A Bibliography Relating to the Broad Seal War in New Jersey, 1838-40

Rutgers University has made this article freely available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters. [https://rucore.libraries.rutgers.edu/rutgers-lib/54592/story/]

This work is the VERSION OF RECORD (VoR)
This is the fixed version of an article made available by an organization that acts as a publisher by formally and exclusively declaring the article "published". If it is an "early release" article (formally identified as being published even before the compilation of a volume issue and assignment of associated metadata), it is citable via some permanent identifier(s), and final copy-editing, proof corrections, layout, and typesetting have been applied.


Terms of Use: Copyright for scholarly resources published in RUcore is retained by the copyright holder. By virtue of its appearance in this open access medium, you are free to use this resource, with proper attribution, in educational and other non-commercial settings. Other uses, such as reproduction or republication, may require the permission of the copyright holder.

Article begins on next page
A BIBLIOGRAPHY RELATING TO
THE BROAD SEAL WAR
IN NEW JERSEY, 1838-40

BY RONALD L. BECKER

The Broad Seal War was the result of a contested election between the Whig and Democratic Parties for the six New Jersey seats in the U.S. House of Representatives. The Congressional election took place on October 9-10, 1838, before New Jersey was organized into Congressional districts. Thus all the seats were chosen at large by voters from the entire state. The Governor (William Pennington) and Privy Council had the obligation of totaling the votes received from the county clerks and issuing certificates stamped with the “broad seal” of the state to the victors. After doing so, the Whig governor and his Whig-dominated council announced that all six incumbent Whig candidates were re-elected by an extremely narrow margin. Only Joseph Fitz Randolph collected significantly more votes than his Democratic opponents.

The controversy broke out when it was discovered that the votes from Millville Township and South Amboy Township were not included with the returns from Cumberland and Middlesex Counties, respectively. The Cumberland County clerk (a Whig) claimed that the Millville returns lacked the seal of the township clerk (a Whig); moreover, they appeared to have been opened and were incompletely made out. The Middlesex clerk also cited several irregularities which he claimed invalidated the South Amboy returns. If the Millville and South Amboy votes had been counted, five of the six Whig candidates would have been defeated. Despite this, all six Whigs received commissions of election on November 1, 1838 (for terms beginning December 1839), to which were affixed the official “broad seal” of New Jersey and signed by Governor Pennington.

Thirteen months later, on December 2, 1839, the U.S. House of Representatives met to organize. When the clerk of the House reached New Jersey in the roll call, he called only the name of Joseph Fitz Randolph and passed over the names of the other claimants. The Whig commission holders had expected trouble, but certainly not this soon. A raging two-week debate followed, while the House remained unorganized and without a Speaker. When the debate ended, the House Democratic majority (not counting the five disputed New Jersey seats, the Democrats held a 119-118 edge) voted to leave the five contested seats vacant. Thus New Jersey was left without 5/6 of its legal representation in the House, marking the first time in the country’s history that a state was not so represented. The entire matter was then presented to the House Committee on Elections, which consisted of a 5-4 Democratic majority. The committee began working on the case on January 14, 1840, and dealt with the dispute for several months. Meanwhile the New Jersey legislature and the legislatures of other states passed resolutions for and
Governor William Pennington (Special Collections, Alexander Library). Governor Pennington and his Privy Council totaled the votes and issued certificates of election to all six incumbent Whig candidates.
against the actions of the House, many claiming that the House had no legal authority to conduct business without full representation from the state of New Jersey.

In March 1840, the preliminary report and resolution to seat the five Democratic claimants was accepted by the House. After this was accomplished, the committee continued its work and, after interviewing hundreds of voters and investigating allegations of vote fraud (the Whigs claimed that illegal votes were being cast by aliens for the Democratic candidates), issued its final report on July 8, 1840, which resolved that the five Democrats should retain their seats. The House concurred and thus closed the door on one of the most bitterly contested elections in the young nation's history.

This bibliography attempts to bring together all published sources dealing with the Broad Seal War many of which have never been cited by researchers. It consists of government and private publications and is divided into nine sections (summaries and contemporary accounts, entry nos. 1-5; speeches delivered in the U.S. House of Representatives but published separately, nos. 6-16; major speeches published in The Congressional Globe, nos. 17-41; congressional reports, nos. 42-46; speeches delivered in New Jersey, nos. 47-52; a political broadside, no. 53; action in the New Jersey State Legislature, nos. 54-65; action in the legislatures of other states, nos. 66-69; and secondary accounts, nos. 70-76). Annotations are provided in many of the entries to help clarify their relation to the contested election.

The bibliography does not include manuscript collections, which nevertheless are quite valuable for the study of this controversy. The Peter Vroom and Philomen Dickerson Papers in The New Jersey Historical Society contain several letters relating to the case. Other important collections include the Samuel L. Southard and Garret D. Wall Papers in the Princeton University Library. Because of the volume, newspapers have not been included in the bibliography. The Broad Seal War occupied the newspaper presses of New Jersey and other states for much of the 1838-40 period. The researcher is referred to Wright, William C. and Stellhorn, Paul A. Directory of New Jersey Newspapers, 1765-1970. Trenton, N.J.: New Jersey Historical Commission, 1977. The directory is organized geographically (no direct chronological access for the entire state) but contains all newspapers published in New Jersey. There has been no systematic attempt to read through and include legislative proceedings in states other than New Jersey for this bibliography. However, legislative reports and resolutions published separately and/or in Congressional sources have been included. Also lacking in the bibliography are the minutes and proceedings of the Governor and Privy Council of New Jersey for 1838. They were never published for this period and unfortunately cannot be located in the New Jersey State Library. It is quite probable that they were destroyed long ago.

Material for the federal sources in the bibliography was gathered through an extensive search in The Congressional Globe; The Congressional Journal; The National Union Catalog; B. P. Poore's A Descriptive Catalogue of the Government Publications of the United States, September 5, 1774-March 4, 1881. Washington, D.C.: Government Print-
Philomen Dickerson (Special Collections, Alexander Library). Successful Democratic challenger.
ing Office, 1885; Congressional Information Service’s *U.S. Serial Set Index*. Washington, D.C.: 1975; and cataloged and uncataloged collections of The New Jersey Historical Society and Rutgers University Libraries. *The Congressional Globe* for 1840 (26th Congress, 1st Session) is filled with the debates and proceedings of this case and must be read thoroughly in order to understand the case’s complexity. However, only the major speeches as published separately or in the appendix to *The Congressional Globe* are included in the bibliography.

New Jersey documents were gathered through a search of the minutes and proceedings of the New Jersey Legislative Council and General Assembly; New Jersey statutes; and the collections of Rutgers University Library and The New Jersey Historical Society including several miscellaneous pamphlet and broadside collections at both institutions.

There is much duplication of material. For instance, Governor Pennington’s address and accompanying documents are published separately, in the minutes of the proceedings of the New Jersey Legislative Council and General Assembly, in *The Congressional Globe*, in the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Elections report and in the reports and resolutions of several other state legislatures.

Although the Broad Seal War is well known by name to researchers of nineteenth century American history, there has been very little detailed research based on many of the documents listed in this bibliography. It is hoped that the task will be somewhat facilitated with this tool in hand.
Peter D. Vroom (Special Collections, Alexander Library. Successful Democratic challenger.)
BROAD SEAL WAR BIBLIOGRAPHY
SUMMARIES AND CONTEMPORARY ACCOUNTS

Includes a summary of the text of the reports of the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Elections.


Hone's entry for July 3, 1840 (p. 488) suggests that the Independent Treasury Bill was at least partially responsible for the attack on and unseating of the Whig claimants from New Jersey.

Taken from Bartlett's Abridgement of Debates with added narrative. The summary is located pp. 19-33.

5) [Webster, James] "The New Jersey Congressional Election," The United States Magazine and Democratic Review (v. 5, no. 8, June 1839, pp. 590-608).
The only summary of events leading up to the Congressional debate that followed in the Winter and Spring of 1839/40. The author supports the cause of the Democrats, and his commentary is laced with criticism of New Jersey's election practices.

SPEECHES IN THE U.S. HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES PUBLISHED SEPARATELY


7) Botts, John Minor. Speech of Mr. Botts of Virginia, on the New
Robert Field Stockton (Special Collections, Alexander Library). Captain Stockton, a Democrat, broke with his party and supported the Whig claimant in speeches throughout the State.

The imprint date is questionable. It is possible that Botts presented the printer an advanced copy.

8) Brown, Aaron Venable. Speech of Mr. Brown, of Tennessee, on the Resolution Reported from the Committee of Elections... Connected with the New Jersey Contested Election... House of Representatives, March 17, 1840. [Washington, D.C.: n.p., 1840]

Title page lacking on known copies.


10) Duncan, Alexander. Speech of Mr. Duncan, of Ohio, on the Subject of the New Jersey Election, for Members of the Twenty-Sixth Congress. Delivered in the House of Representatives, January 9, 1840. Baltimore, Md.: Office of the Post, 1840.

11) Jenifer, Daniel. Speech of Mr. Jenifer, of Maryland, on the Proposition to Print the Testimony in Relation to the New Jersey Contested Election. Delivered During the Morning Hour, March 11, 12, 13, 14 and 17, 1840. Washington, D.C.: Gales and Seaton, 1840.


No title page on known copies. Randolph was the only New Jersey representative seated by the House of Representatives. Despite the possibility of fraud, he was clearly one of the top six vote getters in the state.


Title page lacking on only known copies.


Title page lacking on only known copy.

THE JOURNAL OF THE

MAJOR SPEECHES PUBLISHED IN "The Congressional Globe" APPENDIX (CGA)


Garland as Acting Clerk of the U.S. House of Representatives refused to seat the five Whig claimants.


**Congressional Reports**


A detailed 284-page account of the minutes of the deliberations of the committee. Election return evidence and statements from all the parties involved are presented. By a 5-4 vote (strictly along party lines) the committee decided to seat the Democrats with the highest vote totals including those for Millville and South Amboy. The report was issued March 5, 1840 and agreed to by the House March 10, 1840 (again, strictly along party lines). However, the investigation was continued by the committee after the seating of the Democrats and resulted in House Report no. 541 (see entry no. 44).


This report was apparently never presented on the House floor. The Whig minority on the committee denounced the actions of the Democrats on the floor for cutting off the reading of the minority report as
“the first instance of this kind as we believe, that has occurred in the government." The report and statements were signed by the Whigs on the committee (Millard Fillmore, John M. Botts, George W. Crabb, and Truman Smith).


This voluminous 761-page volume contains the testimony of over 600 New Jersey voters and the majority and minority reports of the committee. The majority concluded that some unregistered people (mostly aliens) voted and adjusted the tallies accordingly. However, this still left the five Democratic representatives (by now officially seated in the House) with a clear victory. On July 26, 1840, the resolution was agreed to by the full House by a vote of 102-22. Many Whig members declined to vote, intending unsuccessfully to break a quorum.


The Whig minority again blasted the Democrats in the House and on the committee, but this time presented some evidence of vote fraud which they claimed gave the election to the Whig claimants despite the counting of the Millville and South Amboy votes.


No title page on known copies. Not content to rest with their victory and let the minority report go unanswered, the Democrats on the Committee on Elections (John Campbell, Aaron V. Brown, William Medill, P. F. Thomas and Francis E. Rives) issued this rebuttal. They defend their decision based on the testimony of several hundred voters (some are named individually) and continue the attack on the election officials of Millville and South Amboy, the Governor and Privy Council of New Jersey and the Whig Party in general for willfully and knowingly suppressing the votes from whole townships.

SPEECHES DELIVERED IN NEW JERSEY


48) Garland, Hugh Alfred. Address of the Hon. Hugh A. Garland before the Democratic Mass Con-
Garland urges the Democrats to continue the battle against vote fraud warning of the possibility of Whig governors in New Jersey and other states giving credentials to fraudulently elected claimants. He closes by declaring that "New Jersey has been selected as the Champion of Freedom."

50) Miller, Jacob Welsh. *Speech of Mr. Miller, of Morris, on the Joint Resolutions, Relative to the Exclusion of Representatives of New Jersey from Congress, January 23, 1840.* Trenton, N.J.: Sherman & Harron, 1840.

51) Randolph, Joseph Fitz. *Address ... to his Constituents, the People of New Jersey.* Trenton, N.J.: n.p., 1840.


Refers to the New Jersey Whigs’ "commissioned men the people defeated" before presenting the party’s legislative platform for the election of 1840.

**POLITICAL BROADSIDE**


This message to the New Jersey Legislative Council and General Assembly was accompanied by copies of the commission issued by Governor Pennington and his Privy Council containing the seal of New Jersey, letters written by the Whig and Democratic claimants, and names of "illegal voters" who participated in the election of 1838. The message was printed in the minutes of the proceedings of the Legislative Council and General Assembly, in *The Congressional Globe* and in the reports of The U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Elections (see entries 55 and 56).

55) N.J. Governor. "Governor's Message and Accompanying Documents, January 14, 1840," *Votes and Proceedings of the 64th General Assembly of the State of New Jersey ...* Belvidere,

The Legislative Council (now known as the New Jersey State Senate) went into a Court of Appeals and resolved that 1000 copies of the message be printed and that it be referred to a joint special committee to consist of five members from the General Assembly and three from the Legislative Council.


A vote to adopt the report (which presented eight resolutions generally claiming that until the Whig candidates were seated, the U.S. House of Representatives was not legally constituted and could therefore act on nothing) and to send copies of the report to the upper and lower houses and the governors of all states for their own legislation failed. The vote on the resolutions themselves was tabled.


All eight resolutions were passed by the General Assembly which had a Whig majority.


The same report presented to the General Assembly on the same day.


The Legislative Council passed the eight resolutions, urging strongly that the Whig claimants be allowed to take their seats in the U.S. House of Representatives.

61) N.J. Legislature. Joint Special Committee. Minority Report of the Joint Committee of the Legislature of New Jersey, to whom was Referred the Message of the Governor, and the Accompanying Documents, in Reference to the Exclusion from the House of Representatives of the Persons to Whom Certificates of Election were Awarded by the Governor and the Majority of his Privy Council, January 24, 1840. [Trenton, N.J.: n.p., 1840]

The Democratic minority on the committee called for the seating of the Democratic claimants and blasted all those in the state who abrogated their responsibilities to
allow votes not to be counted and to issue certificates on that basis. However, even the Democrats condemned the U.S. House of Representatives for denying New Jersey its right to representation and urged the House to seat the Whigs who held credentials from the Governor until the others could show a "better title."


The complete text of the joint resolution as passed by the General Assembly and Legislative Council.


Hunter (Speaker of the U.S. House of Representatives) declined to lay the New Jersey joint resolutions before the House as asked by Governor Pennington. Hunter's letter as read in the Assembly on February 4, 1840. On February 5, the Democratic minority in the General Assembly attempted to have the letter printed. The resolution failed.


The same resolutions passed by the General Assembly and Legislative Council on January 21 and January 23, 1840 respectively.


In his annual message to the Legislative Council and Assembly, Governor Pennington called for the State to "vindicate her rights" taken away by the U.S. House of Representatives by refusing to seat the commissioned members from New Jersey. Pennington cites a "solemn protest of fifty thousand of the intelligent freemen of New England recently on Bunker Hill" against the House for its conduct in the New Jersey election case. Thus the New Jersey legislature began its new session on the same note of bitterness that rang throughout the previous one.

ACTION IN LEGISLATURES OF OTHER STATES


The Maine House of Representatives and Senate resolved to support the U.S. House of Representatives in excluding the Whig claimants. The resolutions state that
there is no other constitutional basis for a claim to a seat in the U.S. Congress than election thereto by a majority of the votes of the people, not as a result of certification by state functionaries. The resolutions were passed March 18, 1840 and signed by Governor John Fairfield, March 30, 1840.


The report consists of the New Jersey legislature's resolutions; a report of the Joint Special Committee of the Massachusetts Legislature claiming that the State of New Jersey has been denied her constitutional rights by the U.S. House of Representatives; and six resolutions urging the House to seat the New Jersey representatives.


This resolution is similar to that passed by the Massachusetts Legislature protesting the actions of the U.S. House of Representatives in refusing to seat the New Jersey claimants.


Again the House is condemned for not seating the original New Jersey claimants.

SECONDARY ACCOUNTS

A Democrat, Stockton originally supported his party's view of the outcome of the election, but could not tolerate the treatment of his State by the U.S. House of Representatives.


The Broad Seal War is summarized, pp. 234-238.


74) Lee, Francis Bazley. New Jersey as a Colony and as a State. New