martínez de la Rosa (1787-1856).


299 Imaginary and real events and altercations leading up to the marriage are caught with black humor in *Pauline García’s marriage to Louis Viardot*, a series of caricatures. A reproduction of this series can be seen in the center inset of illustrations of April FitzLyon, *The Price of Genius: A Life of Pauline Viardot*. London: John Calder, 1964.
Pauline allowed herself to be conducted through the affair with great docility. Sand was convinced that this marriage of convenience, which took place in April 1840, would give her young friend the serenity, security, and stability required to pursue her musical career. She believed that Pauline—too engrossed with the emotional and artistic demands of the operatic stage—would not be capable of deep interpersonal passion and would come to care for Louis Viardot in a more or less filial fashion. From a modern perspective, it is not difficult to judge Sand’s scheming as both presumptuous and manipulative. We must remember, however, that marriages of convenience occurred frequently throughout the

300 “Superbe discours d’Indiana” and “Le nes de Mr. V. tombe en poussière.”

301 “Cette enfant . . . ne peut aimer beaucoup, en ce moment, aucun autre être que son mari et celui-là elle ne peut l’aimer que d’une certaine façon tendre, chaste, généreuse, grande sans orage, sans enivrement, sans souffrance, sans passion en un mot.” / “This child . . . cannot love too much at this time any other being than her husband, and him she can only love in a tender, chaste, and generous fashion, without storms, without suffering, in other words, without passion.” George Sand, Correspondance. Journal Intime (Monaco: Éditions du Rocher, 1956), 105.
nineteenth century. It is baffling; however, that Sand would have encouraged such a
union, especially considering the nefarious conditions of her own marriage to Baron
Casimir Dudevant.

We know that Louis Viardot was, from the beginning of the union,
profoundly in love with the singer. He would remain so for the rest of his life. Yet,
despite all the pains that Pauline Garcia, henceforth Viardot-Garcia, took to love her
husband back in the same manner, she found it beyond her reach. She would always
admire his intellect, culture, integrity, and political convictions, but throughout her life,
she could only feel for him profound friendship and esteem. Years later, she would
confess to conductor Julius Rietz:

Mon mari et Scheffer ont toujours été mes amis les plus chers.
Je n’ai jamais pu rendre un autre sentiment en échange du vif
Et profond amour de Louis, en dépit de tout ma meilleure volonté.
J’ai parfois trouvé que c’était mal à moi, injuste du destin, cruel
Tout ce que vous voudrez. Mais la volonté humaine n’a qu’un effet
negatif sur le cœur—elle peut le forcer à se taire, mais non a parler.

My husband and [painter Ary] Scheffer have always been my
dearest friends. I have never been able to return another sentiment
in exchange for the ardent and deep love of Louis, despite the best
will in the world. Sometimes it has seemed to me wrong, the injustice
of fate, cruel, whatever you will. But the human will has only a
negative influence on the heart—it can force it to be silent, but not to
speak.302

Initially, Louis Viardot’s influence on Pauline’s musical career proved to be
unconstructive. Already in October 1839, the liberal writer made the poor decision of
renouncing his post as director of the Théâtre Italien in order to serve Pauline better as

302 Pauline Viardot to Julius Rietz, Dublin, March 26, 1859, in “Pauline Viardot-Garcia to
I, no. 4 (1915), 549-50.
her impresario. During the couple’s four-month honeymoon in Italy, he failed to secure engagements in the principal operatic houses. Upon their return to Paris in August 1840, the Viardots found out that the new administration of the Théâtre Italien was unwilling to bring Viardot-Garcia back to their stage as prima donna because they did not wish to upset their reigning star, the temperamental Carlotta Grisi (1819-1899). Furthermore, as long as the manipulative and mediocre Rosine Stolz (1815-1903) controlled the affections of Léon Pillet, the director of the Opéra, Viardot-Garcia had little hope of stepping onto France’s most important stage.³⁰³ Forced by petty intrigues out of the most important Parisian operatic venues, the singer repeatedly presented herself on the concert stage, at the Conservatoire, and in various salons.³⁰⁴ During the autumn of 1840, Louis’ closest friend, the court painter Ary Scheffer, made one of her most famous portraits, reproduced in Figure 4.2:

³⁰³ Both Grisi and Stolz feared Pauline’s musicianship and artistic intelligence. Until 1847, they managed to minimize and often impede her Parisian operatic appearances.

³⁰⁴ During the winter season of 1840-1841, for example, Pauline was heard at the matinees of Herz and de Labarre, at the Opéra, singing the Requiem of Mozart, at Zimmerman’s salon, at Erard’s concert hall, and at the Conservatoire singing arias from Handel and Così fan tutte. Thérèse Marix-Spire, “Introduction,” in Lettres Inédites de George Sand et de Pauline Viardot (Paris: Nouvelles Éditions Latines, 1959), 38.
Like an illuminated saint, Viardot-Garcia, in a plain black dress and surrounded by a halo-like light, gazes directly at the spectator. One’s attention is immediately drawn to her simple features; the most serious, noble, and spiritual aspects of the teenage singer and composer are emphasized in the portrait. This could well be the image of George Sand’s Consuelo, the literary character that the writer would create a year and a half later.

and which was largely based on Pauline’s personality and artistry. A descriptive passage of the virtuosic and soulful Spanish protagonist of the novel almost seems to allude to Scheffer’s portrait of Pauline:

The little black dress and white collar, the slender and half devout toilette, the pale, calm face, at first so little remarkable, that frank address and astonishing absence of coquetry; all are transformed, and as it were, become divine when inspired by her own genius of song.306

Scheffer—who had most unfortunately fallen madly in love with his model—comforted himself with the filial and warm friendship that the young girl offered to him. The liberal ideals and radical politics of both the painter and her husband appealed to her intellect and developed sense of justice. Later on, she would often play a supportive role in their anti-establishment agendas. At Scheffer’s, for example, the singer met many Polish exiles;307 moved by the plight of Poland and its dispossessed expatriates, Viardot-Garcia composed for them “L’Exilé polonais” (PVG.s.I.5), a strong musical appeal for help308 which she included in her first song collection from 1843. The concluding page of the song is reproduced in Example 4.1:

306 George Sand, Consuelo, quoted in Kendall-Davies, 151.

307 Ibid., 109.

308 Her commitment to the Polish cause was not short-lived. At the height of the Second Empire, Pauline often received dethroned Prince Czartorysky and many other eminent Polish émigrés in her Parisian musical soirées. Louis Héritte de la Tour, Une Famille de grands musiciens: notes et souvenirs anecdotiques sur Garcia, Pauline Viardot, La Malibran, Louise Héritte-Viardot et leur entourage (Paris: Delmain, Boutelleau et Cie., 1922), 92.
The robust chordal accompaniment, martial dotted figures, and overt dramatic tremolos are softened by expressive harmonic colorings and pleading countermelodies in the left hand (mm. 54-57). The vocal line, in turn, possesses rhythmic simplicity, additive phrases of two measures, and an emphasis in the middle and lower registers. All these elements facilitate clear diction and direct declamation. Once again, Pauline Viardot-
Garcia as a composer is more concerned with the communication of ideas than with the creation of empty gestures to display virtuosity. Similar to the songs discussed in the previous chapter, this piece demonstrates the young composer’s superb ability to bring a text to life through music, in this case a text with a moral, political, and social message. One can see already the influence of Sand and Viardot’s liberal ideas on the singer. Fittingly, Ary Scheffer, in collaboration with H. Soltaum, created the drawing for the title page of this song, reproduced below in Figure 4.3:

---

309 All eight songs in the 1843 album have elaborate drawings made by Scheffer and H. Soltaum. The lithographs for the edition were prepared by a certain Rosenthal, who collaborated with the editorial house of Eugène-Théodore Troupenas.
In 1840 and 1841, Viardot-Garcia took advantage of her momentary exile from the Parisian stages to project her image as a new and innovative composer of French song. She began by publishing two songs for “La France musicale,” a journal where her brother often published articles and which had many contributors who had been close friends of her father and sister, including Castil-Blaze and Troupenas. “L’Enfant et la montagne” (PVG.s.0.1.f=PVG.I.1)—a translation of “Des Knaben Berglied,” a Lied to
words of Uhland (probably composed in 1838)—was published in the autumn of 1840.\footnote{See Waddington and Žekulin, 3. This translated Lied will be discussed in detail in chapter 5.}

*L’Album de chant for 1841*, which included five songs by the youngest and best reputed French composers of the day (i.e. Ambroise Thomas, Daniel Auber, Adolphe Adam, Fromental Halévy and Hyppolyte Monpou), also included a new work by her, “L’Hirondelle et le prisonnier,” (PVG.s.0.3.f) to poetry by Hector-Grégoire de Saint-Maur.\footnote{Ibid.} It is significant that her work was included in such a prestigious compilation; it reflects the high opinion that the editors of *La France musicale* had on her compositional abilities.\footnote{Daniel Auber, Adolphe Adam, Hyppolyte Monpou, Pauline Viardot, et al. *L’Album de chant for 1841* (Paris: Bureaux de *La France musicale*, 1841).}

In between Pauline’s successful operatic engagements in England in 1841,\footnote{Pauline visited the island twice during 1841. She had an initial long engagement at Her Majesty’s Theatre from April to June, where she sang mostly Rossinian roles including Desdemona, Tancredi, Cenerentola, and Arsace. At the time, she also added Bellini’s Romeo (*I Capulet ti e Montecchi*) to her repertoire. A shorter engagement in the month of September took her to Gloucester where she sang at the *Three Choirs Festival*. Here, Pauline enjoyed the rigors of the ritualized hospitality of the country gentry: “[J]’ai laissé en Angleterre malaise et ennui, n’emportant que les guinées, qui sont malheureusement la meilleure chose que l’on y trouve. On ne se fait pas une idée de l’esclavage auquel leurs us et coutumes les asservissent, et de la tyrannie avec laquelle ils obligent les étrangers à s’y soumettre. . . . [J]e les défie de me rerattraper dans leurs maisons de campagne” / “I have left in England sickness and boredom, importing only their guineas, which sadly seems to be the best that one finds there. One cannot imagine how enslaved they are to their uses and customs, and the tyranny with which they force foreigners to submit to them. . . . I defy them to try to trap me again in their country estates.” Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Paris, September 14, 1841, in Marix-Spire, *Lettres inédites*, 128.} her friendship with Sand and Chopin blossomed. Chopin respected her artistic finesse and often accompanied her on the piano. He especially enjoyed Pauline’s interpretation of Rossinian roles and arias by Mozart, Handel, and Gluck, but found her superb when she
sang her own compositions and arrangements of Spanish popular songs.\textsuperscript{314} When Chopin
was forced, due to illness, to cancel his appearance with her at Chèz Erard, he sent his
most elaborate apologies through Sand:

\textit{Chopino est beaucoup mieux, mais très faible et la joue est tellement
enflée, qu’il ne pourra pas aller demain chez Mr. Erard. Tâchez donc
de remettre cette soirée s’il est possible, ou d’en arranger une autre pour
qu’il puisse vous accompagner. Il est très tourmenté de l’idée que vous
pourriez vous faire l’idée, qu’il a l’idée que vous pourriez vous faire l’idée,
qu’il a l’idée de vous donner une défaite. Mais moi, je me porte garante pour
lui, et vous assure qu’il sera heureux de vous accompagner cette belle
musique et de se mettre toujours et en tout à la disposition de usted, non
à la façon majorquine mais à la lettre, et en vérite . . . \textsuperscript{315}}

Chopino is much better, but very weak and his cheek is so swollen, that
he will not be able to go tomorrow to the house of Mr. Erard. Try to
make new arrangements for this evening, if it is possible, or to reserve
another date so he can accompany you. He is very tormented by the
idea that you could come up with the idea that he has the idea that you
could conceive the idea that he is giving you the cold shoulder. I, on the
other hand, guarantee and assure you that he would be very happy to play
that beautiful music with you and to be at the service of usted, not in the
Majorcan sense, but truthfully . . .

Pauline, in turn, adored the Polish composer, employed a myriad of sweet nicknames to
address him (from Chip Chip to Monsieur Fritz) and valued his advice in all musical
matters. During a break from her English operatic engagements in April 1841, she wrote
to Sand: “Tell good Fritz that I employ my vacations on composing, I hope he does the
same.”\textsuperscript{316} Possibly she began drafting at the time some of the material which she later
included in her first song collection of 1843. An unpublished song which was almost

\textsuperscript{314} Ibid., 157.

\textsuperscript{315} George Sand to Pauline Viardot, Paris, Winter 1841(?), in Ibid., 97-8.

\textsuperscript{316} “\textit{Dites au bon Fritz que j’emplie mes vacances à composer. J’espère qu’il fait autant.”}
Pauline Viardot to George Sand, London, April 8, 1841, in Ibid., 102.
certainly drafted during these spring holidays was “L’Enfant.” A close-to-completion autograph manuscript, with corrections from the composer, can be found at Harvard’s Houghton library.\textsuperscript{317} The manuscript has the following final inscription: “\textit{Londres, 5 avril}.”\textsuperscript{318}

The anonymous poem in “L’Enfant” describes the funeral procession of an apparently dead four-year-old boy who, just before being buried, wakes from his profound sleep. The poem is an example of the Romantics’ morose—and very real—preoccupation with childhood death and live interment. Curiously, as Pauline composed this song of infant death and resurrection, she might not have known that she was pregnant with her first child, Louise (1841-1918).

The last section of the manuscript and my transcription of it are reproduced in Figure 4.4 and Example 4.2 respectively. The song’s migrating tonality (from the home key area of F minor to the final chords in C major) and sudden change of meter (from common to triple time) are direct musical responses to the unexpected turn of events in the poem after the procession of mourners enters the cemetery:

\textsuperscript{317} Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant,” AMs with AMs corrections, MS Mus 232, item 54, Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

\textsuperscript{318} In Waddington and Žekulin’s 2011 on-line catalogue, Waddington argues that this song in principle could have been composed in April 1839, 1841 or 1871, since Pauline spent the month of April in London during these three years. Based on the subject-matter of the poem, he chooses April 1871 as the date of composition. This, however, seems highly unlikely. The handwriting in this autograph has a certain delicacy which characterizes many of Viardot-Garcia’s earliest manuscripts. Her handwriting later on became much more secure, with larger gestures which were also drawn faster. Also after the early 1840s, Viardot-Garcia seldom dated her manuscripts. The fact that she wrote to Chopin on April 8, 1841 that she has spent her holidays composing (letter quoted above), further supports my theory that “L’Enfant” was completed during this period. See Waddington and Žekulin, 25.
There are no tempo or agogic indications in the manuscript. The text reads “Ils entrent précédès du vierge et du suaire/ Mais quel tableau touchant mouille leurs yeux de pleurs/ l’enfant était assis sur son lit funéraire/ et souriant jouait avec les fleurs.” / “They entered preceded by the virgin and the shroud/ But what a touching spectacle filled their eyes with tears/ The child sited on his funerary bed/ Smiling and playing with the flowers.”
Example 4.2. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant,” after Ms Mus 232, item 54, mm. 64-82.
Interestingly, this would not be the last time that Pauline would approach the subject of childhood death; in her first song collection, she included “L’Enfant et la mère” (PVG.s.I.6). In this song—probably composed in 1841 or 1842—a conversation between a mother and her delirious, dying child is musically complemented by a gentle lullaby, which at the end becomes suddenly agitated. The influence of Schubert’s musical characterization in dramatic Lieder such as “Erlkönig,” “Der Tod und das Mädchen,” and “Der Müller und der Bach” can be sensed in Pauline’s choice of two different vocal registers to reflect the voices and personalities of the child and his mother. The opening phrases of the song are reproduced in Example 4.3.\[320\]

\[320\] This song might have also been a reaction to other French romances being published at the time on the subject of childhood death, for example Donizetti’s dramatic scene, “La Mère et l’enfant,” which had been published in the musical supplement of La France musicale in 1840.
Chopin and Sand encouraged their new friend to compose as often as possible. Shortly before her return from London to Paris in July 1841, Pauline hinted to them the difficulties of performing and composing simultaneously; these would only increase as her operatic career became more successful. Writing to her friends from London, she
complained: “I have composed very little; there has not been any time.” Sand had invited the Viardots to spend the month of August with them at her countryside château in Berry, Nohant. She was wary that if Pauline lingered at the Viardot’s Parisian home in rue Favart, 12, she would dedicate herself into the domestic duties imposed by Louis’ two rigid spinster sisters, “The not too beautiful sisters-in-law,” as the young singer used to call them. Sand explained the dangers of domesticity to the singer:

[A]près Londres, vous allez être libre, vous n’aurez rien à faire à Paris que de travailler à la maison, comme vous faites toujours, et vous y serez dérangée par mille importuns. . . . Ici, vous seriez comme au fond d’un désert. Vous aurez des appartements sonores, vastes, un bon air, un bon piano, un bon Chopin et des cœurs pour vous chérir. . . . Vous feriez ici des choses magnifiques. . . . Venez, songez que votre santé est la principale des affaires . . . la santé de votre cerveau est aussi à considérer, que dans votre vie active de Londres, vous n’avez guères pu composer, et qu’ici vous composerez sans trouble et sans souci du matin au soir.

[A]fter London, you will be free, you will have nothing to do in Paris but to work in the house, as you do always, and you will be bothered by a thousand nuisances. . . . Here, you will be as if in the middle of a desert. You will have sonorous and vast rooms, good air, a good piano, a good Chopin and hearts to cherish you. . . . Here you shall do magnificent things. . . . Come, think of your health as the main thing. . . . the health of your brain should also be considered, remember that during your active life in London, you could not manage to compose, and that here you will compose without troubles or worries from morning to evening.


322 “Les pas trop belle sœurs,” see Ibid., 24.

Sand might have also been concerned for the health of the young mother-to-be. The Viardots visited Nohant during the first fifteen days of August. Pauline spent much time resting and read entire scores with Chopin at the piano. Although April FitzLyon affirms that there is no evidence to support Pauline’s piano studies with Chopin, a drawing made by George’s teenage son, Maurice, demonstrates that she received technical and stylistic advice from the Polish virtuoso. It is reproduced in Figure 4.5:

Figure 4.5. Maurice Sand, “That is the playing of Liszt! It is not fitting for vocal accompaniment,” ink drawing, courtesy of Bibliothèque Nationale de France.

---

324 Ibid., 127.

325 “It has sometimes been stated that Pauline Viardot was a pupil of Chopin, and in her family that tradition is still alive today. He may have given her lessons . . . but there is no direct evidence that he did.” April FitzLyon, The Price of Genius, 95.

326 “Ca c’est le jeu de Liszt [sic]! Il n’en faut pas pour accompagner la voix.” The date which is included on the drawing (June 1844) is difficult to verify, since Pauline was not at
Pauline benefited greatly from her informal lessons with Chopin. Many of the accompaniments in her compositions from the 1840s show a sophisticated understanding of tone color, pianistic counterpoint, and improvised figurations, stylistic elements which are characteristically associated with many of the Polish composer’s miniature creations. Later on that decade, she analyzed Chopin’s style with intelligence when she transcribed some of his Mazurkas for voice and piano. Saint-Saëns would comment on her keen understanding of Chopin’s style and pianistic approach:

She was a great friend of Chopin and she remembered his playing almost exactly and could give the most valuable directions about the way he interpreted his works. I learned from her that the great pianist’s (great musician’s, rather) execution was much simpler than has been generally supposed. It was as far removed from any manifestation of bad taste as it was from cold correctness. She told me the secret of the true tempo rubato without which Chopin’s music is disfigured. It in no way resembles the dislocations by which it is so often caricatured.\footnote{Camille Saint-Saëns, \textit{Musical Memoires}, trans. Edwin Gile Rich, \url{http://www.gutenberg.org/catalog/world/readfile?pageno=1&fk_files=194131} (accessed March 12, 2009).}

Perhaps it was during this initial visit to Nohant that—together with Chopin and encouraged by Sand—she attempted her first transcriptions of some of Berry’s regional songs, although it is more probable that many of these proto-ethnomusicological transcriptions from life performances took place during subsequent visits in the summers of 1842, 1843 and 1845. Sand described some of these sessions to the art critic and novelist, Jules Champfleury:

\begin{center}
Nohant during the summer of that year. It is probable that the drawing was done and/or dated in retrospect.
\end{center}
J’ai vu Chopin, un des plus grands musiciens de notre époque, et Mme Pauline Viardot, la plus grande musicienne qui existe, passer des heures à transcrire quelques phrases mélodiques de nos chanteuses et de nos sonneurs de cornemuse.”

I saw Chopin, one of the greatest musicians of our times, and Mme. Pauline Viardot, the greatest woman musician that exists, spend hours transcribing some melodic phrases of our singers and our bagpipe players.

In October 1841, as she prepared for the birth of her child, Pauline took a three-week break from her performances in the Parisian suburb of Vigneux-sur-Seine. It was here that she had the first opportunity in months to dedicate some time to composition:

Je suis a la campagne depuis près de trois semaines et je me porte très bien, ma voix est excellente, et je compose un peu. J’ai mis à exécution une idée bien neuve et bien hardie : j’ai mis en musique le chêne et le roseau de Lafontaine! je désire beaucoup que Chopin l’entende, afin que je sache si c’est bon ou mauvais.

I am in the countryside after three weeks and I feel very well, my voice is in excellent shape, and I compose a little. I have executed a very new and somewhat risky idea; I have set La Fontaine’s The Oak and the Reed! I wish very much for Chopin to hear it so I can know if it is a good or bad composition.

Apparently, Chopin found the expansive narrative and coloristic accompaniment of “Le Chêne et le roseau” (PVG.s.I.8) much to his taste. Two months after the birth of Louise, he invited the singer to close his concert at Salle Pleyel with her musical fable.

---

328 George Sand to Jules Champfleury, quoted in Marix-Spire, Lettres inédites, 128.

329 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Château Frayé, October 15, 1841, in Ibid., 134.

autograph manuscript at the Bibliothèque nationale has minor corrections in the hands of Pauline and also Chopin: Adjustments to their parts were made as they rehearsed the long song prior to the concert.  

In this original through-composed work, Viardot-Garcia sets large sections of La Fontaine’s poem to measured recitative but often includes breaks of lyricism in the form. This flexibility allows the composer to cover large amounts of text and also to illustrate not only the most relevant imagery in La Fontaine’s fable, but also the sudden changes in affect and character (i.e. narrator, oak, and reed). An example of the composer’s imaginative musical response to the text can be found in her employment of virtuosic chromatic figures, running across the entire range of the keyboard, to illustrate the brewing storm and wild unpredictable wind, which leaves the meek yet pliable reed untouched but brings the powerful yet inflexible oak down. See Example 4.4:

---

During the winter of 1841-1842, Chopin and Viardot-Garcia also performed the song privately for friends. On February 21, an enthusiastic public asked for an encore.

---

332 A note sent by Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, written during the winter of 1841-1842, reads: “Je viens rappeler à ma Ninounne que sa fillie l’attend pour diner avec tutti quanti. Que le Roseau Chopin n’oublie pas le chêne.” / “I want to remind my Ninounne that her little daughter expects her for dinner with tutti quanti. That Chopin, the reed, does not forget the oak.” Ibid., 144.
of the composition; it received, however, the following ambivalent review from the critic Maurice Bourges:

Décidément madame Viardot veut nous rendre sa noble sœur, elle aussi composait de charmantes choses. Que madame Viardot marche donc dans la même voie où elle est entrée avec succès, mais que les délassements du compositeur ne lui fassent pas oublier sa propre vocation.333

Decidedly Madame Viardot wishes to give us back her noble sister, who also composed charming things. May Madame Viardot walk in the path she has chosen with success, but let the diversions of the composer not cause her to forget her proper profession.

Sand, on the other hand, was not willing to minimize the role that composition had in Pauline’s life. She thought “Le Chêne et le rouseau” was not only a “tour de force,” but also “something superb.”334 To Louis Viardot, who often seemed indifferent to Pauline’s creative side, she wrote: “Her Oak and the Reed interests me as much as her Rossini.”335

Her continuous encouragement to Pauline’s compositional efforts often took a fanciful turn. The following letter—which she wrote under the pseudonym of a young man of letters, Horace Dumontet—is particularly witty:

---

333 Maurice Bourges, “Soirée musicale de M. Chopin,” Revue et gazette musicale 9, no. 9 (February 27, 1841), 83.

334 Marix-Spire, Lettres inédites, 136.

335 “Je m’intéresse à son chêne et à son roseau tout autant qu’à son Rossini.” Geroge Sand to Louis Viardot, Nohant, October 1841, Ibid., 85.
On m’a dit que vous joignez à celui de cantatrice dont j’ai été à même de me convaincre par mes yeux, celui de compositeur et que vous pouviez rivaliser sur ce terrain avec les Duchambge, les Malibran, et les Loïsa Puget comme vous rivalisez sur la scène avec les Stolz, les Grisi et les Dorus-Gras. Combien ce jeune homme qui prend la liberté de vous écrire, s’estimerait heureux, Mlle, si vous daignez jeter les yeux sur un faible essai d’une forme nouvelle qu’il vient déposer aux pieds de votre génie! On m’a dit que vous aviez eu la fantasie de mettre en musique l’âne et le petit chien de La Fontaine, les Iambes de M. Auguste Barbier et le dernier discours Aux politiques du spirituel Pierre Leroux. On m’a dit aussi que vous aviez noté un vers solitaire de M. Frédéric Chopin . . .

Someone has told me that you join to your talent as singer, which I have witnessed with my own eyes, a talent as composer and that on this terrain you can rival Duchambge, Malibran and Loïsa Puget just as on the stage you rival Stolz, Grisi and Dorus-Gras. This young man who has taken the liberty to write to you, Mlle, would be immensely happy if you could look upon the weak essay in the form of a novella which he now places at the feet of your genius. Someone has told me that you had the fantasy of setting to music La Fontaine’s “The Ass and the Little Dog,” the Iambes of M. Auguste Barbier and “On Politics,” the last discourse of the spiritual Pierre Leroux. Someone has also told me that you have noted a solitary verse of M. Frédéric Chopin . . .

The allusion to fictitious compositions on the verses of liberal poet Henri Auguste Barbier (1805-1882) and the elaborate, slightly mystical prose of socialist philosopher Pierre Leroux (1797-1871) is almost preposterous, but it gives the reader an indication of the radical political direction that Sand wished Pauline’s choice of text to develop. She also affirms that her compositions surpass those of other women composers of the era, which makes it clear that she appreciated the most original elements of her compositional style. The “weak essay” that Sand refers to could well be, I believe, the initial chapter of

336 Horace Dumontet (George Sand) to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Paris, Winter 1841-1842, in Ibid., 141.
Consuelo, a new serialized novel\textsuperscript{337} which the writer began to publish in February 1, 1842 in La Revue indépendante. This controversial bimonthly magazine was cofounded by George Sand, Louis Viardot, and their political guru, Pierre Leroux, in November 1841. It was an privately funded publication—mostly launched with Louis Viardot’s money—of socialist and republican sympathies, which was misread and attacked by many traditionalists. Enemies among the conservative press—eager to please the repressive and corrupt government that funded them—quickly began an aggressive and denigrating campaign against the directors of the magazine and those who were closely associated with them. The singer became an easy target. We shall see that during the second half of 1842, Viardot-Garcia—idealized by George Sand as the illuminated and revolutionary character of Consuelo—would find herself in the midst of this bitter controversy. To better understand the roots of this conflict, a brief analysis of Sand’s novel will be presented in the next pages.

The writing of the two complex parts of Consuelo—which can be construed as a combination of Bildungsroman, musical novel, and initiation story—coincided with the apex of Sand’s aesthetic mysticism and socialist/egalitarian agenda.\textsuperscript{338} The protagonist, 

\textsuperscript{337} During the initial months of publication Sand referred to Consuelo as a “conte” or a “nouvelle.” See Léon Cellier and Léon Guichard, “Consuelo et la Comtesse de Rudolstadt” in Consuelo et La Comtesse de Rudolstadt, vol. I (Paris: Gallimard, 2004), IV.

\textsuperscript{338} Sand’s idealized vision on the importance of fine arts, particularly music, in the process of reforming society into a more egalitarian and just system is ultimately Saint-Simonian in its origins. It was Franz Liszt who introduced Sand in the early 1830s to the ideas of two disciples of Saint-Simon, Hugues-Félicité de Lamennais (1782-1554) and Émile Barrault (1799-1869). From Barrault, Sand adopted the ideal of the artist as the ultimate leader of society by his or her ability to be in touch with the infinite and the divine. Pierre Leroux, another source for Sand’s socialist and utopian notions, believed that the artist’s mission, as the representative of the Other, was to reflect his or her times. In his most mystical writings, Leroux also announces the organic transformation of society into a socialist system. For a detailed explanation of the origins
an orphaned Spanish girl of humble origins who is educated in eighteenth-century Venice by the intelligent and uncompromising Nicola Porpora,\textsuperscript{339} has the rare ability to understand, emulate, and transmit to all social classes a wide variety of musical styles and thus to bring consolation and reconciliation to an afflicted and divided humanity. In his introductory essay to the novel, Léon Guichard describes the musical gifts of Consuelo as follows:

Music is the natural language of prayer . . . Consuelo sings, with all the fervor of her soul, the canticles that she composes, which make her fall asleep almost happily, “in a celestial calm.” . . . Consuelo sings for those that are capable of listening, more for the people than for a public . . . Thus music was not only for George Sand a “literary topic” but also . . . “a philosophical expression and a social aesthetic.”\textsuperscript{340}

The main character’s Otherness is established early on in the novel. Like the youngest daughter of Manuel García, she is differentiated from those that surround her by her foreign origin, the nobility of her character, and the extent of her talent. A miserable child, Consuelo spends her first ten years in the company of her gypsy mother roaming

\textsuperscript{339}As a child, Sand had learned to admire eighteenth century composers of Italian opera such as Porpora, Jommelli, Gluck, and Handel through the influence of her grandmother, Madame Dupin de Francueil. Her association with Chopin only increased her admiration of what she found to be the sober, noble, and simple beauties of many compositions from the eighteenth century.

\textsuperscript{340}“La musique est la langue naturelle de la prière . . . Consuelo chante, dans la ferveur de son âme, les cantiques qu’elle compose, et qui la font s’endormir presque heureuse, « dans un calme céleste ». . . Consuelo chante pour tous ceux qui sont capables de l’entendre, pour le peuple plus que pour le public . . . La musique n’a donc pas été seulement pour George Sand un « thème littéraire », mais aussi . . . « une expression philosophique et une esthétique sociale. »” Léon Guichard, “Pauline Garcia et la musique dans Consuelo et La Comtesse de Rudolstadt,” in George Sand, Consuelo et La Comtesse de Rudolstadt I (Paris: Gallimard, 2004), XVIII-XIV.
throughout the world. It is interesting—and disturbing—to read how Sand struggles to reconcile the protagonist’s Otherness with the prejudices common to her times:

. . . Consuelo [est] née en Espagne, et arrivée de là en Italie en passant par Saint-Pétersbourg, Constantinople, Mexico, ou Arkangel, ou par toute autre route encore plus directe à l’usage des seuls Bohémiens. Bohémienne, elle ne l’était pourtant que de profession et par manière de dire; car de race, elle n’était ni Gitana ni Indoue, non plus qu’Israélite en aucune façon. Elle était de bon sang espagnol, sans doute mauresque à l’origine, car elle était passablement brune, et toute sa personne avait une tranquillité qui n’annonçait rien des races vagabondes. . . . Elle n’avait pas cette pétulance fébrile interrompue par des accès de langueur apathique qui distingue les zingarelle, Elle n’avait pas la curiosité insinuante et la mendicité tenace d’une ebbrea indigente. Elle était aussi calme que l’eau des lagunes en même temps aussi active que les gondoles légères qui en sillonnent incessamment la face. 341

. . . Consuelo [was] born in Spain, and traveled from there to Italy passing through Saint Peters burg, Constantinople, Mexico, Arkhangelsk, or by any other of those direct routes used exclusively by the Gypsies.

She was, however, only Bohemian in her profession and as a manner of speaking, for racially she was neither Gypsy, Hindu, nor Israelite in any way. She was of good Spanish blood, without a doubt Moorish in origin, because her skin was slightly dark; Her physiognomy had a tranquility unrelated to the vagabond races. . . . She did not have the gypsy’s febrile petulance, interrupted by accesses of languishing apathy or the tenacious mendicity of an indigent Jewess. She was as calm as the water of the lagoons and at the same time, as active as the light gondolas which furrowed their surfaces incessantly.

Sand’s solution to the problem of Consuelo’s (and Pauline’s) origin is to purify it from associations with the most marginalized groups of nineteenth-century Europe, the Jews and the Gypsies, yet have her retain the Romantic allure of the exotic Spaniard.

Consuelo’s physiognomy and early experiences correspond to those of the roamer and the foreigner, but her character has been tamed and acculturated into Venetian society. 342

341 Sand, Consuelo et La Comtesse de Rudolstadt 1, 13-4.

342 Pauline, who had been born in Paris, had also been assimilated into French culture.
Clearly, Sand wants her readers to be attracted to Consuelo’s exoticism, but she also wants to elude their abhorrence towards the incomprehensible or shady elements of her origin. As modern readers we might be repelled by this overt exercise of ethnic cleansing, but we should remember that these prejudices were profoundly entrenched in the European psyche of the era. By writing such a passage, Sand was probably trying to protect Pauline’s standing within Parisian society. Pauline too attempted to shield herself and her family by keeping quiet about the less reputable elements of her origin. Years later, she would confess what she believed to be the truth of her origins to her intimate friend, Julius Rietz:


The Lord made me just fit for travelling. It was in my blood before I was born. Even when I am at my happiest in any place, I cannot see anyone depart on a journey without feeling a certain yearning to go along. I must surely have that from my father for . . . now don’t take fright, he was born in Seville, in the part of the town where only Gypsies live—there you have the great secret! My father knew his mother, but he never knew anything about his father. My mother, on the other hand, is of noble descent. Nothing can vex her more than when my brother and I, in fun, make some allusion to our Egyptian origin. 

---

Consuelo’s voice and semi divine understanding of music are other—perhaps even more potent—sources for her Otherness. Throughout the novel, those that hear her sing are mesmerized by her sublime prowess and expressivity. Upon listening to her voice for the first time, the devious nobleman and impresario, count Zustiniani believes that he has heard a mermaid or an archangel. Shortly before engaging her in his operatic company, he hears her performing Marcello’s sacred aria, “I cieli immensi narrano” in the Church of San Lazzaro dei Mendicanti. Consuelo’s exalted interpretation and spiritual conviction transform her and those around her. As she finishes the aria, a confused Zustiniani cries out:

Par tout le sang du Christ, cette femme est belle! C’est sainte Cécile, sainte Thérèse, sainte Consuelo! c’est la poésie, c’est la musique, c’est la foi personnifiées!

By all the blood of Christ, this woman is beautiful! It is Saint Cecilia, Saint Theresa, Saint Consuelo! It is poetry, it is music, it is faith personified!

The revelation of her semi-divine status does not impede Zustiniani from trying to seduce Consuelo and from attempting to use her recklessly at his operatic productions. The gifted singer eventually escapes from the vacuous virtuosity which she finds in the Venetian operatic stage, and finds herself in the midst of Bohemia, in the mysterious Castle of the Giants. At the residency of the noble Rudolstadtts, she sings a Spanish hymn to the virgin; the eccentric and musically gifted heir of the family, Count Albert von

---

344 “[Consuelo’s] socioeconomic and racial difference earns her the status of stranger and the nickname of gipsy, or bohémienne. But her dedication to singing and her speed and accuracy in learning music also set her apart from those around her.” Powell, 28.

345 Sand, Consuelo et La Comtesse de Rudolstadt I, 17.

346 Ibid, 74.
Rudolstadt is so moved that he rediscovers not only his lost voice but his mental stability. He throws himself at her feet, exclaiming in Spanish: “Consuelo, Consuelo, Consuelo de mi alma!” Consuelo marries Count Albert, who is also an accomplished violinist, but secretly leaves the Castle of the Giants when she wrongly believes that her newlywed husband has died.

In the second part of the novel, *La Comtesse de Rudolstadt*, tyrannical King Frederic II becomes obsessed with the diva’s voice and presence. When she repeatedly requests his permission to leave Berlin, the king, suspecting Consuelo—not without reason—of revolutionary plotting, incarcerates her in Spandaw. Through these series of unfortunate incidents, Sand is perhaps forewarning Pauline that the power of her talent could provoke not only intense emotional and physical responses but also dangerous situations for her in the future.

There is one final stage of differentiation for Sand’s character: The apex of the last part of the novel occurs as Consuelo undergoes an initiation ceremony with a radical secret society, *Les Invisibles*. Count Albert, under disguise, is the leader of the group and the singer’s final compensation is to be reunited with him. Consuelo’s spiritual maturation is brought about by these series of cumulative experiences and trials, which finally lead her and her husband to proclaim, through the emotive and semi-divine language of music, the principles of the French Revolution—Liberty, Equality, and Fraternity—and also to announce a new religion, one in which the musician becomes priest or priestess and therefore divine messenger of a renewed world. It should now be

---

347 “Consolation, Consolation, Consolation of my soul” Ibid., 263. Sand’s convictions on the regenerative and therapeutic powers of music are explicit in this passage of the novel.

348 Sand is in all probability referring to the Spandau Citadel in Berlin, which was one of the best preserved Renaissance military structures of Europe.
palpable that in Consuelo, Sand gives music, be it operatic, religious, or popular, a sacred role. Léon Guichard elaborates on the function that these different genres have in the novel:

In Consuelo . . . there are three types of music. Triumphant music, the music of opera, which expresses the most tender or strong passions with all its resources, the ornaments of bel canto . . . A more austere, noble and profound music, to which [Consuelo], the gypsy, by divine gift, feels spontaneously related; . . . this is the sacred music of great masters such as Marcello, Pergolesi, Handel, and J. S. Bach . . . [And] another type of music to which George Sand gives a privileged position . . . popular music. [Consuelo], the pupil of Porpora, is extremely sensitive to the music of the people . . .

Consuelo not only incarnates all of these genres through performance, she also composes them. In fact the act of composing often comes to stand as a symbol for psychological growth and spiritual maturation and occurs at key points in the novel. The passages where Consuelo is described in the act of composing or where Consuelo speaks about her feelings towards composition are particularly revealing, and might well have been based on conversations between Sand and Pauline. Consuelo receives from Porpora counterpoint and compositional exercises, which she realizes with great diligence, often staying up until late at night. The protagonist publically demonstrates her musical

---

349 “Il y a . . . dans Consuelo . . . trois ordres de musique. La musique triomphante, la musique d’opéra qui exprime les passions tendres ou fortes avec toutes les ressources, les ornements du bel canto . . . Une musique plus austère, plus noble, plus profonde, à laquelle [Consuelo], la zingarella, par un don du ciel, se sent spontanément accordée, . . . la musique sacrée des grands maîtres comme Marcello, Pergolèse, Haendel et J. S. Bach . . . [et] une autre sorte de musique à laquelle George Sand donné une place privilégiée . . . la musique populaire. [Consuelo], l’élève de Porpora, n’est que trop sensible à cette musique du peuple . . .” Leon Guichard, “Pauline Garcia et la musique,” XLII.

350 Sand, Consuelo et La Comtesse de Rudolstadt, vol. I, 45. As a child and teenager, Pauline too received rigorous counterpoint lessons from Anton Reicha.
invention for the first time in the improvised ornaments and extended cadences, which she adds to an aria from *La Diavolessa*, one of Galuppi and Goldoni’s comic operas. Amazed by the correctness of her modulatory passages and the affective truthfulness of her complex ornaments, Porpora, who is among the public, suddenly rises from his seat exclaiming:

_C’est toi qui es le diable en personne. . . . Méchante fille ! . . . tu m’as joué un tour pendable. Tu t’es moquée de moi. Tu m’as caché la moitié de tes études et de tes ressources. Je n’avais plus rien à t’enseigner depuis longtemps, et tu prenais mes leçons par hypocrisie, peut-être pour me ravir tous les secrets de la composition et de l’enseignement, afin de me surpasser en toutes choses, et de me faire passer ensuite pour un vieux pédant._  

It is you who are the devil incarnate. . . . Malicious girl! . . . you played me a rotten trick. You have mocked me. You hid from me half of your studies and resources. I did not have anything else to teach you for a long time, and you hypocritically kept on taking my lessons, perhaps to seize from me all the secrets of composition and musical instruction, in order to surpass me in all things and then make me pass as an old pedant.

Consuelo, of course, has no intentions of ridiculing her domineering and somewhat insecure master, for whom she shows a profound respect throughout the novel.  

Nevertheless, she has an understanding of musical improvisation, which eludes the formalistic Porpora and stems directly from her upbringing in popular music. Her improvisatorial gifts bloom when she meets the gypsy Zdenko in Bohemia, with whom she exchanges folk tunes and sustains conversations on musical freedom and spontaneity. Later on, when she believes that her newlywed husband has died, she travels through the Bohemian woods towards Vienna, where she hopes to reunite with Porpora. On the way

---


352 She happily adopts, for example, the stage name of *La Porporina*.  

---
to that city, she meets a teenage musician, Joseph Haydn, who wishes to study voice under the guidance of her old master. Very soon both musicians befriend each other and decide to travel together under assumed identities, Beppo (Haydn) and Signor Bertoni (Consuelo). Once Consuelo discovers Haydn’s creative facility, she gives lessons in composition to him. After examining his excellent but dry contrapuntal exercises—extracted from Fux’s *Gradus ad Parnassum*—Consuelo advises him not only to profit from the rigorous discipline that Porpora will impose on him but also to develop a feel for improvisation and a soulful understanding of popular music:

"Essayez-vous à improviser, tantôt sur le violon, tantôt avec la voix. C’est ainsi que l’âme vient sur les lèvres et au bout des doigts. Je saurai si vous avez le souffle divin, ou si vous n’êtes qu’un écolier adroit, farci de réminiscences... Il faut que vous appreniez aussi sur le violon quelques chansonnettes que vous m’accompagnerez. Vous allez voir que ce n’est pas une mauvaise étude. Ces facéties populaires sont pleines de verve et de sentiment original; et quant à mes vieux chants espagnols, c’est du génie tout pur, du diamant brut. Maestro, faites-en votre profit: les idées engendrent les idées."

Try to improvise, be it on the violin or with your voice. This is how the soul manifests itself at the lips or at the tips of the fingers. I will then know if you have the divine breath, or if you are nothing but an adroit schoolboy, stuffed with old lessons... It is also necessary for you to learn some popular tunes on the violin, as you will accompany me. You will see that this is not a bad study. These popular simplicities are full of verve and truthful sentiment; As far as my old Spanish songs, they are pure genius, diamonds in the rough. Maestro, do this for your own benefit, for ideas engender ideas.

As David A. Powell has demonstrated, in many of the musical novels of Sand, the act of composing is often linked to the act of improvising. Improvisation for Sand is

---

unequivocally related to divine inspiration. For her, a good composer is necessarily a fine improviser. One could draw parallels on Consuelo’s ideas on musical invention with many of Manuel Garcia père’s thoughts on the connection between vocal spontaneity, technical ease, and artistic freedom. Viardot-Garcia not only understood these ideas but was known for her fabulous capacity to improvise ornaments and cadences. She too, of course, was admired as an interpreter of popular Spanish songs.

Consuelo gives her advice freely to an enthusiastic Haydn, but like her real counterpart, she is a timid composer, one who doubts her musical imagination and her creative gift. The protagonist explains to her new friend:

Malgré mes longues et sévères études de contre-point avec un aussi grand maître que le Porpora ce que j’ai appris ne me sert qu’à bien comprendre les créations du génie, et je n’aurai plus le temps, quand même j’en aurais l’audace, de créer moi-même des œuvres de longue haleine . . .

Despite my long and intensive studies of counterpoint with such a great master as Porpora, that which I have learned serves me only to fully understand the creations of genius. I do not have the time, even if I had the audacity, to create elaborate compositions.

Haydn believes in Consuelo’s aptitudes to detect genius. When they finally reach Vienna and after he begins his studies with Porpora, he often presents her with his newest instrumental compositions, which she admires and compliments. Sand consolidates the friendship of these two characters in order to give authority to Consuelo’s taste in musical

---

354 See Powell, 28. Sand has also left us passages in her letters, where she expresses unbound admiration for the improvisations of Chopin and Liszt.


composition. When she made up these lines, the writer had, of course, no way of knowing that in the next decades important French composers such as Berlioz, Gounod, Saint-Saëns, Massenet and Fauré would seek the compositional advice and approval of Viardot-Garcia.

In the early 1840s, Sand must have been a close witness to Pauline’s creative hesitations. This might explain the many letters sent to the singer in which she praises the originality of her compositional gifts. Hoping to further thwart Pauline’s doubts in this respect, she bestows the main character of Consuelo with an opportunity to dedicate herself to composition under inauspicious circumstances: Imprisoned for several months by Frederic II in Berlin, without a keyboard and with only a few writing implements, Consuelo—in the darkest hours of the night—finds release from her predicament by systematically committing to memory the compositions that appear as fully formed creations in her mind:

[L]es ténèbres, loin de lui causer l’effroi qu’elle en attendait, lui révélèrent des trésors de conception musicale, qu’elle portait en elle depuis longtemps sans avoir pu en faire usage et les formuler, dans l’agitation de sa profession de virtuose. . . . [E]lle se permit de consacrer quelques heures de la journée à noter ses inspirations, comme ces procédés prenaient du temps, et qu’elle avait une très petite provision de papier réglé, elle reconnut qu’il valait mieux exercer encore la robuste mémoire dont elle était douée, et y loger avec ordre les nombreuses compositions que chaque soir faisait éclore. Elle en vint à bout, et, en pratiquant, elle put revenir de l’une à l’autre sans les avoir écrites et sans les confondre.\(^{357}\)

Darkness, far from provoking the horror which she had expected, revealed to her treasures of musical conception, which she had carried within for a long time without having the opportunity of formulating or using them due to the agitated nature of her profession as virtuoso. . . . She dedicated a few hours each day to the notation of these inspirations, but since these procedures took time, and she only had a limited amount of ruled paper, she recognized that it was better to exercise the robust memory with which she had been endowed, by committing to it the numerous compositions that each evening emerged from her. She achieved her goal and after some practice she could go from one piece to the next without having written them down and without mixing them up.

Like Consuelo, Viardot-Garcia possessed an impressive memory, although it is doubtful that she could have accomplished the Mozartian feat described above. From Sand’s Neoplatonic portrayal of musical conception, one deduces that she was convinced that her friend’s creative talent remained half-dormant, waiting for the proper opportunity to make itself fully manifest. Isolation and introspection were essential elements—from her perspective—for the spiritual revelations of creativity to occur.

Later on, the imprisoned Consuelo has the chance of notating some of her compositions in a diary which she dedicates to both Porpora and Haydn:

---

358 A couple of her memory feats became legendary during her lifetime. For example, on March 30, 1847 in a production of Robert le diable at the Royal Opera of Berlin, Pauline brilliantly substituted on very short notice, soprano Leopoldine Tuczek-Ehrenburg in the role of Alice. To the amazement of those in attendance, that evening she sang not only that extensive and difficult role, but also her regular role, Isabelle. This was possible because adjustments were made so that both characters would not appear at the same time on stage. See letter of Pauline Viardot-Garcia to Mathieu Wielhorski, Berlin, March 28 and 29, 1847, quoted in Michèle Friang, Pauline Viardot au miroir de sa correspondance (Paris: Hermann, 2008), 86.

359 We shall see that in the next years of her life, Pauline would seldom have the opportunity to distance herself completely from her operatic career and her family obligations. The first seven years after in Baden-Baden proved to be the most productive of her compositional career, which seems to prove Sand’s point. See the Envoi of the present dissertation.
I sing every evening for close to two hours, and it seems to me that I make progress. What purpose does it serve? The vaults of my dungeon can only echo my voice back, they cannot hear me. . . . But God listens to me, and when I compose a canticle, which I sing to him with all the fervor of my soul, I experience a celestial calm and fall asleep almost happily. It seems to me that in my sleep the heavens respond back to me and that a mysterious voice sings to me a more beautiful canticle than mine, which the next day I try to recall and sing. At present, I have pencils and still have a bit of ruled paper in which I shall write my compositions. A day perhaps, you will play through them, my dear friends, and I will not be completely dead.

Artistic immortality and divine inspiration are thus fused in the act of writing down one’s compositions and in the act of interpretation, realized afterwards by other sympathetic spirits.

Consuelo, however, fails to become a renowned composer. After she is rescued from Spandaw, she is transformed by the initiation rites of Les Invisibles and is happily reunited with her illuminated husband, Albert. She then continues her brilliant singing career for another ten years, until she loses her voice after learning that her husband has been imprisoned in Prague for his subversive activities. Political persecution eventually force the impoverished couple and their many children to go into hiding. The wise Count

---

of Rudolstadt is transformed by all his sufferings into a sort of musical prophet, an oracle that speaks through the voice of his Stradivarius of a future world homogenized by divine fraternity and social justice. When a group of German illuminati manage to locate the family not too far from the Castle of the Giants around 1774, they are astonished by the power of Albert’s playing:


Nothing in these unknown chants, announced either languor or daydreaming. They resembled warlike hymns, which materialized before our eyes: triumphant armies carrying banners, palms, and mysterious signs of a new religion. I saw the immensity of all the nations reunited under a single standard, without any tumult in the ranks, a fever without delirium, an impetuous impulse without fury, human activity in all its splendor, victory in all its clemency, and faith in all its expansive sublimity.

The mystical socialism of Pierre Leroux, which had fascinated Sand for many years, is apparent in this vivid vision of a future where the human race is joined in a religious celebration of its ultimate social transformation.

Consuelo becomes the keeper and interpreter of the fascinating music of her clairvoyant husband. However, it is very soon apparent to the group of illuminati that the

---

music and the character of “La Zingara de consolation” are as unique as those of her husband. One of them, Philon, is initially struck by the incongruent combination of her wild appearance and her knowledge of Masonic symbology:

[ELle . . . se mit à nous interroger par les signes et les formules de la maçonnerie écossaise, avec une sévérité scrupuleuse. Nous étions fort surpris de voir une femme initiée à ces mystères qu’aucune autre n’a jamais possédés que je sache ; et l’air imposant, le regard scrutateur de celle-là, nous inspiraient un certain respect, en dépit du costume bien évidemment zingaro.]

She . . . began to interrogate us with a scrupulous severity and with the signs and formulas used in Scottish masonry. We were strongly surprised to find a woman initiated in these mysteries; as far as I know, none other possesses this knowledge; Despite her gypsy costume, her imposing air and probing gaze inspired in us an unequivocal respect.

Learning from the illuminati that rumors of their presence are running through the Austrian states, Consuelo fears for the security of her family. She decides that they must flee Albert’s native country. Sensing an imminent departure, the countryside inhabitants assemble around the family to hear their divinely inspired music one last time. The high point of their final performance is a ballad composed by Consuelo, “La bonne déesse de la pauvreté.” The couple’s beautiful son, named after the gypsy Zdenko, sings the lyrics with brilliant technique as his mother accompanies him on the guitar. It cannot be casual that this is the first time in the extensive novel that one of Consuelo’s compositions is heard in public. As the Bohemian folk and illuminati listen to the rendition of the song,

---

362 This is how the Bohemians of the region address Consuelo. Ibid., 404.
363 Ibid., 409.
their emotional reactions are strong. Philon describes the effect of the music on those in attendance:

[A]près que [la Zingara] eut préludé sur la guitare avec un génie particulier empreint de la couleur méridionale, [l’adolescent] se mit à chanter, accompagné par elle . . . Imaginez vous cette ballade, rendue en beaux vers dans une langue douce et naïve qui semble avoir été faite pour les lèvres de l’adolescence, adaptée à une mélodie qui remue le cœur et en arrache les larmes les plus pures, une voix séraphique qui chante avec une pureté exquise, un accent musical incomparable . . .\(^{364}\)

After [la Zingara] played the prelude on the guitar with distinctive southernmost genius, the adolescent began to sing . . . Imagine this ballad, rendered in versed language of a sweet and naïve nature, seemingly made for the lips of adolescence and adapted to a melody which moved the heart and brought the purest tears into the eyes, a seraphic voice that sang with exquisite purity and incomparable musical accent . . .

The German illuminato—who appears to possess a finely trained ear—also has the opportunity of transcribing the melodic line and a free translation of the ballad’s lyrics, which were, supposedly, originally in an unspecified Slavic tongue.\(^{365}\) The novelist’s words for the song are marked by her mystical egalitarian message, her Rousseauian love of nature and simplicity, and her militant desire for social justice. An extract from this long prose poem follows:

---

\(^{364}\) Ibid., 424.

\(^{365}\) Although Sand’s novel only includes the prose lyrics to the song, she might have hoped for Pauline to compose a vocal line and an accompaniment for them. Given the extensive and unequal length of Sand’s narrative prose poem, this might have been an extremely difficult task to accomplish.
“La bonne déesse de la pauvreté”

BALLADE

Chemins sablés d’or, landes verdoyantes, ravins aimés des chamois, grandes montagnes couronnées d’étoiles, torrents vagabonds, forêts impénétrables, laissez-la, laissez-la passer, la bonne déesse, la déesse de la pauvreté !

... 

Quelques hommes se sont assemblés pour la maudire. Ils l’ont trouvée trop belle et trop gaie, trop agile et trop forte. Arrachons ses ailes, ont-ils dit ; donnons-lui des chaînes, brisons-la de coups, et qu’elle souffre, et qu’elle périsse, la déesse de la pauvreté !

Ils ont enchaîné la bonne déesse, ils l’ont battue et persécutée mais ils n’ont pu l’avilir ; elle s’est réfugiée dans l’âme des poètes, dans l’âme des paysans, dans l’âme des artistes, dans l’âme des martyrs, et dans l’âme des saints, la bonne déesse, la déesse de la pauvreté !

... 

Tes enfants cesseront un jour de porter le monde sur leurs épaules ; ils seront récompensés de leur peine et de leur travail. Le temps approche où il n’y aura plus ni riches, ni pauvres, où tous les hommes consommeront les fruits de la terre, et jouiront également des bienfaits de Dieu ; mais tu ne seras point oubliée dans leurs hymnes, ô bonne déesse de la pauvreté !

Ils se souviendront que tu fus leur mère féconde, leur nourrice robuste et leur église militante. Ils répandront le baume sur tes blessures, et ils te feront de la terre rajeunie et embaumée un lit où tu pourras enfin te reposer, ô bonne déesse de la pauvreté !

My translation is presented below:

---

Ibid., 420-3.
“The Kind Goddess of Poverty”

BALLAD

Sanded roads of gold, green moors, ravines loved by the chamois, great mountains crowned by stars, wandering torrents, impenetrable forests, let her, let her pass, the kind goddess, the goddess of poverty!

... 

A few men assembled to curse her. They found her too beautiful and too joyful, too agile and too strong. Let us tear off her wings, they said; let us give her chains, break her with blows, so that she suffers and perishes, the goddess of poverty!

They chained the kind goddess, they beat and persecuted her, but they could not vilify her. She took refuge in the souls of poets, in the souls of peasants, in the souls of artists, in the souls of martyrs, and the souls of saints, the kind goddess, the goddess of poverty!

... 

One day your children will cease carrying the world on their shoulders; they will be rewarded for their sorrow and their work. The time approaches when there will be neither rich nor poor, when all men will consume the treasures of the earth and will enjoy the benevolence of God; but you will not be forgotten in their hymns, oh kind goddess of poverty!

They will remember that you were their fertile mother, their robust nursemaid and their militant church. They will spread balm on your wounds, and they will make from the renewed warm earth a bed, where you will be able to finally rest, oh kind goddess of poverty!

Thus, Consuelo’s compositions do not serve to create and perpetuate her artistic reputation or her personal wealth; in fact, as the novel closes, she and her family disappear into the Bohemian woods—poor, pursued, and forgotten by most in the musical world. Instead, her knowledge of music, creative talent, and self-expression are all directed towards spreading a consolatory socialist message among the dispossessed of Europe. Her individual and finely chiseled personality becomes the instrument through which she protects her husband and forms the character of her children, who in this case stand as representatives of the next generation of artists, liberals, and revolutionaries. It is
in the final passages of Sand’s *Consuelo*, that the influence of Saint-Simonian thought, in particular its preoccupation with the role of the artist in the transformation of society, becomes manifest. From such a conclusion, it is apparent that the novelist had grand ambitions for Pauline not only as an artist and a composer but also as a renovator of society.

Viardot-Garcia still had to live up to Sand’s high expectations by solidifying her reputation as exceptional singer and publishing her initial albums of compositions. In the next years, she would have to achieve these goals with the consciousness that Europe’s intelligentsia was reading Sand’s novel and that they all knew that the character of Consuelo was inspired on her faculties and personality. The identification made by many German musicians and intellectuals between Consuelo and Pauline, for example, is documented in an epistolary exchange between Rebecka Henriette Dirichlet (1811-1858) and her older sister, Fanny Hensel (1805-1847) and in comments made by Meyerbeer to Pauline, during a visit to Leipzig in the summer of 1843:

---

367 “I agree with Cueroy, Marix-Spire, and Rambeau about the importance of Saint-Simonism in the formulation of Sand’s aesthetics, finding more influence from the doctrines of Saint-Simonian disciples than has been intimated by recent scholars.” Powell, 292-3.

368 The passage of the years did little to transform Sand’s militant attitude towards Viardot-Garcia’s functions as social reformer. Years later, at the height of the 1848 Revolution, Sand expected for Pauline to interrupt her successful singing career, and to guide the artistic renovation of France. See chapter 6 of the present dissertation.

369 “Have you heard Madame Viardot-Consuelo? That dreadful Georges (sic) Sand! Every kitchen-garden I see reminds me of her.” Rebecca Lejeune Dirichlet to Fanny Hensel, Leipzig, 15 July 1843. Fanny responds “I can well believe that every kitchen-garden reminds you of Consuelo, but it really is a pity that you do not hear and see her prototype on stage. She is an incomparable person! And many of her traits are so true to nature that when I hear her speak, Consuelo stands before me.” Fanny Hensel to Rebecca Lejeune Dirichlet, Berlin, July 27, 1843. Parts of both letters are translated and quoted in April Fitzlyon, *The Price of Genius*, 134.
Meyerbeer has plans for me. He tells to anyone that is willing to listen that for him I am the first artist of the universe, that it is me that he wanted at the Opéra, that he wants me still, and that he will not present any work there until I have been engaged. . . . He calls me his dear little Consuelo. He is half crazed with your Consuelo. He speaks and dreams about it constantly, and wants to absolutely speak with you when you return to Paris. He dreams of an opera based on the part of the novel which takes place in Bohemia, in the Castle of the Giants . . .

Although Meyerbeer never composed his dream-work based on Sand’s novel, he kept his word and did not create another grand opera for Paris until 1848, when she presented herself on the stage of the Opéra for the first time in the premiere of Le Prophète.371 One can see that for the budding singer, the pressure of living up to the idealized image of Consuelo was compensated by the popularity that Sand’s work achieved on her behalf. As we shall soon see, it would not take long for Pauline to reproduce the operatic triumphs of Sand’s protagonist.

As the initial installments of Consuelo were being published, the Viardots travelled towards Madrid, their first stop in a series of Spanish engagements lasting three and a half months (from the end of April to mid-August 1842). The demanding

370 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Leipzig, August 2, 1843, in Marix-Spire, Lettres inédites, 181.

371 It is curious to note that during the autumn of 1843, Liszt too dreamt of composing a grand opera based on Sand’s novel. See Ibid., 182.
circumstances which the singer found during her first and only Spanish tour\textsuperscript{372} did not impede her from reading the latest installments of the novel and sending letters to Sand with her reaction to them:

\begin{quotation}
\textit{Je ne puis pas vous dire ce que se passe en moi depuis Consuelo . . . je suis toute fière d’avoir été un des fragments qui vous ont servi à créer cette admirable figure. Ce sera sans doute ce que j’aurai fait de mieux dans le monde.}\textsuperscript{373}
\end{quotation}

I cannot explain what has occurred to me after Consuelo . . .
I am so proud of having been one of the fragments that have served you to create this admirable figure. It will doubtlessly be the best thing I do on earth.

Viardot-Garcia reported from Madrid that the novel’s chapters were being translated into Spanish and that the intellectual and artistic elite of the country eagerly awaited for their publication.\textsuperscript{374} As Sand learned about the singer’s triumphs in Spain, she reflected on Viardot-Garcia’s professional future and her role as a representative of the gifted Other.

A letter from the second half of June 1842 not only reads as a calculated artistic manifesto, but also as an accurate prophecy of Pauline’s upcoming accomplishments:

\begin{quotation}
\textsuperscript{372} In the capital city, the Italian operatic company had been dissolved, and Viardot-Garcia had to form a new group, act as musical director, repétiteur, and prima donna as she mounted Rossini’s \textit{Otello} and \textit{Il Barbiere}. Despite these hurdles both productions were very successful. At the same time, Pauline prepared to sing a new operatic role, Norma. See Kendall-Davies, \textit{The Life and Works}, 147-9.
\end{quotation}

\begin{quotation}
\textsuperscript{373} Louis Viardot and Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Madrid, July 29, 1842, in Marix-Spiere, \textit{Lettres inédites}, 43.
\end{quotation}

\begin{quotation}
\textsuperscript{374} The translated installments of \textit{Consuelo} were published in \textit{El Heraldo} starting on September 1842. The novel was translated throughout Europe, sometimes without permission from the government as was the case in Russia, where Sand was idolized. Ibid., 196.
\end{quotation}
The conclusion is that you are the first, the only, the great, the true singer, and that one day this will be proved to the unsophisticated, the connoisseurs, and the sympathetic . . . you are the priestess of the ideal in music and your mission is to divulge it, to make it comprehensible, and to lead the reluctant and the ignorant to an instinct and a revelation of the true and the beautiful. You have something greater to acquire than your reputation and fortune. One and the other will be made necessarily, but you will use these only as mediums to facilitate and ensure the labor of your might and genius on the century. (These thoughts are mine). Chopin also believes them, but dares not to speak them out too loudly. He fears that if he attributes to artists a divine mission, he might give the appearance of taking himself too seriously.

In order to accomplish this task, Sand realized the importance of building an international reputation, one which could not be destroyed by the pettiness of the politically compromised Parisian press. Probably Sand already began to realize the negative consequences that the publication of her newest novel in La Revue Indépendante would have for Pauline’s Parisian career:

375 Sand to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Nohant, June 15-30, 1842, in Ibid., 159.
Il faut revenir . . . avec une renommée si bien faite au loin, que les cabales ne puissent plus servir qu’a la consolider. Il faut, que les journaux avec leur petite critique ignorante, pédante et de mauvaise foi, ne viennent pas tous les matins vous dire allez à droite, allez à gauche . . . Paris sans engagements au théâtre me paraît un tombeau pour vous, et je voudrais que d’ici à deux ans, au moins, vous ne le considérez que comme un pied-à-terre . . . Je veux que toutes les fleurs qui poussent en Europe tombent à vos pieds . . .

It is necessary to return from abroad . . . with such a solid reputation that the factions here cannot serve but to consolidate it. It is necessary that the journals with their small and ignorant criticisms, arrogantly made in bad faith, do not come every morning to tell you if you must go left or right. . . . Paris without performances in the opera houses is a tomb for you, and I would wish that for at least two years, you would consider it nothing more than a pied-à-terre. . . . I want all the flowers that Europe possesses to land at your feet . . .

It is sobering to imagine the weight of this artistic mission and professional strategy on the consciousness of a twenty-year-old woman. Yet Viardot-Garcia—like her sister and her father before her—was confident of her abilities and accustomed to being treated with a mixture of admiration and awe. The trip to Spain was significant not only because of her many successes on the operatic stage, her debut as Norma, and the celebrated concerts that she gave in Granada, but because she soon recognized herself in the reflection offered by the warm landscape of Spain and the proud character of its people. The people of Andalusia, in particular, acknowledged her as one of their own. They still remembered her father’s magnetic personality and tonadillas. A presentation of Norma in Granada was preceded and followed by absolute popular frenzy:

376 Ibid., 159-160.

People fought at the gate of the theatre. All Granada was there. A mass of peasants came from the most remote corners of the countryside. Those who did not have tickets, bought them through scalpers. In the midst of screams and applause, the representation came to an end. Pauline had to ask for a piano to be brought on stage and in “druidic costume” sang vitos and peteneras which were frenetically petitioned by the public.

Even though she had been born in France and had never stepped on the native country of her parents, Viardot-Garcia must have trembled with the excitement of recovered identity that evening. Among the Spaniards, she could drop all masks, all imposed traits, and be truly herself. Shortly after the Viardots returned to Paris at the end of August, Pauline confessed these feelings to Sand, who—at her disastrous sojourn in Majorca with Chopin and her children—was suspicious of anything Spanish:

*Je desire . . . vous parler de ma chère Espagne, de son beau ciel, de ses habitants, de moi-même . . . Le Spleen de Louis a passé en entrant en France, et je vous dirai tout bas que je crains l’avoir pris en quittant l’Espagne. . . . Tout ce que je puis vous affirmer, c’est qu’ici je trouve qu’il fait froid et que l’on n’y voit pas clair.*

I wish . . . to tell you of my dear Spain, of its beautiful sky, of its inhabitants, of myself . . . Louis’ depression passed as soon as he entered France, and I will whisper to you that I fear I caught it when we left Spain. . . . All that I can assure you, is that it is too cold here and one does not see with clarity.

---


378 Ibid., 48.

379 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Paris, August 27, 1842, in Ibid., 164.
Despite her love for the country, she would never have the opportunity of visiting it again. At the end of that summer, she had reasons to feel apprehensive, for she had not secured a position at the Théâtre Italien. Finally, she was allowed to sing Tancredi and Arsace, roles that Grisi did not want and which lay far too low for her voice. She also had the opportunity of singing Cenerentola, a role in which she excelled. Nevertheless, she would have been better off if she would have followed Sand’s proposed strategy and left Paris, for what followed was a nasty public campaign intended to tarnish her reputation. The magazines that published the most aggressive articles were *La Revue de Paris, La France musicale,* and *La Revue des deux mondes.*

Here follows but a taste, a fragment of a nasty note published by Félix Bonnaire, director of *La Revue de Paris* at the beginning of 1843:

> Que Mme. Pauline Viardot n’interroge-t-elle les grands modèles qui posent devant ses yeux sur la scène italienne ? Certes, les conseils d’une tragédienne comme la Grisi . . . voudraient mieux pour elle que toutes ces inspirations plus ou moins psychologiques puisées dans le romans du jour, et qui finiraient par devenir aussi insaisissables que le sont au piano les vaporeuses nuances du jeu microscopique de M. Chopin.

Why doesn’t Mme. Pauline Viardot avail herself of the great models that sing with her on the Italian stage? For sure the advice of a great tragic actress like la Grisi . . . would be more useful to her than all those quasi-psychological inspirations extracted from the novels of the day, and which will end up by becoming as ungraspable as the vaporous nuances of M. Chopin’s microscopic playing.

---

380 A detailed overview of the origins and development of this agressive campaign is presented by Marix Spire, “Introduction,” *Lettres inédites,* 48-58.

In less than a single paragraph, Bonnaire’s malicious pen vilified not only Consuelo but those friends closest to Sand’s heart. This attack was particularly shameful in view that only two years earlier Bonnaire had given Pauline’s performances rave reviews. The leftist tendencies of La Revue Indépendante and of Sand’s newest novel would not be forgiven by the conservative regime of Louis Phillipe. Sadly, the attacks on Pauline’s operatic performances coincided with the publication of her first song album at the beginning of 1843. French critics ignored the originality of this eight-song collection, which will be discussed in detail in the next chapter.

The contrast between Pauline’s terrible winter season in Paris and her triumphant visit to Spain during the previous summer finally made it clear to the Viardots that the singer would have to gain her operatic reputation outside of France. In the next five years, Germany and Russia, and not Italy as Sand had predicted, would provide Pauline with the opportunity of becoming a prima donna assoluta.

Despite the artistic exile that resulted from her association with Sand and Chopin, Pauline never regretted her friendship with these two remarkable artists. She attempted to remain close to Chopin, even after the pianist’s break with Sand. Pauline’s most palpable tribute to his musical genius was her vocal arrangement of fifteen of his Mazurkas. The year previous to his death, Chopin had the opportunity of

---


383 For months she tried to promote reconciliation between the pianist and the writer. See chapter 7.

384 Viardot-Garcia made many of these arrangements in the 1840s. At the time, it appears that most had words in Spanish. Two collections of the arrangements were initially published in Paris in 1864 and 1865 with French words by Louis Pomey. The first collection has been
hearing a few of them at several concerts which the singer gave in London. He found them compelling and effective:

*Les journaux m’ont consacré des articles élogieux. . . Hier, au concert de Convent-Garden, Madame Viardot a chanté mes mazurkas qui ont été réédemandées . . C’est sans que je l’en eusse priée qu’elle a chanté mes compositions.*

The newspapers have dedicated praising articles to me. . . Yesterday, at her concert in Covent Garden, Madame Viardot sang my mazurkas, which were encored. . . She sang my compositions and I did not have to ask her to do it.

Chopin was less happy later on that summer when he realized that his name had been excluded from some of the programs which included the arrangements. Chopin construed this incident as a shameless attempt at self-promotion:

In Viardot’s programmes . . . there is no longer the item “Mazurkas of Chopin” but merely “Mazurkas arranged by Mme. Viardot”—It is all the same to me; but there is a pettiness behind it. She wants to have success and is afraid of a certain newspaper which perhaps does not like me. It once wrote that she had sung music “by a certain M. Chopin” whom no one knows and that she ought to sing something else.

Perhaps Pauline was trying to protect Chopin from his antagonist in the British Press? In any case, after Chopin’s death, Pauline did not fail to acknowledge the composer either in

---


concert programs or at the time of the Parisian publication of these arrangements in the 1860s. A reproduction of the cover for the second series is reproduced in Figure 4.6:

Figure 4.6. Cover for *Six Mazourkes de F. Chopin pour chant et piano arrangées par Mme. Pauline Viardot* (Second Series), n.d., courtesy of Bibliotheque Nationale de France.
Viardot-Garcia and Sand remained friends for almost four decades. Yet, important points of conflict in the relationship lay ahead. The first major disagreement resulted from the Viardots’ expensive purchase of Courtavenel, a manor house in the region of Rozay-en-Brie in 1844. The picturesque but dilapidated castle displayed, among other things, six towers, a moat, and a drawbridge. Sand—who could be, at times, too outspoken and manipulative—was furious with the purchase of the country estate, partly because Courtavenel was too far away from Nohant and partly because Pauline did not manage to visit her that summer after having spent many months touring Russia, Germany, and Austria. In her letters, she accused Pauline of having transformed into a bourgeois proprietress, forgetting her social and artistic duties. Pauline, who hated confrontations, was mortified. Louis Viardot defended his wife:

_Si une maison de campagne, avec 90 arpents de terre, est un manoir féodal, où l’on doive oublier ses opinions, ses goûts simples, et jusqu’à ses amis, où l’on doive devenir duchesse, pourquoi Nohant, qui est quatre ou cinq fois plus considérable, ne vous a-t-il pas empêchée de devenir l’un des plus fervents comme des plus éloquents apôtres de l’égalité?_

If a country house, with ninety arpents of land, is a feudal manor house, where one must forget one’s opinions, one’s simple tastes, and even one’s friends, where one must become a duchess, why did Nohant, which is four or five times larger, not impede you from becoming one of the most fervent and eloquent apostles of equality?

In the envoi of the present document, we shall see that a more serious divergence resulted from Viardot-Garcia’s failed creation in the 1850s and 1860s of _La Mare au diable_, an _opéra-comique_ to a libretto by Sand, which Pauline was supposed to set to music. Despite

---

{387 Letter of Louis Viardot to George Sand, Courtavenel. August 14, 1844, in Marix-Spire, op. cit., 207.}
these difficulties, Pauline would remain loyal, supportive, and admiring of her friend. During the difficult months of preparation of *Le Prophète* in 1848 and 1849, Pauline sought comfort and strength in the letters that Sand had written to her throughout the years:

*Je viens de passer deux heures entières à relire toutes les lettres que vous m’avez écrites depuis que nous nous connaissons, depuis que j’ai le bonheur de vous aimer, et je ne puis pas résister au besoin de vous écrire, pour vous remercier les larmes dans les yeux, de l’affection dont vous m’avez donné tant de preuves, et que j’ai constamment regardé comme un des plus grands bonheurs de ma vie.*

I have just spent two full hours rereading all the letters that you have written to me after we first met, after I had the good fortune of loving you, and I could not resist the urge of writing to you to thank you, with tears in my eyes, for all the proofs of affection which you have given me and which I consider constantly among the greatest joys of my life.

Pauline’s reaction should not be unexpected; Sand had, after all, not only found her a devoted husband, but fiercely encouraged her development as singer and composer, supporting her at important moments of crisis and self-hesitation, and giving her a strong sense of mission: In the mirror of Consuelo, Pauline found much of the focus and resolution to achieve her artistic and creative goals.

---

For the release of her first album of songs, Pauline Viardot-Garcia turned to Eugène-Théodore Troupenas, one of the most sought out publishers in Paris, who had previously collaborated with close friends of hers such as Rossini and Chopin. Troupenas, as we have seen, was an old acquaintance of the Garcia family; he had been particularly close to María Malibran and Charles de Bériot, serving often as their financial advisor and publishing many of their compositions. In the 1830s, he had expressed admiration for the songs of Viardot-Garcia’s older sister. A letter from the publisher to the de Bériots, sent in 1836, the year of Maria’s tragic death, confirms his respect for her compositional abilities:

*Depuis le 15 juin, chers amis, j’ai absolument oublié que je suis éditeur de musique, et je crois que je ne chercherais pas à me le rappeler si la délicieuse romance de la bonne petite femme (« La Fiancée du brigand ») de Maria, en cours d’impression ne l’exigeait.*

After June 15, dear friends, I have absolutely forgotten that I am an editor of music, and I believe that I would have not attempted to remember it, except that Maria’s delicious romance about a good little lady (“The brigadier’s fiancée”) is in the course of being printed.

---

389 Troupenas published two albums of Maria Malibran’s songs. The last one, *Dernières pensées musicales de Marie Félicité Garcia de Bériot*, appeared posthumously in 1837. See chapter 3.

It is probable that as editor of la Malibran, Troupenas might have felt curious about the compositions of her younger sister. He might have heard some of her songs after her arrival in Paris in 1838.

In October 1841, four years after the publication of María’s posthumous album, Viardot-Garcia met Troupenas at rehearsals for the premiere of Rossini’s *Stabat Mater*.391 They probably agreed then to release an album with eight of her compositions. At least half of the songs eventually included in *L’Album de Mme. Viardot-Garcia* were composed by the end of 1841, yet it took most of 1842 to bring the project to full fruition.

With her best calligraphy and paying much attention to expressive markings, Pauline prepared for Troupenas fair copies of the works which she considered to be her most significant compositions. Her fair copies of “L’Exilé Polonais” (PVG.s.I.5), “L’Ombre et le jour” (PVG.s.I.7), “Le Chêne et le roseau” (PVG.s.I.6), and “Adieu les beaux jours” (PVG.s.I.4) can be found in the Département de la musique of the Bibliothèque nationale de France.392 The first page of “L’Ombre et le jour” is reproduced in Figure 5.1:

---

391 “Rossini vient d’envoyer en fin son Stabat Mater à Troupenas, qui désire le faire entendre proprement aux artistes, journalistes et toute la haute clique musicale. Cette audition aura lieu à la maison.” / “Rossini has finally sent his *Stabat Mater* to Troupenas, who wishes to give a proper audition to artists, journalists, and the entire high musical clique. This audition will take place at my house.” Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Château Frayé, October 15, 1841, *Lettres inédites de George Sand et de Pauline Viardot*, ed. in Thérèse Marix-Spire (Paris: Nouvelles Éditions Latines, 1959), 134.

392 Call numbers for these manuscripts are Ms. 5878, Ms. 5879, Ms. 5877 and Ms. 5875 correspondingly. For more detailed information on these autographs see appendix F.
One can see in these autographs that Pauline and her editor carefully considered and revised not only musical aspects of the works such as dynamics and articulation but incidental details such as dedicatee, title, and position of the song within the collection.\(^{393}\)

\(^{393}\) For a detailed overview of the songs in this collection see appendix E.
This last aspect was certainly not casual. Her extensive setting of La Fontaine’s “Le Chêne et le roseau”—composed, performed, and corrected during the winter of 1841-1842—served deliberately as virtuosic close to the album. The opening songs of the collection, on the other hand, were two translated Lieder to the poetry of Uhland—“La Chapelle” (PVG.s.I.2=PVG.s.0.1.g) and “L’Enfant de la montagne” (PVG.s.I.1=PVG.s.0.2.f). By placing them at the beginning of the album, it is not improbable that Viardot-Garcia wished to acknowledge the musical debt of the six other *romances* to the Lieder tradition.

Two other complete autographs relating to this album can be found in the black notebook now at Houghton Library, Harvard University (Ms Mus 232, item 60): a German version of “La Chapelle,” which has already been discussed in chapter 3, and a manuscript for the fourth song of the album, “Adieux les beaux jours,” a song composed in 1838 or before. The opening section of this manuscript is reproduced in Figure 5.2:

---

394 For a discussion on the chronology of these two manuscripts see chapter 3.
Since drafts or autographs for songs “L’Abricotier” (PVG.s.I.3), “L’Exilé polonais” (PVG.s.I.5), and “L’Enfant et la mère” (PVG.s.I.6) do not exist in the black notebook, I believe that they were composed either in 1840 or 1841 during respites from Pauline's operatic tours and concert obligations.

Dedicatees for the songs included close friends of the singer such as George Sand (no. 1), Ary Scheffer (no. 2), and Mme. É. Troupenas (no. 6), family members such as Eugenie García (No. 3) and Louis Viardot (No. 8), and professional acquaintances such as the composer Daniel Auber (No. 4) and the baritone Jean-Antoine-Juste Géraldy (No. 5). Troupenas, an intelligent seller, planned an attractive edition, which would present Viardot-Garcia’s first album in the best of all possible lights: As has already been mentioned, Ary Scheffer, in collaboration with H. Soltaum, created charming and elaborate covers for each of the compositions, which were then expertly engraved by a certain S. Rosenthal. These engravings were included in both the collected publication
and in the separate, individual publication of each song. Figure 5.3 presents a reproduction of the title page for “L’Abricotier:”

Figure 5.3. A. Scheffer and H. Soltaum, drawers, and S. Rosenthal, engraver, “L’Abricotier,” title page, litograph, ca. 1842, courtesy of Stadtbibliothek, Berlin.
Such attention to visual presentation might seem superficial from our modern perspective, but it should be recalled that albums of romances were mostly consumed by members of the Parisian bourgeoisie, who were as concerned with the ease of their musical content as with the decorative presentation of their covers—particularly if they illustrated pretty young girls in submissive attitudes, as is the case above. As a result of the attractive design of the 1843 album, the difficulty of some of its songs might have been overlooked by buyers from the bourgeoisie.

Musically, the album demonstrates Viardot-Garcia’s sophisticated assimilation of the different stylistic influences which were quickly transforming the identity of French art song at the time: As we have seen, in the early 1840s, the simple charms of the Romantic romance—so much appreciated in the Parisian homes and salons of the aristocracy and the bourgeoisie—were slowly being stifled by the introduction of German Lieder into French soil. Already in 1839, the critic Henri Blanchard wondered if the musical and national identity of the romance could be safeguarded under such conditions:

*Ou va la romance? . . . va-t-elle se transformer en lied, c'est-à-dire acquérir plus d'étendue et des modulations, ou restera-t-elle simple, naïve, et caractéristique comme elle le fut toujours, de notre goût national, ainsi que le bolero est l'expression de la musique espagnole?*

What will happen to the romance? . . . Will it metamorphose into Lied; in other words, will it acquire a longer extension and more modulations, or will she remain simple, naïve, and characteristic as it always has been, part of our national taste, just as the bolero is the expression of Spanish music?

---


Although Viardot-Garcia might have appreciated the direct simplicity of the better romances of popular composers such as Antoine Romagnesi or Louisa Pouget, the inclusion of two Lieder in translation at the beginning of the album makes it clear that she had no intentions of censoring the external influences operating at the time on French art song. In the spirit of the romance, on the other hand, the songs in the album which employ French lyrical poetry, “Adieux les beaux jours” and “L’Ombre et le jour,” are simpler in their form and presentation of musical material; they are enriched, nevertheless, by a varied harmonic palette, integrated and active accompaniments, and a sophisticated interaction between text and music. Such elements demonstrate an absorption of the most relevant stylistic aspects of Schubert’s Lieder, many of which Viardot-Garcia knew very well since her student days with Liszt and Reicha.\footnote{See chapter 3 and Antoine Virenque, “Pauline Viardot et Schubert,” \textit{Cahiers Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot, Maria Malibran} 2 (1978), 102-8.} The 1843 album also illustrates Pauline’s literary interests. It includes a setting of a text which imitates medieval folk poetry (i.e. “L’Abricotier”) and the narrative setting of La Fontaine’s “Le Chêne et le roseau.” Curiously the collection does not include a translated version of one of Pauline’s famed Spanish songs. It is possible that she felt that buyers would not be able to adjust to the rhythmic intricacies and vocal production often associated with the Iberian style.

For each of the eight compositions in the album, Pauline assigns a relevant subtitle (i.e. \textit{ballade, romance, couplets, chanson servienne, dialogue, fable} and \textit{mélodie}).\footnote{This is the only one of Viardot-Garcia’s albums to include this type of descriptive legend for each of the compositions.} These subtitles create expectations with regard to form and content; thus, one rightly expects “L’Exilé polonaise”/\textit{Couplets} to be a composition in strophic form,
“L’Enfant et la mère”/Dialogue to be a miniature dramatic scene between a mother and her child, and “Adieux les beaux jours”/Romance to be an atmospheric simple song in either strophic or rondo form. The subtitles are also useful analytical tools, allowing us to better understand Viardot-Garcia’s appraisal of her compositions. It would be impossible to give in this chapter a detailed stylistic and technical analysis of the eight songs, so I have selected three contrasting compositions for the subsequent musical discussion: “L’Enfant de la montagne”/Ballade, “L’Abricotier”/Chanson servienne, and “L’Ombre et le jour”/Mélodie. The complete scores for these songs can be found in appendix E of the present dissertation. Consulting them before approaching the subsequent analytical discussions should make the task more comprehensible and enjoyable.

A scholar, lawyer, and professor originally from Tübingen, Ludwig Uhland’s wrote numerous Lieder and ballads, which were influenced by his admiration of Achim von Arnim and Clemens Brentano’s Des Knaben Wunderhorn (1805), Thomas Percy’s Reliques of Ancient English Poetry (1765), and Johann Gottfried Herder’s Stimmen der Völker (1778 and 1779). His poems were first compiled in the popular 1815 collection, Gedichte. Many contemporary German composers, such as Carl Loewe and Conradin Kreutzer, felt attracted to Uhland’s sophisticated imitations of folk poetry and the nationalist and liberal ideals reflected in them. “Des Knaben Berglied,” written while Uhland was still a student at the University in 1806, was first published in the Gedichte. German composers felt attracted to this poem: Loewe composed a setting, which he published in his Lieder of 1829; Schumann created his own version twenty years later for his Liederalbum für die Jugend.
In 1838, Pauline completed several settings of Uhland’s poetry, which resulted—as was discussed in chapter 3—in the publication of “Die Capelle” in the third musical supplement of Schumann’s Neue Zeitschrift für Musik. Although no drafts or autographs of her German setting of “Des Knaben Berglied” have been located, some scholars believe that this song was also finished in 1838. The composer would have then had the lyrics translated for the work’s initial publication in one of the musical supplements of La France musicale in 1840. In that magazine, the song was entitled “L’Enfant de la montagne.” The title would be retained for the publication of the work in Pauline’s first album of songs.

Because the original German version of this song has not been located, it is not known how much of the musical material was modified to adapt it to the French lyrics. Later on in life, however, the composer kept musical changes to a minimum in translated versions of songs which she had originally composed in Russian, German, and Spanish. Therefore, it would not be overly speculative to assume that the versions closely resembled one another.

Viardot-Garcia organized “L’Enfant de la montagne” in a loose ternary form, although the recurring musical statement at the end of each poetic strophe (with the

---

399 Autograph manuscripts of “Fischerlied” (Ms Mus 232, item 60 [3.]) and “Seliger Tod” (Ms Mus 232, item 60 [5.]) can be found in Houghton Library, Harvard University. These works were never published.


401 Waddington and Žekulin, 3.
exception of the third one) and the cleanly divided musical sections could easily make this work pass as a type of rondo form:

Figure 5.4. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1.

Taking into account the principal harmonic motions in the composition, strophe I (section a) remains grounded in the tonic key area (the motion to the mediant can be reinterpreted as a mere modal recoloring), strophe II (section b) creates harmonic tension by moving to the dominant and its own modified mediant (C-sharp major). This tension is relieved first by a return to the tonic in the musical refrain and then, in strophe III (section c), by the motion to the submediant (vi). A retransition to the dominant prepares the return to the tonic in strophe IV (section a’), after which tension is built incrementally until a final move to the tonic at the end of strophe V (section b’). This malleable formal and
harmonic plan, supported mostly by tonal shifts by thirds,\textsuperscript{402} allows the composer ample coloristic opportunities to recreate in music the allegoric complexity and compressed imagery of Uhland’s poetry. Before exemplifying these musico-poetic correspondences, however, it is important to illustrate some of the peculiarities which arose as a result of adapting the translated version of the poem to the song’s original melodic line.

A comparison of Uhland’s poem and the French translation employed in Viardot-Garcia’s song demonstrates that they share similar metric and strophic schemes (five lines per strophe, and eight syllables per line).\textsuperscript{403} The rhyme scheme, on the other hand, differs in some important details (i.e. German: aabbc, French ababc or ababa):

\textsuperscript{402} Modulation by thirds is a common tonal and expressive resource in many of Viardot-Garcia’s compositions. This demonstrates her familiarity and ease with the harmonic language employed by the generation of composers who followed Beethoven (i.e. Rossini, Schubert, Liszt, Schumann, etc.) Charles Rosen has discussed in detail the importance of mediant and submediant shifts for Romantic composers. Charles Rosen, Chapter 3: Formal Interlude, in \textit{The Romantic Generation} (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1995), 236-57.

\textsuperscript{403} This, of course, once one makes the proper adjustments for silent schwas (\textit{e muets}) and elisions in the French translation.
“Des Knaben Berglied”

1 Ich bin vom Berg der Hirtenknab',
2 Seh' auf die Schlösser all herab;
3 Die Sonne strahlt am ersten hiere;
4 Am längsten weilet sie bei mir;
5 Ich bin der Knab' vom Berge!
6 Hier ist des Stromes Mutterhaus;
7 Ich trink ihn frisch vom Stein heraus;
8 Er braust vom Fels in wildem Lauf,
9 Ich Fang ihn mit den Armen auf;
10 Ich bin der Knab' vom Berge!
11 Der Berg, der ist mein Eigentum,
12 da ziehn die Stürme ringsherum;
13 Und heulen sie von Nord und Süd,
14 So überschallt sie doch mein Lied:
15 Ich bin der Knab' vom Berge!
16 Sind Blitz und Donner unter mir,
17 So steh ich hoch im Blauen hier;
18 Ich kenne sie und rufe zu:
19 Laßt meines Vaters Haus in Ruh'!
20 Ich bin der Knab' vom Berge!
21 Und wann die Sturmglock einst erschallt
22 Manch Feuer auf den Bergen wallt,
23 Dann steig ich nieder, tret ins Glied
24 Und schwing mein Schwert, und sing mein Lied;
25 Ich bin der Knab' vom Berge!

“L'Enfant de la montagne”

Je suis l'enfant de la montagne;
D'en haut je vois le fier manoir,
Et toi, soleil, tu m'accompagnes
Je suis, de l'aube jusqu'au soir,
Je suis l'enfant de la montagne.
Près de mon toit jaillit la source
Du torrent aux flots écumeux ;
Du roc en roc suivant sa course,
J'y baigne mes pieds amoureux.
Nous sommes enfants de la montagne.

Il est à moi ce mont sauvage,
Avec ses prés, ses neiges, ses bois.
Quand sur son front gronde l'orage,
Des vents ma voix domine la voix.
Calme je me ris de leur rage.

Si l'éclair luit, si le tonnerre
Sous mes pieds gronde avec fracas,
Du ciel d'azur ma voix altière
Lui dit : Tonnerre, n'approche pas !
Respecte le toit de mon père.

Que le tocsin, dans la campagne
Appelle aux armes nos soldats ;
L'ardeur guerrière alors me gagne,
Je vole armé pour les combats,
Suivez l'enfant de la montagne!

In the translated version, the elegant and compressed precision of the German language is sacrificed in order to sustain the metric and strophic schemes of the original poem. This formal preservation facilitates the adaptation of the French translation to the melodic line of the original German Lied. The importance of the one-line refrain in Uhland’s imitation of folk poetry is underestimated in the French version. The refrain is not employed in poetic strophes III and IV, and it is modified in strophes II and V. This poetic manipulation is somewhat insensitive, but serves to strengthen and complete the imagery.
in the translated version. The omission provokes a semantic conflict with the recurring musical statement associated with the one-line refrain.

The recurring musical statement—reproduced in Example 5.1—is integrated by three motivic ideas: 1) motive x, an arpeggiated F-sharp minor chord in first inversion presented by the voice, 2) motive y, a chromatic and modulatory ascent of seven notes in the bass which ends in the leading tone of the tonic key area, and motive z, an arpeggiation of the tonic chord first presented by the pianist, and then, in a slightly modified version, repeated by both pianist and singer.


In the French version, the appearance of the musical refrain at the end of strophe I (section a) corresponds with the poetic refrain. Later on in the song, at the end of strophe IV (section a’), the musical refrain does not coincide with the poetic refrain, which has been substituted by the translator for the verse, “Respecte le toit de mon père”. Because the repetition of the three-syllable verb “respecte” (an archaized form of the command
“respectez”) does not adapt well to the metric accentuation of motive y, the composer decided to import from the previous verse the word “tonnere.” Example 5.2 reproduces the end of Strophe IV (section a’):


![Example 5.2](image)

Although motives x and y in this instance serve well to illustrate the menace of the approaching thunder, the adaptation of motive z’ to the eight syllables of “respecte le toit de mon père” results in a consequent to the vocal phrase which is a tag wordy and, therefore, particularly difficult to deliver in performance.

Pauline sometimes takes additional liberties with the translated text, occasionally adding a few words to some verses to make a smoother and more effective adaptation to the existing vocal line. For example, in strophe III, she substitutes “Calme et debout je me ris de leur rage” for “Calme je me ris de leur rage”. Although the additional words break the poem’s metric scheme by adding two extra syllables, this allows the composer to create more effective prosody in an extended melodic phrase of ten bars (mm. 78-87). The phrase is reproduced in Example 5.3:
In this instance, however, it is baffling that the final unaccented syllable of the phrase gets a tie on a downbeat, therefore becoming unduly emphasized. The accentuation of this final *e muet* can, of course, be minimized during performance. This minor mistake in French prosody is perhaps the result of the rhythmic liberty of the long musical phrase.404

There are many musico-poetic correspondences in the song, which manifest themselves through a variety of compositional resources, among them a) the correlation of phrase structure to declamatory rate, b) illustrative figures in the accompaniment, and c) the development of central motives in response to certain poetic images. In the subsequent discussion, I will exemplify some of these correlations

The courage and boastfulness of the son of the mountain are effectively portrayed in the musical setting by the idiosyncratic phrasing and melodic shape of the youth’s

404 Defenders of “correct” practices in prosody for French song and opera such as Charles Beuchemin and Castil-Blaze would have disapproved already in the 1850s and 1860s the notational employment of a tie for the final unstressed syllable in a melodic phrase. The critic, Maurice Bourges, on the other hand, would have perhaps praised the rhythmic originality of this composition. See Noske, 51-61.
vocal line. Arpeggiated chords are common as well as long sustained notes. The latter increase the length of the antecedent in phrases but are not present during their resolution, thus making for much shorter consequents. Example 5.4 illustrates the lack of balance in the declamatory rate of certain vocal phrases:


This unbalance gives a clear sense of the youth’s impetuosity and exalted state of mind.

Equilibrium between the length of the antecedent and consequent is briefly established in strophe III (section c). Although the third strophe of Uhland’s poem reverberates from the beginning with the dangers of a gathering storm, Pauline’s musical setting initially disregards this imagery to create a pastoral setting illustrating the perfect identification between the youth and the beauty of nature. The passage is reproduced in Example 5.5:
This moment of pastoral bliss is the foundation upon which the composer builds the depiction of the storm in the virtuosic accompaniment and the vocal prowess of the boastful youth as he confronts it.\(^{405}\) Thus, the formal purpose of these measures is to give the initial dynamic gradation to the climatic conclusion of the composition.

Musical depictions of echoes, water-figures, lightning, and storms—among other natural phenomena—are expertly rendered in the accompaniment and demonstrate Pauline’s study not only of Schubert’s Lieder,\(^ {406}\) but also of German operatic scores such

---

\(^{405}\) In Uhland’s poem, the storm is also an allegorical reference to the invading armies which menace the homeland of the youth.

\(^{406}\) Musical depiction of exterior atmosphere or objective elements described in a poem (e.g. the movement of the sea, the rustling of leaves, the falling of tears or rain, or the slow moving of a caravan through the desert) was, of course, splendidly achieved in an important number of Schubert’s Lieder through an imaginative variety of piano figures. Schubert’s genius was his unprecedented ability to link through these figures a poem’s exterior imagery with the poetic persona’s emotions. The concreteness of the accompaniments in many of Schubert’s Lieder invited composers of French song in the late 1830s and 1840s to reject the disconnected and stereotyped accompaniments of romances.
as Weber’s *Der Freischütz*, a work which she enjoyed and knew well. The echo effects, which dominate strophe I (section a) and strophe III (section b) and their reprises (sections d and e), produce with great economy a sense of spatial immensity and also a direct understanding of the close identification between the youth and his beloved mountain. The first instance of the echo effect is reproduced in Example 5.6:


![Example 5.6. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, mm. 3-9.](image)

Echo effects in Romantic and Classical operas which Pauline sang were, of course, not uncommon. She might also have been familiar with Schubert’s employment of them in some of his songs; a similar example to the one quoted above can be found in an early setting of “Abschied” (poetry by Johann Baptist Mayrhofer), which Schubert composed in 1816. Here the mountain walls also project back the vocal line of the singer:

---


408 Explicit examples can be found in songs such as “Alinde,” D. 904 and “Das Echo,” D. 868.
The motion of the river dominates Strophe II (section b). Pauline’s arpeggiated water-figure—simpler than those employed by Schubert in works such as “Auf dem Wasser zu singen,” “Die Forelle,” or *Die schöne Müllerin*—is enlivened by chromatic slides in its inner voices, creating a colorful variety of chords, which blend with one another with almost imperceptible continuity through the use of common tones. Example 5.8 illustrates the harmonic metamorphosis of the water-figure:


This kind of gradual harmonic transformation was, of course, often employed with expressive power by contemporary composers such as Chopin and Liszt.
Chromatic motion, particularly in the bass line, plays an important motivic role throughout the composition. Motive y, an ascending segment in open octaves (5-5#-6-6#-7-1) makes its initial appearance in the first full measure of the song. Its function is to emphasize the move from dominant to tonic. In the first full statement of the song’s refrain (mm. 18-27) motive y reappears, now serving as a modulatory chromatic slide which takes us back to the tonic key area (see Example 5.1). In the second statement of the refrain (mm. 50-57), this ascending chromatic motive is extended through rhythmic diminution, so that it now covers a distance of two octaves. Example 5.9 reproduces this fragment of the work:


An inverted presentation of the first half of this extended motive (i.e. a descending chromatic scale) serves to depict the menace of the gathering storm in the closing measures of strophe III (section c). In the final part of the song, chromatic scales fully permeate the accompaniment, initially in their menacing descending form (mm. 123-134), as the youth confronts the power of the invading army, and then in their assertive and extended ascending form (mm. 135-139), as he exalts his countrymen to follow him.
in a final heroic statement of the refrain. Example 5.10 reproduces this section of the score:


It is not surprising that Pauline decided to open her first album of songs with this brawny and somewhat subversive composition, which she significantly dedicated to George Sand. Aesthetically and philosophically the work resonates with many of the artistic and social principles sustained by the writer, particularly with the idea that the children of the folk are closer to Nature and spiritual freedom, and would eventually lead
a fight against an oppressive social system (in this case metaphorically represented by the storm and the invading army). Sand probably viewed this song as a worthy child of Consuelo! Apart from these philosophical (and political) considerations, the imaginative musical structure of “L’Enfant de la montagne” makes it clear that Pauline had true ambitions as a composer and did not plan just to create pleasant and moralizing ditties for the daughters of the bourgeoisie.

Pauline might have taken the decision to set the lyrics for the third song of the collection, “L’Abricotier”/Chanson servienne, thinking that she was confronting a genuine example of Serbian poetry. Folk poetry of all countries—genuine and imitative—was an endless source of fascination for French Romantic composers and writers: One only has to think of Berlioz’s popular collection of 1829, Neuf Mélodies imitées de l’anglais, Op. 2, also known as Mélodies irlandaises, based on Thomas Moore’s emulations of Irish folk songs or Victor Massé’s Chants bretons (1853), based on texts penned by Auguste Brizeux. We have already seen how attracted Pauline was not only to the popular poetry and music of Spain but also to the folk songs of the region of Berri and to Uhland’s imitations of German ballads.

---

409 Prof. Susan Youens has brought to my attention the fact that for Uhland and other nationalistic poets, such as Goethe and Schiller, the Swiss cantons were models of democracy, particularly after the political disappointment provoked by the reinstatement of monarchies after the defeat of Napoleon in 1815. Schubert and other composers of his generation made use of lyrics in the Swiss style in some of their Lieder and employed a series of stock resources to illustrate them (i.e. echo effects, yodeling calls, imitations of alphorns). In this way, they also artfully convey their democratic sympathies. Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Enfant de la montagne” is a worthy representative of this type of Lieder. See Susan Youens, Schubert’s Late Lieder: Beyond the Song-Cycles (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 157-62.
In 1814 and 1815 two volumes of translated Serbian folk songs compiled by the
linguist Vuk Stefanovic Karadzic (1787-1864) were published in Vienna. This poetic
anthology, made of songs and recitations which Karadzic heard during his childhood and
collected in Serbia, Bosnia, and Croatia during his youth, included short narrative songs
supposedly sung by women (Frauenlieder) as well as longer heroic ballads, allegedly
invented by men. The anthology became extremely popular and was reprinted several
times in Germany during the 1820s and 1830s. It was even praised by Goethe in a
theoretical essay from 1825 entitled “Serbische Lieder.” In 1834, the two volumes were
translated to French by Élise Voïart, who prefaced the work with a colorful description of
the Frauenlieder:

[Les femmes servientes, douées pour la plupart d'un vif sentiment
poétique, les inventent à chaque circonstance nouvelle, et les chantent
dans leurs réunions aux fêtes, aux mariages et autres solennités
domestiques, il est tels de ces chants qui remontent à la plus haute
antiquité. Ce sont comme les fragments de compositions plus vastes,
mais dont le sujet principal s'est, depuis long-temps, effacé de la
mémoire des hommes . . .

Serbian women, endowed for the most part with vivid poetic
sentiment, invent them as new circumstances developed, and
sing them at their celebrations, marriages and other domestic
solemnities; there are fragments in these chants which
go back to remote antiquity. They are like segments of vaster
compositions whose principal subject has been after a long time
forgotten by the memory of men . . .

410 German and French contemporaries spelled his name: Wuk Stephanowitsch
Karadschitsch.
411 Wuk Stéphanowitsch, *Chants populaires des Serviens*, vol. I, trans. Élise Voïart
(Paris : IAM, 1834).
http://books.google.de/books?id=5YYAAAAAcAAJ&pg=PA27&dq=Chants+populaires+des+serviennes&hl=es#PPP1,M1 (accessed May 25, 2009).
It is not surprising that French writers—even some *paroliers*—were attracted to these novel chants and tempted to imitate their narrative compression, free form, and exotic charm. The poem that Pauline employed as basis for her song is not found in Stefanovic’s *Frauenlieder*; it is probably a French imitation of these chants, sharing several concepts and images with them, including the choice of youth over old age and the archetypical representation of a young mysterious woman as the guardian of natural resources. Its expertly crafted poetic surface (i.e. quatrains with much alliteration and a more or less clean versification scheme employing octosyllabic verses) and the gentrification of the three main characters (aristocrats are seldom present in the short *Frauenlieder*) are clear departures from Stefanovic’s models. Compare “L’Abricotier” to one of the translated versions of the Serbian chants in free form, “Soucis du cœur.”

---

412 I have included a number to the left of each verse of “L’Abricotier” to facilitate its identification within the formal and analytical graph given in the following pages. A repeated number followed by an apostrophe signifies that the line is repeated but contains one or two modified words.
“L’Abricotier”

1. Un ruisseau coule et murmure
2. Au pied d’un abricotier,
3. Angèle est sous la verdure,
4. Quand arrive un vieux chevalier ;
5. Salut noble damoiselle ;
6. Peut-on boire un peu de cette eau ?
7. Peut-on manger ce fruit nouveau ?
8. Peut-on embrasser Angèle ?
9. Non, Seigneur, l’eau ne se boit,
10. Ni l’abricot ne se touche,
11. Ni ma bouche ne reçoit

“Soucis du cœur”

1. Elle lave son beau visage la jeune fille,
2. Et elle dit en baignant ses joues gracieuses :
3. “Si je savais qu’un vieillard dût te baiser,
4. Là j’amasserais toutes les plantes d’absinthe,
5. Je les broirais, et j’en ferais une eau,
6. Afin que les baisers du vieillard soient amers.
7. Mais si je savais que ce fût un jeune homme !
8. J’irais dans le riant jardin,
9. J’en cueillerais toutes les roses,
10. Desquelles je préparerai une eau,
11. Dont je te baignerais chaque jour,
12. Afin que les baisers du jeune homme,

The graceful, old-fashioned employment of language in “L’Abricotier” brings these verses closer to the aristocratic world of Renaissance writers such as François Villon and Charles d’Orléans than to the sensual domain of many of the short Frauenlieder. In the last three strophes of the poem, the initial ones are cleverly modified to create a resolution to the narrative; these minimal alterations naturally suggested to the composer a strophic setting. Figure 5.5 presents the song’s formal outline:
Musical strophes A and A’ subdivide into three sections (a, b, c), each corresponding to one poetic strophe (i.e. I, II, III for musical strophe A, and IV, V, VI for musical strophe A’).

Section a establishes in musical terms the setting described by the narrator: The murmuring waters of the brook are constantly heard in the right hand of the accompaniment, The moto perpetuo created by the chromatic sixteenth-note figures is set against a tonic-dominant pedal played by the left hand. The effect created by these opposing musical energies is mesmerizing and not unlike the one achieved in the opening bars of Duparc’s famous “L’Invitation au voyage” (1870). The song’s opening bars are reproduced in Example 5.11:
The melodic neutrality of the poetic narrator (who initially alternates between only two pitches) and his slow delivery of the opening lines also contribute to create a sense of remote reverie. The arrival of the old knight at the end of this section marks the first modulation of the composition. There is also a sudden change of texture and musical character at the beginning of section b: Nature itself seems to stop its flow when confronted with the knight’s alien, self-centered force. The suspenseful pauses that occur after each of his greetings emphasize the tension. Example 5.12 reproduces this segment:
The boastful pedantry of the old knight is emphasized through the employment of homophonic textures and dotted-rhythmic figures. Yet there could be real danger in the suave but persistent questions of the chevalier, who hides his true intentions beneath vocal phrases embellished with appoggiaturas and turns. The *forte* exclamations in the accompaniment, which mark the end of each of his requests, forewarn of the sexual hazard which menaces Angèle. This segment is reproduced in Example 5.13:

Example 5.13. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “L’Abricotier,” PVG.s.l.3, mm.42-49

His charade is imperfect, though; throughout section b there is a conflict between the tonality associated with the old knight (F-sharp minor) and the tonality associated with nature and Angèle (A major). When his feigned gentleness yields no result, he loses
patience and attempts to become forceful. The composer signals this through a sudden crescendo and an ascent in both voice and accompaniment. Example 5.14 presents these phrases:


But the chevalier is old and ultimately not strong enough to impose his will; Angèle has no difficulty in denying his advances in section c of the song. No one is allowed to drink the water of the brook, eat the fruit of the apricot-tree, or kiss her mouth. The moving currents of the river (reappearing initially the parallel minor key) resonate behind the voice of the mysterious lady, who mockingly mimics the contours of the chevalier’s vocal line. Angèle takes the listener through a series of elusive tonicizations (achieved mostly through sequencing and chromatic motion) before landing firmly in the original key for one final and climactic rebuff to the old knight’s advances. Her voice is louder and higher than that of the old knight at his pushiest. The last part of her rebuff is reproduced in Example 5.15:

In musical strophe A’ the only difference is found in the salutations of the young chevalier (section b’). His vocal line skips upwards and covers intervals of a fourth or fifth instead of skipping downwards or moving upwards by step. Evidently, his voice has not been weighted down by the passage of the years. The beginning of his vocal line is reproduced in Example 5.16:


It is significant, however, that his requests are presented with the same musical material and words employed by the old knight. He too seeks to entice and seduce the young maiden, but his advances—when compared to his greetings—seem gentler than those of the old man. An intelligent singer should be able to portray this subtle difference by reining back the power and ardor of his/her voice. Full potency to impose his wishes is not required, however. Angèle responds positively to the second knight not because he is less boastful or less self-centered but plainly, because he is younger. Her words are
different, yet her elusive musical material remains the same throughout section c: The young man will drink the water, eat the fruit, and kiss her mouth, but he will never fully possess her ever-flowing essence.

“L’Abricotier” demonstrates the composer’s significant talent at creating musical characterizations and her economic use of motivic material to achieve maximum dramatic results. After spending a lifetime near the operatic stage, Viardot-Garcia created with ease this type of theatrical *romance*, which combined narrative and dramatic elements.\textsuperscript{413} Such songs were popular in Parisian salons at the time. The singer, composer, and writer Antoine Romagnesi described them as *romances passionnées et dramatiques*.\textsuperscript{414} Most of them, however, were of inferior quality, being less original and compelling than the example discussed above.

The path towards the stylistic consolidation of French *mélodie* was interconnected to the approach by composers of the era to condensed lyrical poetry full of intimate emotion. Although the period was rich with wonderful examples of personal poetry (e.g. most of the poems found in Alfred de Musset’s *Nuits*, Alfred de Vigny’s “Les Destinées,” and Alphonse de Lamartine’s “Novissima Verba”), many of these works tended to be either too long or too loose in their form\textsuperscript{415} to be easily set to music.

\textsuperscript{413} Other examples of narrative songs in the first collection are “L’Enfant et la Mère”/Dialogue (PVG.I.6) and “Le Chêne et le Roseau”/Fable (PVG.s.I.8).


\textsuperscript{415} Formal elements which characterized much of the poetry of Victor Hugo, Lamartine, and Alfred de Musset included the free strophe, mixing of meters throughout the poem, the enjambment of phrases, and the displacement of the alexandrine. Not until the works
Notwithstanding the shortage of succinct lyrical poetry, Romagnési identified a new type of expressive, personal song in the salons of the 1840s, a type of work which he identified as *mélodie rêveuse et grave*. Viardot-Garcia’s seventh song in her first collection, “L’Ombre et le jour” (PVG.s.I.7), falls under this category.

The song employs a poem by a minor Romantic poet, Édouard Turquety (1807-1867), who—being a follower of Lamartine—remained more or less loyal to versification techniques of the eighteenth century. His intimate poems were collected in *Esquisses poétiques* (1829). This anthology was admired and often employed by Viardot-Garcia during the 1840s.

Turquety’s short works are transparent in their formal outlines and can thus be easily set to music. “L’Ombre et le jour” and its English translation are presented below:

---

of Charles Baudelaire, Théophile Gautier, and the Parnassians appeared, was a balance achieved between formal cohesiveness and lyrical expression.

416 Romagnesi, 9.

417 Three of the songs in Viardot-Garcia’s second collection, *Dix melodies par Pauline Viardot* (Paris : Brandus, 1849), employ Turquety’s lyrics: “Solitude” (PVG.s.II.1), “Un jour de printemps”/Caprice (PVG.s.II.4), and “Villanelle” (PVG.s.II.5).
Turquety’s poetic descriptions are particularly rich with what Frits Noske identifies as “interior atmosphere,” in other words, the subjective emotions of the poetic persona. These are in turn projected onto the “exterior atmosphere” or the supposed objective reality of the poem, on occasion even modifying its physical qualities.

It is no longer a question of personal identification with the natural world and its temporality as was the case with the youth and the mountain in Uhland’s “Des Knaben Berglied” or with Angèle and nature in “L’Abricotier.” In Turquety’s poem there is a mannerist distortion of nature to better suit the emotional state of the poet. In “L’Ombre et le jour” the contrasts of the dawn are over-emphasized and almost immediately frozen in time into a sustained image, a metaphor for the two opposing emotional states presented by the poetic persona. Already, this short and apparently insubstantial text anticipates in subtle ways the intensely subjective and mystical poetic revolution initiated by Baudelaire’s *Les Fleurs du mal* (1857) and continued in the works

---

418 Noske, 74.
of Symbolist poets such as Paul Verlaine (1844-1896) and Stéphane Mallarmé (1842-1898).

According to Noske, French composers of mélodie during the second half of the nineteenth century were more interested in evoking through their accompaniments the rich “inner atmosphere” of a poem than its most concrete exterior imagery. This is understandable considering the complex mixed emotions and sensations present in the more sophisticated poems of Baudelaire and his followers, works which demanded strong interpretative abilities from the composer. Frits Noske elaborates on the difficulties which these composers confronted when making decisions about the musical rendering of these emotionally complex texts:

Le musicien dispose de textes . . . qui exigent beaucoup de son génie. La manière dont il accomplit cette tâche, touche au secret le plus profond de l’art et échappe à tout analyse scientifique. Cependant, l’importance de sa contribution ne laisse pas de doute: la musique seule possède la faculté de rendre l’inexprimable et de réaliser l’atmosphère intérieure.  

The musician had at his disposal texts . . . which demanded a lot from his genius. The way in which he accomplished this task touches the deepest secret of art and escapes scientific analysis. The importance of his contribution, however, does not leave a doubt: music alone possesses the faculty of rendering that which is inexpressible and of realizing the [poem’s] inner atmosphere.

Upon first examination, Viardot-Garcia’s rendition of the inner atmosphere of Turquety’s “L’Ombre et le jour” might seem simplistic. Its music appears unsophisticated and repetitive when compared to other songs of the collection. The vocal range is reduced and its melodic phrases—doubled and often imitated by the accompaniment—reappear cyclically. The song is presented in bar form (aab); each of its three musical sections

419 Noske, 77.
corresponds to one poetic strophe, with the last section representing the subdued climax and resolution of the work. A formal and harmonic overview of the work is presented in Figure 5.6:

![Strophe Analysis](image)

Figure 5.6. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7.

A closer harmonic study of the brief composition, however, reveals an ingenious and subtle symbolic employment of adjacent but divergent tonal areas (B-flat major and C minor), which represent contrasting psychological states and their physical manifestations. Figure 5.6 shows how opposing imagery in the poem is assigned to these contiguous keys:

---

420 From the Classical era, these keys had had traditional symbolic and coloristic associations, which Viardot-Garcia probably recognized. C minor was considered to be a somber and tragic key. B-flat major, on the other hand, was considered to be a bright and positive tonality.
It is significant that throughout the song many of these words and short phrases are sung (at least partly) on their representative pitch. A detailed exemplification of Pauline’s peculiar employment of these two contrasting pitches/tonalities to illustrate the inner atmosphere of the poem follows.

The symbolic employment of pitch and tonality in the song creates static but colorful chordal progressions in the first two musical stanzas (i.e. sections a and a’). For example, the opening statement in the piano—a succession of chords in second inversion which ultimately delineate in parallel motion descending arpeggios of an incomplete B-flat major chord adjacent to a C minor chord—leaves the listener ambivalent about the tonal direction of the composition. Example 5.17 illustrates the piano’s opening statement with an outline of the chords it projects below:
In fact, tonic and supertonic chords and tonal areas appear next to each other throughout the composition at the foreground, middleground, and background levels, thus emphasizing the static union of opposite emotional forces. This simple introductory phrase also contains motive x, which in its very few variants, organizes most of the accompaniment and vocal line. Like the first songs of Fauré, written twenty-five years later, Viardot-Garcia’s “L’Ombre et le jour” is dominated by a recurrent rhythmic pattern.

The fragmented and repetitive delivery of the text in the song’s first two sections perpetuates the sensation of musical stasis. The two initial lines of Turquety’s poem are the only ones that suggest temporal motion or change; Pauline, however, undermines any sensation of transformation or progress by employing a chordal progression which basically extends the tonic chord. Harmonic stasis joins a rocking circular rhythm in both voice and accompaniment (long, short, long, short) to accentuate the feeling of musical inertia. Example 5.18 reproduces this section of the score:
This repetitive *berceuse* rhythm is associated with the positive feelings generated not only by the dawn, but by the beloved. From a psychoanalytic perspective, the poetic persona must experience near her the same sensation of comfort, security, and perpetuity that a child experiences in the arms of his mother. When the poetic persona describes his own negative emotions (mm. 23-25), on the other hand, the harmonic changes occur at a faster rate and the berceuse rhythm disappears. This sudden tonicization matches his melancholic, shifting perspective beautifully. See Example 5.19:

To emphasize the emotional apex of the poem, a restrained acceleration in harmonic rhythm, tempo, and delivery of text takes place at the beginning of the third musical stanza (mm. 26-34). Section b is reproduced in Example 5.20:


In two impassioned sequential phrases—which ascend through C minor and D major without being disrupted by the accompaniment—the voice reaches its highest pitch and
dynamic level (m. 32). This occurs as the poetic persona recognizes in the contrasting elements of dawn the image of his union with the beloved. In this highly sensual and intimate musical moment, the protagonist’s symbolic key of C minor rises to meet in a higher plane (D minor) the symbolic key of the beloved (B-flat major):

Like the sexual act, true merging of divergent tonalities (and characters) is possible only briefly, so that two descending sequential phrases—separated once again by the piano’s imitative one-bar interpolation—bring us back to the original register, dynamic range, and comforting harmonic stasis of the song’s opening. The poetic persona and his beloved are differentiated in these final phrases, which exist next to each other, without the ability to fully merge.

As a result of its discreet emotional range, economic employment of motivic material, symbolic interplay of tonal areas, tight integration of text to music, and sensual pleasure in sheer sonority, L’Ombre et le jour” can be appraised as an example of early French mélodie. Its qualities bring to mind songs from Fauré’s First and Second Collections such as “Ici-bas!” and “Le Secret.” In these three songs the poem’s inner atmosphere is portrayed with both musical intimacy and elegance by the composers.

Overall Viardot-Garcia’s first album not only demonstrates a full-fledged understanding of the complexities of German Lieder, but also a sensitivity towards the diverse types of romances of the 1830s and 1840s. In the collection, ballads inspired by German poetry and Schubert’s Lieder take their place side by side with dramatic scenes, heroic chants, atmospheric romances, and extended narrative songs, giving us a distinct impression of the composer’s musical imagination and ability to adapt to a variety of
styles. In this respect, the album anticipates many of the compositional inclinations that one discovers in her next collections of songs. Among these one should mention a) an interest in popular song from across Europe, b) the translation of songs originally composed in a foreign language to French, c) an attraction to French and German Romantic poetry, but also to popular poetry and works from the Renaissance and Baroque, d) a sophisticated and coloristic employment of harmonic progressions within distinct sectional forms, e) a general tunefulness of the vocal line resulting from the composer’s close contact to Italian opera, f) a particular facility in the setting of dramatic and narrative scenes, g) an intimate union between voice and accompaniment, and h) a latent desire to raise the salon romance to new levels of artistic integrity.

In the early 1840s, Viardot-Garcia began to experience difficulties reconciling her compositional ambitions with her operatic career, a fact which she could hide without difficulties in the first collection of songs. In the next chapter, we shall see how her international career from 1843 onwards demanded most of her time and artistic attention, limiting the hours that she could spend composing. It is not surprising, then, that almost six years separated her first album of compositions from her next collection of songs, *Dix mélodies par Pauline Viardot* (Paris: Brandus, 1849).

The singer’s operatic engagements in Germany, England, and Russia, however, established her artistic reputation and brought her in contact with creative artists, writers, and intellectuals of her own generation from across Europe, particularly with the writer Ivan Turgenev, and later on—upon her operatic return to France after the 1848 Revolution—with Charles Gounod. In the next chapter, we shall explore how these experiences influenced the genesis of her second collection of songs.
CHAPTER 6

CAN A COMPOSER HAVE AN INTERNATIONAL OPERATIC CAREER?:
NEW FRIENDSHIPS, CHALLENGES, AND SACRIFICES

After the disastrous winter season of 1842-1843 at the Théâtre Italien, Viardot-Garcia, encouraged by George Sand’s advice, decided to seek her artistic fortune outside of Paris. As a result, the singer and her husband spent the summer of 1843 in Vienna, Prague, and Berlin. Her winning performances in these cities did much to restore her shaken confidence and gave her the opportunity of reestablishing friendships with Giacomo Meyerbeer, Fanny Hensel, and Felix Mendelssohn. Audiences were enthralled to meet the model who had inspired Sand’s Consuelo. Wherever she sang, her success seemed magically assured. Viardot-Garcia wrote the following encouraging report to George Sand from Austria in May of that year:

Vous savez probablement que mon succès a été colossal. Je puis le dire hardiment puisque tout le monde le dit, que les journaux le répètent, et que du reste le public le prouve suffisamment par son affluence et ses hurlements de joie. Vous pouvez bien vous imaginer comme je suis heureuse de chanter devant un pareil public. . . .

You probably know that my success here has been colossal. I can say it with frankness because everyone says it, the newspapers repeat it, and above all, the public proves it sufficiently by their numbers and by their screams of joy. You can imagine how happy I am to sing before such a public. . . .

---

421 It was during this visit to Berlin, that an enthusiastic Meyerbeer first offered the role of Fidès to Pauline, whom he affectionately called his “little Consuelo.” Meyerbeer would not be able to premier Le Prophète in Paris until April 1849.

The tour marked the beginning of the most eventful decade of her career as singer. In late August, the Viardots returned briefly to Paris and then visited Nohant for two weeks. After this respite, they went back to Berlin and then on to Leipzig, where Pauline had a chance of meeting Clara and Robert Schumann. At the Gewandhaus in mid-September, Pauline, Clara, Felix Mendelssohn, and his young protégé, twelve-year-old Joseph Joachim, gave a concert which must have been a memorable affair. Apart from singing some of her staple repertoire (e.g. extracts from *La cenerentola* and Handel’s “Lascia ch’io pianga”), the singer accompanied herself in a group of French, German and Spanish songs. Among these—very probably—were some of the compositions included in her first album of songs.

Overall, the summer engagements of 1843 must have made it clear that she could count on the support of the most prominent German composers, directors, and performers. During these months, Viardot-Garcia also solidified friendships in high aristocratic circles, particularly with members of the Prussian royal family. Taking these two factors into account, the Viardots’ next move was somewhat baffling: Quite suddenly, the administrators of the Imperial Opera of Saint Petersburg—through the recommendation of the tenor Giovanni Battista Rubini (1794-1854), a colleague from Viardot-Garcia’s inaugural London season—offered her a contract to be their *prima donna assoluta* for the 1843-1844 winter season. The terms of the agreement were

---


424 For the next two decades, Pauline would cultivate her friendship with the Royal family, particularly with Prince Wilhelm (1797-1888)—who would eventually succeed his brother, becoming King of Prussia in 1861 and then Kaiser in 1871—and his wife, Princess Augusta of Saxe-Weimar (1811-1890). During Pauline’s years of residence at Baden-Baden (1863-1870), she often received the King and Queen of Prussia at her home.
extremely generous. In addition, Viardot-Garcia was given the opportunity to perform next to esteemed friends and colleagues, Rubini and the talented baritone Antonio Tamburini (1800-1876). She signed the contract without hesitation.

In late October, the Viardots—after a brief stop in Warsaw to visit Chopin’s parents—reached the Imperial capital. On November 3, the singer premiered in the role of Rosina. This success was followed by representations of Rossini’s Otello and Bellini’s La sonnambula. By the end of the month, the Russian public—who had not had the chance of hearing Italian opera for more than a decade—had fallen under the spell of Viardot-Garcia’s personality, packing every seat of the Imperial Opera House. Almost overnight, she had become one of the most discussed and admired figures of the city. In a letter to George Sand, the singer described the mesmerizing effect that she had on her Russian admirers:

Pauline was to receive 50,000 rubles plus half of the profits of a benefit performance in which she would sing. After her first season in St. Petersburg, the singer accumulated enough wealth to purchase the castle of Courtavenel. See Michèle Friang, Pauline Viardot au miroir de sa correspondance, (Paris: Hermann, 2008), 58.

During a musical soirée held in the house of Chopin’s parents, Pauline performed a Spanish song. Kendall-Davies believes this might have been “L’Absence”/Caña Española, PVG.s.II.3, but this is incorrect, since, according to a letter that Chopin wrote to his family on July 18, 1845, this work was composed in Vienna in 1844. “L’Absence” was published in 1849 as part of Pauline’s second collection of songs. During the 1840s, Pauline often performed transcriptions of traditional Spanish songs, which some thought to be her own compositions. Some of these arrangements were so popular that they were published in 1853 in a brief collection of four songs entitled Ispanskiye romansy, aranzhirovannyye Polinoyu Viardo (St. Petersburg and Paris(?): Brandus, 1853). See Waddington and Žekulin, 7.
[M]on succès ici est aussi grand que vous puissiez le rêver pour votre Consuelo . . . il augmente à chaque représentation, et . . . je me sens faire des progrès tous les soirs . . . lundi dernier dans le Barbier, les applaudissements ont été tellement frénétiques et prolongés, que je n’ai pu commencer qu’après quelques minutes—J’étais véritablement émue de cet accueil si affectueux—Je les ai remerciés au 2d acte par une petite surprise qui a manqué faire crouler la salle—Je leur ai chanté un air populaire russe ! (en russe, bien entendu). Je n’ai jamais entendu pareil tapage—L’empereur a applaudi comme un enragé.427

My success here is as grand as you could have ever dreamt for your Consuelo, . . . it increases with each performance, and . . . I feel that I make progress every evening. . . . Last Monday in the Barber, the clapping was so frantic and prolonged, that I could not begin to sing until a few minutes had passed—I was truly moved by their affectionate reception—I thanked them during the second act with a little surprise that almost made the hall collapse—I sang for them a popular Russian air! (in Russian, of course). I never have heard such a racket—The emperor clapped like a madman.

She had chosen to sing a well-known air from *Ruslan and Ludmila* by Mikhail Glinka whom she had recently met and befriended.428

Viardot-Garcia’s triumph was the result not only of her talent and exotic allure, but also of the relative inexperience of the Russian public with Italian opera and her uncanny ability to mimic traits of the predominant social group. She knew that singing to the Russians in their native tongue with a near perfect accent was a speedy way of gaining their favor; the previous Summer, she had used this skill at a benefit performance during her Austrian tour: On that occasion, she sang a popular tune in Viennese patois to

---

427 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, St. Petersburg, November 18 to 30, 1843, in Marix-Spire, ed., *Lettres Inédites*, 192-3.

428 This was the beginning of a Pauline’s lifelong commitment to the promotion of Russian music, many of the works of Glinka, Lvov, Tchaikovsky, Balakirev, and Anton Rubinstein received their first audition outside of Russia either in Pauline’s concerts or during one of her musical soirées. The case of her relationship to Tchaikovsky is particularly interesting. See “Pauline Viardot-Garcia,” Tchaikovsky Research Net, http://www.tchaikovsky-research.net/en/people/viardot-garcia_pauline.html (accessed August 2, 2009).
a surprised group of spectators who “recalled her ten times, and bombarded her with flowers.”

Viardot-Garcia could adapt her gift for mimicry to the expressive requirements of any social group. During her first Russian winter, for example, Pauline was invited to the palace of a nobleman, where she heard a group of gypsies. When they finished their medley of songs and dances, she performed for them. Louis Viardot related their surprised reactions in an article, which was later published in France:

Les bohémiens demandèrent, pour dernière récompense, que Mme. Pauline Viardot, qui se montrait le plus attentif de leurs auditeurs, se mît au piano pour chanter à son tour. . . . Cette espèce de musique et cette espèce de chant, qu’ils entendaient pour la première fois, jeta les bohémiens dans une surprise extrême. . . . ils n’interrompaient leur silence recueilli que par exclamations dont un interprète nous traduisait le sens: “Ce n’est pas un être humain qui chante, disait l’un, c’est autre chose. » « Encore, ajoutait un gros vieillard, si elle avait de l’embonpoint ! Mais d’où sort cette voix ? » Lorsque, après quelques fragments italiens et quelques romances françaises, Mme Viardot chanta des airs espagnols, les bohémien se retrouvèrent comme dans leur pays. Ils les comprirent parfaitement et s’en firent répéter deux ou trois, voulant, disaient-ils, ne plus les oublier et les arranger à leur usage.

429 Kendall-Davies, 165.

430 Louis Viardot, “De quelques instituts de musique en Russie,” Revue et gazette musicale de Paris 11, no. 37 (September 15, 1844), 312.
The gypsies asked, as a final reward, for Mme. Pauline Viardot, who had been the most attentive member of the audience, to sit at the piano and sing for them. . . They were extremely surprised by this type of music and singing [opera], which they were hearing for the first time. . . . Their astonished silence was interrupted only by sudden exclamations, which were translated for us by an interpreter: “It is not a human being that sings,” said one, it’s something else.” “Perhaps,” added a fat old man, “if she had some plumpness! But where does that voice come from?”

After some Italian fragments and French romances, Mme Viardot sang Spanish airs; the gypsies found themselves at ease, as if in their own country. They understood these perfectly, and were proud to repeat two or three of them, wanting, they said, not to forget them and to arrange them for their own use.

This incident seems like a case of life imitating art—with a few changes, the scene could have probably been incorporated into George Sand’s Consuelo. Not surprisingly, Russians from all classes were soon ready to adopt Pauline as one of their own. 431 She quickly made friends among the intelligentsia and the aristocracy: Chopin’s talented musical friends, the Wielhorsky brothers, Counts Mikhail and Matvei, became admirers and promoters; the gifted violinist, military general, and musical director of the Imperial Chapel, Alexei Lvov, followed each of her performances, and a handsome and somewhat eccentric nobleman by the name of Ivan Turgenev fell hopelessly and irrevocably in love with her.

At the time of their first meeting on November 13, 1843, Turgenev—the second child of an aristocratic family with immense land holdings in the province of Orel, about three hundred kilometers south of Moscow—had yet to make a name for himself as a

431 “The profound way in which Pauline had moved the Russians was truly extraordinary and few others, however famous or talented, have been greeted with quite such hysterical enthusiasm and called ‘our own’.” Kendall-Davies, 185.
When he was still a teenager, he had studied history and philosophy in Berlin, and had become fascinated by German culture and music. Shortly before hearing Pauline for the first time at the Imperial Opera, he had pleased his domineering mother—a deranged and sadistic woman named Varvara Petrovna, who regularly whipped her serfs and emotionally abused anyone who showed the least sign of weakness—by commencing a career as a civil servant in the Ministry of the Interior. He was, however, unfit for the post and starved for intellectual and creative experiences. His meeting with Viardot-Garcia was not casual coincidence: After weeks of spying on her at operatic presentations and social functions and declaring his infatuation to anyone who cared to listen, he managed to become the singer’s Russian tutor. Pauline must have been amused by this charming and assiduous admirer, who quickly took her through the basic elements of his language and introduced her to the poems of Alexander Pushkin and Mikhail Lermontov. She probably would have been surprised—even a bit alarmed—to learn that this young eccentric would soon be prepared to renounce family and fortune in order to follow her across Europe.

When they first met, Turgenev had little musical sophistication, being unable to sing or “play even the simplest of melodies on a piano.” Although he enjoyed the works of Beethoven, Schubert, and Mozart and had a desire to see the birth of a Classical tradition in his own country, his musical judgment was still largely undeveloped.

---

432 In 1843, only one of his stories had been published, Parasha. The literary critic, Vissarion Belinsky, however, found compelling elements in his style and predicted for him a promising future as poet. Turgenev’s literary future took almost a decade to materialize: The first mature works, the play A Month in the Country and the novel Rudin, date from the mid-1850s.

Viardot-Garcia, by then familiar with various musical traditions of Europe, probably did not need Turgenev’s aid to recognize the artistic quality of the songs of Glinka or Count Mikhail Wielhorsky, but the budding writer did introduce the singer to Romantic Russian poetry. In the next years, she reciprocated this kindness by forming the musical taste of her new friend. Henri Granjard correctly recognizes the extent of Pauline’s musical influence on Turgenev:

*Il faisait siennes toutes les préférences musicales de [Pauline] et les défendait avec plus d’intransigeance qu’elle contre les « musiciens de l’avenir » et même contre la musique moderne russe, celle de Moussorgski et de Borodine.*

He made all or Pauline’s musical preferences his own and defended them, with much more intransigence than she would have, against the “musicians of the future” and even against modern Russian music, particularly that of Mussorgsky and Borodin.

Turgenev’s initial contact with Pauline’s compositional method prepared him for the significant task of creating lyrics and translations for the albums of Russian songs which she published in St. Petersburg during the 1860s.

His interest in Viardot-Garcia’s compositions came early on in the relationship:

According to Barbara Kendall-Davies, in May 1844, a collected album with songs by Lvov, Glinka, Matvei Wielhorsky, and Viardot-Garcia was published in St. Petersburg.

---


The volume encompassed several of the compositions which the singer had published in her first album of songs, including “La Chapelle” (PVG.s.I.2), “L’Ombre et le jour” (PVG.s.I.7), and “Adieux les beaux jours” (PVG.s.I.4). In an article for the press, Turgenev praised the songs and commented that “Adieux les beaux jours” made him weep since it had “a sad passion, sweet and somber, with true expression.” Since Turgenev could not read music, he must have heard Viardot-Garcia performing these compositions at some point during the winter of 1843-1844. The strong impression that her works provoked in him remained unaltered throughout his life. In the upcoming decades, he would praise repeatedly her compositional gifts, both in private letters to his friends and in public articles written for the Russian press.

Viardot-Garcia’s triumphs during her initial season in the Russian capital have been described in detail by various biographers. For the purpose of this chapter, suffice it to say that numerous concerts, operatic presentations, social functions and rehearsals took most of her time to the extent that she barely had the opportunity to write to close friends and family members, let alone compose any music. Her success was such that she was reengaged together with Tamburini and Rubini for the next winter season. Before leaving the Russian capital in March 1844, she had the chance of using her popularity to

---

436 I have been unable to locate this album and Waddington and Žekulin do not mention it in their on-line catalogue. The reference to the joint collection, its contents, date of publication, and Turgenev’s reception comes from Kendall-Davies, 196-7.

437 In the late 1860s, Turgenev’s praises in the press of Viardot-Garcia’s initial Russian song collections, were received suspiciously by members of the “Mighty Handful,” particularly César Cui, who criticized the songs harshly. See “Pauline Viardot-Garcia,” Tchaikovsky Research Net, http://www.tchaikovsky-research.net/en/people/viardot-garcia_pauline.html (accessed August 2, 2009).
promote the touring Schumanns. To the press of St. Petersburg, she open-heartedly affirmed “Clara’s singing on the piano is better than mine.”

During a short visit to Vienna on her way back to Paris, Viardot-Garcia learned from her husband that he had arranged—with the funds she had earned during the previous year—for the purchase of the castle of Courtavenel. In July, she inspected the property for the first time and soon realized the extent of work required to make the mansion habitable. Instead of resting, composing, and rekindling her little daughter’s affection after long months of separation, she found herself in the midst of a reconstruction project that summer with workers banging and scraping their way through the dilapidated castle. Despite the inconveniences, Viardot-Garcia must have felt proud of her new home. Throughout the years she made several drawings of its majestic facade. Figure 6.1 reproduces one of them:

---

438 Quoted in Kendall-Davies, 185. Although Clara Schumann made a strong impression among the Russian connoisseurs, she did not achieve the massive popularity of Viardot-Garcia.
George Sand—anxious to see Viardot-Garcia and concerned for her friend’s health after her extensive travels—tried to convince the singer to escape to Nohant for a few weeks:

[V]ous trouverez un vrai repos sans les travers des arrangements domestiques et les soucis naissans de la propriété. Car vous n’aurez pas de plaisir à Courtavenelle, je vous le prédis, tant que vous n’y serez pas installée depuis longtemps.439

You will find here real repose without the domestic labors and concerns that go hand in hand with property. I predict that you will derive no pleasure from Courtavenel until you have been installed there for a long time.

But the singer, overwhelmed and hesitant, could not give a concrete date of arrival to Sand and in the end missed her chance to visit Nohant that summer. She was simply too

busy: Apart from having to pick the furniture and color scheme for the decoration of each of the castle’s rooms, she had to receive visitors from around the region, take care of the many needs of the members of the extended family who had moved into the castle, and keep up with her toddler daughter, prepare difficult roles for the upcoming season (among them, Norma), and give voice lessons to her younger cousin, Antonia, who had been engaged by the Imperial Opera to perform Adalgisa and other secondary roles.

From an explanatory letter that Louis addressed to an irked and impatient George Sand in mid-August, it becomes evident that although Pauline’s compositional activities had come to an almost complete halt, she was in the process of compiling a second collection of songs with works which she had already completed or were close to completion:

*Que se soit par affection pour sa cousine, ou pour servir ses pauvres parents, toujours est-il que Pauline donne à Antonia deux et trois leçons par jour, sans la faire avancer beaucoup, et qu’elle néglige tout le reste, au point qu’elle n’a pu seulement transcrire six ou huit morceaux qui doivent composer un second album. Pensez qu’on a engagé Antonia sur la parole de Pauline et qu’elle va se trouver responsable du succès de sa cousine, ou du moins des services qu’elle doit rendre à la direction théâtrale.*

Whether out of affection for her cousin, or to be of service to her poor parents, Pauline gives Antonia two or three lessons every day, without helping her to advance very much, and neglecting everything else, to the point that she has only been able to transcribe six or eight pieces, which are meant to comprise a second album of songs. Think that [the Imperial Opera] has engaged Antonia on Pauline’s recommendation and that she will be responsible for the success of her cousin, or, at least, for the services that she is to provide to the directors of the theatre. It is very probable that there was at least a spoken agreement with the publisher Troupenas for a second collection of songs. Otherwise, why would there have been a

---

440 That summer Viardot-Garcia’s mother, her two sisters-in-law, and her uncle Paolo Sitchès with his wife, Mariquita, and his daughter, Antonia, were in Courtavenel.

441 Louis Viardot to George Sand, Courtavenel, August 14, 1844, in Ibid., 207.
pressing need to prepare fair copies of songs, presumably for publication purposes, in the midst of her busy summer? In preparing these fair copies, which are now lost, she must have soon realized that she did not have enough material to present a collection *au pair* with her first song album and that she would have to compose several new songs before releasing it. Amidst all her engagements and obligations, this would not be an easy task: The second collection of Pauline’s songs, *L’Album Viardot de 1850*, did not appear that year, or even the next, but five years later, in December 1849.

Fragments, drafts, and autographs for five out of the ten songs published in 1849 have either not been located or do not exist. Is it possible, then, to deduce which songs for the second album were copied down by Pauline during the summer of 1844? I believe that, to a certain extent, one can make an educated conjecture. Some of the fair copies which were prepared at the time probably had their origins in the black notebook which Pauline had acquired in 1839 (Ms.Mus.232, Item 60). Drafts for three of the ten songs which comprise *L’Album Viardot de 1850* can be found in it: “Marie et Julie” (PVG.s.II.8), “La Chanson de Loïc” (PVG.s.II.7), and “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6). Pauline found the lyrics for these three songs in *Les Cantilènes*, the first collection of poems by

---

442 We can infer that these transcriptions were meant for Troupenas’ publishing house from the fact that in 1842 she had prepared for him fair copies of all the songs included in the *Album de Mme. Viardot-Garcia* (1843). For details see appendix F.

443 Drafts for “La Chanson de Loïc” (PVG.s.II.7), “Marie et Julie” (PVG.s.II.8) and “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6) can be found in Ms.Mus.232, Item 60, Houghton Library, Harvard University. An autograph manuscript of “La Luciole” (PVG.s.II.9) is in a private collection in Paris and a fragment of “Un jour de printemps” (PVG.s.II.4) was auctioned in NY in 1995. A piano version of the closing “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10) also exists. For full details see appendix F. To my knowledge “Solitude” (PVG.s.II.1), “La Petite chevrière” (PVG.s.II.2), “L’Absence”/* Caña Española* (PVG.s.II.3), and “Villanelle” (PVG.s.II.5) exist only in their published version.

Gustave de Larenaudière, a follower of Victor Hugo and Alphonse de Lamartine, but also a cultivated admirer and translator of the Greco-Roman Classics. De Larenaudière’s anthology was published in 1842. Viardot-Garcia must have enjoyed the mixture of candid charm, intellectual seriousness, and intimate feeling found in his lyrical poetry. She must have also realized that the conciseness and regularity of form in many of them were well-suited for musical adaptation.

The poem “Marie et Julie” was written down by Viardot-Garcia in an undated page of the black notebook. In the next page, one finds a musical draft which registers the composer’s initial reaction to the poetry. The sketch is only twenty-one measures long, yet it captures the expressive essence of the final version of the song. It is reproduced in Figure 6.2:

---


446 Gustave de Larenaudière, Les Cantilènes (Paris: Dauvin et Fontaine, 1842).
Figure 6.2. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “Marie et Julie,” draft circa 1842-1844, Ms.Mus. 232, Item 60 [15.], courtesy of Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.

An approximate transcription of this fragment is presented in Example 6.1. The transcription does not seek to make any kind of musical adjustments or corrections; it merely serves, as far as possible, as visual aid for the study of the composer’s original draft:
Judging from the strange mixture of rhythmic values, it seems that the composer decided to shift from a 3/4 to a 3/8 meter in the middle of the draft. Perhaps she started by jotting down the vocal line in 3/4, even 6/4, but then proceeded to notate the third system in 3/8. This adjustment might have been the result of attempting to fit the rhythmic value of the accompaniment’s figures to those of the preexisting vocal line. The composer did not bother to correct previous measures in a consistent fashion, probably because the sketch
was jotted down quickly. Viardot-Garcia does not indicate, for example, that the sixteenth-note figures in the accompaniment are triplets.

A comparison between the draft and the corresponding measures in the finished version shows how Viardot-Garcia developed embryonic motivic ideas into a full-fledged composition. The final version of “Marie et Julie” clarifies many of the incongruent details in the draft, which appears to have served both as memory aid for improvisations initially realized at the piano and as sketch to outline the metric, rhythmic, and harmonic structures of the song.
In the black notebook, a skeletal fragment outlining the melody of “La Chanson de Loïc,” also based on poetry of de Larenaudières, can be found immediately after the
initial draft of “Marie et Julie;” this might suggest that both songs were begun at about the same time. Entries begun from the other end of the notebook include an elaborate draft for one of the longest songs in the second collection, “En Mer.” One can presume that these sketches and drafts were begun after Viardot-Garcia read Les Cantilènes in 1842 or early 1843 and completed before the summer of 1843, in other words, before the singer began her busy singing tours in Austria, Germany, and Russia, or during the summer of 1844, at the time of Viardot-Garcia’s first visit to Courtavenel.

As has been stated, the autographs which Viardot-Garcia made during July and August 1844, have either not survived or not been located. Thus it is impossible to ascertain how complete “Marie et Julie,” “La Chanson de Loïc,” and “En Mer” were before she departed for her second Russian season. In the letter of Louis Viardot to George Sand (August 14, 1844), the singer’s husband explained that she had transcribed six or eight pieces. He might have exaggerated the number a little in order to make Viardot-Garcia’s case before Sand stronger. On the other hand, Louis might simply have been reporting the bare facts, and several other songs of the second album might have been completed or close to completion in August 1844. At the time, Viardot-Garcia was certainly drafting compositions outside of the black notebook. Three particular songs from the second album fit this profile, “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10), “Un jour de printemps”/Caprice (PVG.s.II.4), and “L’Absence”/Caña Española (PVG.s.II.3). What little is known of the genesis of these three works will be discussed in the next pages.

“Tarentelle” began its life as a piano composition. A fragmentary autograph of it, dated November 19, 1839 and signed “Pauline Garcia,” can be found in

---

447 The sketch and final version of the song will be discussed in more detail in Chapter 7. For full details on the sketch see appendix F.
Juliette Zimmerman’s musical album. At some point during the 1840s (perhaps even during the summer of 1844) Pauline arranged it for voice and piano using anonymous lyrics. A detailed musical study of “Tarentelle” will be presented in the chapter 7; therefore, I limit my comments here merely to its origins.

In March 4, 1843, in a musical supplement of *L’Illustration*, Pauline published “Une fleur” (PVG.s.0.4.f), a setting of a poem by Édouard Turquety. The poem was later republished in the second album as “Un jour de printemps”/* Caprice* (PVG.s.II.4). Since “Une fleur” was published independently, I will take the opportunity to comment on it briefly:

To set Turquety’s descriptive—yet thoroughly conventional—invocation of a spring day, Pauline employed a 3/4 meter and a fast tempo, *Allegretto*. The initial motivic material, composed of two contrasting ideas (i.e. repeated block chords in the low register set against playful quintuplet figures in the high register), permeates the accompaniment of the entire song. Example 6.3 reproduces the opening bars of this composition:

---

448 The eldest daughter of famed piano pedagogue Pierre-Joseph-Guillaume Zimmerman assembled this album of autographs from 1839 to 1840. It contains the drawings and musical autographs of several singers, composers, writers, and painters who passed through Zimmerman’s famed artistic salon. The album includes musical fragments by Lablanche, Berlioz, and Moscheles. The album reappeared in Caen at the end of the 1990s. For a detailed study of the context in which Juliette Zimmerman’s album was created and a detailed inventory of its contents see Constance Himelfarb, “Un salon de la Nouvelle-Athènes en 1839-1840: L’album musical inconnu de Juliette Zimmerman,” *Revue de Musicologie* 87, no. (2001), 33-65.
The opening illustrates Pauline’s familiarity with the Mazurkas of Chopin. Compare, for example, the accompaniment’s short melodic motives and tonic drone to those in Chopin’s Mazurka in G major, Op. 67, No. 1 (published posthumously, but composed in 1837). Example 6.4 reproduces the opening bars of that score:
The resemblance between these two compositions in the same tonality is probably not superficial. It must be remembered that during the 1840s, Viardot-Garcia arranged for voice and piano several of Chopin’s Mazurkas. Her arrangement for two voices and piano of the work quoted above was published in 1865.

449 It appears that initially most of the arrangements had words in Spanish. See Waddington and Žekulin, 17.

450 “La Beaute”/“Di pięknej!” was the sixth and final arrangement in Six Mazourkes de Frédéric Chopin, Arrangées par Mme Pauline Viardot, Deuxième Série (Paris: E. Gérard, 1865).
There is a naive simplicity in the thematic material of Viardot-Garcia’s charming romance, which is close in spirit to the world of popular music. A studied repetitiveness of the principal motives, for example, is alleviated by Viardot-Garcia’s recoloring of the text through the employment of tonicizations and/or modal mixture.

A year after the publication of “Une fleur,” Pauline composed L’Absence”/Caña Española (PVG.s.II.3). According to a letter that Chopin wrote to his family in 1845, this song was completed during Viardot-Garcia’s brief sojourn in Vienna in March and April 1844:

*Mme. Viardot m’a chanté un chant espagnol de sa composition qu’elle a composé l’année dernière à Vienne; elle m’a promis de vous le chanter. J’aime beaucoup ce chant et je doute qu’on puisse entendre ou imaginer quelque chose de plus beau dans ce genre. Ce chant nous réunira; je l’ai toujours entendu avec ravissement.*

Mme. Viardot has sung to me a Spanish song which she composed last year in Vienna; she has promised that she will sing it to you. I love this song very much and I doubt that I could hear or imagine anything more beautiful in this genre. This chant will reunite us; I have always heard it in ecstasy.

The melancholic composition, so admired by Chopin, emulated a caña, a popular chant from Andalusia in triple time, normally accompanied by guitars and castanets. Since “L’Absence” soon became a staple of Viardot-Garcia’s song repertoire, it will be analyzed in some detail in the next chapter.

From the sparse evidence which has been presented in the preceding pages, it can be concluded that, of the ten songs in the second collection of 1849, six already existed at some degree of completion by the end of the summer 1844: “L’Absence”/Caña Española (PVG.s.II.3), “Un jour de printemps”/Caprice (PVG.s.II.4), “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6), “La

---

451 Letter of Frédéric Chopin to his family, Nohant, July 18, 1845.
Chanson de Loïc” (PVG.s.II.7), “Marie et Julie” (PVG.s.II.8), and “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10).

At the end of August of that year, Viardot-Garcia traveled back to Russia. Her second season there was as triumphant as the first one, with numerous performances of La sonnambula, La cenerentola, Don Pasquale, Lucia di Lamermoor, L’elisir d’amore, and Norma at a packed Imperial Theatre. Additionally, she sang the Russian premiere of Lvov’s Bianca e Gualtierro (December 1844) and gave concerts throughout the city. Once again, her schedule was full, with little time to rest, compose, or write letters. At the end of the season, in March 1845, she described her professional situation to George Sand:

Il y aura bientôt deux grands mois que je ne vous ai écrit—cependant tous les matins en me réveillant ma première pensée a été pour vous . . . je vous jure que je n’ai pas trouvé le temps matériel de le faire—La dernière moitié de la saison a été accablante de représentations et occupations de toute espèce . . .

Soon two long months will have passed in which I have not written to you—Nevertheless, every morning when I wake, my first thoughts are for you . . . I swear I have not found the physical time to do it—The last half of the season was packed with all sorts of performances and activities . . .

Since Viardot-Garcia was unable to finish this letter, Louis had to complete it for her several days later:

452 Pauline Viardot-Garcia and Louis Viardot to George Sand, St. Petersburg, March 1845, in Lettres inédites, ed. Thérèse Marix-Spire, 209.
Cette lettre, chère Madame Sand, est commencée depuis plusieurs jours... Vous avez du vous apercevoir, aux changements d’encre et de plumes, ainsi qu’aux hachures du style, qu’elle avait été fait par morceaux comme un habit d’arlequin. C’est que réellement la pauvre Pauline ne peut écrire de suite une seule page. Depuis que le théâtre est fermé, elle est plus occupée que lorsque il était ouvert. Elle a littéralement un concert par jour, sans compter les répétitions...

This letter, dear Madame Sand, was started many days ago... You must have noticed the changes of inks and pens, as well as the fractures in style, since it was pieced together, like a harlequin’s costume. Poor Pauline, in reality, never had the chance of writing a full page. After the theatre closed, she has been busier than when it was open. She literally has had a concert per day, without taking into account the rehearsals...

Evidently the misunderstandings of the previous summer, described in chapter 4, had been all but forgotten and the Viardots wished to resume their friendship with Sand.454

As a result of her intense concertizing, Viardot-Garcia’s health faltered for a few days before departing for concert presentations in Moscow. She recovered quickly, though, and gave three impressive performances at the Bolshoi Theatre at the end of April; in one of them, she was recalled thirty times to the stage. To please the adoring public, she decided to repeat the entire concert on the spot!455

In the meantime, Turgenev had managed to secure a leave of his public post. To the great displeasure of Varvara Turgenev, who considered Pauline nothing more than an

453 Ibid., 210.

454 Sand too was eager to forget the ugly accusations which had been exchanged a few months before and to reinstate Pauline/Consuelo in her proper niche: “Le plus beau jour de ma vie sera celui où je serai témoin d’un triomphe digne de vous et où je vous verrai comprise de tous comme je vous comprends et comme je vous aime.”/ “The most beautiful day of my life will be the one in which I witness a triumph worthy of you and in which I see everyone understanding you as I understand and love you.” George Sand to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Paris, January 25, 1845, Ibid., 216.

455 Kendall-Davies, 200.
astute gypsy with a good voice, her son intended to follow the Viardots to France. Both the singer and her husband seemed pleased with the young poet’s initiative. They considered him a good friend and readily invited him to Courtenenel, where he spent a few happy months that year, shooting game with Louis and adoring the singer from a reasonable distance.

In June 1845, Viardot-Garcia was reunited with George Sand and Chopin at Nohant. It was like old times; she sang with Chopin accompanying her at the piano (among the works which they performed repeatedly was “L’Absence”/Caña Española), read the latest works of the novelist, and sketched the countryside around her in the company of Maurice, Sand’s twenty-one-year-old son. The young man took the chance to complete a charming portrait of her, reproduced in Figure 6.3:

---

456 “Turgenev took his mother [to one of the concerts that Pauline gave at the Bolshoi Theatre]. . . . On her return home Varvara Petrovna was in a black mood. . . . At the end of supper [she] suddenly struck her knife angrily on the table, and said, as if talking to herself: ‘It must be admitted, that damned gypsy does sing well!’” FitzLyon, The Price of Genius, 186.
The previous year, Sand’s son had fallen in love with Pauline, and many biographers have speculated that the twenty-three-year-old singer returned his attentions to a certain extent. If this was the case, she must have benefited from sharing experiences and having
an *amitié amoureuse* with someone who was close to her age. Probably she was already beginning to suffer a level of emotional disconnect in her marriage and the difficulties and stresses of her professional and personal life might have required some sort of affective outlet. Notwithstanding, if the liaison indeed existed, it was a brief one, and Viardot-Garcia and her family managed to remain friends with Maurice once his passion subsided.

In August, Meyerbeer invited Viardot-Garcia to sing for Queen Victoria and Prince Albert and the Royal couples of Belgium and Prussia at the musical festival organized around the unveiling of the Beethoven Monument in Bonn. During the celebrations—which took aristocrats and musicians down the river Rhine to Bruhl, Bonn, Cologne, and Koblenz—Pauline had a chance to meet friends such as Liszt, Mendelssohn, and Berlioz.\(^{457}\)

In late September, the Viardots—accompanied this time by their daughter, Louise—took off for what they hoped would be a third triumphant season in St. Petersburg. Unfortunately, it turned out to be a disastrous affair. Soon after the singer’s inaugural roles as Norma and Amina, Louis contracted a severe case of cholera and was ill for several weeks. The singer took care of him and somehow managed to keep up with

\(^{457}\) Jenny Lind also participated in the festival; it was her first appearance next to Viardot-Garcia. Although Lind had been a student of Manuel García fils, comparisons—among friends and in the press—between the contrasting voices and artistic gifts of both women were inevitable. Many years later, Viardot-Garcia clarified for her mother their futility: « *Manuel est bon avec sa Lind et son éternelle comparaison avec sa carrière.* Il s’imagine que je pourrais faire en Angleterre ce qu’elle fait, et il me semble qu’il s’abuse étrangement. Pour cela il faudrait que ma carrière à moi eut été bâtie sur pilotis de puff—et rien n’y ressemble moins. » / “Manuel is fine with her Lind and his eternal comparison [between my career] and hers. He imagines that I can do in England what she has done, and I believe he strangely deceives himself. For this to happen, it would be necessary for my career to be built on pillars of banality—nothing could be further from the truth.” Pauline Viardot-Garcia to Joaquina Sitches, London, circa 1857, in Friang, 163.
her operatic engagements. Shortly afterwards, the Viardots’ little daughter got the whooping cough, and the singer—exhausted and with depleted defenses—also contracted the sickness. In February 1846, she was forced to cancel her contract with the Imperial Theatre. Against everyone’s advice, the Viardots decided to travel back to France in the middle of the winter. As a letter to count Mathieu Wielhorski attests, the trip back home was a miserable affair with bad weather haunting each of their steps:

Hier, enfin, après un affreux voyage de neuf jours, nous sommes arrivés à Tilsit, fatigués, brisés, maladés. Nous avons éprouvé tous les retards imaginables, tous les ennuis possibles, et même couru quelques dangers.458

Yesterday, at long last, after a horrendous trip of nine days, we arrived to Tilsit, tired, knocked about, and sick. We experienced all imaginable delays, all possible annoyances; at times we were even in danger.

After more than a month on the road, the family arrived in Paris, where Sand—working already on the ill-fated Lucrezia Floriani—was anxiously waiting for them. The terrible difficulties that Viardot-Garcia experienced during her last Russian season were regrettable, but in retrospect, perhaps also unavoidable. She was juggling too many unpredictable elements in her personal and professional life, and a balance could not be sustained for too long without someone or something going awry, thus upsetting all other aspects of her existence. During her initial days in Paris, George Sand probably counseled the singer to find the peace and quiet she needed to reproject her priorities and plan her next move. In May, she went to Courtavenel and communicated to the writer her mixed emotions before this unexpected period of reflection and rest:

Louis est depuis quelques jours à Paris. Ma mère et Antonia y sont allées ce matin. Je suis seule ici avec mon oncle, Mariquita, et Louisette. Vous ne sauriez croire combien je me trouve heureuse de cette solitude—Je voudrais que cela durât quelque temps—non que ma famille me gêne, mais il me semble que je me retrouve et que je me tiens bien mieux compagnie à moi-même que lorsque je suis entourée—Est-ce de l’égoïsme? Non, c’est une sensation trop douce pour avoir une si vilaine source. C’est plutôt un sentiment de clarté dans le cœur. Il me semble que je vois plus clair, que je sens plus clair, que je respire plus clair . . .

Louis has been in Paris for a few days. My mother and Antonia left this morning. I am alone here with my uncle, Mariquita, and Louisette. You could not believe how happy I find myself in this solitude—I wish this could last for some time—it is not that my family bothers me, but it seems to me that I find myself again and that I keep myself better company alone—Is this egoism? No, it is too sweet a sensation to have such a villainous source. It is instead a feeling of clarity in my heart. It seems to me that I see more clearly, that I feel more clearly, that I breathe more clearly . . .

In this blessed solitude, the singer soon realized that she desperately missed the intellectual and creative rigors of her early youth and found herself studying history and philosophy, translating Romantic and medieval poetry, and composing again:

Depuis mon arrivée à Courtavenel je travaille assez sérieusement—je me suis promis de ne plus gâcher mon temps comme par le passé, et je me tiens parole. Je lis beaucoup. Louis m’a conseillé l’Essai sur les mœurs de Voltaire—Je fais des traductions de l’anglais et de l’italien—Dante et Byron sont mes deux victimes. J’ai terminé ce matin mon Savatier et le financier de La Fontaine. Je voudrais pouvoir vous le faire entendre, ainsi qu’à Chopin. Je n’ai pas le moindre sentiment d’appréciation sur mes propres compositions lorsque je viens de les achever. Je serais curieuse de savoir à quoi m’en tenir sur ce nouveau-né—tous ce dont je suis certaine, c’est que l’inégalité des vers m’a donné beaucoup de mal—et dans les arts, tout mal est bon travail, et tout travail progrès.

459 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Courtavenel, May 31 [1846], in Lettres inédites, ed. Thérèse Marix-Spire, 224.

460 Ibid., 224.
After my arrival at Courtavenel, I have been working very seriously—I have promised that I will not waste my time as in the past—and I remain firm in my purpose. I read a lot. Louis recommended Voltaire’s *Essay on Manners* [and the Spirit of Nations]—I also make translations from English and Italian to French—Dante and Byron are my two victims. This morning, I finished my *Savatier et le financier* of La Fontaine. I wish you and Chopin could hear it. I cannot judge my own compositions when I have completed them. I would be curious to know what to expect of this newborn. I am certain, however, that the inequality of the verse has caused me a lot of trouble—and in the arts, trouble entails much work and all work is progress.

The choice of writing to Sand on the exact day that she concluded this setting is significant. Viardot-Garcia might have done so to regain the writer’s approval on the problematic issue of managing her time in order to maximize her creativity as a composer. The decision to working on a text of La Fontaine is also noteworthy. As Viardot-Garcia informed Count Wielhorski, that year Parisian society was ablaze with the novelty of setting these fables to music:


In Paris, the latest rage is Levassor singing the fables of Lafontaine at the Royal Palace. I will transcribe a sample for Baby at the end of this letter. Sponge cakes are the new sweets to take with tea. Here, dear count, you have the great successes of this winter.

Viardot-Garcia’s transcribed sample is a strophic musical setting of a versified version of La Fontaine’s “Le Corbeau et le renard,” probably by the singer Auguste Levassor. It is a charming, simple *romance*, more suitable, perhaps, for the ears of young children than

---

for the supposedly sophisticated world of the Parisian salon. The first couplet and refrain are presented below:

Example 6.5. Auguste Levassor(?), “Le Corbeau et le renard,” mm. 1-25.

After completing the transcription, Viardot-Garcia made the following ironic comment to Wielhorski:

*Quelqu’un a dit que Lafontaine faisait parler les bêtes comme de gens d’esprit, mais que l’auteur de ceci faisait parler les gens comme les bêtes très bêtes.*

Someone has said that La Fontaine made animals speak like ingenious people, but the author of this [work] makes people speak like the dumbest of beasts.

It must be remembered that Viardot-Garcia had concluded her first song album with a setting of La Fontaine’s “Le Chêne et le roseau” (PVG.s.I.8), a composition which Sand

---

462 Ibid., 26.
had qualified as extraordinary and Chopin had admired. Hearing Levassor singing his own unsophisticated arrangements of La Fontaine might have inspired her to attempt a new, ambitious setting of a work by the fabulist. It is very probable that, at least in 1846, her intent was to conclude her projected second song collection with “Le Savetier et le financier.” Since this song was, in the end, not included in the collection, I would like to digress at this point to make a brief description of its principal musical characteristics.

La Fontaine devised “Le Savetier et le financier” to illustrate the moral and spiritual evils brought by greed and the accumulation of wealth: A humble cobbler, happy to do his job, sings all day with virtuosic abandonment and enjoyment; his neighbor, a rich financier, on the other hand, is miserable, always worrying about his business and sleeping but a few hours at night. Attracted and repelled at the same time by the cobbler’s freedom and naive spirit, the prosperous banker decides to make him a gift of one hundred crowns. The cobbler is amazed: never has he seen such wealth! He goes home and hides the money in the cellar. Soon, however, he begins to worry about it, losing his ability to sing or sleep. Finally, he is so emotionally spent that he decides to return the cursed money to the banker. After doing so, the cobbler recovers his voice and joie de vivre. La Fontaine’s original fable follows in the next page:

---

463 In 1843, Viardot-Garcia dedicated “Le Chêne et le roseau” to her husband, who, like Sand, admired La Fontaine’s fables. One can sense Louis’ influence on the singer’s intellectual and artistic activities in the spring of 1846. Perhaps it was his way of controlling a wife who was gradually becoming emotionally estranged from him? Both April FitzLyon and Barbara Kendall-Davies coincide that Pauline’s relationship with Turgenev had intensified during the difficult winter of 1845-1846, when the young writer served as moral and emotional support to Pauline as she took care of her sick family.
“Le Savetier et le Financier”

Un Savetier chantait du matin jusqu’au soir ;
C’était merveilles de le voir,
Merveilles de l’ouïr ; il faisait des passages,
Plus content qu’aucun des sept sages.
Son voisin, au contraire, étant tout cousu d’or,
Chantait peu, dormait moins encore ;
C’était un homme de finance.
Si sur le point du jour parfois il sommeillait,
Le Savetier alors en chantant l’éveillait,
Et le Financier se plaignait,
Que les soins de la Providence
N’eussent pas au marché fait vendre le dormir,
Comme le manger et le boire.
En son hôtel il fait venir
Le chanteur, et lui dit : Or çà, sire Grégoire,
Que gagnez-vous par an ? — Par an ? Ma foi, Monsieur,
Dit avec un ton de rieur,
Le gaillard Savetier, ce n’est point ma manière
De compter de la sorte ; et je n’entasse guère
Un jour sur l’autre : il suffit qu’à la fin
J’attrape le bout de l’année :
Chaque jour amène son pain.
— Eh bien ! que gagnez-vous, dites-moi, par journée ?
— Tantôt plus, tantôt moins : le mal est que toujours ;
(Ét sans cela nos gains seraient assez honnêtes,)
Le mal est que dans l’an s’entremêlent des jours
Qu’il faut chômer ; on nous ruine en fêtes.
L’une fait tort à l’autre ; et Monsieur le curé
De quelque nouveau Saint charge toujours son prêne.
Le Financier, riant de sa naïveté,
Lui dit : « Je vous veux mettre aujourd’hui sur le trône.
Prenez ces cent écus : gardez-les avec soin,
Pour vous en servir au besoin. »
Le Savetier crut voir tout l’argent que la terre
Avait, depuis plus de cent ans,
Produit pour l’usage des gens.
Il retourne chez lui ; dans sa cave il enserre
L’argent et sa joie à la fois.
Plus de chant : il perdit la voix
Du moment qu’il gagna ce qui cause nos peines.
Le sommeil quitta son logis,
Il eut pour hôtes les soucis,
Les soupçons, les alarmes vaines.
Tout le jour il avait l’œil au guet ; et la nuit,
Si quelque chat faisait du bruit,
Le chat prenait l’argent. À la fin le pauvre homme
S’en courut chez celui qu’il ne réveillait plus.
Rendez-moi, lui dit-il, mes chansons et mon somme,
Et reprenez vos cent écus.
La Fontaine’s humorous and detailed fable gave Pauline ample opportunity to create—within the freedom of a through-composed form—contrasting musical illustrations of the two characters, a compositional and dramatic task which came naturally to her. To illustrate the joyous liberty of the cobbler’s voice, Viardot-Garcia employs a vocalise at the beginning of the song which begins in the key of G major (parallel major to the tonic). As the passage descends, it turns back to the minor mode, giving it a certain melancholic and remote feel. The passage is reproduced in Example 6.6:

The dull rich man, after spending entire nights worrying about his stacks of cash, slumbers away the early hours of the morning. His dozing is captured with musical humor by falling chromatic lines in the left hand of the accompaniment. These are pitched against the rocking, repetitive motion of the broken octaves in the right hand.

Example 6.7 reproduces this passage:


The financier’s grandiloquence is also depicted by Viardot-Garcia’s musical gestures. His dubious offering to the wide-eyed cobbler is represented by serpentine, false tonicizations, succeeding themselves in rapid sequence (i.e. thirteen measures take us through eight tonal shifts). These sudden harmonic shifts accompany the pompous vocal
line of the rich man as he delivers both cash and repetitive, overcautious advice. The passage is reproduced in Example 6.8:


The incredulity and excitement of the cobbler, as he imagines stacks of crowns piling atop each other, are also captured in Viardot-Garcia’s imaginative piano figures. See Example 6.9:
The cobbler’s compulsion to hide the money is reflected in the ensuing chromatic descent of the bass from dominant to tonic, a convincing portrayal of the obsessive mental imprisonment that the simple man suffers as a result of his newly acquired fortune. The passage is reproduced in Example 6.10:
Viardot-Garcia’s employment of piano figures to comment on the narrative and enrich the psychological portrayal of the characters can be directly linked to the German ballad tradition as developed by both Schubert and Loewe. The composer was importing—with full technical and expressive command—these musical resources to enrich the expressive possibilities of the French *romance*. Overall, “Le Savetier et le financier” requires not only an accomplished singer with vocal flexibility and a substantial gift for characterization and comedy, but also a supreme pianist capable of producing a fluid narrative out of the many changes in texture, harmony, and affect in his/her part.

Regrettably, we do not know the reactions of Sand and Chopin to Viardot-Garcia’s setting of “Le Savetier et le financier.” It is not difficult to imagine that later
that year Sand heard the singer’s interpretation of the extended song with enthusiasm. Both philosophically and politically, the fable of La Fontaine adhered to the writer’s socialist and revolutionary ideals. She probably thought that her protégée had once again created a composition worthy of her literary counterpart. The song’s demonizing of wealth accumulation and property, however, might have been too explicit for members of the bourgeoisie. In the conservative ambiance of the July Monarchy and during the uncertain months after the 1848 Revolution, they probably would have confused its moralizing message with radical propaganda. Perhaps as a result of this, the song was not published as part of the singer’s second song collection. In fact, almost six decades separated the moment of composition from the moment of publication. In 1904, the eighty-three-year-old composer published her last album of songs. The last work in this album was “Le Savetier et le financier” (PVG.s.XVI.6). It seems fitting and poetic that both her first and last albums concluded with a fable of La Fontaine.

Viardot-Garcia remained in France with few obligations during the summer of 1846. The whole family was still weak and convalescing. Louis seemed depressed as well; perhaps he felt the singer’s emotional aloofness? In an attempt to reconnect and to regain strength, the Viardots decided to travel for a few weeks to Boulogne to take the waters. From there, the singer wrote a letter to George Sand telling her that she continued

464 Because Marix-Spire believed this song was never published, subsequent biographers of Pauline Viardot-Garcia have failed to give proper attention to this composition.


466 Stylistically, the 1904 version of “Le Savetier et le financier” is closely related to the finest compositions of the singer’s first album of songs, particularly to “Le Chêne et le roseau” (PVG.s.I.8), so there is little question that the piece was completed during the 1840s.
to compose and was considering her sentimental situation carefully. A letter which Turgenev wrote to Viardot-Garcia the following autumn confirms that she had completed a few songs during that summer: “I prefer to congratulate you on the employment of your time in the countryside . . . Yes, I am certainly curious to see your works. . . . Patience!” Turgenev, however, did not have a chance to hear her new compositions that year, for Pauline did not return to St. Petersburg for a fourth winter season. In a letter addressed to Mathieu Wielhorski, she expressed her regret and her hopes for a future reunion with her Russian friends and admirers:

_Croyez le bien, sans une série de circonstances aussi intimes, rien n’aurait pu me faire renoncer volontairement au bonheur de retourner dans un pays que j’aime tant, où j’ai de si vrais amis, et où j’ai vécu si heureuse de toutes façons, comme femme et comme artiste. . . . Cette absence, je l’espère, ne sera pas éternelle, ni même de longue durée. Tâchez de ne pas m’oublier durant ce temps!_ 469

Believe me, apart from a series of intimate circumstances, nothing would have made me renounce voluntarily the happiness of returning to a country which I love so much, where I have such true friends, and where I have lived so happily in every way, as woman and artist. . . . This absence, I hope, will not be eternal or too long. Try not to forget me during this period!

Louis’ ill health and his inability (or unwillingness?) to chaperone her were the principal causes behind the singer’s canceled return to Russia. One can perceive the singer’s

467 Kendall-Davies, 218.


sadness at not being able to reunite with close friends. If she would have learned that she was to visit Russia only once more, in the 1850s, she would have been broken-hearted. After all, the country had propelled her maturation as operatic singer, and had, perhaps, seen the birth of her first amorous passion as a grown woman.

There was, however, no time to sulk. Viardot-Garcia spent the next two winter seasons (1846-1847 and 1847-1848) in Berlin, performing Italian opera at the Königstadt Theatre and works translated to German at the Deutsche Theatre, often under the baton of an enthusiastic Meyerbeer. Since members of the Prussian royal family remained close fans, the singer also gave concerts at the palaces of Postdam, Charlottenburg, and Sanssouci. Viardot-Garcia could thrive and work far away from her Russian friends, but Turgenev could not live too long away from Pauline. In January 1847, he traveled to Berlin with the intention of remaining close to the singer henceforth.470

In Germany, Viardot-Garcia’s performing schedule was, once again, extremely busy. She had to learn or relearn complex roles in German, including her staple Rossinian roles, the title roles in *Norma* and *Iphigénie en Tauride*, Valentine in *Les Huguenots*, Alice in *Robert le diable*, Rachel in *La Juive*, and Leonore in *Fidelio*. In her letters to Turgenev and George Sand, she gave vent to some of her frustration:

---

470 At the end of the 1846-1847 winter season, he followed the Viardots first to London and then to Courtravenel and Paris. Because of his lack of funds, he remained in France for the rest of the year, unable to follow Viardot-Garcia back to Germany for the 1847-1848 winter season. The Viardots received him in their household with open arms.
Après demain je chante pour la 1re fois Valentine dans les Huguenots, en allemande !!!!! Vous ne sauriez croire quel travail je suis obligée de faire pour chaque rôle. D’abord il faut arranger le texte pour élanguer le plus possible les mots cruels qui déchirent la bouche, et qui font l’effet d’autant de ronces au travers desquelles la pauvre voix peut à peine se faire jour. Une fois le texte change il faut oublier l’ancien et apprendre le nouveau, puis se le mettre dans la langue, puis dans la voix. Enfin c’est une rude besogne. On dit que je prononce bien, je le crois, ma foi, je me donne assez de peine pour cela.471

The day after tomorrow, I sing for the first time Valentine in Les Huguenots, in German!!!!!! You would not believe what labor I am forced to do for each role. First, one must arrange the text to stretch as much as possible the cruel words which tear the mouth. These are like bramble branches through which the poor voice can hardly emerge. Once the text has been changed, it is necessary to forget the old version and learn the new one, then one must get it into the tongue, then into the voice. To sum it up, it is a rough job. It is said that I pronounce well; by faith, I believe it: I have given myself enough misery to achieve that.

Just when Pauline was completely overwhelmed with obligations, made “stupid through work,”472 George Sand and Frédéric Chopin were in desperate need of her friendship.

The sentimental crisis brought by the publication of Lucrezia Floriani (1846) and by the evil whisperings of Solange and her dissolute husband, the sculptor Jean-Baptiste Clésinger, destroyed the already tense liaison between Sand and Chopin. When Viardot-Garcia attempted to mediate in the summer of 1847, there was little she could do. During a break in Paris, she met with a distressed and suspicious Chopin. In September, from Dresden, she wrote the following lines to George Sand in an attempt to sugar-coat the true sentiments of the Polish composer:

471 Pauline Viardot-García to George Sand, Berlin, January 22, [1847], in Lettres inédites, ed. Thérèse Marix-Spire, 232.

472 “Stupide a force de travail,” Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Berlin, February 27, 1847, in Ibid., 234.
[Chopin] est toujours aussi bon, aussi dévoué—vous adorant comme toujours, ne se réjouissant que de votre joie, ne s’affligeant que de vos chagrins. Au nom du ciel, chère Mignounne ne croyez jamais les amis officieux qui viennent vous raconter des fagots.473

[Chopin] is always so good, always so devoted—he adores you as always, he only draws joy from your joy and affliction from your sorrows. In the name of heaven, dear Mignounne, never believe the officious friends that come to tell you lies.

Sadly, the singer, drowned in musical engagements, could do little to stop the break-up from afar. In the same letter she explained to Sand her professional activities for the following months:

J’ai déjà chanté [à Dresde] 2 fois . . . (toujours en Allemand) et j’y dois donner encore 4 représentations. D’ici nous nous rendrons à Hambourg pour y chanter 6 fois, depuis le commencement de Xbre jusqu’au 20. A partir de cette époque nous serons à Berlin jusqu’aux premiers jours de Mars, époque à laquelle je retourne à Paris, pour y prendre un peu de repos et préparer ma saison au Théâtre Italien de Londres, où je dois chanter Mai, Juin, Juillet et un partie d’Août.474

I have already sung in Dresden twice . . . (always in German) and I still have to give four representations. From here, we will go to Hamburg, where I will sing six times, from the beginning of October until the twentieth of that month. From that time onwards, we will be in Berlin until the first days of March, when I will return to Paris to rest a bit and to prepare my season at the Italian Theatre in London. I will sing there May, June, July, and part of August.

In 1847, Pauline was also having difficulties with her old friend Clara Schumann. Clara resented her for not doing more to promote the works of her husband

473 Pauline Viardot-Garcia to George Sand, Dresden, October 19, 1847, in Ibid., 236.

474 Ibid.
inside and outside of Germany (in 1840, Schumann had dedicated to her the Heine
*Liederkreis*, op. 24) and for associating too closely with Meyerbeer, a composer whom
she and Robert considered vulgar and artificial at best.\textsuperscript{475} Because of her busy schedule
that year, Viardot-Garcia declined to participate in performances in Leipzig and Dresden
of Schumann’s popular oratorio, *Das Paradies und die Peri*, promising Clara, instead, to
perform in a recital of her husband’s songs.\textsuperscript{476}

Viardot-Garcia, in turn, resented and misunderstood Robert Schumann. She
believed that his constant mood swings were selfish, limiting and tormenting the life of
his constantly pregnant wife. Early in January 1848, close to the time of the birth of the
Schumanns’ first son, Ludwig, Pauline had the indelicacy of writing the following lines
to Clara:

\begin{quote}
Ich hoffe, dass du schonst dich ein wenig mehr als wenn wir in
Dresden waren. Bedenke, liebes Clärchen, dass deine Gesundheit
die Bedingung ist, zum ganzen Glück deiner Familie, . . .
Denn du bist die Einzige im Haus die dafür besorgen kann. In
unseren Jahrhundert wird wenig mit der Composition verdient, mit
Ausnahme der dramatischen Musik. Selbst die grössten Talente
würden verhungern, wenn sie Nichts anderes hätten . . . Uebrigens
weiss ich nicht warum ich mir erlaube dir das Alles zu sagen, denn
du weisst es ebenso gut wie ich, und dein Robert gewiss noch viel
besser—Aber was dein Robert nicht genug weiss ist das eine Frau
dans ta position muss sich vielmehr schonen, wie du es thust. Es
gilt um deine künfigere Gesundheit—und wenn du auch böse
mit mir drum sein wirst, ist es als Freundin meine Pflicht dich
daran zu erinnern, dass du kannst nicht ruhig genug bleiben,
und dass dein Mann sich nie genug bemühen kann, dir alle
Anstrengungen, alle Unannehmlichkeiten zu ersparen . . .
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{475} See Robert Ignatius Letellier, “Introduction,” to Giacomo Meyerbeer, *The Diaries of

\textsuperscript{476} Kendall-Davies, 228.

\textsuperscript{477} Pauline Viardot-Garcia to Clara Schumann, [January] 1848, in Beatrix Borchard,
“« Ma chère petite Clara – Pauline de mon cœur » Clara Schumann et Pauline Viardot, une
I hope that you are taking care of yourself a little better than the last
time I saw you in Dresden. Consider, dear little Clara, that your
health is of prime importance for the well-being of your family,
. . . you are the only one in the household that can look after them.
With the exception of dramatic music, in our century one makes
very little from composing. Even the greatest talents are starving,
when they have nothing else . . . By the way, I do not know why I allow
myself to tell you this, since you know it just as well as I do, and
your Robert knows it even better—But what your Robert does not
know well enough, is that a woman dans ta position should take better
care of herself. It is about your future health—and even if you become
angry with me, it is my duty as a friend to remind you of this: the fact
that you cannot have enough calm and that your husband cannot make
enough efforts to spare you all preoccupations and discomforts.

Pauline’s message to pregnant Clara was essentially prompted by friendly concern, but
her wording and timing were poor at best. Clara, ever the loyal defender of Robert,
retorted in a letter full of anger and bitterness, in which she accused Pauline of
misunderstanding not only her husband’s works but also all German music. She also
accused her of self-promotion through the easy spectacle of French and Italian opera. The
polarizing effect of nationalistic thought in art is evident in her words:

"Tu as du sang espagnol en toi, tu aimes les hommes pleins de feu,
brillants, de même la musique ; . . . pour quelqu’un qui comme toi
déclare Meyerbeer premier compositeur de notre temps, comment
les compositions de mon mari peuvent-elles te plaire ? . . . Tu apprécies
par-dessus tout le virtuosité, moi l’artiste créateur . . . De même
que tu méconnais mon mari, tu méconnais les Allemands: si tu crois
qu’ils n’ont de goût que pour ce qui est amusant et brillant, comment
les éditeurs de musique pourraient ils si bien payer la musique sérieuse?" 478

478 Clara Schumann to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Dresden, January 9, 1848, in Ibid., 137.
You have Spanish blood and you love men and music which are full of fire and glitter; . . . How can you appreciate the compositions of my husband when you declare that Meyerbeer is the first composer of our time? . . . You appreciate above all virtuosity, I appreciate the creative artist. . . . The same way that you misjudge my husband, you misjudge the Germans: if you believe that they only have taste for that which is brilliant and amusing, how can music editors pay well for music that is serious?

Such an exchange would have marked the end of many friendships, but Viardot-Garcia was a practical and measured woman, true to her word, and steadfast to Clara. An avid promoter of Beethoven, J. S. Bach, Schubert, Mozart, Gluck, and Mendelssohn outside of Germany, she did not even think it pertinent to respond to the accusations of misunderstanding German music. In her next letter to Clara, she simply stated that “master creator” (composer) and “artist creator” (interpreter) were inseparable since “each on his own remains mute, but together they create the most elevated and most noble pleasure of men, art.”⁴⁷⁹ After this, she evaded any further discussion and continued the letter writing about family matters. Clara accepted this missive as a peace offering.

From September 1846 to March 1848, there is limited epistolary evidence of Viardot-Garcia’s compositional activities. What exists indicates that despite her busy schedule, she continued to compose and to perform her works. Letters from Turgenev to Pauline, written in November and December 1847, mention some of the songs which she would later include in the second song album. In the first letter, Turgenev recommended

to Viardot-Garcia to present some of her compositions in Germany, for example “La Luciole” (PVG.s.II.9) and “La Chanson de Loïc” (PVG.s.II.7). A few days later, in a postscript, he also mentioned another new composition, “La Petite chevrière” (PVG.s.II.2):


P.S.—For some days now—always while I write—I do little else but sing the song of the Loëc (sic). Oh my God! And my goatherdess—You will have [success] Madame; you will have it in Berlin. I give you my word of honor.

These three songs were probably concluded during Viardot-Garcia’s summer break in Courtavenel. At that time, the singer must have performed them repeatedly, otherwise, Turgenev, who could only read music imprecisely, would have not recalled them well enough to sing them four months after the singer’s departure from France. In a letter written to Count Wielhorski in September 1847, Viardot-Garcia confirmed in the form of a little verse her compositional activities during that summer:

J’ai beaucoup composé
Un peu dessiné
Pas de tout chanté.
Beaucoup dormi.
Beaucoup mangé.
Beaucoup pensé à vous.


481 Ivan Turgenev to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Paris, December 2/14, 1847, in Ibid., 44.
I have composed a lot,  
Drawn a bit  
And not sang at all.  
I have slept a lot,  
Eaten a lot,  
And thought of you a lot.

Though there exists no further evidence, it is probable that the singer had a chance of presenting some of her new compositions during the winter season of 1847-1848 in Germany. A brief description of “La Petite chevrière” follows:

In the postscript quoted above, Turgenev referred to “La Petite chevrière” as his song. This might indicate either his predilection for the work or the possibility that he penned or arranged the lyrics for it.\(^{483}\) Hoping to find the source of inspiration for the words of this song, scholar Henri Granjard associated them with an incident from Laurence Sterne’s *Voyage sentimental en France et en Italie* (1764). In that instance the roaming protagonist finds a melancholic goatherdess struck by the pangs of love who plays a flute.\(^{484}\) A comparison of this narrative with the lyrics of the song quoted below makes this association highly improbable. The figure of the goatherdess is stereotypical in European literature from the Middle Ages onwards. Like the shepherd and


\(^{483}\) Three out of the ten songs in Viardot-Garcia second album include anonymous poetry. The Spanish lyrics for “L’Absence”/*Caña Española* (PVG.s.II.3) probably were penned by Viardot-Garcia or one of her close family members. The words for “La Petite chevrière” (PVG.s.II.2) and “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10) might have been penned by Viardot-Garcia, friends, or professional *paroliers*.

\(^{484}\) See Henri Granjard, ed., *Quelques Lettres d’Ivan Tourguénev à Pauline Viardot*, 44.
shepherdess, she is often associated with spiritual purity and a return to Nature. Such is the case with the lyrics of “La Petite chevrière:”

“La Petite chevrière”

Ah! c'est déjà ma fauvette
Qui chante sur le pommier;
J'ai dormi longtemps;
Allons il est temps !
Il est temps, car la clochette
Sonne au cou de mon bélier.

Allons, mes chevreaux gentils,
Suivez-moi, grands et petits,
Allons faire la dinette,
Sous les chênes du sentier.
Hé là bas, là bas,
Ne vous battez pas

Qu'il fait bon dans la montagne
Où personne ne me voit
De jolis oiseaux
Boivent aux ruisseaux.
Mais là-bas dans la campagne
On étouffe sous un toit.

On ne voit que des méchants
Qui maltraitent les enfants,
 Là-haut Finaut m'accompagne,
Et me mène au bon endroit;
C'est qu'il m'aime bien,
Mon bon petit chien.

“The Little Goatherdess”

Ah ! It is time, my little warbler
Who sings on the apple tree;
I have slept a long time;
Let us go, it is time!
It is time, because the small bell
Sounds on the neck of my ram.

Let us go, my gentle goats,
Follow me, great and small,
Let us go make dinner,
Under the oaks of the road.
Hey, down there, down there,
Do not fight each other.

It is so beautiful in the mountain
Where no one can see me.
The pretty birds
Drink in the brooks.
But down there in the countryside,
One chokes under a roof.

One sees naught but bad people
Who mistreat children.
Here in the heights, Finaut is next to me
And brings me to a good place;
Cause he loves me well,
My good little dog.

This anonymous poem also contains a transparent critique of the evils generated by society and civilization. The pure-hearted girl’s mistrust towards people is palpable; she prefers to wander the mountain heights with her dog than to return to a countryside where she has only seen (and experienced?) abuse. The poem’s message resonates with that of other poems which Pauline decided to set at the time, such as “Le Savetier et le
financier” (PVG.s.XVI.6), “L’Exilé polonais” (PVG.s.I.5), and “L’Enfant et la montagne” (PVG.s.I.1=PVG.s.0.1.f).

Viardot-Garcia’s musical setting emulates the tunefulness and rhythmic liveliness of the popular style as perceived by Romantic composers such as Schubert and Chopin. A delicate accompaniment in the middle and upper registers of the piano—imitating the repetitive chirping of the warblers—dominates the strophic song. The vocal line is simple and syllabic, employing almost exclusively an arpeggiation of the tonic chord. The opening of the song is reproduced in Example 6.11:


As closing gesture for each of the two musical strophes, the vocal line employs stylized yodeling calls. The motivic material of the four-measure call (mm. 47-50), immediately repeats with slight variations (mm. 51-54). It is closely related to the last three measures

485 In this setting, two poetic strophes equal one musical strophe.
of the initial phrase of the song (mm. 10-12). The yodeling calls are reproduced in Example 6.12:


In comparison to other songs by Viardot-Garcia, the harmonic vocabulary of the work seems exaggeratedly rudimentary, with a single modulation occurring in the middle of the musical strophe, a brief movement to the relative minor before the return of the opening musical material. This fragment is reproduced in Example 6.13:
Viardot-Garcia’s interest in the musical structure of popular music can be readily sensed in other songs from the second collection. Other examples which make use of a simplified musical approach are “L’Absence”/Caña Española (PVG.s.II.3), “Villanelle” (PVG.s.II.7), “La Chanson de Loïc” (PVG.s.II.7), and “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10). As we shall see in the next chapter, the aesthetic motivation behind this simplification can be directly linked to George Sand’s idealization of popular music in Consuelo and to Viardot-Garcia’s desire to establish a more direct communication with audiences.

From Turgenev’s letters we can deduce that at least eight of the ten songs found in the second album were completed or close to completion by the end of the summer of 1847. The dates of composition of the two songs in the second album which have not been discussed until now, “Solitude” (PVG.s.II.1) and “Villanelle” (PVG.s.II.5), are harder to establish: There are no sketches or autograph manuscripts for these works and
as far as I know, they are not mentioned in the surviving letters which Viardot-Garcia sent or received during the 1840s.

During the first months of 1848, Viardot-Garcia’s thoughts were probably far away from the German stages. Her heart must have pounded with excitement as news of the dethronement of King Louis-Philippe crossed the Rhine. Sand, who had so recently lived through the loss of Chopin and Solange, sprang back to life at the opportunity of participating in the new Republican government. Now that the writer’s hopes for social renewal appeared to be materializing, she expressed the high expectations she had for Viardot-Garcia in the new political order:

. . . [I]l y a de grands devoirs qui réclament tout notre temps, toutes nos forces, toute notre âme. Vous allez bientôt nous ramener, j’espère, les consolations de l’art, remède divin, et force bienfaisante. Vous me direz tout ce que vous allez faire, car je compte sur vous pour faire dans l’art la révolution que le peuple vient de faire dans la politique.486

. . . There are great duties which demand all of our time, strength, and soul. You will soon bring us back, I hope, the consolation of art, which is both divine remedy and benevolent force. You must tell me all that you plan to do, because I count on you to create in art the revolution that the people have just brought about in politics.

The writer’s Saint-Simonian prospects for Consuelo’s archetype were considerable and, in retrospect, probably unrealizable. These comments demonstrate, however, the idealism which reigned during the first months of the Republic, before the new order became tainted by the competition of two ineffective political factions and by the atrocities committed during the barricade days of June.

Viardot-Garcia had a limited chance to participate in the Republic’s initial hullabaloo. Upon her return to Paris at the beginning of March, the minister of the interior, Alexandre Ledru-Rollin—encouraged by George Sand—commissioned her to compose and perform a patriotic hymn, a new *Marseillaise*, which would celebrate not only the inauguration of the Théâtre de la République (formerly the Théâtre français), but the birth of a new social order. In practical terms, the piece was intended to open the theatre’s first free performance for the Parisian populace scheduled on April 6. The hymn was to be followed by *Le Roi attend*, a comic political pastiche written especially for the occasion by George Sand. Employing the patriotic verses of the republican poet, Pierre-Auguste Dupont, the composer had a few weeks to complete the score. Viardot-Garcia decided to model her composition directly on *La Marseillaise*, emulating its march meter, martial tempo, dotted rhythms, and phrase structure. *La Jeune République*, as the piece came to be known, recreates with some level of success the idealism and heroism expressed in that composition. Correlations between the two works are easily discovered in the impassioned musical refrain, which is reproduced in Example 6.14:
Most of the resemblance has to do with the martial character of both works, but here and there, one does hear similar melodic gestures. For example, the soloist’s phrase “Frères, serrons nous autour d’elles” (mm. 51-52) resembles the Marseillaise’s “Aux armes, mes citoyens, Formez vos bataillons.” The singer’s emulation of the famous revolutionary hymn does not mean she lacked her own musical concepts. Most probably, she understood that the piece was to be heard by a large group of unsophisticated listeners who would have a better chance of remembering its musical contours if they could associate it with a known piece. From the letters that George Sand and Viardot-Garcia exchanged, we can deduce that *La Jeune République* was intended to inspire partisan sentiments, spreading sympathy among the attending masses for the most radical factions of the new government. The performance of the work had to be planned for maximum theatrical effect. It was determined that forty young female students of the Conservatoire, wearing dresses of white muslin crossed by tri-color bands, would form the majority of the chorus. They would incarnate the young republic. The choir would be conducted by Narcisse Girard, the orchestral director of l’Opéra. Viardot-Garcia’s participation as soloist was, in the eyes of Sand, crucial for the success of the performance. There was only one problem. That spring, the singer was suffering from migraines. As a result, she had decided not to perform for a few weeks. She wanted to be ready for her operatic engagements in England, which began in May. A few days before the performance, Sand tried to change Viardot-Garcia’s mind by appealing to her sense of duty:
Prenez donc le temps de vous guérir, ma chérie et de nous faire un chef-d’œuvre— . . . Il faut absolument que vous chantez vous-même votre cantate (sic). Je veux qu’’on vous voie, qu’’on vous admire et qu’’on vous aime, et que vous preniez pied en France de part la République. On va aussi donner dans la salle de l’opéra des concerts du conservatoire au peuple—Chantez-y si vous êtes ici. Il ne s’agit plus de s’user pour des bourgeois, mais de conquérir le peuple et le pouvoir.487

Take the time to get better, my dear, and to create for us a masterwork— . . . It is absolutely necessary that you sing your cantata (sic). I want all to see you, to admire you, to love you, and for you to take your place in France, on the side of the Republic. Members of the the Conservatoire will also give concerts at the Opéra for the people—Sing there if you are here. It is no longer a question of employing oneself for the bourgeoisie, one must conquer the people and the power.

This time Sand’s words could not change Viardot-Garcia’s mind. The experienced singer knew that she needed all her vocal stamina in order to perform in England and that she required rest. She was also not willing to renounce her bourgeois engagements (and thus to destroy her artistic reputation) in order to defend the new French government. She chose the tenor Gustave-Hippolyte Roger488 to take her place at the concert. Despite Viardot-Garcia’s absence, the first performance of La Jeune République was a success. Before the end of April—once again through the influence of Sand—the score was published by four allied Parisian editors (i.e. Launer, Troupenas, Brandus, and Meissonnier). Sale profits were donated to the Fund for Patriotic Causes.489 In the unstable political environment, however, the composition was quickly forgotten. After all, hundreds of revolutionary hymns were composed in Paris in 1848.


488 The next year she would sing next to Roger in the premiere of Meyerbeer’s Le Prophète.

489 One can read on the title page of La Jeune République’s first edition: “Le produit de la vente sera versé à la Caisse des dons patriotiques.”
In May 1848, Viardot-Garcia returned to London’s operatic stages after an absence of almost seven years. She had been engaged for the summer season by the administration of the new royal theatre in Covent Garden to sing some of her most famous roles. Here she faced the intrigues of her perpetual enemy, Giulia Grisi (1811-1869), and her husband, the tenor Giovanni Matteo de Candio, also known as Mario (1810-1883). On several occasions, for example, the tenor became suddenly indisposed, including the day of her initial appearance as Amina on May 9. Many of the parts which she had hoped to sing had to be postponed or canceled due to lack of planning by the administrators of the new operatic venue. Despite these difficulties, Viardot-Garcia worked well, giving a series of impressive recitals, some of which included her arrangements of Chopin’s Mazurkas. Her close friendship with Berlioz developed as a result of a recital in Hannover Hall on June 29, in which she sang under the composer’s baton. On that occasion, Viardot-Garcia sang a new orchestral arrangement of “La Captive” with such sensual abandonment that the composer immediately declared her one of the greatest singers of all times.

Both Turgenev and Sand kept her well informed of the latest developments in France, sometimes in long, depressive letters. Sand soon realized the distance which

---


491 See Chapter 4 of the present dissertation.

492 Berlioz had initially orchestrated “La Captive” for soprano Cornèlie Falcon in 1834. This version, however, is now lost. The orchestration that the composer prepared for Viardot-Garcia was published in 1849; in this publication, which was dedicated to Pauline, the song was transposed down from its original key of E major to D major. See Julian Rushton, “Berlioz and the Mezzo soprano” in Peter Bloom, ed. *Berlioz: Scenes from the Life and Work* (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2007), 75.
separated her republican and socialist dreams from the brutality of the uneducated masses:

Si nous avons Napoléon, ce sera encore un an ou deux d’agitations et de révolutions pendant lesquels le peuple peut être égaré et faire de grandes et de détestables choses, parce qu’il a de grands instincts et une ignorance funeste. . . . Ils croient que Napoléon n’est pas mort et qu’ils votent pour lui en votant pour son neveu. . . . [D]ans le fond de la Vallée Noire, on entend dire des billevesées de l’autre monde et on voit une population à l’état d’enfance. 493

If we take [Louis]-Napoleon, there will still be one or two years of agitation and revolution during which the people can be stirred to do great and detestable things, since they have both strong instincts and a terrible ignorance. . . . They believe that Napoleon has not died and that they will be voting for him, when they vote for the nephew. . . . At the bottom of the Black Valley, one hears stupidities which seem to come from another world and one sees a population in an infantile state.

Viardot-Garcia returned to France in October 1848. Once again, her actions were not particularly subversive or antibourgeois. The Viardots had just bought a comfortable house in the rural outskirts of Paris, on 48 Rue de Douai, 494 a few streets away from the studio-villa of their good friend, the painter Ary Scheffer. Remembering Sand’s bitter recriminations after the acquisition of Courtavenel, Viardot-Garcia, in a letter written in December 1848, tried to justify her decision to buy new property in the aftermath of the revolution:

---


494 Today the Viardots’ house no longer stands. The edifice which took its place is close to Montmartre, particularly to the Moulin Rouge.
On a absolument voulu faire de moi une propriétaire—eh bien, soit, mais ce ne sera pas à mon profit—. . . Nous avons employé toutes les espèces d’ouvriers, les maçons exceptés, et notre argent a passé dans leurs mains. . . . Ma foi, s’il vient un jour où la propriété soit détruite, je mettrai moi-même le feu aux quatre coins de ma maison, je mettrai dans mon paquet de voyage mes petits talents et ma gaieté et « va comme je te pusse » je marcherai droit devant l’orage—je suis sure que je ne manquerai pas de compagnons de route—n’est ce pas ma mignounne?495

I have absolutely been forced to become a proprietress—all right, so be it, but it will not be to my profit—. . . With the exception of masons, [Louis] and I have given employment to all kinds of workers, and our money has passed to their hands. . . . Truly, if a day comes when property is destroyed, I will set fire to the four corners of my house, I will place in my traveling pack my little talents and my cheerfulness and “as fast as I can” I will walk straight towards the storm—I am sure that I will not lack a traveling companion—is it not true, mignounne?

In these words it seems that Pauline wants to convince Sand—perhaps even herself—that time had not changed her ideals or priorities, that despite all her worldly success, she, like Consuelo, la zingara della consolatione, the Saint-Simonian priestess, was still ready to put all else aside to work silently and anonymously towards the construction of an equal and just society. Despite these affirmations, Viardot-Garcia had been marked by all her struggles and successes. She was no longer the talented and malleable teenager that Sand had idealized in Consuelo. She had matured into an artist with a personal vision of music and the human experience. From this point onwards, she would privilege her own artistic flourishing and that of others.

That winter Viardot-Garcia needed her hard-earned house in Paris. Here she could get ready for the biggest challenge of her career, her first appearance at the Paris...
Apart from singing in productions of Les Huguenots, Norma, and Don Giovanni, she was to prepare the role of Fidès for the premiere of Meyerbeer’s new work, Le Prophète. The first production was meant to be a spectacular, lavish event. All music lovers in Europe eagerly awaited the premiere, for which no expense was spared; after all, Meyerbeer had not produced a grand opera for thirteen years! Novel extravagant numbers and stage effects were being planned, including a ballet where the dancers skated, supposedly on ice (i.e. Pas des patineurs) and a sunrise achieved through the employment of electricity. Yet in December 1848—four months before the premiere—Meyerbeer’s gargantuan final version of the score—conceived to take full advantage of the voices of Viardot-Garcia and of the tenor Roger—was still far from being ready. Many cuts were still necessary as well as major revisions of the principal roles. A letter that Pauline wrote to George Sand at the beginning of December makes it clear that she was still unacquainted with her full role:

---

496 Pauline had not sang an operatic role in Paris, after the press’ scandalous reception of her interpretation on the winter of 1842-1843. See Chapter 4 of the present dissertation.

Je suis déjà en train de travailler au Prophète, que le gd. Maestro me fait connaître bouchée par bouchée. Toutes ces bouchées finiront par former un grand plat, et un bon. C’est très simple, très noble, très dramatique, et par conséquent très beau. Je suis très heureuse d’avoir une perspective aussi intéressante pour mon hiver. Il me faut du travail, beaucoup de travail, c’est ce que m’a sauvée jusqu’au présent, ce sera, je l’espère, ma sauvegarde pendant aussi longtemps que j’aurai une voix, des yeux et des bras...  

I have already began to work on Prophète, which the great Maestro is teaching me mouthful by mouthful. All of these mouthfuls will end up forming a great, good plate. [The work] is very simple, noble, and dramatic and consequently, very beautiful. I am very happy to have such an interesting prospect for my winter. I need work, a lot of work. This is what has saved me up until now, and it will be, I hope, my safeguard for as long as I have voice, eyes, and arms.

During the four months of rehearsal before the premiere, Meyerbeer—with his characteristic intelligence and theatrical cunning—was not insensitive to the many suggestions presented by those involved in the project. It is well known, for example, that Meyerbeer made several cuts to the role of Jean based on Mme Roger’s outspoken misgivings on the length and difficulty of her husband’s part. According to the memoirs of Viardot-Garcia’s oldest daughter, Louise, her mother also played an important part in fine-tuning the dramatic and musical role of Fidès:

On sait que c’est à son intention que Meyerbeer écrivit le rôle de Fidès du Prophète; mais on ignore généralement comment fut compose ce rôle: Meyerbeer appréciait à sa juste valeur le sens critique de ma mère; de sorte que, chaque fois qu’elle rejetait, comme ne lui plaisant pas, des passages de cet opéra, il lui apportait deux ou trois versions de chaque morceau afin qu’elle choisit celle qu’elle préférait. S’il n’en avait pas été ainsi, le rôle de Fidès aurait été insipide, ce qu’on saurait guère lui reprocher d’être aujourd’hui.  

498 Pauline Viardot-García to George Sand, Paris, December 6, 1848 in Lettres inédites, ed. Thérèse Marix-Spire, 256.  

499 Louise Héritte-Viardot. Mémoires de Louise Héritte-Viardot. Une Famille de grands musiciens : notes et souvenirs anecdotiques sur Garcia, Pauline Viardot, La Malibran, Louise
It was for [my mother] that Meyerbeer wrote the part of Fidès in *Le Prophéte*; but many ignore how this role was composed: Meyerbeer had a full appreciation of her critical sense; so that, each time that she disliked or rejected a passage of the opera, he brought two or three versions of that number to her so that she could choose the one which she preferred. If it had not been so, the role of Fidès would have been boring, something which you cannot say of it today.

Perhaps Héritte-Viardot exaggerated her mother’s involvement in the creation of the role. In 1849 she was only eight years old, and her memories of the period might not be very trustworthy. This comment, however, is probably based on her mother’s recollections, therefore it might be unwise to dismiss her words entirely, particularly if we take into consideration that in the next ten years, Viardot-Garcia served as musical advisor to two other major composers, first to Gounod during the Spring of 1850, and then to Berlioz in 1859 and 1860. Both of these composers—who at the time were also romantically infatuated with Pauline—left letters expressing their gratitude for her musical advice. An extract from a letter written by Berlioz to Pauline on January 25, 1859, gives the reader an idea of how highly the composer of *Les Troyens* regarded her musical criteria:

---


---

500 Viardot-Garcia not only served as musical advisor to Gounod in 1850-1851; for all practical matters, she launched his operatic career. See the envoi of the present dissertation and Thérèse Marix-Spire, “Gounod and his First Interpreter, Pauline Viardot,” part I, *The Musical Quarterly* 31, no. 2 (April 1945), 193-211.

501 For a detailed study of Berlioz’s emotional and creative involvement with Viardot-Garcia, see Patrick Waddington, “Pauline Viardot-Garcia as Berlioz Counselor and Physician,” *The Musical Quarterly* 59, no. 3 (July 1973), 382-98.
J'ai bien travaillé hier; il a fallu porter le feu et la cognée dans le finale où vous n'avez fait que de timides remarques. Je crois qu'il va très bien maintenant. Que ne vous dois-je pas pour avoir attiré mon attention sur tant et tant de défauts graves? Mais vous verrez que cela finira par être beau, beau comme votre sentiment de l'art, beau comme votre génie, beau comme votre âme est belle, beau comme tout en vous est beau.  

I worked very well yesterday; it was necessary to bring fire and intensity to the finale, on which you have made only timid remarks. I think it is now very effective. What don't I owe you for having brought to my attention so many serious defects? But you shall see that [Les Troyens] will end up being beautiful, beautiful as your sentiment of art, beautiful as your genius, beautiful as your soul, beautiful as your entire being.

It is then not surprising that Louise affirmed in her memoirs that her mother during these years “composed and collaborated, generally anonymously, in important works.”

Pauline’s correspondence with George Sand during the first months of 1849 is a testimony of how carefully the singer prepared the role of Fidès. She nearly exhausted herself—both on the stage and off it—figuring out every single detail of her interpretation. She was convinced that her future relationship with the Paris Opéra depended directly on her successful creation of the role. She was largely rewarded when the première came: The French press and public were mesmerized by the tragic heights that she achieved. When George Sand learned of her achievement on the day of the première she wrote to her from Nohant:

---


503 “[Ma mère] composait et collaborait (généralement de façon anonyme) à des ouvrages importants. . . . ” Louise Héritte-Viardot, Une Famille de grands musiciens, 65.
Eh bien . . . je vous l’avais prédit. Vous êtes dans toute la force de votre voix, de votre âme et de votre génie, vous avez enfin gagné la grande bataille. Vous avez eu un succès fou, étourdissant. . . . [J]e suis heureuse que tout cela s’arrange pour vous poser enfin là, où depuis longtemps vous deviez être, c’est-à-dire au 1er rang, sur le 1er théâtre du monde, avec l’œuvre du premier maestro vivant. . . .

And so . . . I foretold it to you. You are now in full command of your voice, your soul, and your genius, you have at long last won the great battle. You have had a mad, astounding success. . . . I am pleased that all [the circumstances] gathered so that you could finally reach the place where you should have been a long time ago, in other words, in the first rank, in the best theater of the world, singing the opera of the greatest living maestro. . . .

When the successful production— with brand new cuts made by Meyerbeer— was taken to London in July 1849, the English press was also thoroughly impressed by her interpretation:

Madame Viardot’s impersonation of Fides is one of the highest exhibitions of dramatic and musical art that has been witnessed on the lyric stage. The character is developed with consummate skill, and is gradually worked up, as the interest of the drama and the music progresses, from the quiet contentedness of the humble peasant to the tragic grandeur of the devoted heroine whom fate and circumstances have forced above her ordinary nature. . . . We have no time to enter into details at present about Madame Viardot’s singing, but it is enough to say that it was admirable throughout, that the bravura air of the fourth act was a grand piece of energetic execution, and that in the pathetic and brilliant styles she was equally good and equally delighted the audience . . .

Viardot-Garcia’s involvement with the first production of Le Prophète marked the beginning of the most successful period of her career. The doors of the Paris Opéra had finally opened to her, and her reputation in France as one of the greatest living singers

504 George Sand to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Nohant, April 19 or 20, 1849, in Lettres inédites, ed. Thérèse Marix-Spire, 274.

505 James W. Davison, “Royal Italian Opera,” The Times (Wednesday, July 25, 1849).
was now undeniable. 1849 and 1850 brought repeated performances of Fidès; incredibly, she would play the role more than a hundred times in the next few years. As artist and musician, this was a somewhat wearisome experience, but it allowed her to propel other aspects of her career, and to help, through her newly acquired influence, many emerging figures of the musical world, including Charles Gounod and Camille Saint-Saëns.

Viardot-Garcia’s heightened fame also helped her to promote her compositions in France and abroad. In contrast to the publication of her first song collection in 1843, which was largely ignored by the press, the Album Viardot de 1850 received much publicity and praise in both France and England. As we shall see in the next chapter, this collection of ten songs, which appeared at the end of 1849, was enthusiastically reviewed by the French critic Henri Blanchard and by the singer’s close friend and admirer, the English writer Henry Chorley.

In the six years which separated the publication of her first and second album, Pauline developed as a singer; her rise to international fame did not occur overnight or without personal sacrifice and struggle. In maturing as artist and woman, she lost touch with some of the strong idealism which had guided her teenage years. Demanding professional circumstances had forced her to make difficult practical choices—sometimes precipitously, sometimes with great calculation—which had important consequences in her personal life. After knowing Turgenev, for example, she realized that the relationship with her husband, albeit being pleasant and friendly, would never be truly amorous. She also sacrificed intimacy with her young daughter in order to develop her singing career, a decision which later on, she would come to regret. She also had to reconsider aspects of her relationship with close friends such as Frédéric Chopin, George
Sand, and Clara Schumann. As a composer, one can say that these were frustrating years, in which she seldom found the time to write down her ideas. In the next chapter, we shall see the consequences that these limiting factors had on her compositional output.
CHAPTER 7

STRUGGLING TO KEEP THE BALANCE: 
SIMPLICITY MEETS SOPHISTICATION IN L’ALBUM VIARDOT DE 1850

In the last months of 1849, Viardot-Garcia’s second collection of songs was published in Paris by Louis Brandus, under the title L’Album Viardot de 1850.506

Brandus, who had begun his enterprise in 1846, often collaborated with the publishing house of Viardot-Garcia’s friend, Eugène-Theodore Troupenas.507 In 1849, however, Troupenas was fatally ill. This might have prompted the singer to turn to Brandus for the release of her second album.508

As was previously discussed, Viardot-Garcia had been planning a second album of songs for almost six years. As early as 1847, she could have published a collection of eight songs—the same number of compositions which were found in her first album of 1843. “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6), “Marie et Julie” (PVG.s.sII.8), and “L’Absence”/Caña Española (PVG.s.II.3), for example, were most probably completed by around 1844.509 Furthermore, “Une fleur” (PVG.s.0.4.f) had been published independently in 1843; it would be renamed and republished in L’Album Viardot de 1850 as “Un jour de printemps” (PVG.s.II.4). Although Viardot-Garcia would not include in the second album her ambitious setting of La Fontaine’s “Le Savetier et le financier,” it had been

---

506 For a detailed overview of the ten songs in this collection see appendix C.

507 Viardot-Garcia’s patriotic hymn, La Jeune République, for example, was released by both publishing firms in 1848.

508 Troupenas died in April 1850. That same year Brandus purchased his firm.

509 Sketches and drafts for these compositions can be found in the black notebook now at Houghton Library, Harvard University, a sketchbook which the composer did not employ after 1845 or 1846.
completed in the spring of 1845. Additionally, two letters of Turgenev from December 1847 indicate that “La Luciole” (PVG.s.II.9), “La Petite chevrière” (PVG.s.II.2), and “La Chanson de Loïc” (PVG.s.II.7) were finished that summer.\textsuperscript{510} Probably Viardot-Garcia lacked the time to complete or order fair copies of these eight works for her publisher in 1847, but it is clear that she had more than enough unpublished material to release a second collection at the time.

Whichever the reason for the hold-up in publication, it worked favorably for the reception of \textit{L’Album Viardot de 1850}. As discussed in Chapter 6, Viardot-Garcia’s reputation in France and England after the premiere of \textit{Le Prophète} in April 1849 was at its peak. Her fame as a singer heightened the interest of the public and the press in her newly published compositions. Two important music critics wrote celebratory reviews of the collection shortly after its publication: Henri Blanchard in \textit{La Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris} and Henry Chorley in London’s \textit{The Anathaeum}.

In his review of the collection, Blanchard, who had known Viardot-Garcia since at least 1838, characterized her compositional talent as both unconventional and original. According to him, her songs confronted the formal, harmonic, and expressive limitations of the salon \textit{romance} with imaginative freshness:

\textsuperscript{510} For information on the genesis of these eight compositions see chapter 6.
La République voit surgir une nouvelle muse de la romance, du lied (sic), de la mélodie fantaisie, Pauline Garcia-Viardot . . . vient donc de publier un album pour l’année 1850, renfermant des mélodies caractéristiques ornées d’accompagnements pittoresques qui disent parfois autant que le chant et complément on ne peux mieux ces charmantes fantaisies qui ne sont pas jetées dans le moule ordinaire de ces petites compositions. Ce qui, dans ce recueil, doit plaire à l’artiste, au rêveur, à la jeune fille pensive et musicienne, c’est le caprice, la fantaisie, l’irrégulière variété de l’auteur dans l’expression de sa pensée musicale ; c’est parfois l’heureux oubli de l’éternelle romance à trois couplets obligés.  

The Republic has seen the birth of a new muse of the romance, the Lied, and the fanciful mélodie. Pauline Garcia-Viardot . . . has just published an album for 1850, which encompasses melodies of sharp character decorated by picturesque accompaniments, which often say as much as the vocal line and complement faultlessly these charming musical fantasies. [The songs] are not casted in the ordinary mold of these small compositions. The artist, the dreamer, and the young pensive girl who is a musician should be pleased to find in this collection caprice, fantasy, and an irregular variety in the expression of the composer’s musical thoughts. It is perhaps the happy oblivion of the eternal romance with three obligatory couplets.

For Blanchard, Viardot-Garcia stood as the innovative and worthy successor of Loïsa Puget (1810-1889), the prolific and popular composer/singer of salon romances.  

Blanchard had repeatedly praised Puget’s illustrated albums until her virtual retirement from public life and composition in 1845, when she married the lyricist and actor Gustave Lemoine.  

Henry Chorley’s review of the collection in The Anathaeum gave an acute analysis of Viardot-Garcia’s cosmopolitan musical style:

---

511 Henri Blanchard, “Album de Mme Pauline Viardot,” Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris 51, no. 51 (December 23, 1849), 399.  

512 For more on the compositions of Loïsa Puget see chapter 2.
These compositions by Pauline Viardot are better than much which passes for good music: they are individual in style—not assuredly Italian—not strictly German—not precisely French. Their originality does not reside in their “melodies” so much as in their entire structure. In many cases the accompaniment is not an accessory to the song, it is an essential. . . . On the whole, there is no examining this collection of mélodies (unpretending and ephemeral though the form be) without receiving the impression that Madame Viardot is capable of doing in her art what no woman before her has done; in more ways than one . . . she throws out evidences of power to imagine and to complete works which, without indulgence or qualification, shall take their place amongst the best music of like form and order written by men.513

Throughout his analysis, the author pays particular attention to the composer’s flexible management of harmony, accompaniment, form, and text-setting. Chorley notes Viardot-Garcia’s recurrent emulation of popular music (i.e. villanelle, tarantella, siciliana, etc.) in the collection and the individuality that she is able to imprint to these derivative compositions. Throughout the present chapter, the opinions of Chorley and Blanchard will be quoted often.

Whereas the songs of Viardot-Garcia’s first album carried dedications to close friends, family members, and professional acquaintances residing in Paris, the various origins and reputations of the dedicatees of the second collection make evident the scope of the singer’s international career. Two of her noble Russian friends who were also musicians, General Alexei Lvov and Count Mathieu Wielhorsky, received dedications for “Villanelle” (PVG.s.II.5) and “Un jour de printemps”/Caprice (PVG.s.II.4) respectively. An eccentric English patroness, Lady Thomas Monson, who shared the Viardots’ friendship with Charles Dickens, was the dedicatee for “Solitude”

(PVG.s.II.1).\footnote{514} “L’Absence”/\textit{Caña Española} (PVG.s.II.3) was dedicated to Meyerbeer and “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6) to her new admirer, Hector Berlioz. Famous singers who had appeared next to her in London and Paris in \textit{Les Huguenots} and \textit{Le Prophète} also obtained her favor: Gustave-Hyppolyte Roger received the dedication for the only song in the collection conceived for tenor voice, “Marie et Julie” (PVG.s.II.8). “La Chanson de Loïc,” in turn, was dedicated to one of the favorite singers of Rossini, the contralto Marietta Alboni. A singer who was very popular at the time in Parisian salons, Mme. Gaveaux-Sabatier, was the dedicatee of “La Petite chevrière” (PVG.s.II.2)—doubtlessly to encourage her to perform Viardot-Garcia’s compositions in these social and artistic spaces. Only one of the relatives of the composer received a dedication for a song, her first cousin Antonia Sitchès, a singer who, as was discussed in chapter 6, benefited from Viardot-Garcia’s exhaustive voice lessons in Courtavenel during the summer of 1844. In 1849, Antonia married the Belgian violinist, pedagogue, and composer Hubert Léonard; the dedication of the composer’s brilliant and festive “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10) perhaps served to celebrate this event.

The second album includes in its initial pages a masterful etching by Achille Martinet,\footnote{515} reproducing Ary Scheffer’s portrait of the composer.\footnote{516} The individual front covers for the songs, however, were not drawn by Scheffer or etched by Martinet. Instead, the drawings for the covers were quickly realized by various illustrators who

\footnote{514} For more information on the Viardots’ friendship with Lady Monson, see Barbara Kendall-Davies, “Pauline Viardot Garcia en Angleterre,” \textit{Cahiers Ivan Tourguéniev, Pauline Viardot, Maria Malibran} 22 (1998), 68.

\footnote{515} Achille Martinet (1806-1877) received the \textit{Grand prix de Rome} in 1830. He spent three years at the Villa Medici, which was then under the direction of Ingres. He made remarkably detailed etchings of paintings by Murillo, Ingres, Scheffer, and Fleury.

\footnote{516} For a reproduction of Ary Scheffer’s portrait, see Figure 4.2., 216.
collaborated with the Brandus firm (i.e. Victor Coindre, F. Teichet, Charles Bour, and Frédéric Bouchot). Among them, Victor Coindre—known for his republican sympathies and for his drawings of the June days in 1848—and Frédéric Bouchot—a caricaturist who contributed regularly to journals such as *Le Charivari, La Caricature* and *Journal pour rire*—were the most accomplished. The former’s illustration for “Tarentelle” with its competently realized landscape and figures is presented in Figure 7.1:

Figure 7.1. Victor Coindre, drawing, Thierry frères, printmakers, title page for “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10, litograph, ca. 1849.
Most illustrations for the *Album Viardot de 1850*, however, were mediocre and artificial, appealing to the sugary tastes of the bourgeoisie. The flowery image that F. Teichet produced for the front cover of “Marie et Julie,” reproduced in Figure 7.2, reflects the sexual fantasies of men of the era. A young fellow overlooks—and perhaps wishes to control—two passive and sweet young girls, completely unaware of his presence:

Figure 7.2. F. Teichet, drawing, Thierry frères, printmakers, title page for “Marie et Julie,” PVG.s.II.8, lithograph, ca. 1849.
Though Blanchard in his review of Pauline’s second album praised the quality of these images, Henry Chorley began his article with the following ironic comment on them:

The other day M. Berlioz characterized this New Year’s book as an album containing nothing good—save the music. To perfidious English eyes, also, its binding appears more tawdry than substantial. Its illustrations are common-place expositions of Sentimentality in a boat-cloak, Sentimentality with a Samson’s beard,—Sentimentality in a fancy peasant costume.517

It seems that Chorley did not share the taste for stereotyped sappy poses and backgrounds, ordinary occurrences in illustrations of the Victorian era. The most relevant aspect in the critic’s comment, however, is his testimony of Berlioz’s positive reception of Viardot-Garcia’s compositions,518 despite its sentimental illustrations and perhaps, even, despite of what the composer of Les Nuits d’été might have deemed as an inferior choice of poetry.519

Viardot-Garcia’s own reaction to the illustrations employed by Brandus is not known. As an observant visual artist, she must have noticed the second-rate quality of many of them. It is difficult to believe, however, that she did not see and approve these

517 Henry Chorley, “Dix Mélodies par Pauline Viardot,” 79

518 Berlioz had become fully acquainted with the influential critic in 1847, during his first trip to England; although Chorley translated to English excerpts from La Damnation de Faust and L’Enfance du Christ for publication and the London stage, their relationship was not always positive. See Monir Tayeb and Michel Austin, “Berlioz in London: Friends and Acquaintances,” The Hector Berlioz Website. http://www.hberlioz.com/London/BLfriends.htm#chorley (accessed, January 2, 2010).

519 This last point seems doubtful, however. After all, Berlioz’s own taste in poetry was not always impeccable. Besides setting several poems of one of the most representative poets of Viardot-Garcia’s first and second song collections, Édouard Turquety, he favored Romantic poets such as Roger de Beauvoir and Adolphe de Bouclon, who today are virtually unknown.
images before the album’s initial publication. A description of the most general compositional aspects of this collection follows.

Although it would be reasonable to attribute the relative musical simplicity of many of the works in Viardot-Garcia’s second album—particularly when compared to many of her earlier publications—to the demands imposed on her time by career and family, I believe that there also exists an aesthetic component to her stylistic choices. These might have been a response to her compositional preference, at the time, for the immediate and simple eloquence of the popular style as understood by George Sand and other Romantic writers and composers. When creating many of these compositions, Pauline could have—consciously or unconsciously—adopted the mask of Sand’s Consuelo, the roaming gypsy who in her improvisations and compositions holds a mirror to the sensibility of the simple folk. This does not mean, of course, that Viardot-Garcia had not shown, previous to the publication of Sand’s novel, an interest in interpreting and emulating popular styles; after all, some of her initial successes in Paris during the late 1830s and early 1840s were linked to her convincing interpretations of Spanish and Mexican songs. Literary critic Simone Vierne further elucidates this point:

_Quoi a été le moteur premier de cet intérêt ? La question est vaine (et insoluble) En réalité [George Sand et Pauline Viardot] sont fascinées par cette musique qui vient des « sources ». . . . C’est que pour les deux artistes, il ne fait pas de doute que l’art est un, de la chanson populaire aux compositions musicales et littéraires plus savantes. Mais elles sont toutes deux persuadées aussi que le « peuple-poète » comme dit Consuelo, est celui qui est capable de renouveler l’art, comme il doit sauver et régénérer le monde._

Who initially generates this interest [in popular music]? The question is futile (and unsolvable). In reality [George Sand and Pauline Viardot] were both fascinated by the music which springs from the “sources” . . . For both artists there is no doubt that art was a continuum, from popular song to the most cultivated musical and literary compositions. Yet both of them were convinced that the “poetic people,” as Consuelo states, were the only ones capable of renewing art, just as they should know how to save and regenerate the world.

Viardot-Garcia’s admiration of popular poetry and its Romantic emulations can already be perceived in her first collection of songs, in which, she included settings for two “Swiss” ballads of Uhland, “L’Enfant de la montagne” (PVG.s.I.1) and “La Chapelle” (PVG.s.I.2), and the lyrics of a supposed Serbian song, “L’ Abricotier” (PVG.s.I.3). The complex harmonic treatment and virtuosity in both the vocal parts and accompaniments of these three compositions, however, place them far away from the aesthetic universe of folk music. The emulation of popular music from several parts of Europe, on the other hand, is more evident in her second collection.

Despite the fact that Viardot-Garcia’s second album was composed slowly and unevenly over a period of more than ten years, one notes a persistent development of specific aesthetic concepts in many of its compositions. Mainly, a consistent search for expressive authenticity through the simplification of rhythmic, melodic, and/or harmonic resources often coexists with a sophisticated command of the composition’s overall form and musical details. The compositional quest to achieve a balance between the simplicity of popular music and the sophistication of art song can be detected in many of the composer’s musical thoughts.

Not only does the composer include in the collection works inspired by the strong rhythmic contours of traditional dances and songs such as a Spanish caña (“L’Absence,”
PVG.s.II.3), a tarantella (“Tarantelle,” PVG.s.II.10), a siciliana (“Solitude,” PVG.s.II.1), a Polish mazurka (“Un jour de printemps”/Caprice, PVG.s.II.4), and a French villanelle (“Villanelle,” PVG.s.II.5), but the collection also includes texts describing idealized popular types such as a goatherdess (“La Petite chevrière,” PVG.s.II.2) and a cattle-herder (“La Chanson de Loïc,” PVG.s.II.7). Some of the uncomplicated and direct lyrics might have even been written by Viardot-Garcia. This might be the case particularly with two songs, “L’Absence” and “Tarentelle.”

Shortly after the publication of the second album, George Sand had the opportunity of studying its first four songs. The reaction of the writer of Consuelo to these works reveals that she had recognized in them a mirror to her most cherished aesthetic ideals in music:

*Je connais à fond maintenant les quatre premières pièces de votre album. Je ne m’y suis mise qu’il y a deux jours parce que je voulais en faire une étude particulière. Je trouve que la Chevrière, et la Romance espagnole sont deux chefs-d’œuvre sans un grain de poussière, et j’ai peur pour votre grand compositeur [Gounod] qu’il n’ait pas dans toute sa vie deux idées comme celles-là . . .*

I thoroughly know now the first four pieces of your album. I wanted to make a particular study of it, so I applied myself to its study for two days. I find that the Chevrière, and the Spanish Romance are two masterpieces without a single defect, and I fear for your great composer [Gounod], who has not had in all his life two ideas like these . . .

It is significant that Sand was most attracted to the songs which expressed in straightforward musical terms the sentiments of supposed popular types, the innocent goatherdess in “La Petite chevrière,” with her love of animals and nature and her

---

rejection of the cruelty engendered by society,\textsuperscript{522} and the abandoned woman in
“L’Absence”/\textit{Caña Española}, whose obsessive lament is a direct manifestation of the
guttural, expressive dances and songs of Andalusian gypsies. The anonymous lyrics of
these two songs were more appealing to Sand than the two poems of Édouard Turquety,
“Solitude” (PVG.s.II.1) and “Un jour de printemps”/\textit{Caprice} (PVG.s.II.4), which Pauline
set in the first and fourth songs of the album. From Sand’s letter, it is also clear that
despite the repeated praises that Viardot-Garcia had made of Gounod’s music during the
last months of 1849, the writer remained unconvinced of his personal and artistic
qualities.\textsuperscript{523}

In a majority of the songs, there is an abundance of musical resources which
emulate elements characteristic of popular music, including ostinato rhythmic figures,
drones, and the imitation in the accompaniment of instruments often employed in folk
genres such as the guitar, castanets, and tambourine. In contrast to many of the songs in
the first collection, a good number of these compositions have immediately recognizable
formal outlines. Strophic, modified strophic, and ternary forms are readily identifiable.
The vocal parts of these songs also display a search for the spirit of the folk. Yodeling
calls, for example, are present in “La Petite chevrière” and an attractive sequence of
nonsense syllables, reproduced in Example 7.1, is attached to the most memorable
melodic phrases of “La Chanson de Loïc:”

\textsuperscript{522} For a brief discussion of this song see chapter 5.

\textsuperscript{523} At the time Viardot-Garcia was closely collaborating with Gounod in the creation of
his first opera, \textit{Sappho}. For a detailed study of the singer’s artistic and personal relationship with
Gounod see Thérèse Marix-Spire, “Gounod and his First Interpreter, Pauline Viardot,” parts 1-2,
\textit{The Musical Quarterly} 31, no. 2 and 3 (April and July 1945), 193-211 and 299-317.
This extract also exemplifies directness in harmonic language and modulatory resources. Viardot-Garcia’s search for musical simplicity and popular “authenticity” in the collection at times results in a primitive and repetitive employment of non-functional ostinato figures. The most striking case of this tendency can be found in “L’Absence”/Caña Española, a song which will be discussed in detail further ahead.
In her letters to Sand during the 1840s, Viardot-Garcia at times reiterates the writer’s musical aesthetics, even when popular music is not involved. When describing for Sand the style of Meyerbeer’s *Le Prophète*, for example, she comments: “It is very simple, very noble, very dramatic, and consequently, very beautiful.” This sentence could have well been extracted from Sand’s descriptions of Consuelo’s improvisations and compositions. There is no reason to believe that Viardot-Garcia would have not desired the same stylistic qualities in her own compositions, even in those that combined characteristic popular rhythms with intimate lyrical poetry. Such is the case in her melancholic and beautiful setting of Turquety’s “Villanelle.” The first and last strophes of this work, originally found in the poet’s *Esquisses poétiques* (1829), are presented below:

---


525 See chapter 4.
Voici venir sur la pelouse
Les rayons du soleil qui meurt :
Avec son murmure endormeur
Voici venir l’ombre jalouse :
J’écoute, et les voix du printemps
Font gémir la feuille éveillée.
J’aime le soir et la veillée :
La veillée est douce, et j’attends.

... 

Si, du moins, dans le vallon même
Où le soir je viens l’appeler,
J’entendais doucement parler
Celle que je pleure et qui m’aime ;
Je crois l’entendre par instants,
Mais c’est quelque feuille envolée.
Ah ! je n’aime plus la veillée :
La veillée est triste, et j’attends

... 

Here come upon the plain
The rays of the dying sun:
With its lethargic murmur,
Here comes the jealous shade:
I listen as the voices of spring
Make the roused foliage moan.
I love the evening and the vigil
The vigil is sweet as I wait.

If at least in this small valley
Where I cry out her name each evening,
I heard the gentle words
Of the beloved for whom I weep;
I believe I hear her at times,
Yet it is naught but a flying leaf.
Oh! I cannot love any more the vigil:
The vigil is sad as I wait.

The poem’s symbolic language represents not only the fall of night upon a plain during a spring evening, but the mixed emotions of the poetic persona as he waits and yearns for a beloved who does not return his devotion. The image of the leaf carried by the wind at the end of the last strophe, for example, serves as a metaphor for the fragility of his hopes and expectations. As was discussed in chapter 5, Turquety’s Romantic poetry often distorts natural phenomena to better reflect the inner psychology of his poetic persona.

In Viardot-Garcia’s strophic setting of “Villanelle,” the musical expression of this poetic ideas is quite straightforward. In the first musical strophe, as the singer invokes the “voices of spring” in an arch-shaped vocal line, the sparse and repetitive accompaniment—characteristic of French Romantic villanelles in duple meter—blooms into triplet rhythmic figures (mm. 18-26). Simple modal mixture colors central imagery such as “the jealous shade” (mm.15-17), and a sustained pause at the end of the

See for example Berlioz’s setting of Théophile Gautier’s “Villanelle” in Les Nuits d’été and Henri Reber’s own version of the same text.
musical strophe illustrates the singer’s anticipation of “the sweet vigil” (m. 34). The song’s first musical strophe is reproduced in Example 7.2:

Chorley expressed the apparent contradiction between musical simplicity and increased vocal expression in the following comment: “[Some] of the “melodies” are more purely vocal. . . . The “Villanelle” will, perhaps, prove the most enticing canvas for the singer among the half score here collected.”

At this point it should be clarified that some of the songs in the album—particularly those based on the refined Romantic poetry of Gustave de Larenaudière (1812-1862)—“Marie et Julie” (PVG.s.II.8), “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6), and “La Luciole” (PVG.s.II.9)—do not aim to emulate popular music. These three songs are French mélodies, rooted in the world of the Parisian salon and more sophisticated in their employment of musical resources. Not surprisingly, these works caught the full attention of critics Chorley and Blanchard. The former made the following observations about “Marie et Julie”:

In “Marie et Julie, [the accompaniment’s] vacillation and changes of modulation convey the indecision of the Paris who balances his admiration for the pair of divinities whom he worships;—voice and piano combining to produce one of the most complete illustrations of a mood in mind existing in music. We do not recollect a lied by Schubert more complete than this. We do not recollect any with so much finesse. . . .

Chorley was a smart critic capable of pinpointing the creative strengths of an individual composer. Viardot-Garcia’s considerable talent for musical characterization has been discussed and exemplified repeatedly throughout the previous chapters. It is this

---

528 Ibid.
compositional aptitude which impressed the English critic sufficiently to make a direct comparison with Schubert’s Lieder.

A short extract of this song is reproduced in Example 7.3. The accompaniment’s subtle shifts in harmonic coloring are beautiful, portraying the yearning vacillations of the poetic persona:

Example 7.3. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “Marie et Julie,” PVG.s.II.8, mm. 24-44.

Modal mixture, repetitive rhythmic figures, and median shifts are, of course, also characteristic of many of Schubert’s Lieder, for example “Rastlose Liebe” and “Die Forelle.” In those works, Schubert signals hinge words in the poems by sudden modal shifts in the accompaniments’ repetitive rhythmic figures, just like Viardot-Garcia reacts here to the words “Mais j’aime” (m. 37) by lowering the third scale degree of the
preceding A major chord, thus reaching the proper mediant key and catching the attention of her listener.

Up until this point, Viardot-Garcia’s second album has been discussed in its most general musical and aesthetic aspects. For a more thorough technical and stylistic analysis, I have selected three contrasting compositions that can give the reader a sense of the variety of expression encompassed in the collection: Viardot-Garcia’s realization of an Andalucian caña, in “L’Absence” (PVG.s.II.3), her setting of Gustave de Larenaudière’s philosophical poem, “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6), and her invention of an Italian tarantella, “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10). Complete scores for these three works can be found in appendix E of the present dissertation.

According to a letter of Chopin to his family,\textsuperscript{529} Viardot-Garcia created “L’Absence”/Caña Española during a brief sojourn in Vienna in March or April of 1844. From 1844 to 1849, she performed it often with Spanish words in France, Russia, Germany, Poland, and England. An undated letter from 1858 to German composer and conductor Julius Rietz (1812-1877) makes it plain that this composition was hers and not a transcription or an adaptation of a popular song from Andalusia:

\textsuperscript{529} Frédéric Chopin to his family, Nohant, July 18, 1845. Segments of this letter are quoted in chapter 6.
Je veux pourtant vous raconter en quelques mots la soirée donnée à la Altenburg en mon honneur. Tout le ban et l’arrière de la Zukunft étaient présents . . . Comme je m’y attendais bien on m’a fait chanter. Savez-vous ce qui a fait le plus d’effet ? devinez—ma caña—et je n’avais pas [dit] de qui c’était—vous pouvez vous [imaginer] au Diapason très élevé d’exaltation qui donne le ton à la Altenburg le tapage qui a éclaté quand le nom de l’autor-esse a été prononcé—et c’est la princesse qui l’a deviné ! Oh les femmes sont fines !

I want to tell you in a few words about the soirée given at the Altenburg in my honor. All the vanguard and the rearguard of the [Music of the] Future were present . . . According to my expectations, they made me sing. Do you know what made the greatest impression? Guess? My caña—and I did not [say] by whom it was—you can [imagine], knowing the high pitch of exaltation to which the Altenburg is keyed up, the noise that burst out when the name of the author-ess was pronounced—and it was the Princess who guessed it! Oh, women are keen!

The source for the Spanish verses of Viardot-Garcia’s caña remains unknown. She might have heard them often when she was a child or during her tour in Madrid and Granada in 1843. She might have also created them at the same time that she was composing the music. Perhaps she could have even found them in a compilation of Spanish poems, although I have been unable to locate a historical or modern anthology which includes these coplas. The song was translated to French for its 1849 publication. The two original Spanish strophes, however, were included in miniscule typeset at the end of the score. A translation to English follows:

---

1 Si de tu ausencia no muero
2 Y con ella he de morir,
3 Digan que soy del mundo
4 La muger más infeliz.
5 Una palabra me distes
6 La que no me cumplirás,
7 Más yo cumpliré la mía
8 De no olvidaré jamás.

If I do not die from your absence
And I will die with it,
Let it be said that in the world
There is not an unhappier woman.
You gave me your word
And you will not keep it,
But I will keep my promise
Of never forgetting you.

The poetic structure of these two strophes—four octosyllabic verses, the second and fourth rhyming in assonance—corresponds to a cuarteta romanceada, typical of Andalusian folklore and in particular, of flamenco types of songs or palos known as polos and cañas.531 In the publication of 1849, several of the Spanish words lack acute accents, which I have decided to include in this transcription. The spelling of “muger” is also old-fashioned; in Spain, it had been standardized to “mujer” around 1750. This could indicate that the poem was created and/or published before the middle of the eighteenth century. Letters written in Spanish by members of the García family, on the other hand, often omit accents, use outdated spellings, and include awkward grammatical constructions closer to French than to Spanish,532 so it is still conceivable that Viardot-Garcia created or jotted down these verses from memory around 1844.

The French translator must have thought that the original lyrics of the song were too repetitive (i.e. with only two strophes for sixteen musical phrases), thus deciding to augment his or her version to four strophes of four verses each. In reality, repetition of verses still plays an important role in the translation since there are just four additional lines, which I have underlined in the copy below. Additionally, I have bolded the font of

---

531 Pedro Camacho Galindo, Andalucía y su Cante (Madrid, 1969), 86.

the two initial verses which are repeated in the French translation, functioning as poetic refrain:

1. Aux longs tourments de l’absence
2. Le seul remède est mourir.
3. Dans la triste indifférence,
4. Pourquoi si longtemps languir?
5. Sans repos, sans espérance?
6. Est-ce vivre que souffrir?
7. Aux longs tourments de l’absence
8. Le seul remède est mourir.
9. Lorsque je tiens ma promesse
10. Ingrat, de t’aimer toujours,
11. Peut-être une autre maîtresse
12. T’envivre d’autres amours.
13. C’est hélas ! trop de souffrance,
14. Je sens mon cœur défaillir
15. Ah ! des tourments de l’absence
16. Le seul remède est mourir.

The extended translation, which follows closely the phrase structure of the song (i.e. one poetic verse=one musical phrase), attempts, perhaps, to be more polished in its content and standardized in its meter and rhyme scheme than the original Spanish version. Although to some extent the meaning of the original lyrics is reflected in the French version, the translation somehow fails to capture the visceral emotions of the poetic persona. Additionally, the polished surface of the French verses clashes with the improvisatorial “cante jondo” style that Viardot-Garcia attempted to recreate in the vocal line of the composition.

Fortunately, it is not difficult to fit with correct prosodic phrasing the original eight Spanish verses to the song’s sixteen vocal phrases, which are invariably syllabic
with melismatic flourishes at their close. Ambivalence in the recreation of the Spanish version, however, is represented by the question of which verses should be repeated and at what time. The following possible solution is offered to the reader; for comparison purposes, it uses the same highlighting scheme as the one employed for the copy of the French translation.

1  Si de tu ausencia no muero  
2  Y con ella he de morir,  
3  Digan que soy del mundo  
4  La muger más infeliz.

3  Digan que soy del mundo  
4  La muger más infeliz.  
1  Si de tu ausencia no muero  
2  Y con ella he de morir.

5  Una palabra me distes  
6  La que no me cumplirás,  
7  Mas yo cumpliré la mía  
8  De no olvidarte jamás.

7  Mas yo cumpliré la mía  
8  De no olvidarte jamás  
1  Si de tu ausencia no muero  
2  Y con ella he de morir.

The Spanish verses in bold type repeat in the same pattern as those in the French translation so their placement within the sequence of vocal phrases in the song is certain.

In my Spanish version, those underlined verses which were new in the French version become reiterations of the previous two lines (i.e. verses 2 + 4 = verses 5 + 6 and verses 11 + 12 = verses 13 + 14). The immediate reiteration of verses—complete or partial—is not uncommon in modern examples of polos and cañas and offers a satisfactory solution
to interpret the song in its original language.\textsuperscript{533} For the subsequent musical analysis, I will employ this version of the Spanish text.

During the first decades of the nineteenth century, the \textit{caña} and the \textit{polo}, two closely related genres, enjoyed great success, being considered the finest types of flamenco song in Andalusia. Spanish ethnomusicologists have tried for decades to trace the origins of the different \textit{palos} or genres of flamenco song with little success. The first mention of these two types of song dates from the last decade of the eighteenth century: A certain \textit{cantaor} of gypsy extraction, Cristóbal Palmero—also known as “Tobalo El Polo”—interpreted these kinds of \textit{cante hondo} songs with great virtuosity.\textsuperscript{534} Few lyrics of \textit{polos} and \textit{cañas} were copied down during the nineteenth century, and no annotated musical example of an Andalusian \textit{caña} from the first half of the nineteenth century survives;\textsuperscript{535} furthermore, the various transformations that a song experiences through oral transmission seems to assure that few of the \textit{cañas} that we hear today correspond to those that were interpreted in the nineteenth century.

Taking this context into account, it is fascinating—and ethnomusicologically significant—to discover that the music and lyrics of Viardot-García’s \textit{caña} have important correlations with the few descriptions of this \textit{palo} made during the nineteenth century. There are two accounts which I will quote here. The first comes from \textit{Escenas

\textsuperscript{533} In the original score, Viardot-García marked Spanish verses 4 and 5 and 7 and 8 with brackets and a “bis;” this indicates that the composer wanted these two pairs of verses to be reiterated immediately.


Andalusias by Serafín Estébanez Calderón (1799-1867), a writer native of Málaga. This compilation of newspaper essays describing Andalusian characters and situations was first published in Madrid in 1847, three years after Pauline composed her caña in Vienna:

[L]a Caña . . . es el tronco primitivo de estos cantares . . . los Olés, las Tiranas, Polos y las modernas Serranas y Tonadas. [Se] parece con poca diferencia a la palabra “Gaunnia” que en árabe significa “el canto.” Nadie ignora que la Caña es un acento prolongado que principia por un suspiro, y que luego después recorre toda la escala y todos los tonos repitiendo por lo mismo un propio verso muchas veces, y concluyendo con otra copla por un aire más vivo, pero no por eso menos triste y lamentable. Los cantadores andaluces, que por ley general lo son la gente de a caballo y del camino, dan la primera palma a los que sobresalen en la Caña porque, viéndose obligados a apurar el cante, como ellos dicen, o es preciso que tengan mucho pecho y facultades, o que de pronto den al traste y se desluzcan. Por lo general la Caña no se baila, porque en ella el cantador o cantadora pretende hacer un papel exclusivo. . . . El canto principia también con un suspiro, la guitarra rompe primero con un suave son y melancólico por “Mi Menor.” El cantador o cantadora entra cuando bien le parece. Y son de muy notar, por cierto, los toques y particularidades de este canto que por lo mismo de ser tan melancólico y triste manifiesta honda y elocuentemente que es de música primitiva.536

[T]he Caña . . . is the primitive trunk of these songs . . . Olés, Tiranas, Polos and the modern Serranas and Tonadas. With little discrepancy [the word] is similar to the word “Gaunnia” which means in Arabian “song.” Nobody ignores that the Caña is a prolonged accent which begins with a sigh, and that afterwards runs all the scale and all the notes repeating many times its own verse. The Andalusian cantadores, who by general law are members of the people of the horse and the road, give their first applause to those that are outstanding in the Caña because, forced to accelerate the song, as they say, it is important that they have much breath control and faculties, otherwise they might fail and lose face. Generally the Caña is not danced, because in it, the cantador or cantadora pretends to play an exclusive role. . . . The song begins with a sigh, the guitar enters first with a soft and melancholic sound in E minor. The cantador or cantadora begins when s/he thinks best. One should notice, by the way, the chords and peculiarities of this song; since it is so melancholic and sad, it manifests profoundly and eloquently that it is primitive music.

536 Serafín Estébanez Calderón, “Asamblea general de los caballeros y damas de Triana, y toma de hábito en la orden de cierta rubia bailadora,” Escenas Andaluzas (Madrid, 1847), 162.
Estébanez Calderón probably did not possess much musical training; as a result, many of his observations seem vague. From his description, however, we can draw the following deductions relevant to our discussion of Viardot-García’s composition: 1) In the nineteenth century, the caña was considered to be an ancient type of song, having musical qualities which linked it to the centuries of Moorish occupation in Andalusia. 2) The caña was the direct ancestor of many of the palos or types of songs commonly interpreted by the gypsies (i.e. “people of the horse and the road”). 3) The caña, as described by the author, had two parts. The first one, which began with a “vocal sigh,” was followed by a section which was marked or “accented.” The initial section appears to have had a poetic/musical refrain, which repeated often. The second part, according to the author, was more virtuosic, intense, and fast, and 4) the melancholic and primitive musical qualities of this song manifested themselves in several perceived factors, including the idea that the caña’s tonality began in E minor. This last point seems confusing. How is E minor “primitive”? Based on modern examples of flamenco song, I believe Estébanez Calderón had difficulties expressing that the melodic line of the caña had elements of the Phrygian mode.

Since the caña is the manifestation of the personal and sorrowful emotions of a particular cantaor or cantaora, it appears that one should not consider it a purely folkloric genre. Individual expression, invention, and artistry—through the exploitation of stock procedures—seems key to its idiomatic success. Some of the observations made by Estébanez Calderón on the caña are enriched by the testimony of a virtuosic interpreter, whose career peaked in Seville during the 1880s and 1890s, the cantaor Antonio Chacón.
Pero, dirán mis lectores, ¿qué es la Caña? Musicalmente . . . es un cante que está en el mismo plano que las Soleares, es decir, compás ternario (3 x 4), y que guarda cierto parentesco musical con la Serrana, Alboreá, [y] Liviana. . . . Literariamente, cualquier copla romanceada le va bien y con versos octosílabos. Su copla se divide en dos partes con sus correspondientes ¡AYES! Y en cuanto a los “paseillos,” no existe una norma fija y determinante. Lo normal es que sean cinco, pero también caben perfectamente seis. Al término de la copla suele cantarse—no es necesario—“El Macho.”

But my readers will say, what is the Caña? Musically speaking . . . it is a song that is in the same category with the Soleares; in other words, it has a ternary meter (3 x 4). It also shows a certain musical relationship to the Serrana, Alboreá, [and] Liviana. . . . Literally, any copla romanceada with octosyllabic verses will fit well with the music. The lyrics can be divided into two parts, each with their corresponding ¡Ayes!. There is no established norm for the amount or type of its “paseillos” [sequences of dance steps]. Normally, there are five, but six can also fit perfectly well. At the end of the poem one can sing—but this is not necessary—the “Macho” (the refrain).

Chacón adds valuable and specific information about the musical characteristics of the caña. According to him, the lyrics fall into the poetic pattern of a copla romanceada, its musical form has two sections, and its meter corresponds to 3/4. Chacón also appears to elucidate several of Estébanez Calderón’s observations: 1) The “sustained sighs” described by Estébanez Calderón are the “ayes,” which are characteristic to this day of the expressive cante jondo style. According to Chacón, these appear at the beginning and/or end of the song’s two musical sections, and 2) Estébanez Calderón’s “own verse” is the “macho” or refrain of the song described by Chacón, which often, but not always, makes a final appearance after the caña’s last strophe.

Elements in the description by the famous cantaur, on the other hand, differ from the points in Escenas Andaluzas. Estébanez Calderón, for example, believed that the caña was seldom danced, whereas Chacón merely reflected that the sequence and types

---

537 Quoted in José Blas Vega, Vida y cante de Don Antonio Chacón (Madrid: Cinterco, 1990), 151.
of steps were not firmly established. Chacón and Estébanez Calderón also related the
caña to different palos of flamenco music and to different folkloric songs and dances of
Andalusia. These attempts to establish the philological relationships of palos—conceived
and transmitted within an oral tradition—can often result in arbitrary and controversial
conclusions, which are hard—if not impossible—to prove.

It is not difficult to discover correlations between Viardot-García’s caña and the
descriptions of the genre quoted above. These will be established as the composer’s piece
is analyzed.

Viardot-García’s song in its Spanish version employs two quatrains, which
correspond in their rhyming and metric format to the strophes of a copla romanceada.
The two-line refrain forms part of the first strophe; it reappears again in between both
and at the end of the second strophe; the refrain is thus, Chacón’s macho of the copla. Its
reappearance determines the song’s rondo form. Figure 7.3 presents the formal outline of
Viardot-García’s caña:
In Viardot-Garcia’s *caña*, the refrain or *macho* corresponds to section a of the rondo form; its reiterations (sections a’ and a’’) are prolonged by expressive “¡Ayes!” A study of the musical setting of the first statement of the *macho* reveals several links to Chacón and Estébanez Calderón’s descriptions. Example 7.4 reproduces the first 8 bars in the score:


Not only is Pauline’s *caña* in the triple meter indicated by Chacón, but the low vocal line of the refrain circles around the pitch d, which functions *de facto* as the “final” of a
melody in the Phrygian mode, very possibly the “primitive” and melancholic E minor mentioned by Estébanez Calderón. The sixteenth-note figures in the vocal line emphasize rhythmically and melodically the semitone-tone sequence characteristic of the first three steps of the Phrygian scale (i.e. D-E-flat-F). Later on in the song, many of the melismas in the vocal line also function as markers of this mode.

The accompaniment’s building cell is heard from the start. It is one-measure long and hypnotically static. The fast triplet figure which begins it can be heard as pianistic imitation of the rasgueado technique commonly employed by flamenco guitarists. In contrast, the staccato sixteen-note figures can be heard as imitations of castanets or the singer’s taconeado. The one-compass pattern repeats, with almost no variation, in the first statement of the refrain and its two subsequent reiterations. As Estébanez Calderón indicated, the initial figure could repeat indefinitely until the cantaor or cantaora decided the best moment to begin singing. Perhaps, he or she could also decide to improvise a series of “¡Ayes!” before beginning the refrain, something which is not uncommon in modern performances of polos and cañas and which Estébanez Calderón seems to hint when he indicates that the singer begins with a long sigh.

There is very little harmonic motion in the initial section, which is made up of a prolonged dominant pedal briefly interrupted by submedianit and subdominant chords at the end of each measure (the tonality projected is that of G minor). Harmonic stasis is characteristic of many accompaniments in flamenco song, since it facilitates the improvisatorial freedom of cante hondo vocalization. Harmonic stasis seems also to be an economic solution to the difficult problem of preserving the modal quality of the
melodic line. It also serves well to portray the inexorable suffering of the feminine poetic persona/cantaora.

The building cell of the accompaniment also dominates section b of the song, which functions not so much as an area of musical contrast, but as a musical derivation from the refrain. Variety is achieved through a series of sequential transpositions, through which the bass progressively descends an octave (i.e. from D3 to B-flat 2 to F2 to D2). The vocal line is also derivative: initially it skips upwards a sixth from D4 to B-flat 4 only to descend gradually to its initial register. It retains its modality throughout, at times adding melismatic turns, at times presenting only a transposed version of the opening vocal phrase of the refrain (for example, mm.15-16 = mm. 4-5). The varied repetitiveness of section b illustrates well the inescapable fate and progressive psychological decline of the cantaora as she realizes that her obsessive pangs of love can only be avoided through death. An extract of section b is reproduced in Example 7.5:


The return of the opening macho in section a’ (mm. 19-30) is not a blind response to the expressive conventions of the caña, it is also a calculated musical response to the ensnared mental state of the feminine poetic persona. Her mournful “¡Ay!” at the end of the first reiteration of the macho, reproduced in Example 7.6, traces the melodic shape of
her emotional decline with exactitude, an octave descent from D5 to D4, which echoes the bass’s octave drop in section b:


It is at the crucial from D5 to D4 (mm. 26-27) that the listener first encounters the first authentic cadence of the composition (i.e. V to I in the key of G major). A cadence in the parallel major seems highly symbolic; it appears that, death, the only possible release from the pain caused by the absence of the beloved, would be a welcomed liberation. Yet, this is a false resolution, for the cantaora/poetic persona is not quite ready to part from her misery and resentment: The chord of G major (mm. 27-31) becomes almost immediately a dominant preparation to the subdominant key area (C minor), which governs the tonality of section c, an area of emotional and musical contrast.

In comparison to the short vocal utterances of sections a and b, the first melodic phrases of section c expand to four and even five measures. The singer must also employ a sustained but accented flow of air, at forte or fortissimo dynamics, and reach the highest tones of the song (F5) in the midst of flowing melismas. The delivery of the second part of the poem or copla requires much virtuosity and stylistic and expressive control from the cantaora/poetic persona, who remembers here the false promise of her
lover as well as her unaltered pledge to never forget him. It is striking how this section corresponds to Estébanez Calderón’s description of the second part of a caña, a livelier if not less lamenting section, needing many faculties and “chest” from the singer, a section in which the cantaor or cantaora can easily fail and loose face. Example 7.7 reproduces a segment of this section:


The percussive accompaniment here is also formed by one-measure building cells. Four-measure phrases interact in a kind of dialogue with the vocal line; these could imitate the rhythmic zapateado of the dancing cantaora or the palmas of the clapping chorus who would have surrounded her under normal performing conditions in Andalusia. Although the individual phrases of the accompaniment are harmonically static, overall the section presents two authentic cadences in the tonal area of C minor/C major (iv/IV).

At the end of this section, a descending stepwise transposition of the building cell takes

---

538 At a festive reunion of gypsies (jaleo) or at a café cantante, it was stylistically desirable for the chorus not only to clap in certain types of palos, but also to express their approval and enjoyment of the interpretation with interjections such as: “¡olé!,” “¡ezo e!,” “¡agua!” “¡azúcar!,” “¡toma!,” “¡así se canta!,” “¡mu bien dicho!,” and “¡vamos allá!” “Glosario de Términos Flamencos,” http://www.andalucia.org/flamenco/glosario/j/ (accessed March 3, 2010).
the bass line from C3 to Bb2 to A2. The chord built on this last tone serves as dominant preparation to the tonic key area. The transition is reproduced in Example 7.8:


Compression in the length of the phrases and a gradual descent to the original register of the melodic line (m. 49) accompany this sudden transition to the final statement of the lamenting and static refrain. Its final “¡Ay!” becomes a guttural expression of the *cantaora*’s sustained, irresolvable pain. There is no final cadence to alleviate the deadly grasp of the song’s obsessive accompaniment.

Mostly unaware of the stylistic and performing conventions associated with this type of flamenco song, contemporaries of the composer did not fully grasp the finely realized details of her *caña*. They were struck, however, by its originality and also by an authenticity which they were not accustomed to encounter in even the most popular exotic *mélodies* of the day (e.g. Berlioz’s “La Captive” or Mompou’s “L’Andalouse” and “Sara la Baigneuse”). Perhaps not surprisingly, Henri Blanchard could not quite make up his mind if the song was a *bolero* or a *seguidilla*: 
On ne peut rien entendre de plus ibérien que l’ABSENCE, cagna Espagnola (sic). Le temps du bolero est marquée d’une façon toute pittoresque et bien guitarrienne dans l’accompagnement. Le meilleur éloge qu’on puisse faire de cette seguidilla mélancolique, c’est qu’on la dirait empruntée à l’Andalousie. Sa vague tonalité, ses modulations originales et la poétique douleur dont elle est empreinte, on dû plaire à Meyerbeer, à qui l’auteur a dédié ce piquant boléro.

One cannot hear anything more Iberian than l’ABSENCE, cagna Espagnola (sic). The meter of a bolero is marked in a very picturesque and guitar-like fashion in the accompaniment. The best compliment one can give to this melancholic seguidilla is that one would believe it was notated in Andalusia. Its vague tonality, its original modulations, and the poetic pain with which it is imprinted, must have pleased Meyerbeer, the dedicatee of this piquant bolero.

We do not know Meyerbeer’s exact reaction to the caña, but one can venture to say that Viardot-Garcia would have not dedicated a song to him if it would have not pleased him.

Chopin—as was discussed in the previous chapter—admired the caña, and had heard it, perhaps interpreted its piano part, on repeated occasions with fascination. Years later, Liszt—in a glowing article for the Neue Zeitschrift für Musik on Viardot-Garcia’s personality and career—signaled this work as a definite indicator of her compositional talent:

_Elle compose avec le sentiment le plus tendre, et s’exprime avec une délicatesse harmonique que plus d’un compositeur connu pourrait lui envier. . . . Il nous faut citer en particulier, parmi les mélodies qu’elle a publiées en deux cahiers, la Cagna Espagnola (sic) et En Mer, dédiées à Meyerbeer et à Berlioz. . . . _

539 Henri Blanchard, 399.

540 Frédéric Chopin to his family, Nohant, July 18, 1845. Extracts from this letter are quoted in chapter 6.

She composes with most subtle sensitivity, and expresses herself with a harmonic delicacy which could be envied by more than one known composer. . . . Among the mélodies which she has published in two volumes, one should quote in particular the Cagna Española (sic) and En Mer, dedicated to Meyerbeer and to Berlioz respectively . . .

In his review/biography, Liszt failed to mention earlier compositions of his former pupil. It is probable that he did not possess, at the time, a copy of her first album of songs. All the works mentioned in the review belong to L’Album Viardot de 1850.

A musical and aesthetic contrast to “L’Absence”/Caña Española can be found in the sixth song of the collection, “En Mer” (PVG.s.II.6). In this evocative mélodie, Viardot-Garcia made a setting of a philosophical poem by Gustave de Larenaudière entitled “Entre le ciel et l’eau,” which was published in his first and only poetic anthology, Les Cantilènes (Paris: Dauvin et Fontaine, 1842).

Originally from Vire, Normandy, de Larenaudière received from his earliest years a thorough education in history, literature, and geography, disciplines which were of particular interest to his father, Philippe-François de Larenaudière, president of the civic tribunal of that town. Later on, like many other poets and musicians of his generation, he pursued law studies in Paris. Although he obtained his law degree in 1835, for the rest of his life he would dedicate himself to literary and journalistic activities, writing cultural articles for La Patrie and organizing a literary salon in the late 1830s. A passionate admirer of Greek and Roman civilizations, de Larenaudière traveled several times to Italy and translated fragments of the works of Catullus, Tibullus, and Anacreon. Although de Larenaudière’s reputation as a poet has now almost completely vanished, his contemporaries admired his refined poetic sensibility and intellect:
Plein d’enthousiasme pour les magiques inspirations de Victor Hugo, les suaves harmonies de Lamartine, Gustave de Larenaudière entra franchement dans le mouvement moderne. Mais, ses connaissances nombreuses aussi bien que la droiture de son esprit, le firent rester dans ce juste milieu, que l’un de ses maîtres aussi, le sage et aimable Horace, conseillait en toutes choses. Il sut être jeune sans être excentrique. La poésie, en effet, doit être l’image et non la caricature d’un siècle. . . . Ceux qui comme lui connaissent à fond les auteurs anciens, se laissent difficilement entraîner à de ridicules élucubrations. . . . Tournez tous les feuillets de son recueil, et vous verrez que chacune de ces pages respire le plus tendre souvenir des écrivains aimés de Rome et de la Grèce.542

Full of enthusiasm for the magical inspirations of Victor Hugo and the soft harmonies of Lamartine, Gustave de Larenaudière inserted himself fully in the modern movement. Nevertheless, the extent of his knowledge and the rectitude of his soul made him avoid all extremes, a virtue which another one of his teachers, the wise and gentle Horace, advised in all things. He knew how to be young without being eccentric. Poetry, as a matter of fact, should be the image of a century and not its caricature. . . . Those who like him knew in depth the ancient writers were hardly moved by ridiculous divagations. . . . Turn all the pages of his collection, and you will see that each of these pages breathes the most tender reminiscence of the beloved writers of Rome and Greece.

De Larenaudière’s respect for the poetry and civilization of the ancient world, as well as his sympathetic understanding of the frailty which underlies human existence can readily be perceived in many poems of Les Cantilènes including “Vanitas Vanitatum Vanitas,” “Adraste et Lydie,” “La Jeune fille de Téos,” and “Réminiscence de Tibulle.” It can also be appraised in “Entre le ciel et l’eau.” That poem and its English translation are presented below:

---

La lune dans les cieux, promenant ses clartés,
Se mirait sur les flots, sur les flots argentés.
Je voguais solitaire, et, m'éloignant des grèves,
Entre le ciel et l'eau je balançais mes rêves.
Entre le ciel et l'eau quand la nue est d'azur
Quand le flot est tranquille et que le cœur est pur,
La double immensité nous parlé et nous révèle
La faiblesse de l'homme et la force éternelle.

Ces cieux ont éclairé des empires puissants
Et ces flots ont mugi sous des murs menaçants,
Ces cieux brillent toujours ces flots roulent encore,
Allez hurler Carthage au visage du More.

Des autels abattus, des empires détruits,
Le calme des déserts aux lieux de mille bruits
Montaient au ciel. Voilà ce que le monde antique
Lègue au monde nouveau dans un sens prophétique.

The clear moon, wanders in the skies,
Contemplating itself on the waves of silver.
I row in loneliness, pulling afar from the shores,
Between sky and water, I balance my dreams.
Between sky and water, when the cloud is blue,
When the wave is calm and the heart is pure,
The double immensity speaks and reveals to us
The weakness of men and the strength of eternity.

These skies have dawned on powerful empires
And these waves have roared under menacing walls,
These skies shine forever and these waves still roar,
Go scream Carthage to the face of the Moor.

Burned altars, destroyed empires,
The calm of the desert instead of the thousand noises
Which once rose to the skies. This is what the ancient
World bequeaths to the new one, with prophetic clarity.

The writer’s scholarly diligence is reflected in the formal precision of the poem, which consists of four polished quatrains of alexandrines, each dodecasyllabic verse dividing into two symmetric phrases by clearly marked césures or metrical articulations. Only a bold employment of enjambed verses in the last quatrain of the poem interrupts the regular rhythmic flow of these phrases. This disruption might initially seem like a defect to the reader; it could, however, be a calculated attempt to emphasize the existential conclusions of his poetic persona. De Larennaudière’s clarity of expression, the loftiness of his ideas, and the beauty of his imagery unite to make a forceful evocation of temporal and natural infinity as opposed to the tragic condition of mortal man, who is able to appraise nature’s perpetuity through his senses and intellect, but can imitate it only in the momentary achievements of civilization.

Young Viardot-Garcia, full of studious curiosity and ambitious creativity, must have felt naturally attracted to de Larennaudière’s serious, beautiful poem. Although the formal outlines of the text were transparent and regular enough to favor a musical setting,
she must have soon realized the challenge of capturing in musical terms the roaming thoughts of the poetic persona, in other words the inner atmosphere\textsuperscript{543} of de Larenaudière’s text. At the same time, she still needed to create a setting which rendered the rich exterior atmosphere of the poem (e.g. the spatial immensity of sky and sea, the reflection of the moon on the waters, and the soft movement of the silvery waves against the boat). Her solution to this problem was to create a work in which motivic material, tonal areas, vocal line, and accompaniment functioned not only as musical descriptions of the exterior atmosphere, but also as symbolic representations of the fluctuating thoughts of the protagonist and the conceptual universe of de Larenaudière’s poem. This \textit{mélodie rêveuse et grave}, as Antoine Romagnesi would have undoubtedly called it in his day,\textsuperscript{544} shows once again the strong musical influence that Schubert’s Lieder had on the formation of a more sophisticated type of French song in the 1840s. Viardot-Garcia’s manipulation of these musical elements will be described in detail in the next pages.

To maximize the clarity of delivery of Larenaudière’s text, the composer chose a moderate \textit{Andante} and a mostly syllabic vocal line, comfortably placed, for most of the song, in the middle range of the voice. Apart from changing the title, Viardot-Garcia made very few alterations to the poem: Probably to have a clearer (i.e. less scholarly) metaphor, she altered verse 16 from the somewhat mysterious “Allez hurler Carthage au visage du More” to the more comprehensible “Et le nom du Carthage est inconnu du More,” the latter being a simpler allusion to the ancient glory of that city before it was conquered by the Moors in 698 A.D. At the end of her setting, Viardot-Garcia also

\textsuperscript{543} See chapter 5 and Frits Noske, \textit{La mélodie française de Berlioz a Duparc}, 77.

decided to repeat the initial strophe of the poem, perhaps to allow for the philosophical conclusion of the fourth strophe (i.e. “Voilà ce que le monde antique lègue au monde nouveau dans un sens prophétique”) enough musical time to permeate the consciousness of both singer and listener. This repetition creates an arch shape in the modified poetic structure, in which the singer/poetic persona “departs” from the sublime, expansive scenery of the first strophe to abstract mental ramblings through time and space in strophes two, three, and four. In Viardot-Garcia’s modified version of the poem (i.e. strophe 5=strophe 1), the discovery of the damned fate of modern civilization brings back the singer/poetic persona to the unchanged and impassive solidity of the natural world. One could naturally expect this poetic arch shape to be reflected in the formal structure of the composer’s musical setting, perhaps through the employment of a loose ternary form with a significant, contrasting mid-section for strophes two, three, and four. Instead, Viardot-Garcia chose a modified strophic form to organize her musical material, perhaps to keep the attention of both singer and listener in de Larenaudière’s poetic/philosophical message. Figure 7.4 presents the formal and harmonic outline of the song:
Formal transitions between the sections and subsections are often blurred by an overlap of one or two measures among musical phrases. This—together with a coloristic employment of the principal harmonic areas and an almost constant reiteration and development of the initial motivic material—makes the formal outlines of the composition less distinct than those found in other early songs of the composer.

The two principal motives organizing the song appear in the singer’s opening phrases: Motive x (mm. 6-7) is a stepwise descent from tonic to dominant, a descending tetrachord initially associated with the movement of the moon through the sky. Motive y (mm. 10-11), an ornamental turn around the tonic, is connected with the shifting reflections of the moon on the silvery waves. Fittingly, this last motive is soon imitated by the piano (mm. 11-12 and mm. 13-14), but transposed a minor sixth below and distorted by the addition of an appoggiatura. Example 7.9 reproduces the first appearance of these motives:

Figure 7.4. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “En Mer,” PVG. II.6.
Motivic transformation plays an important role throughout the song. Through this musical resource, the composer transforms the initial textual associations of the motivic material, changing them to also represent the inner atmosphere of the poem. Motive x, in particular, acquires structural and symbolic importance. Transposed and extended version are employed as ground bass in parts of subsections b (mm.14-23), c (mm. 24-46), and c’ (mm.63-90). Often, it is associated with key moments in the poetic/compositional structure. For example, two versions are employed when the poetic
persona has his/her philosophical revelation at the end of poetic strophe IV. Example 7.10 presents the transformations of the tetrachord at this moment in the composition:

Example 7.10. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 81-92.

The employment of motive x as ground bass illustrates the composer’s interest in Baroque music, when repeating descending tetrachord figures were commonly employed to organize extended areas of laments and meditative compositions.

Harmonic stasis characterizes subsections a (mm. 1-13) and a’ (mm. 47-62). A lack of functional progressions in conjunction with long sustained tonic pedals serve well to illustrate the unchanging, eternal quality of the natural world as perceived by the singer/poetic persona. Example 7.11 reproduces a fragment of subsection a’:
Example 7.11. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 54-62.

Not surprisingly, motive y, the ornamental turn around the tonic, is associated with these stable subsections, although incremental permutations of it are linked with the vocal phrases at the climax of the song (mm.24-46). These motivic transformations are indicated in Example 7.12:

Through these clever permutations motive y becomes associated not only with the objective musical description of the reflecting waves and the sea, but with the abstract concept of eternity.

In subsections b (mm. 14-23), c (mm. 24-46), and c’ (mm. 63-90), harmonic stasis is disrupted in order to give musical representation to the physical and mental roaming of the singer/poetic persona. Distancing from the tonic key area seems to occur by increments. In subsection b—as the boat of the singer/poetic persona pulls further away from the coast—the distancing implies only a movement to the dominant. This modulation is supported by an illustrative figuration of broken octaves in the right hand of the accompaniment, suggestive of the rocking motion of the boat above the waves.

This section of the song is reproduced in Example 7.13:

Example 7.13. Pauline Viardot-Garcia, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6, mm. 15-23.

Subsequent tonal excursions take us further away from the tonic/dominant polarity. Like many of her contemporaries, Viardot-Garcia employed tonal areas not so much for their functional value, but as an opportunity to color musical thoughts. The entrance to the realm of inner thought and dreams takes place through a tonicization to the mediant key area (mm. 24-33). Later on in the song, the increased complexity of the poem’s inner
atmosphere carry us even further away from the original tonality: Subsection c’, in particular, takes place in the remote tonality of E major, an enharmonic respelling of the dominant’s Neapolitan (F-flat major). This sudden and remote coloristic shift portrays well the existential conclusions reached by the singer/poetic persona after his/her exploration through the shattered glories of the ancient world. The return to the tonic area from this remote key is achieved economically through a diminished chord in measure 90 (see example 7.10 above). The third musical strophe (section A’’) remains firmly anchored in the tonic area, although it too seems recolored after the song’s remote harmonic excursions.

A long, advanced draft for this song can be found in Viardot-García’s black notebook (Ms.Mus. 232, Item 60 [20]). In it, one can see how carefully the composer planned out the transformation of the motivic material and the metric setting of the text. One can also observe that in several instances, the melodic contours of the vocal line were different. For example, the vocal register for the first two verses of the second musical strophe (beginning of subsection c) was higher than the register employed throughout the first strophe. Later, the composer must have realized that this higher register corresponded exactly to the one employed during the climax of the song (mm. 38-46). Determining that this would ruin the melodic bloom of the song’s climax, Viardot-García decided to readjust the melodic line at the beginning of subsection c, recomposing the phrases at a lower melodic register. A reproduction of this fragment of the draft is presented in Figure 7.5. Example 7.12, reproduced above, shows the final version of these bars:
The melodic line is carefully planned and reconsidered in this fragment. On the other hand, the swiftly scribbled notes of the accompaniment—many times no more than a type of musical shorthand—seem to have served the composer as memory aid for harmonies and figurations initially improvised at the piano. From this example it appears that Viardot-Garcia initially elucidated the metric, rhythmic and melodic aspects of her vocal line against a general harmonic background. Only then she proceeded to clarify the figurative aspects of the accompaniment.

In “En Mer,” Viardot-Garcia wished to create a musical complement to Larenaudière’s poetic universe, representing in musical terms its allegorical and philosophical complexities. Her setting achieves this compositional task with subtlety.
and economy through the well-planned development of motives, the symbolic employment of tonal areas, and a beautifully crafted vocal line, which prioritizes accurate prosody and aural clarity. Composers of French song in the 1840s had seldom pursued the integration of music and poetry so rich in inner atmosphere. Critics did not fail to notice the originality and complexity of this composition. In his review of the album, Henri Blanchard was struck by how the song’s compositional resources illuminated the ulterior meaning of Larenaudière’s text. Blanchard also strove to describe the emotional effect of the song upon the listener:

Quand le compositeur a des idées, et que ces idées sont mises en contact avec celles de divers poètes, il en résulte une variété, une richesse d’expression qu’on ne peut trouver dans un auteur qui se produit avec sa seule individualité... Notre cantatrice-compositeur interprète, dans une mélodie simple, grande et solennelle... les pensées d’un autre Byron... Et sur cette mélodie simple se promènent une basse qui semble une tradition de la voix des anciens prophètes, des modulations hardies, des transitions enharmoniques, d’ingénieuses imitations; et ce chant grandiose s’éteint en de lointains échos, en de vagues regrets, qui témoignent en l’auteur de tout cela le foyer du feu sacré et du génie de l’art.545

When the composer has ideas, and these ideas are put in contact with those of diverse poets, variety and richness of expression result, which one cannot find in an author who relies solely on his individuality. Our singer-composer interprets, in a simple, grand, and solemn mélodie... the thoughts of another Byron... Underneath a simple [vocal] melody moves a bass which resembles the voice of ancient prophets. Bold modulations, enharmonic transitions, ingenious imitations [are employed]; and this imposing chant dies out in remote echoes and vague regrets, which testify to this author all that can be found in the art’s hearth of sacred flames and genius.

Curiously enough, Blanchard could have used very similar words to describe the musical resources and sublime emotional effect of much later examples of French mélodie which

545 Henri Blanchard, 400.
have thematic connections to “En Mer” (i.e. the employment of the sea as a metaphor for eternity), for example, Duparc’s “La Vie antérieure” or Chausson’s Poème de l’amour et de la mer.

Viardot-Garcia chose to close her second song album with a spirited song based on the rhythmic, metric, and melodic conventions of the tarantella. This Southern Italian dance was very much in vogue in Paris during the 1830s and 1840s. Viardot-Garcia’s “Tarentelle” (PVG.s.II.10), with its spirited fast tempo (Allegro vivace) and its cascading scalar passages for the voice, adds a playful and virtuosic dimension to the collection.

The genesis of this composition is somewhat uncharacteristic for the composer, who normally preferred to proceed from poetic text to musical setting. In the autumn of 1839, the singer—then nineteen and unmarried—composed a piano miniature entitled “Tarentelle” for the artistic salon of Pierre-Joseph-Guillaume Zimmerman. Zimmerman’s salon was one of the finest of the Nouvelle-Athènes, an artistic area centered on the Square d’Orléans. The salon was frequented by piano virtuosos and composers such as Thalberg, Chopin, Field, and Cherubini. During the winter of 1839-1840, Zimmerman’s eldest daughter, Juliette (1820-1855), assembled an album which included not only drawings by her fiancé, the portraitist Édouard Dubuffe, but various autographed musical fragments and miniatures by composers, singers, and pianists, including Rubini, Lablanche, Zimmerman, Berlioz, Moscheles, and Thalberg.546 In the last pages of this album, one finds an autograph, which Pauline completed on November 546

19, 1839 and which she dedicated to Juliette, who was only one year older than herself.547 A reproduction of this autograph is presented in Figure 7.6:

Since the quality of this reproduction is low, a transcription of this autograph is presented in Figure 7.7:

[Image of hand-written notes]

---

547 The exact inscription in the album reads: “Souvenir à mon amie Juliette / Pauline Garcia / Paris le 19. 9[vem]bre 1839.”
With its compound meter, fast tempo, phrase regularity, and its mixture of staccato and legato articulations, this short but complete musical thought in C minor exhibits many of the characteristics of the dance as stylized by Romantic composers during the 1820s and 1830s: the detailed articulation in the left hand, for example, could be an attempt to

---

548 Popular examples of stylized tarantellas in the literature of the era which Viardot-Garcia might have known include the last movement of Mendelssohn’s ‘Italian’ Symphony No. 4 in A major (1833), Rossini’s popular song “La Danza” (1820, published by Troupenas in Soirées Musicales in 1835), and Liszt’s “Tarantella” from his Venezia e Napoli (composed ca. 1840).
evoke percussive tambourines set against the sustained bourdons of the *zampognas*. The melodic line, perhaps, could have been played by a *piffero*. Viardot-Garcia adds interest to the harmonic progressions of this short composition through the employment of modal mixture (m. 35) and brief moments of chromatic motion in the lines of the bass (mm. 9-12) and inner voices (mm. 26-27).

The singer probably interpreted this piano miniature with great success during one of her visits to Zimmerman’s salon. Perhaps she even improvised it on the spot, later annotating the essence of it in Juliette’s album. The surviving autograph, however, is quite detailed, and has very few corrections, which makes it probable that she at least possessed one or two annotated drafts and/or sketches of the composition from which she copied or deduced the existing manuscript. Perhaps she later employed these drafts to arrange the piano miniature into a musical section of a much longer vocal composition. As we saw in the previous chapter, this adaptation might have taken place during the summer of 1844, when she was, according to Louis Viardot, transcribing six or eight pieces for a second album of songs.\(^{549}\) The reworking and expansion of “Tarentelle” might have not been completed that summer, though. She could have finished the task during the unexpected months of rest she had at Courtavenel after her disastrous third winter season in St. Petersburg, in other words, from May to August of 1846, or perhaps even later on.

It is not known who prepared the light-hearted lyrics for the vocal version. It might have been Viardot-Garcia, her husband, or another one of their close literary friends. The lyrics are full of appealing references to Naples and the religious and festive

\(^{549}\) Louis Viardot to George Sand, Courtavenel, August 14, 1844 in Marix-Spire, ed., *Lettres inédites*, 207.
aspects of its culture, but the poet probably did not believe that they had enough value to 
merit recognition of authorship in the publication of 1849. A translation of the poem’s 
three strophes follows:

1  Dansez, pêcheur Napolitain,  
   Dance, Neapolitan fisherman, 
2  En chantant votre gai refrain,  
   As you sing your happy refrain, 
3  Dansez, pêcheur Napolitain,  
   Dance, Neapolitan fisherman, 
4  La mer est calme et l'air serein,  
   The sea is calm, the air serene, 
5  Dansez, pêcheur Napolitain,  
   Dance, Neapolitan fisherman, 
6  Sans nul souci du lendemain.  
   With no concern for the future.

7  Si du Vésuve ou de l'Etna  
   If from the Vesuvius or Etna, 
8  La flamme étincelle,  
   A flame sparks, 
9  C’est un fanal qui brillera,  
   It’s but a shining lamp, 
10 C’est un fanal de bal :  
   It’s but the lamp of the ball: 
11 Et si la mer, sur Ischia,  
   And if the sea in Ischia 
12 Ses flots amoncèle  
   Piles up its floods, 
13 Sa grande voix résonnera,  
   Its great voice will resound, 
14 C’est un signal de bal...  
   It’s but a sign for the ball…

15 À la madone, à Saint Janvier,  
   To the Madonna, to Saint Januarius, 
16 Donnez le cierge et le dernier,  
   Give both candle and last prayer, 
17 La main de ces patrons bénis  
   The hand of these holy patrons, 
18 Mené tout droit en Paradis,  
   Will take you straight to Paradise, 
19 Mais en attendant  
   But while we wait 
20 Du départ le triste moment,  
   For the sad moment of departure, 
21 Livrons le reste de nos jours  
   Lets dedicate the rest of our days, 
22 À la danse, au vin, aux amours.  
   To dance, wine, and love.

Strophe I is fairly regular, with six octosyllabic verses. Strophes II and III, on the other 
hand, are longer and freer, each with eight lines that combine octosyllabic verses with 
shorter pieds of six and even five syllables (e.g. verse 19). The irregularity of form in the 
poetic material is a good indicator that the lyrics were created to fit a preexisting melodic 
line.

Repetition of strophes in Viardot-Garcia’s song occurs in the following 
sequence: strophe I, strophe II, strophe III, strophe I’, strophe III, strophe I, and strophe 
II. The initial strophe, thus, functions as a poetic refrain, reappearing three times
throughout the composition, although its second statement appears in an abbreviated form, getting rid of the inner reiteration of the initial verse and altering a few words for the sake of grammatical clarity:

1 *Dansez pêcheur Napolitain,*
2 *En chantant votre gai refrain,*
3 *La mer est calme et l’air serein,*
4 *Point de souci du lendemain.*

Dance, Neapolitan fisherman,
As you sing your happy refrain,
The sea is calm, the air serene,
No worries for the future

Based on this sequence of strophic repetition, Viardot-Garcia could have naturally been inspired to choose an overall rondo. Instead, she decided to give contrasting musical material to the second abbreviated repetition of the poetic refrain, thus creating a more complex overall musical structure, which can best be described as an arch form. A formal and harmonic outline of the composition is presented in Figure 7.8:

![Harmonic and Formal Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10.](image)

Figure 7.8. Formal and Harmonic Analysis of Pauline Viardot-Garcia’s “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10.
The arch form reflects itself not only in the sequence of presentation and varied repetition of each of the four musical sections (i.e. Intro≈Coda, A≈A’, B≈B’, C=C), but also in the amount of harmonic tension created as the song progresses towards and away from the composition’s center. Harmonic tension is built by increments: Both the introduction (mm. 1-62) and section A (mm. 63-114) are fairly stable, rooted in the home key area of C minor; section B (mm. 115-130) modulates to its relative major (Eb major) and presents half of its bass lines with stepwise chromatic motion. Finally, section C (mm. 131-138) is the most unstable; its two four-measure phrases move quickly through four brief tonicizations: C minor (i), Eb major (III), G minor (v), and Bb major (V/III).

Example 7.14 reproduces the second phrase of section C:


Harmonic tension then unravels as the song passes again through the tonic’s relative major in section B’ (mm. 139-154), and then settles in the tonic key area in section A’ (mm. 155-190) and the Coda (mm. 191-229).

With more than sixty measures, the introduction (mm. 1-62) is the longest segment of the composition. Within its first four phrases (in reality two four-measure phrases with their respective reiterations), it quickly establishes the internal logic of the
song (i.e. clarity and regularity in its phrase structure, economic duplication of previously presented material, employment of descending scalar patterns in the bass, extended drones, and serpentine melodic passages). Example 7.15 reproduces the opening phrases of the song:


Diatonic and chromatic versions of descending tetrachords, often with extensions of one or several tones, organize many of the bass lines throughout the song. Although the employment of this ground bass figure is not consistent, it does create, in the long-run, a certain aural uniformity in the composition. This, in combination with an exhaustive regularity in the length of phrases (i.e. mostly four measures long), a consistent immediate repetition of them, and the employment of tonic pedals and unvaried rhythms in both the vocal part and the accompaniment, produces an almost hypnotizing effect on
the listener. Through these musical resources, Viardot-Garcia perhaps wished to invoke the trance-like effects that the folkloric tarantella purportedly had on both dancers and a.

Section A (mm. 63-114) is in reality a transcription of Viardot-Garcia’s 1839 piano miniature with a sixteen-measure extension added at its end (in section A’, this extension is not even present). Poetic strophe I is quickly delivered in three four-measure phrases (mm. 63-74) accompanied by the stepwise descending pattern in the bass line. In the first two phrases a diatonic descent goes from tonic to subdominant, in the third phrase, a chromatic version of it takes the listener from tonic to dominant. This section of the score is reproduced in Example 7.16:

Poetic strophe II initiates with two four-measure phrases presenting the first part of the strophe. These two musical phrases are immediately repeated, delivering the second part of the strophe. In the meantime, the bass sustains a tonic drone, while the descending tetrachord in its diatonic version is transferred to the upper voice of the accompaniment, this time moving from a fifth to a second scale-degree. Subsection e is reproduced in Example 7.17:

Subsection f (mm. 91-106) is characterized by a desynchronization of two measures between the delivery of the phrases of voice and accompaniment. The text here, “Dansez la Tarentelle, dansez la” does not form part of the original strophic structure of the poem. This repetitive invitation to dance, together with an increase in the dynamic levels (from \( p \) to \( ff \)) and a raise to a sustained G5 in the vocal part creates the first emotional peak of the song, which is reproduced in Example 7.18:
Section A then closes with an interlude which employs musical material from the Introduction (mm. 107-114 = mm.17-24). The only difference with the initial presentation, is that the bass line is transferred an octave below its original register.

A sudden shift to the relative major takes place after one measure of silence, marking the beginning of section B. In character this section is not truly contrasting to the introduction or to section A, employing the same musical resources encountered so far. Here, variety and interest are created by increased demands on the flexibility and stamina of the singer (mm. 122-124). Sudden fast skips to the upper register are particularly virtuosic. See Example 7.19:
Throughout section C (see Example 7.14) and the varied repetitions of sections B and A (mm. 141-156 and mm. 157-193), the singer hardly gets an opportunity to catch his/her breathe between phrases. It soon becomes apparent that the composition is not only a stylized dance, but a medium to display vocal virtuosity and endurance. In this respect, like many Italian arias of the day, the denouement coincides with the climax of the work. The coda presents exciting bel canto passages at neck-breaking speed (in measure 208, the composer asks for a pressez of the original Allegro Vivace). Here, the original serpentine melodic passage of the introduction (see example 15) is transformed into a two-octave scalar ascent and descent (mm. 213-224). The seven-measure tonic extension
after the final cadence of the composition (mm. 224), continues the virtuosoic *tour de force* with sustained trills and a final skip to a high C:


These *bel canto* passages are not empty technical gestures. If the tarantella supposedly drove its dancers to a wild frenzy of contortions and skips, then the best way of expressing that in vocal terms is through the employment of virtuosic pyrotechnics.

Critics Blanchard and Chorley were charmed by Viardot-Garcia’s “Tarentelle,” remarking in particular its originality of conception and authentic Mediterranean feel.
Blanchard began his comment on the song with the following ironic observations on the extreme popularity of the tarantella among Romantic composers:

[I]l n’est point de pianiste-compositeur qui n’ait mis au jour sa tarentelle, Mme Viardot, à l’exemple de Rossini dans les Marinari de ses mélodies de salon, a voulu aussi jeter sur le papier sa TARENTELLE. Cette danse napolitaine échevelée, cette fièvre, cette rage de chorégraphie a été exprimée par Mme Viardot avec tout l’entrain, le délire méridional, qui caractérisent nos farandoles du Midi. . . . C’est de la mélodie inspirée, allègre, et franche, et qui semble écrite sous le ciel de l’Italie. Elle plaira partout . . . parce qu’elle est vive et passionnée, et vraie et amusante.\(^{550}\)

There is no pianist-composer who has failed to present us with his Tarantella. Mme Viardot, who has the example of Rossini’s Les Marinari from his collection of salon songs, has also wished to toss on the paper her “Tarentelle.” This tumultuous Neapolitan dance, this fever, this choreographic madness has been expressed by Mme Viardot with all the abandonment and delirium that characterize our circle dances from Midi. . . . It is an inspired, happy, and honest song, which seems to have been written under the sky of Italy. It will please everywhere . . . because it is lively and passionate, entertaining and true.

From this comment, it seems that Blanchard was not too familiar with Rossini’s Soireés Musicales (1835). Although “Li Marinari” does have a compound meter and an Allegro moderato indication, it is really a dramatic duet—normally sung by a baritone and tenor—depicting a dark seascape in the midst of a storm. Its first part, at least, can hardly be characterized as a tarantella.\(^{551}\) It is probable that Blanchard confused titles and was really referring to the joyous and virtuosic eighth song of that collection, “La Danza,” which Rossini appropriately subtitled “Tarantella Napolitana.”

\(^{550}\) Henri Blanchard, 400.

\(^{551}\) Pauline was familiar with this duet and sang it often during the 1840s. Meyerbeer registered some of these interpretations in his diaries during May 1847. See Mark Everist, The Diaries of Giacommo Meyerbeer, Vol. 2, trans. and ed. Robert Ignatius Letellier, (Cranbury, NJ: Associated University Presses, 2001), 225.
Chorley’s own remarks on Pauline’s “Tarentelle” run parallel to those of Blanchard, although his account of the piece is more precise and observant:

The best of the series (to our thinking) is the “Tarentelle” with which it concludes. As was remarked some weeks ago, to write a good “Tarentelle” is no longer easy: especially to write one for the voice, of which the agility is necessarily limited. Here, however, the feat is done: that mixture of Southern glow and savagery which belongs to the dance is thrown into the song with an amount of novelty and spirit nothing short of masterly. The coda will tax to the utmost the most accomplished and ready vocalist.  

Unlike Blanchard, Chorley realized that the vocal difficulties of the last song in the collection would make it inaccessible for most singers and thus that despite its merits, the work would seldom be performed.

The vocal virtuosity and hypnotic employment of limited musical resources in “Tarentelle,” the elegant prosody and sophisticated interaction of poetic concepts and musical motives in “En Mer,” and the passionate Andalusian energy of “L’Absence”/Caña Española exemplify well Viardot-Garcia’s artistic sophistication. Her second album was not conceived as entertainment for members of the Parisian bourgeoisie—many of whom, in any case, would have been incapable of interpreting these compositions—but as a realization of original and complex musical thoughts and even as a medium to present an integrated aesthetic program.

It is significant that the year of publication of the album, 1849, marked exactly ten years of close friendship between Viardot-Garcia and George Sand. The collection is indeed a worthy tribute to the intellectual, political, and artistic exchange of these two

---

552 Henry Chorley, 79.
personalities, for in it, as was explained in the introductory remarks of this chapter, Viardot-Garcia sought to recreate—consciously or unconsciously—the pure, naïve, and exceptional inventions of her literary alter-ego, Consuelo, a group of beautiful compositions reflecting the sensibility of the people, speaking directly into their hearts (often through the mirror of their own popular style), transforming their souls, and elevating them above an unjust social fate.

It must also be remembered that the album was published only a year after the 1848 Revolution, when the socialist hopes of many artists and intellectuals of France were momentarily realized. As we saw in the previous chapter, Viardot-Garcia openly supported the Republican government, composing and presenting her hymn, *La Jeune République* that year. It is not surprising, then, that Blanchard identified Viardot-Garcia’s 1850 album as the original and imaginative manifestation of the muse of a new social order.\(^{553}\) The album was the materialization of Republican vocal music. Once one takes these extraneous factors into consideration, the composer’s aesthetic program for the album, perhaps unwittingly, transforms into a Saint-Simonian socialist statement.

From this standpoint, Vardot-Garcia’s second album represents the creative peak of her aesthetic and political relationship with George Sand. It might not be unrelated that the album also marked the beginning of a severe compositional crisis for her. Despite the fact that the collection was highly praised by important critics, Viardot-Garcia would not publish original compositions for almost fifteen years. In the final envoi, the external and internal causes underlying this blockage will be briefly discussed.

\(^{553}\) Henri Blanchard, 399.
ENVOI

In 1849, Turgenev—who by then was visiting Courtavenel regularly—found the black notebook in which Viardot-Garcia had notated her earliest compositions and proceeded to examine it with his rudimentary musical skills. He then wrote a letter to the singer, then preparing the premiere of Le Prophète in London, with his reactions to songs which he had never heard before:

. . . Ayant trouvé sous le tapis vert du piano votre gros livre de musique, je me suis permis de l’ouvrir et de le parcourir. — Malheureusement ma main droite ne joue pas assez bien du piano pour pouvoir me donner ne fût-ce qu’une idée de la mélodie; cependant, j’ai tenté de déchiffrer certains morceaux que vous ne nous avez jamais chantés ! — Autant que je puis en juger, vous avez été distinguée de tout temps.554

. . . Having discovered under the green rug on the piano your big book of music, I allowed myself to open and inspect it.— Unfortunately, my right hand plays the piano only well enough to give me a vague sense of the melody; notwithstanding, I managed to decipher certain pieces which you have never sung for us!— From what I could judge, you were always a distinguished [composer].

We know that Turgenev was inspecting Viardot-Garcia’s black notebook because further on in the letter, he commented on autographs of complete songs contained in it, such as “L’Hirondelle et le prisonnier” (MS Mus 232, item [10.]). His lack of familiarity with many of the unpublished songs in the notebook shows that already in 1849, the singer was not performing her earliest compositions, a testament to the ephemeral quality of art song in the nineteenth century. In Paris, works were meant to be heard for a couple of seasons and then put aside, often by the composer/performer. Viardot-Garcia’s two first

554 Ivan Turgenev to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Courtavenel, July 23, 25, 26, 28/August 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 1849, in Ivan Turgenev, Quelques Lettres d’Ivan Tourguénev à Pauline Viardot, ed. Henri Granjard (Paris: Mouton, 1974), 89-90.
albums of songs (1842 and 1849) would soon suffer the same fate as her earliest unpublished works. This process was perhaps accelerated by the creative predicament which she experienced from 1850 to 1863, a period of thirteen years when she did not compose a single original song.

The roots of what could be termed this creative blockage could easily be attributed to external causes: In the early 1850s, the singer gave birth to three more children: Claudie (1852), Marianne (1854), and Paul (1857). Additionally in 1850, she and Louis Viardot decided to adopt Pélagie, the eight-year-old natural daughter of Turgenev and Avdotia Ermolaïevna Ivanova, one of the seamstresses of his mother. Pélagie or Paulinette, as she soon came to be known, proved to be a conflicted, tormented child who did not get along with either her adoptive mother or Viardot-García’s eldest daughter, the obstinate and spirited Louise.

Apart from these daunting maternal obligations, Viardot-García was busy furthering her singing career. First and foremost she was the great interpreter of Fidès in Meyerbeer’s *Le Prophète*. Numerous new roles soon followed, including Zerlina and Donna Anna in *Don Giovanni*, Papagena in *Die Zauberflöte*, Rachel in *La Juive*, and Azucena in *Il trovatore*. Operatic and concert tours during this decade took her to England, Ireland, Hungary, Poland, Russia, and Germany.

---

She used her momentous success as Fidès to further the professional prospects of talented friends. To begin with, she took up the cause of Charles Gounod, who reintroduced himself to the singer in 1849. Viardot-Garcia was so impressed by Gounod’s magnetic personality and the beauty of his romances that she instantly recommended that he compose an opera.\textsuperscript{556} Not only did she suggest a librettist, Emile Auger, and a noble plot based on the tragic life of the Greek poetess of antiquity, Sappho, but she negotiated with the director of the Opéra, Nestor Roqueplan, a contract for the unknown composer. Roqueplan accepted Viardot-Garcia’s scheme on the condition that the work should be short and that she should appear in the principal role.\textsuperscript{557} In the following months, she nursed Gounod though the death of his younger brother, inviting him and his mother to spend the summer of 1850 in Courtavenel. As the new opera took shape, she wrote letters of encouragement from Berlin and London. Throughout the autumn, she and Gounod revised the first draft of the work, the composer often following her guidance and making changes to the score, even during the final rehearsals of the opera.\textsuperscript{558} If Sapho— with its somewhat stoic, declamatory musical style, and avoidance of overt theatrical melodrama— was not a success at its premiere on April 16, 1851, it nevertheless did much to launch the identity of Gounod as an operatic composer.\textsuperscript{559} The close friendship between singer and composer became tarnished shortly afterwards by


\textsuperscript{557} Patrick Barbier, \textit{Pauline Viardot}, 151.

\textsuperscript{558} Ibid., 156.

nasty rumors of an amorous liaison.\textsuperscript{560} Gounod did not have the courage to protect the reputation of the singer before his suspicious future father-in-law, Joseph Zimmerman, who proceeded to break his relationship with the Viardots. Despite Gounod’s gutless attitude, he would always remember with gratitude Viardot-Garcia’s decisive intervention on his behalf at this crucial juncture of his professional development.

Her involvement with Berlioz at the end of the decade also yielded a mixture of productivity and disappointment.\textsuperscript{561} In the spring of 1859, Berlioz was invited by the impresario and director of the Théâtre-Lyrique, Léon Carvahlo, to create a new adaptation of Gluck’s \textit{Orphée} for the voice of Viardot-Garcia, a request which he accepted only in light of his admiration for the singer—whom he had directed several times in London and Baden-Baden—and for her musical salon in Paris. Viardot-Garcia was only too happy to collaborate with Berlioz. In August 1859, she had done all in her power to promote \textit{Les Troyens} in Baden-Baden, inviting both Julius Rietz and Franz Liszt to listen to a concert where she performed under Berlioz’s baton two scenes of the still unconcluded opera.\textsuperscript{562} She seems to have been in a hurry to promote the composer whose music she profoundly admired, for she suspected that his physical suffering and emotional distress at the time—a direct result of his unhappy marriage to the singer Marie Recio, his recurring neuralgias, and the electrification treatments he decided to pursue to cure them—had him at death’s doors. To further complicate the situation, upon their

\textsuperscript{560} See Thérèse Marix-Spire, “Gounod and his First Interpreter, Pauline Viardot,” part II, \textit{The Musical Quarterly} 31, no. 3 (July 1945), 302.

\textsuperscript{561} Viardot-Garcia and Berlioz’s relationship during this period has been documented in detail in Patrick Waddington, “Pauline Viardot-Garcia as Berlioz’s Counselor and Physician,” \textit{The Musical Quarterly} 59, no. 3 (July 1973), 386. Neither Rietz nor Liszt could attend the performance.

\textsuperscript{562} Ibid., 386. Neither Rietz or Liszt could attend the performance.
return from Germany, Berlioz (who in an uncharacteristic move had accepted Viardot-Garcia’s invitation to her country estate) confessed to her his desperate, unerring passion. Shortly afterwards, the singer recounted to Julius Rietz his declaration in the following terms:

“Toute ma vie,” m’a-t-il dit, “n’a été qu’une longue et ardente aspiration vers un idéal que je m’étais créé. Mon cœur avide d’aimer s’est fixé dès qu’il a trouvé séparément une des qualités, une des grâces de cet idéal—hêlas, le désillusionnement est venu bientôt me prouver que je m’étais trompé. Ma vie s’est passée ainsi et au moment où je la sens près de s’éteindre, cet idéal, auquel m’avait fallu renoncer, comme à la création fantastique d’une folle imagination, apparait tout à coup à mon cœur mourant! comment voulez-vous que je ne l’adore pas! laissez-moi passer les derniers jours qui me restent à vous bénir, à vous remercier d’être venue me prouver que je n’étais pas fou.”

“My entire life,” he told me, “has been one long, fervent hankering after an ideal of my own creation. In its eagerness to love, my heart would set itself upon a single quality or virtue of this ideal; but disillusionment, alas, would soon show me my mistake. It is in this manner that my life has been passed; and just as I feel that the end is near, the ideal—which I was compelled to renounce as some strange figment of my wild imagining—has suddenly appeared before my dying heart! How can I help adoring it? Let me spend my last remaining days in blessing you, and thanking you for coming as a proof that I was not mad at all.”

Viardot-Garcia could only respond with sustained kindness and friendship to such a tormented confession. Berlioz’s infatuation was to last through the revision and rehearsal process of Gluck’s *Orphée*, which received its premiere on November 18 of that year.

The impressive interpretation of the singer in the title role soon became legendary.

Admired for the noble virtuosity of her singing and the dignified sublimity of her

---

pantomime, *tout Paris* flocked to the theatre to see her. From 1859 to 1863, Viardot-Garcia would represent the role at least 138 times. As a result of this triumph, new opportunities in the French capital opened up which henceforth had seemed improbable. Apart from several contracts with the Théâtre-Lyrique, the director of l'Opéra, Alphonse Royer, offered a contract from July 1861 to March 1862, to perform new roles which included a transposed version of Gluck’s *Alceste* (*Alceste*), Beethoven’s Leonora (*Fidelio*), Verdi’s Azucena (*Il trovatore*) and Donizetti’s Léonore (*La Favorite*).

Through the final apotheosis of her singing career, Berlioz’s attitude towards his newly found “ideal of the beloved” was a somewhat contradictory mixture of admiration and disapproval. It is not that he did not recognize the superb qualities of her interpretation of Orphée, but because the publicity at the time of the opera’s premiere centered on the singer, he naturally felt cheated out of proper recognition for his arrangement and transposition of the score. He also believed Viardot-Garcia had added ornaments too freely to segments of her arias, and he particularly disliked the widespread attention that her virtuosic cadenza for the aria “Amour, viens rendre à mon âme” received, even though he had encouraged her in the first place to be as inventive as she pleased. When he was asked by Royer to collaborate in the arrangement and

---

564 Ibid., 219.

565 Against Berlioz’s wishes, this cadenza, initially approved by Saint-Saëns and him, was included in the piano and voice version of the arranged opera. See Christoph Willibald Gluck, *Orphée et Euridice*, piano-vocal score (Paris: Léon Escudier, 1859).

566 “Pour la cadence finale du dernier air du premier acte, on peut parfaitement ramener un thème entendu précédemment, comme les instrumentistes virtuoses font dans leurs concertos. . . . On dira, s’il le faut, que c’est le point d’orgue fait par Legros, qui jouait Orphée à Paris quand Gluck y montra son ouvrage. Le Parisien gobera cela parfaitement.” “For the final cadenza of the last aria of the first act, one could perfectly bring back a theme previously heard, as instrumental virtuosos do in their concertos. . . . One can say, if necessary, that this is the cadenza which Legros sang when Gluck presented his work in Paris. A Parisian would gobble this perfectly.”
transposition of *Alceste*, Berlioz refused initially, going back to his characteristic puritanical attitude towards the operatic scores of Gluck. The administration of the Opéra was forced to organize a committee to investigate his claims, which finally reached the conclusion that transpositions and arrangements were a necessity if the title role was to be interpreted by Viardot-Garcia.\(^{567}\) Berlioz eventually yielded and transposed at least six scenes of the opera for the singer around 1860.\(^{568}\) During this affair, the composer’s front to the singer was smooth and genteel, perhaps because at the time, she and her oldest daughter, Louise, were collaborating in the piano reduction of the orchestral score of *Les Troyens*, a labor which Berlioz never recognized publically.\(^{569}\)

When the time finally came to stage the second part of Berlioz’s monumental opera, *Les Troyens à Carthage*—to the great disappointment of Viardot-Garcia—the composer did not choose her for the part of Dido, but a younger singer Anne Charton-Demeur. Perhaps it was for the best, for Viardot-Garcia’s voice in 1863 was already in decline, marked by a bold and ambitious stage career which had lasted twenty-five years.

Despite her numerous personal and professional obligations during the 1850-1863 period, Viardot-Garcia completed several ambitious projects as transcriber, arranger, and

---

\(^{567}\) Waddington, “Berlioz’s Counselor and Physician,” 397.


commentator. The most important of these is her *École classique du chant*. By 1863, fifty piano arrangements of arias by Lully, Handel, Pergolesi, Weber, Mendelssohn, Bach, Mozart, Cherubini, Méhul, Marcello, and Gluck, among others, had been published by J. Hamelle. Each aria was preceded by stylistic and interpretative comments by the singer; the most popular among them were published in different keys and at times included *obbligato* string parts.\(^{570}\) In the early 1850s, Viardot-Garcia also completed arrangements of Spanish songs, often in collaboration with court composer Sebastián Iradier.\(^{571}\) She might have been also working on new vocal arrangements of Chopin’s Mazurkas, as two collections were published in 1864 and 1865. When it comes to original compositions, however, the period is curiously stark. Not a single *romance, Lied* or *mélodie* seems to have been composed during these years.

One single original project—a one-act *opéra-comique* to a libretto written partly by George Sand and based on her own novel *La Mare au diable* (1846)—seems to have attracted Viardot-Garcia’s creative interest.\(^{572}\) Throughout the 1850s, both Sand and Viardot-Garcia thought that a “petit opéra berrichon”\(^{573}\) would be an excellent opportunity to present to the audiences of Paris the transcriptions of folkloric dances and songs which the singer had completed in the region of Berry during the early 1840s. In the summer of 1859, after years of solicitous requests from the singer, Sand finally

---

\(^{570}\) For a full list of arranged compositions in *École classique du chant* see Waddington and Žekulin, 8-15.

\(^{571}\) For an example of Viardot-Garcia’s collaboration with Iradier see chapter 3.


produced a scenario, which would shortly afterwards integrate lyrics written by poet and librettist Gustave Vaëz. Sand’s timing could have not been worst. Despite the singer’s best intentions, she was completely absorbed by her operatic and concertizing obligations from that moment until the family’s move to Baden-Baden in the summer of 1863. Henceforth, Viardot-Garcia found various excuses not to complete the project, culminating in the defensive and apologetic letter written by Louis Viardot on behalf of his wife to Adolphe Joanne, a friend of George Sand, during the summer of 1869:

*Lorsque M. Massé a voulu sur ce même sujet de la Mare au Diable écrire un opéra-comique, Pauline s’est empressée d’offrir à Mad. Sand de lui rendre le poème que celle-ci lui avait confié. Elle est toute prête encore à le lui remettre, si Made. Sand veut le confier à un autre plus compositeur : par exemple, M. Bizet, s’il a pleinement réussi dans la Petite Fadette. Pauline n’en conserva pas moins une vive et constante reconnaissance à sa chère Mignonne, et regrettera de n’avoir même pas osé entreprendre de se faire son égale. C’est ce sentiment de juste défiance d’elle-même qui l’a toujours glacée et paralysée, c’est ce qui l’a privée bien involontairement, d’un honneur et d’une joie qu’elle aurait toujours ambitionnés : d’abriter son nom sous celui de Made. Sand dans une œuvre commune.*

When M. Massé wanted to write an *opéra-comique* on the *Mare au Diable*, Pauline hastened to offer to Mme. Sand the poem which she had entrusted to her. She is still ready to give it to him or to someone who is more of a composer, for example M. Bizet, if he fully succeeds in *La Petite Fadette* and if Mme. Sand so wishes. Pauline will preserve not a less vivid and constant recognition of her dear *Mignonne* and regrets not having dared to make herself her equal. It is this feeling of rightful uncertainty about herself which has frozen and paralyzed her. It is that which has deprived her involuntarily of an honor and joy which she has always ambitioned: to place her name below that of Mme. Sand in a common work.

---

574 Segments of this letter, which had important (and negative) consequences for the reception history of Viardot-Garcia’s compositions during the twentieth century, were discussed in some detail in the introduction of this dissertation.

575 Louis Viardot to Adolphe Joanne, Baden-Baden, June 7, 1869, quoted in Marix-Spire, “Vicissitudes d’un *opéra-comique,*” 139.
Viardot-Garcia’s humble and submissive attitude towards the “masterpiece” of Sand, as described by Louis, does not ring quite true. Particularly in light of the fact that in 1869, she had just completed the six most productive years of her compositional career, creating and staging four French operettas in collaboration with Ivan Turguenev, composing German Lieder to the words of Müller, Pohl, Goethe and Mörike, and publishing three Russian albums of songs, where she did not hesitate to put her name next to those of Lermontov, Kolstoff, Pushkin, Turgenev and Fet. Part of the true motives for the composer’s unwillingness to approach Sand’s scenario are presented in a veiled fashion earlier in the letter:

[T]out récemment, elle a écrit deux ou trois opérettes, sur des paroles françaises. Mais il faut remarquer que ces paroles ont un sens très précis, une situation très spéciale, enfin un caractère très déterminé. . . Je pourrais ajouter que Gustave Vaëz, qui a fait de fort bons vers de poête, ne leur a pas donné toujours des rythmes commodes à la musique, et qu’enfin plusieurs morceaux de poésie n’ont pas été faits, le chœur des laveuses pour l’introduction, etc. . . .

Very recently, she has written two or three operettas, with French words. But one should remark that these words have a very precise sense, [are linked to] a very special situation, in other words, [have] a well-defined character. . . . I could add that Gustave Vaëz, who makes very good verses as a poet, has not always given comfortable rhythms to set to music, and that many of the lyrics were not made, the choir of washing women for the introduction, etc. . . .

Reading through the scenes which George Sand produced in 1859, it is not difficult to understand the challenges of setting to music some of the writer’s vague, sprawling situations. By her own admission, the writer did not understand much about operatic

---

576 Ibid., 138.
The lyrics produced by Vaëz are now lost and therefore their quality cannot be judged. It is very possible that Viardot-Garcia saw the libretto as hopelessly flawed and did not wish to hurt the feelings of her old friend by bringing to the forefront these defects, preferring instead to demean herself through the letter written by her husband.

But possibly in the 1860s, Viardot-Garcia not only found formal inconsistencies in the scenario but also a content which seemed too implausible: After the political and ideological disappointments brought by the failure of the 1848 revolution, its short-lived mess of a republic, and the cynical decadence (and stability) brought by the Second Empire, the pastoral pleasantries of Sand’s *La Mare au diable* must have seemed a bit too distant, faded, and naive. The happy Rousseauian innocence of Sand’s peasants contrasted too strongly with the reality of violence, pettiness and ignorance witnessed by the writer in Paris and Berry during the darkest hours of the Second Republic. In her preface to *La Petite Fadette*, written in Nohant on December 21, 1851, Sand tried to justify the gap between her new pastoral aesthetics and the political and social transformation of France in the following terms:

---

577 “Je ne sais pas du tout faire d’opéras, mais je me ferai aider pour la forme par quelqu’un de compétent . . .”/ “I do not know how to make an opera at all, but for the form, I will seek aid from someone competent . . .” George Sand to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Nohant, May 21, 1859, in Ibid., 131.
Preaching unity to men who are cutting one another’s throats, is crying to the wilderness. There are times when souls are so agitated that they are deaf to every direct appeal. Since those June days of which present events are the inevitable consequence, the author of the story that you are going to read has undertaken the task of being amiable though he should die of chagrin. . . . He knows that he has given pleasure to those who love that strain, and that to give pleasure to them that suffer from the same ill as he, in knowing the horror of hate and of revenge, is to do them all the good that they can receive: very fleeting, and passing relief, it is true, but more real than a passionate declamation, and more impressive than a classical demonstration.  

Sand did not consider this as artistic escapism. Despite her momentary chagrin, to the end of her life, she was willing to imagine an enlightened peuple, above political pettiness and cruelty, who would eventually bring about her utopian socialist state. The pastoral novels written during the late 1840s and early 1850s are a tribute to that ideal, but if Sand was willing to sustain her illusion after witnessing and participating in the violent transformation of France from republic to empire, many other contemporary artists and writers quickly gravitated away from the Saint-Simonian principles which had motivated her. Théophile Gautier, who had feverishly followed the social and political developments of the 1848 Revolution, would embrace a bourgeois lifestyle in the following decade and take refuge in the notion of “l’art pour l’art.” In his aesthetic universe, art became a subjective, individual experience which did not need to justify itself by its moralizing or didactic value. Baudelaire’s political ideals were also victimized by the Revolution and its consequences. Fighting with almost suicidal fervor during the July days, his dreams of social and artistic renewal crashed down after Louis-
Napoléon Bonaparte inflicted upon his own presidency a theatrical *coup d’État*. To the Republican lawyer Arcelle he declared:

*Le 2 Décembre m’a physiquement dépolitiqué. Il n’y a plus d’idées générales. Que tout Paris soit orléaniste, c’est un fait, mais cela ne me regarde pas. Si j’avais voté, je n’aurais pu voter que pour moi. Peut-être l’avenir appartient-il aux hommes déclassés?*  

December 2 has physically depoliticized me. There are no longer general principles, that all Paris is Orleanist is a fact, but that does not concern me. If I would have voted, I could have only voted for myself. Perhaps the future belongs to the outcasts?

Like Baudelaire, some artists and writers managed to escape the political witch-hunt which followed the coronation of the emperor and sent Republican *anti-coup* figures like Victor Hugo into an exile lasting almost twenty years. These fortunate artists, however, were marked by the new social and political order as extremists, dangerous elements which should not be promoted. Retreat into an inner universe of sensation and creation seemed the only escape from an ungrateful French public. This was the case with Viardot-Garcia and her husband.

The singer was aware of the Sand’s depression and bafflement as her Republican dreams came tumbling down. She also witnessed how her husband’s political involvement in the 1848 Revolution resulted in the family’s unofficial ostracized position during the initial years of the Empire. In a letter to Julius Rietz, she communicated these thoughts and her dislike for the new artistic taste of the Parisians:

---


. . . In Paris it is impossible for me to do anything satisfactory—I should have to sing bad music prettily (I hate prettiness in art) and do other things that honorable women ought not to do. Ah, dearest friend, you have no idea of the baseness which rules here now and in every sphere of public life—I cannot see it without feeling heavy at heart. Nearly all the women singers are courtesans. Paris is no place for me. —We live a very quiet life—that suits me exactly. My husband, who is a Republican, as you know, will have nothing to do with the present régime, and of course has no intercourse with its leaders. Everything is accomplished now through protection but woe to him who must beg for it! He must usually purchase this necessary exalted favor with his honour. God be praised, we do not need it; we have never debased our freedom, soiled our honor.\(^{581}\)

Exile, disappointment, and isolation, these were the rewards attained by those artists and writers who attempted to transform France in 1848. Thus seems to have ended Viardot-Garcia’s career as Consuelo, high musical priestess of Sand’s program for social regeneration. It was not that she and her husband did not want to uphold their Republican ideals; more likely, they had experienced enough of political reality to understand the personal sacrifices and limited results that such idealism entailed. Viardot-Garcia was not a young girl anymore; she could admire all the virtues of George Sand and yet recognize

the shortcomings of her utopian vision for herself and for the moral and spiritual
elevation of France. A demanding career had also taught her the importance of strictly
upholding, before any other social, political, or economic ideal, her creative mission as an
individual artist. In her correspondence, she shared these self-centered thoughts more
readily with Ivan Turgenev and Julius Rietz than with George Sand.

Shortly before the 1848 Revolution, for example, the Russian writer commented
in bitter disappointment to the singer how hateful and puny modern artistic
manifestations seemed to him and how he longed for literary and musical works which
could clearly reflect social and cultural ideologies:

\[
Tandis que dans le temps de crise et de transition où nous
vivons, toutes les œuvres artistiques ou littéraires ne représentent
tout au plus que les opinions, les sentiments individuels, les
réflexions confuses et contradictoires, l'éclectisme de leurs auteurs ;
la vie s'est éparpillée; il n'y a plus de grand mouvement général.\]

582

Despite the times of crisis and transition that we are living through,
all artistic or literary works represent nothing more than individual
opinions and feelings, the confused and contradictory reflections and
the eclecticism of their authors; life has been scattered, there is no
longer a grand general movement.

A few months after the presidential election of Louis-Napoléon, however, his vision
seems to have altered radically. Now individual artistry was directly correlated to the
principle of Beauty:

\[\text{Ivan Turgenev to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Courtavenel, December 25, 1847, in Ivan}
\text{Turgenev, Lettres à Madame Viardot, ed. Halpérine-Kaminsky (Paris: Charpentier, 1907), 30.}\]
Vous me demandez en quoi réside le «Beau». Si en dépit des ravages du temps qui détruisent la forme sous laquelle il se manifeste, il est toujours là . . . C’est que le Beau est la seule chose qui soit immortelle, et qu’aussi longtemps qu’il reste un vestige de sa manifestation matérielle, son immortalité subsiste. Le Beau est répandu partout, il s’étend même jusque sur la mort. Mais il ne rayonne nulle part avec autant d’intensité que dans l’individualité humaine; c’est là qu’il parle le plus à l’intelligence.  

You have asked where Beauty can be found and, if despite the ravages of time which destroy the form in which it resides, it is always there. . . . Beauty is the only thing which is immortal and as long as a trace of its physical manifestation subsists, its immortality persists. Beauty presents itself everywhere, it extends even beyond death. But nowhere does it radiate with more intensity than in human individuality; it is there where it speaks most profoundly to intelligence.

The individual artist’s quest for beauty and truth was the creative credo of Viardot-Garcia and her circle during the 1850s. Her musical salon, where the works of J. S. Bach, Schubert, Weber, Mozart, Gluck, Mendelssohn, and Beethoven were often interpreted, became a refuge from the debased tastes of the era for writers such as Flaubert and Dickens and musicians such as Berlioz, Gounod and Rossini. Saint-Saëns gives us a glimpse of the quasi-religious revelations which took place in the “temple dedicated to music” at 48 rue de Douai:

583 Ivan Turgenev to Pauline Viardot-Garcia, Tourguenevo, September 9, 1850, in Ibid., 137.

One fine day the annual volume [of the Bach Gesellschaft] was found to contain a cantata in several parts written for a contralto solo accompanied by stringed instruments, oboes and an organ obbligato. The organ was there and the organist as well. So we assembled the instruments, Stockhausen, the baritone, was made the leader of the little orchestra, and Madame Viardot sang the cantata. I suspect that the author had never heard his work sung in any such manner. I cherish the memory of that day as one of the most precious in my musical career. My mother and M. Viardot were the only listeners to this exceptional exhibition. We did not dare to repeat it before hearers who were not ready for it. What would now be a great success would have fallen flat at that time. And nothing is more irritating than to see an audience cold before a beautiful work. It is far better to keep to oneself treasures which will be unappreciated.585

Those deemed deserving enough were eventually guided by Viardot-Garcia into a shrine room where she kept Mozart’s autograph score of Don Giovanni—which she had acquired in London in 1855—in a custom-built ornate box.586 Finally, the Viardots self-imposed exile in 1863 from Paris to Baden-Baden—considered in the nineteenth century as an oasis of natural beauty and graceful society—can be construed as an escape into an aesthetic universe. Here political disappointment could be left behind and full dedication to art and beauty could be attained.


586 “The autograph . . . was associated with a number of ritualistic discourses comparable with very few such documents before or since. Pauline Viardot preserved the document in an artefact that was as close in construction to a reliquary that its nature would allow, and treated it as a shrine. Its position was described with great pride by Viardot in her correspondence, and visitors to her homes in Paris and Baden-Baden behaved exactly as if they were in the presence of a relic: Rossini genuflected and Tchaikovsky claimed to have been in the presence of divinity. The autograph, coupled to its surrounding ritualistic discourses, was elevated to the status of a national monument when it was displayed at the Exposition Universelle of 1878, and at the anniversary exhibition of Don Giovanni’s premiere in 1887. When it was donated to the library of the Conservatoire in 1892 (announced as early as 1889) its sacred and national characteristics were elided. By this time, the autograph of Don Giovanni had contributed substantially to the ongoing nineteenth-century project of enshrining Mozart.” Mark Everist, “Enshrining Mozart: Don Giovanni and the Viardot Circle,” 19th-Century Music 25, no. 2, 165.
Taking this context into consideration, the inability of Viardot-Garcia to compose an *opéra-comique* to a scenario based on Sand’s *La Mare au diable*—a work which documents folkloric costumes of the Berry peasants in idealized physical and psychic planes where spiritual, mental and social transformation remain attainable—becomes clearer. If this *opéra-comique* is to be understood as the culminating opus of Viardot-Garcia under the guise of Sand’s Consuelo, it is logical that all efforts to create it—after the political and social disappointments brought by the 1851 *coup d’état*, were abortive—despite the singer’s best intentions. Putting aside all practical considerations (i.e. Sand’s difficulties in creating the scenario, the libretto’s formal defects and limitations, and the unlikelihood of a work by Sand and Viardot-Garcia being premiered at any Parisian theatre during the first repressive years of the Second Empire), the shock waves of the political transformation of France must have forced Viardot-Garcia to seriously question, consciously or unconsciously, the viability of her adopted identity as Sand’s “priestess of the ideal music” and all her compositions created behind that mask. Furthermore, it is also possible to link the creative blockage which she experienced from 1850 to 1863 to this identity crisis.

As was explained in chapter 6, in many of the songs of Viardot-Garcia’s second song album, a search for expressive authenticity through the simplification of rhythmic, melodic, and/or harmonic resources often coexists with a sophisticated command of the composition’s overall form and many of its musical details. In the compositional quest to achieve a balance between the simplicity of popular music and the sophistication of art song, Viardot-Garcia could have sought to recreate the pure, naive, and brilliant

---

587 See Brigitte Lane, “Voyage et initiation dans la Mare au Diable,” *Études françaises* 24, no. 1 (1988), 71-83.
inventions of Consuelo, a music which could reflect the sensibility of the people, speaking directly into their hearts but also elevating them spiritually and preparing them for the social and political reconstruction of France. These derivative villanelles, sicilianas, tarantellas, and cañas, however, had their artistic and musical limitations and Viardot-Garcia may have well exhausted their line of creative development, running into an aesthetic conundrum as composer in the 1850s. The conundrum was further complicated by the disappearance after 1851 of the ideological motivation which justified the creation of such music. If Consuelo was no more than the utopian invention of Sand and the singing voices and souls of her beloved peuple could be so easily tainted with blood, ignobility, and ignorance, what was the virtue of recreating their music?

One eventual escape from this dilemma was to turn one’s attention fully to music itself and disassociate from its supposed social significance. The study of the discipline of music, with the beauty and history of its own inner laws, seems to have obsessed Viardot-Garcia during the 1850s. Her numerous arrangements of arias from the Baroque and Classical eras, her study and interpretation of the scores of Bach, Gluck, and Beethoven, and her enshrinement of Mozart’s music are all indicative of her search at the time for a new, truer line of creative development.

The fact that shortly after she immigrated to Baden-Baden in 1863 she began to compose once again further supports this theory. Leaving behind the physical and psychic epicenter of her creative/ideological quandary allowed her to reestablish full contact with her compositional gifts and opened new lines of artistic growth. Only one year after her arrival to the spa town, she published her Dvenadtsat’ stikhotvorenii
Pushkina, Feta I Turgeneva, arguably her most original and powerful compilation. This collection of twelve songs, published with both Russian and German lyrics, contains settings of highly personal and passionate poems by Pushkin (e.g. “Tsvetok”/“Das Blümlein”, “Das kholmakh Gruzii”/“Auf Grusien’s Hügeln”, and “Zaklinaniye”/“Die Beschwörung”), Fet (e.g. “Tikhaya zvëndnaya noch”/“Ruhige, heilige nacht!”, “Dve rozy”/“Zwei Rosen” and “Zvëzdy”/“Die Sterne”) and Turgenev (e.g. “Sinista”/“Die Meise”). The maturity and quality of these songs is stunning, particularly in light of the fact that Viardot-Garcia had not composed an original work in almost thirteen years.

Various musicologists have compared the musical language of these songs to that of Brahms and Wagner and have offered them, in their French translation from 1866, as examples of full-blown mélodies next to those of those of Chausson, Franck, and Duparc. Once the doors of the creative dam had been released, numerous ambitious works were composed in quick succession, including four chamber operettas, several albums of Russian songs, and about fifteen Lieder. In fact, the Baden-Baden years represent a distinct second period in Viardot-Garcia’s compositional career, although many scholars and performers remain under the erroneous impression that these works,


some of them truly accomplished masterpieces of German and Russian song, were the initial creative efforts of a woman in her forties.

Despite the research advances of the last forty years, the early vocal compositions of Viardot-Garcia remain a sort of odd curiosity among researchers and performers. It is widely assumed that Viardot-Garcia did not fully adopt her role as a composer until her singing career was over and she began collaborating in the Russian albums and French operettas with writer Ivan Turgenev. Although the singer did become much more prolific in the 1860s, as we have seen in the course of the present dissertation, she had been composing since her early teens. Should Viardot-Garcia’s initial songs continue to be ignored by the musical community?

From the perspective of the present study, this would be unfortunate. For the creation of Viardot-Garcia’s earliest vocal compositions coincides precisely with the moment which specialized scholars such as Fits Noske and David Tunley have identified as critical in the formation of a new, more flexible style of French song, leading eventually into the mélodies of composers such as Duparc, Chausson and Fauré. Like other influential composers of French art song in the late 1830s and 1840s, such as Niedermeyer, Monpou, and Berlioz, Viardot-Garcia produced highly successful settings inspired by German Lieder, Romantic poetry, and popular music. Supple formats, expanded and adventuresome harmonic progressions, sophisticated accompaniments, excellent prosody, and exceptional musical characterization can be found in compositions of this period such as “Die Kapelle,” PVG.s.0.1.g, “L’Enfant de la montagne,” PVG.s.I.1, “L’Abricotier,” PVG.s.I.3, “L’Ombre et le jour,” PVG.s.I.7, “L’Absence,” PVG.s.II.3, “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.4, and “Le Savetier et le financier,” PVG.s.XVI.6. Furthermore,
Viardot-Garcia’s fame as a singer and adopted identity as the gifted, exotic Other contributed in large measure to extend the reputation of this repertoire among contemporaries. Writers and composers such as Sand, Chopin, Adam, Liszt, Berlioz, Turgenev, Schumann, Saint-Saëns, Chorley, and Blanchard left enthusiastic published and unpublished accounts of their reactions to these songs.

Through the publication and promotion of her two earliest song albums, Viardot-Garcia contributed to the raising of expectations surrounding the typical French *romance* of the 1840s. She modernized its style, introduced into it foreign musical resources, and liberated it from the formal regularity and musical weakness which had staled its expressive possibilities until then. The quality of these publications in combination with her international fame pushed Viardot-Garcia into the vanguard of the revitalization tendency of French art song. Just as Berlioz and Gounod have been commonly embraced from the time of Ravel to our days as the “fathers” of French *mélodie*, Viardot-Garcia, who had no true female competitor in the 1840s, may now finally receive her own accolade as the “mother” of French *mélodie*. Until now, the singer’s earliest compositions have remained a buried treasure. It is my hope that the present dissertation will in some measure contribute to restoring Viardot-Garcia’s rightful historical position as an influential and original composer of European art song.

---


593 Future projects which I plan to develop as a result of the present investigation include a critical edition of Viardot-Garcia’s original songs and a study of select Russian, German, and French albums published after 1863.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS AND ARTICLES


______. “Soirée musicale de M. Chopin,” *Revue et gazette musicale* 9, no. 9 (February 27, 1841): 82-3.


Davison, James W. “Royal Italian Opera.” The Times (Wednesday, July 25, 1849).


ELECTRONIC RESOURCES


THESES AND DISSERTATIONS


RECORDINGS


UNPUBLISHED LETTERS AND MUSICAL MANUSCRIPTS


______. Notebook. AMs with AMs corrections and revisions, bound in 3/4 black calf with marbled boards, entries from both ends. Item 60 in Pauline Viardot-Garcia Papers (MS Mus 232). Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA.


PUBLISHED SCORES


______, ed. École classique de chant. Collection de morceaux choisis dans les chefs
do’œuvre des plus grands maîtres classiques italiens, allemands, et français, avec
le style, l’accentuation, le phrasé et les nuances propres à l’interprétation

_____. “La Jeune République.” Paris: Launer, Brandus, Troupenas and Meissonnier,
1848.


_____. Night is falling, Canzonetta. New York: Schirmer, c. 1942.


______. Six mélodies pour une voix, suivies d’un duo pour deux voix. Paris: J. Hamelle,
1890.


______. Une heure d’étude. Excercises pour voix de femme, écrits pour ses élèves par
Mme Pauline Viardot. Adoptés au Conservatoire national de musique, 2 vols.
APPENDIX A

Published Songs and Song Collections
by Pauline Viardot-Garcia. (1838-1910)
## Appendix A

### Published Songs and Song Collections

1 by Pauline Viardot-Garcia. (1838-1910)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Song #</th>
<th>1st Pub.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“L’Hirondelle et le Prissonier” (G. de Saint-Maur)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1841</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Album de Mme. Viardot-Garcia</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Auf die Rose”</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1843?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. 10 mélodies par Pauline Viardot</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1849</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Die Klagende” (Dilia Helena)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. 12 stikhotvoreniy Pushkina; Feta I Turgeneva/</td>
<td>Russian/German</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1864</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zwölf Gedichte von Pushkin, Feth, und Turgeneff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Desyat’ stikhotvoreniy Pushkina, Lermontova, Kol’tsova/</td>
<td>Russian/German</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zehn Gedichte von Pushkin, Lermontoff, Kolzoff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Die Sterne” (M. Lermontov)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Frühlingslied” (C. W. Müller)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1866</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Pyat’ stikhotvoreniy Lermantova i Turgeneva</td>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Dva romansa na slova Géte I Ye. Tyurkasti</td>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1869</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Der Gärtnere” (E. Mörike)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“In der Frühe” (E. Mörike)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Nixe Binsefuß” (E. Mörike)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Das ist ein schlechtes Wetter” (H. Heine)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1870</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 In the present list, I only include the titles of those songs, which were originally published individually and later not included in song albums. Also, original album songs later translated and/or re published in another collection are not taken into account twice in the “Song #” column. These adjustments allow for a more accurate tally of Viardot-Garcia’s output of published original songs.

2 While I have assigned Roman numerals to Viardot-Garcia’s song collections, individual songs are indented and receive no number. The table is largely derived from Waddington and Žekulin’s online catalogue.

3 This song was published as Item 16 in Das singende Deutschland. Album der ausgewähltesten Lieder und Romanzen [für eine Singstimme] mit Begleitung des Pianoforte, ed. Philipp Reclam (Leipzig: 1843?). See Waddington and Žekulin, 4.

4 A year after the publication of this album, Douze mélodies sur des poésies russes de Feth, Pouchkine, Tourgueneff, Lermontoff et Kolstoff (Paris : E. Gérard, 1866) appeared in France. This collection combined and translated songs included in the first two Russian/German albums published in 1864 and 1865.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Languagee</th>
<th>Song #</th>
<th>1st Pub.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Räths” (Richard Pohl)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Shest’ stikhovoreniy G.Geyne, E. Mërike i R. Polya(^5)</td>
<td>Russian/German</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1871</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Pyat’ stikhovoreniy Gëte, Pushkina, Mërike,Geybeyla i Polya</td>
<td>Russian/German</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Six mélodies et une havanais varie à deux voix</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Vier Lieder (J. W. Goethe, E. Mörike, and R. Pohl)</td>
<td>German</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. Stikhovoreniya Geybelya, [Geyne], Gëte, Kol’tsova,</td>
<td>Russian/Some Italian</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lermontova, Mërike, Polya, Pushkina, Turgeneva, Tyurketi,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyutcheva i Feta</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII. Six mélodies (Second Series)(^7)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Désespoir” (L. Pomey)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Lamento” (Th. Gautier)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Mignonne” (P. de Ronsard)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII. Six chansons du XVe siècle(^8)</td>
<td>Old French/French</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV. Six mélodies (Third Series)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Scene d’Hermione” (J. Racine)(^9)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“La Marquise” (M. Vaucaire)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Ressemblance” (S. Prudhomme)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1889</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^5\) This collection included several of the German songs published the previous year by Robert Seitz in Weimar.

\(^6\) For this collection editor A. F. Iogansen assembled all the songs previously published by him and added two translated songs from *Six mélodies et une havanais variée à deux voix* (Paris : Heugel & fils., 1880). Additionally he translated and published three never before released *Canti popolari toscani* and four new songs with poetry by Pushkin. See Waddington and Žekulin, 43.

\(^7\) Three of the songs in this collection were previously published in the 1870s in Russia and Germany. See Ibid., 44.

\(^8\) The lyrics for this collection were extracted from *Chansons du XVe siècle, publiées d’après le manuscrit de la Bibliothèque nationale de Paris par Gaston Paris et accompagnées de la musique transcrète en notation moderne par Auguste Gevaert* (Paris: Firmin-Didot et Cie, 1875). See Ibid., 45-6.

\(^9\) Lyrics extracted from Racine’s tragedy, *Andromaque.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Language(s)</th>
<th>Song #</th>
<th>1st Pub.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Le Rêve de Jésus”(^{10})</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV. <em>Six mélodies pour une voix, suivies d’un duo pour deux voix</em></td>
<td>French</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Parme” (S. Prudhomme)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Grands oiseaux blancs” (L. Pomey)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Les Attraits” (Eighteenth century poem)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Rossignol, rossignolet” (J. Boulmier)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Trois jours de vendange” (A. Daudet)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Chanson de mer” (S. Prudhomme)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Bonjour mon cœur” (P. de Ronsard)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“La Nuit” (L. Pomey)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Au jardin de mon père” (Fifteenth century poem)</td>
<td>Old French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Chanson de la pluie” (I. Turgenev)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Ave Maria”</td>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1901</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XVI. <em>Mélodies</em> (V. Hugo, S. Prudhomme, La Fontaine)</td>
<td>French/Old French/Italian</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1904</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Canzone d’amore” (Tuscan poetry)</td>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“En douleur et tristesse” (Fifteenth century poem)</td>
<td>Old French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Liberté!” <em>Chanson de page</em> (S. Bordèse)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Berceuse” (S. Bordèse)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>c. 1910</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDIX B

Published Vocal Arrangements and Transcriptions
by Pauline Viardot-Garcia
(1844-1910)
## Appendix B
### Published Vocal Arrangements and Transcriptions by Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1844-1910)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Song #</th>
<th>1st Pub.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“La Leçon”</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. <em>Lyubimyye ispanshiye romansy</em> [Spanish Songs]</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. <em>École classique du chant</em></td>
<td>Italian/German/French</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>1861?–1891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. <em>Six mazourkes de Frédéric Chopin</em>, Series I</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1864</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. <em>Six mazourkes de Frédéric Chopin</em>, Series II</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. <em>Cinquante mélodies de Franz Schubert</em></td>
<td>German/French</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. <em>Chansons espagnoles de Manuel García, père</em></td>
<td>French/Spanish</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. <em>Trois valses de Franz Schubert</em></td>
<td>French</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“La Jota [de los estudiantes]”/ “Sérénade des étudiants”</td>
<td>French/Spanish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1876</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. <em>Canti popolari toscani/Narodnyye toskanskiye pesni</em></td>
<td>Italian-Russian</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1878</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canzonetta de concert tirée du 17ème quatour de Haydn</td>
<td>Italian/French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Akh! My gornykh kazachek”</td>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. <em>Six airs italiens du XVIIIe siècle</em></td>
<td>Italian/French</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Les Bohémiennes” (Words by Victor Wilder)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1886</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11 Individual arrangements and transcriptions are indented and receive no Roman number in this table, which is directly derived from Waddington and Žekulin’s online catalogue.

12 A popular Spanish song arranged as a duet by Viardot-Garcia.

13 This album was later translated and published in Germany by Breitkopf & Hartel (1879) and France by E. Gérard (1880). The lyrics for all of Viardot-Garcia’s *Canti Popolari Toscani* were extracted from Giuseppe Tigri’s collection of the same title (Florence: 1856), see Waddington and Žekulin, 40.


15 “All but no. 5 in this set are arrangements of pieces contained in a bound volume given to Pauline Viardot by Fortunato Santini in 1840, and which is now at the Hargrove Music Library, Berkeley.” Ibid., 46.

16 An arrangement of Brahms’ Hungarian Dance, No. 6
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Song #</th>
<th>1st Pub.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Les Cavaliers”¹⁷ (Words by L. Pomey)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1886?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. <em>Mélodies populaires des provinces de France</em></td>
<td>French</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1887</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“La Fiancée”¹⁸ (Words by L. Pomey)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI. <em>Mazourkas</em>¹⁹</td>
<td>Polish/French</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Ta chevelure”²⁰ (French words by Des Louÿs)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1905</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Chanson hongroise” (French trans. L. Pomey)</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1910</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹⁷ An arrangement of Brahms’ Hungarian Dance, No. 7.


¹⁹ This collection included the twelve previously published arrangements of Chopin’s mazurkas (1864 and 1865) as well three new arrangements of Op. 7, No. 3, Op. 17, No. 1, and Op. 59, No. 1. For further details see Ibid., 42.

²⁰ An arrangement of a popular Neapolitan song.
APPENDIX C

Catalogue Raisonné:
Published Song Collections, Songs and Arrangements
by Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1838-1850)
Appendix C

Reasoned Catalogue: Published Song Collections, Songs and Arrangements of Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1838-1850)

For this mini-catalogue of Viardot-Garcia’s early songs, vocal transcriptions and manuscripts, I have devised the following identification system: Three initial capital letters, “PVG” stand for the full name of the composer. After a dot, these are followed by the letters “s,” “a,” or “t,” which stand for song, arrangement or transcription.

In the case of songs published within an album, the Roman numeral following the letter “s” refers to the collection’s chronological sequence of publication. The final Arabic number refers to a song’s placement within a particular collection. Thus PVG.s.II.8 indicates that “Marie et Julie” was published in the second collection of the composer (published in 1849) and occupies the eighth place within it.

For songs published individually, the letter “s” is followed by a “0.” An Arabic number then ensues, which refers to the placement of the song within the chorological sequence of publication for this category. The letters “f,” “g,” “r,” “i,” or “s” after the Arabic number represent the language of the song, French, German, Russian, Italian or Spanish respectively. The song “Die Capelle”, which was initially published in Germany in 1838, for example, has the following identification figure, PVG.s.0.1.g. The song was later translated and published in France within the composer’s first musical album, hence PVG.s.0.1.g = PVG.s.I.2.

Manuscripts and fragments do not receive an identification figure in my system, but retain the catalogue number assigned by their particular library, which is, of course, not chronological. The autograph manuscript “Seliger Tod” in Harvard Houghton’s Library is identified as bMS Mus 232, Item 60, [6.]. This will allow for easy retrieval of archival material by future investigators. A table of manuscripts composed between 1838 and 1850 can be found in appendix F.
Although cumbersome, my identification system intends to be both precise and flexible. It is my hopes that it can be applied in the near future to the entire chronological catalogue of Viardot-Garcia’s instrumental and vocal compositions.\textsuperscript{21}

\textsuperscript{21} Chamber instrumental works could be identified with the letters “ch”, operettas with the letters “o”, piano works with “p”, etc. Thus Pauline’s first chamber operetta from 1867 \textit{Trop de femmes} would be identified as PVG.o.1.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>DEDICATEE</th>
<th>KEY(S)</th>
<th>VOCAL RANGE</th>
<th>TEMPO</th>
<th>METER</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>PVG.s.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. "L’Enfant de la montagne" / Ballade  
"Je suis l’enfant de la montagne" | 1838 ? rev. 1839 | trans. of L. Uhland by Emilien Pacini | Mme. George Sand | D Major | A→g♭⁴ Allegro con brio \( \downarrow = 126 \) | 6 8 | Originally published in *La France musicale*, 1839? | 1.1= 0.2.akhir |
| 2. "La Chapelle" / Ballade  
"À-haut se voit la chapelle" | June 1838 | trans. of L. Uhland | Mr. Ary Schefler | A-flat Major | ab→g⁰ Andantino \( \downarrow = 92 \) | 2 4 | Originally published individually in German Leipzig: Musical Supplement, *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* III (September 1838)  
AMs in Houghton Library, Harvard University  
MS Mus 232, Item 60, [6.] | 1.2= 0.1.git |
| 3. "L’Abricotier" / Chanson servienne  
"Un ruisseau coule et murmure" | ca. 1840/41 | ? | Mme. Echengue Garcia | A Major | c♯⁴→a² Allegretto \( \downarrow = 120 \) | 2 4 | Published in German translation:  
(Mainz: Schott, 1845?)  
(Leipzig: C. F. Leede)  
(Vienna: H. F. Müller)  
Published in Russian:  
"Abrikosovo drevo"  
(St. Petersburg: V. Bessel, n.d.) | 1.3 |
| 4. “Adieux les beaux jours” / Romance  
  "Déjà la tendre fleur" | 1838 or before | ? | M. Auber | A Minor | d→g♯ | Andantino | 3 | 8 | AMs in Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5875  
  AMs in Houghton Library, Harvard University  
  MS Mus 232, item 60, [6.] | I.4 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 5. “L’Exilé polonais” / Couplets  
  "Fouleant des chefs" | ca. 1840/41 | ? | M. I. Geraldy | E-flat Major | bb→bb♯ | Allegro maestoso | 3 | 4 | AMs in Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5878 | I.5 |
  "Oh ! ma mère, entends cette voix" | ca. 1840/41 | ? | Mme. E. Troupenas | E Major | b→f♯ | Andantino | 6 | 8 | AMs in Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5879 | I.6 |
| 7. “L’Ombre et le jour” / Mélodie  
  "Vois-tu la nuit" | 1840/41 | Edouard Turquety  
  Mme. La Comtesse di Essex | B-flat Major | e→f | Andantino | 3 | 4 | AMs in Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5879 | I.7 |
| 8. “Le Chêne et le roseau” / Fable  
  "Le chêne, un jour" | 1841 | La Fontaine  
  Louis Viardot | D Major | a→f♯ | Allegro Moderato | 3 | 4 | Published also:  
  (Paris: Schott, n.d.) | I.8 |
L’ALBUM VIARDOT DE 1850²
(Paris: Brandus et Cie., 1849)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>DEDICATEE</th>
<th>KEY(S)</th>
<th>VOCAL RANGE</th>
<th>TEMPO</th>
<th>METER</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. “Solitude” / ‘La primevère mourante’</td>
<td>before 1843</td>
<td>Edouard Turquet</td>
<td>Lady Th. Monson</td>
<td>G Minor</td>
<td>d₁→f²</td>
<td>Andantino</td>
<td>6 8</td>
<td>Published also as “La Solitude” (Paris: L’Illustration, March 4, 1843)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. “L’Absence” / Caña Española / ‘Aux longs tourments de l’absence’ / ‘Si de tu ausencia no muero’</td>
<td>1844</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Mr. G. Meyerbeer</td>
<td>G Minor</td>
<td>e₁→f²</td>
<td>Andantino</td>
<td>3 4</td>
<td>Initially only Spanish words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. “Un Jour de printemps” / Caprice / ‘La légère fleur tremble sur sa tige’</td>
<td>before 1843</td>
<td>Edouard Turquet</td>
<td>Mr. Le Comte Matthew Wielhorski</td>
<td>G Major</td>
<td>d₁→e²</td>
<td>Allegretto</td>
<td>3 4</td>
<td>Published also as “Une fleur” (Paris: L’Illustration, March 4, 1843) AMs in old collection of Philip M. Neufeld, auctioned at Christie’s, NY, Sale 8144, lot 220 (1995)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² The songs in this collection were republished together with those of Collection I in Mélodies de Mme. Pauline Viardot (Paris: E. Gérard et Cie., 1861). The eighteen songs in this collection were ordered alphabetically. In the 1861 edition, the title of “Marie et Julie” was changed to “Marte et Louise”.

491
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Librettist</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Andante/Allegretto</th>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>Additional Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>&quot;Villanelle&quot; ('Voici vent sur la pelouse')</td>
<td>1840s</td>
<td>Edouard Turquety</td>
<td>C Minor</td>
<td>g→f2</td>
<td>Allegretto</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4 AMs at Houghton Library, Harvard U., Ms Mus 232, item 60 [20. and 21]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>&quot;La Chanson de Lore&quot; ('Dès que la grive est éveillée')</td>
<td>1840s</td>
<td>Auguste Brizeux</td>
<td>D Minor</td>
<td>g→f7</td>
<td>Allegretto</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8 AMs at Houghton Library, Harvard U., Ms Mus 232, item 60 [14. And 15.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>&quot;Marie et Julie&quot; ('Les lys sont bien charmants')</td>
<td>After 1842</td>
<td>Gustave de Lareaudière</td>
<td>F Major</td>
<td>d1→f0</td>
<td>Andantino mosso</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8 For tenor Ams at Houghton Library, Harvard U., Ms Mus 232, item 60 [14. And 15.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>&quot;La Luciole&quot; ('Voyez la luciole')</td>
<td>1840s</td>
<td>Mme. Ugalde</td>
<td>C Major</td>
<td>d1→a2</td>
<td>Allegretto vivace</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8 AMs in private collection in Paris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>&quot;Tarentelle&quot; ('Dansez, pêcheur napolitain')</td>
<td>1840s</td>
<td>Mme. Antonia Léonard</td>
<td>C Minor</td>
<td>g→f</td>
<td>Allegro vivace</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8 AMs in private collection Reproduced in Revue de musicologie 87, no. 1, 2001, 42.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</td>
<td>DATE</td>
<td>POET</td>
<td>DEDICATEE</td>
<td>KEY</td>
<td>VOCAL RANGE</td>
<td>TEMPO</td>
<td>METER</td>
<td>EDITORIAL HOUSE, DATE AND NOTES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Die Capelle”</td>
<td>1838</td>
<td>trans. of L. Uhland</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>A-flat Major</td>
<td>a♭→g²</td>
<td>Andantino</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“L’Enfant de la montagne”</td>
<td>1838</td>
<td>trans. of L. Uhland</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>D Major</td>
<td>a→g²</td>
<td>Allegro con brio</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“L’Hirondelle et le prisonnier”</td>
<td>1839 or 1840</td>
<td>Based on a poem by Hector-Grégoire de Saint-Maur</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>C Major</td>
<td>c→g²</td>
<td>Andantino</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Une fleur”</td>
<td>before 1843</td>
<td>Edouard Turquet</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>G Major</td>
<td>d’→e²</td>
<td>Allegretto</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Published as “Un jour de printemps” in * Dix mélodies par Pauline Viardot* (Paris: Brandus & Cie., 1849)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Composer</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Movement</th>
<th>Additional Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Auf die Rose&quot;</td>
<td>1841 or</td>
<td>Anacreon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Not available for this study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'La primavère mourante'</td>
<td>before</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Published in <em>Das singende Deutschland. Album der ausgewähltesten Lieder und Romanzen</em>, 1843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;La Solitude&quot;</td>
<td>1845 or</td>
<td>Edouard Turquet</td>
<td></td>
<td>G Minor</td>
<td>Andantino</td>
<td>6 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'La primavère mourante'</td>
<td>before</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Also published in <em>Dix mélodies par Pauline Viardot</em> (Paris: Brandus &amp; Cie., 1849)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;La Jeune république&quot;</td>
<td>1848</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Bb</td>
<td>d₁→g²</td>
<td>Mouvement du marche</td>
<td>Hymn for voice and choir (Paris: Launer, Trupenas, Brandus, and Meissonnier, 1848)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</td>
<td>DATE</td>
<td>POET</td>
<td>DEDICATEE</td>
<td>KEY</td>
<td>VOCAL RANGE</td>
<td>TEMPO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>.“La Leçon” / Tyrolienne</td>
<td>Before 1844</td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PVG. a.1.f/g
APPENDIX D

Lost Songs and Arrangements by Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1838-1850)
### Appendix D
Lost Songs and Arrangements by Pauline Viardot-Garcia (1838-1850)²²

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Unpublished arrangements of French folk songs | Performed by her and close colleagues  
Possible sources:  
1) Théophile Dumersan, *Chants et Chansons populaires de la France* (Paris: 1843)  
2) *Chansons nationales et populaires de la France* (1847) | 1840s and 1850s |
| Transcriptions and arrangements of Mexican and Spanish popular songs | Including “La Celeste,” “¡Ay, Manola!,” “La Colasa,” “Fortunilla,” etc.  
Only surviving manuscript of numerous arrangements of Mexican songs: “La Gallina,”  
MS Mus 232, item 55, Houghton Library, Harvard U. | 1830s and 1840s |
| “Songes”  
‘Sur ma tête reposée’ | Words by Édouard Turquety | 1843 or before |

²² For full details on these manuscripts consult Waddington and Žekulin, 3-5.
APPENDIX E

Scores

1) “Die Kapelle,” after Ms Mus 232, item 60 [7.]
2) “La Chapelle” / Ballade, PVG.s.I.2
3) “Tu d’amarmi,” after Ms.Mus.232, item 60 [1.]
4) “Il ne vient pas,” after Ms.Mus.232, item 60 [7.]
5) “Le Retour de printemps,” after Ms.Mus.232, item 60 [1.]
6) “L’Enfant de la montagne” / Ballade, PVG.s.I.1
7) “L’Abricotier” / Chanson servienne, PVG.s.I.3
8) “L’Ombre et le jour” / Mélodie, PVG.s.I.7
9) “L’Absence” / Caña Española, after PVG.s.II.3
10) “En Mer,” PVG.s.II.6
11) “Tarentelle,” PVG.s.II.10
Die Kapelle

Ludwig Uhland

Andantino \( \text{\( \downarrow \) } \approx 92 \)

Droben stehet die Kapelle, Schauet still ins Thal hinab.

Drun ten

singt bei Weis' und Quelle Froh und hell der Hinter

knab'. La on la on la ra on la

\( \text{\( \uparrow \) } \) - la Ha la on la on la on la

Copyright © Angélica Minero Escobar
30 a tempo
La-ha-ha-lia.

primo tempo

37 Traurig tönt das Glöcklein nie-der, Schau-er-lich der Lei-chen-chor.

48 Traurig tönt das Glöcklein nie-der, Schau-er-lich der Lei-chen-chor.

59 Stil-le sind die froh-en Lieder, La-on la- Und der

pp
Kna-be lauscht em-por, und der Kna-be lauscht em-por. 
Dro-ben bringt man sie zu

Grabe, Die sich freuen in dem Thal. 
Hin-ter-kna-be! Hin-ter-kna-be!

Dir auch singt man dort ein-mal, 
Dir auch singt man

Dort ein-mal!
La chapelle.

Chant:

La haut se voit la chapelle, Qui domine

Le val ton, la bise sur l'herbe nouvelle,

Joue et chante un jeune garçon, la la

la la

Piano:

Andantino.Animato. d=92

Attacco.

T. Aîné.
Il levo un regard tremblant, il levo un regard tremblant:

Nous conduisons dans la tombe Ce lui qui fit tes chansons;

Jeune enfant, chacun y tombe,

Et sur toi nous chantons, et sur toi nous chantons.

T. 1185.
Tu d'amarmi un di giurasti

Andantino

Tu d'amarmi un di giurasti, Adorato mio sospir,
E daranco un bel riscontro in mercede a questo cor.

Copyright © Angelica Minero Escobar
Quanto è mio, quanto mi piace, tutto è tuo e l'offro in dono.

Ah! se offrir potessi un trono, farrei pago il tuo desir._

Ma s'è ver che basti il core, noi saremo felici ap-pien__ felici ap-pien. Ma s'è ver che
bas - ti il co - re, noi sa - rem fe - li - ci ap - pien. - Sten - di, ca - ra a
me le brac - cia, ch’io mo - rir ti vo - glio in sen,

rall.

sen.
Il ne vient pas

Allegretto

Ambroise Béjart

Pauline Garcia

7

dit quand la saison des fleurs, _ Ra-me-ne-ra_ à printemps dans la plai-

ne, La bre du soins sur ces

16

bords en hauteurs, _ Je vien-drai_ je re-vien-drai fi- nir _ la longue pei-

ne.

Pour-tant hé-

25

Je re-vien- drai, _ je re-vien- drai_ a tempo

34

las! il ne vient pas. _ Pour-tant, il ne vient pas_ hé- las pour tant _ il ne vient
pas!

Loi-seau joyeux a recouvré sa voix

L'air ses par funes lui suis soin murmuré, Tout s'est ran-

accen- le- ram-

ni-mieux et les champs et les bois, Et les co- teaux cou-ron-nés de ver-
Le Retour de printemps

Andante grazioso

Le temps a lais - sié son man-teau
De vent, de froi-dure et de pluye, Et s'est ves-tu de bro de - rie
De sou-leil lui-sant, cler et beau.

Il n'ya beu - te, ne oy - seau, Qu'en son jor - gonne chan-te, ou er ye
Le temps a lais - sié son man-teau
De vent, de froi-dure et de pluye, de

Copyright © Angélica Minero Esebor
Riviére, fontaine et ruisseau,

Por-tenant li-vrejo-li-e, Le temps a lais-sièson man-teau, De vent, de froi-dure et de pluye Le

temps a laïs-sie son man-teau, de vent, de froi-dure et de playe, de

play e.
Chant:

Allegro moderato

Con brio.

Je suis l'enfant de la montagne; D'en haut je vois le fier manoir,

Et toi, soleil, tu m'accompagnes

De l'aube jusqu'au soir

Je suis l'enfant de la montagne.

Ah!

l'enfant de la montagne.
Près de mon toit jaillit la source.

torrent aux flots euryméus;

source, j'y baigne mes pieds amoureux.

source, ma compaigne,

Nous sommes tous enfants de la montagne.
Il est à moi ce mont sauv.

Savoie, avec ses prés, ses neiges et ses bois. Quand

sur son front gronde l'orage. Des vents ma voix doit

mine encore la voix. Calme et debout

je me ris de leur rage.
Pa-gne, Ap-pelle aux ar-mes nos sol-dais;
Lardour guerrière alors me ga-gne, Je vole ar-mé pour les com-

bals,
Et le cœur fier, le bras sanglant, Je

dis-sui-vez l'en-fant

fant de la mon-ta-gne!
Sà._lùt, no_ble dàmoi._sel...le, Sà._lùt,

Peut-on boire un peu de cette
eau? Peut-on man...ger ce fruit nou...veau? Peut-on em.bras...ser An...gè...le? Peut-on man...
Non, Seigneur, l'eau ne se boit, non, Seigneur, l'eau ne se boit, Ni la bise.

Ne se touche, l'eau ne se boit, ni la bise ne se touche, Ni ma bouche ne reçoit nul baiser d'une autre bouche.

Non, seigneur, ma bouche ne reçoit nul baiser d'une autre bouche.

Couplet al Segno Pour finir.
2ème Couplet.

Un ruisseau coule et murmurant
Au pied d’un aubépine.

Angèle est sous la verdure, Quand vient un jeune chevalier.
Sa lutte, sa lutte, noble da moïselle.

Peut-on boire un peu de cette eau? Peut-on manger ce fruit nouveau?

Peut-on embrasser Angèle? Peut-on embrasser Angèle?

peut-on manger ce fruit nouveau? Peut-on embrasser Angèle?

Angèle, Oui, Seigneur, cette eau se boit, oui, Seigneur, cette eau se boit, Et cet aubépine se touche, cette eau se boit, et cet aubépine se touche, Et ma bouche aussi récuse.

Un baiser de votre bouche, oui, Seigneur, ma bouche aussi reçoit un baiser de votre bouche.

T. H86.
"L’Absence"
(Caña Española)

Andantino

Copyright Angélica Mineo Lucbar
EN MER.

Paroles de
M. G. de LARENAUDIÈRE.

Musique de
Mlle Pauline VIARDOT.

J. H. BERLIOZ.

Andante.

CHANT.

La lune dans les yeux, promenant ses claveaux,

PIANO.

Sommeil sur les flots argentés,

Mes lointaines rêves,

Entre le ciel et l'œil quand l'âme est désolée,

Quand la flûte est triste qu'il pleure.
Etto, le coeur est pur,
L'âme immortelle nous porte et nous révèle
La faiblesse de

Thou, me Et la force éternelle,
C'est la vérité.

...n'éternel, sais
Etes-vous mes amis, sans espoir mensonger... C'est un jour brillant toujours

...ces fleurs en tour... Et l'or de Carthage et l'amour du Moire

Des arbres a la luz,
des amours des fruits...
Dancez, pêcheur Napoléon. En chantant o-oh-fugai re-frain. Dancez, pê-

-cher Napoléon. Lamer est calme et faîre se-rein. Dancez, pê-

- cher Napoléon. Sous-mal sen.

B n. 12 x 100, 100

530
Sous son cintre de l'en-de-là.
Si de Venise, où de l'Elbe.

La flamme éternelle c'est un fanal qui brûle - ra,
C'est un fanal de bel, Et si Le

Ses flots à marée - le, S'agrande voix résonne - ra,
C'est un signal de

Dansez dansez la Tarantelle Dansez la
APPENDIX F

Manuscripts of Songs by Pauline Viardot-Garcia: Circa 1838-1850
## Appendix F
Manuscripts of Songs by Pauline Viardot-Garcia: Circa 1838-1850

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>LOCATION AND CALL NUMBER</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Der junge Fischer&quot; <em>Russisches Nationlied</em></td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Pierpoint Morgan Library, NY</td>
<td>AMs, signed “Berlin, le 7 juin 1838”</td>
<td>June 1838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Approche du rivage” ‘Approche du ravage, ô fille du pêcheur’</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Département de La Musique, Bibliothèque Nationale de France Rés Vm7 537</td>
<td>AMs written on the album of sculptor Dantan jeune, signed “Paris, le 20 mars 1839”</td>
<td>March 1839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Tu d’amarmi” ‘Tu d’amarmi un di giurasti’</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60 [1.]</td>
<td>AMs originally composed for the album of Mr. Denza, copied later in Pauline’s black notebook. Signed “fait le 1er aout pour l’album de Mr. Denza -Londres, 1839”</td>
<td>August 1839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Le Retour du printemps” “Le temps a laissé son manteau’</td>
<td>Charles d’Orléans</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60 [2. and 3.]</td>
<td>AMs followed by a draft for the poem’s third strophe, signed “Boulogne a 7 Aout [sic]”</td>
<td>August 1839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</td>
<td>POET</td>
<td>LOCATION AND CALL NUMBER</td>
<td>NOTES</td>
<td>DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mouvement de Tarentelle</strong></td>
<td>___</td>
<td>Private collection</td>
<td>AMs signed ‘Souvenir à mon amie Juliette [Zimmerman]. Pauline Garcia. Paris le 19 9bre 1839.’ Later used for PVG.s.II.10</td>
<td>October 1839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>(for piano)</em></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reproduced in <em>Revue de musicologie</em> 87, no. 1, 2001, 42.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“Die Capelle”/“Die Kapelle”</strong></td>
<td>Ludwig Uhland</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60</td>
<td>Text by L. Uhland AMs signed “Leipzig 1838” Published PVG.s.0.1.g = PVG.s.I.1 (1838)</td>
<td>Autumn 1839 or 1840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Droben stehet die Kapelle’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“Il ne vient pas”</strong></td>
<td>Ambroise Bétoutré</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60</td>
<td>AMs Not dated, but preceded and followed by manuscripts which Pauline dated 1838</td>
<td>Autumn 1839 or 1840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Il avait dit, quand la saison de fleurs’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“Goldfiscllein”</strong></td>
<td>Friedrich Christoph Förster</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60</td>
<td>Fair Copy signed “Berlin 1838”</td>
<td>Autumn 1839 or 1840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Wenn auf dem See’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“Adieux les beaux jours”</strong></td>
<td>Ambroise Bétoutré</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60</td>
<td>AMs signed “Bruselles”</td>
<td>Autumn 1839 or 1840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Déjà la tendre fleur’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“L’Hirondelle et le prisonnier”</strong></td>
<td>Hector-Grégoire de Saint-Maur</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60</td>
<td>AMs Published PVG.s.3.f (1841)</td>
<td>1839 or 1840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Hirondelle gentille, qui voltige’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>“L’Enfant”</strong></td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 54</td>
<td>AMs</td>
<td>1841</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Un enfant de quatre ans’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</td>
<td>POET</td>
<td>LOCATION AND CALL NUMBER</td>
<td>NOTES</td>
<td>DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Amour de Mai”</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U, Ms Mus 232, item 60 [12.]</td>
<td>AMs Fragment</td>
<td>Early 1840s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Le Chêne et le roseau”</td>
<td>Jean de La Fontaine</td>
<td>Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5877</td>
<td>AMs</td>
<td>1842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“L’Abricotier”</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Musikabteilung, Stadtbibliothek, Hanover</td>
<td>AMs Published song PVG.s.I.3 (1842)</td>
<td>Early 1840s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Un Jour de printemps”</td>
<td>Édouard Turquety</td>
<td>Old collection of Philip M. Neufeld AMs auctioned in Christie’s, NY Sale 8144, lot 220 (1995)</td>
<td>AMs Draft</td>
<td>1840s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Adieux les beaux jours” / Romance</td>
<td>Ambroise Bétourné</td>
<td>Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5875</td>
<td>AMs Fair copy used by É. Troupenas to publish PVG.s.I.4 (1842)</td>
<td>1842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“L’Exilé polonais” / Couplets</td>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5878</td>
<td>AMs Fair copy used by É. Troupenas to publish PVG.s.I.5 (1842)</td>
<td>1842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</td>
<td>POET</td>
<td>LOCATION AND CALL NUMBER</td>
<td>NOTES</td>
<td>DATE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| “L’Ombre et le jour” / Mélodie  
‘Vois-tu la nuit’ | Édouard Turquety | Département de la Musique, Bibliothèque nationale de France, Ms. 5879 | AMs  
Fair copy used by É. Troupenas to publish PVG.s.I.7 (1842) | 1842 |
| “La Chanson de Loïc”  
‘De que la grive est éveillé’ | Auguste Brizeux | Houghton Library, Harvard U.  
Ms Mus 232, item 60 [13. And 16.] | AMs  
Fragments  
Published song PVG.s.II.7 (1849) | 1842-1844 |
| “Marie et Julie”  
‘Les lys sont bien charmants’ | Gustave de Lareaudière | Houghton Library, Harvard U.  
Ms Mus 232, item 60 [14. And 15.] | AMs  
Poem and initial draft  
Published song PVG.s.II.8 (1849) | 1842-1844 |
Ms Mus 232, item 60 [17.] | AMs  
Draft | 1842-1844 |
| “Il barcaruolo”  
‘J’ai ma barque le jour’ | Gustave de Lareaudière | Houghton Library, Harvard U.  
Ms Mus 232, item 60 [19.] | AMs  
Draft | 1842-1844 |
| “En Mer”  
‘La lune dans les cieux’ | Gustave de Lareaudière | Houghton Library, Harvard U.  
Ms Mus 232, item 60 [20. and 21] | AMs  
Draft  
Published PVG.s.II.6 | Mid1840s |
| “Soirée d’automne”  
(“Villanelle”?  
‘Voici venir le soir’ | Anonymous | Houghton Library, Harvard U.  
Ms Mus 232, item 60 [22. And 23] | AMs  
Draft  
A possible draft for PVG.s.II.5 | Mid1840s |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TITLE/FIRST VERSE</th>
<th>POET</th>
<th>LOCATION AND CALL NUMBER</th>
<th>NOTES</th>
<th>DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Gretchen”</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>Houghton Library, Harvard U. Ms Mus 232, item 60 [24.]</td>
<td>AMs Draft</td>
<td>Mid1840s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“La Luciole”</td>
<td>Gustave de Larenaudière</td>
<td>Private collection in Paris See Waddington and Žekulin, 6.</td>
<td>AMs</td>
<td>Mid 1840s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>