Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

Line #	Time stamp	Speaker	utterance
1	0:38	СМ	Anyway let's see, where were we the last time?
2		S	Well, when I came here you wanted me to do the towers of four.
3		СМ	Oh right, right, and you were going to [mumbling] your new method to show me, and how many towers of four did you tell there were going to be?
4		s	I think I said around twenty.
5		СМ	You said around twenty.
6		S	and I did and when I did it I got twenty. (4 tall)
7		СМ	You did. And you were using?
8		S	My method. The one. Alright.
9		СМ	Can you tell me about this? Tell me why you need to do this?
10			(Talking others) Can you wait just a minute. Hold on just a second. Make a big difference. How are you
11	1:27	S	Okay. First we have the towers with one white block, and the white block is on the top, and then it's there and then (making towers with exactly one white block in an elevator pattern from top to bottom) it's there and then, it's there, and then it's there. And there's our first group of towers.
12		СМ	Okay, now remember, I'm supposed to be – Stephen, is it? and say to you I think there are more with one white and three black. (points to her towers)
13		S	With one white – no, there's no more with one white
14		СМ	But I'm Stephen, and I say I think there are
15	2:35	S	Well there's – well, okay. You have – okay. Once you get down to the last one, [mumbling] at the bottom, you can't move the white back up, because then you'll just be repeating these things. But if you move the white down one you'll be missing a space and if you can only use four blocks, you can't have another one.(argument by contradiction)
16		СМ	Why can't you move the white on the next position on top?
17		S	Because if you move the white on the next position on top it'll be like this. And you need another you'd need another block here, but you can't do that. (same argument for the top)
18		СМ	Why can't you?
19		S	Because there's only four blocks.(conditional reasoning)

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

20		СМ	Why can't there be five?
21		S	Because well the assignment said we have to use four. <i>conditional reasoning</i>)
22		СМ	Oh ok. So these are. Should we keep a record while we're doing it of how many?
23		S	Okay that's four. Should I draw them?
24		СМ	Well you can. Any way you want to record it. You can write a statement to describe it since you have them made already.
25	4:10	S	Alright. [writes "4 one moving down and boxes the statement and puts the group of 4 towers underneath it on top of the paper] Okay and here's the one moving down. Cause it starts here and it goes down here. Alright. Then we have the two. [3 two stuck together moving in an elevator pattern, puts it under the other grou] And, we go like this. That's one and that's two, and that's three.
26		СМ	Okay and how do you describe this group?
27		S	Well, um, two moving down, two together moving together down?[
28		СМ	Okay, so when you wrote "moving down", what do you mean? [S: the one] Okay, why don't you write that there's "exactly one white" and exactly how else can we say; there's exactly one white
29		S	Um
30		СМ	Want to say something about the black?
31		S	With three black. [writing one moving down with 3 black (does not write exactly and does not write white, but has 4 one white moving down still)]
32		СМ	Okay
33	5:50	S	Okay there. And so this one we can go two two white moving down, down with two black. [writes 2 white moving down with 2 black, boxes it, and puts group of towers under it] And our total there is three.
34		СМ	Okay do you want to say anything about those two? They're the only ways you can have two white moving down?
35		s	No they're stuck.[writes also glued together]
36		СМ	Stuck.
37		S	[writes 3 glued together two white moving down] Okay there, that way you can't get it mixed up with the ones that were apart. Then you have your three white.[a new group but gets interrupted by researcher]
38		СМ	Now hold on. This is the only way to do two white?
39	7:12	S	No, those are not the only way you can do two white but these are the only way you can do two white together.
40		СМ	Okay so these are exactly one white and these are exactly two white. Want to jump to three white before you finish the two whites?

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

41		S	When I did the pattern I did one white, two white stuck together, four white stuck together, then went back and went two white apart. (describing her method)
42		СМ	I see.
43		S	And then there's the one.
44		СМ	I'm sorry to go back but I'm kind of thinking about Stephen again. Suppose he says, "How do you know have all of them?"[referring to two white stuck together]
45		S	Because if you take the last one [BBWW] you can't move them [the two whites] down another one because you're only using four blocks. Okay, here's the first one [referring to WWWB] and here's the second one. [referring to BWWW of the three stuck together group]
46		СМ	Okay.
47		S	That's two, three together [writes "2. 3 together whites with one black"]. Alright there's your next one because you have these two and you have the three at the top, one [black] at the bottom, one on top [black] and three at the bottm [3 whites].
48	9:18	СМ	And no more because?
49		S	Because if you take this one [BWWW breaks it apaprat and shows you would need another block to put in between the whites and black]]and you wanted to move the white down another one you'd need another block to put in here. Now four [drops a block]
50		СМ	Don't worry about it.
51		S	Okay, four
52		СМ	Let me just see what you have here. You have three together whites, three glued together- Glued together- Two white glued together. Three together, okay.
53		S	Okay. And then we have the [writes "1. 4 whits together"] okay and that's the last one. And now then we go back to the two whites stuck together and we make it apart. [builds WBWB, WBBW]
54		СМ	Here let's look it here next to these twos.
55		S	And we can do it like this and that's it. Wait[pauses and is analyzing the two built so far] hmm, let's see. Um oh I forgot. You can also go like this. [builds BWBW] That's the reverse.
56		СМ	Well let's see.
57		S	That's the reverse of that one.
58	12:18	СМ	In what way reversed, Stephanie? what are you reversing?
59		S	Okay well when you show it upside down it's reversed.
60		СМ	But you're not, you're standing it up that's the tower.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

			Mall what the equipm is I would be and when the finished the set I have
61		S	Well, what I'm saying is I would go and when I'm finished, I'd go I have four here, three here, two here, one here [pointing to the written cases so far 4,3,2,1] and I would go double that and I'd go I have two here, four here, six here, eight here [doubling from bottom to top of the cases 1,2,3,4] and I'd add that, but if I went like that
62		СМ	Okay that's thats how you got your twenty. what was your reasoning for getting the double?
63		S	What it is is this isn't the only way you can get two apart. You can make two apart by taking two black and separating them.
64		СМ	Okay but. That's true. That's true. So when you compare these two [alternating color cubes BWBW WBWB], how do you think about them when you use that argument?
65		S	Well, when I use the argument for I double it? I think about them in well, if I'm doing a pattern where I'm using whites apart then I'm not going to use a pattern where I use blacks apart with it [touching and showing with the alternating color towers even though these towers also have the black apart she doesn't realize this] but when I'm taking this and going and doubling the pattern I just turn it upside down and that's how I get my- my other pattern.
66		СМ	And you had a name for that the last time, didn't you?
67		S	This kind of pattern?
68		СМ	Yeah you had a name for the other one that went with it
69		S	Yeah pair I forget. I forget I think it was um hm
70		СМ	You use the word pair now. Which means the last time you had this you automatically found the other one. What did the pair look like [WBBB]. Just tell me, you don't have to .
71		S	It looked like black on top and white[bwww]
72	14:38	СМ	Right. That's how you got 20 by that strategy, right? [mhmm]. Just now you didn't do that here. When you just found the ten, then you just found-how many more two more just now, [of two apart whites]
73		s	Two more
74		СМ	Two more. You said these were also two whites. is that correct? Exactly two whites. Different than the two whites here? In what way? Just you can tell me.
75		S	These are apart and these are together.
76		СМ	Right. But these two are different apart in a certain way. What's the difference between in what way these are apart?[alternating color towers]
77		S	This one has the, uh, black top. This Is the black at the top and this is the white at the top
78		СМ	Ok

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

79		S	But it's also this pattern because if you look here it's black white black white. which is one of these patterns because the whites are still separated.
80		СМ	Let me stop here then. Here we have let's talk about the strategy you were doing before you did double and pairs. In that strategy you said these are exactly two whites. Now again I'm going to pretend I'm Stephen, and I'm saying you've convinced me there only two together there's three. Now I'm asking you to convince me when the two whites apart that there are only three [puts th three towers with two white appart saprately from the two whites together towers: WBBW, WBWB, BWBW]; when you have exactly two white and exactly two black when the two whites are apart, they're exactly three. How would you convince me of that? Is this the way you wanted to put them? Is this the order you put it?
81		S	It doesn't matter.
82		СМ	That's not how I think you had it I think you had this one first.[rearranges WBWB, WBBW, BWBW]
83		S	This one had white at the top. And that's what I started off with had the white at the top then the blue – the black, then the white, then the black.
84	16:59	СМ	This one white on the top then we had a separation then the next white here [referring to WBWB] okay, this one. [referring to WBBW]
85		S	Then, I made a white at the top.
86		СМ	Again white at the top. Okay.
87		S	I had a white at the top. With black in the middle, then a white.
88		СМ	Now these two here are they alike in any way?[comparing wBWB WBBW]
89		S	Yes, they are [yawns]; they both have white separated.
90		СМ	Is there any other way that they are alike, or maybe another way of saying it? These all have white separated, are these different from these in any way? [showing WBWB and WBBW and comparing it to BWBW]
91		S	This one is different from this one, because this one has the two black glued together.
92		СМ	That's true that's but I'm asking is there any way that one of these these two [the both together] are different.
93		S	No not both of them. Well I guess yes this has the black at the top but these don't.
94	18:13	СМ	If I asked you these two are different than these these two [referring to WBWB and WBBW] had whites at the top and then you had to skip [referring to the one black skipped in WBWB] you have white here, and now the only way you skip is this white here [pointing to the last W in WBBW] and this starts here [pointing to first W in BWBW] and you had to skip. How do I know there's no more? [Stephanie yawns] You seem tired, Steph

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

95		S	Yeah, I woke up at six. I couldn't sleep.
96	18:58	СМ	So now you need a nap, are you getting tired [S: just alittle] if you want to stop, you decide.
97		S	No, that's okay.
98		СМ	I'm Stephen and I want to be sure that when you have exactly two whites separated, that there can't be any others than the ones you have here.
99		S	Okay okay the only problem is when you go to make your doubles, you can't make the doubles with this because YOU'VE already made the doubles [evidence of recognition that the two alternating are opposites of each other]
100		СМ	Let's just try not to worry about the made the doubles let's try to prove
101		s	It's always harder with the separates, um… oh, okay…
102		СМ	I wish Stephen were here. Because I think you'd come up with a way of convincing him.
103		S	Okay. You have the two whites separated by two blacks you have the white, black, white, black
104		СМ	I'm not convinced that you're just telling me what you have, that doesn't convince me.
105		S	But then you have the black, white, black, white, and if you want to separate again you'd have to have another piece [using argument by contradiction to add another imaginary black in between the second B and second W of BWBW]. because the white on the bottom.
106		СМ	I don't really see, see it. I'm not sure seems to me that if I'm Stephen that you're just trying to make a case of each one of these three why they're there and I'm not really sure that- I'm not quite convinced that you did all of them and that there cant be anymore
107		S	Ok. Well let me put it this way, we know we can't make another one of these [WBBW] because you can't fit any more than two in between these so you know that this one can't be made again
108		СМ	So When you have white at the top and white at the bottom
109		S	Yeah you can't fit any more than two in the middle. You know that ones finished but then these two [alternating color towers] you have white black white black okay and then you move the white down one
110		СМ	Mmhmm
111		S	Okay and if I move the white down again if I were to say let me put the white in the black space and the black hm and if I were to put the white here with the two blacks here I'd be getting this [BBWW a duplicate of the two together group]]. If I were to put the white here and the two blacks here and the white here, I'd be getting that [WWBB]. If I were to put the white here and a black here and a white there and a black there you'd be getting this [WBWB]. And if I were to put-I shifted it here [showing a white cube independently of the tower and how she

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

112		СМ	shifted it on every position but stops at last position]- no I didn't, shifted it here, no I didnt shift it there, I would've put this this [referring to WBBW] and that the other one you'd be getting the same thing [as WBBW]. So I shifted to every single level and you can't make another one. I think I followed everything you said here so there are possible exactly two white you've added how many more.
113		S	Three more.
114		СМ	So why don't we get it exactly two white next to it.[pointing to right side of the paper where her orginal cases are on the left side of the page.]
115		S	Ok.
116		СМ	Let's put it next to it here [showing the two white together case, she wants the separated case next to it t othe right]. so we have all of this row to be exactly two white next to it. You see this box here, why don't we put it right alongside it. This is not exactly two white. These are the three whites its this box here; these were the two glued together whites, right? and now these are the two whites that are separated. Okay. But you didn't tell me how many whites had to be here.[writes "white separated by black 3.] How many whites exactly are here?[showing exactly two white group separated][stephanie writes a "2" on top of "white separated by black; 3.". So you've convinced me that you four of exactly one whites, you've convinced me that there are exactly six of exactly two whites. And are there two of exactly three whites?
117		S	Maybe. maybe. These are separate whites let's say we'll start at the top. No, we can't start it at the top. Okay we'll start it right here. Okay there's your first one. [ending up starting black at the second poisition instead of at the top and builds WBWW]
118		СМ	Oh, now we're talking about exactly three whites but some separation.
119		S	Mmhmm
120		СМ	Okay
121	25:17:00	S	There's your second one [referring to WWBW] because you moved the black down one [showing how the one black cube is moving down. And that's it. You can't make a third one
122		СМ	Why?
123		S	Because if you move your black another one and if you move your black down to the last space you would have this.[builds WWWB and shows it's a duplicate of one of the two exactly three white together]
124		СМ	Okay I see that but you don't have a black on top here [pointing to the separated group]
125		S	If you have a black on top, then you would have this [referring to BWWW the duplicate of the exactly three white glued together group]

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

126	СМ	So you have how many extras exactly three whites by having separations?
127	S	Two.
128	СМ	Okay so why don't you do that on alongside [pointing again to the right side of the paper to the right of exactly three white glued together][stephanie writes "3 white separated by one black found 2" so you have exactly three whites And then this one was exactly four whites we lost it somehow.
129	s	Oh well. and then you can only make one.[builds WWWW]
130	СМ	Wait a minute aren't we doing whites?[builds BBBB] You can only make whites.
131	S	Oh
132	СМ	How many whites are there here exactly now? [S: none]So why don't you tell me how many exactly no whites. [points to paper at the top next to the all white tower case] Why don't you put it down here. How don't you tell me exactly how many. Keep focusing on whites how many did you get with exactly no whites. Why don't you tell me how many exactly no whites? Keep a record of that.
133	S	mhmm.
134	СМ	Zero whites? No whites?
135	S	Okay I got one.[writes "no whites=1]
136	СМ	What do we have here?
137	S	So far? [sigh] okay
138	СМ	No whites? How many? [points to the towers built that are organized in a long column starting from no white, one white, two white, three white, and four white]
139	S	One?
140	СМ	One white?
141	S	Four.
142	СМ	Ok that's Exactly four whites.
143	S	
144	СМ	Ok. Exactly two whites.
145	S	Two three that's six that's eleven.
146	СМ	Exactly three whites.
147	S	Two, two, That's four eleven that's fifteen.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

148		СМ	Exactly four whites.
149		S	Sixteen.
150		СМ	You told me there was going to be twenty. you just convinced me there can't be any more; I'm very confused.
151		s	We didn't do the opposites.
152		СМ	Are you absolutely sure? Ok lets start: What's the opposite of this?[all black and stephanie shows all white tower] Put it back let's see if all the opposite of these are okay [the one white tower set] let's just leave here what you have 'cause you see this. Did you see any of these? This opposite happens to be here [points; from WBBB to wwwb, THE INCORRECT OPposite]. Isn't that interesting? This is exactly one white and this is exactly three white-
153		S	But you know why.
154		СМ	Why; that's very confusing
155		S	This is also three white. [pointing to group of three white both together and separated but also pointing to the group of one white and saying three white-imagining the oposite of those towers where there are 3 blacks would be white so that's why she is saying white to them]] This is also a three white, so these are all going to be the opposite.[identifies the two groups that will be opposites of each other without yet giving an example of how they are oppsotes of each other automatically]
156	28:39:00	СМ	What you do you mean, these are all going to be the opposite? What opposite?
157		S	This is the opposite of this.[comparing WBWW and BWBB]
158		СМ	Why does that happen?
159		S	Because you're using three whites, this one was the three white column [WBWW] but you're using three whites, this one was one white column but you're using three blacks [BWBB], so it's the opposite, theres your opposites
160		СМ	Oh, so is that always going to work? So you're telling me when you're using exactly one white. All of the opposites of the exactly one white turn up where?
161		s	Here[shows exactly three white group]
162		СМ	In the exactly three whites, and that's because these are these opposites. Okay, so I understand how you got these opposites the no whites with the four whites, and then one white with the three whites. All the opposites in here? for the exactly two writes.
163		S	I thought I saw these ones.
164		СМ	All these are, these are exactly two whites. Do you see these opposites any place here? I do.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

165		S	Hm
166		СМ	I do I see it here [in the same group]. S:here [shows WWBB BBWW] So that's that opposite. Is the opposite of this any place [BWWB]? S: here [SHOWS IT IN THE SAME GROUP]. That's the opposite of its very interesting. That's exactly two whites. That's very interesting. That's the opposite.
167		S	I wonder. Oh yea there [referring to the last pair that they are also opposites] I guess
168	30:07:00	СМ	You did convince me that everything has an opposite and the opposite of this one turned out here, the opposite of these turned out[showing each group with each group that is an oppsite]
169		S	These turned out here.
170		СМ	of exactly one white turned out to be with exactly three whites. And the opposites of the exactly two whites
171		s	came out with the exactly two whites separated
172		СМ	.Why? It did not come out with the two whites separatedS: oh no
173		СМ	Look this is the opposite of these here, somewhere in the exactly two whites you found the opposite of exactly two whites, the exactly two blacks. Why would you find those here when you had to find these here and these here. I wonder why that would be
174		S	Well that was the only one left.
175		СМ	That's a reason. That's not a convincing one; I don't think Stephen would buy that.
176		s	Um
177		СМ	But is there any reason other than that that's true that we have to find them for because we used them all up is there another reason why it would make sense that they would have to be here and couldn't be somewhere else
178		S	Hm I guess. Like um. They have to be here they couldn't be someplace else. They have to be here they couldn't be somewhere else. I have a reason for that. Because if you're using the two, you cant put the two with the three. [referring to two white with three white group]
179		СМ	So when you're using exactly two whites, how many blacks are you using?
180		S	Two.
181		СМ	Why can't you use more than two blacks when you're using two blacks?
182		S	Because the assignment said to use four and you had to use another one.
183		СМ	Now this is the big question. When you started you thought there would be twenty because you found ten by going through a certain plan and you said because of your opposites, that's the word you were using. but

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

184		S	now you went through this plan and you convinced me there are no more when there are no whites than this. I believe it, right? There are no more when there's exactly one white. You went through all your arguments where there's exactly two whites, three whites, four whites. How could you solve your problem when you only paying attention to the whites now. Not even worrying about opposites. Come up with sixteen and convince me there are no more. And when you did opposites you ended up with twenty. Do you think that's possible? Do you see how somebody might get confused about that? [S: mhmm] What do you think? How could I explain? All right. You have your two [solid towers], right, so there's your opposites, you can't look for any more opposites, 'cause these are solid color. We're gonna say these are solid colors. These have the all black and all white. There's no more of these. Then you have this now I convinced you that there is no more of these kind [referring to exactly one white]. And you look for the opposites. [finds the set of exactly three white and one black]
185		СМ	But you didn't do these by finding opposites remember. You didn't convince me by opposite. Cause if you're gonna use an opposite argument with me, I would say how do you know there are more and more and more of them. you've convinced me because you said there's exactly three whites.
186		S	I convinced you that there were exactly three whites.
187		СМ	It Just turned out that there was exactly three whites that's not how you convinced me.
188		S	Hm I convinced you that there were no more of these [exactly three whites] but then when you put them together you find out that they are opposites and you know that you can't get any more of these.
189		СМ	Ok.
190		S	Now that you can't get anymore. Then, you have, the two. And the two you have this one and this one
191		СМ	And how did you convince me of the exactly twos
192		S	I convinced you that there exactly, I convinced you of the twos.
193		СМ	Right
194	34:22:00	S	Now, these and these are opposites so you know you can't get any more of this kind.
195		СМ	Yeh but that's not how you convinced me of more of these - oh I see you want me to accept that you already convinced me. okay why don't you go through that again so you know that Mrs. O'Brien just came in and she made one here, how you convinced me that there are no more than the exactly two whites.
196		S	I convinced you because when I took it, I would go and I compared it for this part of it I compared it. [refering to the alternating towers and

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

			showing how white cube cant go anywhere else]. And I can make it this way this way or this way.
197		СМ	And how about this part of it.[referring to WWBB, BBWW, BWWB group]
198		S	This part of it. Well you know you can't make any more because when you have this down the bottom wait hold on, yeah this down the bottom, (mutters) if you have this down the bottom. if you move the two down the bottom then you need another one in the middle.[referring to WWBB but not clear what she needs, possibly another space in the tower to move the WW down]Ok. and you find the opposite of this one, so you know you can't make any more of that kind. You have the opposite of this one and the opposite of this one,
199		СМ	And more Mrs. O'Brien again, could you tell her why the opposites were exactly two whites you would find the opposites for exactly two blacks in that group?
200		S	This group?[same exactly two group]. Because of what happens is well first of all there's no groups left. And if you um go and you turn this upside down, you have your pair which means if you turn it over again, you have the opposites.
201		СМ	But you went from the exactly one white to find an opposite to find three whites, why didn't you go to a different group?
202		s	Well
203		СМ	suppose you started here and you realized there were none-no groups left. Why didn't you- if I said we didn't know this. let's say there was someone doing this for the first time, and they had looked for the opposites of the exactly two whites, they might not go to this same group; they might look for a different group. Why does it make sense, if it does, to find the opposite in this group?
204		S	So for the opposite [yawns] of this and this is in the same group. Because it just cause um cause you're using the same amount of blocks lets say, ok, here you are using two blocks in the middle and two blocks [whites] separated. Here you are using two blocks in the middle, two blocks separated. And like here [goes to exactly one black group to show another example of a different group that wouldn't be the opppsite of the group being discussed] even if you didn't notice it until the end you're using three blocks and one block and down here you're using three blocks and one block is referring to white or black].
205		СМ	Okay and now you said sixteen and you convinced me there are sixteen. How do you think where do you think the twenty come from? Do you think there's sixteen or do you think they're twenty?
206	37:37:00	S	I think there's sixteen. Cause I've went over it and we checked and we made sure there's no duplicates
207		СМ	We did that with twenties and said "See I made these and they have all their opposites."
208		S	Well I think when I did the twenty I must've not checked for the um extras.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

209	СМ	Could we have done this problem, instead of looking at exactly no whites and one white and two white and three white and four white, could we have done it by looking at exactly no blacks and one black, and two blacks
210	S	Mmhmm that would just be doing the opposite way! You could do that!
211	СМ	Does it work?
212	S	Yep. you don't have to use the two whites together, you could go two blacks, but it's gonna be the same thing as using two whites.[shows a tower alterbnating color and refering to the black by pointing to the black cubes and then referring to the white by pointing to the white cubes]
213	СМ	How would sort of could you sort of talk about it how you would explain to someone. Suppose you said to someone, Mrs. Barnes said to Stephen, "I want you to do the same thing Stephanie did, but I don't want you to go through the argument with exactly no whites, one white, two whites, three whites, but I want you to do it with blacks." What would you advise Stephen to do?
214	S	Do it the same way that I did it with whites because it's going to turn out the same way.
215	СМ	So I could how would you start if I said exactly no blacks? What would you expect that Stephen would show you?
216	S	Exactly no blacks? He'd show me this.[all white tower]
217	СМ	I see, I see and exactly one black which group would he go to do you think?
218	S	He would show me one black, he would show me this.[exactly three white group]
219	СМ	Which was what group for you?
220	S	This was three group.
221	СМ	Exactly three whites what about exactly two blacks? Which group would he be doing?
222	S	He would go to this group. This was my white group; my two white at the bottom.
223	СМ	So was it the same group?
224	S	Actually he was just doing the opposite as me. I would put it in the same group.
225	СМ	Okay that's very, very interesting. if you had to do another problem, you had two strategies, you had an opposite strategy that gave you twenty, you would expect that you missed something. You were really convinced of the sixteen. Cause you've really gone through all those cases. Are there any other possible cases? One white, two white, three white, four white?
226	S	You can use the black system, but other than that no.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

227		СМ	That's a way of doing it but the opposite strategy as me but its that a good way of doing it. But the opposite strategy is that a good way of doing it?
228		S	The opposite strategy can work, but I think it's better to go back and make the opposites.
229		СМ	Oh so it's a good thing to double check by finding that you have opposites. Once you've done this you go back okay, that's very interesting okay that's very interesting. So you have sixteen why don't we put these all here for a minute the way we had them in the groups I'm gonna move these here so we can get a picture of them. Now we had exactly no whites, how was this?and where's the exactly one white that was this, exactly two whites here, exactly three whites here and exactly no blacks?
230		s	Exactly no blacks.
231	41:14:00	СМ	Okay, You really think you feel comfortable with this argument?and if I asked you which I may ask you to do because you've done it so nicely here even though you're tired I might ask you to share this with your class would you be uncomfortable doing that?
232		s	No.
233		СМ	And explaining it? So I What I'm interested in now you feel comfortable sharing that. I might ask you to come to my graduate class I might ask you to do that Stephanie. Do you think this argument would work in the same way, if you had to build towers of five now? I don't want you to do it I want you to talk about what kinds of cases you would have here you have case one: no whites, case two: exactly one white. Case three: which you did three-a, two whites together two whites separated by at least one black then you did case four: three whites, might have a separation In a sense these cases is a very powerful method of proof do you know in very advanced math people prove things by cases. And it's a good proof if you consider all cases.
234		S	With this you could probably make an estimate of how many towers you make get with 5
235		СМ	How would that work?
236		S	Well okay You know you've done this and you've checked it and you've found that you've got four, with groups of two you've got 3. With groups of-well 6. And with groups of um, but when you started out you got 3.
237		СМ	That's interesting
238		S	And that's how it would work
239		СМ	i just noticed something, I just noticed something you've got one 1 4 6 4 1. Isn't that interesting.
240		S	Hm interesting it turns out to kind of like pattern
241		СМ	A different kind of pattern huh

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

242		S	When you started out you had had one wait you had uh four, you had um three, had two and you had one. And with that you could go and you could say well I'm gonna estimate if this is how many you have but forwith five I might go and say you can go and you can say you had one with the four. With five you had five. Well you'll probably get five.[estimating the 5-tall tower in group of exactly one white] That's what you get with the six that's the same thing.[comparing the 6-tall group which is 6 exactly one white] And with the five, here I might get one more than this [talking about the exactly two white group].
243		СМ	Why do you think one more?
244		S	One more, because here you're gonna get one more [the exactly one white group you get one more] you're gonna get one more because when we did the pattern with six you got one more than when you did the pattern with five
245		СМ	What do you think you'd get with exactly one white what do you think you'd get with exactly three white? [trying to ask about a parallel group (opposite group)]
246		S	Not counting the opposites. Probably one white probably another one. [she refers to one will be added to the exacty three group which she broke apart into two sets of towers: WWWB and WBWW & WWBW and BWWW – not sure why this break up because it should have been broken by together and apart]
247		СМ	Probably? You're guessing one more.
248		S	Think this would be five, four, three, two. No five, four, three, um, one instead of four, three, two, one. [shows that the concept of opposite is not used, but rather a pattern of the total numbers that are consecutive that Stephanie notices without warrant as to why this might work. She had a warrant for the exactly one white, but then just continues a consecutive pattern because she thinks each group would have an extra one more.]
249		СМ	That would be your guess before you start.
250		S	Yea that would be my guess.
251		СМ	That's interesting now let's go back here you think in this group when you're building towers of five you would get one more when you were building towers of 5. [talks to someone else on the side third person comes in and says AA: "I'm not sure I'm not sure what's in common here.")
252		S	Oh wow I must've separated the cases wrong. Because these two are glued together the whites are glued together.
253	45:52:00	CM	You want this one in there too.[fixes her mistake, but S doesn't agree with it yet]
254		S	No that one goes with that. Oh this one doesn't belong[notices herself the mistake]
255		СМ	Those are interesting guesses and let's try not to lose those guesses. But before we do that, I'd like us to try something different. I'd like us to think

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

		about something maybe that's not more. But I'd like to think about towers of three.
256	S	Towers of three, okay
257	СМ	And I'd like to think of it if you were using this strategy of towers of three would it work?
258	S	Yeah you might you'd probably get something like this you probably get something with three.
259	СМ	Okay these you'd probably- so for towers of three.
260	S	You'd probably get something like three two one because you'd get less than tower four, you know that, so you get probably you're gonna get three here [exactly one white group] And then on the bottom [group of exactly three white], when you go for towers of three, you're gonna get one here. Which means you're probably gonna get two in the middle.[the exactly two white group]
261	СМ	So how many total?
262	S	Three, two, one um, six. And then when you do your opposites
263	СМ	But wait a minute we didn't get extras by opposites before.
264	S	Yeah, that's right.
265	СМ	We got extras by cases.
266	S	Just without the opposites, you'd get six.[not enough evidence that she is still not thinking that opposites might still be made]
267	СМ	You think six. Okay why don't you show me?
268	S	Okay.
269	СМ	Let's not lose these. Why don't we move these over here and why don't you show me what would happen with towers of three.
270	S	Okay.
271	СМ	I'd like you to set up a parallel argument if you don't mind. That's the way I'm thinking now.
272	S	Okay, we're gonna start with one white.
273	СМ	No, you're gonna start with no whites.
274	S	Oh no whites, okay so that's three blacks. Then
275	СМ	Any other ways of doing this. (laughs) no.
276	S	No. (laughs) then, oh okay. I'm doing the wrong pattern (pause) I have to get the I have to get it through my head.
277	СМ	How many will there be? Don't make them; tell me before you make them.
278	S	Three ![one white exactly]

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

279		СМ	You can make them now. Just wanted to help you
280		S	Okay (pause) right there
281		СМ	You thought six do you still think six?
282		S	No I think seven. I think it's gonna
283		СМ	Why do you think seven?
284		S	Because I didn't include the no whites. I forgot to include the no whites.
285		СМ	You said in class one time there cant be an odd number. I that would mess up the whole opposite thinking. Still think seven?
286		S	Yeah, could be seven.
287		СМ	So you think there doesn't always have to have an opposite.
288		S	Uh, yeah, you don't <i>always</i> have to have an opposite.
289		СМ	So we did exactly one white now what were we doing after exactly one white?
290	49:12:00	S	Exactly two whites.
291		СМ	Exactly two whites?
292		S	I would go. [builds WWB, BWW first and then separately WBW later]
293		СМ	Glued together ones first
294		S	Then you have like that and there was my estimate of two[for glued]
295		СМ	Glued together
296		S	and then you have three so far you have one, two, three, four, five, six, seven. There's seven.
297		СМ	But do the whites always have to be, glued together
298		S	Yeah you don't have to have the whites glued together, you can go like this[builds WBW now]
299		СМ	Is there any other way of not having the whites glued together?
300		S	Mm-mm.[no]
301		СМ	So how many did you find?
302		S	Three okay three and three is six. Eight.
303		СМ	Oh. What do you think?
304		S	I think well um I think. Well I think that. That's all you could make with that. That is might I think that hm I think that I found the opposite. I think that it's going to turn out the same way that it turned out here with the opposites. [pointing to the 4-tallI towers]

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

305	50:39:00	СМ	What's that same way?
306		S	Well you know how we found the opposites from here to here?[pionting to exactly one white to the exactly three white]
307		СМ	Yeah from the it's exactly one whiteto the exactly[pointing to the 3tall exactly one white]
308		s	Oh exactly two white[showing the opposites as she speaks]
309		СМ	And in this case exactly three white[referring to 4-tall]. The exactly one white The opposite turns out to be in the exactly two white I wonder why that is? You think that's accidental?
310		S	I don't know.
311		СМ	It's very interesting.
312		S	Yeah. And then these two opposites so there you go from sixteen to eight.
313		СМ	No you went from six to
314		S	To seven to eight, yeah
315		СМ	What made you change your mind from the six to the seven again?
316		S	I didn't count the no whites
317		СМ	What made you change your mind from the seven to the eight?
318		S	I saw that I forgot about this one the one with the two separate[whites]
319		СМ	Okay, let's put these back from the way you found them.
320		S	Okay, um well they all go down here so it doesn't matter.[she tries to put the one white and two white groupstgoether similary to the way she did with 4tall possibly not realizing there is amissing case because of the missing height.]
321		СМ	No because if it's exactly no whites, then it was
322		S	oh, it was exactly one white
323		СМ	Make sure you have that so Mrs. Austin and Mrs. O'Brien doesn't say there's not more and they can look and be convinced.
324		S	There is exactly one black here.
325		СМ	You sure you have them all?
326		S	Yes.
327		СМ	And here you are sure you have them all?
328		S	Mm-hmm.
329	53:25	СМ	And you did them together and you said you did them separated as you chose to do okay, now exactly three. Oh what the heck let's do exactly

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

330	s	exactly towers of two. I'm gonna drive Mrs. Demi crazy here with the camera but we'll do that anyway. Exactly towers of two. Same same same way of thinking same argument. This is a neat way of proof. Exactly no whites [she says after steph builds BB]. How many? would you have guessed they would all be four without doing it? I would have guessed that, not exactly four, but probably around it.
331	CM	Okay.
332	S	Because you know it has to be less than eight.
333	CM	Towers of one. Don't make them, guess.
334	S	Towers of one one!
335	СМ	You think there's one way of doing towers of one okay, let's do towers of one, exactly no whites.
336	S	Actually there's okay there's two. [builds it]
337	СМ	Okay let's see then we have exactly no whites. Towers of one. Would be a good idea to write some of this down. okay so we have towers of one, two, three, and four.
338	S	One, two[she is writing on pice of paper 1. 2. 3. 4. With large spaces and putting in the totals for each height after]
339	СМ	Leave some room cause we're gonna go to five
340	s	three, four
341	СМ	It's all right. you found how many total?
342	S	Two.
343	СМ	And here?
344	S	Four.
345	СМ	Okay.
346	S	Eight.
347	СМ	and here.
348	S	Sixteen.
349	СМ	Interesting.
350	s	That's weird look, two times two is four, and four times two is eight, and eight times two is sixteen.
351	CM	So what?
352	s	It goes like in a pattern, two times two is four, and four times four is eight and eight times eight is sixteen.
353	CM	Oh, I wonder why?

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

354		S	Well it also turns out that every number is even.
355		СМ	Well if this is pattern what would you guess would be with towers of five?
356	55:08:00	S	If I had to guess? Thirty-two.
357	56:18	СМ	You would guess thirty-two.
358		S	I would guess thirty-two.
359		СМ	Gee, if this works you'd be able to do this pretty fast. Is there a reason why that would work?
360		S	I remember when we did the towers of five in class. It was 32.
361		СМ	I wonder why this works. I wonder why this works. Let's look at what we have here. Let's kind of think about what happens when we build towers of one and towers of two. Why do we have twice as many?
362		S	Because you doubled it.
363		СМ	What would Mrs. Alston will suggest let's pretend these are the towers of one now suppose I start with this and now build towers of two. Why would I expect four rather than two? Why? Now I'm building, starting with my tower of one, which has white on the bottom floor.[s:mm] Why might it be now- Suppose I start with white on the bottom floor. What kind of towers can I build on the bottom floor?
364		S	With one?
365		СМ	With two.[s: with two?]
366		СМ	We know there's only one I could build with white on the bottom floor with one
367		S	You can build two.
368		Cm:	Why? What could I build?
369		s	You can build the solid white.
		cm	With white on the bottom floor you could do this, right? [referring to the solid white that steph built]
		s	You could build this [solid] or you could build this.[picks up BW]
370		СМ	Ok so, I could either put white on the top floor or black on the top floor, if white is on the bottom floor. Now white doesn't have to be on the bottom floor.
371		S	It could be on the top floor. It could be on the top floor.
372		СМ	Right and you told me with white on the bottom floor you could either put a black on the top of it or another white on top of it and there's two of them. but do I have to have only white on the bottom floor?
373		S	No black could be on the bottom floor and theres two
374		СМ	And How could I build it with black on the bottom floor?

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

375		S	Um, this way? [shows Wb]
376		СМ	I could put white on the top floor
377		S	and this way.[shows BB]
378		СМ	That's four. well that helps me see how I could go from towers of two to towers of four. What if I'm going from the top floor we have twice as many how could we get twice as many if we start with these towers? We have these four now[stands up the two tall towers]
379		S	Okay now we're going from here to here okay. With white on the bottom you have this one and you have one, two, three, four [puts all towers with white on the bottom but not accounting for second floor color, so she gets four of them] and these all have white on the bottom and with black on the bottom you have four. [the other four towers not accounting for the second floor]
380		СМ	Yeah, but sort of we are not paying attentin to the second and third floorshow do I know I have the possibilities of that .
381	58:40:00	S	You know what I'm saying, look: with white on the bottom floor, these equal two, but[one tall] and with white on the bottom floor, you have two. The total here is four. Now the total here is four and you get four. [two tall][she is implying there is a number pattern, from 2 total of 1-tall you got 2 from each, from 4 total of 2-tall you should get 4 from each which she does based on the way she arranged them]
382		СМ	Yeah but I could have said in these here [2-tall] you could either have white on the bottom floor or black or white on the top floor or black. It made sense to think of white on the bottom floor or black on the bottom floor because you only started with these two I think.
383		S	Yeah.[incomplete conversation; there is silence for a few seconds and then carolyn moves on to the next question]
384		СМ	Do these problems remind you of any other kinds of problems you've ever seen?
385		S	Um these kinds of problems hm well, only the one that we did when last time when you came with the um, five.
386		СМ	The five.
387		S	Um. usually the problems remind me of the shirts and shorts
388		СМ	Right.
389		S	Usually they remind me but this one doesn't not really usually this one reminds me of the shirts and shorts but this one doesn't.
390		СМ	What way does it usually remind me of shirts and shorts?
391		S	Well usually you have to pair up.
392		СМ	Can you imagine if these could be shirts and pants of some sort an outfit or combination?[shows the two-tall towers]

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

393		S	You might be able to it depends on if you might make it into a problem. You could say Jim has a pair of black pants and a pair of white pants, or white top and a black tophow many outfits can he make? And you can say four.
394		СМ	How would you make four?
395		S	Black with black, and white with white, and white with black, and black with white.[pointing to the towers]
396	1:00:57	СМ	Is there any way you could show me with a picture or anything?
397		S	Mhm. (draws shirts and pants) Black with black, and white with white, and white with black, and black with white.
398		СМ	Okay in a sense this is like the shirts and pants the building of towers with two Could you imagine this with shirt and pants?
399		S	Yeah you could go Jim has a black pair of pants and a white top. How many outfits can he make?
400		СМ	Well if he doesn't have shirts and pants here he just has
401		S	You could say well, you could go like this. Jim has a black pair of pants, a white pair of pants, and oh wow it doesn't matter. And a white shirt and then it would make two but
402		СМ	Yeah here he has two articles of clothing, right? A shirt and a pants, here he only has one article of clothing yeah, it's a little hard to see
403		S	Yeah it's a little harder to work with two pieces of clothing
404		СМ	He just has the pants here
405		S	Yeah
406		СМ	Maybe it's summer he walks around without a shirt well Okay it seems like. This really does seem like a outfit problem of 2. Is there any way we could think of the outfits problem with another piece of clothing let's go back to this. Two shirts two pants. Now suppose we had two hats. Black hat and a white hat.
407		S	Okay.
408		CM	Maybe I should have asked you to do it all on another piece of paper. We already did this; we have two hats, two shirts, two pants.
409		S	Alright
410		CM	Black hat, white hat. Learn How many combinations do we have? (long pause)
411		S	Alright so you have white white black black, then you could go black black black, white white white, black white black, that's three, black white white, that's four, black black white, that's five, white white black, that's six, and then you could go do that (white black black) do that all right makes six.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

412		СМ	Want to write out the letters? you've lost me kind of show me as you're doing it
413		S	White hat, white pants. Oh perfect I put white blue.
414		СМ	Remember you already have these outfits here. So you think when you have the white outfits here
415		S	You get two more outfits.
416		S	Black pants black shirt. Black pants black hat black hat white shirt. Black pants white shirt white hat. Black pants white shirt black hat. Wait I did that one. Then you could move on to the what w t b pants. White shirt black hat black pants. No that's the same made that. Black pants. White pants black shirt. White hat. White pants black shirt black hat. And that one the same one that one must be my favorite I keep making it up. One, two, three, four, five, six, seven. Am I sure I did this? I didn't do that one already? No. hm.
417	1:07:23	СМ	And you're not satisfied with that? What bothers you about it?
418		s	Here I got six but here I got seven and I'm not sure I think I made one over but I didn't.
419		Cm	Is it possible to have seven?
420		s	No.
421		Cm	Why?
422		s	Because you'd be walking around with a hat and a shirt or a hat and a pants or pants and a shirt.
423		cm	Okay so what do you think?
424		S	I think I messed up someplace.
425		СМ	Let's think here, here are your outfits.
426		S	Okay.
427		СМ	You made them and you showed me. Here there were four. You were sure of that. And it's like the towers. You believed it. Now here I am. Now imagine you've come home with two really smashing hats. A black one and a white one. What could you do with these four outfits when you have these two hats?
428		S	What can I do with these outfits when you only have four hats?
429		СМ	Cause now you have three articles of clothing.
430		S	Combinations oh, I think you'd still have six.
431		СМ	Okay, your black hat.
432		S	My black hat could go here. Could go here. That's eight no, that's four.
433		СМ	Okay keep thinking.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

434		S	Okay then
435		СМ	You've got four more with your black hat. But You came home with two hats.
436		S	That's it you'd have white hat, white hat, white hat, white hat.
437		СМ	Well now it's not seven, and it's not six – it's eight.
438		S	Its eight.
439		СМ	Well, how about that here's some towers and now you're making outfits with three articles of clothing. Is there any similarity to this?
440		S	Is there any similarity from these and these?
441		СМ	Now you've told me now with three articles of clothing. Black shirt, white pants. You could now make eight outfits. And you're absolutely convinced. Cause you started with the four combinations. And you told me you could put a black hat on top or a white hat on top. Now if I asked you to make them to produce the eight I bet you could make them really easily but you could kind of imagine what they look like, okay like
442		S	They would look like this.
443		СМ	Right.
444		S	And they would look like this one. And they would look like this one.
445		СМ	But wait a minute what color hat are you using?
446		S	Oh we're using black hat. This one and this one. This one. And
447	1:10:49	СМ	White on the bottom floor, Black on the middle.
448		S	Yeah this one.
449		СМ	You could also give me the other outfits
450		S	This one. This one does go here. This one. This one. Where'd my last one go?
451		СМ	Two whites on the bottom?
452		S	That one must go there.
453		СМ	First two floors. Now isn't that interesting?
454		S	Yeah.
455		СМ	Now if I gave you two feathers: a black feather and a white feather
456		S	Ok. then. we go to the fourth blocks
457	1:11:32	СМ	Why?
458		S	Because we're adding another piece of clothing.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

459		СМ	Lets talk about it.
460		S	Oops black feathers on the very top
461		СМ	You don't have to do it; you could just tell me what you would do.
462		S	Okay well. Okay.
463		CM	now we have all of these. The w hats on the top of all those outfits. Right. Ok.
464	1:12:05	S	Now we have black hat on top.
465		СМ	On top of what where would you be putting the black hats on top of?
466		S	Black hats on top of these?
467		СМ	Mhm
468		S	So all of these would now have a black feather on top, that's what you're telling me?
469		СМ	Not the right order. I was wondering why I couldn't find the rest.
470		S	I was wondering why I could find it.
471		СМ	Started to worry right
472		S	Yea.h.
473		СМ	You lose it?
474		S	I'm not sure? Oh.
475		СМ	Okay so how many did we get when you put the black on these very outfits?
476		S	You have eight.
477		СМ	Now we put white on the very top
478		S	That's
479		СМ	Okay, you have a white on the very top
480		S	So. That's sixteen
481		СМ	Does that make sense?
482		S	Wait. We have 9.
483		СМ	Ok. These are the ones with the whites on the very top. Let's flatten them out because [inaudible].
484		S	They all they're not the same because does that make you feel better. I was getting worried there too Stephanie. Now I don't want you to do this. I know you're getting tired and I want you to go back. These are your shirts, pants, hats, feathers. And now we're going to have a flower. Black

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

			and white flower to go on top or some kind of design (laughs) Without doing it, tell me how many combinations do you get?
485		СМ	I would say okay if you getprobably twenty?
486		S	Now you have sixteen outfits. Now you're going to put on top of this either a black feather or white flower. Or decoration.
487		СМ	Instead of making the towers.
488		s	I'm not even asking you to make them suppose you put a black.
489		СМ	On top.
490		S	Ok
491		СМ	Just tell me
492		S	What's gonna happen
493		СМ	Okay youre gonna get black on these
494		S	Yeah ok.
495		СМ	Do you have black on?
496		S	Okay so You're going to get 32. So it is sort of like the shirts and shorts problem. You could figure out. That's what we got when we multiplied and when we did the problem the last time.
497		СМ	What did you have?
498		S	A method.
499		СМ	What's the method?
500	1:17:04 (WV)	S	All you have to do is take the last number you had and multiply by two.
501		СМ	You're convinced it's always going to work? What I would like you to do is you've done extraordinary work and you have really today come up with another method. You have one method you made from last time. Now so if I were to say to you if you were building towers of six, what would you say to me?
502		S	Okay towers of six and towers of five. Thirty-two. Towers of six that's um sixty-four.
503		СМ	Sixty-four, right. And You also have a method of finding also sixty-four what was it?
504		S	Multiply the last one by two.
505		СМ	That was the answer but how would you show me What was your strategy?
506		S	Shirts and shorts problem.
507		СМ	That's another way but How would remember when you did towers of four.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

508		S	Um You would go line by line
509		СМ	Well you said there were first first case. First cases
510		S	I think there were four in the first case. Four.
511		СМ	One in the first case
512		S	Youre talking about the black one.
513		СМ	You used all those cases one whites, two whites –up to how many?
514	1:17:39	S	With towers of six you could go up to – five, four, six to sixty-four.
515		S orcm??	You'd go to 6
516		СМ	Exactly 6 w. What id want you to do and You've been wonderful and you've had so little sleep. I just wish you could write me sort of a story about if you were gonna be the teacher or you were gonna explain to a friend. Hey look if were doing these problems Amy might come in again. She may say okay everybody were going to be doing Towers of Six. You'd have all this information and it sort of isn't fair. I'd love if you could do that for me and we'd have to plan some time so you could share it. You just were wonderful. I'd like you to talk to Michelle Ask her say to her tell me Michelle how you did this. I'd like you to come in and tell me how many towers you could build with exactly 6 high that are exactly two colors. How many towers could you build that are exactly 10 high. With exactly two colors. You think you'd know how to do that.
517		s	Yeah
518		cm	Yeah I think you could too.
519		s	All you'd have to do then is we know we have towers of six times it six, seven, eight, nine actually six, seven, eight, nine, ten that's four. By four, not by four, by eight because what happens is you multiply by two.
520		S	What would multiply by two what would multiplying by two give you?
521		СМ	It would give you.
522		S	Or you could just go like this 64 times two equals um. Then you could just go that would be the seven towers, sixteen one four five two eight that's the eight towers, nine towers, eight towers. Thats twelve one ten eleven one four five five twelve is the nine towers eighteen nineteen. That's the ten towers, [CM: how many?] one thousand. Wait huh, [cm: Check this]
523		S	That's four, that's two, that's ten one goes on top
524		cm	You wrote one-nine I don't know why
525		s	Yeh but that's ten.
526		S	Oh, that's why, okay so there is 1,024.

Towers problem, 03-06-1992 Location: Kenilworth, NJ Researcher: Carolyn Maher

Video:

https://drive.google.com/open?id=14X2HOXeHBa nsOpO2sLXj0P71Dlzpp5G

Transcriber(s): Ella and Victoria

Krupnik

Verifier(s): Adam Smargon, Kara

Teehan, Victoria Krupnik

Date: Summer 2018

527		СМ	Would that be same as you were gonna do multiplying by eight?
528		S	No that's fifty-one – 512, which Gave me eight towers.
529		СМ	Wonder why it didn't work multiplying towers by eight. Wonder why that was. The nine towers. Why do you think so?
530		s	I think I it was actually easier going like this trying to figure out
531		СМ	Lthink you had a good idea.
532		S	You had to be sure if you doubled the nmber , tripled the number, that it would absolutely work.
533		СМ	What I'd like you to think about I think the idea was very good. You multiplied it by eight. But notice what you did here. You multiplied it by eight. You didn't multiply it by eight. You multiplied it two times two times two times two times two.
534		S	That's twelve – sixteen
535		СМ	So if you had multiplied by sixteen it would've worked.another two.
536		СМ	You gotta think about it why the idea didn't work but almost work. It's nice to have shortcuts if you're not sure they're gonna work then wow. Did you think you learned anything today
537		s	I learned those methods
538		cm	People would love to have those methods. Well again I say thank you I would like to come back and have your essay.
539		S	Okay
540		Cm	I would love to see, if you go back to those towers of six and you could prove all the cases there should be how many
541		s	64
542	1:25:08(wv)	cm	And convince your classmates that you have not left any out because left any out duplicates if you catch them you're okay but if you don't catch them. That's wonderful.